



# PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

**AFTERNOON SESSION: 3.00 p.m. – 4.45 p.m.**

**Gibraltar, Wednesday, 25th June 2014**

## **Business transacted**

Order of the Day.....	3
Confirmation of Minutes .....	3
Papers to be laid.....	3
Questions for Oral Answer .....	4
Tourism, Commercial Affairs, Public Transport and the Port .....	4
Q439/2014 Tourism and the Port – Details of conferences attended by Departments .....	4
Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.....	10
Q440/2014 City Fire Brigade – Waterport Power Station fire; details of foam used.....	10
Q441/2014 Victoria Stadium – Installation of seating in stands; cost .....	11
Q442/2014 Victoria Stadium – Cleaning and upkeep of seats; details .....	11
Q443/2014 New power station – Reclaimed site; details.....	13
Q444/2014 New power station – Imported generators; costs involved.....	14
Health and the Environment .....	14
Q445/2014 World Health Organisation Report – La Linea air quality; assessment .....	14
Q446-447/2014 Eco Wave Power – Purchase of electricity; tariff rates.....	15
Q448/2014 Commonwealth Park – Maintenance contract.....	15
Q449/2014 Care Agency staff – TUPE transfer; details .....	17
Equality, Social Services and the Elderly .....	17
Q450/2014 Social Services – Vacancies for senior care workers .....	17
Q451/2014 Dr Giraldi Home – Plans to relocate to the Mount.....	18
Q452/2014 Care Agency – Subcontracted care workers; details .....	18
Traffic, Housing and Technical Services.....	19
Q453/2014 George Jeger House and Portmore House – Provision of an additional lift .....	19
Financial Services and Gaming .....	19
Q454/2014 Minister’s travelling expenses – Trips undertaken; details .....	19

Q455/2014 AmCham trade mission – New investments; details .....	23
Q456/2014 Minister’s visit to Bermuda – Details.....	26
Enterprise, Training, Employment and Health & Safety .....	26
Q457/2014 Future Job Strategy Graduate Scheme – Graduates applying for social worker positions .	26
Deputy Chief Minister .....	28
Q459/2014 Marriott Hotel and office block – Proposed construction; update .....	28
Chief Minister.....	29
Q460/2014 Legal consultants – Drafting services costs.....	29
Q461/2014 General legal services – Government costs; details .....	29
Q462-463/2014 Spanish media – Advertising; sums paid .....	30
Q464-465/2014 Queens Hotel – Acquisition of site; costs involved .....	31
Tourism, Commercial Affairs, Public Transport and the Port .....	33
Question 440/2014 continued – City Fire Brigade – Waterport Power Station fire; details of foam used .....	33
Chief Minister.....	35
Q466/2014 Jason Cruz – Details of allowances .....	35
Q467/2014 Previous Speaker’s tax affairs – Report into leak of information; update .....	38
Q468-471/2014 Sunborn Hotel/Credit Finance Company Ltd – Details .....	39
<i>The House adjourned at 4.45 p.m.</i> .....	41

# The Gibraltar Parliament

*The Parliament met at 3.00 p.m.*

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: P E Martinez Esq *in attendance*]

## PRAYER

*Mr Speaker*

## Order of the Day

**Clerk:** (i) Oath of Allegiance.

## CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

**Clerk:** (ii) Confirmation of Minutes – the Minutes of the last meeting of Parliament, which was held on 29<sup>th</sup> and 30<sup>th</sup> May 2014.

5 **Mr Speaker:** May I sign the minutes as correct? (**Members:** Aye.)

*Mr Speaker signed the Minutes.*

**Clerk:** (iii) Communications from the Chair; (iv) Petitions; (v) Announcements.

## PAPERS TO BE LAID

**Clerk:** (vi) Papers to be laid – the Hon. the Chief Minister.

10 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay on the table the Gibraltar Annual Policing Plan 2014/2015; the Consolidated Fund Pay Settlement – Statement No. 1 of 2012/2013; the Consolidated Fund Supplementary Funding – Statement No. 2 of 2012/2013; the Consolidated Fund Reallocations – Statement No. 3 of 2012/2013; and the Statement of Supplementary Estimates No. 1 of 2012/2013.

15

**Mr Speaker:** Ordered to lie.

**Clerk:** The Hon. the Minister for Education, Telecommunications and Justice.

20

**Minister for Education, Telecommunications and Justice (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay on the table the Annual Report of the Gibraltar Prison Board for the year ended December 2013.

**Mr Speaker:** Ordered to lie.

25 The Chief Minister might wish to lay on the table perhaps the Employment Survey Report, which is down for the Minister of Employment.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay on the table the Employment Survey Report 2013.

30 **Mr Speaker:** Ordered to lie.

**Clerk:** The Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Commercial Affairs, Public Transport and the Port.

35 **Minister for Tourism, Commercial Affairs, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay on the table the Hotel Occupancy Survey Report of 2013 and the Tourist Survey Report of 2013.

**Mr Speaker:** Ordered to lie.

## Questions for Oral Answer

40

### TOURISM, COMMERCIAL AFFAIRS, PUBLIC TRANSPORT AND THE PORT

**Q439/2014**

**Tourism and the Port –**

**Details of conferences attended by Departments**

**Clerk:** (vii) Reports of Committees; (viii) Answers to Oral Questions.  
Question 439/2014, the Hon. D J Bossino.

45 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Tourism and the Port provide details of the conferences that the Departments he is responsible for has attended over the 2013-2014 financial year, with the same level of detail as set out in Table T.2 of the Gibraltar Government website?

50 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Commercial Affairs, Public Transport and the Port.

**Minister for Tourism, Commercial Affairs, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Gentleman is set out in the schedule that I now hand to him.

**Mr Speaker:** It is quite a lengthy schedule. I suggest that we continue with Question No. 440 and we can always come back to any supplementaries.

**SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 439/2014**

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the Greenport Conference in Antwerp 8-10 Oct 2013 : 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£807.58
Flights	£220.30
Travel Expenses	£120.00
Subsistence	£152.11
Hotel	£414.90
Additional Expenses (CorporateReg IOSH)	£160.00

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the Cape Verde Bunkering Conference 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£-
Flights	£1174.98
Travel Expenses	£-
Subsistence	£692.02
Hotel	£119.37
Additional Expenses	£-

Cont...

**CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 439/2014**

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the Platts Bunker Fuel conference Barcelona 4-5 Dec 2013 : 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£675.00
Flights	£776.20
Travel Expenses	£-
Subsistence	£401.83
Hotel	£778.03
Additional Expenses	£-

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at 35<sup>th</sup> Intl Bunkering Conference Copenhagen 1-4 april 2013 : 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£2324.56
Flights	£880.00
Travel Expenses	£-
Subsistence	£-
Hotel	£127.70
Additional Expenses	£-

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the FEMIP Conference Athens 16-18 April 2013 : 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£-
Flights	£458.00
Travel Expenses	£46.65
Subsistence	£-
Hotel	£587.64
Additional Expenses	£-

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the Axelrod Energy Projects World Fuel Summit 9-11 May 2013 : 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£2470.22
Flights	£244.30
Travel Expenses	£168.64
Subsistence	£162.96
Hotel	£715.63
Additional Expenses	£-

Cont...

**CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 439/2014**

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the Miami Management Disaster Seminar 29 Apr-3 May 2013 : 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£-
Flights	£-
Travel Expenses	£-
Subsistence	£112.09
Hotel	£-
Additional Expenses	£-

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the Med Coastguard Conference 26-28 June 2013 : 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£
Flights	£180.50
Travel Expenses	£110.60
Subsistence	£114.28
Hotel	£192.00
Additional Expenses	£-

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the Aracon 2-5 October 2013 : 2013 : 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£1520.12
Flights	£596.00
Travel Expenses	£558.90
Subsistence	£365.50
Hotel	£1028.24
Additional Expenses	£-

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the London Shipping Week 9-13 Sept 2013 : 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£-
Flights	£-
Travel Expenses	£21.10
Subsistence	£374.00
Hotel	£679.00
Additional Expenses (Corporate Dinner)	£205.37

Cont...

**CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 439/2014**

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the Gibraltar London Day 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£
Flights	£
Travel Expenses	£
Subsistence	£149.64
Hotel	£
Additional Expenses	£

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the IBIA Singapore Bunkering Conference and visit to Hong Kong 4-7 Nov 2013 : 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£1780.00
Flights	£6037.20
Travel Expenses	£-
Subsistence	£1909.12
Hotel	£1571.82
Additional Expenses (Sponsorship of IBIA Conference)	£5220.00

Costs with breakdown of The Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the IBIA Annual Dinner London February 2014 : 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£600.00
Flights	£1023.20
Travel Expenses	£336.41
Subsistence	£283.10
Hotel	£2160.00
Additional Expenses (Intl Bunker Assoc. Annual Fee)	£350.00

Cont...



**CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 439/2014**

Costs with breakdown of The Department of Consumer Affairs attendance at the Trading Standards Institute Conference in 2013-2014 (Financial Year)

<b>Year 2013</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Conference Cost	£513.60
Flights	£564.00
Travel Expenses	£41.50
Subsistence	£146.70
Hotel	£1020.00
Additional Expenses (Bank Charges)	£20.00

Costs with breakdown of Gibraltar's attendance and participation at the Red Ensign Conference from 14<sup>th</sup> to 16h May 2013

	£
Year	Costs:
Flights	4,610.87
Hotels	958.95
Subsistence	601.72
Courier (Bell)	165.17

Costs with breakdown of Gibraltar's attendance and participation at the Gibraltar Superyacht Forum on 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013

	£
Year	Costs:
Attendance, participation and event sponsorship	2,500.00

Costs with breakdown of Gibraltar's attendance and participation at the Future of Superyachts Forum in Palma de Mallorca from 18<sup>th</sup> to 19<sup>th</sup> June 2013

	£
Year	Costs:
Flights	163.00
Hotels	535.50
Subsistence	305.41
Delegate Participation	560.00

Cont...

**CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 439/2014**

Costs with breakdown of Gibraltar's attendance and participation at the 2<sup>nd</sup> Annual World Congress of Ocean 2013 in China from 21<sup>st</sup> to 26<sup>th</sup> September 2013

Year	£ Costs:
Flights (x 2)	2,439.00
Delegate participation & Accommodation (x 2)	2,580.00
Taxis	25.65
Vaccination (x 2)	204.00

Costs with breakdown of Gibraltar's attendance and participation at the Global Superyacht Forum 2013 in Amsterdam from 17<sup>th</sup> to 21<sup>st</sup> November 2013

Year	£ Costs:
Flights	309.00
Hotels	336.00
Subsistence	554.79
Delegate Participation	971.70

Costs with breakdown of Gibraltar's attendance and participation at the German Ship Owners Association in Hamburg from 12<sup>th</sup> to 15<sup>st</sup> February 2014

Year	£ Costs:
Flights	241.57
Hotels	327.50
Subsistence	173.51
Subsistence	22.00

**SPORTS, CULTURE, HERITAGE AND YOUTH**

**Q440/2014**

**City Fire Brigade –  
Waterport Power Station fire; details of foam used**

**Clerk:** Question 440, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

55 **Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister with responsibility for the Fire Brigade say how much foam the City Fire Brigade used in the Waterport Power Station fire of Sunday 20th April 2014, whether they had enough and if any extra foam was needed from the Defence Fire Service and if so, how much was used?

60 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the total foam 'concentrate' (foam liquid before being mixed with water) used by the City Fire Brigade was 450 litres. An additional 1,325 litres were deployed by the Defence Fire Service for their foam appliance at the incident.

65 The City Fire Brigade has a total availability of 73,200 litres of medium expansion foam and an additional 16,250 litres of Hi-Ex foam, giving a total foam stock of 89,450 litres.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** I am grateful for that, Mr Speaker.

70 Could the Hon. Minister say why the Defence Fire Service was deployed to use their foam and not the City Fire Brigade, and tap into their stock as he said of 89,450 litres?

**Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, in an incident like that, what happened was that they needed more foam to be squirted or at least thrown into the incident, and therefore as a resilient measure, what they do is call on the Defence Fire Service who have the appliances.

75 The foam can be supplied by the City Fire Brigade and so they were there to aid the City Fire Brigade in the incident; it does not mean that we went to ask for their stock. We had enough stock, as can be seen from the figures, but they come along because they have got appliances which can be used and deployed in the incident.

**Q441/2014**

**Victoria Stadium –  
Installation of seating in stands; cost**

**Clerk:** Question 441, the Hon. E J Reyes.

80 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Sport provide details of the cost to install seats at the stands pertaining to the Victoria Stadium football pitch?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

85 **Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the total cost for the supply and installation of the seats for both spectator stands at the Victoria Stadium main pitch was £29,143.30. This included a number of spare parts to ensure proper and regular upkeep of these seats.

