



PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

MORNING SESSION: 9.30 a.m. – 11.35 a.m.

Gibraltar, Friday, 19th October 2012

The Gibraltar Parliament

The Parliament met at 9.30 a.m.

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH, OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: M L Farrell Esq RD *in attendance*]

SUSPENSION OF STANDING ORDERS

5 **Standing Order 7(1) suspended
to lay an agreement on the Table**

Clerk: Sitting of Parliament, Friday, 19th October 2012.
Suspension of Standing Orders, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

10 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I beg to move under Standing Order 7(3) to
suspend Standing Order 7(1) in order to proceed with the laying of an agreement on the Table.

Mr Speaker: Those in favour. (**Members:** Aye.) Those against. Carried.

15

DOCUMENTS LAID

20 **Agreement laid before the House**

Clerk: Papers to be laid. The Hon. the Chief Minister.

25 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay on the table an Agreement
between Her Majesty's Government of Gibraltar and the Ministry of Defence of the Government of the
United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland relating to the provision of Education Services.

Mr Speaker: Ordered to lie.

Questions for Oral Answer

30

TOURISM, PUBLIC TRANSPORT AND THE PORT

35

Heritage, Culture, Tourism and Environment inter-Ministerial Committee Meetings and issues covered

Clerk: Answers to Oral Questions continue.
Question 819/2012, the Hon. D J Bossino.

40

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port advise when the inter-Ministerial Committee comprising the Heritage, Culture, Tourism and Environment Ministries was set up, how many times it has met, what issues it has deliberated on and what conclusions have been reached?

45

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

50

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Yes, Mr Speaker, the Committee was set up on the 21st February of this year and has met three times, on 21st February, on 21st March and 4th May. The Committee deliberates on all the manifesto commitments in respect of Environment, Tourism, Transport, Heritage and Culture. The conclusions are ongoing and are published as they are implemented. The hon. Gentleman may have seen some of the announcements already.

55

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, I was interested to find out how matters were progressing in relation to that inter-Ministerial Committee, because as far as I am aware, there was only one initial announcement which was featured in the *Gibraltar Chronicle* back in January. Now the Minister refers to other announcements having been made. I am not necessarily aware of those.

In respect of that particular article, the Minister is aware that reference was made to a new thematic Neanderthal Park as being on the cards. Is that still on the cards? If it is, can he give this House any reports as to progress in relation to that particular project?

60

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, I should add that in addition to the official meetings that have been held on the dates that I have just said, there have also been bilateral meetings with different Ministers, in order to progress different projects through.

65

It does give me great pleasure to list some of the matters that have been discussed and already delivered: the Jazz Festival; more planting of trees; the Green Procurement Seminar; support to event-led Tourism; the exploration and implementation of solar street lighting; encouraging the use of Gibraltar as a cruise port; the work with industry tourism operators, the re-providing of the Moorish Castle Estate park; the Museum's Spring 2012 lecture series; an environmental feedback session; the refurbishment of John Mackintosh Hall Library; Summer Nights; preparations for major excavations at Gorham's and Vanguard Caves; Gibraltar National Week classical concert, the Mega Concert; Gibraltar National Week events; Gibraltar Fair; free travel for Route 5 for old age pensioners; the Rock of Gibraltar designated as a special area of conservation; the Thinking Green Trade Fair; the improvement to bus routes; the Calpe Conference; new tours for cruise ship passengers; and the campaign against dog fouling.

75

Those are a list of matters on manifesto commitments that have been discussed at the meetings that I have just said, and bilaterally, and have already been delivered.

80

Tourism, Public Transport and the Port Trainees on placements within Ministries

Clerk: Question 820, the Hon. D J Bossino.

85

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port provide details giving a breakdown by age, gender and nationality of all trainees on placements within the Ministries for which he has responsibility, indicating the Department, Agency, and Authority where they are placed and the nature of the work they are undertaking?

90

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Yes, Mr Speaker, I now hand over to the hon. Gentleman the information requested as of 12th October 2012.

SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 820/2012

PLACEMENTS OF TRAINEES

	AGE	GENDER	NATIONALITY	DEPT/AGENCY/AUTHORITY	LOCATION	WORK CARRIED OUT
1	21	Female	British Gibraltar	Ministry of Tourism, Transport & the Port	Office	General Administration
2	23	Male	British Gibraltar	Ministry Of Tourism, Transport & the Port	Office	Messenger & Admin
3	20	Female	British Gibraltar	Gibraltar Tourist Board	Accounts Department	General Administration
4	27	Male	British Gibraltar	Gibraltar Tourist Board	Coach Terminal	Coach Park attendant
5	21	Male	British Gibraltar	Gibraltar Tourist Board	Information Offices	Visitor Information Patrol Officer
6	19	Female	British Gibraltar	Gibraltar Tourist Board	Information Offices	Visitor Information Patrol Officer
7	24	Female	British Gibraltar	Gibraltar Tourist Board	Information Offices	Visitor Information Patrol Officer
8	45	Female	Lithuanian	Gibraltar Tourist Board	Upper Rock Department	Maintenance/Cleaner
9	38	Female	British Gibraltar	Gibraltar Tourist Board	Upper Rock Department	Administration
10	20	Male	British Gibraltar	Gibraltar Tourist Board	Upper Rock Department	Maintenance
11	22	Male	British Gibraltar	GibiBikes	Gib Bus Company Depot	General Maintenance
12	47	Male	British Gibraltar	Gibraltar Bus Company	Gib Bus Company Depot	Driver
13	55	Male	British Gibraltar	Gibraltar Bus Company	Gib Bus Company Depot	Driver
14	27	Male	British Gibraltar	Gibraltar Bus Company	Gib Bus Company Depot	Painter
15	20	Female	British Gibraltar	Maritime Administration	Watergate House, Casemates Square	Seafarers Certificates, General Admin Support and Yacht Registry assistance
16	22	Female	British Gibraltar	Maritime Administration	Watergate House, Casemates Square	Surveyors' support and technical administration
17	21	Female	British Gibraltar	Maritime Administration	Watergate House, Casemates Square	Surveyors' support and technical administration
18	28	Female	British Gibraltar	Maritime Administration	Watergate House, Casemates Square	Replacements of STCW Endorsements
19	19	Female	British Gibraltar	Maritime Administration	Watergate House, Casemates Square	Replacements of STCW Endorsements
20	24	Male	British Gibraltar	Maritime Administration	Watergate House, Casemates Square	Replacements of STCW Endorsements
21	23	Female	British Gibraltar	Consumer Affairs	10 Governor's Lane	General Administration

**Investment programme on tourist sites
Detailed breakdown**

95

Clerk: Question 821, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port advise how the Government intends to spend the £1,000,000 as set out in the Approved Estimates of Revenue and

100 Expenditure 2012-13 which has been allocated in this financial year in respect of the investment programme on tourist sites, by providing a detailed breakdown?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

105 **Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa):** Yes, Mr Speaker, once again, it gives me great pleasure to inform the hon. Gentleman that the intention is to spend the funds allocated as follows: public toilets refurbishment at Jews Gate, £96,543; the bridge replacement at St Michael's Cave, £72,431; extensive refurbishment at St Michael's Cave, estimated at £348,180; public
110 toilets refurbishment at Apes' Den, £33,237; new sewer line at Apes' Den, £127,053; installation of new sewer and staff toilets at Great Siege Tunnels at £148,068; rock fall risk assessment, phase 1 at Great Siege Tunnels, £11,510; repairs to the viewing platform at the Great Siege Tunnels, £20,779; ticket office extension at Moorish Castle, £21,885; public toilet refurbishment at the 100 Ton Gun, £19,118; repairs to Waterport Fountain and a new pump system, £14,628 and a new viewing platform at the end of Holy
115 Land Tunnel in the Great Siege Tunnels £86,567. That comes to a total of the £1,000,000.

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, I am grateful for the Minister giving me that list and I would be even more grateful if he could perhaps provide me with a schedule or a copy of his answer in written format.

120 Now, as best as I have been able to, I have done a list of the items which he has provided to this House this morning. In relation to that list, can I ask the Minister, Mr Speaker, whether he is prioritising any of the items he has just listed and what the programme of works are in relation to that particular list?

Hon. N F Costa: Well, Mr Speaker, as the staff of the staff of the GTB will tell him, as far as I am concerned, my hope would be for all works to start at the same time all over the place, but I am advised that things do not quite work that way. There are development and planning issues to be taken on board
125 and those that do not require planning can start straight away.

The projects that have started are the Waterport Fountain, which started on 17th October; the work to the toilets at the 100 Ton Gun will begin on 23rd October; and the viewing platform will begin on 5th November. Those are works that can proceed without development and planning permission.

130 All of the other projects that I have listed require to proceed through the planning process, but having said that, Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman can rest assured that I will ensure a fair wind on all of these projects, so that they are completed within this financial year.

135 **Marketing promotions and conferences**
Estimated expenditure 2011-12; forecast outturn 2012-13

Clerk: Question 822, the Hon. D J Bossino.

140 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port provide a breakdown of the estimated expenditure for 2011-12, as well as the forecast outturn for the same period, for marketing promotions and conferences, as set out in the Approved Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure 2012-13?

145 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, as the financial year 2011-12 has already passed, we can in fact provide the hon. Gentleman with the actual figures, instead of estimated expenditure.

150 In respect of the forecast outturn, as set out in the Approved Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure for this financial year, it is as set out in the schedules which I now hand over to him.

SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 822/2012

<i>GIBRALTAR TOURIST BOARD - MARKETING, PROMOTIONS & CONFERENCES 2011/12</i>		
	VOTED	ACTUAL
	2011/2012	EXPENDITURE
LITERATURE	£59,000.00	£71,197.00
TRAVEL TRADE ACTIVITY	£36,100.00	£24,902.00
MEDIA PR ACTIVITY	£2,000.00	£2,389.00
CONSUMER ADVERTISING	£187,650.00	£199,738.00
TRADE SHOWS/FAIRS	£38,000.00	£41,272.00
CONSUMER SHOWS/FAIRS	£34,000.00	£21,817.00
TRADE & CONSUMER SHOWS/FAIRS	£20,500.00	£14,795.00
TRAVEL EXPENSES ALL EVENTS	£20,000.00	£15,639.00
OTHER COSTS	£17,200.00	£9,041.00
LONDON OFFICE ADMIN & SUPPORT SERVICES	£78,000.00	£83,217.00
ONLINE ADVERTISING	£2,000.00	£1,222.00
CONSUMER ADVERTISING	£10,000.00	£36,334.00
EVENTS	£4,000.00	£0.00
OTHER COSTS	£11,000.00	£71,425.00
AIRLINE JOINT MARKETING	£200,000.00	£200,013.00
MEDIA PR ACTIVITY	£2,050.00	£0.00
CONSUMER ADVERTISING	£30,000.00	£58,372.00
TRADE & CONSUMER FAIRS	£36,500.00	£31,060.00
OTHER	£2,000.00	£93.00
GRAND TOTAL	£790,000.00	£882,526.00
<i>GIBRALTAR TOURIST BOARD - MARKETING, PROMOTIONS & CONFERENCES 2012/13</i>		
	VOTED	PROJECTED
	2012/2013	EXPENDITURE
LITERATURE	£59,000.00	£59,000.00
TRAVEL TRADE ACTIVITY	£36,100.00	£36,100.00
MEDIA PR ACTIVITY	£2,000.00	£2,000.00
CONSUMER ADVERTISING	£187,650.00	£187,650.00
TRADE SHOWS/FAIRS	£38,000.00	£38,000.00
CONSUMER SHOWS/FAIRS	£34,000.00	£34,000.00
TRADE & CONSUMER SHOWS/FAIRS	£20,500.00	£20,500.00
TRAVEL EXPENSES ALL EVENTS	£20,000.00	£20,000.00
OTHER COSTS	£17,200.00	£17,200.00
LONDON OFFICE ADMIN & SUPPORT SERVICES	£78,000.00	£78,000.00
ONLINE ADVERTISING	£2,000.00	£2,000.00
CONSUMER ADVERTISING	£10,000.00	£10,000.00
EVENTS	£4,000.00	£4,000.00
OTHER COSTS	£11,000.00	£11,000.00
AIRLINE JOINT MARKETING	£200,000.00	£200,000.00
MEDIA PR ACTIVITY	£2,050.00	£2,050.00
CONSUMER ADVERTISING	£30,000.00	£30,000.00
TRADE & CONSUMER FAIRS	£36,500.00	£36,500.00
OTHER	£2,000.00	£2,000.00
GRAND TOTAL	£790,000.00	£790,000.00

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, from a very cursory check, there is quite a lot of information I would like to go through and I will do so with a bit more time, when this sitting finishes.

155 The reason why I asked this Question, Mr Speaker, is because it is clear from the Budget Book that there has been an increase from the estimated figures 2011-12 to the forecast outturn for the same period of in fact I think to the penny, £88,000. The information that I have, given that that period straddles both administrations, from the predecessor in post, is that as at the time of the General Election, the expenditure was very much in line with the estimated figure.

160 Now, that is just by way of a general preamble, Mr Speaker, but if I could ask these specific questions in relation to the list which I have just been provided. The first one is: there is an entry here, which is described as 'Other Costs', where there is a figure of £11,000 which was voted for 2011-12, whilst the actual expenditure – and I think this is the item which has been the subject of the greatest increase – increases to a figure of £71,425. I cannot do the maths very quickly, but that just seems like a lot of money. I would ask the Minister for an explanation for that.

165

Hon. N F Costa: Yes, Mr Speaker, I suppose that we can call it an ecumenical year, given that the financial year did straddle both administrations.

170 In respect of the 'Other Costs' which I anticipated is what the hon. Gentleman would ask me, it relates to £20,000 being allocated to the production of the film *La Roca* and £42,000 for the *Gibraltar* film. I hope that satisfactorily answers the question of the hon. Gentleman.

Hon. D J Bossino: I am grateful for that, Mr Speaker.

175 I also have another question and that is that there appear to be, certainly in the first section, three items entitled 'Consumer Advertising'. If I just very quickly look at it... Yes, they have each been the subject of, I would say, considerable increases. If I can ask the Minister what that relates to and why it is split into... it features on three occasions?

180 **Hon. N F Costa:** Well, Mr Speaker, I cannot agree with the hon. Gentleman's preface that they amount to considerable increases. For example, in respect of Consumer Shows and Fairs, there is in fact a reduction from £34,000 to £21,000, so that is less money spent on that.

Trade Shows and Fairs is £38,000 voted, and what was actually spent was £41,000. When you take into consideration, the less money spent on the previous item of expenditure, it more than definitely makes up for it.

185 And the same I would say in respect of Consumer Advertising, which goes from £187,000 voted and £199,000 spent.

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, I can give the Minister another example, under the title 'Consumer Advertising' where, if he goes further down the table, he will see that £10,000 was voted in relation to that particular item, and £36,000 was in fact spent.

190 But my question, Mr Speaker, is not that at this stage. My question is why is it that 'Consumer Advertising' features on three separate occasions in the top block – and I have not counted it in the second block, but I think it also repeats itself there, again on three separate occasions?

195 Maybe I am not understanding the table, and I would be grateful for an explanation from the Minister in relation to that point.

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, in the first place, I think it is fair to point out to this House that nine out of ten months were – (**A Member:** Twelve.) nine out of twelve months, sorry, were passed under his administration, so the vast majority of the expenditure would in fact relate to when they were in Government, and only of course, the three other months relate to us.

200 Whereas I have the breakdown as requested in the notes of the Question, that is what I can provide him. If he wants me to tell him exactly what was spent when, that is an entirely different question, which would require my officials to investigate at that level of detail, which he will, I am sure, agree with me is not a fair question, because it has not been provided as notice.

205 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I am really not pursuing the increase at this stage. I am really not pursuing that. All I want to know is – in my view, it would be in fact a simpler question – why it is that the item of expenditure described as 'Consumer Advertising' appears on three separate occasions in each table. That is all.

210 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker, as I have already told the hon. Gentleman, the table and the way it is set out, in terms of the detail of the breakdown of the costs, is exactly the same form that has been provided since they were in Government. As I say, that has been done for nine out of the twelve months of the financial year, so I cannot go any further, other than to say that was the form that was used by them and we simply have followed the form when providing the hon. Gentleman with the answers.

215 In relation to the specific question he asks, one is Consumer Advertising, the other one is Consumer Shows and Fairs and the other one is Trade and Consumer Shows.

For instance, for the Trade and Consumer Shows, it relates to the London Boat Show; in respect of Consumer Affairs, it relates to the Wedding Show at Earl's Court; Consumer Road Shows, Manchester Consumer Road Show.

220 That I hope provides the differentiation to him, but those were during the time that they were in Government.

225 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I do not want to be unfair on the Minister, and if he does not know that is fine and maybe we can speak about this later –

Hon. N F Costa: I just answered the question.

230 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Well, no, he needs to... I would ask him, I would urge upon him, not to be unfair on me. I was not in Government personally, and none of those who have governmental experience on either side of me had charge of this particular Ministerial Portfolio, so other than conferring with them now *a la* a quiz show, (*Laughter*) I would just ask the Minister whether he knows – fine, he inherited this system, but whether he can tell us now, on 19th October, after being almost a year in Government – whether he knows why there are repeated references, three in each table, to ‘Consumer Advertising’.

235 With respect Mr Speaker, I appreciate that there are other sections in the table which have the word ‘consumer’ in it, but I am not concerned about those at this stage. In the cursory check and the limited time I have had available to digest this information, this is one of the features which strikes me, and I just wanted an explanation from the Minister who is responsible for these matters to elucidate me.

240 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker –

Hon. D J Bossino: If he does not have the information, I do not want to be unfair on him –

245 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, it is not about whether I do not have the information and that I have not answered. I do understand perfectly the question that he is asking me, but with all due respect to him, he is basically asking me to divine through telepathy why the officials who prepared this table when they were in Government decided to call certain things and label them in the way that they did.

250 Now, I have told him that I cannot for the life of me tell him why, when this table was first prepared by their administration when they were in Government decided to label certain things the way they did. However, I have gone towards an explanation of the question that the hon. Gentleman has asked me, by telling him what the different labels – which the officials, when they were in Government, decided to describe them as – contained, in order to give them an idea what the officials then decided to include, and I will do so again by way of clarification.

255 In respect of Trade and Consumer Shows, what appears on the breakdown is London Boat Show. London Boat Show: the label put is Trade and Consumer Shows. That I imagine happened at some point when they were in Government and they would know why they put that label. I cannot divine as to the reason why.

260 In respect of Consumer Shows and Fairs, I have already told the hon. Gentleman too, Consumer Road Shows, Wedding Shows, Manchester Consumer Show. The label attached by officials then working with the GSD Government was ‘Consumer Shows/Fairs’.

Now Mr Speaker, I imagine that it is conceivable and within the realm of possibilities that different labels and different nomenclature could have been put to that, but those are the labels that were attached then and I cannot assist the hon. Gentleman in telling him why those labels were used.

265 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I do not want to labour the point but –

A Member: Don’t then.

270 **Hon. D J Bossino:** No, but Mr Speaker, the explanations which the Hon. Minister is giving me in this House are unacceptable to this extent, in the sense that yes, there are civil servants and officials who devised the system, but *he cannot get away from the fact* that he has been in office and holding this office for the last nine to ten months. So he ought to have been at least put on enquiry, when he was given this table, to have asked his officials why it is that there are – which is the question that I am particularly interested in asking – three different references to Consumer Advertising. That is all I want to know Mr Speaker –

275

Mr Speaker: I think the Hon. Minister may be in a position to answer the reason why, if he is given sufficient notice and time to try to go and find out. (**Hon. D J Bossino:** Yes.) But he may not have the information with him here today.

280 **Hon. D J Bossino:** I accept that, that’s right.

285 **Mr Speaker:** And having been a Minister for many years, I can tell the hon. Member, that is a fact of life. When a Minister stands up in the House to answer a question, he may not have with him all the information that the hon. Member of the Opposition is seeking.

So I think it is fair for you to ask the question. I think what the Minister obviously should do is to go back to his officials, try to find out if there is a reason and inform you at a future date.

Other than that, I do not think we are going to make any more progress today.

290 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, unless I misunderstood the Minister, I hear the Chief Minister say that is what the Minister is offering to do and I accept that offer. Of course I accept that recommendation. *(Interjection)* Maybe we have been speaking at cross purposes. I did say that we wanted to be fair to the Minister and, by all means, that is indeed the way that I wanted to progress and pursue matters.

295 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, with all due respect to the hon. Gentleman, the first thing I said was that if I had received written notice of the question, I would go and find out.

300 But to further assist the hon. Gentleman, I imagine that it is taken as given that the reason why there are these different heads is because we do not just do marketing in Gibraltar, but we do marketing in the UK and in Spain and in Gibraltar. I assumed that he knew that, which is why I have not stated the obvious, which is that marketing is done in Gibraltar, in Spain and in the UK.

Marketing and official visits
Estimated expenditure 2011-12; forecast outturn 2012-13

305

Clerk: Question 823, the Hon. D J Bossino.

310 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port provide a breakdown of the estimated expenditure for 2011-12 as well as a forecast outturn for the same period for marketing, promotions and conferences, as set out in the Approved Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure 2012-13?

Clerk: The Question is 823. I think there may be some...

315 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port provide a detailed breakdown of the forecast outturn figure for 2011-12, as well as the estimated figure for 2012-13 in respect of Head 29, sub-head 2(2)(b) – ‘Marketing and Official Visits’ of the Approved Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure 2012-13?

