



PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

AFTERNOON SESSION: 3.00 p.m. – 5.50 p.m.

Gibraltar, Thursday, 20th February 2014

Business transacted

| | |
|--|----|
| Questions for Oral Answer | 3 |
| Chief Minister..... | 3 |
| Q205/2014 Borders and Coastguard Agency – Employment structure | 3 |
| Q206/2014 GBC – Plans to make entirely self-sufficient..... | 6 |
| Q205/2014 continued – Borders and Coastguard Agency – Employment structure..... | 6 |
| Q207/2014 Previous Speaker’s tax affairs – Report into leak of information | 7 |
| Q208/2014 Affordable homes available for sale – Ownership terms | 7 |
| Q209/2014 Foreign investors – Government plans..... | 8 |
| Q210-223/2014 Sunborn floating hotel project – Works at Ocean Village Marina; details and costs.. | 10 |
| Q224-228/2014 Credit Finance Company Limited – Commuted pensions; loans..... | 12 |
| Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety | 15 |
| Q185 and Q188/2014 Business start-ups and nurture schemes – Benefit to new companies | 15 |
| Q186/2014 Gaming industry and Employment Service – Provision of liaison service | 20 |
| Q187/2014 Public and private sectors – Number of people currently employed..... | 22 |
| Q189/2014 Sunborn floating hotel project – Update on recruitment process | 22 |
| Q190-191/2014 Leisure Construction & Maintenance Company Limited – Details of employees and directors | 25 |
| Q192/2014 Accident on scaffolding erected at Laguna Estate – Submission of incident report | 28 |
| Q190-191/2014 continued – Leisure Construction & Maintenance Company Limited – Details of employees and directors..... | 28 |
| Q193-194/2014 Scaffolding erected in Gibraltar – Inspected and certified..... | 29 |
| Q195/2014 Future Job Strategy – Total cost to taxpayer..... | 29 |
| Q196-199/2014 Gibraltar Savings Bank – Value of debentures; breakdown of debt | 31 |
| Q200/2014 Personnel in public service – Increase in numbers..... | 32 |
| Deputy Chief Minister | 33 |
| Q201/2014 Gibraltar Civil Aviation – Security screening | 33 |

| | |
|---|----|
| Q200/2014 continued – Personnel in public service – Increase in numbers | 38 |
| Q201/2014 continued – Gibraltar Civil Aviation – Security screening | 41 |
| Q202-203/2014 – Erection of scaffolding – Government and private projects..... | 41 |
| Q204/2014 – Government projects – Scaffolding costs; contractor..... | 47 |
| Questions for Written Answer | 50 |
| Q204/2014 continued – Government projects – Scaffolding costs; contractor | 50 |
| adjournment..... | 50 |
| <i>The House adjourned at 5.50 p.m.</i> | 50 |

The Gibraltar Parliament

The Parliament met at 3.00 p.m.

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: M L Farrell Esq RD *in attendance*]

Questions for Oral Answer

CHIEF MINISTER

Q205/2014

**Borders and Coastguard Agency –
Employment structure**

Clerk: Answers to Oral Questions continued.
Question 205 of 2014, the Hon. D J Bossino.

5 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister with responsibility for Aviation provide details of the employment structure at the Borders and Coastguard Agency to include the number of grades and how many are employed in each of those grades, together with their duties and responsibilities?

Clerk: Answer the Hon. the Chief Minister.

10 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I will now hand the hon. Member a schedule containing the information requested.

Answer to Question 205

| <u>GRADES</u> | <u>Nos Employed</u> | <u>Duties and Responsibilities</u> |
|-------------------------|---------------------|---|
| Chief Executive Officer | 1 | CEO Duties |
| Duty Manager | 3 | <p>Immigration Responsible for the control of people entering Gibraltar via its borders. Responsible for the supervision and operation of the checking and deciding the right of entry to all individuals entering Gibraltar. Responsible for the accurate examination of travel documents. Supervising and coordinating the collection of intelligence for the RGP, SB and CSRO as required. Supervising and coordinating the arrangement for the repatriation of those who have arrived without a valid travel document or in breach of immigration laws. Security Managing all security measures taken in all entry points. Conducting daily security inspections. Manage the review and collation of all security CCTV footage. Responsible for the recording and reporting of prohibited articles confiscated during the course of an x-ray or physical search Responsible for the supervision of the execution of correct procedures when physically opening and searching baggage Responsible for the development and implementation of policies and procedures of security procedures for day to day operations Responsible for ensuring that all security regulations are met and maintained. Liaising and advising the Gibraltar Port Authority on matters of maritime security</p> <p>Other Supervising subordinates Assigning all Borders and Coastguards officers their relevant duties and shifts and ensuring sufficient staff are available to avoid lapses in security</p> |
| Training Manager | 1 | <p>Act as Head of Training Dept. Conducting Training needs assessment. Developing training programmes within the Agency. Maintain training levels. Plan and deliver detailed training packages to new entrants and refresher training to existing officers. Provide support to Management in responding to training and operational issues.</p> |

Contd...

Contd Answer to Question 205

| | | |
|---------------------------------------|----|---|
| Training Manager cont; | | Resolve and respond to training issues on the application and interpretation of processes and legislation. Manage the learning and Professional Development of the workforce and identify training needs through consultation with management, Regulators and other official bodies. Responsible for the operational worthiness of the training equipment. Custodian of all BCA Post Instructions, their amendments and promulgation. |
| Training Officer | 1 | Assisting the Training Manager in his duties. Build, plan and deliver dynamic training. Develop training programmes within the Agency. Continuously see and support new approaches, practices and processes to improve the efficiency of the training provided. Establish and maintain effective working relationships with employees, management, customers and Regulators. Deputise for the Training Manager as required. |
| Senior Borders and Coastguard Officer | 16 | Supervise the Border and Coast Guard Officers in the carrying out of their duties and ensuring that those duties are carried out in compliance with all applicable legislation, rules, codes and directions of the Agency. Ensure that all equipment is properly maintained and operational. Ensuring that all operating protocols and procedures are up to date. To embark on vessels and aircraft on which Border and Coastguard Officers are required to embark. To exercise disciplinary control and report breaches of discipline to a superior officer. |
| Borders and Coastguard Officer | 62 | To carry out and discharge all manner of security duties and functions. Perform all Immigration Control and duties at all entry points and collecting any statistical information and other data as required by the Agency. Controlling and directing vehicular and pedestrian traffic flow at immigration points. |
| Security and Immigration Officer | 15 | To carry out and discharge all manner of security duties and functions. Perform all Immigration Control and duties at all entry points and collecting any statistical information and other data as required by the Agency. Controlling and directing vehicular and pedestrian traffic flow at immigration points. |
| Administrative Officer | 1 | Preparation of Salaries, keeping records of Annual Leave and Sick Leave entitlement. |

Mr Speaker: The schedule is fairly long. It is two pages of rather small print. If he wishes, we can go on to other questions and then come back. It is up to you.

15 Since it is Mr Feetham who is asking the next question then, the Hon. Mr Bossino, you can have a look at the schedule and we will return to it. Okay?

Hon. D J Bossino: Yes.

Q206/2014

GBC –

Plans to make entirely self-sufficient

Mr Speaker: So call the question for the Hon. Mr Feetham.

20 **Clerk:** Question, 206, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister state whether GBC is on track to become 'entirely self-sufficient', which is the expectation the Government expressed in 2012?

25 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, this remains the Government's aim and it is one which the current CEO shares and is working towards. We are very much on track on the planning for this.

30 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, do the plans for making GBC entirely self-sufficient, are they still the plans that existed in 2012 or have they moved on from 2012? Has the Government changed its policy or is it just simply a continuation of what it was aiming to do in 2012?

35 **Hon. Chief Minister:** A continuation of what was aimed for in 2012, Mr Speaker.

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, Mr Speaker, no doubt the hon. Gentleman will recall that this question was last asked in November of 2012. At the time the Hon. the Chief Minister said, when he was asked how does he intend to make GBC entirely self-sufficient, he said, 'Mr Speaker, by the profits of the joint venture it has created, namely Gibraltar Entertainment Networks Limited'. Is he saying to this House that that project is still on course to become successful and therefore underpin GBC's entire self-sufficiency?

Hon. Chief Minister: Yes, Mr Speaker.

**Q205/2014 continued –
Borders and Coastguard Agency –
Employment structure**

Clerk: Question –

45 **Hon. D J Bossino:** I am grateful –

Mr Speaker: Go back to Question 205.

50 **Hon. D J Bossino:** I am grateful, Mr Speaker, and I am also grateful to the Hon. the Chief Minister for the very full information he has kindly provided me in his answer – it is very much appreciated.

In fact, Mr Speaker, one of the concerns that I have that has been reported to me, and it has kind of been confirmed as a result of the information that the Hon. Chief Minister has given me, is that those who are employed as security and immigration officers are carrying out, in effect, the same duties – let me get this right – as the Borders and Coastguard officers, of which there are 62 and of the former there are 15.

55 As I understand it the security and immigration officers get paid less than the Borders and Coastguard officers. Maybe he can confirm whether that understanding is correct and if it is, why is it that the security and immigration officers are doing exactly the same duties for less money than the Borders and Coastguard officers? But as I am not sure about the information I have received, it may be that the premise of the question is wrong, but maybe he can confirm that.

60 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I do not have the information as to salaries here. Now that he has put that question I am quite happy to look into it and speak to him after the meeting at some stage in the next week or so.

65 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, maybe I can obtain the information myself, but obviously he will have the information more readily available than I, and if I find any information in relation to that I will tell the Hon. the Chief Minister, but I would encourage him to look into it.

70 The other point I would raise, Mr Speaker, is that in the estimate book, which was approved at the time of the last budget, there was a provision for 2013-2014 of 14 security and immigration officers, yet we have one more. Can he explain why that is?

Hon. Chief Minister: No, Mr Speaker, and I do not have the estimates book with me, but I am quite happy to check that, in the same way I am going to check the other point he has raised and have a conversation with him, probably not today, but maybe tomorrow or next week.

Q207/2014
Previous Speaker's tax affairs –
Report into leak of information

75 **Clerk:** Question 207, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, further to Question 839/2013, can the Chief Minister please state whether the report into the leak of the tax affairs of the previous Speaker has now been finalised?

80 **Clerk:** Answer the Hon. the Chief Minister.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, I understand that the report has not yet been finalised.

Q208/2014
Affordable homes available for sale –
Ownership terms

85 **Clerk:** Question 208, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please provide a breakdown of how many flats may be sold to the public on co-ownership and 100% ownership terms, broken down by reference to ongoing developments announced by the Government?

90 **Clerk:** Answer the Hon. the Chief Minister.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, all buyers in respect of the affordable homes available for sale will be given the choice to purchase between 50% and 100% share of those homes, so there is no predetermined co-ownership percentage.

95 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, and on that basis, effectively what he is saying to me is that the Government will not impose, say, for example, a 20% margin of those that will be on 100% terms, 80% say, co-ownership. So given that that is the case, how will the Government allocate these flats to various applicants, bearing in mind that it is likely to be that the projects are likely to be oversubscribed? These projects are the same as Waterport Terraces and Nelson's View. They are all over-subscribed. Can the Government perhaps give me some information in relation to that?

100

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, as I have said publicly in relation to all of these issues, how much one can buy is not going to determine what choice a person has of which of these homes are going to be available to them.

105

The priority, as I have said publicly at the launch of these projects, will be based on people's places on the housing waiting list. I specifically said that we did not think it was proper...well it is not a question of proprietary. We did not think it was appropriate that under the last Administration the affordable homes were sold to those first who could afford to buy the largest share. We have taken a completely different attitude, as he will now know, and your place on the housing waiting list will be what grants you the priority of choice.

110

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, Mr Speaker, I understand that, and of course he is entitled to have a different policy and I do not criticise it. I do not criticise the policy for one moment, but bearing in mind that people

115 that are on the housing waiting list and a lot of those people may be on the housing waiting list because they cannot afford to buy, has he factored that in to the equation? What are the criteria for allocation if, for example, there is not sufficient take-up from people on the housing waiting list?

120 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, that is not the indication that we have from the people on the housing waiting list. At the moment it appears that we may be oversubscribed from people on the housing waiting list. If we are not, then there will be different classes and categories of people who may be entitled to buy those flats that are left and we will cross that bridge if we come to it. We have ideas as to how we will deal with it, but at the moment it seems very clear to us that the people on the housing waiting list are the ones looking to buy. Now, obviously, if somebody has not got the means to buy, they will not buy.

125 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is the Government satisfied that there is sufficient lending capacity in Gibraltar in order to ensure that people have the funding to fund their purchases for these projects?

130 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, yes, we are, and in fact it may be that in some instances people do not even need to borrow. I mean with a 2RKB starting at £27,600, which is less than the hon. Gentleman's car is worth, they may be able to buy them with one cheque. (*Laughter*)

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker –

135 **A Member:** Is it?

Hon. D A Feetham: Actually, no, it is not. I know what my car cost second hand and he does not. But, of course, it is all irrelevant.

140 But, Mr Speaker, surely the Government (*Interjections*) has taken into account in its policy in respect of these developments that there have been difficulties in the lending sector. Barclays has gone. Now we know that Norwich and Peterborough will also be going by the end of the year.

Does the Government, for example, expect to be taking some of the demand through the Gibraltar International Bank? Can he give us some information in relation to that, for example?

145 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, of course the Government is satisfied that there is sufficient lending capacity. There is more lending capacity in Gibraltar at the moment than there was when the original co-ownership estates were put up for sale and in the marvellous job that was done by the GSLP Administration between 1988 and 1996, where 2,000 homes were developed. There were less building societies in Gibraltar and mortgages were available to all of those people who purchased then.

150 And Barclays has not gone, Mr Speaker, and is not going. Barclays is going to remain in Gibraltar with a much reduced capacity; but they have already said, and the hon. Gentleman should recall, that they are going to continue offering mortgages until 2016, which is beyond the date when mortgages are going to be required for these properties. So we are entirely satisfied that there is going to be sufficient lending capacity in the market.

155 The position of Gibraltar International Bank will be made clear by Gibraltar International Bank.

Q209/2014
Foreign investors –
Government plans

Clerk: Question 209, the Hon. D A Feetham.

160 **Hon D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is the Chief Minister in a position to make an announcement in relation to those foreign investors which he said he had up his sleeve as far back as May 2011, and which in answer to Question 846/2013 he said he would be announcing towards the end of January 2014?

Clerk: Answer the Hon. the Chief Minister.

165 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, yes, sir.

The recent visit to the Berlin Money Show, which was the subject of a Government Press Release, was in connection with the launch of the Gibraltar International Mint as the joint venture marketing company that will be seeking to place a new Gibraltar silver coin in the market for investment silver coins. The joint venture is with one of the numerous potential investors who have been working with the Government since

170 before our election. A specific statement on this has been agreed with the said investor, but agreeing it is slightly delayed. The launch of the new coin was timed to coincide with the 25th anniversary celebrated at the Berlin Show of the Vienna Philharmonic, one the most successful investments of the coins. The Austrian Mint is responsible for the minting of the Philharmonic and will mint the new Gibraltar coins and a distribution agreement has been entered into with one of the major German companies in this market.

175 Whilst it is early days to estimate what the revenue potential is, what is clear is that there is a huge market and that even a small share of this market will provide Gibraltar with a new source of income.

Other potential investors who were working with us before our elections are still in the process of finalising their investments in Gibraltar. Further statements will be made when relevant.

180 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I rise... I feel slightly deflated. I thought when he as far back as May 2011 made a little bit of a song and dance about these investors he had up his sleeve to... just over... well, in fact it is longer than two and a half years, to come back and to say 'Gibraltar International Mint' is slightly disappointing I have to say.

185 But, Mr Speaker, can he perhaps give an indication of what kind of contribution does he expect this will make to the economy in terms of growth of the economy? What are we talking about in terms of income to the Government, or is he not in a position to provide that kind of information so we can assess the overall contribution to the economy and whether that is going to be significant or it is not going to be significant?

190 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, the fact is that I am not answerable, as Chief Minister of Gibraltar, for anything I said in May 2011, but I am entertaining the hon. Gentleman's questions. I am not going to give him an estimate today of what this business is going to be worth in the future.

He will recall that at election time he was the one that ventured into making estimates of what results were going to be and what turnouts were going to be, and making those sorts of estimates in my view is a little bit foolish so I am not going to do that.