90 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Sorry Mr Speaker, the Minister has just said for both. What does he mean by both? By both, I understand more than one. Can he please enlighten me on that issue?

**Hon. S E Linares:** Yes, Mr Speaker.

95 As he well knows there is the East Stand and the West Stand and so the answer is for both spectator stands. You asked for the total, which is the football pitch, and I am just stating that it is in the east and the west, being both.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Thank you, Mr Speaker, that does clarify the matter.

100 Then I think the... or, I know that the Minister also said that includes some maintenance. Can he elaborate a bit further on the details of maintenance? What does it actually entail?

**Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, that is the question he has put in Question 442, which I will answer later on. It is not relevant to this question. I can answer it, but then I will be answering the next question.

**Q442/2014**

**Victoria Stadium –  
Cleaning and upkeep of seats; details**

**Clerk:** Question 442, the Hon. E J Reyes.

105 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Sport provide details of what maintenance programme is in place for the cleaning and upkeep of seats pertaining to the Victoria Stadium football pitch?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

110 **Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority has a contract with a cleaning company that is entrusted with the regular cleaning of all auxiliary facilities, which includes the main pitch spectator stands and seats.

115 General upkeep, whenever possible, is carried out directly by the GSLA staff members, including any necessary replacement of broken seats for which spares were acquired at the time of the initial supply and installation contract.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** So, Mr Speaker, referring back a little bit to Question 441 as well, the supplier, who for £29,143 supplied the seats, and the Minister mentioned that there was something involved as well in the maintenance... given that the GSLA has contracted out for cleaning, and I take it from the answer that the GSLA, where possible from its spares, would repair the seats, what does the supplier actually do in respect of maintenance then?

**Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, the supplier supplies the seats and therefore what we got was a contractor that puts the seats, and that was the total cost which is the supply of the seats. They placed the seats and that is it. The seats are then maintained by the GSLA, having extra seats to replace, and so there is no maintenance contract with the supplier. The supplier just supplies the seats. We place them and then the GSLA maintains them.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, if I may inform the Minister further, one of the reasons for posing this question is as a regular attendee at the Stadium, I noticed, having sat there on the main stand on the western side for a weekday match, that unfortunately some spectators had not been the tidiest of people and had spilled drinks, especially the fizzy drinks that when they dry up tend to leave a very sticky seat and so on. Yet, however, it was three or four days later by the time I went to the next match at the weekend, I noticed, those same seats were still in the same unusable condition.

Would the Minister please take it upon himself to ensure that other than the sweeping up... I know that seems to be done in a rather satisfactory manner because a lot of sunflower seeds, ends and so on are left there and they seem to be cleaned out quite regularly, but the actual seats, a fair number of them, were unusable for a number of days. So can the Minister please give an assurance, not just to me, but all regular spectators in the stadium, that it will be closely monitored for ensuring that the highest level possible of cleanliness is being maintained?

**Hon. S E Linares:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I will go even further. If they are not doing their job properly, they will be called in and asked why they are not doing their job properly.

I completely agree with the hon. Gentleman that if those seats are not maintained, as they should be, that some managers or the facilities manager should make sure that they are. So, yes, I will go back to them and ask why they were not cleaned on the days... if the hon. Member can give me the dates. I will go back and ask them why they were not cleaned on those dates. You are absolutely right, that is what the cleaning company is there for, and if they are not doing their work properly, then the management should take it up with the cleaning company that they do so.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

That is good to hear. Whilst we are on the subject, can I also inform the Minister, and I think all spectators will agree, there has been a certain level of improvement now in respect of spectators watching mainly football games because the Gibraltar Football Association is actually now providing what is called a 'match delegate' – you see from his vest that he has got the word 'delegate' written – who has even helped to control the abusive language coming from spectators. The match delegate has taken some action. However, the match delegate has informed me that he is not the landlord and therefore has no authority to try and curtail the...at the moment not very frequent, but I suspect that as time goes by it will increase. There are people who are not being as friendly towards the installation of the seats as possible and they tend to walk on the seats, rather than walk on the path provided and so on.

One of the common comments amongst spectators is that perhaps if GSLA staff have a physical and visible presence of them along the stands, it might help to curtail this. It is the same as a police officer, in that his presence helps to prevent a crime happening rather than just being a detective to try to verify it, because there are very few cases, but some seats are already not in an ideal condition for sitting upon as they have been cracked. They have been badly used and kicked about. So I would like to work together with the Minister in ensuring that we look after our facilities in the best manner possible.

**Hon. S E Linares:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I think we are again singing from the same hymn sheet here. I would ask the hon. Member that whenever he sees or is speaking to the delegate, that he also speaks to the management of the GSLA, like I will, in order for the presence of the employees of the GSLA are there so that the seats and everything is policed as it should be.

So, yes, I am quite happy and I would suggest that whenever the hon. Member sees this, that he approaches one of the managers there and tells them, like I will if I see it or... and I will report then what the hon. Member is just saying.

**Q443/2014**  
**New power station –**  
**Reclaimed site; details**

**Clerk:** Question 443, the Hon. J J Netto.

**Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, further to the answer to Written Question 79/2014, can the Minister for Utilities please provide the approximate cost for the reclaimed site for the new power station and the name of the company which will be doing this aspect of the works?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the answer remains the same as that of my answer to Written Question 79/2014.

**Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, I have not got with me right now my previous question, but I recall – and please correct me if I am mistaken – that what he said before was that the award had not taken place, but I think he gave me a date in which the works would commence, which would be at the end of this particular month. Therefore, if that is correct and work is going to commence at the end of this month, I am sure that by now there must be a company who has been awarded the particular works and what will be the approximate cost. Has anything not changed in relation to that and he cannot provide a figure?

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, in order to try and assist the hon. Gentleman, because I think we have been through this issue before and he knows that this is an important project that is dealt with not just by the hon. Member but also by my office, what we have said before is that the reclamation will be dependent on which option is chosen for the power station. We cannot say more obviously, because the issue has not yet been announced publicly.

Therefore by giving details of the reclamation, we would in effect be giving an indication of which options are being chosen for the particular power station; but, as he himself has indicated in his question, we have said that it is likely that there will be an announcement towards the end of this month and then he will have more detail by then.

**Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, what I do not seem to understand, given that the Minister for Utilities already indicated that works will commence by the end of this month in relation to the reclamation site of the power station, it seems logical to assume therefore that a company has already been awarded at least those aspects of the work, and if a company has been awarded, we should be able to know which particular company it is and what is the approximate cost for those aspects of the reclamation works.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** He is right, Mr Speaker, that he does not seem to understand. He is also right, Mr Speaker, to say that he is making assumptions. He starts his question by prefacing that he assumes, and as I often say to him, when he says that, to assume makes an ass of you and me in many ways, in the lexicon of the English language.

Mr Speaker, what I have said is that by disclosing details of the reclamation, we would perhaps be giving an indication publicly of an award of a tender that is not yet something that can be announced publicly for the reasons he himself has indicated, because the date is likely to be towards the end of this month. So all I am saying to him, Mr Speaker, is he has got to wait a little bit more and then he will have all the information. It is just a question of the Government being able to make the announcement at a particular time.

This is a European tendering process that we are talking about in respect of the power station and the reclamation is linked to it; therefore we have to make sure that we scrupulously follow the rules.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is the Chief Minister saying that they have in fact identified – if not allocated already – the tender in relation to the land reclamation, but that he is not in a position to identify who the successful tenderer is or who has been identified to do that work, because to do so would indirectly identify who is the preferred bidder in relation to the power station because the land reclamation will be influenced by the bid? Is that the position?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker that is what I have said.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q444/2014**

**New power station –  
Imported generators; costs involved**

230 **Clerk:** Question 444, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, further to the answer provided to Question 354/2012, does that figure include... 2014, I beg your pardon – does that figure include the overall cost associated with the temporary generators, including the cost of transport, maintenance and running costs, or is it just the cost of purchasing or hiring those generators?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

240 **Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, no sir. The figure provided includes the overall costs *inclusive* of transport and running costs. An additional £49,745.80 will include the maintenance and repair costs.

**HEALTH AND THE ENVIRONMENT**

**Q445/2014**

**World Health Organisation Report –  
La Linea air quality; assessment**

**Clerk:** Question 445, the Hon. J J Netto.

245 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, further to the answer given to Written Question 109/2014, has the Government or the Department of the Environment raised the matter with any European Union officials, and is the Government or the Department of Environment conducting any assessment or assessments as a result of the World Health Organisation Report in relation to the fact that La Linea happens to have the worst air quality in Spain and how this may be affecting the health of Gibraltarians?

250 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health and the Environment.

**Minister for Health and the Environment (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the Government has not raised this matter with any European Union official.

255 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, could I ask the Hon. Minister whether he thinks the report of the World Health Organisation is significant in order to arouse an analysis by him or his Department in relation to this matter?

260 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Certainly Mr Speaker, I think that is a perfect legitimate supplementary.  
The Government has raised the matter with its appointed air quality consultants, Ricardo-AEA, who advise that while the WHO Report does show that La Linea has the highest concentrations of PM2.5 within the Spanish cities analysed, these levels are still below the legislative thresholds for human health contained within the EU Air Quality Directive. These are 25 micrograms per metre cubed to be met by 2015 and 20 micrograms per metre cubed as from 2020. La Linea is reported as having a figure of 18.  
265 Gibraltar's annual mean was 15 in 2012 and this figure has always been below the 20 micrograms per metre cubed since monitoring began.

Given that the levels are well within the compliance thresholds, there is nothing to be gained by raising the matter at any other level; nevertheless, Government recognises that PM2.5 is a pollutant and therefore continues to monitor the situation and to work to improve local air quality.

**Q446-447/2014**  
**Eco Wave Power –**  
**Purchase of electricity; tariff rates**

270 **Clerk:** Question 446, the Hon. J J Netto.

**Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Government state if the cost of \$5 million to build the buoy floaters in order to produce electricity from sea waves, and its corresponding infrastructure (as quoted in the Bloomberg Article of 16th June 2014) will be paid by the Government or the company, and if this is to be paid by the Government, will it come from the consolidated fund or from what other entity?

**Clerk:** Answer the Minister for Health and the Environment.

280 **Minister for Health and the Environment (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 447.

**Clerk:** Question 447, the Hon. J J Netto.

285 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide the tariff rates that will be charged by Eco Wave Ocean Power Plant Company Limited to the Government during the 25-year contract entered, and whether there is a stipulated monthly or otherwise amount of energy that the company needs to produce and sell to the Government?

290 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health and the Environment.

**Minister for Health and the Environment (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the costs of building the buoys and associated infrastructure will be met by the company, Eco Wave Power. The tariff rates are commercially sensitive and therefore this information will not be provided in public.

295 **Hon. J J Netto:** Will the Government provide it privately or confidentially?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, if the hon. Member requests this, I will provide that information.

**Hon. J J Netto:** I am grateful Mr Speaker.

**Q448/2014**  
**Commonwealth Park –**  
**Maintenance contract**

300 **Clerk:** Question 448, the Hon. J J Netto.

**Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Environment please say which company has obtained the maintenance contract of the new Commonwealth Park and what is the annual cost to the contract?

305 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health and the Environment.

310 **Minister for Health and the Environment (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the maintenance contract has been awarded to the management company that runs the Botanic Gardens, Wildlife (Gibraltar). There were three tenders submitted; the other two were non-compliant. The annual cost of the maintenance contract is £160,916.69.

**Hon. J J Netto:** Sorry, could the Hon. Minister mention the figure again? I did not get that.

315 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** £169,916.69, Mr Speaker.

**Mr Speaker:** £160 –

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** £160... sorry, I beg your pardon – £160,916.69.

320 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, could the Hon. Minister provide the names of the two other companies that actually put in a bid?

325 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I cannot provide that in this forum because obviously there will be issues to do with the non-compliance with which I am not familiar and I do not think it would be proper for those two other companies that submitted.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, could the Hon. Minister say how the other two companies were non-compliant?

330 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, no. I was not part of the tender process and therefore I am not aware. I do not even know for certain which those companies are. That is something that we would have to have notice and I am not sure whether we would be able to provide that information. It is a tender process that I have not been involved in personally.

335 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I note from some pre-emptive research that the Hon. Minister for the Environment was, until some time ago, a 60% shareholder in Wildlife Gibraltar Limited. Can the Minister now confirm that he no longer has any interest in the company?

340 **Mr Speaker:** I do not see how that arises from the matter that we are dealing with. What has that got to do with the Commonwealth Park? Does it have to do with Commonwealth Park? Yes.

