



# PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

**MORNING SESSION: 9.15 a.m. – 1.08 p.m.**

**Gibraltar, Thursday, 19th February 2015**

## **Business transacted**

Prayer .....	3
Confirmation of Minutes .....	3
<b>Questions for Oral Answer .....</b>	<b>3</b>
Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.....	3
Q163-168/2015 Trainees – Details of levels followed.....	3
Q169/2015 Public service employees – Increase in numbers .....	5
Q170/2015 Government projects – Costs and contracts awarded to GJBS and Bizzy Bee Ltd .....	7
Q172-179/2015 Government finances – Update.....	11
Business & Training .....	19
Q80/2015 Employment Service – Changes made to address complaints.....	19
Q81/2015 Government website – Table EMP.7 update.....	22
Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.....	24
Q82/2015 Monument to women of Gibraltar – Commissioning and location .....	24
Q83/2015 Sports Injury Clinic – How to be set up and run .....	24
Q84/2015 GSLA school swimming classes – Cancellations .....	25
Q85/2015 Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority – Vacancies.....	25
Q84/2015 continued GSLA school swimming classes – Supplementary question .....	26
Q86/2015 Gibraltar Rugby Football Union and Gibraltar Cricket Association – Provision of alternative facilities .....	27
Q87-88/2015 Cultural grants – Awards for 2014-15 .....	28
Q89/2015 Sports Development Projects – Details of grants .....	31
Q90/2015 Gibraltar Philharmonic Society – Grants awarded 2014-15.....	31
Q91/2015 Heritage sites – Details and costs of works .....	32
Q92/2015 Liberator Bomber AM911 – Progress on removing and exhibiting wreck .....	33

Transport, Traffic and Technical Services .....	33
Q123-132/2015 Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan – Cycling .....	33
Q133-135/2015 Bicycle rental scheme – Plans for delivery .....	41
Q136/2015 Adult cycling proficiency courses – Potential introduction .....	44
Q137-138/2015 Buses – Full specifications of old and new .....	45
Q139/2015 Bus drivers merging onto Rosia Road – Resolving difficulties at Red Sands Road .....	46
Q140/2015 Safety of red buses – Works on Europa Road .....	47
Q141-143/2015 Buses– Increasing service levels .....	47
Q144-158/2015 City centre traffic – Government’s plans .....	49
<i>The House recessed at 1.08 p.m. ....</i>	<i>54</i>

# The Gibraltar Parliament

*The Parliament met at 9.15 a.m.*

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: P E Martinez Esq *in attendance*]

## PRAYER

*Mr Speaker*

## CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

**Clerk:** Meeting of Parliament, Thursday, 19th February 2015.

Order of Proceedings: (i) Oath of Allegiance; (ii) Confirmation of Minutes – the Minutes of the last meeting of Parliament which was held on 22nd and 29th January 2015.

5       **Mr Speaker:** May I sign the Minutes as correct? (**Members:** Aye.)

*Mr Speaker signed the Minutes.*

10       **Clerk:** (iii) Communications from the Chair; (iv) Petitions; (v) Announcements; (vi) Papers to be laid; (vii) Reports of Committees; (viii) Answers to Oral Questions.

## Questions for Oral Answer

### ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, TELECOMMUNICATIONS & THE GSB

#### Q163-168/2015

#### Trainees –

#### Details of levels followed

**Clerk:** We commence today with Question 163, the Hon. E J Reyes.

15       **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide details of how many of the Trainees who obtained NVQs Level 1, as listed in answer to Question 768/2014, have continued working towards obtaining NVQ Level 2; providing a breakdown showing the corresponding NVQ discipline being followed?

20       **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question with Questions 164 to 168.

25       **Clerk:** Question 164, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Government provide details of any of the Trainees who obtained NVQs Level 2, as listed in answer to Question 768/2014, have continued working towards obtaining NVQ Level 3; providing a breakdown showing the corresponding NVQ discipline being followed?

30 **Clerk:** Question 165, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Further to the answer provided to Question 60/2015, can the Government say by when it is estimated that the Assessor at the Engineering Training Centre will obtain the required EAL Award in Assessing Competence in the Work Environment Level 3; as well as indicating who is carrying out any  
35 official assessment duties until the necessary qualifications are obtained by the individual concerned?

**Clerk:** Question 166, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Government provide the missing information in respect of all the 134 Trainees listed in answer to Question 768/2014, as the information provided through answer to Question 62/2015 only accounts for 123 Trainees in respect of NVQs attained?  
40

**Clerk:** Question 167, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Government provide revised and/or updated information in respect of the 74 Trainees listed in answer to Question 766/2014, as the information provided in answer to Question 63/2015 accounts for 75 Trainees in respect of NVQs they are currently undertaking?  
45

**Clerk:** Question 168, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Government provide details of any new Trainees enrolled at either (a) Construction Trades Training Centre; (b) Engineering Trades Training Centre, since the answer provided to Question 64/2015, listing the specific discipline or course being followed indicating at what NVQ Level, the Examination Board and Awarding Body who will upon successful completion certify the award, as well as stating at which Training Centre they are enrolled?  
50  
55

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, the Trainees progressing to Level 2 are in the following trades: Carpentry – four; Bricklaying – two; Plastering – two; and Wall and Floor Tiling – one.  
60

The Trainees progressing from Level 2 to Level 3 are in Carpentry – four; and in Bricklaying – one.

The Assessor undergoing training within the Engineering Training Centre is expected to attain the qualification by the end of September 2015. Currently official assessment duties are overseen by the Gibraltar College.  
65

The 11 Trainees omitted from the answer to Question 62 were 10 trainees obtaining NVQ Level 1 in Plumbing, accredited by City & Guilds and one trainee NVQ Level 3 in Fabrication and Welding and accredited by EAL.

In respect of the answer given to Question 63/2015, the extra trainee at NVQ Level 2 was in Carpentry. The correct figure was one trainee and not two. 24 trainees have now enrolled at the Construction Training Centre and are following City & Guilds NVQ Level 1 Courses in Painting and Decorating, Carpentry and Plumbing.  
70

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Thank you, Mr Speaker. I have got a small query that perhaps the Minister can clarify for me. Having been able to see an actual certificate of an NVQ Award, the Minister keeps on referring to the awarding body as City & Guilds yet on the certificate it says that it is the Construction Industry Training Board (CITB).  
75

Does the Minister have any sort of explanation as to why on the one hand we call it City & Guilds and the certificate as such is issued under the nomenclature of CITB?  
80

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Well I am not able to clarify the point about the specific certificate he is talking about because I have not seen it, but I can tell him that at one stage the City & Guilds and the CITB were awarding the qualifications jointly.

Quite recently, I think within the last 18 months, they split and now they no longer provide – they provide the same qualification but they are now separate. So there are people who will have a certificate that will have both logos, as it were, and there will be people who will only have CITB and there will be people who will have City & Guilds.  
85

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, it helps at least to a certain extent to clarify that. Should the Minister ever come into further information of division or reunification of boards and so on, I would be grateful –  
90



even if it is behind the Speaker's Chair, if he just updates me, because sometimes I try to look on official websites to try and see the actual contents of the syllabus and one does not know whether to search under City & Guilds or under CITB. Whatever the Minister can do for ease of reference, I appreciate that.

95 **Hon. J J Bossano:** I am not sure that there is much difference in the content, although one of the reasons why... well, the initial move, as the hon. Member knows because I told him, I think, three years ago when I started on this, was that there were employers in the industry who were saying they preferred City & Guilds. He was right in that the information that I brought to the House, which was information that they had provided to me, which was that they were talking about City & Guilds as if it was a different  
100 qualification, when in fact it is a different awarding body, which is something he pointed out to me and was right. But I was acting on information that they gave me which I was not in a position to question.

So in terms of the awarding bodies, I do not think the difference between them is all that much, given that until a couple of years ago, they were both doing the same syllabus. But I am told that in the City & Guilds version, there is now more practical work and less written work, and that I think is an important  
105 consideration, because we have a problem in that many of the school leavers and some of the older people in the industry who are coming back to get qualifications are not all that proficient in the English language. Although they know what they are doing and they can describe it to you in Spanish if you question them, it does not mean necessarily that they can write a thesis on it.

So to the extent that there is a difference other than for example that the training is now more geared to maintenance work because we believe that is where the long-term future is in terms of secure jobs rather  
110 than putting up buildings which go up, and then when they are finished there is no more work, other than that element which would be the same whichever of the two we took, I think that is the main difference.

But I will try and get the information for the hon. Member that is more accurate than the one I can give him standing on my feet.

115 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Thank you, Mr Speaker, and just to state in this House, I concur wholeheartedly with the Minister's views: City & Guilds does have quite a good reputation. Certainly employers in Gibraltar for many, many years have been satisfied with the standards required from City & Guilds and 'if it ain't broken, why fix it?' So the Minister will continue to receive my support if he carries on down the avenue of  
120 City & Guilds.

At the end of the day, I think all sides of this House prefer to have good quality craftsmen, irrespective of what the nomenclature on the certificate may say.

**Hon. J J Bossano:** I am grateful for his support, Mr Speaker.

**Q169/2015**  
**Public service employees –**  
**Increase in numbers**

125

**Clerk:** Question 169, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, what permanent increases have there been in numbers in employees in the public service since 1st April 2014 broken down by reference to the Civil Service, the GDC and any  
130 other Government company, public authority or entity for which the Government is accountable?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr  
135 Speaker, the figures for December 2014 are not yet available. The increases in respect of the figures given for 31st March last year have increased by the end of September as follows: Civil Service – 4; GDC – 33; Public Agencies and Authorities – 72.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, does this include the over 70 recruits for the Customs Department, the  
140 figures that the Hon. Minister has provided?

**Hon. J J Bossano:** No, those would be civil servants and there are only four, so four cannot possibly include 72.

145 **Hon. D A Feetham:** So in fact the figure – obviously we do not have the figures post-September, I will ask again next month, but the figure is likely to be closer to 200 extra bodies within the public service as a whole as from March of last year?

150 **Hon. J J Bossano:** I am not able to confirm that figure. All I can tell him is that this is based on the same analysis that I gave him for 31st March figure which is the number of... If I remind the hon. Member, this is the quarterly exercise that is done by the Statistics Office, which was being done when he was in Government and every three months they produce a snapshot of the people that there are working at the end of the quarter. If you compare one quarter with the other, the difference that you get is the figures that I have given him.

155 I mean it is a net figure so there will be some Departments that have gone up and some that have come down; but the bottom line is that there are four more civil servants, 33 more GDC grades and 72 more in the agencies and authorities.

160 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, the actual net increase... I have done the calculations, he may not agree but the actual net increase from March 2012 to March 2014, within the public service as a whole, that includes Civil Service, GDC, authorities, entities, etc was 513 at a recurrent cost to the Taxpayer, in terms of recurrent expenditure, of £8.2 million if we take into account the lowest possible pay scale. So it is actually likely to be more than that.

165 Does the hon. Member feel comfortable with these increases in recurrent expenditure and these increases in the public service or does he feel that perhaps he feels comfortable now but that moving towards the future, this is something that is going to have to be re-examined, these increases in the public service, because Gibraltar cannot sustain such increases in recurrent expenditure?

170 **Hon. J J Bossano:** I assume, Mr Speaker, that the 513 that he is referring to is the figure that I gave him for last year, but not the figure in this question.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** The figure is a figure calculated from the Estimates Book and also answers that the hon. Gentleman has given me and it is from March 2012 to March 2014. So it is those two full years for which the Government is responsible, there has been an increase, a net increase in the public service of 513 bodies at the lowest pay scale that is £8.2 million of recurrent expenditure that has been added to the recurrent expenditure bill on an annual basis.

180 **Hon. J J Bossano:** I think his figures are wrong, Mr Speaker, but of course it is difficult to analyse what he is saying because he has asked me what has happened since March 2014 and now he produces a figure of what has happened since March 2012. Well, if he wanted to know the figure since 2012 I would have had that produced and then I would have given it to him but I am not sure his figure of 513 for that period is there because I have not checked it myself and I have not provided it at this stage.

185 What I provided him for example the last time he put this question which was for the Financial Year 2013-14 was that there were 47 more civil servants and 12 more GDC. So if his figures were accurate, which I do not believe they are, it would suggest that in the first year there must have been an increase of 400. I do not recall 400 more civil servants or GDC employees, certainly not GDC because I remember the GDC number since I was much more involved in the GDC administration than in the Civil Service side and I remember that there certainly was not that level at all. I think what we had initially was the 84 people who came back from the Civil Service and in fact in the first year, those 84 might have gone up maybe by 30 to about 111, something like that from recollection that is in 2012-13.

190 So if in the first 12 months we had about 20-odd in the GDC extra and since then we have had 12 in the second year, which makes it 36, I do not see how he can get to 500 in the period. But I will go back and check the figure and if he wants to ask me the same question again, I will tell him whether I think the financial side of the question is correct.

195 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, I can assure him that we have been meticulous in our consideration, but if the answer is that the hon. Gentleman has given this House... but also in the comparison of Estimate Books as to compared to previous Estimate Books – but leaving aside the question of the past, we are talking about this year, substantial increases within the public service and the figures that he has given me are likely to increase, they do not take into account the 70-odd Customs officers who have also been recruited. What I am asking is, in terms of Government policy and intention moving towards the future, does he feel comfortable with that kind of increase within the public service and the recurrent

200

expenditure that entails, or does he believe, as indeed I believe, that moving towards the future, there really has to be a taking of stock and keeping under control those numbers of coming into the public service, because in the current climate I do not think that is sustainable, moving forwards.

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, it is self-evident that what is not sustainable is that everybody should finish up working in the public sector, which is what most people would like, because there would be nobody left in the private sector to pay taxes.

So clearly, the philosophy has to be that we employ people in the public service, not because people like to be in the public service because they are much better off, but because the public service needs them in order to deliver the service. And I think the philosophy of any government has to be to make use of the human resource that employing people is, in the most efficient way possible so that without the quality of the service suffering, we do it with the least number of people that it is possible to do it, so as to keep the cost within sustainable limits.

But it has to be accepted, I think, that if there have been four more civil servants since March, in that six-month period, it is because a case has been made for the need for those four additional ones. I can tell the hon. Member that generally the case is made for ten times that many and if there are four there, it is quite likely that the request was for 40 in the first place – something that I am sure he can recall from his days in Government as being the norm. The Departments always argue that they need more people and I have yet to see a Department that comes and offers to release staff to another one.

But as a general rule, in my view, the correct approach to take is that to accept that by the very nature of things there will be changes in the requirements of the Government service which make it necessary to increase in some areas and as far as possible those increases should be compensated by reductions in other areas, where the need may not have been as much in the present as it was in the past.

So we should try as far as we can to ensure that there is no net increase, even though there may be increases in some professions or some grades where an expert is required but which can be compensated by not replacing some people that we lose in other areas.

That would be, in my view, something that we should all aim to achieve but easier said than done.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker, easier said than done. When I was in Government, I only had a PA and a secretary. Probably because as I told him last month, I am rather averse to increasing the recurrent expenditure bill for the Government.

But, Mr Speaker, does he have any figures in terms of what the additions to the recurrent expenditure bill, there is going to be with these additions that he has provided this House in answer to the question that I have asked him at all. Does he have those calculations there?

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Mr Speaker, no because in some cases, it means that if the people have come in during the course of the last six months, they may have been provided for in the estimates we have approved in this House, but that money is not being paid from 1st April so you have a situation where I mean, between now and the end of March, nothing much is going to change.

I think the reflection of additional costs in personal emoluments will be seen once the estimates are closed and brought to the House. But I can tell him that at this stage, not all the Departments have put in their requests so we have not yet got a global figure that I could give him an indication of whether we are going to be facing a much bigger increase than in other years or the same model as other years.

But I can assure him that the efficient use of manpower is a fundamental element in any sensible policy in terms of the public service and therefore I would not disagree with that.

#### Q170/2015

#### Government projects –

#### Costs and contracts awarded to GJBS and Bizzy Bee Ltd

**Clerk:** Question 170, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, how much has the Government paid GJBS in respect of Government projects since it took office, divided by financial years?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 171.

**Clerk:** Question 171, the Hon. D A Feetham.

260 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, please provide details of all contracts that have been awarded to Bizzy Bee Ltd by the Government, any Government-owned company or public authority or entity?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.

265 **Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, the amount paid by the Government to GJBS in respect of Government projects by financial year was as follows: 2011-12, pro rata for the fourth quarter given that he is asking since we were elected, was £7.691 million; 2012-13 – £13.165 million; 2013-14 – £31.436 million; and 2014-15, the first three quarters, that is until December – £38.525 million.

270 The details in respect of the contracts awarded to Bizzy Bee are contained in the schedule which I now hand to the hon. Member.

**Schedule to PQ 171 of 2015**

Scud Hill Steps	£160.00
Hargraves Parade	£540.00
Town Range	£1,600.00
Town Range	£300.00
Town Range	£100.00
Red Sands House	£335.00
Sheffield House	£87.00
Town Range	£400.00
Town Range	£450.00
Town Range	£130.00
Town Range	£1,750.00
Wilson's Ramp	£600.00
St Jago's	£160.00
St Jago's	£475.00
St Jago's	£318.00
Stanley Building	£600.00
Gavino's Dwellings	£1,100.00
St Jago's	£700.00
St Jago's	£2,100.00
Flat Bastion Road	£163.00
Key House Moorish Castle	£212.00
Causeway House	£340.00
Willis's Road	£496.00
North Pavillion	£280.00
Flat Bastion Road	£375.00
Alameda House	£200.00
Vineyard House	£135.00
Prince Edward's Road	£100.00
Town Range	£600.00
Town Range	£1,100.00
Town Range	£700.00
Town Range	£1,100.00
Alameda House	£800.00
Victoria House	£300.00
Canton House	£400.00
Hargraves Parade	£108.00
Brother O'Brien	£108.00
Warspite House	£108.00
Kestrel House	£108.00
Hood House	£500.00
Goole House	£410.00
St John's Court	£130.00
Ramillies House	£81.00
Tarik House	£392.00
Archbishop Amigo House	£90.00
Rodney House	£100.00
Hood House	£245.00
St Jago's	£80.00

Medview Terrace	£80.00
Ince House	£100.00
Arengo's Palace	£80.00
Gavino's Dwellings	£80.00
Devil's Tower Road	£3,000.00
Light House	£550.00
Governor's Meadow Promenade	£300.00
Stanley Building	£2,700.00
Town Range	£1,200.00
Stanley Building	£3,340.00
Canton House	£420.00
St John's Court	£300.00
Hermes House	£250.00
Victoria House	£340.00
Flat Bastion Road	£350.00
Victoria House	£1,400.00
Stanley Building	£12,789.95
Anderson House	£1,300.00
South Barrack Ramp	£450.00
St Josephs	£320.00
Kingsway House	£400.00
Alameda House	£150.00
Shamrock House	£300.00
Alameda House	£130.00
St John's Court	£1,240.00
North Pavillion	£300.00
Churchill House	£416.00
St Josephs	£570.00
Stanley Building	£21,732.00
Town Range Car Park	£200.00
Arengo's House	£588.54
St John's Court	£300.00
Ballymena House, Laguna Estate	£600.00
Somerset Court	£260.00
Oronsay House	£225.00
Scud Hill House, Scud Hill	£7,097.50
Stanley Building, North Façade	£25,583.64
Coelho House	£1,280.00
Knights Court	£600.00
Prince Edwards Road	£970.00
Valiant House	£100.00
Orsova House	£761.00
Stanley Building, North East	£10,128.46
Scud Hill House, Scud Hill	£6,492.32
Ironside House, Glacis Estate.	£25.00
Cathay House, VBE	£60.00
Goole House	£191.00
Fearless House, Laguna Estate	£855.00
Aquitania House, VBE	£1,766.00
Portmore House, Glacis Estate	£324.00

275 **Mr Speaker:** Are there any supplementaries?

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, if I can draw the hon. Gentleman's attention to the schedule that he very kindly sent across the floor of the House in relation to Bizzy Bee Limited, the hon. Gentleman will see a final entry which is the Varyl Begg Estate entry for £97,000. Bearing in mind that my question was details of all contracts that have been awarded to Bizzy Bee by the Government and effectively the public sector, it says £97,000 but my understanding is – and indeed I think it has been confirmed in communiques from the Government in answer to communiques from us in relation to this particular company – that the Varyl Begg tender was for £1.5 million.

280 Why the discrepancy between the £97,000 in relation to Varyl Begg and the £1.5 million which we know is roughly the figure in terms of the award for the total works of the Varyl Begg Estate?

285

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, Mr Speaker, because I assumed that what he wanted to know was what had been paid to date, given that the answer to the question that he is now putting to me he already has and by the Rules of the House he is not supposed to ask me questions to which he already has the answer.

290 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, I think the question is very clear. It is: please provide details of all contracts that have been awarded to Bizzy Bee. What he has given me then is a schedule of payments made to Bizzy Bee. So effectively in terms of the quantity, the size of the contracts and the money that is going to be paid at some future date is obviously going to be significantly higher. Indeed it is probably going to be more than double what we see here, probably more than quadruple what we see here, because  
295 the Varyl Begg contract in itself was £1.5 million and only £97,000 is accounted for.

Does he have the figures there of the actual contract, and it is a question that I have asked, the details of all the contracts awarded in terms of the price, the contract price awarded to Bizzy Bee rather than what has been paid?

Perhaps in terms of some of these I suppose, some of the smaller jobs, the figures here are the contract award because perhaps some of these smaller awards Town Range £1,600 that is what has been paid in respect of this particular project, I mean I do not know. But what I am interested in is really the contract award and the price that has been awarded to Bizzy Bee for contracts awarded by the Government.

300 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, the contract for Varyl Begg the answer is that he had the information before he put the question so he knows that and in respect of the others, those are jobs that have all been completed and the figure there is the full price for each job.

305 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Just to be clear, all the way up to Ramillies House for £1,286, all of that includes the sum paid and the contract price awarded to Bizzy Bee, I want to be absolutely clear about that, that is the money paid, plus the price agreed with the Government for these jobs, right up to Varyl Begg Estate.

**Hon. J J Bossano:** It is what I have told him, Mr Speaker.

310 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, in relation to the question on GJBS the £7 million, £13 million, £31 million and £38 million, does he have any breakdown in relation to how this is broken down in relation to projects at all there, by way of supplementary information that his civil servants may have provided?

315 **Hon. J J Bossano:** No, this is not something that they can produce at the drop of a hat. It would take a lot of time to go back and check. This is all money that has been paid on projects that have been approved by this Parliament in the Improvement and Development Fund.

320 I cannot tell him... the money in any one year is not necessarily all in a project that started and ended in that same year. As he knows, most of the capital projects overlap one year and the next so there will be jobs that started maybe in their time which finished after 2011-12 and some maybe carrying on.