320 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Yes, Mr Speaker, the breakdown of the expenditure for 2011-12 is contained in the schedules I now hand over to the hon. Gentleman.

325 The estimated figure for 2012-13 in respect of Head 29, sub-head 2(2)(b) is £45,000. This includes £15,000 allocated for the purposes of promoting the Gibraltar Yacht Registry.

SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 823/2012

SCHEDULE 2011/2012 – Head 29 2 (2) (b)

MARKETING AND OFFICIAL VISITS

Detailed breakdown of expenses

ADVERTISING

	£
PV032/12 Riviera Maritime Media – Tanker & Trade	700.00
PV034/12 Elaborate Communications – Ship Management Int.	700.00
PV067/12 The Year Book	1147.00
PV243/12 Riviera Maritime Media – Tanker & Trade	700.00
PV308/12 Gibtour Trade Directory	1000.00
PV331/12 Gib Yacht Registry – IPC Media Ltd	4000.00
PV444/12 Ship Management International	700.00
PV446/12 Superyacht Photography – Rising Sun	50.00
PV468/12 Tanker Operator Magazine Advert	450.00
PV566/12 Ship Management International	<u>1000.00</u>
TOTAL	£10447.00

COURSES

PV024/12 MLC Course Instructors	774.00
PV148/12 Hull & Structural Surveys, Fundamentals of Marine Engineering, Marine Engineering Surveying – Mr A Federico	3740.00
PV184/12 Mr N Hodgson – Instructor for Thetis Course	139.00
PV188/12 Accident Training Course	300.00
PV189/12 Accident Training Course – Mr Nicholas Beer – Flights	236.00
PV190/12 Accident Training Course – Mr Nicholar Beer – Bed & Breakfast	894.00
PV204/12 Shipboard Training Audit – Mr A Federico	209.15
PV208/12 Flights A Federico – Shipboard Training Audit	325.00
PV232/12 ISM Training – Mr A Federico	914.00
PV412/12 Lloyds Diploma Exam – Mr Steve Gomez	214.94
PV413/12 Lloyds Diploma Exam – Mr Steve Gomez – Flights & Hotel	744.44
PV483/12 Marpol Course – Subsistence A Federico	200.00
PV494/12 ECDIS Training Expenses – Mr D Graham	112.76
PV506/12 Stability Course – Mr A Federico – Subsistence	300.00
PV519/12 Stability & Marpol Course – Mr A Federico	768.00
PV524/12 ECDIS Training – Mr D Graham	700.00
PV525/12 Internal Auditor Course	450.00
PV570/12 Diploma In Marine Surveying – Mr A Federico	550.00
JV458 Credit for Training Related Items	3092.09

Cont.....

CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 823/2012

JV287	Adjustment Marpol Expenses	47.87
JV	Adjustment Advance for Stability Refresher Course	136.75

	TOTAL	£8294.58

HOSTING OF MEALS

PV004/12	Coastguard Agency	215.35
PV162/12	Sea Trucks Group	260.00
PV167/12	Sea Trucks Group	30.90
PV175/12	Maritime Accident Investigators	200.00
PV180/12	Maritime Accident Investigators	<u>47.30</u>
	TOTAL	£753.55

MARKETING & OFFICIAL VISITS

PV358/12	Marketing Trip to Germany – Mr A Cubbin	695.56
PV456/12	GL Classification Committee – Mr A Cubbin – Taxi	110.00
PV535/12	Marketing & Class Society Meeting – Germany	1366.72
PV573/12	Monitoring of ABS – Mr A Cubbin	493.27
PV592/12	REG-TF Germany – Subsistence Mr A Cubbin	<u>1000.00</u>
	TOTAL	£3665.55

MISCELLANEOUS

PV020/12	Chamber of Shipping – Mr T E Springett – Return Air Fare	93.43
PV023/12	London Office – Display Stand to Heathrow	211.20
PV045/12	Accommodation Mr A Chatterjee	125.30
PV216/12	Mr D Cocklan – Visas expenses	25.70
JV149	Adjustment - advance for MV Hanoi	200.00
JV354	Meridian Marine Audit	<u>455.50</u>
	TOTAL	£11111.13

NETWORKING

PV185/12	REG Website	<u>100.00</u>
	TOTAL	£100.00

QUALITY MANAGEMENT SYSTEM CERTIFICATION - ISO

PV292/12	SGS United Kingdom Ltd	837.78
PV557/12	SGS United Kingdom Ltd	<u>1383.31</u>
	TOTAL	£2221.09
		Cont.....

CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 823/2012

SEMINARS

PV003/12	Yacht Seminar	104.00
PV300/12	Yacht Seminar	115.95
PV316/12	Yacht Seminar	<u>560.50</u>
	TOTAL	£780.45

TOTAL EXPENDITURE £27,373.35

Official visits
Costs incurred; purpose

330

Clerk: Question 824, the Hon. D J Bossino.

335

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port provide details of the visits on Government business he has undertaken out of Gibraltar, with details of each destination, costs incurred and the purpose of each visit since he assumed office?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

340

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Yes, Mr Speaker, as the hon. Member knows by this stage, the information is already available on the Government's website.

345

Flight recording service
Accuracy of telephone information

Clerk: Question 825, the Hon. D J Bossino.

350

Hon. D J Bossino: I always forget to check the Government website before coming to the House. *(Laughter)*
Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port advise the House what arrangements are in place to ensure that the flight recording information, advertised through telephone number 8998, is accurate and current?

355

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

360

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Yes, Mr Speaker, the system was temporarily suspended due to technical reasons. The 8998 telephone service has now been restored and I am confident it is accurate and current.

365

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, there are two reasons why I ask this question. One is that I did come across press reports – in fact they were letters to the *Chronicle* – which raised serious concerns about the impact that false information or dated information provided by this telephone service could have on Gibraltar's reputation. The second reason is that I, myself, called the number and there was simply no reply. Can I ask the Minister whether he can advise this House when it was that the service was reinstalled?

370

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman is correct to say that the telephone service was temporarily suspended because it was not working properly and, as a result of the malfunction, it was suspended from Friday, 28th September to Tuesday, 16th October.

375

The reason for the malfunctioning of the service is essentially due to the transfer from one air terminal to the other. The new telephone system in the new terminal works over the internet and the service provided works on an analogue system. This has now been resolved and the way that we ensure that it is updated, so that there is no serious risk to the reputation of Gibraltar by virtue of a malfunctioning telephone service. I can assure the hon. Gentleman that it will be updated every morning, every time there is a change and then at the end of the operational day. To be doubly sure that there is nothing wrong, a duty manager will check it as well.

380

Monarch Airlines
Details of incentive scheme

385

Clerk: Question 826, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port advise whether any incentive was offered to Monarch Airlines in order to secure the Gibraltar to Birmingham route?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

390 **Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa):** Yes, Mr Speaker, all commercial discussions are sensitive, as these are part of the Government's continuing drive to increase air connectivity and the hon. Gentleman will, I hope, agree with me that to publicly announce across the floor of this House whether or not an airline enjoys an incentive scheme, if at all, will be to obliterate any negotiating advantage of Her Majesty's Government of Gibraltar in any such discussions.

395

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, I am sensitive to what the Hon. Minister has said.

400

As I understand the position from my own personal intelligence gathering, given that I have not held office previously, there was in fact an established incentive scheme which entailed things like, for example, offering reduced landing charges, and that is fine. The reason why I ask this question is whether this particular airline was offered anything over and above the established incentive scheme and if that entails an expenditure on the public purse, I think, Mr Speaker – and I say this with some trepidation because I am not aware of the ins and outs of how these things work – as an Opposition Member I am entitled to scrutinise the Government in relation to that.

405

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, to answer the first part of the hon. Gentleman's question, there is an incentive scheme which was devised by the GSD when in Government, an incentive scheme still today that continues to exist.

410

Now, in respect of whether any particular airline does enjoy an incentive package or not, I will need to insist to the hon. Gentleman that I will not provide any details because such discussions are confidential in nature.

415

But let me also remind the hon. Gentleman, in order that he appreciates that we are simply following a custom which was certainly practiced by the GSD when in Government, that the Hon. Mr Holliday, when Minister for Tourism, when asked by my hon. Friend, Dr. Joseph Garcia, 'Can the Government say how many airlines are interested in flying?' – forget the fact about commercial discussions and incentive schemes etc – 'how many airlines are interested in flying?', the then Minister for Enterprise said:

420

'The Government continues with its contacts and discussions. However, in common with my response in previous Parliamentary Questions, for reasons of commercial confidentiality it would not be appropriate for me to provide further information.'

And this relates to simply the number of airlines with which they are in discussions and not even such sensitive details in my submission as would be a commercial discussion on an incentive scheme.

425

Oil pollution Contracted services expenditure

430

Clerk: Question 827, the Hon. D J Bossino.

435

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port provide details as to what the contracted services expenditure under the 'oil pollution' Head set out in the Approved Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure 2012-13 relates to, to include to whom the services are contracted and the terms of the contract, including its duration and costs?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

440

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Yes, Mr Speaker, in the recurrent expenditure under Contracted Services, Item 21 states an estimated expenditure of £75,000. This amount relates to the contracts in place between Oil Spill Response Ltd (OSRL) and the Gibraltar Port Authority.

OSRL charge an annual fee for 'Associate Membership'. The contract is valid until 31st May 2013 and caters for OSRL's response for Tier 3 incidents.

445

OSRL charge the GPA an 'Annual Equipment Access fee'. The contract is valid until 22nd October of this year and caters for OSRL's response to Tier 2 oil spills.

OSRL also charges a 'Maintenance fee' for servicing and maintenance of GPA oil spill equipment.

450

Hon. D J Bossino: I did not quite take, Mr Speaker, full note, but I think there is a separate contractual relationship with OSRL in respect of one particular item and that is something to do with equipment, I think.

Hon. N F Costa: Yes, the Annual Equipment Access fee.

455 **Hon. D J Bossino:** That is right. In relation to that particular service, Mr Speaker, as I understand it, if I have understood the Hon. Minister correctly, that is due to end at some date in October. I have got a note of 26th October; it may have been 22nd October, this year. So this is next week.

Can I ask the Government what its intentions are in relation to that particular contract and whether the Minister intends to renew or perhaps look elsewhere.

460 **Hon. N F Costa:** Subject to any advice that the Captain of the Port may give me to the contrary, his advice to date has been that we renew the contract.

465 **Gibraltar Ship Registry
New registrations**

Clerk: Question 828, the Hon. D J Bossino.

470 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port advise this House how many of the new ships, which he has previously indicated would be registered during the course of the next year or so, have in fact already been registered?