345 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, on a Point of Order, if the hon. Member had an interest in that company, the rules require him to disclose that before answering the question. Given that he did not, the House is entitled to believe that he had no such interest given, in particular, the hon. Member's pre-emptive research, as he referred to it – not that most people need to do any pre-emptive research to know that John Cortes was involved with the Alameda Gardens before he was a Minister.

350 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I do not think that the House can assume anything of the sort. That the House can just simply assume what the Chief Minister has said, simply because of... it just does not follow. But, Mr Speaker, I do not think it is a proper Point of Order.

355 Mr Speaker, this supplementary – (*Interjection*) It does arise out of it, because the answer is Wildlife... the Hon. the Minister was a shareholder of this particular company until very recently and my understanding is that the question talks about interest, and of course that interest can involve an interest in trust as well as a direct interest if it were a shareholding.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I have no problem in presenting the facts. Even though I was a shareholder of the company for many years through two Administrations, I must point out that I never took any director's fees and only the salary that the Hon. Mr Netto approved for me.

360 I have taken no active part in the running of the company since I was elected. I retired on Election Day on hearing the result of the Election and I resigned some time ago. The paperwork has been completed relatively recently, but I am no longer a shareholder of that company. I thought it was only right that I should point that out, even though I have no –

365 **Mr Speaker:** May I remind hon. Members, of course, that there is such a thing as a Register of Members' Interests and that before raising matters here, they can direct their attention to that particular Register. Then, having regard to the information entered there, they may or may not raise the matter here. That would be the proper procedure to do in the first place.

370 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, if I may assist, I had declared that interest on election and I have subsequently written to the Clerk to advise him of the fact that I had resigned. The Clerk will have that information. (*Banging on Desks*)

375 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, in relation to the point that the Chair raises in respect of the Register, the purpose of the question was to elicit confirmation from the Hon. Minister that there was no indirect interest that may not have been present in the Register. I do note that the Register had reflected that interest and take the Minister's confirmation that that is no longer the case given that he has no direct interest in the company any more.

380 Mr Speaker, perhaps I am going to take... I am actually going to take further counsel in relation to the next supplementary if perhaps the Speaker would indulge me just for a moment? Thank you.



**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I am not prone to pussy-footing around in these things.

Mr Speaker, can I ask the hon. Gentleman directly, does he hold any interest at all in this particular company on trust? He may not be a shareholder – he has said so and of course I accept – but are any of the shares in this particular company held on trust for the hon. Gentleman? That is the question.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** No, Mr Speaker. These are intricate legal points, but, no. I am not sure whether I understand fully the question, but it is not being held for me on trust in any kind of understanding that the day I cease to be a Minister it will be given back to me or anything like that. I resigned them totally, because even though I have had no interest – and I think the hon. Members opposite know me well enough to know that I am above that sort of thing – I did not think that it would be correct for me to continue to be a shareholder with a company that has Government contracts. Therefore I resigned.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** So therefore, Mr Speaker, there are no arrangements in place at all – I think he has said this, but I just want him to confirm this – for the hon. Gentleman to resume being a shareholder of this particular company upon him ceasing to be a Government Minister.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** No, Mr Speaker. That was my instruction to my lawyers. If they have not carried them out, I can categorically tell the House now that I have no intention of assuming that role in the future.

**Q449/2014**  
**Care Agency staff –**  
**TUPE transfer; details**

**Clerk:** Question 449, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, further to Written Question 120 can the Minister for Health explain the set-up of the clinical Care Agency personnel who became GHA staff after a TUPE transfer on 11th November 2013, and which establishment of the Estimates Book they will be reflected in and where their salaries will come from?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health and the Environment.

**Minister for Health and the Environment (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the transferred staff are Gibraltar Health Authority employees under the Medical (Gibraltar Health Authority) Act 1987, deployed to the Elderly Residential Services of the Care Agency. During the period while they are deployed, the employees are subject to the management and direction of Elderly Residential Services of the Care Agency.

The staff are reflected in the Care Agency appendix of the Estimates Book which is where their salaries are reflected, and before anybody asks, Mr Speaker, I have no shares in the Care Agency. (*Banging on Desks*)

**EQUALITY, SOCIAL SERVICES AND THE ELDERLY**

**Q450/2014**  
**Social Services –**  
**Vacancies for senior care workers**

**Clerk:** Question 450, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Social Services say when the senior care worker vacancies will be filled on a permanent basis?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Equality, Social Services and the Elderly.

**Minister for Equality, Social Services and the Elderly (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, as the hon. Lady is already aware, there is a review of the Residential Services and until the review is completed, current vacancies will continue to be covered as present.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister confirm is this the review that started from when she took office and does she have an idea of when the review will end?

430 **Hon. S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, it is a continuous review. It is somewhat different to an initial review that was undertaken because initially there was a review for particular purposes and now there is a review in relation to staff and staffing structures.

435 This review is very in-depth. Every single member of staff of the Residential Services is being spoken to. I understand that we are not yet 50% of the way in relation to speaking to the staff now with the summer break with lots of people being on leave. I envisage that this will probably be ready by the autumn, but I cannot categorically state. It all depends on how quickly the team can get to speaking to the staff.

**Q451/2014**  
**Dr Giraldi Home –**  
**Plans to relocate to the Mount**

**Clerk:** Question 451, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

440 **Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Social Services say if there are plans to move the Dr Giraldi Home from its present location to the Mount?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Equality, Social Services and the Elderly.

445 **Minister for Equality, Social Services and the Elderly (Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, the matter is being discussed generally, but there are no specific plans.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Hon. Minister say if it is being looked at to move the Dr Giraldi Home at all from its present location?

**Hon. S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, as I have just said, it is being looked at generally.

**Q452/2014**  
**Care Agency –**  
**Subcontracted care workers; details**

450 **Clerk:** Question 452, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

455 **Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Social Services state what the terms and conditions are for care workers subcontracted from private care providers, such as ADA Company Ltd and Grand Home Care, who undertake work for the Care Agency in terms of contract length, rates of pay and facilities?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Equality, Social Services and the Elderly.

460 **Minister for Equality, Social Services and the Elderly (Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, these contractors are private companies and they are required to conform with the statutory employment conditions that apply to all employers.

465 **Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Hon. Minister confirm if it is the Care Agency that actually sets up these contracts for the individuals?

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, I think I have already answered that question. This is something that is subcontracted and care workers are employed by their employer – their employer being the subcontractor.

**TRAFFIC, HOUSING AND TECHNICAL SERVICES**

**Q453/2014**

**George Jeger House and Portmore House –  
Provision of an additional lift**

**Clerk:** Question 453, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Housing confirm if his Ministry has any plans to provide an additional lift to service George Jeger House and Portmore House at Glacis Estate?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Traffic, Housing and Technical Services.

**Minister for Traffic, Housing and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, the matter remains under review with technical issues being the reason why a further lift has not been added to these blocks. The original works were undertaken by the GSD Administration, who are the ones responsible for only one lift being installed in each block at the time.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can I simply add a personal appeal to the Minister? Given that this lift has to service 85 flats, of which unfortunately the residents there are getting older by the day and not younger, would he please take a personal interest and do everything possible to try and alleviate the situation, because unfortunately as the Minister provides me monthly details, the lift breakdowns and so on are unfortunately a rather common occurrence?

It does mean that some elderly tenants end up being housebound for quite a while and some have even had to cancel doctor's appointments because of the non-mobility and lack of lift at that time. So a second lift, if at all possible, would greatly enhance the quality of life for our residents there. Irrespective of any political allegiance, I am making this personal appeal.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I am grateful for that from the hon. Gentleman. If I may say so and inform the House, the Hon. the Minister for Housing has been an advocate for the addition of these lifts for some time and we are in fact in the process of trying to ensure that none of the technical issues that have been raised will prevent us from being able to deliver on this issue for the people of both Portmore House and George Jeger House.

Can I just ask him – I know that he is not here to answer questions – but why is it that they did not install two lifts in that area at the time that they were in Government, because frankly it would have made sense to do so at the time it seems to us? He can answer, if he wishes, or not.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, yes, if I had been Minister for Housing at the time, perhaps I would have had some information. *(Laughter)* I do not have it with me. *(Interjections)* So, it is not that I am trying to shy away from answering, but I would need notice of that question. *(Laughter)*

**Hon. Chief Minister:** I am extraordinarily grateful to the hon. Gentleman for that candid response and given that the man who was Minister for Housing is sitting to his right, I am surprised *(Laughter)* that he is not able to obtain the information.

But I will write to him so that he can then, I hope, confirm to us why it was that they made the decision at the time, which they appear to be so against now, given that the problems that he is raising are problems which arise from their decision making. They are problems which arise from the fact that they only installed one lift. They are problems that we are going to resolve and they are problems that may cost more now than if they had done them. But he shall have my letter asking him for a full and frank answer to one of the things he appears to have changed his mind about now. **(A Member: Hear, hear.)** *(Banging on desks)*

**FINANCIAL SERVICES AND GAMING**

**Q454/2014**

**Minister's travelling expenses –  
Trips undertaken; details**

**Clerk:** Question 454, the Hon. D J Bossino.

515 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, further to Question 398 of 2014, can the Minister for Financial Services confirm that the information sought in this question is now fully set out in the Government website, as he alleged was the case when he provided his answer in Parliament?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services and Gaming.

520 **Minister for Financial Services and Gaming (Hon. A J Isola):** Mr Speaker, yes, sir.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Member will recall that on the last occasion that I asked this question, which was in the last sitting, he said that the information was in the website at the time.

525 When I carried out... and I dutifully sat down and did not ask any supplementaries, following the Rules of the House, which is that information which is publicly available ought not to be the subject of a question in the House, and I thought that the relevant page on the website had been updated with the information which I sought. But in fact when I did, during the course of the lunch break, have a look at what was available on line, it in fact did not contain the information. Can the Minister confirm that this is in fact the case?

530 **Hon. A J Isola:** No, Mr Speaker. When the hon. Member asked the question last time, I was informed by those in the office who deal with posting the information on the website that it was in fact on the website, and hence the answer given.

535 When I checked the website myself, as he did, I discovered that some elements of it had not been updated and some had. Therefore, the answer would be, to be accurate, that part of it was and part of it was not.

540 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, it was not just a question of updating information. It was a specific question which I asked which related to who attended with him – that information was not on the website. It is not a question of updating. It is a question of that information not being publicly available as he in fact told me at the last sitting of the House. So maybe he should have a word with his chums at the *New People* and tell them that it was not such an absurd question after all as was reported in the press.

545 Mr Speaker, going to the matter of the information, which is now updated – and I note that the website suggests that it was updated only on Monday 23rd June 2014 – that information which is now publicly available states that the hon. Member attended, between 24th and 28th March, various cities – Amsterdam, Rotterdam and Casablanca. In relation to Amsterdam and Rotterdam, he was accompanied by a Mr Paul Astengo. Whilst in relation to Casablanca only, he was accompanied, I think, by one of the Chief Minister's private secretaries, Gareth Flower. Why is it the case that Mr Flower attended with him to Casablanca?

550 **Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Member has made about six or seven questions within the same one and a number of statements to boot.

555 Firstly, the information that was on the website at the time, as I mentioned in my previous answer, was that it was partly there and partly not there. The part that was not there are the names of the people that he has mentioned and so I stand by the answer that I gave him to the previous question.

Secondly, with regard to whether the question was an absurd question or not, irrespective of whatever the *People* may say, some may take the view that it still is and was an absurd question.

560 In relation to Mr Gareth Flower, Mr Speaker, Mr Gareth Flower had arranged a number of important meetings formally in Casablanca through a number of introductions he had made with banks and financial institutions, including the Stock Exchange in Casablanca, Casablanca Finance City and a number of banks in Casablanca, all of which form a part of what Gibraltar Finance and this Government is trying to do in extolling the virtues of our community and our jurisdiction as a jurisdiction of choice in financial services, Mr Speaker.

565 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, what involvement has Mr Flower, as a private secretary of the Chief Minister, with matters in relation to financial services? I mean the matter just does not stack up. I simply do not understand. If he could answer that particular question and clarify the position in relation to that.

570 Secondly, Mr Speaker, the hon. Member is again mistaken. He is wrong. The information which was not there was not simply related to who attended with him, but also a question which I asked in the question on the Order Paper, which are the costs. The costs in relation to accommodation for his meetings in London in May and for accommodation for his meetings in Bermuda were not there. Can he confirm that is the case because that information was not there when I looked at it at lunchtime?

**Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Speaker, the information in relation to the visit to Bermuda definitely was not there because he asked me the question in May and I went to Bermuda in June. *(Laughter)* So I do not quite understand how he can say that I am incorrect when he is asking me to confirm that the information was on the website. How could it have been there in May if I travelled in June? Of course, it was not there. It may have been an estimate of what it may have cost, but certainly the visit had not happened.