325 There are things that involve going back and putting work right that goes back to the time of OEM and the estates that were left in the lurch and had to be put right and are still having work done to them. So the answer is, I can get it for him but it will take some time to do it and it will probably mean that there will be the same projects appearing in more than one year and it will be matched by the amount that the House has approved. This is money approved and paid for the projects in question.

330 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker, bearing in mind that GJBS are undertaking some very major projects for the Government, they are undertaking the £24 million project in respect of the small boats marina and they are also undertaking the project in respect of the cladding to the three estates, Glacis, Laguna and Moorish Castle and also they are undertaking the construction of the affordable homes in the Aerial Farm near Eastern Beach, we are talking about some very substantial projects undertaken by GJBS  
335 on my calculation, roughly nearly £200 million.

Is it safe to say, and does he agree, that these figures do not take into account the major outlay that is to come from the Government in respect of those major projects totalling nearly £200 million?

340 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, I do not think I am qualified to judge him on the fairness of the things that he says (*Interjection and laughter*) but whether it is fair or not, it is not accurate because he needs to understand that I am giving him the answer to the question that he asked, which is on the Government's projects. He knows that when he was in Government, the Government was paying some things as Government projects and some things were not being paid as Government projects, and it is the same still today.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, can he elaborate on that answer? What does he mean, the Government paid some projects as Government projects and some projects not as Government projects in the light of that £200 million outlay by the Government towards GJBS for the completion of those three construction projects that I mentioned in my question earlier?

**Hon. J J Bossano:** What I mean, Mr Speaker, is that as was the case before December 2011 when GJBS was being paid, for example £40 million or £50 million from the I&D Fund and other things were being paid because the car parks were being done by the car park company. So the car park company was paying for the car parks and that is something that was happening, so the system continues to be as he did it.

Whether there is still £200 million more or less to meet, I cannot confirm because that is speculative. I have not done the numbers and I only use numbers when I am sure they are accurate.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I cannot, with respect to the hon. Gentleman, think for one moment that he has not looked at these figures and that he has not calculated what is outstanding and what is to be paid either via a Government-owned company or directly from the Government or wherever, to GJBS in respect of £200 million which he knows that GJBS has got to be paid in respect of all these projects. I just cannot fathom that, I know the hon. Gentleman well and quite frankly I cannot see that he has not made that calculation.

But let me ask him this. Does he accept that the Government does not have the money at this present moment, in order to pay – ?

**Mr Speaker:** No, sorry, it does not arise from the original question.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, if Mr Speaker rules the question out, then obviously I am going to have to sit down because that –

**Mr Speaker:** If the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition in respect of GJBS has asked a very simple question, how much has the Government paid GJBS in respect of Government projects since it took office, divided by financial years. It has been answered in the manner in which the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition asked the question. It has been answered.

Now he is expecting the Government to look into the future and give an answer to an all embracing supplementary that does not arise from the original question. It is as simple as that.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, may I provide Mr Speaker with my views in the most respectful manner that I can, but they are my views. (*Laughter*)

Mr Speaker, the whole purpose of this question is to look at how much money has been paid to GJBS in respect of those very substantial projects and to then determine how far the Government has the cash flow to pay for those projects. Because if the Government has still an outlay of for example £160 million in respect of these projects, bearing in mind that this is the Government that says it is going to complete its manifesto commitments within this term, that is another £160 million that it has to pay and of course our contention is, that the Government does not have the money to pay.

But of course, if Mr Speaker rules the question as inadmissible, then I obviously respect that decision but I think that he knew where we were coming from in the same way as obviously, because my intention in asking this question is pretty clear to anybody that has thought about this particular issue.

**Mr Speaker:** It is perfectly admissible for the Leader of the Opposition to seek further information in respect of the information that has been given of the expenditure for all these financial years that is perfectly admissible. But the supplementary that he is asking goes far way beyond that and if what he wanted was an answer in respect of future cash flow, he could have asked a specific question in the first place. He can still do so for the future at the next meeting.

**Q172-179/2015**  
**Government finances –**  
**Update**

**Clerk:** Question 172, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please state what the Government cash reserves were as at 31st January 2015?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development and Telecommunications.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this with Questions 173 to 179.

**Clerk:** Question 173, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please provide a breakdown by bank and amount of that part of the aggregate public debt which comprises public debt as at 31st January 2015?

**Clerk:** Question 174, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Chief Minister please provide this House with a breakdown by debenture issue of that part of the aggregate public debt which comprises Government debentures as at 31st January 2015?

**Clerk:** Question 175, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Chief Minister please provide details of the value of Gibraltar Savings Bank debentures or other debt security as at 31st January 2015?

**Clerk:** Question 176, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Chief Minister please provide a breakdown of where and how all the monies deposited in the Gibraltar Savings Bank have been invested and the rate of return on each of these investments as at 31st January 2015?

**Clerk:** Question 177, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Please explain why the Government is not able to provide details of all investments and transfers of monies made out of Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Ltd over the last calendar year, including the identity of the recipient.

**Clerk:** Question 178, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Government please explain why it is not prepared to provide details of all monies deposited or investments made by the Government, in Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Ltd over the last calendar year, together with the dates and details of the bank and bank accounts into which the money was deposited?

**Clerk:** Question 179, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Government please explain why it is not prepared to provide details of the terms in which Credit Finance Company Limited has deposited the sum of £347 million in Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Ltd and whether all the directors of Credit Finance approved that transaction?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development and Telecommunications.

**Mr Speaker:** I say to the Leader of the Opposition to assist him that he does not have to take notes in respect of the answers to these eight questions, because I am going to provide him with the whole answer immediately after the Minister has given the answer, alright? Because it is long and complex and it is eight questions and it is difficult to follow.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Very generous of you, Mr Speaker. *(Laughter)*

As at 31st January, the aggregate Public Debt consisting of bank debt was: Barclays Bank Plc £150 million; NatWest Offshore Limited £50 million.

Government debentures by maturity date were as follows: 2017 debentures £30,142,200; one month's notice £238,989,700.

The value of Gibraltar Savings Bank debentures and other debt security by maturity date was: one month £30,741,400; 2015 debentures £10,960,900; 2016 debentures £22,935,600; 2017 debentures



465 £95,853,900; 2018 debentures £163,895,100; 2019 debentures £137,271,000; other debentures  
£135,010,346; bonds £104,854,712; deposit accounts £237,463,243.

The average yield of the different categories of investments vehicles held by the Savings Bank for the month of January are as follows:

470 On-call accounts with the Bank of England, the Crown Agents and Gibraltar Banks had an average yield of around 0.55%. The Gibraltar banks were the Royal Bank of Scotland, Barclays Bank, National Westminster, Jyske Bank and Lloyds Bank.

475 Floating Rates Notes quoted on the London Stock Exchange had an average yield of 0.98%, the Floating Rates Notes were issued by the following: European Investment Bank, the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development, Neder Waterschapsbank, KfW, Republic of Finland, Volkswagen Financial Services, Dexia, GE Capital UK, Westpac Securities, Australia & New Zealand Banking Group, Centrica Plc, ASB Financial Services, Royal Bank of Canada, BG Energy Capital Plc, Suncorp Metway Limited, BMW Finance and National Grid Gas Plc.

480 Monthly income debentures with a 6% return and preference shares in Credit Finance with an average dividend of 5.6% were held. As previously explained, quoted stocks and call accounts fluctuate marginally on a daily basis, these fluctuations are not significant.

I shall now hand over the Savings Bank Fund Statement listing the investments for January 2015. The Government Cash Reserves for January were £52.79 million.

As stated in the previous answer, in respect of the investments of the Gibraltar Savings Bank and of Credit Finance, I am not prepared to provide any further information than has been previously provided.

485

Answer to Question 179 - Schedule to Question 176 / 2015

SAVINGS BANK FUNDSTATEMENT OF INVESTMENTS ON 31 JANUARY 2015

DESCRIPTION OF STOCK	NOMINAL VALUE	MARKET PRICE ACCRUED INTEREST %	MARKET VALUE ACCRUED INTEREST	TOTAL MARKET VALUE ON 31/01/2015
EIB FLOATING RATE NOTE 22/02/17	£20,000,000.00	100.306 0.141	£20,061,227.20 £28,140.82	£20,089,368.02
EIB FLOATING RATE NOTE 05/01/16	£20,000,000.00	99.980 0.045	£19,995,947.40 £9,023.50	£20,004,970.90
INTERNATIONAL BK RECON & DEV FRN 19/01/16	£4,235,000.00	100.002 0.018	£4,235,068.01 £782.45	£4,235,850.46
NEDER WATERSCHAPSBANK FRN 09/04/18	£12,200,000.00	100.000 0.045	£12,200,000.00 £5,441.09	£12,205,441.09
KFW FRN 09/03/15	£17,000,000.00	99.998 0.095	£16,999,611.38 £16,159.50	£17,015,770.88
REPUBLIC OF FINLAND FRN 25/2/16	£5,000,000.00	100.025 0.111	£5,001,252.95 £5,555.03	£5,006,807.98
VOLKSWAGEN FIN SERV NV FRN 12/10/15	£5,000,000.00	99.995 0.045	£4,999,749.05 £2,239.81	£5,001,988.86
DEXIA CREDIT LOCAL FRN 15/4/16	£4,000,000.00	100.023 0.035	£4,000,919.80 £1,385.64	£4,002,305.44
GE CAPITAL UK FUNDING FRN 20/3/17	£2,000,000.00	99.776 0.078	£1,995,528.14 £1,555.35	£1,997,083.49
WESTPAC SECURITIES NZ LT FRN 2/10/17	£5,000,000.00	100.000 0.073	£5,000,000.00 £3,644.92	£5,003,644.92
AUST & NZ BANKING GROUP FRN 4/2/16	£5,000,000.00	100.195 0.197	£5,009,760.80 £9,872.47	£5,019,633.27
CENTRICA PLC 5.5% 24/10/16	£6,000,000.00	106.931 1.492	£6,415,885.32 £89,506.85	£6,505,392.17
ASB FINANCE LTD LONDON FRN 13/03/17	£5,000,000.00	100.264 0.147	£5,013,184.70 £7,341.34	£5,020,526.04
ROYAL BANK OF CANADA FRN 4/6/19	£5,000,000.00	100.081 0.151	£5,004,026.75 £7,569.79	£5,011,596.54
BG ENERGY CAPITAL PLC 5.125% 07/12/17	£5,000,000.00	109.351	£5,467,559.55 £38,613.01	£5,506,172.56
VOLKSWAGEN FIN SERV NV 2.375% 13/11/18	£3,000,000.00	102.768 0.514	£3,083,037.36 £15,421.23	£3,098,458.59
SUNCORP-METWAY LTD FRN 06/10/17	£5,000,000.00	100.134 0.080	£5,006,718.60 £3,987.36	£5,010,705.96
CANADIAN IMPERIAL BANK FRN 15/1/18	£5,000,000.00	100.000 0.033	£5,000,000.00 £1,643.16	£5,001,643.16
GE CAPITAL UK FUNDING FRN 16/1/18	£3,000,000.00	100.000 0.041	£3,000,000.00 £1,221.24	£3,001,221.24
GOVERNMENT DEBENTURES	£218,000,000.00	100.000	£218,000,000.00	£218,000,000.00
BANK OF ENGLAND	£22,404,330.15	100.000	£22,404,330.15	£22,404,330.15
CFC SHARES	£400,000,000.00	100.000	£400,000,000.00	£400,000,000.00
GSBA	£5,000,000.00	100.000	£5,000,000.00	£5,000,000.00
GIBTELECOM	£37,798,895.33	100.000	£37,798,895.33	£37,798,895.33
ROYAL BANK OF SCOTLAND GBP CALL A/C	£5,553,361.56	100.000	£5,553,361.56 £15.22	£5,553,376.78
LLOYDS BANK GBP CALL A/C	£406,365.46	100.000	£406,365.46 £1,672.30	£408,037.76
BARCLAYS BANK	£77,984,439.90	100.000	£77,984,439.90	£77,984,439.90
NATIONAL WESTMINSTER OFFSHORE LTD	£29,855,599.00	100.000	£29,855,599.00	£29,855,599.00
JYSKE BANK	£20,226,720.83	100.000	£20,226,720.83	£20,226,720.83
	£953,664,712.23		£954,969,981.32	£954,969,981.32
CASH	£4,000,000.00	100.000	£4,000,000.00	£4,000,000.00

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, it is a disappointing answer in respect of Questions 177 and 178, I have to say.

Mr Speaker, does he not realise that if the Government as we know has caused £347 million to be transferred from Credit Finance into Gibraltar Investment Holdings Ltd, which is the holding company for all Government-owned companies, and he himself last time round told me that this money was being used ‘for Government Companies’ cash flow requirements’ – that is a direct quote from the answer that he gave me last time round – that this House is entitled to know how that money is being spent in respect of all those Government-owned companies?

Otherwise, it is impossible for this House, and then of course for the community at large through this House, but certainly Her Majesty’s Opposition in this House, to scrutinise how large parts of the public finances of this community are being handled and how the people’s money, savers’ money in this case is being spent. Does he not recognise that effectively what the Government is doing, or the actions the Government is taking are unprecedented in drawing the shutters on the Opposition’s ability to scrutinise large parts of the public finances of this community?

**A Member:** Hear, hear.

**Hon. J J Bossano:** I do not agree with him, Mr Speaker.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, let me link this to the previous supplementary questions that I was asking, and this time they are legitimate because they arise from these questions.

Does he not accept that if what has happened – which we know has happened because this is what he told me last time round, £347 million has gone from Credit Finance to Gibraltar Investment Holdings Limited, in order to fund the cash flow requirements of all Government-owned companies – £347 million – that money is bound to be used in order to fund some of those very same projects that I asked him about a few moments ago – the £24 million in respect of the small boats marina, the cladding at the three estates and the affordable homes? The reason why the Government is doing this is because it does not have the money to do it directly itself, because cash reserves are now down from the last time that I asked the question, from £60 million to £52 million and the Government cannot borrow more than £51 million. Last time round he said £51 million, I suspect that with cash reserves at £52 million, that figure has also gone down.

Effectively, what the Government is doing is using savers’ money, through Credit Finance and the Gibraltar Investment Holdings now, as an unaccountable credit card. It is like going to the bank and applying for a credit card to the bank, without declaring the fact that you already have credit cards with other banks and with the credit limits all the way up to the hilt. That is what the Government is doing.

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, Mr Speaker, I do not agree with what he says that the Government is doing, but I can tell him that I know exactly what he is doing. What he is doing is what he has been doing ever since 9th December 2011 when we announced the expansion of the Savings Bank, which is to do everything possible to undermine the success of the Savings Bank. And now, he starts off by saying ‘Well, what has the Savings Bank invested in?’

Well look, no institution anywhere, state owned or private, who operates by taking savers’ money, produces a monthly list of all the investments that it makes. It produces it once a year when it closes the year and has audited accounts. He wants it every month, he gets it every month but then getting it every month he says, ‘Ah yes, but you put the money in Credit Finance so who did Credit Finance give it to? GIH and who did GIH give it to?’ Eventually I suppose he will want me to tell him that somebody got paid on a building site and went out and spent the money in Morrison’s so he can track down the last penny. *(Laughter)*

Since the whole purpose of the exercise is not to protect the credit cards of anybody but in fact to undermine the success of the Savings Bank which belongs to the people of Gibraltar, I am not in the business of helping him to achieve that and therefore I am not prepared to tell him what is done with the money that is part of the cash reserves. All I can tell him is that the pool of merging the cash reserves of all the companies and the Government together and using it as a single pool was not invented by me; it was invented by them in their time and we have continued with the same system.

And I can tell him, if he thinks I am going to give him information in this House so that somebody writes an opinion in the *Chronicle* who describes himself as a GSD executive member and former Gibraltar Government tax adviser, which is true, he used to be my tax adviser because I imported him *(Laughter)* and having imported him to ensure that we collected more tax, he eventually left the Government and devoted himself to advising people how to reduce their tax bills, a metamorphosis which is unusual in that this is a case of a gamekeeper turning poacher, instead of a poacher turning gamekeeper. *(Laughter)*

This member of the GSD Executive presumably wants to remind people that he was my tax adviser in order to lend credibility to the nonsense that he writes and says that the Government has failed to make clear what is the level of funds deposited in the GSB by non-local. Well I am not sure what a non-local is, whether it is a non-resident or a non-Gibraltarian. He happens to be a non-local if it is the second.  
(Laughter)

But he then goes on to say that the information which has been provided has not been provided, it has been provided on two occasions, and therefore he deduces that the whole of the £1 billion belongs to the non-local rich so that they can get richer with the Taxpayer guaranteeing the payments. Well, given that no local saver according to a member of his executive has any money in the Savings Bank, I would not worry too much about what happens to the non-local rich.

**Hon. Sir P R Caruana:** Mr Speaker, having enjoyed for more than 16 years, the considerable intellectual pleasure and challenge of being the hon. Member's immediate and direct political opponent, I recognise in his answer to that supplementary, every characteristic of 'Bossanesque' parliamentary technique (Laughter) that I recall during those hugely pleasurable 16 years.

Mr Speaker, the issue is not whether the Government... I had better convert this into a question: does the hon. Member not acknowledge that in parliamentary terms, the issue is not whether the Government is in fact spending the money wisely or unwisely; it is not whether it is doing things with the money that the Opposition would not have done, or perhaps spending the money on things that the Opposition would have done differently or different things to the things that the Opposition would have done but still done; it is nothing to do with that?

The essence of the Opposition's position is that by the device that they have used to fund the Government holding companies, and we used to do projects through Government company structures too, but the alternative to giving a statement in Parliament through the budget estimate debates, by including in the debate about what you are going to spend the money on and where it is coming from, is that if you do it through companies, you give Parliament through answers to Opposition questions, information about that expenditure as if you had done it through the Consolidated Fund, so that Parliament is not reduced in its capacity, through the medium of the Government choosing to do things through companies, in a way that disables Parliament from keeping the Government under scrutiny.

Parliament's right and this is why I rise, because the hon. Member knows that I no longer participate in front-line political debates, except where I think it raises something fundamental to this Parliament and fundamental to the interests of Gibraltar – which is that for good or for bad, Parliament must have the right at least to keep tabs of what the Government is doing for its own sake, without that being a comment about whether what the Government is doing is good, bad or indifferent and to the extent that the Opposition by not getting the whole picture through Government's refusal to provide company information, as we used to provide it, means that the Government, that the Opposition cannot do that job.

Is the hon. Member at least willing to distinguish between the question whether we want the information to be able to put out a press release that somebody has used Government funds to do his shopping in Morrison's, if I could just borrow his smoke screen example, willing to distinguish between that on the one hand and the Government's, the Opposition's right to know that if that was happening, the Opposition, the Parliament has a right to know it.

It may be an entirely justified spending of money in Morrison's because he may be buying the tea for the worker's canteen, but that does not mean that Parliament is not entitled to be aware of it. And I would ask him to acknowledge and accept that Parliament's wish to defend through the Opposition its right to scrutinise the public finances is not a comment on the propriety of that expenditure, or the desirability of that expenditure; it is an objective and a virtue in its own right for its own sake because it is a keystone of our parliamentary system of governance. Will he acknowledge that? (*Banging on desks*) [Hon. J J Bossano: No, Mr Speaker] Ah!, you do not acknowledge that, then we are in deep trouble.

**Hon. J J Bossano:** I must say that in reference to his opening remarks, I had not realised during the 16 years how much the hon. Member was enjoying himself. I am sorry he did not show the enjoyment at the time that it was happening. (Laughter)

The hon. Member is talking as if Parliament had voted money to do something and we were refusing to tell him what the money voted on was being spent.

This is the Gibraltar Savings Bank investing in an entity. If the legitimacy of the concept is if the Gibraltar Savings Bank invests in an entity which is using the money in Gibraltar, you can ask down to the last penny who is the last person who got some money out, but if it is in the Bank of Finland then there are no questions as to what the Bank of Finland does with the money when they get it from the Savings Bank, well, it is a distinction that I do not draw because if the concern is the safety of that money it is considerably safer in Gibraltar administered by civil servants than invested in the Bank of Finland and administered by people we do not know.

If the concern is what is the pool of the liquidity being used for, well look, it is being used for short-term cash needs the same as it was being used before and it is being repaid as the figures that he has every month shows. Every month it shows that the amount in GIH is going down and the amount in the other elements of the portfolio of Credit Finance is going up and that is what will continue to happen,

**Hon. Sir P R Caruana:** Mr Speaker, does he acknowledge that if that is the answer to my supplementary question – and I am grateful to Mr Speaker for his indulgence in allowing me to technically convert it into a question – that if that is his answer to my supplementary, does he not acknowledge that he is not addressing my point?

Mr Speaker, when the Government invests public funds in the Bank of Finland, the Bank of Finland I suppose then re-invests it and remains liable to the Gibraltar Government for repayment to it, providing it does not fail financially and goes itself into bankruptcy, is responsible for repaying that. But does he not acknowledge that if he seeks to compare what I am talking about with that, he is at best paying lip service to the principle of parliamentary scrutiny and at worst, obfuscating the reality?

What is happening here is that money starts, a little bit of it public but most of it in the Savings Bank, depositors' money, the Government then procures that the Savings Bank invests that money in a Government-owned company. That Government-owned company then puts it in the Governments company that sits at the top of the structure of companies through which the Government often spends money as we used to do.

Does he not realise that it is a sort of washing job that the money starts in a place where the Government guarantees its repayment to Taxpayers, goes through two companies and comes back into Ministers' hands to decide how it should be spent and that is not a comparable situation to his example about the Bank of Finland?

Mr Speaker, I have often said in this House and I have not been universally popular on my side of the House for saying it, that there is no great, implicitly, there is no great objection, because all governments do it round the world, of borrowing money from depositors, even savers, to spend. That is why governments borrow money; governments do not normally borrow money to just leave it sitting in a current account. I am not objecting to that. I have never objected to the fact, I have said that I want the Government to tell the depositors that that is what they are doing just for the sake of transparency but there is nothing intrinsically wrong in the Government borrowing money from depositors of the Savings Bank to spend on building a block of flats, if that is what the Government thinks it wants to spend the borrowed money on.

I am not complaining about that. What I am complaining about is that having done that and shunted the money through to a corporate structure, it then will not account in this House for what that corporate structure, owned by the Government and controlled by Ministers, is spending the money on so that the Opposition and through the Opposition, Parliament... which in our context is a little bit of a nonsense because Parliament is divided only into the Government front bench and the Opposition front bench now with one exception, and that therefore Parliament cannot keep tabs, even through the medium of asking questions, as they used to keep tabs when I was doing the same thing of spending public money through companies, of how much is being spent, on what it is being spent except obviously what we can see going up.