195 But, Mr Speaker, new homes, a new hotel, new office developments, that is real investment, Mr Speaker, and that is what we are seeing in our economy, together with a new Bank. So I am not surprised that the hon. Gentlemen is deflated, furious and frustrated.

200 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I have to say that if you compare the hon. Gentleman's... the Government's achievements in this area and the areas that he has mentioned over the last just over two years and compare it, for example, to the achievements of the first GSLP Government during the same period, and there is absolutely no comparison. He is way, way behind in the achievement stakes, if I may say so myself.

205 But, Mr Speaker, just so I understand it, this is the only investment that he had in mind when he made these statements in 2011 and has made several statements to me in this House when I have asked this question over the last two and a half years. This is the extent of the investments that he had in mind when I was asking the questions and he was answering them across the floor of this House and also when he was making these statements two and a half years ago.

210 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I consider the GSLP Government's achievements from 1988 to 1996 to have set the standard that I would hope one day to be able to be in the shadow of. That was one of the most exciting governments that Gibraltar has ever seen. Involving as it did Joe Bossano leading Gibraltar's economy from a place where we were having to borrow to pay recurrent expenditure, to standing on our own two feet and putting us in the position where we could utter the words, 'self-determination' in the context of self-sufficiency at last.

215 I know that he had family links to that Government and he is justly proud of what happened then, as I am to lead the party today that delivered in those days what I think is, without doubt, a lesson in good and appropriate Government and how to turn an economy around. So if I am failing to achieve what Joe Bossano achieved in 1988 to 1996, I will always continue to try and emulate it.

220 I will never, Mr Speaker, say that I turned my back on what my party did then or what it did in Opposition – something which I note is not the case in respect of Members opposite, given that they already trying to forget much of what they did when they were in Government and already denying it vide the interviews given by him and his new Party Chairman as to the way they do things now compared as to the way they used to do things before.

225 But, Mr Speaker, if the economy grows from £1.1 billion to £1.65 billion by the time I call the next General Election, even Joe Bossano will say that that was not bad.

Mr Speaker, if I started the process of building 1,000 homes, half of what the GSLP built between 1988 and 1992, because by then already 2,000 were to be started, that is at least half of what the GSLP achieved. It may not be enough and I will always be in awe of that Government, but it is so much more than the GSD did between 1996 and 2000. (*Banging on desks*)

230 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, I am glad that he thinks so because of course he actively campaigned against the GSLP in 1992. (*Laughter and banging on desks*) So I am afraid that there is role reversal here. The point that he always makes against me that he has left himself open that I make against him. (*Laughter and interjections*)

235 But I have to say, Mr Speaker, because of course, he is going to come back to me, that although I was not supportive of the GSD prior to 2004, I hope that in the same way as he lambasts me about the 16 years abysmal record of the GSD here and there, that when we talk about the positives, of which there were many in relation to the GSD, that he also gives me credit for that too (*Banging on desks*) because I will accept the credit because the net balance is heavily weighted in terms of achievement to the burdens or the ‘unachievements’ of the last 16 years.

240 But, Mr Speaker, in relation to this particular investment, is Credit Finance involved in any way, shape or form – and I ask this question in the widest possible terms – in terms of any guarantees that have been provided for the investors, any assurances that have been provided by Credit Finance, as well as any direct or indirect financial assistance of whatever form –I am trying to sort of keep it as wide as possible for the hon. Gentleman... of whatever form in relation to this investment and these investors?

245 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, in 1992 I was a student at University (**A Member:** Ah.) and I have learnt many things since then.

250 But it is very clear, if the hon. Gentleman goes back and looks at everything I said, that none of the criticisms I made in 1992 refer to any of the things that I have praised today, which is the economic performance of that Government – something which even Joe Bossano’s greatest detractors always speak highly of. So, Mr Speaker, I do not think there is any contradiction whatsoever. But I think history will speak for itself and will demonstrate what it was that each of the Governments that have led Gibraltar has delivered. There does not need to be a debate about it between us today; but he wanted to make the comparison, so I dealt with the comparison.

255 I am quite happy to deal with the question as widely as he has put it in relation to Credit Finance, Mr Speaker. There is absolutely no involvement in respect of Credit Finance in the way that he has described it or otherwise howsoever arising in respect of this investment. But I just do not know if the directors of Credit Finance might have bought one of these coins already, but that would be a matter entirely for them.

Q210-223/2014

**Sunborn floating hotel project –
Works at Ocean Village Marina; details and costs**

260 **Clerk:** Question 210, the Hon S M Figueras.

Hon. S M Figueras: Can the Chief Minister provide details to this House of all costs incurred directly or indirectly by the Government or Government-owned companies, owned directly or indirectly, in whole or in part, as a result of the enabling works at the site where the Sunborn floating hotel is now located at the Ocean Village Marina?

265 **Clerk:** Answer the Hon. the Chief Minister.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, I will answer together with Questions 211 to 223.

270 **Clerk:** Question 211, the Hon. J J Netto.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Port state who is paying or who has paid for the cost of the infrastructural works to accommodate the Sunborn floating hotel in Ocean Village and how?

275 **Clerk:** Question 212.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, can Parliament have a copy of the agreement between the Government, the owners of the Sunborn and the proprietors of Ocean Village with regard to the Sunborn floating hotel project and provide the total cost of this project broken down by each entity involved?

280 **Clerk:** Question 213.

285 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Port state if the infrastructural works to dock the Sunborn floating hotel in Ocean Village was a Government project or a private one?

Clerk: Question 214.

290 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Port state who is project managing the infrastructural and dredging works in order to accommodate the Sunborn floating hotel in Ocean Village?

Clerk: Question 215.

295 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, further to the letter sent to me by the Hon. Neil Costa MP on 14th January 2014, can the Minister for the Port provide Parliament with the names of all the companies, including Steel Mac Ltd that submitted a bid for the dredging works in order to store the contaminated material in the *MV Nord Star* and state what were their respective bids?

Clerk: Question 216.

300 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, further to the letter dated 14th January 2014, from the Hon. Neil Costa MP to me, could the hon. Member confirm that Burando Maritime Services is still contracted by the Government to remove the dredged material from Ocean Village, and if not, why not?

305 **Clerk:** Question 217.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Port state if Steelmac Ltd had been contracted by Burando Maritime Services or by the Gibraltar Government, in order to dredge the contaminated material in Ocean Village and place the said material in the *MV Nord Star*?

310 **Clerk:** Question 218.

315 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Port state if some of the contaminated waste material arising from the dredging of the Ocean Village to accommodate the Sunborn has been transferred and deposited at the Nerva (Huelva) rubbish dump?

Clerk: Question 219.

320 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, if contaminated waste material from the dredging of the Ocean Village has been transferred to the Nerva (Huelva) rubbish dump, can the Minister for the Port state what tonnage has been deposited there and whether such material has emanated from the waste material deposited in the *MV Nord Star*, the *MV Meridian*, or from subsequent dredging and delivered by lorries to Nerva?

Clerk: Question 220.

325 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Port state how much tonnage of contaminated waste material from the dredging of Ocean Village has been removed to the Netherlands by using the *MV Meridian* and if this ship will be further engaged for the transportation of further contaminated waste, and if not, why not?

330 **Clerk:** Question 221.

335 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Port state if the 4,000 tonnes of contaminated waste material from the dredging of the Ocean Village still remains inside the *MV Nord Star*, and if so, what is the Government going to do to safely dispose of such material?

Clerk: Question 222.

340 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Port state if in the issuing of the export licence to the various companies involved in the removal of the contaminated waste material from the dredging of the Ocean Village, there is an Environmental Audit trail included to ascertain that all the contaminated waste material will be either properly treated or safely deposited and made inert, and if so, who is the competent Authority to conduct the Audit trail?

345 **Clerk:** Question 223.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Port state who is paying for the removal of the contaminated material to the various final destinations, and how?

350 **Clerk:** Answer the Hon. the Chief Minister.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, the Government notes and welcomes that the Sunborn five star floating hotel is now permanently docked in the area between Ocean Village and Marina Bay. This is the first new hotel established in Gibraltar in many years. A number of further hotel projects have since been announced as well as the refurbishment of existing hotels.

355 The total cost of the infrastructure required to berth the Sunborn vessel at the said location is in the process of being calculated. This cost will not be borne by the Government. The benefits of the infrastructure works have accrued to Ocean Village and Sunborn and although Government has undertaken the works as an urgent Government project in order to enable this hotel project to progress, the costs will be shared by those who have taken the benefit of the said works. Government is in the process of agreeing with both Ocean Village and Sunborn what proportion of the works each is liable for and how they will respectively reimburse the Government. The Government is not privy to any agreement between Ocean Village and Sunborn and cannot therefore provide details or a copy of it. There is no agreement between Sunborn and the Gibraltar Government.

360 A Government of Gibraltar Project Manager was instructed to manage both infrastructural and dredging works appertaining to this project.

A total of four companies submitted bids for the dredging works with these being awarded to Steel Mac in the sum of £680,000.

Burando Maritime Services are still contracted to remove all dredged material from Ocean Village.

370 As far as the Government is aware no contaminated material has been transported to a rubbish dump in Nerva in Huelva.

Approximately 6,300 tonnes of dredged material was removed by the *MV Meridian*. It is up to the company contracted with the removal of the material to decide whether or not to engage this vessel for any further works in relation to this project.

375 As far as the Government is aware, approximately 1,300 tonnes still remain inside the *MV Nord Star* out of the original quantity deposited there. This material will be disposed of by Burando Maritime Services.

The companies involved respectively with the collection, transportation, exportation and disposal of the contaminated waste material arising from the Ocean Village dredging are all licenced to undertake these operations. The Environmental Agency is the competent Authority in all matters relating to the collection, storage, transportation and disposal or recovery of waste under Part VA of the Public Health Act.

380 The removal of the contaminated material is being paid by Burando Maritime Services as the company contracted by Her Majesty's Government of Gibraltar to do so. The material is being transported by land.

Q224-228/2014
Credit Finance Company Limited –
Commutated pensions; loans

Clerk: Question 224, the Hon. D A Feetham.

385 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please state what is the value of commuted pensions of Civil Servants paid out by Credit Finance Company Limited as at 31st January 2014?

Clerk: Answer the Hon. the Chief Minister.

390 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 225 to 228.

Clerk: Question 225, the Hon. D A Feetham.

395 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Chief Minister please state what is the amount lent by Credit Finance Company Limited to the owners of the Sunborn as at 31st January 2014?

Clerk: Question 226.

400 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Chief Minister please provide details of the amount lent to the management companies of housing estates by Credit Finance Company Limited as at 31st January 2014?

Clerk: Question 227.

405 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Chief Minister please state as at the 31st January 2014, how much has been lent by Credit Finance Company Limited in relation to Government arrears, broken down by the type of arrears?

Clerk: Question 228.

410 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Chief Minister please state as at 31st January 2014, what is the total amount loaned by Credit Finance Company Limited?

Clerk: Answer the Hon. the Chief Minister.

415 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, the value of the commutations paid out to Government pensioners for Credit Finance Company Limited, as at 31st January 2014, was £20,707,012.

The total amount of the loan book of Credit Finance Company Limited as at 31st January 2014 was £46,646,565.

As has already been explained in the House previously, details of individual loans issued by Credit Finance Company Limited will not be given.

420 The details requested in Question 227 remain the same as those provided in answer to Question 758/2013 by letter of 23rd November 2013. I note, Mr Speaker, that that letter was also copied to you.

425 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, in relation to Question 225, which is the loan that has been provided to the Sunborn, the hon. Gentleman has publicly stated in an interview in the *Chronicle*, he said that the loan as at... I think it was July of last year, was just under £30 million. Now, if he can provide that information publicly in an interview to the *Chronicle*. Why can he not provide it in this House when he has provided the information publicly to the *Chronicle*? We know because he has done that, that it is just under £30 million. All I am asking is for an update of that position to be provided to this House as at 31st January 2014. I think it is not an unreasonable question given the information that he has already provided publicly.

430 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, it is becoming a bit tiresome to have the same debate in every meeting of the House. The hon. Gentleman will get from me the total amount of the loan book of Credit Finance Company Limited. He will get no further breakdown. That is the position of the Government. We are perfectly comfortable with giving that information. We are not comfortable giving more information because of the way that we read our obligations as lenders.

435 Mr Speaker, Sunborn has said certain things about its borrowing. At the time that I gave the interview to the *Chronicle*, I reflected what the position was at the time. I think if the hon. Gentleman looks at exactly what I said, I do not think he is reflecting it in the way that I said it. The Government's position remains as it has been for the past six meetings of the House.

440 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, I am afraid that I still take the view, as we do on this side of the House, that it is totally unacceptable behaviour on the part of the Government. But what about in relation to Question 226?

445 The Hon. the Chief Minister has accepted in answer to past questions that there have been loans to the management companies, of at least one management company of at least one housing estate. I am not asking for the identity of... those housing estates – I am not – which is the concern that he has publicly expressed, which is, 'I am not going to breach confidentiality. We do not agree that it applies, 'but I am not going to breach confidentiality in revealing the identity of the people on this loan book'. But I am not even asking that. I am asking to provide details of the total amount, the *total amount*, not in relation to one, the total amount owed... sorry, lent to management companies of housing estates. Surely that is information that the Opposition is entitled to ask and it is information that the Government should not be reticent in providing.

450 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the Government has not lent any money to any housing estate that it is refusing to talk about. What we are talking about is loans by Credit Finance Company Limited and it really is becoming tiresome, Mr Speaker.

455 I know that the Hon. Gentleman might have felt that he was on to a winner when he started to criticise Credit Finance and he thought that he might finally be able to bring down economic hell and brimstone on

460 the Government and this might help him to achieve his aim of becoming Chief Minister, even if it involved rack and ruin for the people of Gibraltar.

We have said what we are going to say about the loan book of Credit Finance. We are not going to give any breakdown of it. If the hon. Gentleman wants to know what a particular estate has borrowed from Credit Finance, why does he not call the Chairman of the management company of the estate that he believes has been loaned money by Credit Finance and ask him? That person is likely to tell him because he is likely to have written to all the people who reside in that Estate and it is not confidential information in the hands of those individuals, but it is in our view confidential information in the hands of the Government. That is the position. We have made it clear. It is becoming tiresome to have to repeat it. He may not like the answer, Mr Speaker, but it is the one he is going to get.

470 I am just tempted to tell him to go back and read the *Hansards* of what I have already told him. Repeating the question is not going to change the answer.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, this is a different question. It has been allowed onto the Order Paper. It is a different question.

475 Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman is a master of attempting to confuse the issue. There is no confidentiality issue in relation to this. I am not asking him to reveal the identity of the housing estates which have been lent money. I am not asking him that. I am asking: what is the total amount that has been lent to housing estates in Gibraltar? There cannot be any confidentiality in that at all and I do not understand what the Government's reticence is.

480 Can he explain how he justifies the extension of the Government's policy which I do not agree with, but I understand, which is, Confidentiality bites here. I cannot reveal the identity of the people that have received loans', to the position he is taking now during the course of today, which is, but 'I am not even going to tell you the totality of what has been lent to housing estates'? It is a remarkable lack of transparency and accountability (*Banging on desks*) where they ought to be accountability and transparency in this House.

485 **Hon. Chief Minister:** That is nonsense, Mr Speaker. It is an attempt to grab a headline which he thinks will benefit him in some way, and it really is something that the people have seen through.

I have said before, this is not my position now. This is the position that we have been putting since we started debating in this House, that we will not give any details of individual loans. I have said we would not give names. We will not give areas etc. I have said that on a number of occasions.

490 He has got a problem with his memory, Mr Speaker. He needs to go back and check *Hansard*. We had this problem in the Select Committee, where he thought I had said one thing, when actually I had said another. When he goes back and checks the *Hansards*, he will hopefully come back and confirm that he got that wrong. When he goes back and checks this, he will also see that he got that wrong.

495 The Government is being *completely transparent*. We are *totally* see through on this issue, but what we are not going to do is give him the details that he wants because we believe that that is confidential. I have given him, Mr Speaker, a moment ago, the total amount of the loan book. The total, he has got it. The amount loaned by Credit Finance: £46,646,565. Totally transparent. Totally see through. But he is not going to get the details of every single loan or what it is for, or who it is to. It is not going to happen and that has been our position from the beginning.