In relation as to why Mr Gareth Flower was there, I would have thought that the hon. Members opposite would welcome the fact that different Departments of the Government are involved in promoting Gibraltar and indeed in promoting the use of Gibraltar in jurisdictions irrespective of who that person may be. The fact that the Chief Minister's Office has representation in facilitating meetings through people he had met in a previous visit, I would have thought would be welcome. It seems not to be.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, it seems that the Member ought to check the website before answering the question in the manner that he has answered, because in fact, Mr Speaker, unless he is suggesting that I am being mendacious in the way I am posing the questions, the fact of the matter is that I did check the website information during the course of the lunch hour and the Bermuda trip was already there. If he checks the position, Mr Speaker, it shows that it was updated on 8th May 2014; yet the information in relation to the 2nd to the 9th June Bermuda visit was there and that is the position.

But, nevertheless, Mr Speaker, there is still information which he has not provided in the question which I sought back on 29th May and that relates to the costs of those who attended with him. All I have are the attendees. But I do not yet have – and the Parliament therefore does not yet have – the costs of those who attended with him. Is he in a position to provide that information now?

**Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Speaker, it is really quite remarkable that when you are trying to be transparent and updating information onto the website with the frequency that we do, that we should be criticised for it. I can understand why, because obviously the Members opposite did not have that philosophy when they were in Government **(A Member: Hear, hear.)** *(Banging on desks)* although they seem to be very keen to adopt it now in Opposition.

The information in respect of Bermuda was a provision for what visit was about to happen within the following 10 days/two weeks after the question. So it was actually advanced information of what was going to happen, which I thought the hon. Member would actually welcome.

In respect of the costs on Bermuda of the people accompanying, then obviously, Mr Speaker, that question is a separate question on the Order Paper which is in fact Question 456 as to what the costs are of the delegation that went, and I will give him that when we get there.

In respect of the other costs of other individuals, those have not been provided, the Member is absolutely right. If he requests those, I will obtain that information for him and write to him separately, Mr Speaker, as I do not have that information available to me.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Just to point out, Mr Speaker, that in fact the information was requested in the question. The fact is that the Minister very smugly, and I think ungentlemanly on the last occasion, simply sat down and said, 'No, the information is on the website', when it has been proved, I think beyond any reasonable doubt, Mr Speaker, that the information was not on the website and maybe he should reconsider next time he answers questions in the way he has.

**Mr Speaker:** Perhaps the jury should now return a verdict of guilty. *(Laughter)*

**A Member:** Unanimous!

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I would say to the hon. Gentleman, with respect, it ill behoves Members of the Opposition, who represent the Party that was in Government for 16 years that did not provide information on any website and had to be asked to provide information, to accuse any Member of this side of the House of being gentlemanly or not less gentlemanly. I do not think that is what we come here for and I do not think it advances our possibility of getting through a Question Time that is about information. And I would ask that we simply try and address issues as to information during Question Time.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I agree with the Hon. the Chief Minister, and of course we want to progress matters, but this is not an isolated incident. I raise it because I think it does concern... Mr Speaker, we have been asking questions on this side of the House and on more than one occasion we have received an answer, 'the information is on the website'. We have then gone to the website and the information has not been on the website.

Or alternatively, actually I asked questions of the Chief Minister last month and the month before where I asked a question, and he said, 'the information is *going to be* uploaded onto the website'. I could have stuck my ground, I could have said, 'No, no. I have asked the question in Parliament now. You have got to provide me with the answer'. But he said, 'Look, it is going to be on the website and quite frankly my interest is in getting the information'.

But I give notice to the Chair, Mr Speaker, that this is Question and Answer, and of course they have their own transparency agenda of putting information on websites and elsewhere. But at the end of the day, if we ask a question and then the answer is, 'it is on the website', they have got to make themselves responsible for the answer. That is all. I think that is a perfectly reasonable point, Mr Speaker.

**Mr Speaker:** I agree with the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition, because Members of the Opposition are entitled to ask a question seeking information. If they are seeking information and they are being told that that information is in the public domain, Hon. Ministers of the Government and their civil servants should ensure that it is on the website.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Absolutely, Mr Speaker. And as the hon. Gentleman says, he can stand his ground and insist on the answer. Mr Speaker, the answer from now on will be, 'the information is on the website or will shortly be on the website'.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I give the Chair notice that if the answer next time round is 'it will be shortly on the website', there will be a Point of Order on this side of the House, because that is a wholly unacceptable answer. I have accepted it in the past in order for Parliamentary proceedings to flow, but if it becomes a matter of course on the part of the Government, we will stand our ground, because that is not a proper way of answering a question.

**Mr Speaker:** What is not proper to do is to say something to the effect of, 'I have the information. I know what the information is, but I am going to be giving it in two or three days' time'. (*Interjections*) That is not correct under the rules of questions.

If the information is available and it is not going to be provided here in Parliament at the time when the question is asked, then it ought to be on the website. It should not be a case that it is going to be on the website tomorrow or the day after. It should be then on the website because the hon. Member of the Opposition is perfectly entitled to seek the information on the day that the question is being asked, provided that it is available.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, you will recall from your time in Parliament on this side of the House and on the other and from your understanding of Erskine May, that the Chair has control over questions, but not over answers. The position of the Government is, Mr Speaker, that if we have information we give it.

Now, the whole purpose of putting things on the website is actually to prevent Members opposite being in the position in which we were, which was of constantly having to come here – and I hesitate to say it, but, Mr Speaker, twice or three times a year maximum – to extract this information. The whole idea is that they... principally it is going to be them that have access to this information, but the whole of the community as well if they wish, to see that information and it should be updated regularly. Now Mr Speaker, there is no desire on the part of the Government to delay that – absolutely none whatsoever; but, it is a process of updating, getting invoices, ensuring that the information is right and then uploading it onto the website.

Now, if the Government has the information when we are asked the question, if it is not on the website then there is usually a very good reason and it may be that the relevant civil servant with responsibility will say, 'Well, we have not put it on the website yet because we have not reconciled it yet'.

Now, do you have the information? Well, Mr Speaker you may have the information that is subject to reconciliation and if you give information which is not subject to reconciliation and it is then a penny out, then Members opposite will come here the following month and say, 'the information on the website is three pence out of the information that you gave the House'. And then we will have to give the information as to reconciliation.

So the whole purpose, Mr Speaker, of what we are doing, is to ensure that when hon. Members ask questions they can ask questions about substance, not simply to seek statistical information. That is the whole purpose of the Government's openness and transparency agenda and that is why I have said that that is the attitude we will take in order to ensure that we get this right for the whole of the community. I hope, Mr Speaker, that their attitude, should they ever be elected, would be to continue to provide that information, which they previously did not provide, openly and publicly on the website, which is exactly what a modern Government should be doing. It should not lead to anybody being accused of being anything

695 other than a gentleman, because I think the rules provide that we should not be calling each other that sort of thing.

700 **Mr Speaker:** May I also add that it is of course perfectly proper for Government Ministers to say, at any given point of time, 'that information is not readily available at the moment'. It is a lengthy process. It is a difficult process and it takes time to compile. That is a proper answer also to a question and therefore it will be provided in due course.

**Q455/2014**

**AmCham trade mission –  
New investments; details**

**Clerk:** Question 455, the Hon. D J Bossino.

705 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Financial Services state the areas of business with the number and value of new businesses which allegedly resulted in new investments following the AmCham mission?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services and Gaming.

710 **Minister for Financial Services and Gaming (Hon. A J Isola):** Mr Speaker, the question refers to a body, the Gibraltar American Chamber of Commerce, that is not within or a part of the Government. It is therefore unable to provide the information required.

However, it is certainly true that the Government was delighted to welcome and support the first trade mission to the Rock by this Chamber of Commerce and we are confident that business opportunities will flow as a result.

715 Government will continue to support private sector initiatives, like AmCham, to attract business and investment to Gibraltar.

720 **Hon. D J Bossino:** But, Mr Speaker, was the press report, which appeared in the *Gibraltar Chronicle*, of 2nd June not based on information provided by the Government? Was it not the Government's press release which said that at least nine Memorandums of Understanding were signed as a result of this mission?

725 **Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Speaker, it is not for me, as the Minister for Financial Services and Gaming, to answer in this Chamber for private sector activity. We welcome it. We are entitled to welcome it.

As the answer says, Government will continue to support private sector initiatives to attract business and investment to Gibraltar. So in this Parliament certainly, my position is, Mr Speaker, that the activity of private sector initiatives like AmCham, like the Swiss Invest Group that came to Gibraltar, is not to answer to the Opposition on agreements reached, of whatever nature, between private sector bodies.

730 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, he is saying he is not answering to the Opposition in this Parliament, but the Government itself is saying in a press release to the outside world, to the press locally and beyond, no doubt, and I quote from the article, which says:

735 'The Gibraltar Government...'

I assume that the figure of nine MOUs came from the Government itself and no other source, but I may be wrong on that. But certainly what the *Chronicle* says in relation to more MOUs being completed in the near future, the source of that information is the Gibraltar Government. It says:

740 'The Gibraltar Government said it is likely that more MOUs will be completed in the near future...'

745 So how is it that he is able to provide this information to the public, but is yet unable or unwilling to provide this information, this very important information in this House? (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) (*Banging on desks*)

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** For a very simply reason, Mr Speaker, and the hon. Gentleman should perhaps be less angry and think a little bit more (*Interjection*) because the information... I am sorry, Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman's cat seems to have died. He seems to want to feel a little bit of sadness

this afternoon. Perhaps if there were less performance, Mr Speaker, and more thinking we would not have this.

What the hon. Gentleman has said is that AmCham is a third party private entity. That press release, Mr Speaker, comes not from the hon. Gentleman's office, because the AmCham is not to do exclusively with Financial Services or Gaming, but from No. 6 Convent Place, which is the Government's Press Office, which relying on information given to us by the AmCham issued that press release.

That does not mean that we can give more details, unless the hon. Gentleman is saying that we should not rely on the information we are given as to what number of Memoranda etc. are signed. It is very simple. The Government is told by the organisers of the AmCham they have signed nine Memoranda of Understanding and there may be more in the future, and that is what the press release is based on. It does not mean that we can give more information for something for which we are not responsible.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, it is based on information which the Government has. The first sentence of its press release says:

'Resulting from last week's AmCham Trade Mission, at least nine MOUs have already been signed between American firms [etc...] and Gibraltarian counterparts'

So can he at least tell me, Mr Speaker, can the Minister or the Chief Minister tell me what further information has come to their ears which they can share with this Parliament?

Are there more MOUs which have been signed? Does he know what the MOUs relate to in relation to what areas of business and in relation to which companies? I assume that is information which he may not want to provide.

But certainly, in relation to which businesses, which is the premise on which I have asked the question, the *areas* of business with the number and the value, is that information which at least he has, which he can share with this House, or is it not information which he has available?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** No, Mr Speaker, it is not information that I have available, but he could check. I assume that the reason that he is... how he says... Well, very simply, by contacting the AmCham, which is exactly what we were doing at the time. We were in contact with the AmCham.

When he asks us for information, we give the information that we have. If we do not have further information, if we have not had the information provided to us, we do not go out to third parties to seek that information. But I assume, Mr Speaker, that all of this angst that I see developing in him is because he is delighted with the work that the Government is doing in the United States, delighted with the fact that there is now an AmCham here and he wants to know more, Mr Speaker, about how successful all of this is and how fantastic it is for the Gibraltar economy.

It is not, I hope, the opposite – in other words that he is actually very disappointed to see the Government is leading in working with the United States, that there is now a private sector body that has picked up the cudgel, that they are saying that they have had of the AmCham visit already nine Memoranda of Understanding and probably more, and actually he is very angry that the Government is in this, as in so many other things, doing so well. That might also represent the angst that I see in him.

I know, Mr Speaker, that despite the fact that I think he and the Leader of the Opposition were invited to the dinner that the Government organised, something which did not happen at the time that they were in Government for the AmCham, they will not have had the opportunity then of seeing a member of Mr Obama's Cabinet, who recently resigned from public life, leading the trade mission, which was part of what the AmCham was organising. This is a huge step forward for Gibraltar and the commercial relationship with the United States, something that I hope I detect in behind all that anger and behind all that angst is what they really want to be welcoming. (*Banging on desks*)

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, yes, thank you very much for the kind invitation extended to me and to the Deputy Leader of the GSD, less than a week's notice from the event. Unfortunately we had to decline because – as was public knowledge at the time – we had a GSD activist event on the night and that is simply why we had to decline.