Does he not realise that there is a distinction? He may not want to agree with it but there is a distinction between the criticism of the borrowing of money from depositors for public purposes, which I make no comment on, subject to quantum, and a simple plea for that not to result in opacity to Parliament about what that money is being used for and when. They are two wholly different things and I am speaking only to the second one of the two.

**Hon. J J Bossano:** They are only two wholly different things because he chooses to formulate it that way. As far as I am concerned Mr Speaker, the Savings Bank has got a £1 billion deposited in it and £600 million of that is reinvested outside and £400 million is invested here. The money that is not invested in the long term, that it is deposited in, is the money that is in cash in the Credit Finance and forms part of the cash resources of the Government and the companies as a single pot and that money will come back and is coming back every month to Credit Finance and then being reinvested.

That does not mean that they are entitled to say, 'Well look, I want to know how much of each pound went into GIH.' It is a pool of money as he knows, because he was the one who devised it, which is fluctuating on a daily basis as money comes in and out of the Government or money comes in and out of the companies or contractors putting in more invoices or not but the final financing of everything is not a matter that will be done by the Savings Bank or Credit Finance.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I gave way to the Hon. the Backbencher but I do have a number of more supplementaries on what is an important issue where the Government has decided to bunch a number of questions together.

Mr Speaker, does he accept at least this, a very short question that if the Government had not caused Credit Finance to pay over £347 million to the Gibraltar Investment Holdings Limited in order to fund the cash flow requirements of Government-owned companies, that the Government itself would have had to pay that £347 million and that therefore it is a saving to the consolidated fund of £347 million?

**Hon. J J Bossano:** No, Mr Speaker, I do not accept it.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, I do not understand how on earth he can disagree with that and what the Government is doing you see – it is even worse than the Hon. the Backbencher has put it – and I agree and associate myself with most of the comments that he has made in relation to the transparency issue, but of course if you have – and I am asking whether he agrees with me, if you have a net debt of £392 million and the Government can only spend out of the amounts that it has borrowed another £51 million, then it stands to reason that what the Government is doing by injecting £347 million from the Gibraltar Savings Bank into Government-owned companies, in order to fund those Government-owned companies which would otherwise have been funded by the Government either through reserves or through borrowing, that the Government is effectively using this as a device to circumvent the legal borrowing limits.

That is what the Government is doing and that is obnoxious to this Parliament. Not only is it obnoxious to this Parliament for all the reasons that the Hon. the Backbencher has mentioned and that I have added to, but because those borrowing limits are there to ensure that Governments do not borrow in a manner that becomes unaffordable. And the debt that this community faces is both the £392 million direct debt and then the £400 million in Credit Finance £347 million of which is being used to fund Government-owned companies. It is nearly £800 million of debt.

Now, does he not agree with me on that?

**Hon. J J Bossano:** No, Mr Speaker, I do not agree with anything that he has said and I accept that what I say on this side of the House is obnoxious to him and I can tell him that the feeling is reciprocated.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** But, Mr Speaker, if the Government had not caused this £347 million to be paid into Gibraltar Investment Holdings which is now being used in order to fund all Government-owned companies, where would the money have come from, a very simple answer, a very simple question. Where would those £347 million have come from if the Government had not caused Credit Finance to pay that money over to Gibraltar Investment Holdings?

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, Mr Speaker, as I understand it that is an entirely and self-evidently a speculative question to which I do not have to give an answer. But I presume that the Government might have done what his Government did over many, many years which is to get supplier credit from other people, none of which was brought to this House including the occasion when I discovered £20 million in one of the tables I was given for which there was no explanation and I asked the then Chief Minister what it was and he said he could not remember. Eventually he remembered that it was £20 million that he had obtained at the bank in order to buy shares in a private development of the place where the parking is now going up.

Well look, if being so accountable is so important, many of the mechanisms that are now considered to be unaccountable were invented by them, so it is simply a case of, if I do it then it is okay but if you do it, it is wrong.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, again, the hon. Gentleman is trying to obfuscate the issues in his classic and traditional way.

Does he not accept this – and it is my final supplementary, Mr Speaker, and I am very grateful for Mr Speaker's indulgence – does he not accept this the Government with the level of direct borrowing that it has, which is the highest in the political history or the history of this community at £392 million with £51 million away from that borrowing limit in terms of spending it can only spend another £51 million, it did not have the money to capitalise, to effectively fund these Government-owned companies to the tune of an extra £347 million? Does he at least not accept that?

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, Mr Speaker, I do not accept that anything has been capitalised. I told him that these are the cash holdings that are held in a pot together with the Government's own cash reserves and the companies, all of which are handled together and I do not consider that to be capitalisation.

Capitalisation is what has happened with the Savings Bank buying shares in Credit Finance – *(Interjection)* Well, he can ask another question, I do not have to give way.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, well Mr Speaker, I use the word capitalisation and it is not capitalisation; it is funding. Does he not recognise that with the borrowing limits as they are, with the Governments direct debt at £392 million, the Government could not have funded Government-owned companies to the tune of £347 million and to that extent, effectively what the Government is doing is, it is saving that money from direct expense from the consolidated fund and indeed an increase in the public debt of £347 million which it could not have incurred by law in accordance with the laws on how much a Government can spend?

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, Mr Speaker, the hon. Member knows that if the Government wanted to exceed the limit laid on the net debt which is not something that the Government set as a target, he knows that the target was bringing down the gross debt but I know they do not attach importance to the gross debt, only to the net. But if the Government wanted to do it, all it had to do on 9th December 2011 was proceed with the motion that was already in preparation, suspending the limit that there was if that was what the Government wanted to do.

**Hon. Sir P R Caruana:** And that would have been the transparency that I am calling, does the hon. Member acknowledge that?

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Well it might be the transparency or might not be the transparency, but the hon. Member is asking me if it was impossible to do anything else and I am telling him that it was not.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** But, Mr Speaker, it is not only a transparency point and that is the main point in relation to this particular issue that he has now raised, but how on earth can this Government lambast...and the Chief Minister lambast his predecessor, Sir Peter Caruana, for having an intention, indeed there, for having an intention to come to this House to raise the legal borrowing limits when this Government does not come to this House to raise the legal borrowing limit but covertly borrows £347 million, which it would not have been able to do under the law as it stands at the moment? (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) (*Banging on desks*) And does he not accept that that is a contradiction in terms – indeed a very dangerous non-transparent opaque contradiction in terms?

**Hon. J J Bossano:** No, Mr Speaker, I do not accept either his analysis or the whole list of adjectives that he has added to them.

**Mr Speaker:** We will now move on. The question of transparency and opacity has been totally and fully ventilated.

## BUSINESS & TRAINING

### Q80/2015

#### Employment Service – Changes made to address complaints

**Clerk:** We now move to Question 80, the Hon. D J Bossino.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Employment state if there have been any changes in his Department which have resulted in less complaints in connection with the service being provided?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Business and Employment.

**Minister for Business & Training (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, whereas perhaps I thought that the drafting of the answer would have raised the temperatures too early in the morning, sadly by the time that I have given the answer, I see that temperatures are already quite inflamed and so the tenor will not, I hope, increase the temperature.

Mr Speaker, yes sir. The result of the General Election in late 2011 resulted in a change of Government, which meant that instead of the relevant Minister trying to avoid seeing people as he presided over growing numbers of unemployed peaking at 1,200 as the now Leader of the Opposition identified during the election campaign, the now GSLP/Liberal Minister dramatically changed style and approach. As a result, working hard in implementation of the Future Jobs Strategy, Minister Bossano achieved a record-breaking reduction in unemployment which was at a record low in December, since records began, of 228. As a result, Mr Speaker, we have had many less complaints.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** This House does not accept, as we ever accepted, that unemployment was at the level that he has indicated in his reply and I must say, it really reeks through in his answers that it is clearly not the Hon. Minister's style. I am sure his answer has been drafted by somebody else who is on his left-hand side.

Mr Speaker, the question arises in relation to a very specific point that I made during the course of my budget speech and that related to the comments made by the Gibraltar Public Services Ombudsman in his report of 2013, when he said very clearly –

**Mr Speaker:** I am sorry –

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Oh my goodness, what – ?

**Mr Speaker:** There is a very clear Rule which says a supplementary question must not introduce matter not included in the original question. You are now introducing the question of the Ombudsman's Report. That is matter not in the original question.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, it very much arises. The matter that I am dealing with here, Mr Speaker, if I had been allowed to pose the question, relates specifically to the service being provided and the question relates to the service being provided by the Employment Service, so therefore it is particularly apposite that I should be referring to the comments made by the Gibraltar Public Services Ombudsman in relation to the service being provided by this particular Department.

So therefore, Mr Speaker, with the greatest respect, I think I am more than entitled to make a reference because this is not extraneous to the question.

**Mr Speaker:** You could have included a reference to the Ombudsman's report in your main question.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I could have but I chose not to, with the greatest respect.

**Mr Speaker:** You chose not to. I choose to tell you that you are introducing new matter. It is as simple as that. Now, let him try to rephrase his supplementary in another way and we might be able to make progress. Let us see.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, the question arose as a result of comments made by the Public Services Ombudsman, so I really cannot think of any other way of asking this supplementary question.

The Public Services Ombudsman made highly critical comments as to the service being provided by the Employment Service, to the point that he said – and I can read where he said it – that he will be meeting with senior management in order to address these issues because he made the point that there had been a tremendous – a significant, using his adjective – increase in the number of complaints from 2010 to when he wrote this report. In my respectful view, Mr Speaker, I think the question in the Order Paper and the supplementary are both highly relevant to each other.

**Mr Speaker:** I am going to allow the supplementary, but I insist that what the hon. mover of the question should have done was to have made a reference in respect of matters raised in the Ombudsman's report. He should have made a reference in the main question. And it is a very simple matter to do; I do not know why he did not if he then proposed to... or is it just to catch the Minister off-guard?

Question Time is also about getting information. If you want information, put it in the original question otherwise you run the risk of it being ruled inadmissible because of the Standing Rules and Orders. It is nothing to do with me; it is the Standing Rules and Orders.

Now, is the Hon. Minister prepared to answer that supplementary?

**Hon. N F Costa:** Well, Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman knows that had I read the report, I would have been happy to comment on it, unfortunately I have not had sight of that report which goes back to 2013. Perhaps my hon. colleague the former Minister for Employment is aware of the report; and may be able to comment on the substance because I have not read the report.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, if I may, given that you have allowed – and I will take the Chair's comments in relation to this on board for future reference – but given that the Speaker has allowed the question to proceed, perhaps if I can assist by simply reading one particular sentence which arises from the report – and I must insist that I said it during the course of when I first articulated my supplementary question, that I did make a reference to this particular quote during the course of my budget intervention where he said, and it is very simple, he says the 'average complaints'. He talks about a significant increase



in complaints during this year, the average complaints for the years 2010 to 2012 were six per annum whereas during 2013 we have recorded a total of 23 complaints. He refers to things ‘apparently they are varied’ and he talks about ranging from lack of replies when seeking information to alleged unprofessional treatment and dissatisfaction regarding claims for payments under the insolvency funds.

So just to assist the Hon. Minister, given that he is going to rise and provide the answer.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Well, Mr Speaker, given that the question to my colleague has been based on whether there has been a decline in the number of complaints since he took over from me, it appears to suggest that what the Ombudsman was saying was that everybody was complaining about me and now that I am no longer there, they are no longer complaining. *(Laughter)*

The answer to his question is that neither the present Minister nor the previous Minister gets to hear of these complaints. The first time I knew that there had been complaints to the Ombudsman was when he pointed it out to me, just like the first time I knew that there was supposed to be something about some works being done in the Department because in my view incorrectly, the Head of the Department chose to deal or fail to deal with the issue without bringing the matter to my notice when I was there.

I can tell him that when I investigated as a result of him raising it, most of the complaints dealt with people who felt that their claims under the insolvency were not being dealt with, with the speed with which they should be, over which there have been some problems, particularly in relation to the construction industry where there was an issue which arose previously, when the previous Government was in office, over the correct interpretation as to whether the CATA terms apply in the industry or the statutory terms apply in the industry. Where there is an anomaly that what was agreed under CATA is actually something that gives better redundancy to some people and much, much worse to others and that the people who get better redundancy are the people who have been working for a very short time who would get nothing under the statutory scheme, which requires that you are there for at least one year – or maybe two years, I cannot remember whether it is one or two – but all the people who were left out of the statutory were given compensation under CATA, which was based on a sum of money per week that they had worked. So somebody who had been working one week would get something.

But the way that it was interpreted was that then the people who would get many thousands of pounds under the statutory scheme would actually finish up getting considerably less. That has been an issue, that is how it was interpreted before and is still being interpreted in the same way and there are still people complaining that it is wrong that CATA should be providing less redundancy payments than the law says is the minimum because then there is not a minimum.

I can tell the hon. Member that if any of this had been brought to my attention at the time, I would probably have been able to deal with the issue myself, but since the people who were there at the time that these complaints were being made, were not the people who had been there before our years because there had been changes in the Heads of Department, after the person that had been there, Ernesto Gracia had been there for a very long time and therefore he was very conversant with these things, but the people who came in later clearly did not answer the points with the speed with which they should have been answered.

Now, the fact that there were more complaints than ever, in my view is totally unacceptable that it should be happening without the matter being raised at a political level to get to the root of the problem. I hope that now that he has raised it, and I am saying this in public, the same thing will not happen to my colleague as happened to me when I was there, which is that I got to find out about it after the event.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Hon. Minister for the answer he has just given and I must say in relation to his comments in connection with CATA and the statutory position, I just find it very strange from a legal perspective that you can almost contract out of the minimum statutory requirements but I am happy to look at it for him, for a fee that is.

Mr Speaker, I think he expresses a hope that the matter will have been resolved and in relation to that, does he know because the point is also made expressly by the Ombudsman in the report, that he intends to meet with – as he describes it – senior management, if there has not been an improvement within a period and I think he cites of about a few months.

Does he know whether that meeting has, either of the Ministers, ever took place during his time when he was discharging his responsibilities or indeed whether Mr Costa is now since he took over these responsibilities, whether that meeting has in fact taken place?

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Yes, I found out that the meeting had taken place when I started asking questions as a result of him raising it, so this has all happened in the past. By the time it got into the Ombudsman’s Report, some of the complaints were discarded by the Ombudsman as not having substance, but many of the complaints were not about the substance but about the failure to provide answers. The fact that people were waiting to be given answers to issues that they were raising in matters of labour rights and in some

cases, the answer was very simple, the rights that were being raised were not rights that existed in law, however big a grievance a person might have had.

We have had one particular recent case which actually I know went to the Ombudsman and there were meetings with the Labour Inspectors and there were meetings with the Heads of Department, where there was one particular lady who was a Frontier Worker who worked in the private sector, who had serious medical problems and she wanted to be sacked in order to be able to claim unemployment benefit in Spain.

But the employer was being advised by the lawyers that he should not sack her because then he could be facing an unfair dismissal claim. Well, the Labour Inspectors are not, as far as I can tell, employed to go round advising people to sack employees. They explained to her that perhaps what she could do was draft a letter, which they helped her with, saying that she would give up her right to go to an unfair dismissal because her argument was that if she resigned, she would not qualify for the unemployment benefit. The last I heard of it was, it had not been resolved because she insisted not only on being sacked but also of being given a guarantee that the job would be kept for her when she finished with the unemployment benefit in Spain which as everybody knows can be as much as a year and a half.

I think that was one of the cases that either went that year to the Ombudsman or went to the Ombudsman in a subsequent year but I happen to know about this particular case because it was brought to my attention. There were others that I only found out when the whole thing was long dead and buried and only because the hon. Member took the trouble, for which I am grateful of bringing it to my attention. As a result of his intervention and then I did the only thing I could do, go back and ask the Department, why is it that I do not know anything about this?

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q81/2015**  
**Government website –**  
**Table EMP.7 update**

**Clerk:** Question 81, the Hon. D J Bossino.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Employment provide updated details on the information contained in Table EMP.7 of the Gibraltar Government Website.

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Business, Employment, Skills & Training.

**Minister for Business & Training (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is set out in the schedule that I now hand to him.

**SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 81/2015**

Table EMP.7													
Employers registered with the Employment Service by industry group		As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end
Industry group		Jan-13	Feb-13	Mar-13	Apr-13	May-13	Jun-13	Jul-13	Aug-13	Sep-13	Oct-13	Nov-13	Dec-13
A	Electricity Supply	5	4	4	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
B	Water Supply	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
C	Shipbuilding etc.	28	28	28	29	29	29	30	30	31	31	32	32
D	Other Manufacture	65	65	65	65	66	67	67	67	67	67	67	66
E	Construction	567	576	596	599	609	618	623	628	635	646	662	672
F	Wholesale	99	99	98	98	100	100	100	100	99	99	99	99
G	Retail Trade	476	481	482	484	488	490	490	490	493	495	499	503
H	Hotel Trade	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	9	9	10	10	10
I	Restaurants, Bars, etc	201	203	206	207	207	208	208	208	212	213	216	217
J	Repairs to Consumer Goods	63	64	64	65	65	65	66	66	66	67	68	68
K	Sea Transport & Related Services	83	84	86	88	89	90	91	91	91	91	91	92
L	Air Transport & Related Services	9	9	8	8	8	8	8	8	9	9	9	9
M	Road Transport & Related Services	205	209	212	214	215	215	214	216	215	214	214	213
N	Post and Communication	18	17	17	17	17	17	17	17	18	18	18	18
O	Banking, Finance and Insurance	1059	1067	1074	1086	1096	1113	1126	1130	1143	1156	1165	1167
P	Public Admin and National Defence	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9
Q	Police and Fire Service	23	23	23	22	22	22	22	22	23	23	24	24
R	Sanitary Services	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	7	7	7
S	Education	38	38	38	38	39	39	39	39	39	40	40	40
T	Medical and Health Services	137	137	139	140	143	144	147	146	147	148	147	149
U	Other Services	705	709	715	723	727	739	759	773	785	800	811	819

## CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION TO NO 81/2015

Employers registered with the Employment Service by industry group													
		As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end
Industry group		Jan-14	Feb-14	Mar-14	Apr-14	May-14	Jun-14	Jul-14	Aug-14	Sep-14	Oct-14	Nov-14	Dec-14
A	Electricity Supply	5	5	5	5	6	7	7	7	7	7	7	7
B	Water Supply	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
C	Shipbuilding etc.	32	32	32	32	32	32	32	32	33	35	34	34
D	Other Manufacture	67	66	66	66	66	66	68	71	71	71	71	71
E	Construction	682	693	695	704	711	712	723	728	739	754	776	784
F	Wholesale	102	102	101	101	101	101	101	102	104	104	105	105
G	Retail Trade	504	503	506	507	509	514	518	519	520	520	522	525
H	Hotel Trade	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	11	11	11	11
I	Restaurants, Bars, etc	217	219	223	222	224	225	227	228	229	230	231	233
J	Repairs to Consumer Goods	68	68	68	69	70	71	71	72	72	72	72	71
K	Sea Transport & Related Services	91	91	86	86	87	88	88	89	89	90	90	91
L	Air Transport & Related Services	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9
M	Road Transport & Related Services	215	218	220	219	219	219	220	220	221	222	227	230
N	Post and Communication	19	19	19	19	19	19	20	20	20	20	20	20
O	Banking, Finance and Insurance	1171	1178	1187	1191	1196	1203	1215	1226	1233	1251	1257	1263
P	Public Admin and National Defence	9	9	9	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
Q	Police and Fire Service	24	24	24	24	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25
R	Sanitary Services	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7
S	Education	40	40	41	41	41	41	42	43	44	44	44	45
T	Medical and Health Services	150	154	161	162	165	166	166	167	171	173	173	174
U	Other Services	835	847	824	837	859	878	900	912	930	950	964	981

## CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION TO NO 81/2015

Employers registered with the Employment Service by industry group													
		As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end	As at end
Industry group		Jan-15	Feb-15	Mar-15	Apr-15	May-15	Jun-15	Jul-15	Aug-15	Sep-15	Oct-15	Nov-15	Dec-15
A	Electricity Supply	9											
B	Water Supply	2											
C	Shipbuilding etc.	34											
D	Other Manufacture	70											
E	Construction	795											
F	Wholesale	105											
G	Retail Trade	524											
H	Hotel Trade	11											
I	Restaurants, Bars, etc	235											
J	Repairs to Consumer Goods	71											
K	Sea Transport & Related Services	94											
L	Air Transport & Related Services	9											
M	Road Transport & Related Services	230											
N	Post and Communication	20											
O	Banking, Finance and Insurance	1276											
P	Public Admin and National Defence	10											
Q	Police and Fire Service	25											
R	Sanitary Services	7											
S	Education	45											
T	Medical and Health Services	177											
U	Other Services	1004											

**Mr Speaker:** It is a very lengthy and detailed schedule, so we are going to move on to the next question and we will come back if necessary, if the hon. Member wishes to ask any supplementaries.  
Next question.

**SPORTS, CULTURE, HERITAGE AND YOUTH**

**Q82/2015**

**Monument to women of Gibraltar –  
Commissioning and location**

940

**Clerk:** Question 82, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Equality say when the winning design for the monument to the women of Gibraltar, selected nearly two years ago, will be commissioned and where the monument will be placed when completed?

945

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, HM Government is currently working closely with the winner of the design competition for the monument to the women. This is to see how best her design can be fulfilled. A number of locations are currently being considered.

950

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Hon. Minister say which sites are being considered?

955

**Hon. S E Linares:** Not specifically, Mr Speaker, because like I said there are a few of them that we are looking at and we are working with the designer so that it has the best impact that it should have because that is what it deserves.

**Q83/2015**

**Sports Injury Clinic –  
How to be set up and run**

960

**Clerk:** Question 83, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Sport say when the Sports Injury Clinic outlined in the Government's manifesto will be set up and how it will be run?

965

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth,

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, HM Government is still working with stakeholders on how best to run the Sports Injury Clinic. We are considering a number of options.

970

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, that is exactly the same answer the Hon. Minister gave me, I think it was six or eight months ago.

Can the Hon. Minister say if the leaning is more towards providing the service from the GHA or from the private sector?

975

**Hon. S E Linares :** Yes, Mr Speaker. First of all on the comment about eight months ago: this is a four-year Parliament and therefore we will fulfil this before our term of office. (*Banging on desk*)

Mr Speaker, on her specific question of whether we are looking at inclining towards the GHA or the private sector, both are being considered and it could be a combination of both. It depends on the treatment that the sports person might have. If the injury – and again we are looking at it generically – is one that can be done within the GHA then it will be done. As the hon. Lady might know, there are osteopaths and there are physios and the GHA does not employ osteopaths and all these issues are the ones we are considering.

980

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** And finally, Mr Speaker, can the Hon. Minister say when he thinks the service will be set up? Is it just about to happen within the next couple of months?