500 What he cannot deal with, Mr Speaker, is that we are transparent, that we are accountable, that we come here every month to answer their questions, *and* we answer them; but they do not like the answer, Mr Speaker. They do not like the answer because they accumulated rent arrears and failed to recover them. They promised new hotels and they failed to deliver them. They got booted up and now we are having to clear up after them, Mr Speaker. They just cannot deal with it. (*Banging on desks*)

510 **Mr Speaker:** All these exchanges about the loan book of Credit Finance Company Limited were all rehearsed at the previous meeting of the House. The only difference is that the total amount is different as at 31st January to what it was previously, but we are going through the same arguments again.

Hon. D A Feetham: No, Mr Speaker, that is not right. That is not right and perhaps the Hon. the chief Minister –

515 **Mr Speaker:** In respect of lack of transparency –

Hon. D A Feetham: No, no, well of course.

Mr Speaker: – and all these other accusations, is not the same thing?

520 **Hon. D A Feetham:** No, no. Of course. Of course. The underlying criticism is of course the same
(*Laughter*) and will continue to be the same... the lack of transparency and accountability, which rightly we
have criticised. But it is not the same (*Interjection*) and this is the problem here, Mr Speaker, that Mr
Speaker has been persuaded by the very skilful way in which the Hon. the Chief Minister really tries to
confuse the issue.

525 I am not asking about any individual loans. I am asking the totality of the amounts that have been lent to
a particular sector. It is not even individual loans. It is in relation to the housing sector. (*Interjection*)

There may be two, three, four, five housing estates that may have benefited. Well, what is the totality? I
am actually making it easier for the Hon. the Chief Minister to at least provide me with some information
that is different, because of course every time that I ask a question about Credit Finance and the Chief
530 Minister refuses to provide me an answer. Well I go back, I read *Hansard*. I say let me see whether I can
get some information out of him that does not breach his self-imposed red lines, because at the end of the
day I am interested in receiving as much information as possible. This is one of them. This is different.

Does the Hon. Chief Minister not recognise that it is wrong for him to suggest that he is not providing
me with the information because he will not provide me information about individual loans? I am not
535 asking him about individual loans; it is about the totality of what has been lent to housing estates in
Gibraltar. It is a particular issue in relation to a particular sector. If he will not provide me with the answer,
I am not going to push it.

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, as I have said before, and he perhaps needs to go and read *Hansard*
540 once again if he actually does bother to read it, because I think sometimes he does not, I am giving him the
totality of the loan book – the totality of the loan book. Every month he asks for it, he will get it, Mr
Speaker, but he will get no *breakdown* of the loan book. That is the Government's position. We have made
our position explicit on a number of occasions and our position has not changed. He is just trying to see
how he can perhaps get more information. Well, look, if he wants to continue trying to get more
545 information he can do what he likes, but our position is clear, transparent and see through. The total amount
of the loan book every month set out in answers to questions. Absolutely nothing wrong with that, Mr
Speaker. It is the appropriate way to act. It is the way that the Government is advised is the appropriate way
to act.

But, Mr Speaker, I will at least take from him that he considers me very skilful and masterful. He does
550 not often call me things that I might like to remember, Mr Speaker. I will take at least that from today's
session of the House.

ENTERPRISE, TRAINING, EMPLOYMENT, AND HEALTH & SAFETY

Q185 and Q188/2014

Business start-ups and nurture schemes – Benefit to new companies

555 **Clerk:** Question 185, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: Further to Question 676/2013, can the Minister for Employment state whether any
new companies are benefitting from the Government's policy on business start-ups and nurture schemes?

560 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr
Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 188.

565 **Clerk:** Question 188.

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Employment provide details of the Government's business
start-up policy?

570 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr
Speaker, the position continues to be as stated in answer to Question 676/2013.

The Government policy on new start-ups is to provide assistance and advice that may be required by the individual engaged in wanting to set up a new business.

575

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, is the policy as wide as that, because as I understood it – I do not have a copy of the *Chronicle* article which reported on – I think the answer that he or his Department had provided in relation to business start-ups but it was actually more particular than that, albeit confusing?

580

So that the first question is as I put it. In relation to the first question I asked, which was Question 185, does he have an explanation as to why no more companies are benefitting from this particular scheme?

585

Hon. J J Bossano: I can make an educated guess. If the hon. Member remembers, I told him that when the initiative was taken by the Department it was identifying a group of people who had been unemployed for some time, who were in their late-50s and who were therefore finding difficulty in obtaining alternative employment, particularly in the construction industry, given that they were competing with people younger than them and coming over the frontier.

590

Therefore, there were a number of companies where the Department took the initiative of approaching the individuals and suggesting to them that given the difficulties that they were having in finding work, and that we were having in getting employers to take them on, that they might consider the possibility of using their accumulated skills in the industry, as people had been maybe 20 or 30 years in the industry, and with our help set up a business. Those were the first ones that were set up and they were set up because we encouraged it. We went out to suggest it to people. Most of the people in that category were accommodated and have now got these little companies that are doing very well. They have taken on trainees and the owners are working owners – that is they own the company – but they actually use the tools themselves and they help to train young people that we have sent and they have then taken them on. So that has worked very well, but of course this was always a limited market. In that category there might have been seven or eight people, that was all.

595

So that, in my view, is the reason why that particular type of start-up was exhausted, because if tomorrow we find somebody, for example, that is laid off and fits the characteristics that I want and we find we are having difficulty in getting them a job with somebody else, then we would again repeat that exercise, but at the moment there are no potential candidates that have been identified by us.

600

In a few instances, not many, the initiative has been the approach from an investor, who then needed a different kind of help. The help might have been, for example, ‘Well, how do I go about putting together a proposal in order to get EU funding for the project that I want to do?’ or ‘How much help can you give me in training people for what is a specialist task?’

605

So there are effectively two basic sources. One source is the one, in effect, that we created ourselves and the other is a source that comes spontaneously out of people who decide to invest their own money and set up a little business. That is the one where the widely defined part of the answer is because the advice and the help that we give is driven by the demand for the advice and the help.

610

That is to say, the latter category probably do not need any help in setting up a company, they may already have a company, but they may need help with identifying how they can put a package together which is likely to succeed in getting them EU funding, given that there are criteria as to which industries qualify and which do not and how many jobs need to be created. The fact that sometimes, the hon. Member may not know it, but those who have been in Government will know, there are certain EU funds that can only be used to support people who have been a long time out of work or are of a certain age. So all that kind of help and advice is provided to the people who come looking for us, and the advice that they get depends on the questions they ask.

615

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, is all that, which is much more the detail of the policy, as a result of the negotiations which the Hon. the Chief Minister told me on a few – no, he is coming back – previous sessions in this House when he said... and again, I do not have the copy of *Hansard* in front of me, but when he suggested that the detail of the policy, and he knows that the Government has been a subject of criticism from us in relation to its apparent resistance in revealing to us what the detail of the policy is or was, that the Hon. Chief Minister would be entering into negotiations with the GFSB and the Chamber of Commerce. So is what the Minister for Employment just told me a result and the fruit of the negotiations and the discussions which the Chief Minister has had with the GF...? I think he mentioned and singled out the GFSB and did not mention the Chamber of Commerce. Is that the case? Is my understanding the case?

620

625

And, if I may, Mr Speaker, just because I think it is connected as a supplementary, the Hon. the Chief Minister also told me in a previous session that the detail of the policy was available at the ETB. Is that a document that can be obtained from the Hon. the Minister for Employment opposite, because it seems that it is the Hon. the Minister for Employment, as opposed to the Hon. the Minister for Commercial Affairs, who is having charge of this particular scheme?

630

635 **Hon. J J Bossano:** The recipients of the help and advice are the two categories that I have mentioned,
in terms of local businesses, and obviously also the people that I see who are looking at the possibility of
investing in Gibraltar. So the hon. Member got a letter from me telling him the number of people that I was
seeing in different areas about potential investments some time ago, yes. So, for example, those people
would be a new start-up business as well. I mean that if somebody comes and says, 'I want to set up a
640 factory here to do *a, b* and *c*,' it is a start-up business, but it is not local start-up business. In those cases
then the people have got to be given more information about more things which they do not know.

Of course, quite often people who come in with investment ideas have an initial meeting with me as the
Minister responsible for inward investment and then the matter is followed up because they have
accountants or lawyers here who look after their interests when they are not here. These people do not
normally spend all the time here.

645 But the basic approach of the Department is not that we have a sheet of paper that says all the things that
you do, other than the ones that were there already under the Gib Invest Office, which were leaflets that say
if you want to incorporate a company, you do all these things and you go and get these other firms of
lawyers and the firms of accountants. All that material was already there in 2011 and is still there today and
that is predominantly for people who come in from the outside.

650 For the people who are already established in Gibraltar, who may be moving from employment to self-
employment, then the answer is that they sit down with somebody in the Employment Service, who finds
out what it is that they require, and helps them to achieve it and gets them in touch with people. Where
people have got sufficient capital to do all this on their own and get professional advice they do not come to
us for help.

655 Where they come to us for help, frankly the interest that we have is that we want people to be able to set
up employment opportunities and therefore it is the Employment Service who has got a vested interest in
helping a potential employer to get on his feet and open vacancies – it is as simple as that.

660 **Hon. D J Bossino:** But, Mr Speaker, can he confirm this? He will recall that when we raised the issue
about this company, I think it was called ETB1 Limited –

A Member: ETB1 Limited.

665 **Hon. D J Bossino:** ETB1 Limited, and then there was a subject of a change of name, he will recall that
that is when we found out that in fact what was being provided by the Government was a registered
office... almost Corporate Service Provider facilities. There was a registered office, directorships,
shareholders by Government employees, and as a result of us revealing the existence of this company, we
found out (1) that there were more; and (2) we found out that this is a service which was apparently being
670 provided by the Government, although no announcement had been made in relation to that.

So can I ask him to confirm that this service is still being provided as part of this scheme? In other
words, that the Government will provide for those people who are wanting to set up a small ...a business in
Gibraltar as part of its – and I can read it – the business start-up and nurture schemes manifesto
commitment, will be providing corporate service facilities for a limited period of time and then they go off
to another Corporate Service Provider if they find one?

675 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Mr Speaker, I have already answered that. He does not have to go back and look at
Hansard. He has to remember what I have said to him 10 minutes ago.

I told him that the ones that had been done on the initiative of the Department where we had set up the
company, provided them with the directors and did everything that could be done, were for people long-
680 term unemployed in their 50s in the construction industry, all of whom are now operating very successfully
providing services in the construction industry, predominantly as subcontractors, have taken on trainees,
have now taken on their payroll those trainees full-time, and have created employment and activity.
Therefore we have removed both the employer and the employee from the unemployment list and that is
where the level of support that had to be given was very, very high.

685 I have told him about the service that is there. I have told him that although we appear to have used up
the pool of eight or nine people that met that characteristic, that if tomorrow somebody loses their job who
is in his 50s or is finding great difficulty in getting another job, we have great difficulty in getting an
employer to take him... all the explanations that I have already given him, then it will trigger again what we
did already in the first batch of people and we will then use our officers, set the company up, provide him
690 with directors, and then when it is all up and running, pass it over to him.

The people that come to us on their initiative do not need that kind of help. They have already got a
business or they already know enough about having a business to be able to do a lot of this stuff for
themselves and they have got the money, which people who were living on social assistance did not have,
to pay a lawyer or an accountant.

695 So there is nothing mysterious about this. It is a service that is there to meet a need which was not being met. The need was a very limited one in terms of numbers, as there are not hundreds of people in this category. If there were more tomorrow, the service would be reactivated tomorrow.

We ourselves monitor the unemployment list regularly and we monitor where we think there are potential candidates for the provision of this service. Of course, we have approached people who have said they are not interested, as well. The offer has been made to some people who have not wanted to take it up. They have said they do not want to get involved. They do not feel confident in having the responsibility of having... I mean once they get up and running, the companies, for example, that were created in the first year and now in the second year, they now have the responsibility of dealing with the tax and dealing with social insurance and dealing with all those things and not everybody can cope with that. So there are people that we have offered the service to and who have said no.

700 All the people that said yes, we have done it for them. We have not got at the moment anybody else identified as a potential candidate, but that could change tomorrow. But, in addition to that, the service that is provided by the Department, both to incoming investors and to local businessmen and the service that I am doing and other people might be doing other things, is based on what Gib Invest had initially, which was also for local and outsiders, which was really a series of leaflets of where do you go to get what you need; but we go one step further in getting things arranged for them if they need our help. Really, the people that need our help are the people who are entering into a field that they have never done before.

705 If you have got somebody who has already got some business activity, some business experience, they need very little from us, but we are there to help whoever approaches us because it is in our interest, as I have said, as an Employment Service, to help businesses expand and take on more workers, and that is what the rationale of this is all about.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, as I understand what he has said is, this was a scheme open to the unemployed so that the unemployed were provided with help in setting up a company. They were provided with help in terms of directorship services, shareholder services, with civil servants acting as directors and shareholders with the ETB... sorry, with the Town Range address at No. 6 Convent Place being used as a registered address, and then they would be given Government contracts. They would obviously earn an income as a consequence of that and they would then employ trainees from the Future Job Strategy, who they would then train within this company. That, as I understand it, is what he has said.

720 In relation to the 15 companies that were initially set up in this particular way – I think it is 15 – were all these unemployed from the unemployment list?

Hon. J J Bossano: Every single one of the companies that were set up was with somebody from the unemployment list. That is correct.

Hon. D A Feetham: Including the owner of ETB1? I am not going to mention his name across the floor of this House, but the hon. Gentleman knows who he is.

Hon. J J Bossano: No, I do not know who he is, Mr Speaker. I do not know who the owner of ETB1 is. It sounds as if it was from a science fiction serial actually. *(Laughter)*

Hon. D A Feetham: No, not a science fiction, maybe a nightmare for the Government, but not a science fiction.

740 I am talking about Mr Luis Edwards. He is the owner of this particular company, ETB1. Was he part of the unemployment list? Was he unemployed?

Hon. J J Bossano: Mr Speaker, I have already said that every single person that was helped to set up a company was at the time unemployed. Is the hon. Member saying I am lying?

745 **Hon. D A Feetham:** No, I am not.

Hon. J J Bossano: Well, then the answer is, if he has asked me three times if the people who were helped were unemployed and I tell him yes, and he now mentions one individual, it does not matter whether the guy is called Edwards or Feetham. If Feetham was unemployed, he would get help. *(Laughter)*

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, of course, there is a difference between somebody being unemployed and registered unemployed with the ETB.

750 Can you also confirm they were all registered unemployed with the ETB or were they just simply unemployed because they did not have a job at that particular moment in time? Or were they registered unemployed with the ETB? In particular, were they long-term unemployed?

I can understand, perhaps, the logic – (*Interjection*) Well, I can understand perhaps some logic in doing something like this for – provided that they are sufficiently skilled to pass the skills on to other people – the long-term unemployed, but can he confirm they were all registered unemployed?

760 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, I do not know whether the hon. Member is familiar, from the short time he spent in Government, as to how the system works, but he must know that there are people who are unemployed and who in between periods of being registered are lapsed, so the people who are unemployed appear and disappear periodically from the employment register at the rate of about 100 a month. Whether
765 in the particular month that the particular individual was actually helped in setting up a company he happened to be in the lapsed category or in the employment category, I do not know.

Hon. D A Feetham: Well, yes, of course, Mr Speaker, but let me give you another example.
I could resign from Hassans tomorrow, and say, ‘Well, now I am unemployed. Can I have a company now?’ I would not actually say that somebody like that has resigned to get an opportunity from the
770 Government –

Mr Speaker: Has he not answered that question? He said that if Feetham was unemployed (*Laughter*) he would get the... (*Laughter*) He has answered that question already. (*Laughter*)

775 **Hon. D A Feetham:** No, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker has not...
Mr Speaker, I am afraid in the joke that he has cracked, he has not understood the point that I am making. You see, Mr Speaker (*Interjection*) this question of, he has to be unemployed before he benefits, is a massive loophole because you can say to somebody, ‘Resign from your job tomorrow. I am going to give you a company’. He resigns tomorrow and he is unemployed. Now, that is why I have asked and I have
780 sought to draw the distinction between that and somebody who is registered unemployed and long-term unemployed in particular at the ETB. Can he perhaps provide some information in relation to that?

Hon. J J Bossano: Mr Speaker if it is massive loophole, then that massive loophole would be generating a queue of applicants and I would have just told the hon. Member that... he says there were 17. I
785 said there were 8 or 9, and I have just told the hon. Member that as far as we are concerned the Department goes looking for people that we have difficulty in employing in order to see if by helping them to become self-employed it is possible to make them economically active. Or is it that the Opposition, for reasons that are incomprehensible to me, appears to see people idle on social assistance, unemployed, rather than productively employed, generating wealth and bringing an income to their families.