But, Mr Speaker, what he is saying is this. We came out with a press release where we said that there were nine agreements in the private sector between Gibraltarian companies and American companies. That is information that was provided to us by the private sector.

Is he really suggesting that no one in his Office actually bothered to say, 'Well, in what areas are these agreements being signed?' because I would have expected any competent Government that is interested in anything beyond the photo opportunity and the spin, for which the hon. Gentleman is famous for (*Banging on a desks*) that he would have at least... or his office would have at least obtained that information.



810 **Hon. Chief Minister:** I will tell him what competent Governments do, Mr Speaker. Competent Governments ensure that Gibraltar's message is spread around the world. Competent Governments do not stick their heads in the sand and pretend that our only potential and commercial partner is our neighbour to the north. Competent Governments get themselves and the Deputy Chief Minister invited to the White House for meetings in relation to what is happening in Gibraltar. *(Interjections)* Competent Governments...  
815 I know it hurts, Mr Speaker. I know it hurts *(Interjections)* I know it hurts and I am really putting my finger in the wound – *(Interjections)*

**Mr Speaker:** Order.

820 **Hon. Chief Minister:** And I know it hurts *(Interjections)*

**Mr Speaker:** Order.

825 **Hon. Chief Minister:** I know it hurts, Mr Speaker. *(Interjections)*

**Mr Speaker:** I insist...order.

Hon. Members are now beginning to debate and if they carry on like this, within two or three minutes I will be moving on to the next question.

830 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Competent Governments are able to organise dinners at short notice and competent guests are able to accept, even if they have less than a week's notice, Mr Speaker.

835 But what is clear – and I thank the hon. Gentleman for it because it is now abundantly clear – was that they preferred to attend a party event, rather than support Gibraltar business in its relationship with the United States. *Party before country, as usual. (Banging on desks)*

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, may I bring the Hon. the Chief Minister down to earth, because he really does need to be brought down to earth. He has not answered my question.

840 I have asked him... I understand that the information comes from the private sector –

**Mr Speaker:** Ask the question. There is no need for the preamble. I have already heard the preamble, and there is no need for it. Ask the question again, please.

845 **Hon. D A Feetham:** I understand it comes from the private sector, but did your office, or somebody in the office of the Hon. Minister, not bother to enquire what areas of business these Memorandums of Understandings relate to? It is a very simple question, which I would have expected a competent Chief Minister to have the answer to.

850 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, you see the hon. Gentleman appears on television saying that he wants less Punch and Judy politics. Well, I guess what he means, Mr Speaker, by that, is that he and his deputy should not be fighting as much as they are, because when he comes here, Mr Speaker, all he wants is Punch and Judy politics. ...*Dale un abrazo, el de Judas*. All he wants is Punch and Judy politics, Mr Speaker, because he prefaces his question by saying 'a competent Government' and 'a competent Chief Minister' to clearly imply the opposite.

855 Mr Speaker, people will have to make a choice as they made last time as to who they consider competent or not competent, fit or unfit, Mr Speaker, because I was, three years ago, unfit to govern according to those who were then in Government, and today, according to the same people in the way that he has prefaced his question, more or less competent – clearly, less competent in his eyes.

860 Mr Speaker, I have often told him that he will never defeat a foe by disrespecting him. He obviously disrespects me completely. I have given the answer that we do not have the information. If for him that makes us incompetent, thank goodness, Mr Speaker, it is principally just to him.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q456/2014**  
**Minister's visit to Bermuda –**  
**Details**

865 **Clerk:** Question 456, the Hon. D J Bossino.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Financial Services provide details of the cost of the recent visit to Bermuda, together with who attended with him as part of the Government's delegation or at its expense, or as part of the wider Gibraltar delegation?

870

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services and Gaming.

**Minister for Financial Services and Gaming (Hon. A J Isola):** Mr Speaker, the cost of the recent visit to Bermuda by Ministry officials and myself and the names of those who attended together with me, as part of a wider Gibraltar Government delegation, is as follows: cost of flights, £11,370.58; cost of hotel, £5,689.31. I was accompanied by Mr James Tipping, Mr Michael Ashton and Mr Michael Oliver, and if the Members opposite are remotely interested, the trip went extremely well, Mr Speaker.

875

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, is he able to tell me who attended as part of the wider Gibraltar delegation, as there was a photograph in the *Gibraltar Chronicle* again, which featured himself and I think some of the individuals he has mentioned, but also certain individuals from the private sector? Is he able to tell me – that is what I meant by the question – who formed part of the wider Gibraltar delegation? Not necessarily just as part of the Gibraltar Government delegation, but as part of the Gibraltar Plc delegation if you like. Is he able to give me that information? I have got a name, but I would rather not sort of bandy that name across the floor of the House. I would rather he volunteer it. I mean he featured in the photograph. *(Interjections)*

880

885

**Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Speaker, you have obviously seen a photograph in the press which shows three members of our private sector community. Mr Speaker, every time Gibraltar Finance travels abroad promoting Gibraltar's Financial Services sector, it does so in partnership with the private sector.

890

Last week alone, Mr Speaker, Gibraltar Finance with its senior executives were in AIRMIC in Birmingham promoting insurance, in Monte Carlo at a Game Funds Conference, where I spoke with two senior executives promoting the fund sector, and Mr Paul Astengo was in Geneva promoting the Trans Continental Trust Conference and Gibraltar's presence there.

895

In each of those instances, Mr Speaker, the private sector support, the Government initiatives, I am not sure if he still requires me or wants me to give the names of each person that went to each of those delegations. I would need notice of that. It certainly was not... if you read the question that he has asked Mr Speaker, it talks about the costs and then refers to the delegation, the wider delegation... I am hoping he is not asking me to also give him the costs of the private sector delegation because I do not have that.

900

Does he want the answer of who went to Bermuda with the Government?

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Yes.

905

**Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Peter Isola from ISOLAS, Mr Bruno Callaghan from Callaghans, Miss Angelique Vasallo from EY and Mr Michael Oliver, who I have already mentioned, from the Financial Services Commission.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**ENTERPRISE, TRAINING, EMPLOYMENT AND HEALTH & SAFETY**

**Q457/2014**  
**Future Job Strategy Graduate Scheme –**  
**Graduates applying for social worker positions**

**Clerk:** Question 457, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

910

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Social Services say if the four local graduate social workers, who are currently on the Future Job Strategy Graduate Scheme, will be able to apply for full-time permanent and pensionable social worker positions that may become vacant?

915 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment and Health & Safety.

**Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, the four individuals referred to in the hon. Member's question will be able to apply for any vacancy in the public service for which applications are invited from outside the service.

920

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

925

**Q458/2014**  
**Gibraltar Savings Bank –**  
**Breakdown of monies invested; rate of return**

**Clerk:** Question 458, the Hon. D A Feetham.

930 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please provide a breakdown of how all monies deposited in the Gibraltar Savings Bank have been invested and the rate of return on each of these investments as at 31st March 2014, 30th April 2014 and 31st May 2014?

935 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment and Health & Safety.

**Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, as at 31st March the Savings Bank fund was invested in the following manner and yields.

940 On-call accounts with the Bank of England, the Crown Agents Bank and Gibraltar banks had an average yield of around of 0.4%. The Gibraltar banks were the Royal Bank of Scotland, Barclays Bank, National Westminster Bank and Jyske Bank.

Floating Rates Notes quoted on the London Stock Exchange have an average yield of 0.6% The Floating Rates Notes were issued by the following: European Investment Bank; the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development; Dexia; FMS Wertmanagement; Caisse d'Amortissement de la Dette Sociale; KfW; and the Republic of Finland.

945 Capital Bonds with a 5% return, and preference shares in Credit Finance with an average dividend yield of 5.5%. There have been no significant changes in the structure of the Funds investment portfolio in April or May and little change in yields, except that quoted stock and call accounts fluctuate marginally on a daily basis. These fluctuations are not significant.

950 The average return on the fund last year is estimated by the Treasury at around 4%, subject to the figures being checked by the Principal Auditor as is the case for all Special Funds.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, he has answered part of the question. He has not answered the first part, because if the hon. Gentleman looks at my question it is talking about, 'please provide a breakdown of how all monies deposited in the Gibraltar Savings Bank...'

955 The reason why I ask the question – indeed, I have asked this question before and he has provided me with an answer in the format of effectively saying £x million invested in x bank... £x million relating to the 5% debentures in x bank, that is what I wanted. Does he have that information because I really need that information for the purposes of my own Budget speech? I am entitled to it, because that is the question and I have provided notice of the question. Indeed, he has provided me with the answer in the past when I have asked this question.

960

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Mr Speaker, he has not asked the question in the same way in the past. He has asked it differently and I have answered it in the way that he asked it before. This time I have answered it in the way he has asked it this time, because he wants a breakdown of the monies that are deposited in the Savings Bank and the rate of return on each investment, and the rate of return on each investment I have broken down into the different areas so that he will be able to see what we are getting from the money that is put in banks, what we are getting from the money that is put in floating rates. But if he wants the balance sheet of the Savings Bank, then I will get it posted to him, but I have not got it here with me.

965

970 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Would it possible if my secretary gave him a ring? I have to emphasise that when I... and the question is pretty clear, 'Can the Chief Minister please provide a breakdown of how *all monies* deposited in the Gibraltar Savings Bank have been invested *and* the rate of return...? In other words a breakdown of how all the monies have been invested and the rate of return for all those monies. He has just given me the rate of return, but not the breakdown of how the monies have been invested.

975 If my secretary phones the hon. Gentleman's PA and between them deal with this, does he undertake to provide me with this information so that I have it by Friday of this week?

980 **Hon. J J Bossano:** I have got no problem in getting the information done in the way it has been provided before when the question was asked differently, but I do not accept, Mr Speaker, that I am not answering because I am giving him a breakdown of how the money deposited in the Savings Bank has been invested in the different categories.

985 We have got money invested with banks in call accounts. We have got money invested in the Stock Exchange. We have got money invested in a Capital Bond and we have got money invested in the preference shares. So I am giving him a breakdown of how they are invested. I am also giving him the yield in each of those categories. I do not think he has asked for the yield before; he has just asked me before for a breakdown of each individual bit of the balance sheet. I can get that produced for him by the Treasury and he will have it by tomorrow at the latest.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Thank you very much.

#### DEPUTY CHIEF MINISTER

Q459/2014

#### Marriott Hotel and office block – Proposed construction; update

990 **Clerk:** Question 459, the Hon. E J Reyes.

995 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, given the strong objections voiced by a large number of members of the community in respect of the proposed construction of the Marriott Hotel and office block at the site of the ex-Royal Gibraltar Yacht Club, can Government provide this House with assurances that this development, if approved, will be in keeping with the Gibraltar Development Plan?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

1000 **Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia):** Yes, Mr Speaker, the development has already been granted outline planning consent.

As with all applications for planning permission, the Development and Planning Commission, which is an independent statutory body, always considers the Development Plan when granting such consent.

1005 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I think the question really is, does the... and the hon. Gentleman cannot answer for the DPC, I understand that, but is the hon. Gentleman satisfied that this particular project is within the Gibraltar Development Plan or is his view that it may be outside the Gibraltar Development Plan, but because it is of beneficial interest to Gibraltar, the Government is supportive of it?

1010 **Hon. Dr J J Garcia:** Mr Speaker, all the information that we have is that the development is within the Gibraltar Development Plan from the information from the town planners.

**Mr Speaker:** Any supplementary questions?  
Next question.

**CHIEF MINISTER**

**Q460/2014**

**Legal consultants –  
Drafting services costs**

1015 **Clerk:** Question 460, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister explain, further to his answer to Question 418/2014, the reasons for the discrepancy between the information available at the time of filing Question 418 in May of this year and the information that was available when the question was asked in this House, an anomaly set out in my letter to him dated 4th June 2014?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

1025 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, hon. Members will have seen a timetable issued by the House, and I think I made available on the website, that says that I would be answering questions tomorrow, which is the third Thursday of the month... or the fourth Thursday of this month at 3.00 p.m.

At your invitation, given how quickly we have gone through the rest of the questions, I agree it makes sense for us to have my questions answered this afternoon and that is why I have asked that we continue on the Order Paper. The answers are ready and given that all hon. Members I think are preparing for the set piece debate next week, I think we would all be grateful for more time in that preparation and that is why I have agreed to proceed this afternoon.

1030 Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman wrote to me on 4th June in respect of this matter as his question suggests. The reason for the discrepancy is currently being looked into and I will write to the hon. Member opposite with an answer once this is identified by the persons responsible.