985

**Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, definitely before the election.

**Q84/2015**  
**GSLA school swimming classes –**  
**Cancellations**

990

**Clerk:** Question 84, the Hon. E J Reyes.

995

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can Government provide details as to how many, and why some swimming classes at the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority's facilities have been cancelled by schools in 2015?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

1000

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, a total of nine school classes at the pool for the elderly, disabled and teaching have been cancelled in 2015. This has been due to a problem with the air treatment system, which has now been addressed.

The pool has been fully operational since 26th January 2015.

1005

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, this treatment system which seems to have caused a problem, is this the new one that was installed recently or is it a recurring problem which has been there in the system from its original construction time?

1010

**Hon. S E Linares:** No, Mr Speaker, it is definitely not the new one, the new one is working perfectly. There are two pools as he knows, there is what we used to call the GASA pool, the 25-metre pool, and there is the pool for the elderly, disabled and teaching. It is the one for the elderly, disabled and teaching which is not incorporated into the system of which is in the 25-metre pool.

1015

Therefore what we are looking at now is to incorporate the system that is working perfectly with the solar panels. I am happy to say that it is a system that is making a tremendous saving to the pool running costs, where we do not even have to buy diesel so it is even better for the environment and it is being used in many places as an example as to how we should be moving towards zero carbon emissions.

1020

Therefore, what we are looking at now is that the air treatment of the second pool which has been historic has been there for since it was built and there were loads of problems, we are now looking at how we are going to solve that for the long term. But as I said, at least in the short term it has been addressed and it is now working, not as we wish it to be working, it will be working much better when we fix it properly and do the whole system again overall.

Therefore what I am saying is we are hoping that all the system will be up and running soon with all the new systems that we need to put in place.

1025

**Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, the Hon. Minister in his contribution just now said that thanks to the solar panel which has been installed there are huge savings which have been made in expenditure. Could the Hon. Minister provide us with some figures in terms of what the figure for savings is?

1030

**Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, I believe the hon. Member already has in the Order Paper a question to the Minister for the Environment asking about how much the savings – last night reading all the questions that he was asking – I do not have figures as such but I can tell you –

**Mr Speaker:** Not only do you not have figures but it does not arise from the original – again new matter being introduced which is not covered in the original question.

**Q85/2015**  
**Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority –**  
**Vacancies**

1035

**Clerk:** Question 85, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1040

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Further to the answer provided to Question 728/2014, can the Minister for Sports provide details of any vacancies within the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority, as well as indicating by when it is estimated these will be filled?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, we are currently in discussions with the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority regarding improvements to management structures. Discussions are at an advanced stage and these changes should take place in the near future.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I note the Minister said that they should take place in the near future at the tail end of 2014 in a question there the Minister led me to believe that he hoped to have made a decision in respect of whether to keep or otherwise reorganise the post of the Deputy Chief Executive Officer and so on and he said that he hoped to have this completed by the end of the Financial Year which is next month.

Are we still on target, Mr Speaker, for the end of the Financial Year?

**Hon. S E Linares:** Yes, Mr Speaker.

**Q84/2015 continued**  
**GSLA school swimming classes –**  
**Supplementary question**

**Mr Speaker:** Before we deal with the next question, perhaps I should clarify one matter. I apologise to hon. Members that I did miss out that I think the Minister... It is very difficult for me to hear everything and catch everything that is being said. I think the Minister himself introduced the question of savings.

Where that happens, where a Minister in providing an answer widens the ambit of a question, then it is legitimate to ask a supplementary – and if I make a mistake, please draw my attention to it. (*Interjection*)

Where it is not legitimate is of course, if the hon. questioner himself should have introduced it and did not. I apologise to the hon. Member if I misled him.

**Hon. J J Netto:** No, obviously Mr Speaker, I bow to your rulings whenever you make them.

**Mr Speaker:** But it is not easy to be here, hour after hour, trying to pay attention all the times and sometimes there are matters which escape the Speaker's attention. I am only human.

**Hon. J J Netto:** It just caught my attention, given that I follow this type of issues and of course one is glad to hear that as a result of the installation of the solar panels whether in that particular location or any other particular part of the public service, there are savings to be made in relation to expenditure arising from that.

Having said it, the Minister... obviously I want to try and get to the bottom of it. Now the Hon. Minister in his reply did say that I have a question on the Order Paper which... not quite, it is a separate type of question because later on, presumably this afternoon, when I have the opportunity to ask the Minister of the Environment, it is basically where is that the Government at the moment is obtaining renewable energy to the tune of 3.1% arising from the statement in the ERDF Operational Report 2014 to 2020? It is a separate question, it only arises as a result of that.

If the hon. Member has the information, fine; if not, I will simply ask the question next month.

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, I do not have the exact savings because it was not asked. The relationship between the questions that he is asking and the financial savings is that he will realise by the answer to the questions why the GASA pool is being used as an example of how much we are producing in kilowatts or how much we are saving from the power station because the kilowatts have been produced by the solar panels. So it is not a quantity as in financial quantity; it is to do with kilowatts and all the technical issues that are to do with electricity and energy.

But from the top of my head, I can tell him that the GASA pool used to spend an average of nearly £3,000 per month on diesel, buying diesel for the pumps and for the workings of the pool and that is not being spent now.

There is hardly any and there is a reserve there just in case it needs to be put into the system, should the system break down, as a last resort. But I can tell him and I was looking at the actual Vote Book and the expenditure is not there anymore, so that is only but one of the savings that I can just mention as I stand on my feet.

**Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, I am very grateful for that answer.

Q86/2015

**Gibraltar Rugby Football Union and Gibraltar Cricket Association –  
Provision of alternative facilities**

**Clerk:** Question 86, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1100 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Further to the answer to Questions 9 and 10/2015, can the Minister for Sports say if any potential alternative facilities have been identified for use by the Gibraltar Rugby Football Union and the Gibraltar Cricket Association in respect of provision of facilities for the playing, teaching and development of their respective sports in Gibraltar?

1105 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the answer remains the same as my answer to Question 9 and 10/2015 in the previous session of Parliament.

1110 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, the Minister in answer to Questions 9 and 10 said that no identification had been made as he has done previously throughout 2014, yet I can assure Mr Speaker, that the representatives of both the Gibraltar Rugby Football Union and Gibraltar Cricket Association have been able to mention that there seems to be an area that has been identified, which is what I am asking.

I have not asked if there has been a final agreement or settlement or whatever, my question has always been have alternative facilities been identified.

1115 Can the Minister please enlighten us as to what sort of areas have been identified as potential use by these two Associations?

1120 **Hon. S E Linares:** No, Mr Speaker, I cannot specifically say because as he rightly says, this is a discussion we are having with them in order to ascertain whether some areas or a big area we can give to them to see if there is a potential of, so therefore this is what I have been saying all the time, that we have been in discussion with them. The question does not ask whether I have had a meeting with them, but I had a meeting with them only last week where we were discussing issues of how we can improve.

1125 I cannot specifically say to the hon. Member which is the area where we are looking at. There are many areas – he can look at the map of Gibraltar and try and identify areas we could use for the development and teaching of these two sports – but it is not only these two sports that we are looking at areas. We are looking at areas for all other sports and any area that I can identify and I can go to the Deputy Chief Minister and the Lands Management Committee in order to get for sports, then I will do so. This is what we are doing constantly. All the time we are doing that, so it is not a question of saying, ‘Oh, we have identified this for cricket or this for rugby.’

1130 I mentioned to him last time that in relation to the Cricket Association, we have been able to get the Garrison Gym to be shared with the basketball, so that is an area where we can expand on the development of the teaching of cricket. And in the rugby, like I also said to the hon. Member last time, we have been able to sit down with the MOD in order that the Devil’s Tower Camp (DTC) can be used for free for the rugby more often than it used to, obviously because before they used to have to pay and now they do not.

1135 So these are the issues that we are constantly all the time trying to develop, so if that is an answer to the question has there been any advance or any – that is as far as – but there has not been any advance from the last question only three weeks ago in the last session of Parliament.

1140 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Well I have to accept it is a pity, Mr Speaker, that these Associations tell me that the Government does seem to sort of have more advanced planning and so on in a particular area and the Minister has chosen at this particular stage not to make that public and since I am sat on this side of the House, I am going to have to put up with that.

1145 However, Mr Speaker, arising from the information that the Minister has just provided back, he said and in many ways I even welcome, that they have eased the use of the facilities at Devil’s Tower Camp by the Gibraltar Rugby Union and so on.

1150 Can the Minister confirm that the additional use of these facilities is because it is the Gibraltar Sports Authority or some other Government entity that has taken over the locations and then administers them to the Gibraltar Rugby Union; or does the Gibraltar Rugby Football Union have to deal directly with the MOD and with the Sports and Leisure Authority not even getting themselves involved in helping with the development of this sport?

**Hon. S E Linares:** No, Mr Speaker, as the hon. Member knows, the DTC has had issues and still has issues of security on how you go in, how you come out, who goes in, and all these issues. The other issue was that the MOD was charging different entities for the usage of the Devil's Tower Camp.

What we have done is sat with the MOD, we have got a Memorandum of Understanding with them that we will – and he is right there – through the GSLA, we could have a system and in this case it was football and rugby who were the ones that were mainly using the astroturf in the Devil's Tower Camp, that we would have a system where people will have a type of ID card specifically given so that they can go in and out in a safe manner fulfilling all the security issues that the MOD have.

So these are the sort of things that we have tried to clear up because those were the problematic things when the rugby people could not even – well, still cannot – go. A parent cannot come in to see the child who is playing inside the DTC because of security reasons, they have to just wait outside. But then the team manager can take the whole team in because they have a specific security card which they already know at the door, yes okay, these children can come in.

So all these things we have ironed out with the MOD and this is what I am saying that we have got a memorandum of understanding and rugby is a great beneficiary of that system because they have been using that place quite a lot for the rugby. And the hon. Member is right: it is done through the GSLA but it is sort of, like slots are given to rugby and then rugby handles, with the MOD, all these issues that I have just explained.

**Q87-88/2015  
Cultural grants –  
Awards for 2014-15**

**Clerk:** Question 87, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Culture provide updated details, since the answer provided to Question 12/2015, of any cultural grants awarded so far pertaining to the financial year 2014-15?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 88/2015.

**Clerk:** Question 88, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Is the Minister for Culture now in a position to provide this House with a revised schedule showing details of cultural grants awarded so far pertaining to financial year 2014-15, explaining the queries raised through supplementary questions in reply to Question 12/2015?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, due to the fact that only three weeks has passed since the last Parliament session I have been unable to write to the hon. Member – and I think he got a call from my office anyway – as promised.

Therefore I now hand over to the hon. Member opposite, updated details of all cultural grants awarded so far, appertaining to the financial year 2014-15.

This information is now the correct one and is now recorded in *Hansard*.

**Mr Speaker:** Strictly speaking, the schedule is not recorded in *Hansard*. The schedule that he is now providing is not recorded in *Hansard*, if he is just handing it over. If he does not incorporate it in the main answer, I do not think it will be recorded in *Hansard*. Is that the case, Mr Clerk?

Yes, because we are making the schedule part of the answer, it will be recorded; normally a schedule is not recorded, okay.

**Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, I just wanted... because last time there was a mistake in the schedule that I gave him and I promised him that I would write to him with the correct one, but if I had written to him directly, it would not be now in *Hansard*. That is what I am on about.



**Schedule to Question No. 88/2015**

Gibraltar Productions - Sponsorship for Gibraltar World Music Festival 2014	£15,000.00
Dragonfly Arts Ltd - Performing a solo comedy show/ 11th July 2014	£5,750.00
Jonathan Lutwyche – Travel assistance re: Summer school in New York	£3000.00
GNDO	£8,700.00
Gib Photographic Society	£1,800.00
Gibraltar Sea Scouts Band	£600.00
MO Productions	£6,700.00
Stylos Dance Studio	£6,000.00
Allegro Music Productions	£6,411.00
Kings Chapel Singers	£1,340.36
Santos Productions	£7,000.00
Gibraltar Philharmonic Society	£10,000.00
Gibraltar National Choir	£500.00
Andrew Felices on behalf of Janice Felices – Dance Academy	£3,000.00
Gib Re-Enactment Society	£350.00
Gib Face & Body Paint Association	£2,882.50
Gibraltar Arts & Crafts	£1,750.00
1st/ 4th Scout Group	£1,334.00
Manuel Ruiz – book grant	£929.00
Group 2000 - Poetry recital grant	£576.45
Fringe Festival Sponsorship (Its 3 o'clock Somewhere Entertainment Ltd)	£5,000.00
Gibraltar Re-Enactment Society	£350.00
Gibraltar Interfaith Group – Support for Interfaith Calendar	£996.50
Andrew Felices - Cultural Grants on behalf of Janice Felices - Dance Academy	£12,000.00
GFSB - Sponsorship for Rock Chef prize money	£2,000.00
Sonia Golt - Book grant	£1,600.00
Tracy Lee - Book grant	£ 9,650.00
M Olivera – Participation at the World Beauty Fitness & Fashion London	£ 350.00
Danza Academy	£ 5,850.00

**Contd. Schedule to Question No. 88/2015**

Adolfo Canepa- book grant 'Serving my Gibraltar'	£ 9,500.00
Gibraltar Productions Ltd (GWMF) - Sponsorship for Gibraltar World Music Festival	£ 20,000.00
Re-Enactment Society	£ 2,088.00
Humbert Hernandez - Book grant –'Conscript or Convict'	£ 2407.00
Sunborn Gibraltar - Reception for Gibraltar World Music Festival	£ 5,000.00
Masonic Institute - Assistance, reception for book launch	£ 150.30
Re-Enactment Society grant	£ 11,000.00
Patricia Lutwyche - Cultural Grant for Mr Jonathan Lutwyche to attend Britain Got Talent	£ 400.00

**Mr Speaker:** I have been in touch with the hon. questioner and he has kept me *au courant* with this particular answer, thank you.

1210 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, thank you. What my communication Mr Speaker was that after the deadline for submission of questions, the Minister's office did give me in fact from what I received, an exact copy of this schedule but I still wanted to maintain the question so that it is recorded in *Hansard* and also so that I am within the Rules and Mr Speaker should therefore allow me to make a supplementary question in this respect.

1215 Mr Speaker, if I may start with the third item down, there is a young performing dancer who has been granted £3,000 and it says 'travel assistance'. By that nomenclature it means that he seems to have travelled either first class or whatever to New York because £3,000 does take you a hell of a long way further than just New York. Or does that £3,000 incorporate some sort of tuition fees and so on?

1220 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, it is both.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Right, so if it is for everything then travel assistance can be a bit misleading. Mr Speaker, can I take him further down, to a certain extent I am referring a little bit as well to help facilitate matters to the previous schedule I have been given last month, although there has been a great amendment to that and so on.

1225 Can I ask the Minister to clarify where it says 'Gibraltar Sea Scouts Band'? The last time it was in respect of the purchase of instruments and so on for the band. Am I therefore also correct in deducing that just beyond half way down where it says '1st/4th Scout Group £1,334.00' that it is also in respect of musical instruments? Because the Sea Scouts does specify the band and for the 1st/4th it does not. I know  
1230 that these sort of Scout groups receive some money from youth grants and other places, so can he confirm to me that it is actually to do with the band, the 1st/4th contribution?

**Hon. S E Linares:** Yes, Mr Speaker, as he rightly says, the Scouts themselves get grants through the youth grants and therefore it is the right assumption that this should be for the band.

1235 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Great, that helps tremendously, Mr Speaker. We had raised it last time and the Minister was going to look into it, when a payment is given to the parent to Andrew Felices in respect of tuition fees and so on for the Dance Academy for his daughter Janice Felices, it says here now, £12,000.

1240 The Minister was going to try and find out whether that is related to just one academic year or does it spread out over two years because of the way that payments are made? Has the Minister been able to get any information?

**Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, this is appertaining to her annual... so it is a yearly thing and therefore it might roll over the £12,000. We might pay £6,000 and then £6,000 or £3,000 and £9,000 but the annual  
1245 amount is £12,000 because this includes all her travel expenses, all her maintenance expenses, so therefore it is, if the hon. Member thinks about for example a student and I think again in the Order Paper, there is a question of how much a student on tuition fees, they are usually for example in the UK £9,000 which is the average, so this would be like if it were the £9,000 plus another £3,000 for maintenance which, as the hon. Member knows the Department of Education pays maintenance. So the £12,000 is inclusive of all that and  
1250 it is an annual thing.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** That clarifies it a bit. And Mr Speaker, may I round up by asking: the Gibraltar Re-Enactment Society appears four times in the schedule. The very last payment, the penultimate entry Re-Enactment Society Grant, I think that is an annual grant basis of £11,000 but then there are other payments  
1255 not huge amounts but £350 on one side, then £350 again, then £2,088.

Given that this is over and above the grant am I right (1) in assuming this is a one-off payment and not just simply an increase due to inflation on the grant and (2) may I ask the Minister for some enlightenment on why beyond the £11,000 per annum grant, these three separate payments were given in respect of the Re-Enactment Society?

1260 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, these payments, as I understand it, were that for example the £350: they came to us to ask – 'us' as in the committee that actually decides this, which is the Cultural Grants Committee – and they asked for £350 for a specific capital expenditure sort of thing. They wanted to buy a gun or a cannon or some uniforms, which are not part and parcel really of the grant that they get. The grant  
1265 is for running costs as opposed to buying something specific, so all these items are specific.

We give them the grant of £11,000 in order to maintain and do things during the year but then in these cases they have come to ask for something specific. It could well be something like fixing lockers within their premises. These are the sort of things that are the smaller amounts.

1270 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, my understanding always was that the big sum of the grant, £11,000 included recurring costs and certain maintenance and upkeep of uniforms and so on. I can to a certain extent understand what the Minister is trying to say that there are two payments of £350. One takes it that it is two separate payments and not a clerical error again, could be a one-off – perhaps if one had seen from the press that they helped to create an old gun and so on. But there is one that is a slightly bigger figure, it is £2,088 –  
1275 that is an additional 20% to the annual grant.

Can the Minister provide some information at least in respect of the bigger figure, £2,088, which is the third line down on the second page of the schedule?

1280 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, I cannot specifically say what it is, that amount, I do not think it is a vast amount, some of these uniforms and equipment cost quite a lot of money. Therefore I would assume that these are like buying ten new uniforms, which is the amount that they cost. They cost quite a lot of money these uniforms, but what I am saying is that I do not specifically have the information but it should be something that they have asked for and it has been paid. I mean, that is what it is.

1285 **Hon. E J Reyes:** The Minister does not have that information but, Mr Speaker, that is precisely what I am asking, what is it? Exactly £2,088, given the cost of the upkeep of uniforms and so on, £11,000 per annum is quite a substantial sum of money. To require an additional 20% of additional supplementary funding, I do not think I am out of order, Mr Speaker in asking, as I would like to know what the £2,088 is for, if the £11,000 already includes the upkeep of uniforms and so on.

1290 If he does not have it now, could he at least commit himself to trying to provide that information to the House when possible? Your guidance is appreciated, Mr Speaker.

**Hon. S E Linares:** It does not need the guidance of the Speaker. I will do that.

**Q89/2015**  
**Sports Development Projects –**  
**Details of grants**

1295 **Clerk:** Question 89, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Further to the answer provided to Written Question W5/2015, can the Minister for Sports provide a breakdown with detailed information showing what Sports Development Projects the grants for £8,037.07 and £6,000 given to the Gibraltar Shooting Federation were for?

1300 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the breakdown of payments given to the Gibraltar Shooting Federation from Sports Development projects are as follows:  
1305 (1) a payment of £7,000 towards electronic targets for the Gibraltar Target Shooting Association and £1,038.07 for financial assistance towards the Gibraltar Pistol Association's attendance at the IPSC General Assembly in Florida, October 2014, so it's a total of £8,038.07.  
(2) £6,000 second and final payment towards electronic targets for the Gibraltar Target Shooting Association.

1310 Mr Speaker, if the hon. Member wishes, I can pass him the answers so that he does not have to note it down.

**Q90/2015**  
**Gibraltar Philharmonic Society –**  
**Grants awarded 2014-15**

**Clerk:** Question 90, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1315 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Culture provide details of any grants awarded to the Gibraltar Philharmonic Society in the Financial Year 2014-15, indicating the amounts awarded as well as the Head and Subhead to which this has been debited; showing the purpose or purposes for which the grant was awarded?

1320 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the Gibraltar Philharmonic Society receives an annual cultural grant of £10,000 and it comes from the Head that he asked the question before, which is the Cultural Grants Head.

1325 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, the reason why I had to pose this question before the deadline is that in the previous schedule that we can now more or less call obsolete, in answer to Question 12, the Minister had put down that there was £10,000 given to the Gibraltar Philharmonic Orchestra.

1330 So part one of my supplementary is that it raised a concern so that the Society was not receiving any money. I accept that we have kept to that £10,000 well spent in being one of the sponsors, it is nice to see Mr Speaker, when we do go to the concert that among the list of sponsors of individual companies and so on that the Government of Gibraltar is a sponsor and I think that is right and fitting and therefore there is no query in respect of that £10,000.

1335 The schedule given to me just a few minutes ago clarifies that. But then, Mr Speaker, can the Minister sort of confirm or deny whatever that no additional money has been given to anybody, be it the Gibraltar Philharmonic Orchestra or whoever, in respect of purchasing woodwind instruments to develop the Gibraltar Youth Orchestra. Have we made any contributions towards an orchestra or is that just a simple human clerical error, I would say?

1340 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, if he got that information from the previous schedule, it was an error. This now updates and corrects all the errors that is why we are having this discussion and I have given him the new one.

**Q91/2015**  
**Heritage sites –**  
**Details and costs of works**

**Clerk:** Question 91, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1345 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Heritage provide details of all works, together with a breakdown of the respective costs undertaken at any heritage related site, since the answer provided to Question 13/2015 as well as stating by whom these works were carried out?

1350 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth.

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, further to the answer to Question 13/2015, further works undertaken at heritage sites inclusive of costs and works carried out are:

- 1355
- |              |                    |
|--------------|--------------------|
| (a) Site     | Europa Pass        |
| Works:       | Emergency Works    |
| Constructor: | Koala Construction |
| Amount:      | £1,534.32          |
- 1360
- |             |                                     |
|-------------|-------------------------------------|
| (b) Site:   | South Port Gates                    |
| Works:      | Repairs to wooden door              |
| Contractor: | Gibraltar Cultural Services Limited |
| Amount:     | £300                                |
- 1365
- |             |  |
|-------------|--|
| (c) Site:   | Montagu Bastion Bunker                       |
| Works:      | Removal of loose concrete blocks             |
| Contractor: | Construction and Maintenance Company Limited |
| Amount      | £1,680                                       |

1370 (d) Site: Trafalgar Cemetery and St Jago's Stone Block  
Works: Fixing of gate posts, balustrade and painting works  
Contractor: Straits Overseas Limited  
Amount: £1,620.