790 I cannot understand how anybody can be critical unless it is that if you have got a particular name or have got a particular view then it should not apply to you, because it seems to me that what the hon. Member is saying is that it depends who you are whether you get help or not.

I can assure him that if he has got anybody, who is a supporter of his or a member of the GSD, who falls into the parameters that I have described, I will be delighted to help that person. (*Banging on desks*)
795

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, thank you very much to the Hon. Minister for that answer, but you see the concern from this side, or one of the concerns from this side of the House is that for a Government that really delights, because it really does delight, in ticking boxes and making announcements. I mean one announcement that it was continuing paying grants to students, that is one manifesto commitment ticked.
800 (*Interjection*)

Why did the Government not make an announcement about this particular scheme at the very beginning when it started it and we only find out because it appears to us that the Opposition rumbled them with this particular scheme when it made public the fact that there were a series of companies registered at No. 6 Convent Place and Town Range, where directorship and shareholder services were being provided by civil servants?
805

Hon. J J Bossano: Well, I do not know what rumbling means, Mr Speaker, but what presumably he means is that he went to the Companies Registry and looked up the Company Register and found the registered list. If looking things up in the Companies Register is rumbling, I suppose he knows about that because as a lawyer he must do a lot of rumbling all the time (*Laughter*) as part of his livelihood.
810

All I can tell him is what I have told him. We did not make an announcement because we launched the scheme by identifying potential candidates. The scheme is open to people without having to wait for an initiative from us.

815 The people that approach us generally are not the people in the category that I have described because it is something that does not even occur to them. The ones that have done it and are successful and are now providing a service to the Government and to the construction industry, many of these small subcontractors

are now working for the bigger construction companies as subcontractors and therefore that is reflected in people who are not being paid by the Government who are being paid for doing work. But it means that the numbers of Gibraltarians in the construction industry was the highest since 1996, when the last survey was published, and will be higher again, and will keep on getting higher because we keep on training more people and then we stop paying them and then they start earning their keep.

It is a policy that they can criticise or they can not criticise. It is a matter for them. All I can tell the hon. Member is that it is producing the results which in the debates that I had with him initially he was saying he thought it would be difficult to achieve, but if I achieved it he would be happy to see more Gibraltarians working. Well, he does not seem to be happy. He seems to be unhappy because he wants to criticise me for achieving what he thought would be difficult, and I can tell him it is not that I am satisfied that we have exhausted what we can do. I think we can do more and we will be doing more.

But so far what the hon. Member is asking me in his original question is what the state of play is at the moment, well, look, the state of play at the moment is not what did Luis Edwards had for breakfast this morning. The state of play at the moment is what is happening with the policy. The policy: what is happening is that the people we have identified we have actually put on the road to earning a living and that if tomorrow we identify more we will do it. If there are people that we have missed out and they know of, we will be happy to help them and if there are people who on their own initiative come forward and say, 'Well, look, I want to set up this business. Is there a way in which you can help me?', we will listen to them. I have not announced it publicly. Well, look, everything I am saying to him here is public.

Q186/2014

**Gaming industry and Employment Service –
Provision of liaison service**

Clerk: Question 186, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Employment provide details, such as the grade and duties of the person who is providing a liaison service between the gaming industry and the Employment Service as recently announced by the Minister for Financial Services?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, the grade of the person involved in providing a liaison service between the gaming industry and the Employment Service is that of a GDC HEO. The duties of the post in respect of the Employment Service are predominantly driven by ensuring a rapid response to the requirements of the industry, particularly in respect of the need to rely on non-EU nationals who require work permits given the nature of the client base of this industry.

The need for the creation of the liaison service was identified following representations by the industry about delays which affected their ability to recruit specialist staff, especially where non-EU nationals were concerned. Following this initial step the role has been widened to include other aspects, for example, liaising with different companies in respect of the current situation where some sections of the industry are requiring additional personnel whilst others are currently reducing their manning levels. Whilst much of the work involves the Employment Service the Officer concerned also undertakes a similar role in terms of expediting responses from other Government Departments to the requirements of the industry.

The feedback that has been received is that this liaison service is greatly appreciated by companies operating in this sector.

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, the Hon. Minister will know that this was an announcement made by the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services during the course of a debate that he and I participated in, in GBC about two or three weeks ago. He knows that there I welcomed it. I welcome it now as something that will facilitate the service which is being provided to such an important part of Gibraltar's economy.

But the first question I would ask is one of detail. He says this person has an HEO position. Would that be a grade 4, I think it is, under the GDC? If he could just confirm that.

Hon. J J Bossano: A grade 4.

Hon. D J Bossino: A grade 4.

870 And secondly the question which I have is why is it possible, certainly in relation to the initial duties
which this person was carrying out which was more relevant to the duties that may be more properly ought
to have been carried by the Employment Service, why is it that the Employment Service does not have
sufficient, either in numbers or in qualified staff or perhaps even in experienced staff, to be able to provide
875 this service in-house? Why was it necessary to appoint this person to act as a liaison between the industry
and the Service?

Hon. J J Bossano: Mr Speaker, the person was selected in fact because the person was at the receiving
end in the Employment Service of the requests. Effectively what happened was that she was transferred
880 from the Employment Service to the Department responsible for gaming, so that in fact instead of each
individual company approaching the Employment Service with their problems, they have somebody that is
permanently working there to do that for them.

It is a way of providing a channel. The requests finish up being in the Employment Service, but instead
of us having a person in the Employment Service who had a job to do which involved providing a receiving
point from the gaming, the banking, the construction and everybody else, the people in the Employment
885 Service are not broken into dedicated categories of employers. They deal with all employers irrespective of
where the requests come from.

Because the system that was in place when it was being done by the Employment Service was not
giving the priority to gaming in respect of other customers, so it was first come first served, the gaming was
making representations to us. Then in response to that lobbying, I suggested, 'Well look, we will take the
890 employee we have got here and transfer them to the Department that is responsible directly for the gaming',
and now instead of each H R Department coming to my Department looking for assistance with something,
everything goes to that person that is there already and that person then makes sure that it gets to the right
person in the Employment Service having been there and having been at the other end of the business. So
the reason is because effectively what the hon. Member is suggesting as an alternative is what used to
895 happen, which is what they thought was not being sufficiently rapid in providing responses. When we have
changed it, it produced a better result.

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, given the obvious positive experience of this venture, presumably there
900 is no reason why it cannot be extended to other industries like, for example, the insurance industry and –

Minister for Financial Services and Gaming (Hon. A J Isola): It probably is.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): [*Inaudible*] Financial Services.

905 **Hon. D J Bossino:** No, it is not. The question related to –

A Member: Financial Services.

Hon. D J Bossino: Yes, but the question related specifically to the gaming industry. If it is already
910 being provided to other industries within the Financial Services world, then I would ask the Hon. Minister
to confirm that position – (*Interjection*)

Hon. J J Bossano: I think the hon. Member should realise one thing that is peculiar to the gaming
915 industry and that is first of all it is bigger than the others. There are 3,000 employees. Secondly, it is more
diverse in terms of nationality – that is it has more people in it out of the 3,000 that require visas and
permits and other things that most of the others do not and it has a much higher turnover.

The turnover in the industry, for example, I think I gave him the figures at one stage, or if I did not give
it to him I gave it maybe to somebody else in Opposition, but when we looked at the churn we found at one
920 stage about a year ago that although there were at one point in time 3,000 people, there had been actually
9,000 people in the space of about 18 months who had come into the industry and 6,000 who had left. So in
almost every month... well, even more than that, in almost every day there is a spate of terminations and
commencements and in a month there is likely to be a turnover of 60 or 70 jobs in gaming. That kind of
turnover does not exist in other areas where there is more long-term stability, and therefore although there
925 may be others facing similar problems, they are not of an equal magnitude that it can make a difference if
there is somebody permanently dealing with them and specialising and becoming familiar.

Sometimes, for example, I can tell the hon. Member that for this particular officer is dealing also with
banks, because we had a situation a week ago where in terms of detached workers, one of the things that we
have put, one of the mechanisms that we have put in because of the requirement that the detached worker
requires an 11A Form from the country of origin and has got to produce evidence that they are paying
930 social insurance in the country of origin. All those mechanisms which are required by EU law meant that

sometimes somebody was going to be brought in to look, for example, at the IT systems and the time they were going to be here was taken up more in processing that their application met EU requirements. So we have now introduced a fast track system for people who will be here two weeks or less.

935 There was an instance a week ago where the individual that was going to be here was going to be one day over the two weeks. If that had gone through the normal bureaucratic channels, it would have eventually reached a point where somebody would have said, 'It has gone over the two weeks. The answer is no'. Because we have somebody there who was able to pick it up early on and they phoned in and they said, 'Look, although the criteria is two weeks, this person is going to be just one day over the two weeks. Can we be flexible and approve the fast track system?' and the answer was yes. This was for a bank and not
940 a gaming company.

So that gives the hon. Member a flavour of the kind, which on a day-to-day basis you can make life a little bit easier for the people that we want to stay here and make them feel welcome.

Q187/2014

**Public and private sectors –
Number of people currently employed**

Clerk: Question 187, the Hon. D J Bossino.

945 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Employment state the number of people that are currently employed in the public and private sectors respectively?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

950 **Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, as at 31st December 2013, according to the records of the Employment Service, the number of persons employed in the public service was 6,393 and in the private sector 19,707, excluding directors and self-employed.

Q189/2014

**Sunborn floating hotel project –
Update on recruitment process**

Clerk: Question 189, the Hon. D J Bossino.

955 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Employment provide an update on the recruitment process in relation to the Sunborn Floating Hotel?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

960 **Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, there has been constant close co-operation between the Employment Service and Sunborn regarding its labour requirements.

965 The first vacancies were opened in June 2013. Meetings were held in July; August 5th, 14th and 21st; September 5th, 17th, 20th and 23rd; October 3rd, 11th, 25th, 29th and 30th; November 4th, 5th, 6th, 7th, 9th, 21st and 22nd; December 6th, 11th, 13th, 17th and 19th; January 14th, 15th, 20th, 22nd, 28th, 29th and 30th; and in February on the 13th.

970 As a result of all these meetings, a number of the vacancies have been identified and candidates provided from the local workforce either with the required skills or with the potential for training.

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, is the hon. Member able to give me a number of positions filled, because I have here an article, which appeared again in the *Chronicle* on 22nd August, where Mr Stevendale, who is the CEO for Sunborn, said that he was working with Joanna Hernandez and the team at the ETB to fill 200 positions and an additional 20 positions for senior roles. Then he says, in commenting why all the 200 jobs have been placed with ETB... Mr Stevendale said the jurisdiction has been good to Sunborn and Sunborn wants to be good to the jurisdiction.
975

There is then a further article of 7th February 2014, where he mentions another figure of 100, which is 50% less. Can he give me some detail in relation to numbers please?

980 **Hon. J J Bossano:** I think the first caveat is that you should not believe everything you read in the press and I think the second is that I think there was a certain amount of poetic licence in his numbers. There are not all that many people already working there. There are quite a number of people that have been identified as suitable and contracts have been entered into, but with a starting date that has not yet been triggered.

985 But I would be very happy if we were able to take 10 to 15% of the jobs because in fact we do not have amongst the unemployed a large number of people with previous experience of working in hotels – in fact we have very few Gibraltarians working in hotels as it is. If one looks at the actual existing hotels, the bulk of the Gibraltarians are doing office work and there are very few... his dad is the one exception (*Laughter*) and your brother. (*Laughter*) Yes, but there are not and regrettably it is not an industry that has ever been very attractive because it is an industry that you have to work very hard to get to the top; it is a reality. You start at the bottom, you learn every job in the hotel, and eventually when you get to the top you know everything that is going on in the whole outfit; but that of course is not something that you can take into a hotel.

990 There will be people hopefully who are now coming in as trainees into this hotel which will follow that path and I think that if we have more hotels there will be a critical mass in this industry for us to be able to say, 'Well, look, we can now invest maybe in a school which will provide staff for five, six or seven hotels, but with the number of jobs that there are at present, I think many of the jobs that require experience and qualified people will go outside.

995 What we are trying to do is to persuade the Sunborn to take as many of the people that have got qualifications in other areas who are willing to switch profession. We are making the pool of graduates available to them for the areas that those can be trained. We have got a few people that have got background in working as cooks and waiters and that kind of thing, which we are also supplying.

1000 But at the stage that we are now, I think we have got something like a dozen people that we have identified that are ready to go in and there are an awful lot of people that have put their CVs in from outside, but the company gave us an undertaking right at the beginning that they would work closely with us and exhaust every possibility here before they took anybody from outside, and even when they take people from outside... they have got people from Scandinavia where they brought their own people from the parent company. But even when they take people from outside, we shall be trying, as far as it is economically reasonable, to have people additional to their normal complement to give people the opportunity to learn the skills.

1005 But we are at the stage of a process. All I can say is it is obvious from the long list of meetings that have been held between my staff and the company that there has been very close involvement at every stage.

1010 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I just want to assess results and what the Hon. Minister is planning to do in terms of numbers.

1015 He mentioned, I think he said, 10 to 12% as probably the realistic number he is likely to secure from the Sunborn, in terms of employing presumably locals. He then mentioned... he gave an absolute figure of 12, as I understand it that is the current figure. But can he give me an absolute figure that he would like to see employed at the Sunborn?

1020 We have seen, in fact the *Chronicle* reports 200 foundation jobs being placed at the ETB. I am not sure what Mr Stevendale was referring to by 'foundation jobs' as it is in inverted commas, but what figure does he think he is realistically and likely to be able to achieve?

1025 **Hon. J J Bossano:** He has asked me two things. What would I like? I would like everybody except the owner to be from the unemployment list. Well, that is not going to happen.

I think realistically given the nature of the skills that they require, which we have got a very detailed breakdown of, and the pool of available registered unemployed that we have, which is about 400, of which out of that 400 there might have been, I do not know, 20 or 30 from the hotel and catering industry, and most of those people are people who are... the ones with experience are people in their 50s or 60s and they are mainly Moroccan. The younger people are people that are keen to go in, but have had very little experience.

1030 So I can tell the hon. Member that I do not want to shoot myself in the foot by putting a figure that anybody else is going to try and hold me to if we can get more. The realistic figure is that if we manage 15% of the workforce, of whatever the workforce is... if it is 100, 200 or 300. Well, I do not know. I do not manage the ship. The company has opened a large number of vacancies, but in a hotel... this is not... When you are running a hotel it is not the same thing as running something where you have to have a fixed pool of people. In a situation like this where the hotel is opening its door for the first time they may find once

they start operating that they need a smaller core of people for certain activities and that they need to take people, extra people in, like all hotels do when they are full to capacity.

1040 But in any event we would expect all the admin staff to be ours because there does not have to be a specialist catering establishment skill. The people that do the payroll the people that do the office work, all those people we can supply.

1045 The people with catering skills, hotel skills and hotel experience are already working. There may be people who leave other hotels and go to this one. Recruiting from the local labour market is not limited to recruiting from the people who are unemployed. There is nothing to stop the company if they cannot find it from what we have got available, from looking at some of the people who may be working for existing hotels and who have applied to go to this one, because they might think there is a better future, more money or better promotional opportunities.

1050 But at the end of the day, at this point in time we have done a lot of preparatory work, but we are not to the point where I can say, 'Well, look, the hotel is going to have 200 people working in a month's time', that I am not able to say. If it were there, if it opened in a month's time and if there were 200 people, and out of those 200 we had 40 or 50, then I would say we had done well.

1055 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, is the Hon. Minister able to – he may not have this information available with him now – tell this House now how many vacancies have in fact been opened? He has heard me make reference to the press reports, and in fact reading again whilst he was providing his answer, basically what I want to do is establish whether what has been said in the press by the company is in fact the real situation because the company is saying, is reported to have said, that by the time the hotel opens on March 1st, there should be a staff complement of around 100 operational staff in both full-time and part-time positions. Then apparently, the company goes on, it does not give specific numbers but said many of its workers have come from the unemployment list. What I would like the Minister who has responsibility for this for employment is to be able to tell this Parliament what in fact the position is, if he is able to.

1065 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, I can tell the hon. Member when the first announcement was made and before the first vacancy was opened when there were queues going in circles round Ocean Village, the total number of CVs handed in was 2,961, of which 350 were from Gibraltarians, of whom perhaps 50 were unemployed.