1035 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q461/2014**

**General legal services –  
Government costs; details**

**Clerk:** Question 461, the Hon. S M Figueras.

1040 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister provide details to this House of the matters in relation to which the Government has incurred costs for the provision of general legal services, since December 2011, broken down matter by matter as well as by law firm/lawyer?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

1045 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, the cost of general legal services is already on line. I am advised and do not believe it is in the public interest to provide any further information.

1050 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I may well be walking into this one, but could the Hon. the Chief Minister, if it is appropriate in the context of legal drafting services, provide a flavour of the reasons why it is not appropriate in relation to general legal services that he provide that information here?

1055 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, because drafting services result in something which is published, namely a Bill or a Regulation. A Bill becomes an Act, a Regulation that immediately takes effect... rules – something that results in publication.

General legal services sometimes result in things which are not published or things that relate to litigation and we would in effect be giving information about what it is that the Government is doing, which sometimes it makes no sense to put in the public domain.

1060 In many instances the advice is in relation to litigation and therefore you see a product in public of that advice, but in many instances it is just simply advice that civil servants or Ministers require, which may have absolutely nothing to do with anything that is in the public domain and *may* be confidential, either commercially or for other reasons.

But the information is given as to law firm and amount paid; it is just that the breakdown is not given.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q462-463/2014**  
**Spanish media –**  
**Advertising; sums paid**

**Clerk:** Question 462, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please provide details of all sums paid to Spanish media in respect of advertisement associated with the Gibraltar Airport?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 463.

**Clerk:** Question 463.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please provide a breakdown of all sums paid directly or indirectly by the Government to all Spanish media since he became Chief Minister?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, my answer remains the same as has previously been stated in answers to questions of a similar nature. I believe that sharing information of this nature publicly is not in the public interest of Gibraltar.

I am happy to share the information with the hon. Member confidentially, if he so wishes.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I do not understand the analogy that he is drawing. If he is drawing an analogy with consultants, for example, it is a false analogy. Consultants are in a completely different boat and lobbyists are in a completely different boat to advertisement. Advertisement in Spanish newspapers should be treated in exactly the same way as advertisement in local newspapers. The Government already provides what it spends in advertisement to local newspapers. Why draw that distinction?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I think the hon. Gentleman does not want to see the distinction or sees it and is drawing me into an area where I do not think it is in the public interest that we should be drawn publicly.

I am quite happy to give him the information *privately*. I am not saying that he should not have it. I have nothing to hide from the Opposition in this respect, but I do not want to create a route map for those who do not have Gibraltar's best interests at heart to see where it is that Gibraltar is trying to advertise, where it is that Gibraltar is trying to influence Spanish public opinion.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, but I will tell the hon. Gentleman as well what my concerns are and what our concerns are on this side of the House. We are certainly aware of at least two publications – one on the internet and another one written – which have taken a line, which is very reminiscent of the line that local newspapers supportive of the Government take in relation, for example, to my participation in talks in Spain and allegations, for example, that I have somehow a direct line to Mr Rajoy in Madrid.

I would have thought that I would be entitled to know in public, and I would be entitled to actually say to the people of Gibraltar in public, 'Look here. There are these newspapers or Spanish media. They are taking this particular line, in unison almost with publications here in Gibraltar, supportive of the Government, against the Opposition, and they are also being subsidised by the Government here in Gibraltar'. I just feel that this is a perfectly legitimate question for me to ask and for the information to be provided in public.

I may be completely and utterly wrong in drawing any kind of inference, but quite frankly, it seems to me to be quite a coincidence.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** He is completely and utterly wrong, Mr Speaker. I do not have to pay anybody to criticise him. I certainly do not see any or much at all Government advertising in any of the local press that criticises him. So, Mr Speaker, I do not see how he can even pretend to draw that inference.

What I am telling him is that this is in the public interest of Gibraltar. But look, he has got up and said, 'It is all about me. I do not care about the public interest of Gibraltar and therefore I want the information'. Well, Mr Speaker, I am not going to give it to him publicly, for the reasons I have already said. It is not all about him and I am quite happy to give him the information privately. He might be surprised by what he sees.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q464-465/2014**  
**Queens Hotel –**  
**Acquisition of site; costs involved**

**Clerk:** Question 464, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please state how much the Government has agreed to pay for the acquisition of the Queens Hotel?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 465.

**Clerk:** Question 465, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please state what other expenses have been incurred or are expected to be incurred in relation to the acquisition of the entire Queens complex, including, for example, the decanting of other businesses at the site?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I refer the hon. Member opposite to Press Release 259/2014, dated 2nd June, which stated that a full announcement would be made once the final details of the purchase have been completed.

We expect to be in a position to make such a statement next week.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is he saying that the information has not been collated... the entirety of the information has not been collated, because I would have expected, for example, in relation to Question 464, which is to provide how much the Government has agreed to pay for the acquisition of Queens Hotel, that would have been readily available. It is a discreet question. How much has the Government paid for the Queens Hotel? That must be readily available to the Government so that he can provide an answer now in advance of the Budget next week.

**Hon. F R Picardo:** Mr Speaker, of course I know what was agreed to be paid for the Queens Hotel, but his questions, both of them, are taken together because they both relate to the same subject matter. There are issues which I do not yet have final numbers on which I expect to have by next week, like, for example, legal fees etc. All of that is being collated and then the total amount will be given.

Mr Speaker, I do not think it is wrong to say that we are going to make a full statement as to what it is that these costs have been.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, yes, it is – with respect to the Hon. the Chief Minister – wrong, because he can take that position in relation to Question 465/2014 which is the entirety of the costs for the acquisition of the entirety of the complex, and I understand it. I understand that.

But in relation to Question 464/2014, it asks, 'Can the Chief Minister please state how much the Government has agreed to pay for the acquisition of the Queens Hotel?' Surely he has that information. It is a discreet question and surely I am entitled to have it so that then I can use it in preparation for my own Budget speech and that is the reason why I ask it.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman is going to have the information and I am going to make a statement, as I have said, which will set out all of that information. The hon. Gentleman can ask

the questions that he wants and the Government makes the statements that it considers appropriate at the time that is appropriate and we want to make a statement about the Queens Hotel which deals with all of those issues. At the moment I do not want to make this information available.

Mr Speaker, that is the position of the Government. He will have the information. He may even have it before he makes his Budget speech.

**Mr Speaker:** Could I ask if it is the Chief Minister's intention to make the information public outside the House or during the course of his Budget speech on Monday?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Exactly, Mr Speaker, you are much more on point. I will be making the information public in the course of my Budget speech on Monday.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, he may provide it in this House and I understand the distinction the Hon. the Speaker is going to be drawing because if the information is provided outside the House, it really ought to be provided to this House. But the reality is that I have asked the question. I have provided notice of this question. If the information is available to the Government, as it is indeed available to the Government, because it asks 'has agreed to pay', surely the Opposition cannot be at the mercy of the Government in when it wants to provide – *(Interjection)* No. In when it wants to provide the information that it has, otherwise it would drive a coach and horses, Mr Speaker, through Question Time.

If the information is available, simply because I ask another question about the entirety of the costs, which I accept he can give it to me later on, but if he has the information about how much they have agreed to pay... just the sale price and that is what we are talking about here, surely he ought to be providing that. It sets a very bad precedent indeed in my respectful view for the Government to say, 'I have the information, but I am not providing it to you today. I am going to be providing it to you next week because it is convenient for the Government to make a statement next week'. What is the point of Question Time otherwise? *(Interjections)*

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am quite happy to. I thought you wanted to deal with that issue.

Mr Speaker, there are issues around the acquisition of this particular property, which the Opposition have made statements about in order to suggest it has been done for one reason or another. In social media I think I have seen a number of statements by people who have responsibility in their Executive Committee where they have made statements about this particular acquisition. I am therefore going to deal with it in a manner that the Government considers is in the public interest, which is in the fullness of my statement to the House on Monday as to the state of the Government finances.

The hon. Gentleman is going to have the opportunity to reply to me. So he is going to have the information when he says he wants it and needs it, which is before the Budget. But, look, I have to say to him, he used to sit here very calmly and very passively – I might say even docilely – whilst the hon. the backbencher used to take a completely different attitude to the one that he is now recommending to us. This is a particular instance where 72 working hours before a particular debate, I am saying I am going to make a statement, and he is saying I must give him the information now.

Well, look, Mr Speaker, this is the Budget session of the Parliament and the debate on the Estimates will be on Monday, as he knows, and he will have the information then. The community will have all of the information about this acquisition in detail, perhaps even in more detail than he has requested it. It will then understand why the acquisition is going to progress and what the use that the particular facility in question is going to be put to: full, frank and absolute disclosure. Full, frank and absolute accountability and transparency, but not when he says so, Mr Speaker.

**Mr Speaker:** Yes, one other supplementary.  
Carry on.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, it is not when I want to. I have given notice of a question. I have given notice of a question. But, Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman is the new dawn man. Sir Peter Caruana presumably, according to him, is the sunset. He is the new dawn man. He represents change; therefore he ought to be doing things differently. I have given him notice of this particular question. It is a very simple question. He has chosen to bunch it up with something else, but if the information is available, he ought to provide it.

Can he at the very least provide me with that information? I am not asking him for the second limb. I am asking for the sale price in advance of the Budget. I am quite content for him to provide me with that information on Friday, for example.



**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am the new dawn man, but the changes I represent are the changes that I choose to represent, not the change that he decides I must represent when it is convenient to him because he has a sliding scale of what transparency means, one end of it, because he was a Member of that Government that I am criticising now, the GSD, one end of that spectrum is what he used to do when he was in Government with all his Government colleagues and who he takes collective responsibility for and used to defend. And another end of the spectrum is what I do, which represents a new dawn.

Mr Speaker, I will give him a figure that he can start working on for his Budget, if that is what he wants. I have absolutely no difficulty. In fact, Mr Speaker, I will give it to him now. I mean I will give him the figure now. Twenty four meetings of this Parliament, since we were elected, for questions – that is two-and-a-half years that represents ten-and-a-half years of GSD Government. That is a figure he can be working on, Mr Speaker, which represents the new dawn that we are actually demonstrating in Parliament. I would give him a lot of other figures, but he might not be so comfortable, Mr Speaker, before the debate to hear those.

Nonetheless, Mr Speaker, in order to assist and at the level of Parliamentary colleague to Parliamentary colleague, I will make sure that on Friday – so that he can spend the weekend with his calculator – he has the numbers in anticipation of my getting up and making my Budget announcement. It will be unusual, Mr Speaker. It will be the first time, I think, that a Chief Minister extends that courtesy to a Leader of the Opposition.

The Leader of the Opposition's job at a Budget debate is always the hardest because he is the one that has to reply on the spot. In most other Parliaments there is no sharing of information before. In this Parliament in fact there has been previously, under the GSD administration, a hiding of information so that one does not see it until after the Budget Debate; but I am very happy to extend that courtesy to him as a Parliamentary colleague.

## TOURISM, COMMERCIAL AFFAIRS, PUBLIC TRANSPORT AND THE PORT

### Question 440/2014 continued – City Fire Brigade – Waterport Power Station fire; details of foam used

**Mr Speaker:** Does the Hon. Mr Bossino wish to ask supplementaries arising from... I think it was Question 440?

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Yes.

**Mr Speaker:** Please do.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, if I could just quickly go to the question. The question related to all the Departments that the Hon. the Minister for Tourism is responsible for – (*Interjections*) Yes, it is. Yes.

Yes, Mr Speaker, the question related to all the Departments that the Hon. the Minister the Tourism is responsible for and I just find that most of the entries relate to the visits carried out by the Gibraltar Port Authority, in most instances, and in some of the instances I think other than the Department of Consumer Affairs, it does not identify which of his Departments attended the particular convention or fair. Can he provide that information?

Secondly, can he confirm that he has answered the question as set out in the Order Paper, that it does cover *all* the Departments that the hon. Member is responsible for?

**Minister for Tourism, Commercial Affairs, Public Transport and the Port (Hon. N F Costa):** Yes, Mr Speaker, the question was to provide the answer with the same level of details as is set out in Table 2 of the Gibraltar Government. So the first thing I did was to check out the Government website to see the format of the question and therefore the schedule to the question sets out the particulars as is set out in that particular website.

I think I understood him correctly when he said that the schedule does not set out which of my responsibilities attend a particular conference. Did I understand him correctly?

**Hon. D J Bossino:** [*Inaudible*]

**Hon. N F Costa:** But if he goes to the schedule it always says, 'Costs with breakdown of' – and in this particular case the first page – 'the Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at...' and the second, third, fourth, fifth, sixth, seventh, eighth, ninth, tenth, eleventh, twelfth, and thirteenth. So there are thirteen instances

where the Port Authority attends conferences and these are set out in the same way as they are set out in the website. (**Hon. D J Bossino:** Yes.)