1375 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, fair enough Mr Speaker, but he did say that the Europa Pass was sort of emergency works, but he has not said whether it was the gate, the painting or so on. What type of emergency work, does the Minister have any pertinent information?

1380 **Hon. S E Linares:** Yes, Mr Speaker, because I remember the day that it happened. If he knows where the Europa path is, there were some rocks that were falling off the actual wall and there is a house just beside a property and if any accident had happened... It is also to do with the buildings that are at the top, if the hon. Member knows where I am talking about, there must have been probably some works happening at the top and part of the wall was falling down, some of the rocks had fallen down so these are emergency works.

1385 What we did was, we sent the contractor there, they put scaffolding up, in these cases they are stone blocks that might move and therefore what you do is you put them back in and you make them safe. So that is exactly the type of work it was.

1390 **Hon. E J Reyes:** No, Mr Speaker, let me just double-check. The repair works carried out at South Port Gates, am I correct – my note says Gibraltar Construction Services Limited, no? Then can the Minister enlighten me?

1395 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, this was another emergency work of which one of the doors was flapping and it was dangerous and it is Gibraltar Cultural Services. Gibraltar Cultural Services is the company that runs the Mackintosh Hall, that runs the Ince's Hall and all this has replaced the agency.

1400 What happens is that these works and the maintenance team had to go out, which is a heritage job, but because it was such an emergency works, we could not get anybody I think it was a Saturday evening, so when I called the Cultural Services because they were the ones who reported it to me, I said, 'Why don't you go out and do the work yourselves?' and they did. So that is exactly what they did. They just made it safe so that at a later date we will do the whole works again.

#### Q92/2015

#### **Liberator Bomber AM911 – Progress on removing and exhibiting wreck**

**Clerk:** Question 92, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1405 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Heritage provide an update on the progress made so far in respect of Government's intentions as stated by the Chief Minister at the National Press Club on Tuesday, 8th October 2013, 'to work with the Museum in order to bring Liberator Bomber AM, or Alpha Mike, AM911 out of the sea and placed on permanent exhibition in Gibraltar'?

1410 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Sport, Culture Heritage and Youth.

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the HM Government of Gibraltar is still exploring the feasibility and technical aspects of removing the wreck from the bottom of the sea in conjunction with the Gibraltar Museum.

#### **TRANSPORT, TRAFFIC AND TECHNICAL SERVICES**

#### Q123-132/2015

#### **Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan – Cycling**

1415 **Clerk:** We now move to Question 123, and the questioner is the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Yes, Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Transport say on what basis the Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan states that cycling is not currently seen as a viable form of transport?

1420 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

**Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 124 to 132/2015.

1425 **Clerk:** Question 124, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say when a comprehensive cycle strategy will be formulated for Gibraltar and explain why one has not been devised in the last three years?

1430 **Clerk:** Question 125, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport detail the strategy/strategies the Government has developed to ensure the safety of cyclists in Gibraltar?

1435 **Clerk:** Question 126, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say when a comprehensive programme of cycle facilities will be delivered by this Government?

1440 **Clerk:** Question 127, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say whether cycling will be allowed as part of the Core Cycle Network between Convent Place and Casemates along the pedestrianised areas of Main Street?

1445 **Clerk:** Question 128, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say whether cycling will be allowed along Irish Town?

1450 **Clerk:** Question 129, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say whether he has identified potential locations for the establishment of Toucan crossings and advanced stop lines for cyclists?

1455 **Clerk:** Question 130, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say how soon work will begin on the introduction of cycle safety routes as set out in the Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan and provide details of the features of these cycle safety routes?

1460 **Clerk:** Question 131, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say whether the Government will be introducing 'Ride to Work' schemes in the nature of similar schemes available from time to time in the UK?

1465 **Clerk:** Question 132, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say what the total amount of expenditure being budgeted for by his Department for investment in cycling infrastructure is?

1470 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

**Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan includes proposed indicative routes for cycle and pedestrian priority.

1475 At the current consultation stage, feedback is being sought on the principles of the route network and the policies to promote cycling and walking. The deadline for feedback to be provided is tomorrow

20th February 2015 and I very much look forward to reading the input provided by the public and if he is to be positive about this in any way, the hon. Member opposite.

1480 **Once the Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan consultation is complete and account has been taken of the responses, further work will be required to develop and design the routes as part of the implementation stage. If adopted, these routes are expected to incorporate a range of measures, such as Toucan crossings and advanced stop lines.**

1485 **Cycle routes are not meant to replace pedestrian routes but be complementary to them as part of the wider modal shift in forms of transport being proposed. However, the compatibility of pedestrian and cycle movements need to be taken into account and to this end, Main Street and Irish Town are not included as cycle routes at present.**

1490 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I have asked a significant number of questions which the Minister has asked be bunched together, but there really are a significant number of issues that he has not dealt with.

I start with the first question, which is the one I asked the Minister for Transport to say on what basis the Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan states that cycling is not currently seen as a viable form of transport.

1495 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, we must remember that this is a draft plan; it does not necessarily mean that everything in that plan is what the Government's view of entirely what the plan should be. Remember, Mott MacDonald Consultants who were engaged in this were tasked to actually give the Government their proposals and their views independently of what I thought, or we thought or anybody else thought for that matter.

1500 **Hence the perception that they have received when they have been interviewing individuals, people who could possibly use cycling as a form of transport and the main problem or issue raised was that people who were questioned felt that at this point in time, cycling was not currently seen as a viable form of transport. They perceived that they did not feel safe or secure.**

1505 **So it is not why the Minister for Transport says that it is not considered viable, it is not the Government's opinion; it is what has come about from public consultation.**

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, a number of points on that answer.

1510 **The summary published not last week but the week before, is a summary of the plan itself. Therefore when I asked the question about why it is that the summary of the plan says certain things, I enquire as to why it is that it says such things.**

**Now the Hon. Minister tells us that this is about Mott MacDonald's independent view and it is also as a result of the responses received.**

1515 **But, Mr Speaker, would it not be in fact the case, or is it not the case, that given the likely preponderance of responses to the survey having come from people who want cycling, given the disproportionate bias to other forms of transport other than cycling, that this was a likely outcome; and that in fact, Mr Speaker, as has become clear in cities around the world, it is through political leadership and a genuine commitment to the idea of cycling that cycling in fact flourishes?**

1520 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Member's view of the plan is intrinsically flawed. This is not a draft; this is a draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan and as I said earlier, it is the views of the consultants and is also partly the view of the Government. We chose to publish the whole lot, the whole findings of the plan and not hide anything or say and there are things here which are contentious but everything is here now.

1525 **Having said that this is not the plan, this is a very abridged version of the plan. The plan itself when it is printed in due course will be a very, very thorough document which will have things and contingents which are not within this plan or may at least have only been slightly touched upon within the plan and they will be elaborated upon and built upon. So those people who are interested in seeing the reasons for certain proposals or want to go into further detail can do so. But the plan itself will be a very, very detailed and large document.**

1530 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, before I go on to labour the point which I consider is a very important one about political leadership in this context, I would hasten to add to the Minister that in fact, my description of the document, for clarification sake, was that it is a summary of the plan because that is what it is, that is what I have called it, that is what they have called it and yes, it is in draft to the extent that it is still subject to more consultation, still subject to the kind of consultation that means that he does not give answers in this House to questions that I ask.

1535 **Now in his original answer, Mr Speaker, he invites me to make a positive contribution to this debate by participating in the consultation process. Well, Mr Speaker, you really do not get more positive than having**

come to this House practically every month since we were elected to Opposition to talk about solutions, to talk about possibilities which surely the Minister will have taken note of and will constitute my participation in the process which I think is significant enough.

However, to labour the point about the political leadership, Mr Speaker, my concern and the reason why I raise this, is because a plan that identifies cycling and walking as alternatives that should be explored as alternatives, that should be developed as alternatives that people should be made aware of, as being good alternatives of transport to the car and to the motorcycle as they have been for a very, very long time, cannot in my view do well by departing from the premise that cycling in Gibraltar is dangerous, which is the view that the Hon. Minister for Transport, the previous Hon. Minister for Transport expressed in this House the first time we met in January 2012 and the view that is expressed in the plan.

Does the Minister not agree that by expressing the view that it is not safe, that it is not a viable form of transport in Gibraltar, without saying more, Mr Speaker, without saying it will be because we will invest *x* amount or we will do this and that to make it so, is not the basis upon which to depart on trying to make this a cycling community, as I know and I am sure he knows, this community can become.

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, personally I do not have a death wish so I do not go out on my bicycle to get run over or killed or maimed in any way, and I am sure he does not do so either. But that does not mean that the perception of the general public out there, and the reason why there are no more people joining us when we cycle out there, is because they feel that it is perfectly safe.

I mean these are exactly the views that came out of the public consultation. People do not think like we do. And one of the things that the hon. Member did ask me to look at – because he was very concerned because he himself had actually been hit in the rear while he was riding his bicycle – (*Interjections and laughter*) One of the things that he highlighted because he had actually been hit by a car, was the possibility of a zebra crossing or a pelican crossing outside Portland House. So it is clear... That was just his brush with danger in that respect. (*Interjection*) Well, it might have been a motorcycle, but anyway...

People's perception of whether cycling is safe is not what we feel and I find that cycling is safe enough for me to actually take to the road but that is not the perception of the people that were questioned.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Which brings me to another point I would make in relation to a number of questions that he has not actually answered.

The second question I asked, number 124, asked when a comprehensive cycle strategy will be formulated for Gibraltar and to explain why one has not been devised during the last three years. You see, Mr Speaker, the comprehensive cycle strategy is one that is mentioned in the summary of the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan – I hope I got its label right – and I was simply asking the Minister to elucidate upon the details of what that comprehensive cycle strategy will be and when we can expect it to be devised.

And again, Mr Speaker, I have made no secret over the last three years in this House of my disappointment at the fact that nothing has been done in terms of increasing cycling safety awareness by having advertising campaigns or anything of the sort, an initiative which the plan itself identifies as being necessary to promoting the safe use and adoption of cycling as an alternative form of transport and the Minister insists in telling me that because it is going through another process of consultation, he is not going to give me any more details.

Mr Speaker, the question is asked in this House and I believe that this is information that he now has, because the plan has been in the making for the last three years. So will the Minister, and this is not my last supplementary because, Mr Speaker, he has not answered many of the questions, will the Minister tell us when that comprehensive cycle strategy will be formulated for Gibraltar and tell us why no advance, no progress has been made in the development of one in the last three years, when surely he will have been appraised of the information and the likely recommendations that the consultants, who we hope have not brainwashed him, will have brought to his attention during the course of the last three years. (*Banging on desks*)

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, it is incredible that the hon. Member who had 16 years to set up a safety for cyclists (**Several Members:** Hear, hear) –

**Mr Speaker:** No, no, now we are beginning to debate and this is not the time to debate. If you want to debate, then let us have a motion on the Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan and you can debate it under the rules of debate. So get to the point.

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, as I was saying I think the comments made by the hon. Member are extremely unfair. Now the traffic plan is in a stage of development, it is still in the stage of development and the Government will announce all these measures when it feels fit to do so.



1600 The only reason why I think the hon. Member has been pushing for a traffic plan, traffic plan, traffic plan, is to have an opportunity just to look at it with a fine tooth comb and just criticise it like they criticise all other Government projects to the hilt. That is exactly the impression of what is happening here.

1605 So whether there is a comprehensive cycle strategy he will have to wait and see, but it is the intention of this Government to help promote other forms of transport, other sustainable forms of transport and cycling is one of them in question, as is walking.

So as and when the Government is prepared to make mention of these initiatives and as the final traffic plan comes into the public, he will then be furnished with the information he requires.

**Several Members:** Hear, hear. (*Banging on desks*)

1610

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Members applaud a lack of a plan because there is nothing yet concrete. Which brings me to the next question and that is Question 125 which is asking for the Minister to detail the strategy or strategies the Government has developed to ensure the safety of cyclists in Gibraltar. At first glance, Mr Speaker, I have to say none from my own personal experience.

1615 However, the reason why I was asking the question is because as an example in the UK and elsewhere, construction vehicles of which there are many in Gibraltar these days, many carrying scaffolding or empty scaffolding lorries, represent a clear and present danger to cyclists in those communities.

1620 Now I asked the question because I am interested to understand what the plan has unearthed in terms of cycling safety measures that this Government will be taking and I would ask the Minister to articulate a few of those for our benefit.

**Hon. P J Balban:** Let me see what the previous plan actually said about those things to see whether we can gain any insight.

1625 **Mr Speaker:** Let me give a little bit of guidance. Please sit down.

I think there is an alternative procedure that I would commend to hon. Members generally and particularly to Members of the Opposition. If you want to discuss, if you want to debate something like the traffic plan, all you have to do is to introduce a neutral motion: 'This House notes the recommendations, the contents of the traffic plan.'

1630 You can then debate the matter, raise all the points that you want. It is not as if you are introducing a motion which you might lose by Government majority. It is a totally neutral device which was adopted very often during the years when I was a Member of the House. It can be done with the traffic plan, it can be done with the report of the Ombudsman, it can be done with the report of the Principal Auditor and either the Government or the Opposition can introduce a very short motion. 'This House takes note of the...' and then the rules of debate apply.

1635 It is a far better method of procedure in my view than the present one, where you are constrained by the rules applying to questions.

1640 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful for the Chair's intervention and I take on board the recommendation as we have on a number of occasions in the past, but if the Chair will indulge me, Mr Speaker, I have been nothing but positive about the plan since it was published. I said so publicly on *Newswatch* last week when the plan was published.

All I want to do, Mr Speaker, is to elucidate information from the Minister and that is all I am seeking to do. I do not wish to debate the plan today; I wish to elucidate information, Mr Speaker.

1645

**Mr Speaker:** What I do not want hon. Members to do is to keep on going back over what happened over the last 16 or 20 years and both sides do that. Both sides of the House do that. That is what I do not want them to do.

1650 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, granted, but today during this question and answer session, Mr Speaker, I have only asked about the Government's performance in respect of this very particular project and nothing else. I have not alluded to the last 16 years and neither do I want to. I only want information, Mr Speaker. (*Interjection and Laughter*) No, and Mr Speaker I am perfectly happy to talk about the last 16 years if it is in fact what we are going to do here today, but it is not.

1655 What I want to do, is to elucidate information from the Minister which he is hesitant to give me and he betrays his nervousness by so very quickly alluding to the last 16 years of GSD Government, because of course, Mr Speaker, he is nervous about the fact that in the 16 years of the GSD Government, so much was achieved that they cannot hope to emulate in four, eight or even 20 years.

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Member has gone back to the past 16 years once again and I feel that it is only... Why can't I go back to the last 16 years?

I totally disagree with what the hon. Member is saying, the Government has brought out a very positive plan, a very thorough plan, a plan which has been generally very well received even by the hon. Member as he rightly says. But when we look at cycle safety which is something which the hon. Member is raising, and I unfortunately have to see where we are today and what we have inherited along the years and what we did was a scheme which we will talk about later because it is part of...there are questions related to this later on, a scheme which failed, which was the GibiBike scheme.

Now the Government, as I said, is very, very keen and is going to be pushing to help encourage people to sustainable forms of transport, cycling being one of them and the Government will be looking at – as you can see in the plan – the possibility of cycle lanes, which we have been very clear about, with Wellington Front and the walls being used as a segregated cycle lane, so people are not in contact with vehicles. We are looking at every single road in Gibraltar to see whether there is a possibility of having segregated bicycle lanes, which appears to be extremely difficult because of Gibraltar's roads and Gibraltar is too small in size to be able to merit and have this sort of infrastructural changes.

Obviously the Government, like any other Government, will be keen on ensuring the safety of cyclists by use of protective gear if necessary and the Government will most certainly be looking at a scheme for bicycle rental which works, because unfortunately the one – and I am sorry, Mr Speaker, having to go back to that – because what we took over in 2011 was a system which was rushed, which did not work, spares were not available, many of them got stolen and we inherited a lump of bicycles that were unusable.

The Government will take its time, do things properly, because we think that in most modern urban cities around the world, there are schemes which work better or worse, but there are schemes where people can borrow bikes or rent bikes or whatever, and the Government is keen to look at all these schemes but we will do things correctly. We are not rushed to do it and we will make sure that when we have them, that they work.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Hon. Minister for that reply, inasmuch as he provides at least a glimpse of a variety of initiatives that the Government might be able to adopt for itself in terms of enhancing cycling safety. It is lamentable, however, that they have had three years to embark on a programme of awareness on television or in the press, which did not require external consultants at a cost of hundreds of thousands of pounds to brainwash the Minister into agreeing to, but I will now continue and ask a further supplementary arising from specific questions that I have already asked.

In relation to the GibiBike scheme, Mr Speaker, the Hon. Minister will know that there are two or three questions in the Order Paper on that subject and I will therefore not deal with those suggestions, wrong as they are, at this juncture.

I asked the Minister whether he could say when a comprehensive programme of cycle facilities will be delivered by the Government. Again, the answer to the question, Mr Speaker, was a very general one where everything is being looked at. But I would be grateful if the Minister could give me particular attention to that and tell me when it is in fact, that we can expect this comprehensive programme of cycle facilities.

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, before the actual question was asked, the prelude to the question is that obviously he is begging me to go back to the 16 years. I will refrain from doing so because you have said that we should not, but he keeps on saying what have we done in the three years that we have had.

Well, we have a traffic plan which we have said will be a thorough investigation which will give us a very good idea of what we want to do. If he is saying what have we done in the past three years, well if we had inherited something better we would have continued with that, but we did not unfortunately. Again he keeps on asking me to go back and I will try to refrain from doing so.

Again, the hon. Member expects me from the plan to start giving him dates, when am I going to do this, when am I going to do that and when is the Government going to embark on the other? He will learn in due course when the Government is ready to have a timeframe if the Government sees that system to be fit, he will have it. But what he cannot expect is a document which has gone out for public consultation which is almost towards the end of that public consultation, for me to give him details of what he is asking.

He is asking for costs, he is asking for timeframes, he is asking for specifics and unfortunately, those specifics are not available to the hon. Member. This work is still being developed and once we are ready to give him more specific information, we will be happy to do so.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Well, Mr Speaker, that is just inaction hiding behind consultation, but we will leave that there.

Moving on to Question 127 which he did answer, remarkably, in saying no cycling will not be allowed along the pedestrianised areas of Main Street or Irish Town. I would ask, Mr Speaker, is the Minister content that it is okay, it is legal, it is in fact allowed for goods vehicles to be in the area of Main Street and

Irish Town before 10.00 a.m., or 11.00 a.m. I think it is, in the morning; but yet an eco-friendly, quiet, inoffensive form of transport as cycling is not allowed in that area? Is that something that has the potential of being revisited in that context?

1725 **Hon. P J Balban:** Once again, Mr Speaker, this is what we have had. There have never been bicycles allowed to cycle through Main Street or Irish Town. Why is it all of a sudden so important that bicycles should cycle down there? If you want my opinion – (*Interjection*) But the Government – we could have been briefed by them, but if you want my opinion on whether cycling through Main Street and Irish Town is safe, well I have my doubts.

1730 Bicycles are quiet methods of transport. They can travel in one direction or they can travel in others whereas goods vehicles will travel in one direction, their engines make noise, they travel at slow speeds, whereas the bicycle can whisk silently south, west, east, north and people are coming through tributaries, pedestrians are walking. Take Irish Town for example, we have pedestrians coming through all the tributaries to Irish Town and if you are going to make walking dangerous as a result of encouraging bicycles, then I do not think that is convenient.

1735 I think pedestrians, who are the majority of persons, should be encouraged and should not be having to look behind their backs. We have problems with mobility scooters who run people over in Main Street and there are all sorts of issues. So I think these things have to be thought about very carefully.

1740 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful that he has confirmed that it is of his own initiative that he does not want to pursue the idea of allowing cycling on Main Street before 11.00 a.m. like the heavy goods vehicles and to explore the possibility of restricting cycle traffic to those hours and in the direction of the flow of traffic as they exist today. But I can move on, Mr Speaker, because I have my answer.

In relation to –

1745 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, if I may, would the hon. Member give way? I have given the hon. Gentleman –

1750 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I am not going to give way unless it is a Point of Order. (*Interjections by Mr Speaker and other Members*) No, no, thank you very much. Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. As I was saying, I am happy to give way for a Point of Order though. There is not one? Oh good. (*Interjections*)

Mr Speaker, Question 131 – we got to 132, is that right? (**A Member:** Yes.) Again, there was no mention of the Hon. Minister in his replies to the questions of whether the Government is looking to introduce something like a ‘ride to work scheme’ as has existed in the UK from time to time and it is not something that from my review of the plan, was present in it, or rather the summary of the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan.

1755 Could the Minister please enlighten us as to whether this is something that the Government is looking at but is not in the plan?

1760 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, just to answer a question or comment that the hon. Member made earlier, I gave a reply to a question which was my opinion of cycle riding in Irish Town and along Main Street. That does not necessarily mean... I said it was my opinion, that does not necessarily reflect the Government’s opinion. What will happen is, all these things have been looked at and will be taken into account. Just because I think that this should be done, or I think that should be done, this is not my plan and any way this has not been my brain child; this has been something that has come across – no I will not –

**Hon. S M Figueras:** On a Point of Order, Mr Speaker.

**Mr Speaker:** Yes, what is the Point of Order.

1770 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Yes, I wanted to refer to the Hon. Minister’s original answer in relation to that particular question and the answer was no. Not that it was up for consultation; that the answer was no. That was the Point of Order, Mr Speaker.

1775 **Hon. P J Balban:** I do not know what that was all about, Mr Speaker, but what I am saying is whether in future bicycles will be seen riding along Irish Town or on Main Street, that is something which the plan will develop further and we will see what will happen. (*Interjection*)

1780 **Mr Speaker:** Now you have had... I think we can now leave the question of Main Street and Irish Town. You have been asked about Question... [*Inaudible*].

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, all these things are being looked at as part of the plan, the consultants are UK consultants and they are very up to date on all sorts of plans, including the 'ride to work' scheme which is in fact the 'cycle to work' scheme. I do not know whether, it is official, in order to... – it is 'cycle to work' scheme and not the ride. I do not know where he has got the term 'ride' from, he has probably heard it somewhere. But our UK consultants are providing us with all these similar schemes to try to incentivise and if the Government decides to adopt some of these we will make an announcement when necessary.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Finally, Mr Speaker in relation to these questions specifically on cycling, I asked what I thought was a valid question certainly, and one which I think the Minister will agree is important in the grand scheme of this debate.

That is to enquire as to what the extent of the investment planned by his budget entitling infrastructure is. You see, Mr Speaker, I asked the question because in countries on the continent such as the Netherlands where investment is very significant, the modal share of commuting trips or journeys carried out on bicycles is much, much higher than in other places in Europe. In the Netherlands for example it is 27% and in Denmark it is 19% and the UK languishes behind at about 2% in terms of the modal share.