475 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Yes, Mr Speaker, during my Budget speech in July of this year, I informed this House that given the global downturn in the economy, the number of ships on the Gibraltar Ship Registry had fallen by 3% from 316 in April of last year to 306 in April of this year, but that there had been an overall increase in the gross tonnage from 2.12 million to 2.37 million.

480 However, I said at the time of my Budget speech that the schedule for new ships indicated that 35 new ships, totalling over 700,000 gross tonnes would be registered with the Gibraltar Maritime Administration during the course of the financial year.

485 I am very pleased to inform the House that since 1st January of this year, exceeding the expectations that I noted in the Budget, 48 new ships have been registered, bringing the total number of vessels to 329 with a gross tonnage of 3.12 million. This, Mr Speaker, represents an increase of 7% in the number of vessels and 31.6% in gross tonnage and exceeds in six months the projected figure for the year by 13 ships and approximately 300,000 gross tonnage.

490 The above, Mr Speaker, certainly vindicates the Government's policy, announced in the Budget, in the marketing of Gibraltar as a safe, robust and reputable maritime administration.

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, I, of course, welcome the very good news which –

495 **Hon. N F Costa:** I am sure you do.

Hon. D J Bossino: Of course, I do, which the Minister has just given this House.

500 Because the reference to the 35 new ships was made, as the Minister correctly mentioned earlier in his answer, in the context of his Budget speech, it was also made in the particular context of the marketing exercise, if I can put it in those terms, which the GMA made to Germany, I think was what he said. (**Hon. N F Costa:** Yes.)

Can I ask of the 48 new ships, whether they all come from the same... or as a result of that particular marketing initiative?

505 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I will get for the hon. Gentleman the exact number... Well, no. I can tell him in fact that yes, they have been as a result of the marketing; but it is not just in relation to Germany because I said that the new ships had been registered from January of this year.

510 But in addition to the point that the hon. Gentleman makes, which is entirely correct, that the GMA went to Germany to meet existing clients and possible new ones, there was an innovation, once we came into Government, which was a visit made to Norway to meet new owners and, as I say, potential new owners. That is the answer to the question.

**Gibraltar Port Authority
Job vacancies**

515

Clerk: Question 829, the Hon. D J Bossino.

520

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port advise this House how many vacancies are currently available at the Gibraltar Port Authority and what the Government's intentions are in relation to the filling of these vacancies, if any?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

525

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the three vacancies currently available at the Gibraltar Port Authority are Admin/Finance Officer, Port Maintenance Fitter and a Bunkering Superintendent. It is the Government's intention to fill these vacant posts.

530

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, might I refer the Minister to the Budget Book. There is, under Heading 29, which is entitled 'Ports and Shipping', there is a reference, as the Minister well knows, under the particular caption 'Establishment' and in fact there was provision made for 2012-13 for one more staff member. Are these posts, which he has just referred this House to, included in those 18? Does he know?

535

I know I am being unfair to him in a sense that I have not given him notice of a rather specific question; but maybe he can assist. If he cannot, then I can always either write to him later or ask the question at the next sitting.

540

Hon. N F Costa: Yes, Mr Speaker, certainly given the very specific nature of the question, if he could either ask the question, with written notice, or correspond with my office and I will be sure to give him the answer immediately.

**Tourism, Public Transport and the Port
Meetings held with Captain of the Port**

545

Clerk: Question 830, the Hon. D J Bossino.

550

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port provide details as to the occasions he has met with the Captain of the Port since his appointment, to include the dates of these meetings?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

555

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, as the hon. Gentleman will recall, Captain Roy Stanbrook took post on 27th February of this year. It does give me great pleasure, once again, to be able to advise the House, and the hon. Gentleman opposite in particular, the frequency with which I meet the Captain.

560

I now read to him the number of times I met with the Captain on pre-scheduled meetings on a whole variety of different port-related subjects as follows: 21st March, 4.30; 22nd March, 9.00; 22nd March, 10.00; 22nd March, 3.30; 30th March, eight o'clock in the morning; 10th April, 4.30; 16th April, 4.00; 18th April, 5.30; 24th April, 9.30; 25th April, 3.30; 2nd May, 4.00; 2nd May, 4.30; 11th May, 9.30; 18th May, 11.00; 30th May, 5.00; 31st May, 2.00; 1st June, 9.00; 1st June, 10.00; 13th June, 3.00; 24th July, 4.00; 31st August, 9.30; 4th September, 3.30; 27th September, 3.00; 28th September, 4.30; 2nd October, 3.30; 10th October, one o'clock – I missed my gym session then! – 11th October, four o'clock.

565

Although, Mr Speaker, of course it goes without saying that I do meet with the Captain on more occasions, in impromptu unscheduled meetings, and that I talk to the Captain by telephone every other day, if not daily, in addition to e-mail and other correspondence.

570

It did occur to me, Mr Speaker, as I read the question, that perhaps the hon. Gentleman would suggest to me that I install a GPS on the Captain so he knows where he is. (*Banging on desks*)

575

Gibraltar Bus Company Limited
Availability of buses

580 **Clerk:** Question 831, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: Sorry there was a cough. Is it Question 831?

Clerk: Question 831.

585 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port advise how many buses of the Gibraltar Bus Company Limited are currently unavailable for use, with reasons for their unavailability?

590 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

595 **Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa):** Yes, Mr Speaker, at the time of preparing this answer, which was on the 11th of this month, the following vehicles were off-road as follows: one bus was undergoing a routine service and was back in service at the end of business on that same day; one bus is waiting for the transmission cable to arrive from the contractor supplier, and as from the 11th of this month the part should be in Gibraltar in two weeks' time and the fitting time is one day; one bus was undergoing a minor repair to rectify an air leak and was back in service on the same day.

600 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can I ask the Minister, who is conducting the repairs of the buses? I am just basing myself on a press statement, which the Government issued back on 27th June, to the effect that the contract with A M Capurro and Sons Ltd had been terminated. I am just wondering who is – is that the case...?

605 **Hon. N F Costa:** No, Mr Speaker, if I may just give way before he finishes the question. We have not issued a press statement to say that the contract with the Government's mechanics has been terminated. Just to rectify the hon. Gentleman before he asks me the question.

610 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, the premise of the question may have been based on incorrect information or misunderstanding of information provided by the Government because the question was going to be: which company was providing the maintenance service for the buses, assuming that A M Capurro were no longer providing it? It is the same company, is it?

Hon. N F Costa: It is the same company, Mr Speaker.

615

Gibraltar Bus Company Limited
Bus Route 7 set-up costs

620 **Clerk:** Question 832, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port provide details of the set-up costs for Bus Route 7?

625 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

630 **Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, yes, the total cost was £1,057.84, broken down as follows: £5.00 to effect the change of ownership transaction of bus G 8364A – this bus formerly belonged to the Gibraltar Bus Company and had been donated to the Elderly Care Agency by the previous administration when the three Mercedes were purchased; £50.00 to amend the Gibraltar Bus Company Limited operator's licence to include route 7; £627.84 paid to Argus Insurance for the vehicle to be included in the Fleet's Global Insurance; approximately £20.00, inclusive of in-house labour to affix the GBCL decals to the bus; £355.00 for a full mechanical service, that included replacing the alternator that was faulty.

635 It does give me a great pleasure, Mr Speaker, to be able to tell the hon. Gentleman that since the inception of the route, which started on 30th September of this year, there have been a total number of passengers of 1,944.

640 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.
That information is, in any event, on the Government's website.

Hon. N F Costa: I have seen it. (*Laughter*)

645 **Hon. D J Bossino:** I did check that one! I am glad that all my questions are giving him so much
pleasure in answering them. (*Interjection*)

650 **Gibraltar Bus Company Limited**
Qualifications of recently appointed managers

Clerk: Question 833, the Hon. D J Bossino.

655 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Further to Question 692/2012, can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and
the Port advise what qualifications the recently appointed managers to the Gibraltar Bus Company Ltd
hold which results in the Government being satisfied as to their promotions?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

660 **Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, as the hon.
Member will undoubtedly be aware, as a result of Question 692/2012, an extremely lengthy debate
ensued as to the selection of two gentlemen as Administration Manager and Operations Manager.

665 As was made eminently clear, I would have thought, during the course of that question-and-answer
session, it was an independent board of senior civil servants that were satisfied and made
recommendations to me, as a responsible Minister, which I accepted.

Ruling by Mr Speaker

670 **Mr Speaker:** Before we proceed with supplementary questions, there is something that I wish to
make absolutely clear.

675 This matter was debated at great length at the last meeting of the House. In fact, it was debated for
over an hour and a half – a record, I am sure, even for this Parliament – and something that certainly
would not be allowed in any parliament that is based on the Westminster model.

Accordingly, I have no intention of allowing a similar debate in the House today arising from
questions and answers.

680 If the hon. Member is not satisfied with my Ruling, there are two courses of action that he can take.
He can bring a substantive motion to the House, which we will debate in due course, or he can give notice
under Standing Orders 24A and 24B of his intention to raise what is a matter for him, and perhaps for the
public, of urgent public importance at the time when the House adjourns. That would mean in practice
that he could have an opportunity to do so, perhaps if the House is going to adjourn to next week for
Bills.

685 When Bills are introduced they are on the Agenda. After the Bills, I imagine that the adjournment of
the House would be to the following month. If the Bills are taken next week, he would have an
opportunity to debate this matter for 40 minutes at that time.

Hon. D J Bossino: I fully understand, Mr Speaker, why you have thought that you were pre-empting
a situation –

690 **Mr Speaker:** No. I am not pre-empting anything. I am pre-empting a debate. I am making clear under
what circumstances I will allow supplementary questions to be raised, but I am not going to allow the
debate anywhere near what happened at the last meeting of the House.

695 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I can assure the Chair, and Members opposite, that it was not my
intention to go down that particular route. My question is very specific and the Speaker will appreciate,
when I do ask my supplementaries, that it really relates to one particular issue, which is really the issue of
qualifications. In fact, I was going to preface my question with the expression of my personal intention
not to go down the more political debate, which this issue has engendered both inside of this House and
outside.

700 I can assure you –

Mr Speaker: I am very grateful.

705 **Hon. D J Bossino:** – Mr Speaker, that was my intention.

Mr Speaker: I am very grateful for that assurance.

710 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Although I take, Mr Speaker, your point, that was certainly not my intention, but let us see how matters proceed.

Gibraltar Bus Company Limited
Qualifications of recently appointed managers
Supplementary questions

715

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, I simply read the written reply given, or the prepared reply given to me, by the Minister where he said that the Gibraltar Bus Company therefore now has two specialised managers. Can I ask the Minister whether either one or both of these successful applicants are transport managers, as set out in the relevant statute provisions?

720

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, I refer the hon. Gentleman to the answer that I just gave.