1070 The number of vacancies that are presently on our books I cannot tell him, but I doubt that there are 200 vacancies. We have provided in the period 350 names from people unemployed; but of course I have told the hon. Member how long this has been going on. He needs to understand the fact that, for example, we submitted potential candidates way back in August, it does not mean that those potential candidates have been waiting patiently unemployed refusing every other job waiting for the Sunborn to open its doors. Much of the long list of people we have submitted may, when the time comes that the Sunborn says, 'I am ready to employ you' may no longer be interested because they have found something else since.

1075 These are the figures that I have got, the ones that I have shared with him; but I do not think that there are 200 jobs open.

1080 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I will ask a specific question at the next sitting of Parliament in relation to the figures and so therefore the hon. Member will be able to come prepared with the replies. I think it is information which the public ought to have.

The further supplementary I have, Mr Speaker, is – and I am not sure whether he has dealt with it in any specific way in his first reply – how many, if any, future Job Strategy trainees have been taken on to do placements with the Sunborn?

1085 **Hon. J J Bossano:** None at the moment.

1090 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, is there any reason for that, because obviously this is precisely because of the experience and training deficiency which he has identified in the hotel industry. I come from a family who, as he knows, is involved in that particular industry. It is something I would personally would like to see more Gibraltarians doing, given the fact that more hotels are now going to be opened hopefully shortly in Gibraltar. Does that not present an opportunity given that we have the Sunborn here with us now to ensure that our local population is trained in this field?

1095 **Hon. J J Bossano:** The policy, as the hon. Member knows even though he does not believe it, is that we provide trainees with a job guarantee at the end. We run some training courses without jobs, but others... well, if you believe that then you must believe that people have got real jobs and not that it is a sham with dead end jobs, which is what it was yesterday. *(Banging on desks) (Laughter and interjections)*

1100 So the answer is that when the Sunborn is able to sit down with us and do a programme for training which will lead to maybe replacing some of the people that they have because the training will presumably take more than just the short-term training that is now taking place, then if there are suitable candidates and people interested, we will be happy to provide the trainees and finance them.

1105 **Mr Speaker:** I am not answerable for the previous AACR Government, but I am willing to tell the hon. Member behind the Speaker's chair what the results were of a hotel and apprenticeship scheme, which when I was Minister for Labour we introduced.

Q190-191/2014
Leisure Construction & Maintenance Company Limited –
Details of employees and directors

Clerk: Question 190, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1110 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, sir, can Government provide details in respect of the number of employees who may have been employed, since the answer provided to Question 98/2014, by Leisure Construction & Maintenance Company Limited, broken down by grade, age, gender and nationality?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

1115 **Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 191.

Clerk: Question 191.

1120 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can Government provide details in respect of the Directors of Leisure Construction & Maintenance Company Limited?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

1125 **Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, further to Question 98 the answer is none.

The Employment Service has no records in respect of any registered directors of this company.

1130 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, may I just clarify, the Employment Service may have no record of the Directors, but given that this company is a Government-owned company, wearing that hat, can any Minister for the Government side say who the directors are please?

1135 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Mr Speaker, he may give whatever it is that he wants to be given, but if a question is that he is asking for me to provide the details of the directors and I am telling him there are no directors registered with this company in the ETB and no employees, I think that it must follow if it has no trade licence, there are no directors registered, there are no employees. It must follow that it is not doing anything.

1140 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, we spent half an hour this morning on this. (*Laughter*) I have to say my curiosity is piqued with this.

Who withdraw the licence application, if it has no directors and no employees? (*Interjections*)

Yes, whilst he is at it, the Chief Minister has given me another supplementary to ask. Who made the application if there are no directors and there are no employees? (*Laughter and interjections*)

1145 **A Member:** You have not said there are no directors. (*Interjections*) They are not registered as employees.

Hon. J J Bossano: Mr Speaker, the company that registered with the ETB did not register anybody working for it as director or as employee.

1150 We now learn that if it ever applied for a trade licence, which apparently it did, it did not proceed with the application.

Hon. D A Feetham: But, Mr Speaker, is it a Government-owned company or is it not a Government-owned company?

1155 **Hon. J J Bossano:** It is not a Government-owned company. I think the hon. Member was told that when the matter was first raised by him, Mr Speaker.

1160 **Hon. E J Reyes:** No, Mr Speaker. No, I was not told it was not a Government-owned company when the matter was first raised. I was passed to Companies House, for which I had to pay a fee and conduct a search. I found out that there was a company registered on 11th February 2013 with a registered office of 31 Town Range and there are two public servants as share subscribers and that is it, Mr Speaker. Nothing else has been told further to that.

1165 All I know, from the Minister with responsibility for Sports and Leisure, is that two employees, I believe, from his Ministry are the ones who actually signed the application for the trade licence, and in all previous answers the company had no direct employees, as such. So, one understands from all that the Minister for Employment has been saying, that these public servants help in the administration and in the set up of the company and so on. (*Interjection*)

1170 But we have not got to the nitty-gritty now of the latest supplementary by the Leader of the Opposition that from the records this seems to be a Government-owned company and there are no directors, no employees and not even an interest to pursue a trade licence anymore. So why do we have the existence of this company, which originally was going to show itself as trading from premises within the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority?

1175 **Hon. J J Bossano:** What the hon. Member has described is a situation in which there was something that happened at one point in time and nothing has happened since. (*Interjection*)

1180 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is this then one of those companies that the hon. Gentleman was answering questions about earlier on, which is the start-up scheme, where he says that people from the unemployment list or unemployed people were assisting in incorporating a company with public servants as directors and as shareholders in order to then be provided with Government contracts in whatever sector, to then recruit trainees from the Future Job Strategy? Is this one of those companies then?

Hon. J J Bossano: No, it is not. No.

1185 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I do not want to go round in circles, he must know what this company is about.

1190 You have a company. It is registered at Town Range, it's the offices of the hon. Gentleman, and he knows exactly what is happening in his office. It has public servants as shareholders of the company and it applies for a trade licence in the circumstances that the hon. Gentleman, Mr Reyes, has indicated. He must know more about this company surely... what type of a company it is, because if it is not one of those start-up companies and it is not a Government-owned company, what are public servants doing, as shareholders of this company, and what is it doing being registered at Town Range?

1195 **Hon. J J Bossano:** I know it is not one of the companies because those people that he is mentioning are not long-term unemployed construction workers in their 50s. (*Laughter*) So therefore, that is how it is. It is not one of those companies.

1200 The fact that some people set up a company then and nothing else has happened since is because whatever it is that might have happened did not happen and therefore there is no licence, there is no activity, there are no shareholders, there are no directors and no employees, and as far as I am aware there is no company any more.

1205 **Hon. D A Feetham:** But, Mr Speaker, it is a company that is registered at his offices. It is registered at his offices, with civil servants working for him as shareholders. What is this company? What was this company incorporated to do? What was its purpose?

Hon. J J Bossano: Well, Mr Speaker, I think the hon. Member is saying that it is registered in the sense that it was registered originally there. I think he will find that it is no longer registered anywhere and that the company no longer exists.

1210 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Alright, Mr Speaker, so the company no longer exists. The fact is that it was registered at Town Range, his offices, with his civil servants as shareholders. He must have been involved as the Minister or given the go ahead to its incorporation and its register in his offices.

I do not expect civil servants to go on a frolic of their own and incorporate companies and register them at his office. I mean, that is not the kind of thing that I would expect would happen.

1215 So therefore he must have some knowledge as to what this company is about. Can he explain what the purpose of this company was? He has now said it no longer exists. What was the original, the initial purpose of this company, its incorporation and registration at his offices?

1220 **Hon. J J Bossano:** I have not checked, but my understanding is that it is no longer there. I know that they never registered any employees and I know that they never proceeded with an application. Therefore whatever it was that might have been intended never happened. *(Interjection)* I do not know whether people were frolicking about. I am very lenient as a boss in my office, but allowing frolics is not amongst the activities that I permit. *(Laughter)*

1225 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, this is now starting to look like a Monty Python sketch – the one about the dead parrot. *(Laughter)* It is a very dead parrot indeed. Now, I know it is a very dead parrot, but what I am asking is when it was alive, what was its purpose?

1230 Now, Mr Speaker, he is the Minister responsible. It is not an improper question. It is not an unreasonable question. He must have given the go ahead to his civil servants to allow this incorporation of this company, for his civil servants to be shareholders of this company, for this company to be registered at his offices. What was the intention behind this company? Why the reticence of the Hon. Minister to provide me with the information that we are seeking? It is a perfectly reasonable question.

1235 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Mr Speaker, whatever might have been in the mind of those who thought of doing something, since the something did not happen, I do not feel I have to give any answers as to what might have happened if it had been proceeded with – it was not.

Hon. D A Feetham: Let me go back a stage.

1240 Was the Hon. Minister involved in authorising the use of this particular company, for whatever use? He does not want to tell me the use or its purpose. Was he involved in authorising his civil servants to assist in the incorporation of this particular company?

1245 **Hon. J J Bossano:** No, Mr Speaker, they do not require my authorisation for each individual company that is incorporated – this one or any other one.

Hon. D A Feetham: But does he know what the purpose of this company was when it was first incorporated? Does he know that?

1250 **Hon. J J Bossano:** It was not discussed with me and I had no reason to want to know.

Hon. D A Feetham: So is he answering that he does not know?

1255 **Hon. J J Bossano:** I am answering more, that I do not know and that I do not care, Mr Speaker. *(Laughter)*

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, can he clarify an issue which I have in my mind now and I would really seek his assistance in trying to clear the web somewhat.

We have here a company which is registered at his office. The shareholders –

1260 **Mr Speaker:** I honestly do not think that the Hon. Mr Bossino needs to go... I think we all know what it is that has happened. No, you do not need to say.

Ask a supplementary question by all means, but you do not need to give the background, because even I can understand fully what it is all about. *(Interjections)*

1265 **Hon. D J Bossino:** I accept that, Mr Speaker, and I take on that advice.

1270 As I understand it, the Government was providing corporate services to a fixed set of people – in other words, those who were in their 50s, long-term unemployed, I think he also said involved in the construction industry, etc. He has said that this particular company did not fit the bill – in other words, the owner of that particular company did not fit the bill. So can he tell me whether this service is being provided to people who do not fit into criteria? That is the supplementary Mr Speaker.

Hon. J J Bossano: Mr Speaker, I have already told him. I have great difficulty, much as I would like to help the hon. Member who is asking for my help, my problem in helping him is that the help I give him he does not seem to take because he keeps on asking me the same things.

1275 I told him initially that one identifiable category of people were approached by the Employment Service and did not approach us on their initiative, so we went looking for them. They are the people who had been long-term unemployed in their 50s in the construction industry, which we had... This one is not one of them.

1280 I did not say nobody that does not fit into this category has been helped with a company. I did not say that. I said *this* is a category that I can tell the hon. Member is the one that I think we have now exhausted, but tomorrow that could change. So if he is asking me... I have already answered that this is not a company in that category. So the fact that it is not in that category does not mean that all the 17 companies that have been identified by the hon. Member, it is a figure that I am taking at face value, I have not actually counted them, but assuming that there are 17, but if there were more... well, after all, they get their figures wrong a lot of the time and they may be wrong on the 17 as well, Mr Speaker.

1285 But, apart from the ones I have identified, which I think is about 8 or 9, which are the ones that are really doing the work of the construction industry, there have been other companies that have been helped in other areas, they have come looking for us. So this is one that the approach was not initiated by the Employment Service.

Q192/2014

Accident on scaffolding erected at Laguna Estate – Submission of incident report

1290 **Clerk:** Question 192, the Hon. J J Netto.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, can Government state if a child has had an accident as a result of climbing onto the scaffold erected in the Laguna Estate during the last three months, and if so, has the Factories Inspectorate made an incident report setting out the circumstances in which the incident took place and why, and if so, provide Parliament with a copy of the report?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

1300 **Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with 193 and 194.

Clerk: Question 193.

Q190-191/2014 continued –

Leisure Construction & Maintenance Company Limited – Details of employees and directors

1305 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, may I go back to the question about the Leisure Company and just ask one supplementary of the hon. Gentleman? It is information that I did not personally have, but it has been communicated to me, and I think it is a relevant supplementary and an important one.

Mr Speaker, I will be corrected if I am wrong, but the information that we have on this side was that the application for a trade licence related to the maintenance of children's parks in Gibraltar. Can the hon. Gentleman tell me whether that is accurate?

1310 **Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano):** Well, since I did not submit the application for the trade licence, no. I am neither responsible for what was put there, nor for its accuracy.

1315 **Hon. D A Feetham:** And he can confirm that he is not aware of any discussions of any kind between anybody in his Department and the owner, whoever that may be, of this particular company? We do not know because the shareholders are civil servants, so we do not know who stands behind those civil servants.

1320 He is not aware of any conversations between anybody in his Department and the owners of that company in relation to maintenance of children's parks or anything else that this company was purporting to potentially engage in?

1325 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, I do not know what it was purporting to do and not purporting to do, and I certainly do not think I have the responsibility to come here and report conversations that take place between members of my Department and anybody else as if I was eavesdropping. I do not do that to my staff.

Q193-194/2014
Scaffolding erected in Gibraltar –
Inspected and certified

Clerk: Question 193, the Hon. J J Netto.

1330 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Government state if all the scaffolding erected in Gibraltar since 2012 has been inspected and certified and found to be compliant with the Factories Act and its subsidiary legislation prior to the work commencing, and if not, please state the names of the company or companies that were not compliant and the respective site or sites on which this happened?

Clerk: Question 194.

1335 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Government state if there have been any site or sites in which scaffolding that had been inspected and certified after work commenced since 2012, or not inspected and certified at all, and if so, provide the names of the companies and the sites involved?

1340 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, the Government is aware that a child climbed onto a scaffolding in Laguna Estate, but the matter was not reported to the Factory Inspectorate. When the Department became aware, an inspection was carried out by the factory inspector to confirm the safety of the scaffolding.

1345 All scaffoldings, of which the Inspectorate has received notification, have been inspected and certified before works commenced, and none after works commenced or not at all.

1350 **Hon. J J Netto:** I am grateful, Mr Speaker, for that answer, but I did not quite catch the ending part to the first Question 192, where the Hon. Minister said that once they became aware they actually went on site. Have they proceeded to do an incident report to try and find the circumstances of what happened, by the Factory Inspectorate?

1355 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, no, because as I have said there was not an incident reported that required an inspection and a report. It is just that when I became aware of it, and it was brought to my knowledge by somebody, a member of the public or somebody, that there had been a child involved in climbing, I asked them to go and have a look just to be on the safe side of the safety requirements to check that everything was in order and that it was not that the child had been affected by a badly erected scaffolding. They said that clearly the scaffolding had been inspected initially when it was put up and certified as okay, and they went back in case anything had gone wrong and they could not really find anything that could explain how the accident had happened. So it was not taken any further.

Q195/2014
Future Job Strategy –
Total cost to taxpayer

Clerk: Question 195, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please provide details of the total cost of the Future Job Strategy to the taxpayer since 31st March 2013, broken down by month?

1365

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

1370

Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, since March 2013 the average monthly cost of the training programme is £975,000. As was the case with its predecessor schemes, the expenditure covers payments to the individuals in the training programme and operating costs.

1375

The persons covered are those employed by the Employment Training Company, the Construction Training Company, the Graduate Research and Development Company and the Supported Employment Company.

1380

In addition to the costs of materials used in training, which are charged to this item of expenditure and the running costs of Gib Dock and the Construction Training Centre facilities, payments for courses at Bleak House are also covered and payments made in respect of *ad hoc* training – for example, the provision of training to obtain a bus driver and heavy goods vehicle driver licences and plant operation qualifications, which are examples of some of the training that has been going on.

Registration fees payable to UK awarding bodies are also met from this expenditure for trainees that are taking part in the programmes.

1385

Hon. D A Feetham: It is per month, £975 million – (**A Member:** Thousand.) Sorry, £975,000 per month, but I asked only in relation to the Future Job Strategy, he has widened that to include other areas which are not strictly Future Job Strategy. Does he have just a figure for Future Job Strategy... a subdivision?

1390

Hon. J J Bossano: Mr Speaker, what he calls the Future Job Strategy is the label provided to the programme of training in the Election campaign. I mean we do not have anything now called the Future Job Strategy. What we have is all the training financed from one head of expenditure, which is the head of expenditure that is about... I think we put it in this year's budget at £11.7 million and that covers Gib Dock, the Construction Training Centre, all the materials, the wages of the people there, the fees for the City and Guilds, which we have to pay to the United Kingdom.