But it is evident from the report of the All Parliamentary Cycling Group in the UK that cities that invest in infrastructure see a significant increase in the modal share of cycling, such as Oxford and Cambridge who respectively have a rate of 17% and 30%. So my question to the Minister would be twofold. One, what is the current modal share of cycling as a form of transport in Gibraltar and have those findings been provided to him and his Department by the plan, or by Messrs Mott MacDonald; and secondly, how much money is budgeted by his Department – and I am talking about looking forward not back, in terms of investment in cycling infrastructure.

**Hon. P J Balban:** A very clever bit of reading there on the part of the hon. Member, coming up with 'modal shares of cycling' and all these things which he is very up on.

Mr Speaker, the Government will be – what we cannot do is compare little Gibraltar to Oxford and Cambridge or places in Holland as to what we invest in cycling infrastructure. We are very limited in Gibraltar, which means to say that no matter how much we invest in trying to encourage people to cycle in Gibraltar, there is so much we can do. So what we are looking at is a possibility of including some cycle lanes, which is the most we can do and encouraging people to use this form of transport.

So as I said, the full report, when the report is published... What the hon. Gentleman wants is for the Government to say, 'We want more and more information, because that gives me more and more fuel to be able to attack and criticise and whatever.' No, unfortunately we are not ready to provide you with all this information, and I do think at this stage, which is a draft *public* document, that people really want to know what the Government is going to be budgeting or what the modal share or any fancy term in that respect.

The Government obviously will be budgeting for the traffic plan, the Government will be investing considerably in the traffic plan and the hon. Member will have to wait and see how that is shared throughout all the different aspects of the plan itself.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Well, Mr Speaker, I rise only to disagree with the Hon. Minister's assessment of the terms that I have used as fancy language. It is what it is, a modal share of use and I also disagree with his assessment of my approach to these questions this morning, Mr Speaker.

I have been doing nothing but seeking information from him to try and understand the reach of this plan and the extent to which we can all expect that in years to come, because this is not going to happen overnight and I acknowledge that, how we are going to see cycling develop as a form of transport in Gibraltar.

Of course the plan is not limited to that, it has many other aspects, many of which we touch upon in further questions in the Order Paper but, Mr Speaker, I suppose what is most regrettable is that whilst he perhaps to a certain extent, rightly identifies that Gibraltar has certain limitations – not that we are limited because we are certainly limited only by our imagination and that of our political leadership – I would ask the Minister to say what he considers are the series of measures that he can take, starting today, to try and encourage the use of cycling as an alternative form of transport in Gibraltar?

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, it is not what I think. When the Government is ready to provide him with information of what the Government thinks, I will do that.

Now, no matter how much forward planning: I have not planned ahead because eventually in the future I suppose we will see cars that fly! (*Laughter*) But we are not going to go down that route in that respect. As I said, when the Government is ready to provide the hon. Member with that sort of information, then we will do but we are not ready yet.

**Q133-135/2015**  
**Bicycle rental scheme –**  
**Plans for delivery**

**Clerk:** Question 133, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Transport provide full specifications of the urban bike rental scheme contemplated by the Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan – that should read ‘the summary of the Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan’ (A Member: Draft.) ‘draft’ – including information as to when such a scheme will be available?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

**Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 134 and 135.

**Clerk:** Question 134, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say whether the Government has now formulated plans for the delivery of an urban bicycle rental scheme or whether they will be resurrecting the GibiBikes?

**Clerk:** Question 135, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say if Members of the original GibiBike scheme will automatically be registered as members of a new urban bicycle rental scheme, whatever shape that may take, in the future?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

**Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, the Government has no plans to resurrect the ill-thought out and so badly rushed GibiBike scheme, which has been a huge GSD waste of money for our community.

However, the Government is looking into the possibility of introducing a new, well-thought out, unrushed and value-for-money bicycle rental scheme. We are therefore looking at all the commercial options that are available in that respect.

At this point, I am not in a position to provide any further details. If such a scheme will be introduced, we would welcome back all the members of the original and ill-fated GibiBike scheme. However, a decision as to whether registration will be automatic cannot be taken at this stage.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I welcome the answer by the Minister inasmuch as he says that there will at some point – nobody knows when – be a GibiBike equivalent urban bicycle rental scheme.

I do, however, have to disagree with the premise that it was a GSD failure that the GibiBike scheme became as problematic as it did. At the time there were many questions and answers across this floor –

**Mr Speaker:** Now you have made your point. You said and that you disagree, but we are not going to debate that.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker –

**Mr Speaker:** We are not going to go into detail in debating – you have refuted the point –

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Grateful, Mr Speaker.

**Mr Speaker:** – that has been made about a waste of money, so leave it at that and now you go on.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Grateful, Mr Speaker. Yes, happy to, Mr Speaker. I am grateful for the guidance. In relation to the urban bicycle rental scheme that the Government is looking at, I note that he says that the automatic registration of members will not be possible.

Is there any indication at this stage of whether the integration of that urban bicycle rental scheme in terms of locating it close to bus stops, which is something I saw in one of the images in the draft, in the summary of the draft Sustainable Traffic and Transport Plan, will be more or less *a la* GibiBikes in terms of

having it close to bus stops, as they were intended to be when the scheme rolled out to the South District and other areas, which in the event it never did?

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, I think I heard the hon. Member say that I had said that it will not be possible to automatically register persons – if that is what he said then I need to correct his view because I said that at this moment in time, a decision as to whether registration would be automatic cannot be taken at this stage. So just to correct that point in case I misheard.

Now again, Mr Speaker would not wish me to go back and debate why the bikes were so good or so bad or whatever. Clearly the public at large knows whether they were good or bad and why they did not survive.

Anyway, in order to be able to – which is part of the question – in order to be able to, resurrect the GibiBikes you would need nothing close to a miracle really, because in order to resurrect these bicycles is just not possible. The bicycles had serious issues with the locking mechanisms, they had issues with bikes which were stolen as a result of their faulty locking mechanisms, which would have been fine as long as the locking mechanisms could have been repaired or spares could be bought or they could be upgraded. But then, the company was not there to be able to deliver on spares, on service and so the bicycles just died a natural death. So unfortunately that is GibiBikes and many of these bikes are lying in the bus depot as a carcass of rotted metal, which is a shame, because it was a huge expense to the Taxpayer at the time.

Now the Government's idea is that Government is looking into potential schemes because as I said earlier, in most modern urban cities, bicycle sharing systems do work. They are not profit making schemes as the hon. Members knows, so care has to be taken that at least if we are going to invest money in a scheme that it stands the test of time, which unfortunately the others did not. So that is imperative.

Whether the racks will be close to the bus stops or not, well if you think about the size of Gibraltar, there are bus stops very close to each other so these racks will be close enough to bus stops. They will be very much within walking distance or a stone's throw away from buses. Whether they will appear like the picture shows which is the bus stop which has a rack right beside it, whether it will be that configuration or slightly apart, well again these are just ideas.

The idea of the document was to charge people's views on the plan and they can come back to us with ideas. It was meant to be a plan, a document which would see how people thought and get them interested and get them debating and saying well this is really bad or this is really good or this will work or this will not work. I think the plan has done that, I think... the closing date is tomorrow, I think people have been interested either way, whether they are interested because this will affect them or interested positively or whether interest because it will affect them negatively.

I think everyone loves the idea of a traffic plan as long as it does not affect their immediate vicinity and I think people have said and even NGOs have stated, we have to wait and see how things go. There has got to be a series of pilot schemes and I think the plan has done that. It has created a lot of interest, a lot of comments. Some have been negative, some have been positive; some people have written objective pieces on the plan in very much detail which Government really appreciates. I have actually gone through it section by section, so I think the Government has achieved what it set out to do.

Now it will be a time to look at all of these, reflect upon all the ideas and come up with a plan which is well balanced and for the good of the whole community in every respect to try and encourage people to stop using their vehicles as often, to use the excellent bus service that we have, eventually to hopefully use a bike scheme when we are able to decide on how to proceed on that, encourage walking and all the other methods which include sustainability to.

So as I said, this plan is a plan in progress. I know it has taken time and the hon. Member has been really enthusiastic, he has been positive – so much so that he did say publicly that if they ever took office in the future they would not bin it. Of course they would not because I truly think it is a great plan.

So as I said, if the hon. Member just gives us the gift of that extra time, we are almost there now and then all these things will be revealed in due course.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Hon. Minister and there is only one more question. But what I would say is that of course I understand that a certain amount of artistic licence has to be given in the production of illustrations and diagrams in the plan. There is one in the plan of a lady riding a moped on Zoca Flank in a bikini not wearing a helmet. So we are perfectly happy to allow them the artistic licence you need to give in these instances, Mr Speaker.

Also to touch upon a point that he has made which I think is very important and one which I have made publicly but which I wish to make here in this Parliament. Mr Speaker, our approach to these things will be very different to theirs. We will not, if elected to Government this year, take that plan and rubbish it just because it is not our plan. That is not how we do things and that is not how we will do things if we are entrusted with the stewardship of this community this year.

What I would ask, what I would ask the hon. Member is whether he can say whether he has any regrets that this investment that they are looking at and there is no account of how much that could be, but certainly

in the context of the very, very many and splendid investments being made by this Government in projects for the better of the community at large, whether perhaps this might not have been one of those projects which the Government could have taken under its wing at an earlier stage, as soon as it had identified that the GibiBike scheme was not going to exist for much longer, in order to continue to reap the benefits of the interest and the commitment of so many users who were coming to GibiBikes in their droves?

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, yes the Government could have just as they did, got rid of the GibiBike scheme and started looking for another scheme but again, we have the main issue of public perception of cycling in Gibraltar, which we spoke about initially. For us to place a new scheme to replace the old without looking at the actual real reasons why perhaps the bicycle scheme would never be used by people... I do recall that people would use it from the frontier to 6/7 Europort and from the frontier to Waterport Place. Those were the most common routes because people who came to work who lived across the border would use them.

I know that they were popular for the short life they had within that route, but people, I do not think – I may be wrong as I was not there at the time, but I do not think that people... If they are worried about cycling in Gibraltar and the perception is that it is not entirely safe, I do not think any bicycle scheme would encourage people to just take up cycling.

As I said, but once we have segregated bicycle lanes, hopefully which is what we are looking at which is part of the Wellington Front Project then people I think will start realising that cycling can be another way of moving from A to B even if it is just through leisure, it does not have to be a form of transport but encourage people through leisure to use these bicycles, keep people fit which is another reason why people walk or cycle, not just to get cars off the street, it is also to become healthier people.

I do not think, personally, that at the time it would have been a good idea to have scrapped one scheme and replaced it with another because one did not work and this one would have. I think when we are ready and I think when people are ready, I think it is something which we definitely need to explore.

Now, when I mentioned that the hon. Member was looking at the plan with a fine tooth comb, I have got excellent vision, I have got very, very good vision, but I would need a magnifying glass to see whether the lady driving her bicycle on Zoca Flank is wearing a bikini or not. It just goes to show how in-depth the gentleman has gone into the plan just to be able to make useless comments or comments which do not really mean much in terms of, it is not a comment which is constructive in any way; it is just a little... I do not want to use a rude word, just a little... you know. So anyway it just goes to show my perception of what the hon. Gentleman has been doing with the plan.

So as I said just to round off, in essence first let us correct the perception of people, let us encourage people, let us make cycling safer in the perception of people and once we do so, once we have our segregated bicycle lanes, then let us invest in a scheme in a system of the rental bikes perhaps which would also explore, which we do need to explore, because the previous scheme only rented bicycles, but they never thought I think anyway of renting helmets because that would have been the cherry on the cake I suppose because people can use a bicycle but not wear a helmet. There is no law that says you have to use a helmet. Now whether we want to or whether we do not want to, that is a different story. Will people encourage that or will it be another thing to carry around.

But again, we need to look at everything and the Government will be looking at a scheme which works throughout.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, the Minister betrays his fragility when he touches upon once more just an amusing side comment that I made in relation to the plan in terms of artistic licence and that is where I am going to leave that point.

I am going to say, Mr Speaker, that we are going to have to agree to disagree on the popularity of the GibiBike scheme because I recall asking in this House, Mr Speaker, questions in relation to the numbers of people who were signing up to the scheme when it was already in full scale descent to detritus and the numbers of people signing up were still significant because there were a lot of people depending on that scheme.

Now, we will agree to disagree on the point of whether it was a good idea to just take one scheme and replace it with another one which was not beset by all the difficulties and problems that the first one was. But what I will ask the Minister now, Mr Speaker, is a question which I think arises from the answer and which I think needs to be answered to do away with any kind of ambiguity. That is, whether there is any question whatsoever, that an urban bike rental scheme will at some point return to Gibraltar?

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, Government is looking positively at it, very positively at it. It is something which, as I said, all major cities have. I personally think it is a good idea, As the hon. Member said, there were people who signed up for the scheme but I think it is very different, I think when a new scheme comes up and something different arises, I think many people are keen to sign on. We have to really

analyse and what should have been analysed is what the use was after that. As I said when something new turns up it is a great idea, you go and you sign up. Whether you then use it or not is a different issue.

**Hon. N F Costa:** May I?

**Hon. P J Balban:** Yes, please do, yes.

**Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, if I may, my hon. Friend is being far too generous. He should not accept the premise of the hon. Gentleman's questions. The GibiBike scheme did not –

**Mr Speaker:** No, out of order. The hon. Member is out of order.

**Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, I am answering the premises of his question –

**Mr Speaker:** No, I will not allow it, the question –

**Hon. N F Costa:** – which relates to the GibiBike scheme, and I was the Minister responsible for the GibiBike scheme for three years.

**Mr Speaker:** I am sorry, the Hon. Minister will sit down because the questions have not been addressed to him. In the last three quarters of an hour to an hour, we have been dealing with cycling, and it does not involve –

**Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman gave way to allow me –

**Mr Speaker:** To who?

**Hon. N F Costa:** To me, the hon. Gentleman –

**Mr Speaker:** He had no business to give way to you – what for?

**Hon. N F Costa:** Because I am answering –

**Mr Speaker:** He has answered the question –

**Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman has not answered the question because he is leaving out an important part, which is the part that I wish to address to the hon. Gentleman, which is a very simple one.

The hon. Gentleman keeps making the implied criticism in everything that he asks, that we have allowed the GibiBike scheme to deteriorate and as I explained to him, during the course of the last three years, that was not the case. There was no intentional policy of allowing the GibiBike scheme to come to nothing. The GibiBike scheme collapsed because it was a rushed through, ill-thought out, completely inadequate scheme for Gibraltar. That is the answer.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q136/2015**  
**Adult cycling proficiency courses –**  
**Potential introduction**

**Clerk:** Question 136, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Transport say, and I think I know the answer already, whether the Government is contemplating the introduction of adult cycling proficiency courses?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

**Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, if the hon. Gentleman knows the answer, why ask the question in the first place, but I will go ahead and answer. It is



the comments which are totally unnecessary, I think and they do not help in any way. (**Several Members:** Ooh!) (*Interjections*)

2080 Mr Speaker... (*Laughter*) Well, it adds some fun to this, otherwise it gets a bit boring.

**Mr Speaker:** May I call hon. Members to order. This is a serious business. Let's get on like adults, that we are responsible persons, please. (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) Anyone would think that only children sat here.

2085 Now answer the question, please.

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, the RGP currently conducts cycling proficiency courses for young people, particularly with children at school and numerous different social organisations. This also includes HM Government of Gibraltar GSLA summer sports programme.

2090 The RGP have offered cycling proficiency courses to adults before, but this was a programme for people with disability needs.

As part of a plan to encourage a greater take up of cycling in Gibraltar, we will continue to work closely with the RGP in this regard.

### Q137-138/2015

#### Buses –

#### Full specifications of old and new

2095 **Clerk:** Question 137, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** We will be moving along a bit more swiftly now, Mr Speaker. Can the Minister for Transport provide full specifications of the old Dennis buses, including but not limited to engine type, size, number of cylinders, power output and all other technical specifications available for these vehicles?

2100

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

**Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 138.

2105

**Clerk:** Question 138, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Transport provide full specifications of the new buses, including but not limited to engine type, size, number of cylinders, service intervals, power output and all other technical specifications available for the new buses?

2110

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

**Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, in answer to Question 137, although those buses were ordered by the previous Administration when they were on this side of the House, I shall be happy to oblige.

The technical specifications of the Dennis Dart buses are as follows:

Engine type: Cummins

Make (trade name of manufacturer) Dennis Dart

2120

Cylinder capacity: 3,900 cc

Number of cylinders: 4

Propulsion: Diesel

As to the answer to Question 138, which is exactly the same answer but for the new buses, the technical specifications for the new buses are as follows:

2125

Engine type: MAN

Make (trade name of manufacturer) Man-Caetano

Cylinder capacity: 6,871 cc

Number of cylinders: 6

Maximum net power: 213 KW

2130

Propulsion: Diesel

Service intervals: The manufacturer's first vehicle maintenance interval is recommended at 4,000 kilometres. As of yet, the vehicles have not reached such mileage.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** I am grateful, Mr Speaker, so the new buses are diesel like the old buses were.

2135 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, the new buses are...yes, I said propulsion of both these buses were diesel.

2140 **Hon. S M Figueras:** I am grateful, Mr Speaker, can the hon. Member just very quickly – and I do not have too many supplementaries on this issue – say whether the new buses have yet required a service of any kind in terms of their maintenance, not a regular service in terms of maintenance, anything that is not routine?

2145 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, at present, as I said, the service interval has not been reached yet, at 4,000 kilometres the buses will need to undergo their first service. Apart from that, the buses have had certain things checked which are I believe the ramps had to be checked, but again, if you actually give notice of that specific question then I can get more details for him. What I have based this question on is actually the characteristics of the engines, plus the service and the oil changes, filters etc. but no more than that.

2150 **Hon. S M Figueras:** I am happy to give notice of the question but just to clarify what I was asking for, was whether anything out of routine service had needed to be done on the buses, which the Hon. Minister says in relation to the ramps, but I will give notice of that question. I believe my learned and Hon. Leader of the Opposition –

2155 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, yes. Perhaps the hon. Gentleman cannot answer this question; it arises out of his answer, the answer in relation to maintenance, and also a question that I asked the Hon. Minister Costa in December of last year about maintenance.

2160 Has the Government now concluded a contract for the maintenance of the new buses which was still pending in December of last year when I asked this question of the Hon. Minister Costa? If it has, can he identify who has been awarded the contract in relation to the maintenance? If he cannot answer it because he needs notice, I will ask it next time round.

2165 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, I would rather he ask the question next time round and I will have a fuller idea of the reply plus supplementaries to that because as I said, I do not think that has been concluded yet. But I really need notice of that question because obviously it will lead to other supplementaries and I would rather be fully informed by my team before I engage in that sort of debate on that question.

#### Q139/2015

#### **Bus drivers merging onto Rosia Road – Resolving difficulties at Red Sands Road**

**Clerk:** Question 139, the Hon. S M Figueras.

2170 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Transport say how he has dealt with the difficulties experienced by bus drivers merging onto Rosia Road from Red Sands Road at the southern end of Rosia Road?

2175 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

**Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, an application was made to the Traffic Commission for the placing of a mirror opposite the bottom of Red Sands Road. This application was approved and the traffic mirror was subsequently placed.

2180 I am glad to report that the issue has now been resolved.

**Q140/2015**  
**Safety of red buses –**  
**Works on Europa Road**

**Clerk:** Question 140, the Hon. S M Figueras.

2185 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Transport detail the works carried out to ensure that Europa Road is safe for the recently acquired red buses to travel along it?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

2190 **Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, no physical works have been carried out to Europa Road as these have not been deemed necessary at this moment in time.

2195 The whole of Europa Road has, however, been assessed by HM Government Engineers, in conjunction with a firm of specialists Geotechnical Engineers. The assessment has included detailed surveys of the road using ground penetrating radar and intrusive bore holes to allow stability analysis checks to be carried out on the existing walls.

The conclusion of the assessment is that Europa Road can safely carry the weight of the newly acquired buses and a programme of monitoring is currently in place.

**Q141-143/2015**  
**Buses–**  
**Increasing service levels**

2200 **Clerk:** Question 141, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Transport say when the pilot scheme for an evening bus service will commence?

2205 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

**Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 142 and 143/2015.

2210 **Clerk:** Question 142, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say to what extent the bus service will be increasing the level of its service and whether or not the Government is looking to acquire more buses?

2215 **Clerk:** Question 143, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say what changes the Government is making to the layout of the buses and at what cost?

2220 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

**Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, the modifications that are going to be carried out to the buses is to modify the steps to lower the height of the steps.

2225 The estimated cost of this modification is €4,912. Although the new buses conform to EU approved standards, on-site meetings with the Senior Citizens' Associations, Social Services, Disability Groups and the Occupational Therapists were undertaken to better assess their accessibility. In view of the findings it was decided to modify the steps by adding one extra step.

2230 With regard to the evening bus service, there is no definite date for the introduction of this pilot scheme. All the administrative arrangements for such a scheme are currently being studied, which includes routes, timings and pricing etc. The Government will make an announcement in due course.

As part of the STTPP there are proposals to establish new bus interchange hubs. This would create more travel opportunities aimed at co-ordinating bus timetables more efficiently and minimising waiting times between services.

2235 The Government will also be looking at the possible introduction of new ribbon routes which will run at a lower level of frequency of the normal bus routes but would provide connections to key destinations like the hospital. In addition, the Government is looking to acquire more buses to service the Upper Town area.

2240 **Hon. S M Figueras:** I am grateful for the answer, Mr Speaker. Can the Minister for Transport say whether it is this intended investment in new buses that has promoted the insertion into the plan of reference to the possibility of starting to charge for the bus service at some date in the future?

2245 **Hon. P J Balban:** No, Mr Speaker. As I said when the consultants quizzed people and they went out on their surveys, some comments came back – in fact they were surprised by the amount of people who said ‘why should people not pay for the bus?’, people said why have a free bus service? They were keen, people thought it would increase the value of the service somehow, so as part of the... This is a perfect example, as I said before, it was something which could have been omitted because it could well be contentious because it is very easy to say, ‘Well if you are going to be charging, we want whatever.’ But that is not the point, the point was to show what people’s views are and we were surprised that we found quite a few people said ‘Why not pay for buses? Why should it be free? It is costing the Taxpayer a lot of money to have these buses, why can’t people contribute when they are using them?’

2255 **Hon. S M Figueras:** And you know, Mr Speaker, this is the reason why I have raised it in such a neutral fashion because genuinely the plan has been conducted in the way that it has and this is the kind of feedback that Government and the consultants have received, then fair enough, Mr Speaker, you cannot say anything other than that.