725

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, the reason why I raise this point is because under the Transport Act, as the Minister I am sure is very much aware – and certainly I am because I was for many years in the Transport Commission – every transport undertaking, and I do not have the full technical jargon, but basically the Gibraltar Bus Company is a licensed undertaking, licensed by the Transport Commission pursuant to the Act, requires to have amongst its staff, transport managers. That is really why I am asking.

730

A ‘transport manager’ is a defined term in the Act, and I can take the Minister to the relevant provisions. This is precisely why I am asking the Minister whether the Gibraltar Bus Company has... Whether either of these two are considered the transport managers of the Bus Company or whether there is another or more than one individual who will be assigned a transport management role as the company is statutorily obliged to do? Because this then gives rise, Mr Speaker, to issues of qualification.

735

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, once again, I refer the hon. Gentleman to the answer I gave a few moments ago. The board comprised of the Senior MOT Examiner of the Government and it was partly on his recommendation that these two gentlemen were appointed.

740

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, I can well understand that the Minister follows a recommendation of the board; but as the elected individual who has political responsibility over this Company, he ought to have been on notice on an enquiry.

If a recommendation is made, he is entitled, surely, to say, ‘No. This chap or this person does not fit the bill because he is not sufficiently qualified to act as a transport manager.’

745

So it is not good enough for the Minister to simply stand up in this House and say, ‘I simply follow the recommendation of the board,’ if the recommendation which the board made could give rise to a situation, Mr Speaker, where the Gibraltar Bus Company is in *breach* of Gibraltar’s legislation.

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, I repeat what I have said in two supplementary questions.

750

Hon. P R Caruana: Mr Speaker, regardless of who has recommended and who has appointed, and regardless of the degree of interest that the Hon. Minister claims he took or did not take, can the Hon. Minister say whether he is aware what, if any, qualifications these people possess? And that is nothing to do with how and why they were selected or whether he accepted.

755

I am asking for information. Does he know whether... and if so, what qualifications the successful candidates appointed – however they may have been appointed, I do not care – possess?

760

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, this is all based on the premise and that supplementary from the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition is based on the premise of the question as asked by the hon. and Learned Mr Bossino, who referred to the definition of ‘transport manager’ under the Transport Act.

I think it is important that the House, if it is going to have this exchange about what qualifications, etc the Minister believes or checked the transport manager had, given that the transport manager is a defined term under the Act, that the House should know what the defined term actually is. It does not talk about qualifications or anything else. The Act says:

765

“Transport manager”, in relation to a business, means an individual who, either alone or jointly with one or more or other persons, has continuous and effective responsibility for the management of road passenger transport operations or road haulage operations of the business as the case may be.’

770

So the only reference to ‘manager’ is in the definition of ‘transport manager’, which then appears throughout the text as the person who is responsible for the management of that undertaking. There is no definition and in fact that could not be given, who is appointed as a transport manager in many of the transport companies that I have dealt with, in my many appearances before the Commission of which the hon. Member was made a member by the previous Administration, of any qualification required for somebody to be a transport manager.

775

Therefore, Mr Speaker, if the hon. Members *want* to ask the question that they seem to be wanting to pursue for the purposes that has become apparent in the press releases that they have issued on the subject and the exchanges that we have had in this House, then they need to accept that there is no pre-requisite of qualifications set out in the legislation which they are relying on in respect of transport managers.

780

Hon. P R Caruana: That is all very interesting, but completely inapposite to my question. I have not... My question is not premised on the assumption or even the insinuation that there is a requirement for qualification. I have asked a simple question. Regardless of the appointment and the methodology and all this, is the hon. Member aware whether these individuals possess qualifications and if so, what they are?

785

Regardless of whether they are necessary, unnecessary, properly or improperly... it is a perfectly simple factual question. I just do not see why there is such obtuseness in the attitude towards answering it. The answer could be, ‘Yes, they have qualifications and they are these’, or ‘I do not know whether they have qualifications or not’, or ‘They have no qualifications’. It is a factual question. It is not couched in any context of whether those qualifications are needed or not needed, whether they are sufficient or insufficient.

790

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, I think the position has been made now very clear by the Minister to date. I am grateful that the hon. Member has now taken a step back from this issue of qualifications and he now accepts that there is no question of qualifications –

795

Hon. P R Caruana: With respect, Mr Speaker, I am not taking any step back –

Hon. Chief Minister: The position has been made increasingly clear in this House, at the last Question Time; it has been made clear in exchanges of press releases; and it is clear now. The Minister has acted on the advice of a board that recommended that these gentlemen had –

800

Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment (Hon. J J Bossano): The necessary criteria.

805

Hon. Chief Minister: – the necessary... they fulfilled the necessary requirements to be recommended for these posts and the Minister, quite unlike perhaps Ministers in other governments who might have interfered in who gets the job, simply accepted the recommendations of the board.

So the answer given on a number of occasions previously and now, Mr Speaker, is that the Minister has accepted the board’s recommendations that these gentlemen were qualified to take those posts – full stop.

810

Hon. P R Caruana: Mr Speaker, does the Speaker now have an idea of why there are debates for an hour and a quarter which he is not willing to tolerate, because a perfectly simple question does not get a perfectly simple answer? Instead, Ministers resort to distorting the question, putting the question in a context in which the questioner did not put it, lecturing the Opposition about what is relevant and what is not relevant.

815

It is a perfectly simple question! Does the Hon. Minister know what, if any, qualifications these individuals possess? I am not interested... I do not know whether the Hon. the Chief Minister is right or wrong about whether qualifications are needed or not needed. The answer to that is not germane to the question that I have asked, which is a simple factual question.

820

Does the Hon. Minister know, regardless of whether they are necessary or not, whether these two individuals have any qualifications and if so, what they may be? (*Interjection*) Really, Mr Speaker, if he does not want to answer the question, which is becoming increasingly apparent, let him just *say so!* But

825 this smoke screen about whether the qualifications are necessary or not is *wholly irrelevant* to my question.

A Member: [*Inaudible*].

830 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I gave as the Minister had given, a straight answer to a crooked – (*Laughter*) That is why debates go on so long.

835 **Mr Speaker:** If the question is as simple as I understand it to be – ‘do these gentlemen have any qualifications?’ – as a school teacher, I would say that the Minister can investigate, can find out what qualifications they have. For instance, they may have NVQs, they may have a number of GCSEs or O-level or A –level – all those are qualifications. (*Interjection by Hon. P R Caruana*) Whether they are relevant or not is another matter and surely, that is information which the Government can obtain.

Hon. Chief Minister: Thank you very much.

840 **Mr Speaker:** That kind of information, the Government is in a position to obtain and provide to this House.

845 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am going to deal with the issue that the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition has raised, before dealing with your much more eminently sensible suggestion.

The hon. Member said, in the course of his intervention... and if he were to listen instead of sitting there making remarks, whilst I try to answer this question, or indeed as he did yesterday, taking a phone call *within the Chamber*, then we might be able to resolve matters more quickly. (*Interjection*) Yes it was – absolutely right, Mr Speaker. Mr Feetham is absolutely right, it was outrageous that the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition took a phone call in the Chamber, twice. (*Interjections*)

850 Anyway, Mr Speaker, as I was saying –

Mr Speaker: Order!

855 **Hon. Chief Minister:** I gave and the Hon. the Minister gave a perfectly straight answer to a crooked question. The position, Mr Speaker, in the question as asked and the answer as given, is entirely clear. You see, Mr Speaker, the question asks about what qualifications the recently appointed managers to the Gibraltar Bus Company hold, *which results in the Government being satisfied as to their promotions*.

860 Now, that question, Mr Speaker, is perfectly fully answered in the first answer. What the hon. Gentleman is now saying is ‘Well, what qualifications do they actually have?’ You are absolutely right, of course, Mr Speaker, that is a factual question, which does not relate to how the Government makes a determination about satisfaction as to promotions Mr Speaker.

865 The whole tenor of the debate in this House, since the hon. Members opposite decided that their direct system of appointment of people to be directors of company was better than an independent system which saw a board determine who should be qualified to do this, is to try in some way put those who have been appointed, or the qualification of those who have been appointed to take these roles, into question.

Of course, Mr Speaker, (*Laughter and interjections*) we are able to find out, but disconnect from – (*Laughter and interjections*)

870 Mr Speaker, you cannot have a debate with people talking over you. (*Interjection by Hon. P R Caruana*)

Mr Speaker: Clerk, would you please call the next Question.

875 **Further Ruling by Mr Speaker**

Clerk: Question 834, the Hon. D J Bossino. (*Interjection*)

880 **Mr Speaker:** No. We are proceeding with the next Question. The matter is degenerating into a debate which is not appropriate to Question Time, where supplementaries should be short, sharp and to the point.

Hon. P R Caruana: Well, Mr Speaker –

885 **Mr Speaker:** I warned hon. Members 15 minutes ago that I was not going to allow a debate of the nature that took place at the last meeting. I can see definite signs that it is heading in that direction and therefore I am exercising my right to call the next Question.

Clerk: Question 834.

890 **Hon. P R Caruana:** [*Inaudible*] because they time us out.

Mr Speaker: That is another matter. Whether the kind of information which the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition – which I think my common sense tells me, that it is within the realms of the Government obtaining that information – I think –

895

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): We will provide it...

Mr Speaker: My view is that that information should be provided to the House.

900

Hon. Chief Minister: And we will provide it, Mr Speaker.

Mr Speaker: Whatever O-levels in Spanish, English or whatever, let us have that information, by all means.

905

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker –

Mr Speaker: Other than that, I will not allow the matter to deteriorate further into a slanging match.

910

**Gibraltar Airport taxi service
Negotiations with Gibraltar Taxi Association**

915 **Clerk:** Question 834, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port provide details of the negotiations which he is currently holding with the Gibraltar Taxi Association, in order to address the problems being encountered in connection with the taxi service at Gibraltar Airport?

920

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, meetings are held regularly with the GTA, where issues regarding the taxi service are raised.

925 As I stated in answer to Question 597 of this year, the problems that are presently encountered at the Airport are no different to the problems that were encountered in the past under a GSD administration and unresolved.

930 Notwithstanding, the Government, in an effort to address common problems, has demarcated and placed proper signage to ensure that there is a dedicated lane for taxi pickup and drop-offs. Furthermore, in an effort to provide a more efficient taxi service, Government and the GTA are working solidly for the improvement of common scenarios that are constantly causing obstructions to the flows of traffic.

Let me add also, Mr Speaker, as I noted recently in a GBC interview that, given that negotiations are well advanced and progressed with the Gibraltar Taxi Association, I will be making a full statement in due course, once these are concluded.

935

Mr Speaker: Could I commend the Hon. Minister that he makes such a statement here in the House?

Hon. N F Costa: Yes, Mr Speaker.

940

Mr Speaker: Thank you.

Hon. D J Bossino: I am grateful, Mr Speaker.