1290 **Hon. N F Costa:** The next page goes on to the Department of Consumer Affairs and sets out the conference costs there.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** [*Inaudible*]

1295 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes.  
The next one relates to the Gibraltar Maritime Administration and he is correct in saying that that is not set out as it should have been. It should have said, 'Costs with breakdown of Gibraltar Maritime attendance and participation at the Red Ensign Conference', and so he is right in highlighting that.

1300 Then following the next breakdown, similarly it is the Gibraltar Yacht Registry that should have been set out there. Again, the Future of Superyachts would have been the Gibraltar Yacht Registry, which as he knows is subsumed within the Gibraltar Maritime Administration, and similarly, the same with the Annual World Congress and the Global Super Yacht Forum in Amsterdam as well as the German Ship Owners Association in Hamburg. I apologise for the oversight, but they do relate to the Gibraltar Maritime Administration.

1305 **Hon. D J Bossino:** I am grateful, Mr Speaker, to the hon. Member for that. As I asked him for confirmation that all his Departments had been covered, I just find it odd, and maybe he can explain to me why that is the case, that the GTB does not feature, the Gibraltar Tourist Board. Is there a reason for that?

1310 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker. I also asked that question and essentially the way that these events – let us call them generically – are described or are defined depend on whether they are a conference or they are a trade show etc.

1315 Conferences, according to the definition of the administration, depend on attending a conference on a particular subject matter – there are at least 20 that I have shown him – and the participants of the responsibility attend. In some cases the Gibraltar delegation is asked to give a speech; but it is participation at a conference where there are different guest speakers from all over the world who give a talk on a particular subject matter.

1320 The GTB attends trade shows and the trade fairs and it is separately distinguished in the way that they are classified, and so they do not fall as a conference, but as something else. That is the explanation that was given to me and I hope that I have relayed it adequately to the hon. Gentleman.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Yes, Mr Speaker, one learns something every day. I suppose it is information like that which I would also have enjoyed to have received and to have read in some detail. I suppose I ought to use more generic words like 'trade visits' perhaps, is a more appropriate wording.

1325 Mr Speaker, in relation to a specific point which arises from the information as set out in the schedule, does he know why in the second item – they are not numbered, but it relates to expenditure by the Gibraltar Port Authority in relation to an attendance at the Cape Verde Bunkering Conference – the subsistence is in fact considerably higher than the expenditure in relation to the hotel? Whilst if he looks throughout the other items of information the opposite is in fact the case, as I suppose one would expect, but in this case it is almost six times higher than the hotel accommodation. Is he able to shed any light in relation to that?

1330 **Hon. N F Costa:** No, Mr Speaker, I am afraid that I cannot answer that question without notice because I do not know what the answer is. However, speculation, depending on the place of the conference subsistence varies, and of course it also depends on the number of people that have attended, but he can either write to me or I can make a note and I will provide him with the information.

1340 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, also, again they are not numbered, but it is on the third page at the top and it relates to again the Gibraltar Port Authority's attendance at the Miami... presumably it is a 'Disaster Management Seminar' rather than 'Management Disaster Seminar' and it has a blank in relation to flights, for example, and a blank also in relation to hotel accommodation.

Again, given the destination, I assume if it is a Miami Disaster Management Seminar, was held in Miami, I may be wrong, but can he shed any light in relation to that, because it seems that no expenditure was incurred in relation to those two items and one would have expected a considerable item of expenditure in relation to them.

1345 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker, he is absolutely right on that and I will have to obtain the information for him.

Mr Speaker, again, although I do not have the information with me, I can tell him that sometimes until the Government is invoiced, the figures would not of course be published on the website.

1350 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Yes, simply to point out, and my colleagues are quite rightly pointing out, that this is actually in excess of a year old and so I doubt that that is the explanation. But the hon. Member has undertaken to or suggests that he will be providing this information and I may indeed write to him by way of a reminder.

1355

**CHIEF MINISTER**

**Q466/2014**

**Jason Cruz –  
Details of allowances**

**Clerk:** Question 466, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1360 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is the Chief Minister now in a position to inform the House as to the amount which the Government will pay Jason Cruz in respect of (a) an accommodation allowance in Hong Kong and London and (b) an allowance for the private education of his children?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

1365 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, as I told the House last month, Jason Cruz is one of those Gibraltarians who has done extraordinarily well outside of Gibraltar. He is the sort of man we, as a community, are justly proud of. I cannot emphasise enough how happy Government is that he is now working for Gibraltar in the highly competitive market that is South East Asia.

1370 Jason worked for almost 20 years in Hong Kong's commercial sector. His family lived in Hong Kong for almost 40 years and enjoys an excellent reputation and an excellent network of relationships which will happily accrue to the benefit of Gibraltar. Jason was a Director of Cushman & Wakefield in Hong Kong – no mean feat in what is the world's largest privately-owned commercial real estate firm. Recognised as leaders in their field and who have a vast amount of experience working with over half of the Fortune 500 companies.

1375 In that role, Jason has been responsible for the completion of commercial transactions totalling over US\$ 1 billion, Mr Speaker. Indeed, it is not just the Gibraltar Government that is justly proud of him, for Jason's achievements have been recognised by the Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors for the most significant commercial transaction in Hong Kong only last year, Mr Speaker, in 2013. Now that is something that the whole of Gibraltar can be proud of, Mr Speaker.

1380 Jason was co-Head Asia Pacific of Cushman and Wakefield's Banking and Financial Services practice between 2011 and 2013 and previously Head of Asia Pacific for Cushman & Wakefield's Global Alternative Investment Services working with hedge funds and private equity firms. His remuneration includes an accommodation allowance of £1,615 per week. There is, as yet, no specific amounts agreed in respect of school fees.

1385

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, the accommodation allowance of £1,615 per week, is that for both Hong Kong and London, because my understanding of the position is that he is going to be dividing his time between Hong Kong and London because he is taking over some of the roles of Peter Canessa and others in relation to the London office?

1390 Or is it that my understanding is not correct, that he is going to be in Hong Kong for some time and then will be effectively transferred to London? Otherwise, what is the role that he is playing in London?

1395 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am sorry that I deleted that paragraph of what I had said last month because it is the only paragraph that I read last month that I have not read this month. What I said last month was that he would be in Hong Kong until 2016, unless we agreed a later date, and that he would be coming to London and when he comes to London he stays in hotels.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** So from the date of his engagement to 2016, he is playing absolutely no role in London... no oversight role in London. Is that the position?

1400

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the position is as I indicated last time and I went into this in some detail. He will be coming to London and working also in London in respect of some of the issues which require liaison between London and Hong Kong, Mr Speaker. I think it is perfectly normal that that should be the case. What I indicated was that in 2016 or thereafter, whatever time that we agreed, he would likely be taking over in London. *Hansard* discloses what I said last time.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** So effectively his role in London until 2016 is just limited to liaising on Hong Kong matters and he will play no wider role. The reason why I am asking this of course is because we know that Peter Canessa, for example, who used to play a pivotal role in the London office has actually moved out of the London office and is now back in Gibraltar. I understand he is in the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services Department and that is the reason why I am asking.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, I had worked out why you were asking, Mr Speaker, long ago. Mr Speaker, Mr Canessa is now going to run a pivotal role in Mr Isola's office and Mr Poggio is back doing the pivotal role that he was doing for many years without needing anybody pivoting next to him.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I think that is a very odd way of putting it, particularly when you are dealing with a highly respected civil servant, who has given many years of his life to public service. I really do think the Hon. the Chief Minister ought to watch the way that he puts things and the way that he talks... I have to say in a bit of a demeaning way in relation to that particular public servant.

Mr Speaker, in relation to the allowance for the private education of his children, why is it that he cannot provide that figure at the moment... that he does not have that figure at the moment? I would have expected that if you have entered into an agreement with somebody about taking that person on, you would have already agreed not only the details of his salary, but also details of his accommodation allowance, which we have, and details of how much is going to be paid for the private education of his children. Of course very important to the individual, and indeed important to the Government that presumably wants to obviously keep a hand on public expenditure.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I really do not know what it is that the hon. Gentleman is talking about when he says that a senior civil servant has somehow been spoken about in a demeaning way. The one who introduced 'pivoting' into the debate was him when he was talking about one person playing a pivotal role somewhere, which I confirmed he is now going to play somewhere else. Or is he trying to suggest that Mr Poggio is not able to run the London Office on his own because for 15 years that they were in Government, Mr Poggio was happily pivoting on his own in London as he had been before. So I do not see where it is that he wants to pluck this idea of anybody being demeaned.

But, Mr Speaker, I recognise that he is trying to do politics and he is trying to pretend that he is on somebody's side and it may be, Mr Speaker, that people want to be on his side, and God knows what he may have promised them. But anyway, Mr Speaker, I am very clear that Mr Canessa is going to continue to discharge as important a role today as he used to in London now that he is back in Gibraltar and he used to discharge in Gibraltar before he went to London, having been selected without interview by the previous Chief Minister to do that role.

Mr Speaker, as to the issue of school fees, as I understand it, the issue is being discussed and negotiated between the Chief Secretary and Mr Cruz. I suppose it relates to the choosing of schools. I do not know the age of his children or whether they are about to change schools and I do not know how the terms work in Hong Kong. So it may be that they are looking at what the next amount or the next school is going to cost if they are finishing one school or another.

But, Mr Speaker, we are certainly very concerned about public expenditure. We are going to ensure it does not rocket as it did in their time. So he can be rest assured that we will look at every penny when the time comes and when the Chief Secretary brings us a figure, we shall look at it to ensure that it is value for money. But certainly in relation to this contract with Mr Jason Cruz, this is probably one of the best value-for-money deals that this Government has done and we are already hopefully going to start seeing the rewards.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I do not understand how he can possibly say it is best value for money when there are aspects of the contract that still have not even been negotiated and remain outstanding. Quite frankly, this may be a really super individual, a very nice individual and very competent individual, but I remind the Government that he has been chosen *a dedo*. That is what this amounts to – *a dedo* – and therefore as an Opposition we are entitled to scrutinise this particular transaction.

Mr Speaker, does the accommodation relate to all Mr Cruz's children or some of them? Can he give some more information in relation to that for example? I mean the private education, not the accommodation, I should have said.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, we are talking about people having been chosen *a dedo*. Mr Canessa was chosen *a dedo* by the previous Administration. I understand another civil servant went to the United Kingdom chosen *a dedo*. People were chosen *a dedo* to discharge million pound contracts, not just in breach of what they now appear to think is the criteria that people should be chosen for... tenders for, but in breach of European law, Mr Speaker, people were chosen *a dedo* for jobs inside and outside the Government in Government companies. This was the way of the GSD world. It was an *a dedo* world under the GSD.

**Minister for Enterprise, Training, Employment and Health & Safety (Hon. J J Bossano):** They ran out of *dedos*! (Laughter)

**Hon. Chief Minister:** In this particular instance – (Laughter) I have to reflect the comments of the Hon. the Member for Employment who says that they did it so often they almost ran out of *dedos*, Mr Speaker. (Laughter)

Mr Speaker, it is extraordinary that in relation to this particular appointment the hon. Gentleman wants to run with the hare and hunt with the hounds at the same time. He wants to say... you know, he is hitting the GSLP for appointing this man *a dedo*, whilst at the same time saying that he is a lovely man and he might be exactly the right choice, but he wants to talk about the package. Mr Speaker, we are giving him the information about the package. The fact that the information as to the school fees is not yet in place, does not mean that there is anything wrong with the package. He will have the information if he asks again as soon as we have it.

But I am reassuring him, Mr Speaker, that we think that this is exactly in the interests of taxpayers in Gibraltar. This is exactly the right person to do the job. I have not heard any complaints from anybody who wanted the job. I have not heard any complaints about the man who has got the job. I think everybody agrees he is a fantastic addition to the arsenal available to the Government of Gibraltar to attract investment to Gibraltar. I trust, Mr Speaker, that he will agree, otherwise he will be demeaning somebody who is playing a pivotal role and who is highly respected in his field.

**Hon. D A Feetham** Mr Speaker, I do not understand how he can possibly compare Mr Cruz to Mr Canessa who was after all a public servant. Mr Canessa was a public servant. Mr Canessa being a public servant was transferred to London and that is not the same as this particular situation, which is a situation where the Government has chosen somebody *a dedo* without going out to advertisement and without advertising this particular post.

Of course, Mr Speaker, he is the new dawn man, as I remind him. He is the new dawn man. It is no defence for him to say, 'Well you used to do x, y and z'. Well, quite frankly, it is becoming a bit of a habit because he has also done it in relation to the advertisement of the contract for advertisement at the Airport. We discovered all these companies at No. 6 Convent Place, which was also *a dedo*.