1395

Also some programmes that we have started running recently were as a result, for example, of having a situation where we could not provide people with driving licences for heavy good vehicles, or people with driving licences for buses. We have actually moved away from the traditional parameters that we are training people and placing them with somebody and we have told people who are unemployed that we would keep them on the unemployment register, but pay for their training for them to be able to get new skills and qualifications, which makes it easier for us to find them a job, that is also being funded from this vote and that is being funded for people who are, in effect, continuing unemployed and not trainees.

1400

So we are funding all the costs of all the people who are in the four companies that are doing trainees, which includes the Supported Employment which are permanent employees, and the people that sometimes somebody... for example, we have got some people who are doing hairdressing. They are not employed by us as trainee hairdressers, but we are meeting the cost of the tuition of the hairdressing, which was an initiative of somebody from the industry who came to us and said, 'I would be happy to take on people and train them if you meet the cost', and all that cost is also coming out of there.

1405

1410

Hon. D A Feetham: Does he have a breakdown in relation to this? For example, does he have a breakdown as to how much the wages are in relation to this figure, the wages component in relation to this figure of £975 million – (**A Member:** Thousand.) thousand, I beg your pardon?

1415

Hon. J J Bossano: I would say that probably the labour cost of the trainees is in the order of £600,000 or £700,000 out of that, which would include the employers' social insurance contributions.

1420

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, that is in relation, just to be absolutely clear, to those employees of the companies which form part of the label he described earlier of the Future Job Strategy? In other words, those three or four companies, ETCL and CTCL... yes?

Mr Speaker, he also referred to some individuals, who were currently registered unemployed, were being, in effect, paid by the Government an income, but were not following the FJS scheme procedure whereby they would be placed with an employer. Can he also confirm that those individuals are exclusively within the driver category, which I think he referred to?

1425

Hon. J J Bossano: They are not being paid an income. What I said was not that they were being paid, but that they are *not* being paid. So they are registered unemployed. They are getting the unemployment benefit. (**A Member:** Okay.) They continue to be offered jobs, but they are being given the opportunity of

attending courses, and what we are doing is paying the tuition. So, for example, the bus driver and the heavy goods vehicle is costing us £50 an hour for the training (*Interjection*) but this is being paid to the company that is providing the training that puts the bus and the driver and the fuel and charges us £50 an hour.

1430 But the guys that are being trained and then go on and get a licence, we pay for the cost of the licence. These people are on the dole. So we pay for them to be trained. We pay for the costs of the licence. That means of course that we are now able... we have put something like 20 through this system.

1435 The advantage is now that people who had driving licences, but only had the A licence kind of thing, we are now able to, when a vacancy comes up, we are now able to offer candidates with the necessary qualifications to be able to do the job. We have been able to employ some of them as coach drivers for the tourist industry and we have been able to employ some of them as truck drivers in the construction industry.

1440 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, can he confirm – my memory is a bit hazy on this issue – whether this is part of one of the announcements which the Minister for Traffic, I think, made at the time when I had that shadow responsibility? Is that not the same thing?

1445 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Not to my knowledge. Frankly, this is something that was... I mean in some of these cases there are a number of these things going on and in fact the initiative has come from the training provider, that is somebody came to us and said, 'Look, it is very difficult to find local people when we want to hire people for coach tours and it is difficult to find people when we want people to...' I mean there is an upsurge in demand now for people to drive trucks because there is a lot of construction work. We have got people unemployed, we are pressing people in the construction industry to take them on, so somebody came along and said, 'Well, look, I am prepared, for £50 an hour, to train people and take them through and get them qualified.' Then once they are qualified, if they are still unemployed, as soon as I have got a job, I will offer them a job.

1450 As a result of that it was not our idea; it was not *my* idea it was something... An idea put to me, which I welcomed, and therefore we invest a few thousand pounds in this kind of training. This is not big money because there are not thousands of people involved – there are only 20 or 30 – but we are doing this in this area, we are doing it in hairdressing. There are three or four activities of this kind, where in a sense what we are doing is upscaling the people that are registered unemployed. The basic departure from what we were doing before is that they continue to be unemployed, they do not get paid and they continue to be available for work and if, for example, the guy that is doing the training for a truck driver, a vacancy comes in for a store man and he wants to do the store man job, then he will abandon the course. There is no penalty and he goes and does the other job. So effectively all the people that are doing this kind of thing are included in the unemployment figures that I provide the hon. Member with.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q196-199/2014
Gibraltar Savings Bank –
Value of debentures; breakdown of debt

Clerk: Question 196, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1465 **Hon D A Feetham:** Can the Chief Minister please provide details of the value of Gibraltar Savings Bank debentures as at 31st January 2014?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

1470 **Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question with Questions 197 to 199.

Clerk: Question 197.

1475 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Will the Chief Minister please give a breakdown by debenture issue, of that part of the aggregate public debt that comprises Government debentures, as at 31st December 2013 and as at 31st January 2014?

Clerk: Question 198.

1480 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Chief Minister please state what was (i) the gross public debt; (ii) cash reserves; and (iii) the net public debt as at 31st December 2013 and 31st January 2014?

Clerk: Question 199.

1485 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Chief Minister please give a breakdown by bank and amount of that part of the aggregate public debt which comprises of bank debt as at 31st December 2013 and 31st January 2014?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

1490 **Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, the value of Gibraltar Savings Bank Debentures by maturity dates, as at 31st January 2014, was: one month, £23,390,700; 2015 debentures – that is the maturity year – £44,165,200; 2016 debentures, £23,076,600; 2017 debentures, £86,241,500; 2018 debentures, £165,074,000; 2019 debentures, £10,594,400; other debentures, £6,171,623.

1495 Government debentures by maturity dates were, as at 31st December 2013: 2013 debentures, £819,300; 2017 debentures, £67,917,600; one month's notice, £89,057,000.

On 31st January 2014 the figure was 2017 debentures, £67,913,800; and one month's notice, £88,440,800.

1500 The 2013 debenture obviously was repaid before January.

As at the end of December 2013 the gross debt was £457 million; the cash reserves were £222 million; and the net debt was £235 million.

At the end of January the gross debt was £456 million; the cash reserves £223 million; and the net debt £233 million.

1505 The aggregate public debt as at 31st December 2013 and 31st January 2014 included bank loans of £200 million.

These bank loans in both months were £150 million from Barclays Bank and £50 million from NatWest Offshore Limited.

Q200/2014

Personnel in public service – Increase in numbers

1510 **Clerk:** Question 200, the Hon D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Can the Chief Minister please provide the total net increase in numbers of personnel in the public service since he was elected into office broken down by reference to the Civil Service, the Gibraltar Development Corporation, Government-owned companies and public authorities?

1515 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety.

Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment, and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, the net increase between 31st December 2011 and 31st December 2013 is as follows: Civil Service, 123; GDC, 28; Government Agencies and companies, 654.

1520 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, does the 654 include Future Job Strategy trainees within that figure of 654, or is he just giving me, effectively, the permanent increase in the public service in relation to these two areas of Government-owned companies and public authorities?

1525 **Hon. J J Bossano:** It includes everybody who was paid that month from any Government company and therefore it includes the four training companies. The figure is – the hon. Member will remember because it used to be done before – is what the Statistics Office produces every quarter, which shows the people who got paid at the end of that month.

1530 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

Hon. D A Feetham: May I just have a moment?

1535 **Mr Speaker:** Okay.

May I ask the hon. Member to ask the next question because it is a very lengthy schedule in the next question and they can be looking at it at the same time.

Hon. D A Feetham: I do not think I have another question now.

1540 **Mr Speaker:** Mr Bossino.
Question 201.

Hon. D J Bossino: Ah, yes.

DEPUTY CHIEF MINISTER

**Q201/2014
Gibraltar Civil Aviation –
Security screening**

1545 **Clerk:** Question 201, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister with responsibility for Aviation please provide details since he came to office of all those individuals other than the Chief Minister who have benefitted from not having to pass through customs or immigration control when boarding or disembarking from a flight at Gibraltar Airport and have had use of an official car of the Gibraltar Government to include the G1?

1550

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia): Mr Speaker, I will now hand over the hon. Member a schedule containing the information requested.

Answer to Question 201

The Gibraltar Civil Aviation Security Programme 2014 states that the following persons are exempt from security screening:

Section A

- Members of The Royal Family
- Lords and Ladies in Waiting when representing the Queen
- Members of Foreign and Commonwealth Royal Families

Section B

- The Chief Minister of the Government of Gibraltar
- The Governor of Gibraltar
- The Judges of the Court of Appeal
- The spouse of the Chief Minister of Gibraltar
- The spouse of the Governor of Gibraltar
- The spouses and children accompanying persons listed in this section.

Any other person who from time to time may be notified as being authorised by the Gibraltar Civil Aviation Security Regulator

Section C

Police protection officers acting in pursuance of their duties, the person or persons they are protecting, and any other person or persons accompanying the protected person and the police protection officer as they enter security restricted areas at the airport.

As common practice, the person on the exempt list are also granted exemption from Immigration and Customs procedures.

As the persons listed above are automatically exempt from screening, records are not kept of the occasions on which they exercise their privilege.

The Gibraltar Civil Aviation Security Regulator has authorised the following persons as being exempt from screening since I came into Office:

Contd....

Answer to Question No 201

| DATE | FLIGHT NUMBER | NAME | REQUESTED BY | OFFICIAL CAR (OC) |
|------------|---------------|---|--------------|-------------------|
| 11/03/2012 | BA491 | Air Chief Marshal Sir Stuart Peach | MoD | OC |
| 23/03/2012 | BA491 | Lord Greville Janner Ms Maureen Gold, PS to Lord Janner | GoG | OC |
| 04/04/2012 | BA491 | Lord Prescott Mrs Prescott | GoG | |
| 14/04/2012 | ZB69 | Mr M Penning, MP Mrs Penning | GoG | OC |
| 13/06/2012 | BA491 | Royal Visit Support Party Mr J Smedley - Private Secretary Ms P Southgate-Sands - Asst Private Secretary Ms H Howard - Asst Press Secretary Mr C Sheppard - Protection Officer/Police Mr P Andrews - Protection Officer/Police Mr B Tougher - Valet | GoG | OC |
| 13/06/2012 | BA491 | Dr J J Garcia – Deputy Chief Minister(Accompanying the Chief Minister) Mr E Gomez – Chief Secretary Mr M Llamas – Senior Legal Adviser Mr G Flower – Senior Personal Assistant Mr C Golt – Press Officer | GoG | OC |
| 18/07/2012 | BA491 | Ms E Laing, MP - MOD Special Representative Mr A Helliwell - Deputy Director for Policy at Joint Forces Command | MoD | OC |
| 07/09/2012 | BA 491 | Sir John Chapple - Ex Governor of Gibraltar Lady Chapple Sir Francis Richards - Ex Governor of Gibraltar | GoG | OC |
| 08/09/2012 | Private | Music Festival VIPs Ms J Cornish Ms C Darke Ms T Wilson Mr M Dawson | GoG | OC |
| 11/09/2012 | BA 491 | Ms E Laing, MP - MOD Special Representative | MoD | |

Contd...

Contd Answer to Question No 201

| DATE | FLIGHT NUMBER | NAME | REQUESTED BY | OFFICIAL CAR (OC) |
|------------|---------------|---|--------------|-------------------|
| 19/09/2012 | Private | Mr S Reuben & Mr D Ruben | GoG | |
| 08/10/2012 | BA 491 | Dr J J Garcia – Deputy Chief Minister (Acting Chief Minister) Mr E Gomez – Chief Secretary | GoG | OC |
| 12/10/2012 | Private | Mr D Cote | GoG | |
| 21/10/2012 | Private | Mr A Gore Mr J Schlichter Ms Nina Desousa | GoG | OC |
| 17/01/2013 | BA 491 | Air Chief Marshal Sir Stuart Peach Captain Paul Marshall, RN Ms K Langley | MoD | OC |
| 10/03/2013 | BA 493 | Admiral Sir Mark Stanhope Lady Stanhope Commander Dominy | MoD | |
| 08/04/2013 | BA 491 | Azizah Pahang - Crown Princess Muhammad Pahang - Crown Prince Mr Mohd Azeri Mohd YUSOF - Bodyguard Mr Mohd Zahor Ahmad – Butler Mr Misran Daim - Bodyguard Captain Mohamed Najmi Mohamad Sharawi – ADC Mr Shariful Kamal Shaharuddin – Personal Assistant HRH Prince Abdullah Ahmad Shah - Crown Prince Major Ahmad Rashidi Bin Ithnin - Malaysian High Commission in London | GoG | |
| 08/04/2013 | EZY8902 | Hassanal Pahang - Crown Prince Ms A Gibbon – Personal Assistant Mr Mohamed Arif Hasnan – Bodyguard | GoG | |
| 03/05/2013 | Private | Mr S Reuben | GoG | |
| 17/05/2013 | EZY8901 | Ms Lesley Pallett | GoG | |
| 22/05/2013 | Private | Mr J Lennon Ms A Kuhlman Mr A Greig | GoG | OC |

Contd...

Contd Answer to Question No 201

| DATE | FLIGHT NUMBER | NAME | REQUESTED BY | OFFICIAL CAR (OC) |
|------------|---------------|--|--------------|-------------------|
| 18/06/2013 | Private | Rev T Howarth Mr D Michael Mr M Ostro Rabbi A Levy Rabbi E Mirvis Archbishop V Nichols Fr J O'Leary Rt Rev N McCulloch | GoG | OC |
| 20/06/2013 | BA 491 | Mr D Taub, Israeli Ambassador to UK Mrs Z Taub Mr D Dawson, Protection Officer | GoG | |
| 05/07/2013 | BA 491 | Minister J Ciechanowski Minister A Kunert Bishop J Guzdek Brigadier General K Szymański Brigadier General W Grudziński Mr W Strzałkowski | GoG | OC |
| 26/07/2013 | BA 491 | General Sir R Barrons, Commander Joint Forces Command Capt L Nicol, Asst MA to the General Ms T Walton, PS to the General | MoD | |
| 11/09/2013 | | The Hon H Hughes Chf Min ANGUILLA The Hon C Cannonier Prem BERMUDA The Hon Dr O Smith Prem BVI The Hon A McLaughlin Prem CAYMAN ISLANDS The Hon I Hansen FALKLAND ISLANDS The Hon R Meade Prem MONTSERRAT Deputy Mayor S Young PITCAIRN ISLANDS The Hon Dr R Ewing Prem TURKS &CAICO ISLANDS Mr P Bradley ANGUILLA Mr B Penn BVI Mr R James TURKS & CAICOS ISLANDS Ms J Ahearn CAYMAN ISLANDS | GoG | OC |
| 15/09/2013 | BA 493 | Air Chief Marshall Sir S Peach, Vice Chief of the Defence Staff Flight Lieutenant B Goodwin, ADC to the Air Chief Marshall | MoD | |

Contd...

Contd Answer to Question No 201

| DATE | FLIGHT NUMBER | NAME | REQUESTED BY | OFFICIAL CAR (OC) |
|------------|---------------|--|--------------|-------------------|
| 15/09/2013 | ZB 063 | Lady B Peach, Wife of Air Chief Marshall Peach | MoD | |
| 20/10/2013 | BA 491 | Mr J Holland Ms M Holland Mr S Taylor Ms M Chisholm Ms Y Yau Mr P Loasby | GoG | |
| 21/10/2013 | BA 491 | Capt F Pitto, ADC to HE the Governor | MoD | |
| 19/11/2013 | BA 491 | Sir John Major Mr A Earl Ms A Warburton Mr D Stevens Mr P Brady | GoG | |
| 26/11/2013 | BA 491 | Vice Admiral D Steel, Second Sea Lord Capt S Long RN, Flag Lieutenant WO1 T Casey, Senior Naval Warrant Officer | MoD | |
| 11/12/2013 | BA 491 | Rear Admiral Bennett – Chief of Staff Joint Forces Command Commander R Scandling – Joint Forces Command Lieutenant Commander A Mason – Joint Forces Command Rt Hon M Francois MP – Minister for the Armed Forces Mr A Helliwell – Joint Force Command Ms C John – Assistant Private Secretary to the Minister | MoD | |
| 12/12/2013 | Private | Sir R Broadbent Mr K Grace Mr J Tarry Mr M Chipchase | GoG | OC |

**Q200/2014 continued –
Personnel in public service –
Increase in numbers**

1555 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, may I now ask a supplementary whilst my learned and hon. Friend analyses the schedule?