There was just one word which I missed in his response. I am grateful to the Minister for his reply, but I think he mentioned, he said improvements of ‘something’ in our roads. Is it problems, did he say? I did not quite catch that particular word.

945

Hon. N F Costa: Is the hon. Gentleman referring to obstruction to the flow of taxis?

950 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Well, he itemised a list and the first reference was to proper signage; I think it came second.

Hon. N F Costa: Oh yes, I said ‘has demarcated and placed proper signage to ensure that there is a dedicated lane for taxi pickups and drop-offs at the Airport.’

955 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, is the dedicated lane already in place or is it something that forms part of the negotiations and the Government is working towards alongside the Gibraltar Taxi Association?

Hon. N F Costa: No, Mr Speaker, as I am advised, the dedicated lane already exists.

960

**Small boat marina
Plans to build; consultation**

965 **Clerk:** Question 911, the Hon. S M Figueras.

Hon. S M Figueras: Mr Speaker can the Deputy Chief Minister confirm whether the project to build a small boat marina will be going ahead and whether he has consulted with the residents of Europlaza in this context?

970 By way of clarification, I addressed the question to the Deputy Chief Minister, although I understand that it is the Minister for Tourism who will reply.

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

975 **Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, as the hon. Gentleman will remember, I have already answered both parts of this question in answer to Question 689/2012.

980 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, yes, however, I would be grateful if the Hon. Minister would be able to confirm whether there are any issues in relation to the access road for the proposed site of the marina itself and whether any other issues arise in respect of the ownership of that road, access, any of those details in particular.

985 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, it was in answer to a supplementary by the hon. Lady opposite that I explained that all interested parties will be consulted.

Hon. S M Figueras: Yes, I recall that supplementary and that reply indeed.

However, I merely wanted to clarify whether the Europlaza management company has been consulted since that question was asked last month, or at all?

990 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, as I am aware, there has not been communication yet, but most certainly as an affected party, there will be communication and consultation. (*Interjections*) If they are affected, I should add.

995 **Hon. S M Figueras:** And the one final point which was the purpose of originally drafting the question, asking it of the Deputy Chief Minister: is there any chance whatsoever that this project will not proceed, in light of any consultations that may be made with the public and other interested parties?

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, that is, by its very nature, a hypothetical question.

1000 **Hon. S M Figueras:** No, it is a matter of policy.

Hon. N F Costa: No, it is not.

1005 **Minister for Education, Financial Services, Gaming, Telecommunications and Justice (Hon. G H Licudi):** As a result of the consultation.

Hon. N F Costa: Yes.

Hon. S M Figueras: Perhaps I can clarify it for the hon. Member.

1010 Is it the Government's policy that, in the receipt of sufficient public consultation against the project, it will give way to that consultation and not proceed with the project?

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, if I may just clarify to the hon. Gentleman that I prefaced my remarks by saying that 'if there are any rights or issues affecting', so it is conditional on there in fact being...
1015 There may not be any issues at all, so I cannot answer the question the way that he has posed it, because he is predicating a hypothetical question on a conditional issue that may never arise.

Hon. G H Licudi: Mr Speaker, can I just add or clarify a particular point. It is the Government's full intention to proceed with the project as set out in the manifesto and to build a marina for small boats for at least 700 berths before the end of this current term. That is the Government's intention and that is what the Government is going to do.
1020

Hon. S M Figueras: Well, I am grateful for the answer and in light of the fact that the hon. Member has said that there may be no issues, I am happy to wait to see whether in fact any arise.
1025 So I am grateful.

Hon. G H Licudi: Mr Speaker, if there are issues they will be dealt with, but this marina will go ahead.

Hon. S M Figueras: Sorry, I just thought the underground parking by the Commonwealth Park was also going to go ahead.
1030

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Well, Mr Speaker, that is a snide remark which is unnecessary, because the hon. Gentleman has had explained to him a thousand times that the underground car park at the Commonwealth Park, which he likes to refer to constantly, if he checks the manifesto – which he does not like to do; he only likes to talk about the bit which is convenient to him – we say 'or will be provided elsewhere', which is what is happening.
1035

I am sorry, Mr Speaker, I have a very high regard for the hon. Gentleman, but he just does not seem to get it.

Hon. S M Figueras: I get it, but since we are not going to have a debate on the issue, Mr Speaker, I shall not entertain the Chief Minister's comments.
1040

Hon. Chief Minister: Well, then, don't make snide remarks about the Commonwealth Park.
1045

Gibraltar Airport Service level agreements

1050 **Clerk:** Question 913, the Hon. D J Bossino. (*Interjections*)

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Government provide details of the service level agreements which have been entered into with different contractors in relation to Gibraltar Airport to include the services to be provided and costs?
1055

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, I now hand the hon. Gentleman a schedule with information requested.
1060

SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 913/2012

The Service Level Agreements that GATL has negotiated are:

Dematic Logistic System SA	- Baggage Systems	-	€199,950.00 PA
G4S Gibraltar	- Fire Systems	-	£ 23,000.00 PA
Indra Systemas SA	- Specialist IT Systems	-	€308,271.80 PA
Schindler (Gib) Ltd	- Mechanical Elevators	-	£144,052.08 PA
Sheriff Electrical Contractors Ltd	- Mechanical and Electrical Systems	-	£283,511.40 PA
COTELSA SA	- Security Screening Equipment	-	€ 94,700.00 PA

**New Air Terminal
Further planned works**

1065 **Clerk:** Question 914, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Government provide details of the further works which are planned at the new Air Terminal in order to enhance, as the Government has described it, the passenger experience, to include details of the costs?

1070 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port.

Minister for Tourism, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the planned works involve airside weather cover for passengers transiting between parked aircraft and the terminal and a landside weather cover between the terminal and the forecourt for passengers and airport users who are entering or leaving the building – none of which, I must say surprisingly, was provided for in the original design.

1075 These works are at the design stage. The costing for these works will not be ready until these are finalised.

1080 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, the obvious supplementary is does the Minister have any indication as to when he thinks they will be finalised?

1085 **Hon. N F Costa:** No, Mr Speaker, I cannot give the hon. Gentleman an estimate at this point.

Procedural

1090 **Mr Speaker:** Could I ask Members, when asking or answering questions, to try to speak up, because in some cases, particularly if you are fairly tall, there is a distance between yourself and the microphone, because those are meant for people speaking when they are sitting down. So there is a problem and I think you need to raise your voice slightly.

1095 **Clerk:** Thank you.

ENTERPRISE, TRAINING AND EMPLOYMENT

1100

**Future Job Strategy
Numeracy, literacy and IT courses**

1105 **Clerk:** Question 846, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond: Mr Speaker, further to the answer provided to Question 720/2012, can the Minister for Training say when he will be in a position to confirm whether numeracy, literacy and IT courses that were on offer at Bleak House for those on the VTS will be offered to trainees on the Future Job Strategy?

1110 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment.

Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, before I answer the question, can I just put on record my welcome and congratulations. I am sorry I missed your 'enthronement' yesterday.

1115 **Mr Speaker:** Thank you very much. I much appreciate seeing that we both go back to 1972!

1120 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Absolutely, we arrived at the place at the same time!
Mr Speaker, I am not able to provide the date.

Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond: Mr Speaker, in last month's Parliament session, the Hon. Minister said he was looking into how he could provide the equivalent to those in the new system. Could the Hon. Minister perhaps update us on how they are looking into providing these courses for the new trainees?

1125

Hon. J J Bossano: There are a number of factors. One of these is, for example, that some of the trainees are very... There are a number of factors, because all these trainees really have got periods in ETCL, which are negotiated with the prospective employer.

1130

So, for example, if we have got people who are only three months, then it would be a matter for where the employer is interested in them being there and continuing to be in the course after the three months. So we are really looking primarily at those who have got an 11-month period under training, or more.

1135

A lot of them are people that are in apprenticeship courses of the ETCL, and a big chunk of those coming in, in September and October, are going to be people primarily in the construction industry. Again, there has to be an analysis of whether taking time out of the construction training to do this would be of benefit to them or not.

We are looking at the early school leavers to give them priority and the ETCL employees who for example are identified as needing English, Maths or ICT because of the nature of the job for which they are being trained will also be in the selected group.

1140

So we actually expect that when this is ready to start for the ETCL, it would probably start earlier for those in supported employment, where these considerations do not apply and that could happen quite soon. But in the ETCL, once this gets going, what we expect is that it will be covering much bigger classes than used to be the case before, when it was limited to the VTS.

1145

Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond: Mr Speaker, would the Hon. Minister consider evening classes perhaps for those who are working during the day and who would wish to do a numeracy or literacy course?

1150

Hon. J J Bossano: Yes, I am quite happy to have a look at that. I do not think it is something that has been considered.

Thank you.

1155

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, with your leave, may I... because I did offer last time round and if the Minister for Employment wanted to, I could have a coffee to exchange some views with him (**Hon. J J Bossano:** Yes.)

1160

What I recall, in my days as a civil servant with a certain responsibility for the trainees undergoing NVQs, validated by City and Guilds, which I know the Hon. Minister very much favours that awarding body, (**Hon. J J Bossano:** Yes.) those doing the construction trade, there was a recommendation, if not a statutory obligation – I am not absolutely certain – from City and Guilds that apprentices undertaking Levels 1 and 2 in their craft should undergo some literacy and numeracy training, which made a lot of sense. A trainee carpenter should at least attain a Level 1 in numeracy, when it comes to measurements and so on.

1165

So it is more perhaps advice than a question. Perhaps the Hon. Minister may wish to have an opportunity of us having a coffee together, so I can further explain how we can enhance the NVQ qualification, more so, because we are both mutually agreed that the City and Guilds still carries a very good reputation by name and would be beneficial for our future workers.

1170

Hon. J J Bossano: Yes, I am grateful to the hon. Member for his offer to share his knowledge and experience with me in this area. He knows I have just got back, but I promise him we will have the coffee as soon as I can make it. I promise him that.

**Future Job Strategy employees
Employers who have signed contracts with ETCL**

1175

Clerk: Question 847, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1180

Hon. D A Feetham: Is the Minister for Employment now in a position to provide a list of names of employers who have signed contracts with Employment and Training Company Limited in respect of the Future Job Strategy employees?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment.

1185 **Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment (Hon. J J Bossano):** No, Mr Speaker.

Hon. D A Feetham: We had some exchanges last time round. What I would like to know is, how does the Government differentiate, as a matter of policy, between the provision of this information – in other words – the identities of these companies who have entered into contracts with what is a wholly owned Government company and the provision of all the other information that the Government gives, in terms of who has entered into contracts, with either the Government or other Government-owned companies? How do you differentiate where in the former you have explained that you are going back to all these companies, but in the latter you provide the information? How do you justify not providing the information to this House?

1195 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, Mr Speaker, these companies are companies that are co-operating with the Government in the introduction of training opportunities. They may wish or they may not wish their names to be public.