2260 However, Mr Speaker, I would say and I would perhaps caution the Minister, that it strikes me that if I were a bus user, if I were to use the bus every day to rely on it for commuting and I found that in the mornings when, as the plan says, the buses are full to the brim and often buses will go by because they are full and there is just not enough capacity, that as a bus user answering questions about the bus service, I may well be inclined to say, ‘Actually, why don’t we charge so we have less people on the bus?’ and frankly –

**Mr Speaker:** Charging does not arise from any of the three questions.

2265 Look, I did allow the Minister to reply to a question when I should not have allowed it. I allowed the question, I allowed the Minister, hoping that the Minister would just say yes or no, to give a short answer, and now you are no longer dealing with the subject matter of the three questions. You are now dealing with a question of charging, which is a totally separate issue.

2270 I have been liberal, I have allowed people to ask, I have allowed the Minister to give a short answer, but for heaven’s sake, you must not elaborate now and have a debate on whether people are going to pay for the bus service or not!

2275 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful for the guidance and I am happy to leave the issue there and bring it up in a question next month. But only to say, Mr Speaker, that it only arose in the context of the additional cost for acquiring more buses and covering that cost. I thought it was a convenient point to bring it together. So that, Mr Speaker, was the reason why I raised it, in the context of the Minister saying we are going to acquire more buses and therefore there was a cost that was going to be covered and the Minister himself did very helpfully provide – and it arises from the plan – a very full answer to which I thought a quick supplementary was appropriate.

2280 If it is the Chair’s view that it is not appropriate, then I am certainly happy to move on.

**Mr Speaker:** The Chair... I allowed him to answer, conscious as I was of the fact that the supplementary did not really... I thought well fine, let the Minister... He gave a reasonable answer, short, to the point. That should be it, I would imagine. We must not elaborate and now have a debate on something that does not even arise.

2285 So on the one hand I am liberal and I allow it, and then...

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I will raise it as a separate question in next month’s meeting of Parliament, but I believe that the Hon. Leader of the –

2290 **Mr Speaker:** ‘What is the Government’s policy about people paying for the buses?’ That is the question. Why not...?

**Hon. S M Figueras:** But, Mr Speaker, the point that I was getting to, Mr Speaker, but unfortunately I was unable to get to the point, was that there is a concern on this side of the House that consultation, good though it is, can if not tempered by the expertise and the knowledge and experience of the consultants on board and the Minister's own Department's guidance and leadership in this context... I was giving an example of how perhaps the responses might be skewed one way or another and how we needed to guard against being guided by those in a way that might not be representative.

I am happy to leave this issue for discussion by way of further questions next month, but I do believe that the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition has a supplementary to ask.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, before I ask the question, I have to declare an interest, in that I live in the Upper Rock and under the Rules I need to declare that.

But it arises out of Question 142 and the increase in the levels of service and I wonder whether the Government has thought about introducing a bus service for the Upper Rock. I will tell you why I am asking, there have been a number of people in the Devil's Gap area and also further down, the Bruce's Farm area and we are talking about 20 something families up there, asking me as to whether there are any plans in relation to the introduction of a bus service there that then links with Moorish Castle and Calpe on the way down.

I just wondered whether the Minister can provide some information in relation to that if he has any?

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, as far as I am aware, this is the first I hear of a proposal in that respect. It has not come across, as far as I am aware as part of the consultation period, or even as part of your comments on the traffic plan, no-one has raised that.

I would not like to speculate, as there are just a few families up there and I think we have to be very careful. I do not think we can provide a bus service everywhere in Gibraltar because there is no need or there has been no demand and obviously it is difficult but again if it is something that is popular with people in the area, Government will look at everything that is proposed for sure. Then we will weigh up on whether that decision, on what the usage is.

If the hon. Gentleman would like to make that as a proposal, we welcome that sort of thing. But again, I have not heard any comments; they have come to see you, but not me or the Government.

**Q144-158/2015**  
**City centre traffic –**  
**Government's plans**

**Clerk:** Question 144, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Transport say if it is in fact the case that it plans to exclude all non-public service, non-eco-friendly traffic, from within the city walls?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

**Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 145 to 158.

**Clerk:** Question 145, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Transport say whether the Government will be providing dedicated parking spaces in and around the city centre for so-called micro cars?

**Clerk:** Question 146, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say which areas in the city centre are now earmarked to become paid parking spaces and when?

**Clerk:** Question 147, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say when the Government will start charging users for parking in the city centre?

**Clerk:** Question 148, the Hon. S M Figueras.

2350 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say if it is in fact the case that the Government is contemplating the introduction of a congestion charge for Gibraltar?

**Clerk:** Question 149, the Hon. S M Figueras.

2355 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say whether it will be introducing measures to encourage, incentivise and monitor car-pooling in Gibraltar?

**Clerk:** Question 150, the Hon. S M Figueras.

2360 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say what he means when in the summary of the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan, the Government refers to the development of car sharing networks, car clubs, etc?

**Clerk:** Question 151, the Hon. S M Figueras.

2365 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say whether there are any plans to license a social car sharing scheme in Gibraltar along the lines of the Uber service?

**Clerk:** Question 152, the Hon. S M Figueras.

2370 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say whether the Government will be reviewing arrangements implemented in the area of St Joseph's School in the days following the announcement of the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan summary?

**Clerk:** Question 153, the Hon. S M Figueras.

2375 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say where it is proposed to create resident parking schemes as raised in the summary of the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan?

**Clerk:** Question 154, the Hon. S M Figueras.

2380 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say whether it is in fact the case that one of the ribbon routes announced as part of the summary of the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan will be around the outside of Waterport Terraces?

**Clerk:** Question 155, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport detail the measures it is planning to make to the area of the Trafalgar Interchange?

**Clerk:** Question 156, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say what measures he is discussing with the Taxi Association to improve the quality of the service available to users?

**Clerk:** Question 157, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister for Transport say how the Government expects to monitor and maintain appropriate levels of enforcement of traffic laws in Gibraltar?

**Clerk:** Question 158, the Hon. S M Figueras.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** And finally, Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Transport say what the Government means when it refers to 'longer term plans' in the summary of the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

**Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan does not suggest exclusion of non-public service or non-eco-friendly vehicles within the city walls.

At present, Government has no specific plan to provide dedicated parking spaces for micro-cars in and around the city centre, but doing so in future is not necessarily discarded.

Mr Speaker, the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan identifies pilot schemes which will be introduced along Linewall Road and Waterport Road. They will operate on a pay and display basis as is already the case in a number of areas around Gibraltar. An announcement will be made in due course.

The Government is not contemplating the introduction of a congestion charge for Gibraltar at present and there is no mention of this in the draft summary document of the Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan.

The plan makes recommendations aimed at encouraging shared car usage to reduce the number of vehicles on our roads. These recommendations will be fully considered at the end of the public consultation period. However, there are no plans at present to license a social car-sharing scheme in Gibraltar.

Mr Speaker, the traffic and parking arrangements introduced in the area of St Joseph's School are part of a pilot scheme launched under the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan. This pilot scheme and others to follow will be constantly monitored. At present, the RGP who are on site are also monitoring the scheme on the ground and will relay any concerns, or otherwise, to the Ministry as they see fit.

In moving on, Mr Speaker, the draft plan states that residential parking zones have met with support in principle from stakeholders. Further engagements with the tenants' association and residents will now ensue in order to proceed with the pilot schemes in given areas, which will help address the serious misgivings of the residential parking scheme as laid out in the integrated Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan, such as the lack of provision for visitors, carers and commercial vehicles. At present it is not possible to advise on the exact extent and number of zones that might be introduced.

The plan also incorporates a number of proposals to develop a new bus network for the use of core routes supported by ribbon routes. The introduction of one such ribbon route around and outside of Waterport Terraces was shown on the plan as a possibility. Work on core routes and ribbon routes is still ongoing. This, Mr Speaker, is still very much work in progress.

With reference to the Trafalgar Interchange, micro-simulation modelling has been used to examine and review concepts and proposals for different areas of the transport network. These have been used to develop the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan and once the consultation period has been completed and responses taken into account, further work will be required to develop the actual measures. It is, however, expected that these will include the introduction of a new pelican crossing, along Ragged Staff Road as well as changes to the northern area of Alameda Estate to improve pedestrian access.

Mr Speaker, enforcement of traffic laws in Gibraltar are currently monitored by the RGP. Furthermore, there are weekly briefings for the Senior Command on Operation Roadwatch. Offences and Fixed Penalty Notices are issued by the Highways Enforcement Officers. HM Government of Gibraltar will continue to work and liaise closely with the RGP to ensure that enforcement is monitored and maintained to the appropriate levels.

Mr Speaker, in using the phrase 'long term' within the context of the draft Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan, this is to be taken as being a period of between six to ten years and beyond.

In conclusion, Mr Speaker, I am happy to state that consultations with the Gibraltar Taxi Association are presently ongoing to improve the quality of the service to users and any possible changes arising out of these discussions with the GTA will be announced where necessary. The purpose of these discussions are to help improve the service already being provided.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Hon. Minister for the very comprehensive answer that he has given. He has in fact, on this occasion answered I think most of the questions I have asked and the supplementaries will therefore arise out of the answers that he has given, that I have scribbled quickly as he gave it.

In relation to the exclusion of non-public service, non-eco-friendly traffic and congestion charging for Gibraltar, I recognise that those are nuclear options if one can describe them like that. It is perhaps quite appropriate in the sense that they would be the hardest ones for a community of our kind to stomach. However, I mention them in the context of the longer-term solutions in the plan and the reason I ask that particular question, which he has answered by saying six to ten years and beyond, is because it strikes me, Mr Speaker, and unnecessarily this will be a political point, but I give due warning of it, that any revolutionary, any genuinely ground-breaking, gain-changing initiatives contained within the plan – and there are a couple, or three – are contained in the longer term outlook.

Would the Minister agree that the plan, good as it is as I have described publicly and repeat here, does not go far enough in terms of setting out ambitions with clearly set out goals and objectives in terms of the

development within this community of alternative forms of transport such as the personal rapid transit system and ultimately solutions such as congestion charges and anything but eco-friendly traffic being excluded from the city walls, as possibilities?

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, in view of the very long winded prelude, can I just have the question? With all the hon. Gentleman just said, I am lost within... what is the exact question he is trying to ask?

**Hon. S M Figueras:** The question I suppose, if it can be summarised – it was complex but certainly not long-winded, Mr Speaker (*Laughter*) – whether the Minister agrees with the assessment that the plan can perhaps be accused of having fallen short in respect of setting clearly defined, long-term goals and objectives and that in doing so, it has failed to seize the opportunity of this momentum that we see in this community, of establishing what perhaps some might describe as lofty goals as something realistic that this community can achieve, including but not limited to, ideas such as excluding vehicular traffic which is non-eco-friendly and non-public service from within the city walls, or a congestion charge – which is not to say that a GSD Opposition would be pursuing that, but certainly I am keen to understand what the Minister's assessment of that is.

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, I sincerely struggle with the length of the questions. But I cannot agree, remember as I said before, this is a draft plan and if what the hon. Member is asking for is set times and dates similar to what they had when they wrote theirs out, which was a checklist – in fact I do not recall them having timeframes but I do recall a checklist of things as and when they were being done – I do not think the draft plan which has been produced now for the public deems it necessary to have timeframes of when we are going to do this or when we are going to do that and how long are long term and short term etc. As the plan comes out, as we develop the plan, if the Government feels that there is a need to pinpoint timeframes to these things, we will do.

A lot of these things are dependent upon others so there is a domino and cascading effect and you probably want to do things slowly to give people time to react and respond, time to get used to things. If we do these game changing changes, as the hon. Member is mentioning, people are resistant to change. People worry about change. Again, I do not want to go into St Joseph's, because we have had chance to discuss that, but even minor changes do... People are concerned whatever you do. So I think we have to be very careful how we roll things out, we have to be very clear that things depend on other things and we will need to take this as they come.

So again, I do not agree that at this stage of the plan there was any need whatsoever to set dates because dates need to be adhered to. That is something which is clear and the Opposition will hold us to account if I say by 3rd April we will have this done and it is not done. So at this stage there is absolutely no need in my mind that we should have gone the other route. Again, this is a public document, tomorrow is the closing date, let us see what comes from it and then we will have – within a short period of time hopefully – we will have the full document which will not only include the non-technical part of things which is what we have seen now but will also have the technical details of the plan which some people may be interested in, in learning the statistics and all the research that came as part of the plan.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** I am grateful for that answer. Moving on, Mr Speaker, in relation to parking and charging for same in the city centre, much as I personally and certainly this party welcomes the initiative because it is clearly one of the strategies that can be deployed in putting – not necessarily putting people off using their cars, but incentivising them somehow to get where they are going somehow else.

Much as that aspect of the plan might be welcome, how does the Minister, if he would be so kind as to answer, juxtapose that with the commitment to free resident parking so colourfully displayed in the general election manifesto in 2011?

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, they are totally different things. A residential parking scheme is where people reside and there necessarily might not be a need to... Let us analyse what the reasons for paid parking are.

I think that you want to charge people to park so that they do not stay there all day, so in areas where there should be a flow of people, there should be a circulation of vehicles like for example the city centre. So if you want to go down to do a bit of shopping or go and have a coffee or you want to meet someone, then if we do not have areas which are dedicated to pay and display for example, people would not move their vehicles so it does not give enough opportunity for everyone to benefit from going into town.

So there are clearly areas which will require some sort of method which will allow people to go in and guarantee a parking and there are other areas of Gibraltar within more residential areas and there may not be a need for pay and display for that reason.



Now, there may also be a need to have combinations of, because as I said initially one of the reason why the previous plan was put on hold, was because there were many, many complaints that emanated from the North District Plan and that was because anybody going to visit a family member or anybody going in that wanted to deliver a plate of food to someone's home could not do so because there was nowhere to park.

So there may be reasons why one may wish to combine areas of free residential parking with a small limited number of visitors parking, which could be controlled or not by way of pay and display, it could be way of signage which says no more than 30 minutes like we have in Waterport Road, there are numerous methods which can be used to encourage people, so that people do not stay with the parking for long periods of time. So that is why I say they are different issues.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful for the answer. Again, it flies in the face of the expression in their own manifesto for 2011 of the very good looking but unfortunately never to pass two-tier multi-level underground car park below Commonwealth Park, where the manifesto itself had a signed 'free parking' for residents and the manifesto itself said it would be free for residents of Gibraltar, not for residents of the area.

But moving on, as I am keen to do Mr Speaker, he also mentioned in relation to the question of the St Joseph's School reorganisation pilot scheme, has he now received a significant amount of representations from neighbours in the area and are these representations and concerns being taken into account? In particular, representations from people who frequent the area and are now unable to negotiate the area because they are diverted in another direction.

Could the Hon. Minister please provide us with a flavour of how it is that he is hoping to balance the needs of residents and users alike?

**Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, referring to our manifesto whereby the hon. Gentleman keeps referring to our underground parking scheme, I must remind the hon. Gentleman that this was always subject to a technical survey. It was something that was placed in our manifesto, but it was always subject to a technical survey.

But the manifesto commitment still holds. We said that we would provide double the amount of parking in that area and this is something which you will be pleased to know will happen. Whether the package whereby the cars are kept is underground or multi-storey or floating in space does not matter. I think that what the commitment is that we will increase, we will double – (*Interjection*) I am sorry if what I am saying sounds ridiculous, because I think the constant badgering about that, I think is dead and it is ridiculous. This is why I think it requires that little bit of a ridiculous response back just to prove a point.

Now coming to the St Joseph's parking scheme, remember one thing as I told the hon. Gentleman earlier. Yes, there have been complaints by, in fact from members of the public. You will note that there have been numerous complaints from the same people, so if we look at the amount of complaints, there have been up to five, seven complaints from the same individual on different days saying, 'Well this is my complaint for Monday, Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday and Friday.'

There are people who are adamant that they do not want this to work because it affects them and as I said, a traffic plan is something which we have to understand will not be popular for everyone. But it is not this Government's intention or any Government's intention for that matter, to do something which is unpopular or something which is wrong or flawed. Everyone is seeking what is right and what will help everyone in the long term. And I have used this example when we were on *Viewpoint*, when Main Street was pedestrianised originally; the complaints were incredible, I am told. It was viewed that people did not want that, nightlife in town would cease, we were losing a road, etc.

If today you tell people that we are going to introduce cars into Main Street, there would be another uproar about that. So as change comes, people I think need time to settle (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) so it is not the Government's intention, just because a pilot plan is perhaps being perceived as not working to a certain sector of the community we are now going to turn back and say let us stop that because it is not popular, let us go with this instead and that is not popular either, so let us not do anything because we are going to rock the boat whatever we do.

I think it takes a brave Government to say that we are going to give this time and if it fails in the longer term, then we will have to re-assess. (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) There are many things that can be done as well because we want this, we want people to come and complain and even say positive things about it because it is only this way that we will be able to see how it works. People are good to complain but they are not very good to say well it works.

You will be surprised that there have been no positive comments from people coming from wherever to drop their kids off there. That would be expected because these people now benefit from areas to be able to drop their kids or their grandchildren off or whatever, it is just the people who are in the area. Now we may have to adapt it, where at the moment there are around 30 spaces which are there for people to come and drop off their kids, maybe we need to bring that down to 15.

2590 Everything is fluid so as I said, we really appreciate the patience of people who live in the area, we appreciate the comments coming through, we will now be able to see clearly what the views are and the Government in due course will take a decision of what will happen.

2595 **Hon. S M Figueras:** One final supplementary, Mr Speaker and I am grateful for the answer that he has given in relation to that.

Would the Minister, however though, concede that perhaps some more time might have been given to the residents of St Joseph's to assimilate the changes given that they were announced in a summary which was published and was said to go to consultation but then the scheme was effectively, to use quite an unkind word, 'foisted' on the residents within a couple of days? (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) That is the only point I would make in that regard and would the Hon. Minister perhaps concur that that might be a reasonable view to take?

2605 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, I mean I see what the hon. Gentleman is asking and I wonder to myself, if we take too long to do things, we take too long to do things; if we do things quickly, it is done too quickly. (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) (*Banging on desks*) So it is very difficult to get it right. But I think the purpose of... Remember what we have not done is conducted all our pilot schemes at once throughout the whole area, we have done something quickly just to gauge a response and I think it has been extremely effective because this was the intention of this, we are going to launch the traffic plan, we are going to set this pilot scheme up quickly. Yes, you think, let us give people time to read the document. Well, they had a few days, the plan was out on a Thursday, I think it was, and this happened on a Wednesday so people had a bit of time but we wanted to just throw something out there to see what the response would be and I think in that respect it has been positive.

2610 Now as I said, if we give people more time it is a problem, if we give them less time it is a problem, so I think it is a matter of opinion. You have your opinion and we have ours.

2615 **A Member:** Hear, hear. (*Banging on desks*)

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, may I –

2620 **Mr Speaker:** A very short supplementary I hope.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** May I please put a short supplementary, Mr Speaker?

2625 Would the Minister for Transport commit himself in this House that he will consult closely with his colleague the Minister for Education? Because in all these arrangements at St Joseph's Schools, and there are two schools there, we are taking into account residents and we are taking into account parents or grandparents who deliver the children, but there has been no mention... and I hope this House reassures the teaching staff of both St Joseph's Schools that their needs, since they have to be in school before the arrival of any pupils to open the gate and for safety reasons, that their needs will also be taken on board in the consultation process.

2630 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, there is plenty of consultation between the Ministry for Transport and the Ministry for Education. We do discuss ideas constantly and especially when it comes to school children: ideas that I may have that I pass to the hon. Member for his opinion, he then sometimes seeks the opinion of the experts who are there at ground level. So yes, Mr Speaker, the consultation not only does it exist but it will continue existing as long as we are here.

**Mr Speaker:** The House will now recess until 3.00 p.m. this afternoon for Chief Minister's Questions.

*The House recessed at 1.08 p.m.*



# PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

AFTERNOON SESSION: 3.00 p.m. – 6.55 p.m.

Gibraltar, Thursday, 19th February 2015

## Business transacted

<b>Questions for Oral Answer .....</b>	<b>4</b>
Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change .....	4
Q93-97/2015 ERDF Operational Programme 2014-20 – Renewable Energy Action Plan .....	4
Q98/2015 New power station – Payments to successful contractor .....	7
Q99/2015 Cycling related injuries – A&E figures for last five years .....	8
Q100/2015 Mount Alvernia balconies – Safety .....	8
Q101/2015 Abdominal aortic aneurism screening – Commencement and eligibility .....	9
Q102/2015 Sponsored Patients Scheme – Review .....	10
Q103/2015 Consultants’ contract – Negotiations .....	10
Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services .....	10
Q104/2015 Cruise liner arrivals – January 2015 numbers .....	10
Standing Order 7(3) suspended to proceed with a Government Statement .....	11
Statement by the Chief Minister .....	11
<b>Questions for Oral Answer (continued) .....</b>	<b>12</b>
Chief Minister .....	12
Q181/2015 Central Register of Ultimate Beneficial Ownership – Correspondence with UK Leader of Opposition .....	12
Q182/2015 Joe Carseni – Payments made by Government .....	14
Q183-184/2015 Chief Minister’s talk in Madrid – Invitees; associated costs .....	14
Q185/2015 Plans for GBC – Update .....	24
Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services .....	25
Q105/2015 Upper Rock Nature Reserve – Visitor numbers, January 2015 .....	25
Q106-107/2015 Mid-Harbour Estate– CCTV and garage barriers .....	26
Q108/2015 Weather damage to rental homes – Details .....	27

Q109/2015 Government co-ownership housing projects – Unsold homes .....	28
Q110 & 117/2015 Government rental homes – Unpaid rents .....	28
Q111/2015 Reallocation of empty homes – Expenditure and details.....	29
Q112/2015 Urgent decanting from homes – Details .....	29
Q113/2015 Housing Works Agency – Seconded Building Surveyor and M/T Driver .....	30
Q114/2015 Government rental homes – Eviction of squatters.....	30
Q115/2015 Vacant flats – Details .....	30
Q116/2015 Governor’s Meadow House, Alameda Estate – Cost of resurfacing work .....	31
Question 88/2015 continued – Supplementary information .....	31
Q118-119/2015 Disability – Definition and review in law .....	31
Q120/2015 St Bernadette’s Resource Centre – Plans to increase places .....	32
Q121/2015 Supported Employment Scheme – Participating companies .....	32
Q122/2015 Dr Giraldi Inquiry – Final cost.....	32
Financial Services and Gaming .....	33
Q159/2015 Flagship events – Business development goals .....	33
Q160/2015 Finance Centre Department travel expenses – Details .....	34
Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information .....	35
Q161/2015 Supply teachers and/or support auxiliary staff – Details .....	35
Q162/2015 Government subsidised students outside Gibraltar – Full details.....	36
Deputy Chief Minister .....	47
Q180/2015 European Single Skies – Gibraltar’s inclusion .....	47
Question 184/2015 continued – Supplementary information .....	48
<b>Questions for Written Answer.....</b>	<b>48</b>
<i>The House recessed for 20 minutes.</i> .....	49
<b>Order of the Day .....</b>	<b>49</b>
Bills .....	49
First and Second Reading .....	49
Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – First Reading approved.....	49
Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved.....	49
Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting .....	51
Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 – First Reading approved.....	51
Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved .....	51
Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 – Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting.....	52
Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 – First Reading approved.....	52
Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved .....	53
Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 – Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting .....	54
International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014 – First Reading approved .....	54
International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014 – Second Reading approved ..	54
International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014 – Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting .....	54
Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – First Reading approved.....	55

Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved .....	55
Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting	55
Committee Stage and Third Reading .....	56
Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Clauses considered and approved .....	56
Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 – Clauses considered and approved .....	57
Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 – Clauses considered and approved .....	59
International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2009 – Clauses considered and approved .....	59
Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Clauses considered and approved .....	59
Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014; Tobacco (Amendment) Bill 2014; Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014; International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Bill 2014; and Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Third Readings approved: Bills passed .....	60
Government Motion .....	60
Royal Anglian Regiment – Conferring of Freedom of the City of Gibraltar – Motion carried unanimously .....	60
Personal Statement by the Leader of the Opposition .....	62
Adjournment .....	62
<i>The House adjourned at 6.55 p.m.</i> .....	62

# The Gibraltar Parliament

*The Parliament resumed at 3.00 p.m.*

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: P E Martinez Esq *in attendance*]

## Questions for Oral Answer

### HEALTH, THE ENVIRONMENT, ENERGY AND CLIMATE CHANGE

**Q93-97/2015**

#### **ERDF Operational Programme 2014-20 – Renewable Energy Action Plan**

**Mr Speaker:** In the absence of the Chief Minister, we are going to proceed with questions to the Hon. the Minister for Health and the Environment.