Mr Speaker, the answer that he has given me... effectively I have done the total here. It is a total increase in the public service of 805 employees in the public service, from when they got elected to date. That is the answer that he has given me.

1560 I note that earlier on he answered in relation to one of the questions that my hon. Friend, Mr Bossino, asked about the number of people employed in the public and the private sector, he said that in the public sector the number was 6,393. We are looking at the Employment Survey, and the Employment Survey indicates that for 2011 there were 4,574 people in the public service... in the public sector, and in 2012, 4,991. So the figures that he provided Mr Bossino, it appears that there has been a larger increase in the public service than in the answer that he has provided me today. Now, I do not know, that may be explainable, and I am asking him, can he explain the differences in the numbers.

1565

Hon. J J Bossano: Yes, Mr Speaker, the answer and the explanation is a very simple one. The figures are drawn from different sources.

1570 The Employment Survey is the return produced by employers, who put down who they employ. The figure that he has asked me today... the figure of the Employment Survey is only available for one month a year – the month of October. The figure that I have given him is the most recent figure of the computer in the ETB. To give him an indication of why such discrepancies arise, for example, the people who were employed during the summer who have come out from university and were working during the summer
1575 season as beach keepers and life savers and all those who were there until September and then they went back to the university, the Department forgot to inform the ETB that they were no longer there until January and so they will have been included in December.

If he looks back at the questions that I used to put and if I remind them of that, I often pointed out to the Government of the day that there were four different sources of information and four different figures. So if you ask the Social Insurance, you get one figure. If you get it from the Employment Service, you get another one. If you ask the Departments, you get a different one. And if you get the computer in the ETB, you probably have the least accurate of the four and that is because there is no guarantee. We have been trying hard for the last two years to reduce that gap, that discrepancy, between one figure and the other and we are now in the process of tracking down 150 employers who may no longer exist, but have never
1580 bothered to tell anybody that they do not exist, and therefore the records remain in the Employment Service and that may be 200 or 300 people. But there is a serious problem and I think until we start effectively fining people for failing to inform the Department when somebody is no longer working... I mean it is easier to enforce the illegal labour thing where they have got somebody working and they do not tell us, but it is more difficult to enforce when the guy just disappears and nobody tells us.

1590 The answer is that subject to what I have said on a number of occasions about the lack of accuracy of the Employment Service, I think the hon. Member should take the figure that I have given him today with a pinch of salt, but it is a figure that I have.

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, I could understand all that if I were asking questions about the private sector, but we are talking about the public sector.

1595 One would think that the figures in terms of increases in the public sector would be far more accurate than the private sector. I mean employers... the public sector, the employers are Government-owned companies, Government Authorities, Government Departments, the GDC. You see, if one looks at the Employment Survey, one sees that there is an increase from 2011 of 4,574 employees in the public service to 4,991 in 2012, an increase of 9.1% and that is the figures that his Department produced. Today there is a huge jump from there in 2012 to 6,393 and that is a significant increase in the public service.

I had asked for a question about the net increase in the public services. They got into office in December and the answer is 805. That is the answer, 805 today, but if you look at the Employment Survey the increase, in accordance with the answer that he has provided Mr Bossino is of the order of 1,400 from 2012 to today. Which of the two represents a more accurate picture as to the increase in the public service, the figures in the Employment Survey, which he has now supplemented today or this answer that he has provided to me which appears to indicate that there is 805 net increase in the public service since they got into office?
1605

1610 **Hon. J J Bossano:** The most accurate figure is the one I provided him today because that is the payroll. That is to say – (*Interjections*) The one produced by the Statistics Office.

Hon. D A Feetham: To him or me?

1615 **Hon. J J Bossano:** The one that says that there were 123 more people in the Civil Service. The one I have just given him is the payroll. So at the end of December 2011, x number of people were paid, and two years later y people were paid. The difference between the x and the y is the 805 that is... So we had 805 people more being paid out of public funds in December 2013 as opposed to December 2011, and 450 of those would be the trainees.

1620 In terms of the people in the data base, I agree with the hon. Member that the records of the public sector ought to be better than the records of the private sector, but I can tell him that when I got there I discovered that they had people who had left years ago from the Health Authority and nobody had bothered to terminate the contract and send it to the ETB.

1625 We did an exercise about six months ago where we took... whereas the figure in the Health Authority might be something like 800 in the estimate, the figure in the Employment Service was 1,200. We took about 400 people out, some of whom were dead and buried. It has still not been cleaned up and it is a mammoth task. I have got people checking, inputting and correcting things. If he looks back at the answers that they provided me with when I asked similar questions, he will find that in fact the gap is smaller,

1630 maybe by something like 600 or 700, which is as much as I have been able to whittle it down by, by
checking, but it means checking every single employer in Gibraltar and chasing every single Department. I
1635 think, frankly, it is simply not on that Government Departments themselves should be so lax in complying
with the law and informing the Employment Service of the terminations of the employees they have got;
but there are people retired for years and nobody had told...

Indeed, at one stage when I started chasing people up on this I was told by... I think it was by people in
1635 Human Resources or in the Chief Secretary's Office that they thought that the Civil Service did not have to
comply with this. I pointed out to them that there was no exemption for the Crown. The idea was that
because civil servants get a letter of appointment, that they did not have to fill up a termination of
employment form and send it to the ETB and that apparently had been going on for years and nobody had
1640 challenged it previously.

But the answer is that I would expect that the figure that I have given him earlier today, which is what I
got from somebody pushing the button in the computer and saying what is the number, and that is the
number that has come out, we can actually produce the 6,000 names and then we can go and see if those
people are still alive. But the reality of it is that we are trying to reduce the inaccuracy in the system by
1645 chasing people up in the Departments and by chasing private sector employers. Fairly soon I am going to be
announcing that we are going to start fining people if they do not deliver, whether they are in the public or
in the private.

Hon. D A Feetham: I mean, it seemed very odd to me, I have to say, when the hon. Gentleman gave
these figures because on a quick calculation what he indicated was that the total labour force in Gibraltar
1650 public and private sector was in the order of over 26,000, and that seemed to me to be out by about 2,000 or
3,000. (*Interjection*)

So the figures that he has provided for Mr Bossino really are taken from the computer. They are not –
the public service I am talking about – they are not payroll, but presumably if we were to ask next time
round what is the total number of people on the payroll in the public service, those figures are available
1655 from the Treasury in the same way as he has actually given me the net increase of, in the public service
from those figures in answer to my question.

Hon. J J Bossano: That calculation is done on a quarterly basis, and it is done on a quarterly basis by
the statistics that used to be provided for the previous Government and has always been provided. So that
1660 quarterly head count... the different sources count things in a different way. So, for example, in the case of
the figures that I have given him today, it is people who were actually in the month of December receiving
a salary at the end of the month. But it would include, for example, people who are working as supply,
because somebody is on maternity leave. It is the most accurate in the sense that if you got paid you are
1665 there and if you did not get paid you are not there. So if somebody is on unpaid leave they would not be
there. The others are the returns from employers and is what the employer puts down in the form and the
returns from the Employment Service is what somebody put there sometime in the past and either failed to
cancel or even... we had a situation where I have mentioned it to the hon. Member before... The four years,
I know that they think that I have got it in for Mr Montiel, but I do not (**A Member:** You do.) but I have
1670 mentioned before that the four years that Mr Montiel was actually the Minister for Employment responsible
for the accuracy of this, he appeared as not being in Government and being in the GDC in Bleak House.
(*Laughter*) He was hardly in a position to say to anybody, 'I am going to fine you for not notifying it', when
he had failed to notify his own termination in Bleak House and there he was sitting in the office with his
name in the computer saying he was not there. There was a sibling somewhere in Bleak House monitoring
the employment.

1675 Well, I have to say even Mr Speaker was still shown as being in the GDC when I started checking the
records, so –

Mr Speaker: In October 2012, I remember making a return to the Board signifying that I was
terminating employment at the end of October.

1680 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, in December 2011 you were still there, Mr Speaker. (*Laughter and
interjections*)

1685 **Mr Speaker:** [*Inaudible*]

**Q201/2014 continued –
Gibraltar Civil Aviation –
Security screening**

Clerk: Question –

Hon. D J Bossino: No, Mr Speaker, I have got a supplementary in relation to Question 201.

1690 Mr Speaker, I have had some time to look at the schedule and it very helpfully sets out what is the security screening policy of the Gibraltar Civil Aviation Security Programme. Now that particular programme is dated 2014.

1695 Can the Hon. the Chief Minister...the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister – Freudian slip there – tell me what the differences are between the 2014 policy and the policy which was there before that one?

Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia): Yes, Mr Speaker, there was a change to the original programme of 2010, when in April 2011, when the hon. Members were in Government, they added the spouse of the Chief Minister and the spouse of the Governor to the people who are exempt.

1700 There was another change in 2012 when the Civil Aviation Security Regulator was authorised to authorise *ad hoc* exemptions at the request of the Minister for Civil Aviation and that was a change which basically reflected the practice which had been set in place since 2010. Then in addition to that, in 2012 the police protection officers undertaking escorting duties were also included in the list.

1705 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, he has mentioned the spouse of the Chief Minister and the spouse of the Governor of Gibraltar. Presumably what was also added was the spouses and children accompanying any of the above individuals or was that the... that must be the case, surely?

1710 It is the final bullet point in section – (*Interjection*) Exactly. In section B. The Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister has referred to the two I have just referred to, but there is also a final one which refers to... it just logically follows that that would have been added – the spouses and children accompanying persons listed in this section.

1715 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the only changes that we made were those in 2012, were to the escorting policemen and to the procedure. Everything else was there from before we came, including the children, and so it must have been done when the hon. Members were in Government.

1720 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, if I can assist, it is the escorting policemen because we had the Royal visit, I think, in that year and there were escorting policemen escorting Members of the Royal Family. The Chief Minister and the Governor do not travel through the air terminal... at least never have. There may be a situation in the future where we might have to, but we have never travelled with escorting policemen through the air terminal. So this was specifically done to deal with those who were escorting the Royal Family members who came to Gibraltar.

Everything else, every single aspect of the procedure is exactly as set down by them when they were in Administration, and the practice which they built up when they were in Administration.

**Q202-203/2014 –
Erection of scaffolding –
Government and private projects**

1725 **Clerk:** Question 202, the Hon. J J Netto.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, can the Government state the number of scaffolds that have been erected since 2012 to date, stating which ones are Government projects and which ones are private ones?

1730 **Clerk:** Answer the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia): Yes, Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 203.

1735 **Clerk:** Question 203.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, can the Government state the date and location of every scaffold that has been erected since 2012, either in Government projects or private ones, the date on which the scaffold was dismantled, the projects that are still ongoing and the name of the company erecting the scaffold and for what project?

1740

Clerk: Answer the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia): Mr Speaker, I will now hand the hon. Member a schedule containing the information requested.

Answer to Question No 202 & 203

| No | COMPANY | SCAFFOLD LOCATION | START DATE | REMOVAL DATE | WORKS | GOG / PRIVATE |
|----|--------------------|---|------------|--------------|---------------------------------------|---------------|
| 1 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | Rosia Court, Rosia Road | 06-Feb-12 | 20-Feb-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 2 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | Rosia Court, Rosia Road | 12-Feb-12 | 12-Mar-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 3 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | Cornwall's Lane Adj to Horse Barrack lane | 12-Feb-12 | 18-Mar-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 4 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | Lynches Lane | 26-Feb-12 | 11-Mar-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 5 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 67 Irish Town | 26-Feb-12 | 11-Mar-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 6 | A & M Scaffolding | 46 Flat Bastion Road | | | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 7 | Access | 1 Town Range | 05-Mar-12 | 26-Mar-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 8 | Casais | Arengo's Palace Car Park | 01-Mar-12 | 01-Sep-12 | Construction of Multi Storey Car Park | HMGOG |
| 9 | Access | Library Ramp | 12-Feb-12 | 08-Mar-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 10 | Mersey Castle | 30 Cornwall Lane | 18-Mar-12 | 01-Apr-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 11 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | South Pavilion | | | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 12 | Mersey Castle | 19-21 Scud Hill | 30-Jan-12 | 30-Jun-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 13 | Mersey Castle | 75 Governors Street | 01-Mar-12 | 08-Apr-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 14 | Mersey Castle | 18 Shorthorn Estate | 26-Mar-12 | 26-May-12 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 15 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 281 Main Street | 02-Apr-12 | 02-May-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 23 | Mersey Castle | 31-33-35 Cannon Lane | 02-Dec-12 | 03-Mar-13 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 24 | Mersey Castle | Piazzella, Governors Square | 24-Apr-12 | 24-Jun-12 | Part of Building Application | |
| 25 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 17-19 Old Naval Hospital Road | 25-Apr-12 | 09-May-12 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 26 | A & M Scaffolding | Main Street / Bomb House Lane | 06-May-12 | 16-Jul-12 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 27 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 12 Prince Edwards Road | 06-May-12 | 20-May-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 28 | Mersey Castle | Horse Barrack Lane | 06-May-12 | 20-May-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 29 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 79 Irish Town | 13-May-12 | 03-Jun-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |

Contd...

Contd Answer to Question No 202 & 203

| No | COMPANY | SCAFFOLD LOCATION | START DATE | REMOVAL DATE | WORKS | GOG / PRIVATE |
|----|--------------------------------|--|------------|--------------|--------------------------------------|---------------|
| 30 | A & M Scaffolding | Governor's Parade & Main Street (Opposite Cathedral) | 27-May-12 | 10-Jun-12 | Part of Queen's Jubilee Celebrations | HMGOG |
| 31 | A & M Scaffolding | 284-288 Main Street | 19-May-12 | 02-Jun-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 32 | A & M Scaffolding | 4 Cathedral Square | 19-May-12 | 19-Jun-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 33 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 218 Main Street | 10-Jun-12 | 12-Aug-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 34 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 38-40 Flat Bastion Road | 06-Jun-12 | 13-Jun-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 35 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 1-4 Demaya's Ramp | 17-Jun-12 | 21-Oct-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 36 | A & M Scaffolding | Catholic Community Centre, Zoca Flank | | | General Repairs to Building | PRIVATE |
| 37 | A & M Scaffolding | 186-188 Main Street | 17-Jun-12 | 17-Jul-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 38 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 325 Main Street | 27-Jun-12 | 17-Jul-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 39 | A & M Scaffolding | Catholic Community Centre | 27-Jun-12 | 29-Jul-12 | General Repairs to Building | PRIVATE |
| 40 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 2 Hospital Hill | 02-Jul-12 | 03-Jul-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 41 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | Bargain Stores/La Cantina | 08-Jul-12 | 12-Aug-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 42 | Mersey Castle | Church of Scotland | 07-Jul-12 | 12-Aug-12 | Repairs to Façade and Roof | PRIVATE |
| 43 | A & M Scaffolding | Clipper Bar Irish Town | 15-Jul-12 | 19-Jul-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 44 | Mersey Castle | 1 Boyd Street - Queens Hotel | 16-Jul-12 | 06-Aug-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 45 | A & M Scaffolding | 5D Library Ramp | 22-Jul-12 | 23-Sep-12 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 46 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 9-11 New Passage | 01-Aug-12 | 24-Aug-12 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 47 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 10 Castle Street | 02-Aug-12 | 30-Aug-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 48 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 11 Castle Road | 14-Aug-12 | 24-Aug-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 49 | Mersey Castle | 1 Boyd Street | 15-Aug-12 | 08-Sep-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 50 | A & M Scaffolding | 292 Main Street | 23-Sep-12 | 25-Oct-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 51 | Admiral Bridge Investments Ltd | 3 Main Street & 1 to 7 Crutchett's Ramp | 30-Jan-10 | 30-Jan-14 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |

Contd...