1200 What I told the hon. Member opposite in the last question was that the companies would be contacted and asked, and if they say they are quite happy for their names to be published, we will publish them. I have not yet got the information of those who are happy to have it published.

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, I have seen the letter and I am not going to go into the letter, because it will be subject to a statement outside this House next week. But you still have not answered the question because...

1205 Is the answer this, then: that what you are saying is that these types of companies are in a special category of case and therefore there is no obligation on the Government to provide that information? That is the question, but surely, that cannot be right, can it, on the basis that these are, after all, companies that are having their labour subsidised? It is not that these companies are doing a favour to the Government, according to how the scheme works. They are having their labour subsidised by the Government actually paying for these trainees.

1210 So again I ask him, how does he justify it?

Hon. J J Bossano: Mr Speaker, given that the hon. Member first asked the question and gives himself the answer and now wants me to explain, 'How do I justify the answer that he has just given himself?', well, because that is not the answer that I give him.

1215 The answer that I give him is that, as far as we are concerned, we are very grateful to the 140 of over 1,000 that have come forward and accepted taking trainees on, which they normally take in addition to their workforce, not in substitution of. This is not that somebody says, 'Well look, I need 10 workers: send me 10 free workers.' This is the same as was happening before with the VTS, but fundamentally, with a requirement that the training will carry with it a job guarantee – something that the hon. Member first of all claimed was not going to happen and then claimed the guarantee was worth nothing.

1220 So given the fact that it he has been hyper-critical of the scheme, I am not very sure that the people that have been good enough to enter into partnership agreement... and I welcome that they have done that, because they are helping us to replace having to import workers, by giving opportunities to workers in Gibraltar that have been unemployed, in some cases for years. Therefore, with their agreement, I will make their names public and if they prefer that their names should not be made public, I will not make them public.

1225 The fact that the hon. Member thinks that I am subsidising their businesses, which presumably is now a new interpretation to make the scheme capable of being criticised on different grounds, presumably the next thing will be to tell me that it is against EU competition policy. So the answer is that I do not agree with the answer he has given himself and therefore I do not need to justify his own answers.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, I always rise in trepidation when I ask questions of him, because the hon. Gentleman is likely to go 'supernova' on me any minute. (*Interjection*)

1235 Does or does he not accept that these companies are having their labour subsidised to the extent that the Government is actually paying for these trainees and it is not the company that is paying for their training, it is the Government that is paying for their training? Does he not accept that?

1240 **Hon J J Bossano:** No, Mr Speaker, I do not accept that.

Hon. D A Feetham: So is it his position that, effectively, these companies are doing a favour to the Government by taking on these trainees?

1245 **Hon. J J Bossano:** My position is that the 140 employers out of the 1,100 that are in Gibraltar are being public spirited and public minded in accepting giving Gibraltarians the opportunity to obtain skills

which will enable them to obtain employment. I regret that the 900 that are not being as civic minded and as civic spirited are still continuing to import labour from outside and discriminating against our own people. Therefore, he should be welcoming the fact that this is happening, instead of trying to pick holes in it.

1250

**Future Job Strategy trainees
Government contracts**

1255

Clerk: Question 848, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1260

Hon. D A Feetham: Is the Government in a position to state how many employers who have signed contracts with Employment Training Company Limited in respect of the Future Job Strategy trainees have the benefit of a contract with the Government, any public authority or Government-owned company for the provision of goods and/or services with a value of £2,000? I should have said 'or over'. It does not say that, but that is really the intention.

1265

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment.

1270

Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, I am informed by the Procurement Department and other Government Departments that out of 140 employers with a partnership agreement, there are only 10 employers who benefit from Government contracts which are in fact 10, instead of eight that I mentioned in my answer. So outside the construction sector there does not appear to be any of the 140. That is the information I have got. It is not...

Hon. D A Feetham: So the answer is 10 within the construction industry?

1275

Hon. J J Bossano: The last time the hon. Member asked there were eight and now there are 10 in the construction industry. According to the information that has been provided to my Department from others there do not appear to be in any other areas, just the 10 in the construction.

Hon. D A Feetham: Could he please identify these 10 employers?

1280

Hon. J J Bossano: I have not got the information with me; but I will only identify them if they are employers that say they are not in the area of having trainees. That is to say, there will be people who have no longer got the trainees and have got construction, but until they tell me 'yes' or 'no' on the letters that I have sent, I will not identify them. I do not have the names here anyway.

1285

Hon. D A Feetham: I have to say that I really do think that it is an offence to this Parliament that you should make your answers dependent and conditional on whether somebody outside this House actually consents to you providing the information or not; but you see, in relation to this particular aspect, this is one step removed from the previous.

1290

Hon. J J Bossano: I accept that.

Hon. D A Feetham: In the previous, I asked you if these are just trainees. The reason I ask –

1295

Mr Speaker: Hon. Member, I have noticed that sometimes you address the Chair and sometimes you address the Hon. Mr Bossano directly. Will you please address the Chair, because that is a requirement of Standing Orders, and it helps to keep the temperature down.

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, Mr Speaker, perhaps the –

1300

Mr Speaker: The hon. Members should not address each other directly across the floor. They should do so through the Speaker.

1305

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, absolutely. I have been speaking into my microphone because you have been telling me earlier that the microphones have not been working properly. (*Interjection*) But I will ask the question from the Chair.

The previous question that I asked was one step removed. Those were about companies that have taken on trainees. This question is companies taking on trainees that have the benefit of Government

contracts in the construction industry. What possible reasonable explanation could there be for the non-provision of that information to this Parliament? That is the question I am asking the Hon. the Minister.

1310

Hon. J J Bossano: Mr Speaker, the hon. Member must know that the fact that he or any other Member of the Opposition asks a question – the same as has been the case for the preceding 39 years – does not require the Government to provide the information that the hon. Member is seeking. That is to say that to say I will not give the answer that the hon. Member wants *is* to answer the question.

1315

I have already told the hon. Member that everybody that has trainees has been approached by me on the basis that I do not believe the fact that they take trainees on is something that imposes an obligation on the Government to publish the names of those. There might be somebody who is willing to take on trainees, but does not want his name to be known and will not take them on if I produce the name. So that is a policy decision that we have taken in the ETB, that the request for the publication of the names is something that we will only do if the person consents and has no objection to the names being published.

1320

As regards which are the 10 of the contractors on the approved list that have got contracts with the Government when the question was being asked, I accept that there is a difference in the sense that the persons concerned have got the benefit of a contract with the Government; but nevertheless, what I have told the hon. Member is that I will decide what to do in answer to this question once I hear from the 10, and by that time, they may not have a contract with the Government.

1325

The hon. Member has to understand that these are not people who have got long-term contracts to produce anything; they are people who put tenders. That is to say the fact that they have got a trainee does not automatically mean that they have got the contract; it means that they are allowed to submit bids for the work. Therefore the ten that have got it today may not have work next month, or may do. Just to put the matter in its proper context.

1330

The answer that I am giving him – whether he likes it or he does not, it is a matter for him – is that when I have heard from the 10 employers, in addition to all the others, then I will decide whether in the case of a person who has got a contract I should inform the person that I will make the information – about the fact that they have got a contract – public, independent of whether they think their names should be made public as regards their giving trainees an opportunity.

1335

Hon. D A Feetham: I have to say that if these companies did not have trainees and I asked about the contracts, it would be disclosable in this House anyway and habitually, Governments on both sides of the House and of both political persuasions, have actually provided that information. I do not understand why the hon. Gentleman does not want to provide it.

1340

But can he answer this: is the Government's policy to look more favourably upon companies when it comes to, for example, the provision of contracts, particularly actually in the construction sector that may employ Future Job Strategy trainees, than those who do not?

1345

Hon. J J Bossano: No, the policy is that we look more favourably to those who employ resident workers, irrespective of whether they take on trainees or not. But of course we ask the people in the construction industry to take on trainees otherwise we would not be able to improve on the dismal record of having produced, for example, this year, two painters and one bricklayer as a total of output of training of construction workers. That has got to be dramatically increased and it can only be dramatically increased with the cooperation of the employers, who have got no obligation to take on trainees.

1350

**Future Job Strategy
Number of trainees employed permanently**

1355

Clerk: Question 849, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1360

Hon. D A Feetham: Can the Minister for Employment state how many Future Job Strategy trainees have been employed permanently since the 1st February 2012, broken down by month and indicating whether these have been employed in the private or public sector, including the Civil Service, any Government Department or Authority and the GDC.

1365

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment.

Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, there are 37 former GRAD employed in the private sector and zero in the public sector.

The breakdown by month is: February, three; March, two; April, seven; May, four; June, six; July, five; August, five; and September, five.

1370 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Thirty-seven out of a figure of 450 odd that started on the scheme is obviously a low figure. I am not criticising the scheme by saying that. It is, I think, a fact. Is that because the 11 months' training period has not actually expired and that the Minister would expect, after 11 months, that that number from 37 would shoot up considerably?

1375 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, yes, of course, that is indeed the case because there are many more people that are covered by partnership agreements than the 37. The 37 are the result of the fact that this started in February, and in February three were taken on, which in fact was the employer taking on people when they had no obligation to do so and really the take-up would only have started after the first month.

1380 Even in March, which was when the first agreements were signed, two were taken on. In fact the reality of it is that initially, when we had less people coming in, we were giving 11-month agreements and now we are trying to get employers to commit to an earlier period in areas where the training does not have to really last 11 months simply because we want to be able to put more people through the system.

1385 **Hon. D A Feetham:** What about the trainees in the public service, because the majority of the trainees were in fact placed in the public service, as I recall from answers that the Hon. the Minister gave me earlier on this year?

1390 How do you think that those trainees are going to fair? Is it envisaged that a number of them are going to be employed within the public service – at the moment it is zero – for example, via the newly introduced AA grade or is the intention of the Minister to try and eventually move them on to the private sector via partnership agreements with the private sector?

Hon. J J Bossano: No, there is no public sector partnership agreement, that is to say –

1395 **Hon. D A Feetham:** No, private sector partnership agreements, in other words –

Hon. J J Bossano: No, the trainees that are at the moment within the public sector do not have a partnership agreement and do not have a job –

1400 **Hon. D A Feetham:** I understand that.

1405 **Hon. J J Bossano:** – and they will not be put in partnership agreement with the private sector because in fact they have already been given training. They will be offered to employers who open vacancies on the basis that the experience that they have gained in the employment departments where they were placed will in fact no longer debar them, as it was the case before that people were saying, 'Well, look, I want somebody to be a receptionist, but they have never worked on a reception before.' Well, now they have worked in a reception before and now the employer can no longer say, 'I do not want them because they have got no experience.' That is the methodology that will mean that the employees will be *available* for vacancies that come to the Department, where we have now got a proactive system where employers are actually called up individually when a vacancy comes in. We make sure that the vacancy is a real one and that they have not got somebody in the pipeline already and therefore we do not want them to waste our time or to have people being discouraged by going to place after place after place and getting nowhere.