Is he going to answer the question that I asked? Does it relate to all the children of this particular individual or only one of them that we are talking about in relation to this private education allowance?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman just does not know what he is doing politically by treading in this area.

Mr Speaker, I am the new dawn man, but the sun still rises in the east and sets in the west. I am the new dawn man, but Government has to continue operating. I am the new dawn man, but I appointed a Chief Technical Officer without going to interview and I will have to appoint a Financial Secretary without going to interview, and I will have to appoint a Chief Secretary, should Mr Gomez ever leave, without going to interview because those are appointments – those three in particular, which he knows from the hon. the backbencher – used to be appointments by the UK which are now appointments reserved to the Chief Minister of Gibraltar, and that is perfectly proper and perfectly alright.

It is not as if Jason Cruz has become a civil servant because the Government of Gibraltar has employed him and said so. It is not as if Jason Cruz has become a civil servant because the policy of the Government of Gibraltar today is that anybody who has been in the employ of either the GDC or of the Government could simply become a civil servant overnight, as was the case under the previous Administration. This is a gentleman employed to do a particular job *under contract*.

Mr Speaker, I hesitate to raise his name again in this House, but the Hon. Mr Bossino has raised it already. Mr Flower, who was in my office when I arrived, somebody who I am very happy to say does an important function for the Chief Minister of Gibraltar, who I knew and had worked with when I was in private practice and he was in banking, and with whom I have an extraordinarily good relationship, was appointed *a dedo* by the hon. the previous Chief Minister.

Mr Golt, with whom I have the greatest political affinity, was the subject of a vendetta by the hon. the previous Chief Minister of Gibraltar for 15 years for having the temerity to stand against him in 1996. He

used to be as close a friend of his as he used to be of me. He used even to be his ideological partner until he decided to go to the dark side of ideology (*Laughter*) with the hon. Members opposite. He was appointed in the end *a dedo* by them, Mr Speaker.

Mr Cantos who used to do his job before then was appointed *a dedo* by the hon. the previous Chief Minister at the time, and then the appointments *a dedo*, even in Government companies, were myriad.

If I may say so, Mr Speaker, to deal with the particular issue in question, the Gibraltar Airport advertising contract was not an appointment *a dedo*, Mr Speaker, it was to undo –

**Mr Speaker:** Mr Speaker, I have to tell the Chief Minister that we are really running away now from the whole subject and in fact they are in danger not only running out of *dedos* in their hands, but of the feet as well. (*Laughter*)

Let us come down to earth. There is an opportunity next week to debate to your heart's content, when I will be much more liberal than I am prepared to be at Question Time. Let us get on.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** I am grateful, Mr Speaker.

So the only part of the hon. Gentleman's preface which I have not answered is this question of the Airport contract. I will say very succinctly and very quickly, all we did there, Mr Speaker, is appoint the only person that they had failed to appoint to the new company from the old company. In other words, they took everybody who was employed by the company, who used to run the Airport – (*Interjection*) Terminal Management Limited to the new company GATL. They singled out for their usual vendetta-style approach one individual and when we were elected we ensured that we undid that and we gave him the job that he had held for almost 25 years under successive Administrations until their previous leader decided that he was going to be done away with, as if he were to be discarded like rubbish, and we appointed him back.

So none of those things that he has said, Mr Speaker, goes anywhere near dealing with any of the issues that they dealt with and so let themselves down and delivered what was not good Government, Mr Speaker, in many respects.

**Mr Speaker:** One final supplementary and then we will move on to the next question.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, that is all well and good and it is all very interesting – (*Interjection*) No, it is all very interesting, but he has not answered the question. Does the private education allowance relate to all Mr Cruz's children or just one of them? That is the question. He is the Minister for Finance and by the way, he does not know the power of the dark side yet. (*Laughter and interjections*)

**Mr Speaker:** The supplementary question is: is it to do with one child or with more children?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the answer is that I do not know how many children Mr Cruz has (*Laughter and interjections*) or may have at the time of the information. I have told him, Mr Speaker, once the Chief Secretary has done an agreement with Mr Cruz, if he continues to ask me I will give him the information.

Mr Speaker. I am fully conscious that the empire always strikes back, but the Jedi always returns and in the end, in episode six, good prevails over evil. (*Laughter*)

#### Q467/2014

#### Previous Speaker's tax affairs – Report into leak of information; update

**Mr Speaker:** Question 467.

**Clerk:** Question 467, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I hesitate to ask who is Yoda on the Government benches (*Laughter*) but, Mr Speaker, further to the answer he gave me to Question 207/2014, can the Chief Minister please state whether the report into the leak of the tax affairs of the previous Speaker has now been finalised?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have no doubt of who the evil emperor is and who Darth Vader is.

Mr Speaker, the Chief Secretary expects the report in question to have been finalised before the end of October.

**Q468-471/2014**  
**Sunborn Hotel/Credit Finance Company Ltd –**  
**Details**

1580 **Clerk:** Question 468, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, what has been the total expenditure, either by way of loans or otherwise, by the Government or any of its wholly or partly-owned companies, in or associated with the Sunborn floating venture?

1585 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 469 – sorry, Mr Speaker, let me start again.

1590 I will answer this question about the fabulous floating five-star hotel, the Sunborn, together with Questions 469 to 471.

**Clerk:** Question 469, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1595 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please provide details of dividends or any returns actually received by the Gibraltar Savings Bank and the Government from Credit Finance Company Limited?

**Clerk:** Question 470, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1600 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please provide a breakdown of all legal fees and fees in respect of consultants paid out by Credit Finance Company Limited, together with particulars of the transaction it related to?

1605 **Clerk:** Question 471, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Chief Minister please provide a breakdown of how the £430 million invested in Credit Finance Company Limited by the Government and the Gibraltar Savings Bank was in turn invested as at 31st March 2014, 30th April 2014 and 31st May 2014?

1610 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

1615 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, as has already been explained in the House previously, details of individual loans issued by Credit Finance Company Limited will not be given; however, details of the total loan book, including the loan issued to the fabulous floating five-star Sunborn Hotel, are now available on the Government website.

1620 Expenditure has also been incurred in infrastructure work to enable the fabulous five-star floating Sunborn Hotel to berth at its present location and to enable the fabulous five-star Sunborn Hotel to have access to utilities, such as potable water and electricity supply. These works are done for any similar development. The total of such expenditure will as usual be shared by those who have taken the benefit of such works and any amounts paid by the Government are therefore going to be recoverable where the benefit is enured to third parties. Discussions in this respect are ongoing with both the owners of Ocean Village and of the fabulous floating five-star Sunborn Hotel.

1625 Mr Speaker, the total costs of the works has not yet, however, been fully invoiced to Government by some private contractors involved and some invoices are disputed. I am therefore unable to provide any reliable figures for the costs of the works at the moment.

Mr Speaker, the amounts received by the Savings Bank Fund from Credit Finance Company Limited from its investment in redeemable preference shares is as follows: 2012-13, £1.22 million; 2013-14, £19.938 million; 2014-15 to date, £3.75 million, representing two months of the year. No other dividends have been paid to date by Credit Finance Company Limited.

1630 The information requested in answer to Question 470 is, I am reliably informed, already available on the Government website.

Monthly information on the total loan book of Credit Finance Company Limited, including details of total commutations paid as requested in Question 471 are now available on the Government website.

1635 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can I ask the Chief Minister when the answer to Question 471 has actually been provided... has actually been posted on the Government website? Was it after I provided notice of this question, because if it was, then it is his obligation is to provide it to me in answer across the floor of this House? When I last looked at the website, I did not see it before I actually asked this question. That is why I have asked this question. Indeed, even after I had given notice of this question, it was not on  
1640 the Government website. So I think if it was not before, as I am absolutely certain it was not, before I gave notice, his obligation is to provide it across the floor of this House and not just simply refer me to a website.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am informed by those who provide the information to me that it is up on the website. So I assume it is up on the website by the time that I am giving the answer, it must have  
1645 been at the time that he was putting the question.

But, Mr Speaker, if he wants to... if something is not on the website, instead of asking me across the floor of the House in an attempt to embarrass the Government, if that is what he is doing, simply give me a call and say, 'Fabian, the monthly amounts have not been put up on the website', and I will tell the civil servant responsible to make sure it goes up immediately. That is what the information is there for. It is not  
1650 information we are trying to hide. It should be up on the website.

In fact, Mr Speaker, what I can tell him is that I do not have the information with me, but I believe it is the amount that was disclosed last month. I do not think any of those totals have changed in the period since we discussed it and I said that it would be going up on the Government website.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, you see I do not want to have these exchanges across the floor of this House because it is completely and utter unnecessary. I have given notice of a question. We now have a situation where I am being told by my Deputy, Mr Bossino, that in fact the only information, which is the information that I saw when I looked at the website... the only information on Credit Finance on the  
1655 website is the loan book in relation to Credit Finance, the commutated pensions, the amount that has been invested by the Gibraltar Savings Bank in Credit Finance, which is £400 million, and the total equity invested by the Government, and also arrears... loans provided to allow people to repay Government arrears, which is roughly about £1 million.

It does not have the information. It does not provide the information that I have asked in Question 471, which is important. What this is asking is how Credit Finance is actually investing that money. We know that £72 million has been spent. We know that – that is the information on the website – but the remainder of it must be somewhere. That money has to be somewhere. I think that the Hon. the Minister for  
1660 Employment probably can answer that question. I suspect that the money is still sitting – because the transaction was probably a paper transaction – in the Gibraltar Savings Bank wherever the Gibraltar Savings Bank originally invested that money, be it in some account or elsewhere. That is what this question is asking. I want to know how the entirety of the £430 million, which is more than just the £72 million, is actually invested.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, we have had this debate before. The information that I have told him is going to be publicly available on the website is the one that has already been put publicly on the website. So he has gone through the list of everything that he has asked about and it is all on the website, and so I am pleased that he recognises that.  
1675

The balance, Mr Speaker, I have told him before, it is in cash in the companies. It is in cash in the Government companies held in cash.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** It is held in cash on behalf of the company, but where? What account? With what bank? Simply because the hon. Gentleman has said it is held in cash, there is not £430 million. Less £70 million under somebody's mattress, under the Chief Secretary's mattress or Dilip's mattress because they are the only two Directors, together with another senior civil servant of this company. It is not there. It has got to be somewhere. What I am asking is where is that money invested? In other words, with what  
1680 bank is it actually invested... deposited? That is the question.

I even think there is absolutely no commercial sensitivity in this question and indeed it follows from similar questions that I have asked of the Hon. the Minister for Employment and answers that he has provided me, because in fact in fairness to the Hon. the Minister for Employment, he has provided me in the past – he has undertaken to provide to me the same by tomorrow – a list of how exactly the Gibraltar Savings Bank has invested this particular money.  
1685  
1690



I actually suspect that the money in Credit Finance Company Limited that he says is cash in the company, is still sitting in exactly the same place where it was sitting when the share transfer actually took place, and probably the only difference is that the account holder has actually changed. That is all. That is what I suspect is happening.

1695

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the position is that I have told him in respect of that money that it is held in cash in the companies – that is the information that we are giving. I will go back and seek from the Financial Secretary further detail. But if we have had this question before and I have answered it like this before. (**A Member:** No.) I do not think we have had this issue before, but I will go away and I will talk to the person that he refers to by his first name, who I refer to as the Financial Secretary.

1700

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I think the question is very clear and all my questions have been very clear, very precise. There is nothing about directly or indirectly, but I know that the hon. Gentleman has difficulty with those questions.

1705

Could I ask the Hon. the Chief Minister to again provide me with this information by tomorrow, which is when the Hon. the Minister for Employment and also the Minister for the Gibraltar Savings Bank is going to provide me with the parallel information as to how the Gibraltar Savings Bank monies are being invested?

1710

### ADJOURNMENT

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** No. Mr Speaker, his questions are not clear. I have no problems with directly or indirectly and I will not undertake to do that. I will go back and I will talk to the Financial Secretary and I will then give him a call to tell him what the Financial Secretary tells me, but I will not tell him it will be tomorrow. I will tell him that it will happen because I am taking away what he has said.

1715

Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that the House do now adjourn until Monday at 10.00 a.m., when I have notified hon. Gentlemen and Members generally that we will be dealing with the Appropriation debate.

1720

**Mr Speaker:** I now propose the question which is that this House do now adjourn until Monday at 10.00 a.m.

I now put the question which is that this House do now adjourn until Monday at 10.00a.m. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Passed.  
The House will now adjourn until Monday at 10.00 a.m.

1725

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, sorry, are the Written Questions going to be tabled?

1730

**Hon. Chief Minister:** At 10.00 a.m. on Monday.

*The House adjourned at 4.45 p.m.*