Contd Answer to Question No 202 & 203

| No | COMPANY | SCAFFOLD LOCATION | START DATE | REMOVAL DATE | WORKS | GOG / PRIVATE |
|----|-------------------------|---|------------|----------------------|---|---------------|
| 52 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 15-27 City Mill Lane | 10-Oct-12 | 10-Nov-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 53 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 17 Town Range Brooke House | 14-Oct-12 | 21-Oct-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 54 | F T Construction Ltd | 68 Main Street | 14-Oct-12 | 04-Nov-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 55 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | Boschetti's Steps | 21-Oct-12 | 28-Oct-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 56 | First Gibscaffolding Co | The Convent, Main Street | 15-Oct-12 | 18-Feb-13 | Repairs to Façade | HMGOG |
| 57 | A & M Scaffolding | 192 Main Street | 18-Nov-12 | 25-Nov-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 58 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 16 Crutchets Ramp | 18-Nov-12 | 25-Nov-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 59 | Access Scaffolding | 35-37 Irish Town | 18-Nov-12 | 16-Dec-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 60 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 204 Main Street | 09-Dec-12 | 16-Dec-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 61 | Casais | 7 - 9 King's Yard Lane | | | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 62 | Prime Auto Ltd | 5a-7 Rodgers Road | 14-Dec-12 | 21-Dec-12 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 63 | Casais Ltd | 7-9 King's Yard lane | 07-Jan-13 | 30-Sep-13 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 64 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 17 Castle Street | 09-Jan-13 | 30-Jan-13 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 65 | Access Scaffolding | 31-33 Irish Town | 04-Feb-13 | 04-Mar-13 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 66 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 132-136 Main Street | 13-Jan-13 | 31-Mar-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 67 | Mersey Castle | 117 Main Street | 20-Jan-13 | 03-Mar-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 68 | Mersey Castle | 12 John Mackintosh Square | 15-Jan-13 | 03-Mar-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 69 | Mersey Castle | 317 Main Street | 20-Jan-13 | 03-Mar-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 70 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 22 Main Street | 15-Jan-13 | 29-Jan-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 71 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 4 George's lane | 31-Mar-13 | 31-May-13 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 72 | Koala Construction Ltd | John Mackintosh Square, Main Guard Heritage Offices | 04-Feb-13 | 30/11/2013 - ONGOING | Govt Job - Part of Building Application - Main Guard Heritage Offices | HMGOG |
| 73 | Andrews Kent & Stone. | 86-90 Main Street / Tuckey's Lane | 01-Jan-13 | 06-Oct-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |

Contd...

GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT, THURSDAY, 20th FEBRUARY 2014

Contd Answer to Question No 202 & 203

| No | COMPANY | SCAFFOLD LOCATION | START DATE | REMOVAL DATE | WORKS | GOG / PRIVATE |
|-----------|------------------------|---|-------------------|----------------------|---|----------------------|
| 74 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | Waterport Place | 01-Feb-13 | 14-Feb-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 75 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 61B Devil's Tower Rd (Trico) | 17-Mar-13 | 24-Mar-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 76 | A & M Scaffolding | 12 Bomb House Lane | 24-Mar-13 | 07-Apr-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 77 | A & M Scaffolding | 15 RodgersRoad | 07-Apr-13 | 21-Apr-13 | Part of Building Application - Reconstruction of Baclonies | PRIVATE |
| 78 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | Loreto Convent Europa Road | 23-Mar-13 | 13-Apr-13 | Govt Job - Part of Building Application - Schools extension at St Bernards Road | HMGOG |
| 79 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 22 Withams Road | 01-Apr-13 | 15-Apr-13 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 80 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 10 Irish Town | 07-Apr-13 | 21-Apr-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 81 | F T Construction | Ex-Shell House Line Wall Road | 05-May-13 | 19-May-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 82 | A & M Scaffolding | 4 Benzimra's Alley | 12-May-13 | 02-Jun-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 83 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 6 George's Lane | 05-May-13 | 19/05/2013 - ONGOING | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 84 | Access | 46 Castle Road | 20-May-13 | 29-Jul-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 85 | Koala Construction Ltd | 1 Parody's Passage | 03-Jun-13 | 12-Aug-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 86 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 244 Main Street | 08-Jun-13 | 16-Jun-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 87 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | Line Wall Road (Traffic Lights by American Steps) rear of 10 Irish Town | 28-Jun-13 | 11-Jul-13 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 88 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | Gavino's Passage | 01-Jun-13 | 15-Jul-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 89 | A & M Scaffolding | 35 Town range | 05-Jul-13 | 05-Sep-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 90 | A & M Scaffolding | 1 Corral Road | 27-Jul-13 | 18-Aug-13 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 91 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 12 Governor's Lane | 06-Jul-13 | 16-Aug-13 | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 92 | A & M Scaffolding | 46 Flat Bastion Road | 10-Jul-13 | 07-Aug-13 | Govt Job - Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 93 | A & M Scaffolding | 222 Main Street | 14-Jul-13 | 16-Aug-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |

Contd...

Contd Answer to Question No 202 & 203

| No | COMPANY | SCAFFOLD LOCATION | START DATE | REMOVAL DATE | WORKS | GOG / PRIVATE |
|-----|---|---------------------------------------|------------|----------------------|---|---------------|
| 94 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 12 Cotchfoe House Devil's Tower Road | 20-Jul-13 | 05-Aug-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 95 | A & M Scaffolding | 6 B Buena Vista Road | 29-Jul-13 | 26-Aug-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 96 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 17 Governor's Street | 04-Aug-13 | 01-Sep-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 97 | A & M Scaffolding | St Mary The Crowned Main Street | 01-Sep-13 | 01/03/2014 - ONGOING | Govt Job - Cathedral St Mary The Crowned - Repairs to Façade | HMGOG |
| 98 | A & M Scaffolding | Shackleton House Shackleton Road | 08-Sep-13 | 08-Dec-13 | Govt Job - Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 99 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | Queens Cinema Boyd Street | 04-Oct-13 | 03-Nov-13 | Repairs to Façade | HMGOG |
| 100 | A & M Scaffolding | 21 Line Wall Road | 20-Oct-13 | 27-Oct-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 101 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 226 Main Street | 23-Oct-13 | 06-Nov-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 102 | Gibraltar Joinery Building Services Limited | Ex-St Bernards Hospital | 21-Oct-13 | 21/04/2014 - ONGOING | Govt Job - Part of Building Application - Demolition / Reconstruction / internal & external alterations | HMGOG |
| 103 | Access | 10 Trafalgar House | 21-Oct-13 | 04-Nov-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 104 | Hercon Ltd | 59/61 Irish Town & 23 Tuckey's Lane | 01-Nov-13 | 10/01/2015 - ONGOING | Part of Building Application - Internal Etxernal alterations & extension | PRIVATE |
| 105 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | Top of Bishop Rapallo Ramp | 11-Nov-13 | 02-Dec-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 106 | A & M Scaffolding | Chatham Counterguard Fish Market Lane | 13-Nov-13 | 02-Dec-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 107 | Gibraltar Joinery Buinding Services Limited | City Hall Line Wall Road | 13-Nov-13 | 22-Nov-13 | Repairs to Façade | HMGOG |
| 108 | Koala Contruction Ltd | 10 City Mill Lane | 24-Nov-13 | 12-Jan-14 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 109 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 221-225 Main Street | 27-Nov-13 | 29-Nov-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 110 | A & M Scaffolding | Halifax Road | 05-Dec-13 | 20-Dec-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |

Contd...

Contd Answer to Question No 202 & 203

| No | COMPANY | SCAFFOLD LOCATION | START DATE | REMOVAL DATE | WORKS | GOG / PRIVATE |
|-----|-------------------------------------|----------------------------|------------|----------------------|---|---------------|
| 111 | A & M Scaffolding | 62-64 Irish Town | 08-Dec-13 | 15-Dec-13 | Part of Building Application - Internal External alterations & extension | PRIVATE |
| 112 | Akis Enterprise Ltd | Serfaty's Passage | 08-Nov-13 | 20-Dec-13 | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |
| 113 | TGS Maintenance Section | Garrod Road | 08-Jan-14 | 10-Jan-14 | Emergency. Roof panels fell due to recent stormy weather. | PRIVATE |
| 114 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 8 Rodgers Road | 13-Jan-14 | 12/05/2014 - ONGOING | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 115 | Gibraltar Joinery Building Services | Laguna & Glacis Estate | 13/01/2014 | 31/12/2014 - ONGOING | Govt Job - External refurbishment to Laguna, Glacis Estates and Moorish Castle Estate | HMGOG |
| 116 | A & M Scaffolding | Post Office Main Street | 22-Jan-14 | 29-Jan-14 | Govt Job - Repairs to Gutters | HMGOG |
| 117 | Access | Victualling Office Lane | 08-Feb-14 | 09/03/2014 - ONGOING | Repairs to façade | PRIVATE |
| 118 | Koala Construction | Anderson House Calpe Road | 03-Feb-14 | 03/12/2014 - ONGOING | Government Job - General Repairs to Building | HMGOG |
| 119 | Koala Construction | Gibraltar Museum | 07-Feb-14 | 16-Apr-14 | Government Job - General Repairs to External façade and Balconies | HMGOG |
| 120 | Casais | Main Street / Bedlam Court | | | Part of Building Application | PRIVATE |
| 121 | XL Scaffolding Ltd | 15 Tuckey's Lane | 11-Feb-14 | 21/02/2014 - ONGOING | Repairs to Façade | PRIVATE |

1750 **Mr Speaker:** Again, this is a very long schedule... four, five, nearly six pages, may I suggest we go on to Question 204.

**Q204/2014 –
Government projects –
Scaffolding costs; contractor**

Mr Speaker: The Hon. Mr Netto.

Clerk: Question 204, the Hon. J J Netto.

1755 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Government state the money spent per Government project on scaffolding since 2012, stating to which company and whether the payments are for completed works, or for ongoing projects?

1760 **Clerk:** Answer the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

1765 **Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia):** Mr Speaker, the cost of scaffolding for a project is in the main not identified as a separate item in the contract. Scaffolding is included as part of the general contract preliminaries and its cost cannot therefore be easily identified. It is therefore not possible to provide the information for all Government projects since 2012. The information which is available is provided in the table which I hand the hon. Member.

Answer to Question No 204

| Scaffolding costs | | | | |
|-----------------------|--------------|--------------|-------------|----------------|
| Project | Total cost | Paid to date | Pending | Contractor |
| Sandpits House | £ 25,865.60 | £ 17,935.20 | £ 7,930.40 | GJBS |
| Kingsway House | £ 53,307.00 | £ 27,730.31 | £ 25,576.69 | Profield |
| Red Sands House | £ 76,490.74 | £ 24,082.56 | £ 52,408.18 | Sharrock Shand |
| Repulse House | £ 3,132.00 | £ 2,192.40 | £ 939.60 | GJBS |
| Valiant House | £ 3,132.00 | £ - | £ 3,132.00 | GJBS |
| Royal Sovereign House | £ 3,132.00 | £ 2,192.40 | £ 939.60 | GJBS |
| Alert House | £ 3,132.00 | £ 2,192.40 | £ 939.60 | GJBS |
| Anderson House | £ 71,846.51 | £ - | £ 71,846.51 | Koala |
| William Thomson | £ 24,194.88 | £ - | £ 24,194.88 | GJBS |
| Laguna Estate | £ 71,992.80* | £ 41,062.56 | £ 30,930.24 | GJBS |
| Glacis Estate | £192,093.72* | £ 112,523.88 | £ 79,569.84 | GJBS |
| Moorish Castle Estate | £ 72,980.48* | £ 42,914.82 | £ 30,065.66 | GJBS |

Note: Items marked * indicate total costs of scaffolding erected to date and not the overall scaffolding for the project

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, could I ask the Deputy Chief Minister with regard to the last Question 204, I think I understood, subject to be corrected, that he could not give me the cost per project because he could not desegregate the amount of payment to the scaffold from the overall cost of the particular project.

1770 But is it not the case, and please correct me if I am wrong, that the fees, when a particular company is about to put a scaffold up, they have to seek permission from Building Control Department? They have the forms on which they say that on such and such a day they are going to start erecting the scaffold in such a place and are going to end by such and such a date and in accordance with the time that the scaffold is going to be up, then a schedule of rates goes towards the payment of that scaffold for the duration of the scaffold being erected at that particular site. Is that not the case?

1775 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, scaffolding is not something that comes across my desk very often and the reason I have compiled all this is because it is different Government Departments that are only involved and some of them deal with their own projects.

1780 But the information which is available in relation to what he has requested, which is the cost of the scaffolding in the projects that we have, is what I have supplied to him.

The information which he referred to earlier, I think, is revenue generated to the Government from scaffolding, not the cost of scaffolding to the projects. Those are two different things.

1785 **Hon. J J Netto:** So the information with regard to how much is charged for the scaffolding, that can be provided and that can be provided because the information is gathered at the Building Control Department. Is that correct?

1790 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Yes, Mr Speaker, but it is the revenue the Government generates from that and not what is charged by the scaffolding company to the person or the company carrying out the projects. They are two different things.

1795 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful for the Deputy Chief Minister's attempts at clarifying this. Is it correct to assume that where you have the particularisation of HMGOG projects that, given that you have that particular information, you may at some point be able to determine what the cost of that specific project listed as a HMGOG project might be?

1800 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, we can determine the revenue the Government receives from scaffolding which is put up all over Gibraltar in relation to building control fees –that we have available and that we can supply; but that is not what the hon. Member has asked. The information we have compiled... he has asked what the cost is of scaffolding in relation to a project (*Interjection*) which is an expense and not a revenue item – that was the difference.

1805 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Is the Hon. Deputy Chief Minister saying that it is impossible to ascertain the cost to Government of the scaffolding, as in not that it is difficult or perhaps not the most practical task, but impossible to secure the information?

1810 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, it is impossible to obtain in relation to a number of projects because the scaffolding is sometimes included in the costs. It is not broken down as a separate item. But in those projects where it is broken down as a separate item, we have already provided that to the hon. Member in one of the schedules.

1815 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is he saying that in relation to... this schedule is the schedule of total scaffolding... the large one, the very long one – is the schedule that includes a list of all scaffolding erected, effectively, in Government projects or where there is a contract with the Government, presumably with a Government-owned company, then there is a shorter schedule that provides the cost to the Government. Is he suggesting that anything that is not listed in this short schedule is because the cost of the scaffolding is subsumed within the cost of the contract?

1820 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, that is correct. It is not broken down... itemised.

1825 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, in the long schedule, if we take No. 78 as an example, there is scaffolding being erected at Loreto Convent, Europa Road, and it is listed as a HM Government of Gibraltar project, but yet the property I do not think is a Government property. Can the Minister enlighten us how we can have what I understand to be a private entity and yet it has been listed as a Government project?

And in order to save time, and the same will probably apply to No. 97, where the St Mary The Crowned, Main Street, which I take it to be the... yes, the Cathedral there, again it is a Government project and I do not think it is a Government-owned building.

1830 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, the works done to Loreto Convent, although these appear to be March to April 2013, I think are probably part of the work undertaken there by the previous Administration, not by this Administration, and that may simply be a tidying up or a fixing in respect of that.

1835 That building, you are right, is not a Government building, but it appears – I cannot say more than that at this stage – that all of the works and all of the extension done at that school was a Government project, although it is not a Government School and it is not a Government building, but they were the ones who were in power when it was done. I know no more about it.

1840 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, Mr Speaker. That is precisely what I was asking. I was asking for confirmation that it was a Government project, despite the property being a private one.

The same goes for No. 97, which is a start date of September 2013 and is still ongoing. So, that has been going on for four, five months or something and perhaps the Chief Minister can shed some light on that one as well.

1845 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Yes, Mr Speaker, that is different. That is work done to the Cathedral of St Mary The Crowned, which the Government has agreed to subsidise.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, just so that I understand it, may I ask the Deputy Chief Minister, this particular column which indicates private or Her Majesty's Government, what is the difference between the

1850 two? Dealing with what... a private project in relation to which the Government has some involvement?
Because I would not expect the Government to be answering questions for which it is not responsible in this House. If it is a private project, can he explain that?

1855 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Member asked in relation to Government projects or private projects, that was the question, and in relation to scaffolding which had gone up, which is a building control matter, and so in that sense the Government is involved.

Clerk: And with that we come to the end of Oral Questions.

Questions for Written Answer

Clerk: Now we go on to Written Questions, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

1860 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to table the answers to Written Questions, W25 to W35 of 2014.

Q204/2014 continued – Government projects – Scaffolding costs; contractor

1865 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, I know we have moved on to Written Questions, but I have just spotted in the long schedule that the Hon. Deputy Chief Minister gave me that item 24 on the last column, there is nothing at all indicating whether it is a Government project or a private project. Is that one of these... you know, an error in the printing or something?

Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia): Mr Speaker, looking at the scaffold location, it looks to be a private project, but I could not say that for certain without finding out... without asking.

ADJOURNMENT

1870 **Clerk:** The Hon. the Chief Minister.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that the House do now adjourn to Friday 21st February 2014 at 10.30 a.m.

1875 **Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that the House do now adjourn to Friday, 21st February at 10.30 a.m. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.
The House will now adjourn to Friday, 21st February at 10.30 a.m.

The House adjourned at 5.50 p.m.