1410 Where the employer says, 'Yes, I really want somebody,' then we send him some of the people that we have got and some of the people who are unemployed that we have not trained, and that is how they come off the list. They are also, of course, on their own initiative, able to apply for anything that comes up advertised like everybody else in Gibraltar.

1420 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, he has dealt with the situation of a trainee who is based in the public service, who has been trained in the public service, and then if a vacancy arises in the private sector, you are effectively moving that person into the private sector, having, according to you, trained them in the public sector – but, of course, there are a substantial number of people within the public sector.

1425 Is the intention of the Government to effectively have a situation where all those within the public sector will be eventually moved to the private sector; or does he envisage that some of the ones that are in the public sector will actually be employed within the public sector?

1430 Let me tell you why I ask the question; because obviously it is a matter of interest; but there are some trainees who are in the public sector who are suggesting that when they were placed in the public sector, they were told, 'If you are good enough for the job that you are being placed in within the public sector, you will then be eventually taken on within the public sector.' I just want some clarity in relation to this issue, so of course the trainees out there that may be listening to this debate or maybe reading the press know what their position is very clearly.

1435 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, I think the position is crystal clear. Whoever told them that had no authority to do so and they are employees of a company called ETCL. It is their employer who tells them what the terms are under which they are being employed – *except*, of course, where people are being trained for specific jobs like the carers in the Care Agency. There, we are training them to be carers and, therefore,
1440 you cannot say to them, ‘And now, you go and be a receptionist’, or the people who are in fact in the School of Nursing, where again we are training them to be nurses, and we are the only employer of nurses in Gibraltar. But where they are being given generic administrative skills, the answer is there is no guarantee of employment and they should not expect a guarantee of employment, because it is not there. What they have got is in fact a better opportunity of obtaining a job, when they apply for a job, because they are able to put in their CV the time that they spent in different Government Departments. They spend a few months in the Treasury...

This was going on, on a limited scale, under the VTS scheme for people who are doing a course on business studies. Effectively, what we have got now is a much bigger pool of people doing it.

1445

**Future Job Strategy
New placements since 1st March 2012**

1450 **Clerk:** Question 850, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1455 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Divided by month, can the Minister for Employment state how many people have been allowed onto the Future Job Strategy scheme for the first time since the 1st March 2012 and (a) placed with a private company with a signed contract between the employer and ETCL; (b) placed with a private company without a signed contract between the employer and ETCL; and (c) placed in the public sector?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment.

1460 **Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, the breakdown of the persons employed by month is as follows:

(a), that is placed in the private sector with a contract, March, 19; April, 20; May, 35; June, 31; July, 19, August, 19; September, 9; and October, 12.

1465 In the private sector without a partnership agreement yet being signed: March, 4; April, 3; May, 9; June, 4; July, 5; August, 4.

In the public sector the placements are: March, 17; April, 19; May, 21; June, 11; July, 15; August, 4; September, 8; and October, 14.

1470 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Will you please give me the totals for (a), (b) and (c)?

Hon. J J Bossano: It is not on the paper, I am afraid, down here. I will have to calculate it by adding them up.

1475 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I do not have a schedule containing the answer, so I cannot –

Hon. J J Bossano: If somebody brings me a calculator, I will do it for him.

Mr Speaker: It is 302.

1480 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, 302 in total; I asked for the total in (a), the total in (b), and the total in (c).

Mr Speaker: They are 164, 29 and 109.

1485 **Hon. D A Feetham:** I am very grateful, Mr Speaker.

Hon. J J Bossano: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1490 **Hon. D A Feetham:** In relation to in fact any of these, I presume that some of these were in fact trainees that were already on the VTS scheme as at the 1st February 2012 or am I wrong? Are they new intakes on the scheme?

1495 **Hon. J J Bossano:** No, they are people who were not in the scheme already in January, but there were people who were already on the waiting list in January. That is in January, when the new scheme was started, there were people who had been in the old scheme for a number of months and were now coming to their termination date, then they were transferred to the new one and effectively given... We ignored the period they had spent previously and they were given a second opportunity in February.

1500 Then, in March, we started taking the people who had been on the Bleak House waiting list, who were not included as part of the unemployed and were due to enter the old VTS. Those, of which there was something like 90, I believe, from memory, are included in this list.

1505 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Could the hon. Gentleman explain why there are 29 placements with companies and there is no contract between ETCL and that company, bearing in mind that the Government's policy is to require a repayment of the training of... effectively, the training subsidy, if that individual is not taken on at the end of the training?

1510 **Hon. J J Bossano:** The answer is quite simple, that the people in the system that should have made sure that the partnership agreements were signed overlooked these cases and that is now being put right. There is no reason why they should not and if they do not, they will have the trainees removed.

Future Job Strategy scheme Waiting list

1515 **Clerk:** Question 851, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1520 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Minister for Employment state whether his Department keeps a list of people waiting to go on to the Future Job Strategy scheme and if so, what is the number of people waiting to do so?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment.

1525 **Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, there is no separate list.

1530 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, how does the Hon. the Minister and his Department actually decide who goes onto the Scheme in any particular month, and who does not? There must be a system for actually determining who are the meritorious cases or... either it must be done by some merit based on the amount of time that person may be on an unemployment list or some other method.

I am just asking, how does he determine it?

1535 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, I do not determine it, obviously Mr Speaker. This is something that... I am not sitting there, sifting who gets on the list – and who does not get on any list. **(A Member: [inaudible])** I employ people to do that.

I take it that the laughter is that the hon. Member does not believe me, but then I never believed anything he ever said, when he was in Government, so I will not recriminate him for it.

1540 Mr Speaker, the methodology is quite simple, it is demand led. I have explained that to him before, that is to say, when somebody comes into the system requiring labour, we approach him on the basis of meeting his future labour requirements. We are going to be doing this in different areas. Predominantly, it is still the construction industry, because this is where the greatest opportunity exists, but we want to do it in retailing and in other areas.

1545 We therefore talk to the employers. That is, we the Department, the employment officers in the Department, talk to the employers about the possibility of taking on trainees and send them suitable candidates – that is, candidates that the Department... When somebody comes and registers as unemployed, the procedure that has always been followed is that they give an indication of the area of work in which they consider that they would like to work, and we also take into account the area of work in which they have worked previously, so a combination of three factors operate: the previous history of employment of the person; the area of interest of employment of the person; and the selection by the employer. Sometimes we will get approached by employers who may know of unemployed people that
1550 they would be willing to take on as trainees, to the extent that it is possible, we try and encourage employers to give an opportunity to people that have been either unemployed for a long time or that have come out of having had convictions or that have got... So we try, but we cannot in fact force employers to do [inaudible] but we do try to persuade them to take those on, wherever it is possible, as trainees.

1555 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, I wish the hon. Gentleman all the luck in the world in relation to the placement of these individuals within the construction industry, and I hope that the construction industry will be buoyant in the future, because I am told that at the moment, it is rather flat.

1560 But there must be some form of – perhaps not, but there must be some form of list that the ETB must keep that effectively lists individuals with... for example, in relation to the construction industry, the majority of people that you would place in the construction industry are probably people who are interested in training in construction skills. They may have no skills, a lot of them may have no qualifications in terms of O-Levels. There is a profile to those kinds of individuals.

1565 But does that list exist, so that the people within a particular profile, one chooses them off a list in accordance with how much time, for example, they are spending or is this effectively done rather less systematically than that, by some official who may say, ‘Well, look, I remember that there is this individual here that we have got and we interviewed last week’? What is the system that is in place?

1570 **Hon. J J Bossano:** The case of the construction industry, which is the one on which, as I have mentioned in the past, we are putting greater emphasis on and when we make progress there, we hope to move to other areas, there is a dedicated officer, who was previously in the construction industry training centre, who keeps the list of everybody that has either worked or is interested in working in the construction industry. He sends a number of people from that list and the employer then picks the person that they want. So we may send 10 and they take one, as a trainee. That is the way it is done.

1575

**Gibraltar Development Corporation
Board meetings since 1st January**

1580 **Clerk:** Question 853, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Can the Minister for Employment please state how many times the board of the GDC has met since the 1st January 2012, with the dates of those meetings?

1585 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment.

Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment (Hon. J J Bossano): Yes, Mr Speaker, the board of the GDC has met on six occasions since the 1st January, on the following dates: 21st May, 16th July, 31st August, 17th September, 28th September... I will read that again. I had not switched it on!

1590 The board of the GDC has met on six occasions since 1st January 2012, on the following dates: 21st May, 16th July, 31st August, 17th September, 28th September, 9th October.

Hon. D A Feetham: Did you just say 19th October?

1595 **Hon. J J Bossano:** *Ninth.*

Hon. D A Feetham: I notice on the *Gazette* that the composition of the board has recently been changed and that now the position is that there are four or five Government Ministers on the board. What I did not notice from the actual *Gazette* is, who is the secretary of the board, which is a statutory requirement. Is the hon. Gentleman able to help me with that?

1600

Hon. J J Bossano: Yes, the secretary is the Acting Head of the Employment Service.

Hon. D A Feetham: Which is who?

1605

Hon. J J Bossano: Well, it is the senior civil servant in the Department, Denise Chipolina.

1610

**Guaranteed Superannuation Fund
Number of employees opting in**

Clerk: Question 854, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1615 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Has the Government now set up the Guaranteed Superannuation Fund and how many (a) public service employees and (b) private sector employees have opted to take advantage of it?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment.

1620 **Minister for Enterprise, Training and Employment (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, the Guaranteed Superannuation Fund has been in place since 1st January 2012. Up to 30th September, 464 public service employees and seven private sector employees have joined it.

1625 **Clerk:** That completes answers to Oral Questions.

Questions for Written Answer

1630 **W178/2012 withdrawn**

Clerk: Answers to Written Questions, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

1635 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, before the hon. Gentleman rises to give the answers to Written Questions, may I withdraw Written Question 178.

Minister for Education, Financial Services, Gaming, Telecommunications and Justice (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, I am grateful.

1640 **Answers to Written Questions tabled**

1645 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to table the answers to Written Questions numbered W143/2012 to W179/2012 inclusive, except for W178/2012 which I have removed from the bundle after the withdrawal of it.

1650 **Adjournment**

Clerk: The Hon. the Chief Minister.

1655 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that the House do now adjourn *sine die*, and congratulate you on your first sitting of this Parliament as Speaker.

Mr Speaker: I now propose the question, which is that this House do now adjourn *sine die*. I now put the question, which is that this House do now adjourn *sine die*. Those in favour. (**Members:** Aye.) Those against. Passed.

1660 This House will now adjourn *sine die*.

The House adjourned at 11.35 a.m.