5      **Question 93.**

**Clerk:** Question 93, the Hon. J J Netto.

10      **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Environment say if the Gibraltar Climate Change Taskforce has now finalised the Renewable Energy Action Plan as stated in the new ERDF programme plan and if so, will the Hon. Minister provide a copy to Parliament?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

15      **Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 94 to 97.

**Clerk:** Question 94, the Hon. J J Netto.

20      **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Environment state from which renewable sources we are currently obtaining 3.1 MW/year of renewable energy as stated on page 5 of the ERDF Operational Programme 2014-20 stating the individual amounts by each source and whether this is produced by the Government or privately?

25      **Clerk:** Question 95, the Hon. J J Netto.

30      **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, given the statement on page 11 of the ERDF Operational Programme in which it states that Gibraltar is an excellent for placing solar and wind production, can the Minister for the Environment say if any wind turbines are envisaged to be erected during this new programme and if so, provide a statement to Parliament?

**Clerk:** Question 96, the Hon. J J Netto.

35      **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Environment say if we have already had a project that has been partly funded or in the process of being funded through the new ERDF programme. If so, could the Hon. Minister provide details of such?

**Clerk:** Question 97, the Hon. J J Netto.

40 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Environment say if the Government or any other organisation working for the Government is likely to obtain any funding from the new ERDF programme as a result of the new power station to be built?

45 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

**Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, in answer to Question 93 yes, Mr Speaker. A copy of the plan will be provided electronically during the course of this afternoon.

50 The figure included in the ERDF Programme Report indicating that 3.1 MW/year was being generated from renewable sources was based on a previously estimated forecast base line that Gibraltar would be generating approximately 0.002% of its total electricity requirement from renewable energy sources. The figure should have been correctly expressed as 310,000 kWh per year.

55 Moreover, it should be stressed that the figure used was an estimate since forecasting the actual electrical output from renewables per annum is as difficult – particularly in solar power – as trying to forecast the weather for a whole year.

The actual recorded production of renewable energy fed into the network in 2014 – and this is the first time this has ever been done – was 123,880.5 kWh. With the exception of the solar photovoltaic systems set up in Sir William Jackson Grove and the swimming pool, which are operated by private companies all the remaining sources were produced by the Gibraltar Electrical Authority. The complete breakdown is as follows: the GSLA Swimming Pool – 85,218 kWh; bus stops – 17,798 kWh; King's Wharf Car Park – 2,706 kWh; the Frontier – 1,503 kWh; various street lights – 601 kWh; Sir William Jackson Grove – 16,054.5 kWh.

65 The Government is currently investigating the feasibility of installing wind turbines in both onshore and/or offshore environments. It is currently not possible to ascertain whether any wind turbines will be erected during the new programme period until all the required assessments are carried out.

It is nevertheless the Government's desire to generate renewable energy from wind turbines by the year 2018 as highlighted in Gibraltar's National Renewable Energy Action Plan of which a copy, as I said earlier, will be forwarded this afternoon.

70 To date there are no projects that have been partly funded or in the process of being funded under the new ERDF programme and finally, Mr Speaker, there is no present intention for ERDF money to be used in the funding of the new power station.

**Hon. J J Netto:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Hon. Minister for the information given and also indeed for providing the report I have asked for.

75 In relation to one of the questions that deals with the possibility of introducing wind turbines, I think the Minister said that they were looking at a number of places both onshore and offshore. Could perhaps the Minister elaborate a bit more in relation to the specific areas they are looking at to see whether it is feasible or not, at this stage anyway?

80 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, the wind turbine technology is progressing and now it is increasingly possible to generate a considerable amount of wind energy from smaller plants and also plants that rotate on a vertical access rather than a horizontal access, which obviously means there is no danger to birds which is a concern that I have often had and we have had this conversation before, when the hon. Member opposite was Minister.

85 Therefore, because of the possibility of smaller, non-dangerous wind turbines, there are a number of possibilities in Gibraltar which would have to be assessed from the point of view of the wind and also the visual impact. There are in fact some wind turbines now that almost look like artificial trees and there are a number of locations, possibly the Europa Point area for that sort of thing.

90 As far as offshore wind turbines are concerned, we are beginning a number of studies to ascertain wind velocity and reliability of wind and these would clearly likely be, but this is not a commitment, off the east side of Gibraltar. But it is very early stages yet but because this technology is progressing, it is something that we need to look into for the future.

95 **Hon. J J Netto:** I am grateful, Mr Speaker. Could the Minister perhaps indicate whether any sort of feasibility study has been provided to the Government and to the Department of the Environment in relation to the possibility of installing some wind turbines at the Detached Mole and in the Upper Rock Nature Reserve?

100 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I will start with the last one. The Upper Rock Nature Reserve to my mind is not a suitable location because of the other types of environmental impact. There have been studies

carried out in the past on the Detached Mole and that is one area that one will have to consider. But I recall those studies from quite a way back and those are obviously still there but we are looking at other areas because we know the Detached Mole has other possibilities as well for the future.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, exactly, that is precisely what I was thinking about when I was listening to the exchanges between the Hon. Minister and my colleague Mr Netto, that there are studies that indicate that actually the best place to site wind turbines – and now even more so because you have got these vertical ones that operate almost like a corkscrew technology – is in the Detached Mole.

Bearing in mind that the Government – any Government, it does not matter whether it is them or us – will have to have 20% renewable energy by 2020, it does seem to us like a waste of space actually locating the liquefied natural gas there.

I have to say that if we were to win the next election that is precisely what we would be looking to use, the Detached Mole, in order to build these wind turbines because it is the ideal location. Does he not agree with me that there are these studies that appear to indicate that that is the best location in Gibraltar for wind technology?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** If the Member opposite were to win the next election, I can assure you, Mr Speaker, that there will be less renewable energy than if I am in the winning team next time. But anyway there we are, I could not resist that one, Mr Speaker. (*Laughter*)

The studies at the time indicate that of the areas studied, the Detached Mole did in fact seem to be one of the best locations. I cannot confirm whether it is the best because my recollection is not as acute as that, it is a little while since I read the report and clearly that is a possibility.

At the time I am not sure whether offshore wind farms were being considered, these are obviously very expensive and you have to measure up the investment and the return of that investment and as technology progresses it will be better. So that is a possibility.

I will not comment on the location of liquid natural gas because the final decision on that and where that will go has not been taken and obviously it is not a supplementary to this particular question but it is a supplementary to other exchanges that there has been over the last few days.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, bearing in mind that on this side of the House we have been publishing our policies in relation to a number of areas where in our view, we have been breaking away from past practices of keeping cards close to one's chest and publishing a policy that people can see what the GSD is about and what the GSD is going to be doing if it were to get into Government, well in advance of the General Election, may I invite him to consider this policy that we feel is an attractive one and would help in assisting the Government to meet, any Government, to meet its 20% quota by 2020?

It is having a system whereby private residences can plug into the distribution network and incentivise through tax incentives for example, those private residences building say for example solar panels, so that if there is a net production of electricity by the private individual within his home, they can then effectively plug that into the system so that they are net producers of electricity, those homes, and then the Government will give them some kind of credit for example in relation to electricity. Is that something that the Government can consider as a policy and adopt themselves?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I claim some credit for the conversion of the Members opposite to the environmental movement (*Laughter*) and you cannot deny that. (*Interjection*)

Anyway, Mr Speaker, it is a very good idea but it is not exclusively the idea of the Member opposite. We are in fact currently discussing the question of feed-in tariffs for this sort of initiative. In fact already, there is, as I have said, some solar power being fed into the grid for the first time but these are in Government buildings so obviously there is not the same need for a feed-in tariff. But absolutely, this will probably be rolled out I suspect before the next election, so he will not be able to get the credit for it, whether or not he wins it. (*Laughter*)

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I have to say that I did not know that the Government was thinking of doing this. It seemed to me to be a good idea just based on my reading that other jurisdictions were doing it and I am delighted that the Government has, as it were, decided to adopt this particular policy, which is a policy that we were in fact going to be announcing ourselves when we announce how we would meet the 20% requirement by 2020.

Now, Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman has spoken about wind turbines. The hon. Gentleman has spoken and indeed the Government has installed solar panels as well. What other forms of renewable energy does the Government envisage it will be adopting in order to meet this 20% requirement by 2020?



**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I have to be careful because if I give too much away, I may actually be writing the hon. Member's manifesto. *(Laughter)*

The sea is clearly one. As we have announced we have one initiative which is looking at wave energy and we have one or two others and I say one or two because I am not sure whether one of those two is still on the cards in which we are looking at the use of marine currents. The technology there is much newer and it is not completely tried and tested, but we are encouraging developers of this technology to come and use Gibraltar to carry out these tests and we will shortly be carrying out some marine current surveys off the south west of Gibraltar, to see if there is enough to generate electricity from that source.

So the wind, the sun and the sea are the three main ones that I think will be applicable to Gibraltar.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I agree entirely with him that those are the three areas. May I invite the hon. Gentleman that perhaps he might meet myself and also the Shadow Minister for the Environment Mr Netto, because it strikes me that this is one of those areas where perhaps – it does not matter what Government or what political persuasion there may be after the next election – that we could do with continuity of policy irrespective of who is in Government. There is an obligation –

I will give way to Mr Licudi – do you want me to give way?

**Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Yes, Mr Speaker, I am very happy for him to give way.

I can confirm that there will be continuity of policy, because we will win the next election. *(Laughter)*

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, thank you very much for that comment. Since the hon. Gentleman was stripped away from his most important portfolios, he has obviously got very little to say. **(Several Members: Ooh!)**

May I return to the main purpose of this supplementary, and it is an invitation to meet with myself and his Shadow on this side of the House, to perhaps try and pool ideas so that there is continuity of policy in terms of the environment looking towards 2020, where there is clearly this requirement for there to be the provision of 20% renewable energy. It is an invitation I make publicly to the hon. Gentleman as a sign of good faith and also as a sign of the constructive politics that we are certainly about, particularly in this area.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I have been teaching the Members opposite about the environment for several decades. I have no problem in continuing to do so.

**A Member:** Hear, hear. *(Laughter and banging on desks)*

#### Q98/2015

#### New power station – Payments to successful contractor

**Clerk:** Question 98, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, I think we might be less constructive on this question.

Mr Speaker, how much has the Government paid the successful contractor thus far, in respect of the contract to build the new power station?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

**Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, no payments have yet been made.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is the reason for that because effectively the Government only has £52 million *(Laughter)* worth of reserves, Mr Speaker, **(A Member: Hear, hear.)** and in fact can only borrow another £51 million before it reaches the legal borrowing limit – therefore this Government is yes, skint and does not have the money in order to pay for the £77 million for the power station before the end of the financial year?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** No, Mr Speaker, not at all. The first payment as far as the agreement is concerned is not due until April.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is that pursuant to a request that the Government has made of this particular company that no invoices are submitted until after 31st March because prior to 31st March the Government is skint and does not have the money to pay for outlays of this nature?

220 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the Member opposite will remember that I became Minister responsible for energy two days before we signed the contract so it took me very little time to sort that one out, didn't it?

So the arrangements were made prior to that but I am absolutely certain that this was just part of what was programmed and that the relevance of what the hon. Member opposite has said is just non-existent.

225

**Hon. D A Feetham:** And, Mr Speaker, can he confirm that the £77 million for this particular power station and indeed, it is going to be nearer £140 million – actually slightly more than £140 million for a variety of reasons, but let us just concentrate on the £77 million – that the £77 million is going to be paid out of the Consolidated Fund and that no monies that have been deposited by the Government, or caused by the Government from Credit Finance to Gibraltar Investment Holdings Limited is going to be used in order to pay for this particular project?

230

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I would have thought so but I have answered the question. This is a supplementary that I do not think I have to answer but I do not think it is relevant. No payments have been made and the intricacies of how the payments are being made do not fall under my area of responsibility. Therefore I think that should be asked more specifically again on a future occasion.

235

**Q99/2015**  
**Cycling related injuries –**  
**A&E figures for last five years**

**Clerk:** Question 99, the Hon. S M Figueras.

240 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Health provide details of the number of cycling related injuries dealt with by the A&E department at the Hospital on a month by month basis for the last five years?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

245

**Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the information is not accessible as it is recorded as a road traffic accident and is not specifically recorded as a cycling accident. So I am not able to provide that information.

250 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, just one supplementary. In the context of everything that we were discussing this morning and we are not going to labour the point at all this afternoon, is looking at the possibility of somehow categorising incidents in that way something that the Government might look at? Thank you.

255 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, on receiving this answer, it became apparent that there are some categories that could be subdivided more greatly. Clearly, we do not want the staff at A&E to spend too much time on recording and less time on treating, but with the advent of the electronic health record and the A&E module is due to come on line in just a couple of months, we are looking at actually being able to key in more categories so that more information will be accessible in the future.

**Q100/2015**  
**Mount Alvernia balconies –**  
**Safety**

260

**Clerk:** Question 100, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister responsible for Elderly Care advise whether the newly refurbished balconies at Mount Alvernia are safe and are open for use by the service users and their families?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

**Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, yes sir, the refurbishment of Mount Alvernia balconies and façades received their approval notice and certificate of completion, number 7229, from the Department of Planning and Building Control. The Health and Safety Plan was approved by the Planning Supervisor of Technical Services.

Mobile residents and relatives can enjoy the use of the balconies whenever they wish. The balustrades have been designed to a height to maintain safety measures and all risk assessments have been carried out by the Health and Safety Officer.

Presently we are in the process of implementing disabled accessible ramps for balcony access for those in wheelchairs. However, the premises were completed in the 1960s when no requirement for disability was in place and therefore we have issues that are being assessed in order to find the best option for wheelchair users.

All balconies have awnings for the summer period which is the best time for residents to enjoy the sunshine and view. Residents are happy that finally they now have a splendid view of the bay, resplendent in the beautiful light of the new dawn that this Government has brought about, (*Laughter*) as they have previously had the scaffolding blocking their view and making their rooms dull for more than 12 years. (*Applause*)

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, when have these particular balconies been opened for members of the public and also for service users? The hon. Lady has said the summer, but I have been there visiting a relative of mine and I was told that the balconies were not accessible to service users because the Government was still assessing whether it was safe for service users to be able to use them.

Now that was in December and those reports are actually coming to us thick and fast and that is the reason why this particular question has been asked. Is he aware that service users are being prevented from going onto those balconies because there is this impression on the part of staff, that it is unsafe and that the Government is looking at safety issues in relation to the balconies?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, obviously a service user with certain conditions like dementia, or whatever, would not be allowed out on their own and unescorted. I have not had this information passed to me, I have consulted my hon. Friend who was previously Minister with responsibility for the elderly and she shares that view.

I will, however, be there tomorrow afternoon – I go there as often as I can – and I will myself assess it and attempt to step onto the balcony. If there is that kind of issue I will certainly deal with it right away, but the prepared reply that I have from the officials responsible is the one that I have mentioned, clearly with a little bit of flourish added, and therefore that is the information that I have.

#### Q101/2015

#### Abdominal aortic aneurism screening – Commencement and eligibility

**Clerk:** Question 101, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul Hammond.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Health say when the abdominal aortic aneurism screening will be starting and who will be eligible for it?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

**Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Yes, Mr Speaker. The hon. Lady will be very happy to learn that the programme will be launched on 25th February – the prepared answer says 24th but actually it is 25th February – and is due to commence in March. Screening will be for men approaching their 65th birthday.

The hon. Lady will no doubt wish to congratulate the Government for this great innovation. (*Banging on desks*)

**Q102/2015**  
**Sponsored Patients Scheme –**  
**Review**

**Clerk:** Question 102, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Very welcome news, the AAA screening.

Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Health say at what stage the review of the Sponsored Patients Scheme is?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

**Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Apologies, Mr Speaker, the actual green paper was not in front of me so I thank the Deputy Chief Minister for loaning me his iPad so that I can reply from here. Oh, it has just been found, thank you. It was buried under other green papers!

Mr Speaker, yes sir, I have this week had what will have been the final meeting of the working group and I now have proposals ready for discussion and approval by Cabinet.

**Q103/2015**  
**Consultants' contract –**  
**Negotiations**

**Clerk:** Question 103, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Health say what stage the negotiations for the consultants' contract are at?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

**Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, yes sir, the negotiations are at an advanced stage with the final draft contract having just been reviewed by the GHA's legal advisers. It will be presented to Unite for final discussions within weeks.

**TOURISM, HOUSING, EQUALITY AND SOCIAL SERVICES**

**Q104/2015**  
**Cruise liner arrivals –**  
**January 2015 numbers**

**Clerk:** Question 104, the Hon. D J Bossino.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Hon. Minister for Tourism please provide details of the number of cruise liner arrivals for the month of January, 2015?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, two cruise ships arrived in Gibraltar during January 2015.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I am simply making a direct comparison to the position as it was last year, I have not had the opportunity of looking at previous seasons and years and to see whether this is a trend and which direction it is going. But certainly, the difference between January 2014 and January 2015 is in effect three less.

Does she have an explanation as to why that is the case? Had she prepared that as an expected supplementary from me?

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, I do have the figures for the expected annual figures which we expect during the course of the year, not just the month, and we have an additional 216 ships expected in 2015, no sorry 216 ships are expected in total which is 35 more than last year.

365 I would like to add to that that passenger numbers will also be up.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Yes Mr Speaker, that is the expectation but does she have an explanation as to why there were three less from last year?

370 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, this is a fluid arrangement so companies' itineraries fluctuate from time to time.

**Standing Order 7(3) suspended  
to proceed with a Government Statement**

**Mr Speaker:** The Hon. the Chief Minister.

375 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I beg to move under Standing Order 7(3), to suspend Standing Order 7(1) in order to proceed with a Government Statement.

**Mr Speaker:** Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye) Those against? Carried.  
The Chief Minister.

**STATEMENT BY THE CHIEF MINISTER**

380

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, as hon. Members are aware, the Foreign Secretary, the Right Hon. Philip Hammond MP, is today in Madrid for the purposes of meeting with the Spanish Foreign Secretary Sñr Garcia Margallo y Marfil. I have this afternoon heard from the Foreign Secretary after he has finished his meeting with Sñr Margallo.

385

As hon. Members will also be aware, the Foreign Secretary has in the past months, been embarked on a tour of European Capitals holding talks with all EU partners in respect of EU reform. This visit was part of that tour and included discussion of the Foreign Policy challenges the UK and Spain share, including continuing Russian-backed aggression in Ukraine and the threat of global terrorism.

390

The Foreign Secretary has confirmed that during the course of the meetings with his Spanish counterpart, he also took the opportunity – as we had agreed that he would – to raise the concerns of the UK Government and those of HM Government of Gibraltar.

In particular, the Foreign Secretary raised the issue of the continued incursions by Spanish state vessels into British Gibraltar Territorial Waters which he told Sñr Margallo are illegal under international law and therefore unacceptable.

395

He also raised the continued delays at the frontier between Gibraltar and Spain.

The Foreign Secretary has also confirmed that he told his Spanish counterpart, as we had agreed, that Spain needs to address delays at the border, which the European Commission has already found to be disproportionate.

400

Further, and also as agreed between us, Mr Hammond raised our joint disappointment at Spain's holding up EU aviation legislation by seeking to exclude Gibraltar, in a blatant further breach of the Córdoba Agreements, which the UK and Gibraltar continue to honour, and are EU law.

Mr Hammond restated our common call for a return to dialogue in order to deal with these and all other issues and matters of mutual interest to people who live and work on both sides of the frontier.

405

Mr Speaker, the House will be pleased to note that, in that context, the Foreign Secretary reminded Sñr Margallo that the UK remains strongly committed to the Trilateral Forum for dialogue. He also told him that until we can return to that forum, we in the United Kingdom and Gibraltar will continue to work towards ad hoc talks, involving all relevant parties, on issues of mutual interest.

The Foreign Secretary informed me that Sñr Margallo has made a further proposal in this respect today which the Government will now be further considering with UK colleagues.

410

Mr Speaker, no-one should confuse, or allow anyone else to confuse them into thinking that the raising of the issues about Gibraltar today amounted in any way to a bilateral negotiation about Gibraltar. No such negotiation will be acceptable to the people or Government of Gibraltar and this House.

Indeed the UK, through its Foreign Secretary, has confirmed again today in Madrid, its strong commitment to the Trilateral Forum and its and our hopes to return to that forum whenever possible.

415 As Ministers have already stated, Spain is a key partner for the UK, as it is for Gibraltar, but the UK/Spain bilateral relationship is not as strong as it could be due to recent Spanish actions towards Gibraltar and its people.

Mr Speaker, in that context, the Government is pleased that the position set out by the Foreign Secretary in Madrid is exactly in keeping with what was agreed between us and entirely represents the position of the Government and people of Gibraltar.

Mr Speaker, I trust that this statement will assist in informing the House as to the events of today in Madrid. This is what has delayed me from arriving in time for three o'clock this afternoon.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker, certainly from this side of the House, 'no to bilateralism, yes to trilateralism' is our policy and has been our policy for over 16 years. So in that sense, Mr Speaker, we associate ourselves with the sentiments expressed by the Chief Minister and we certainly welcome that that is the position that has been made clear by the Foreign Secretary to the Foreign Secretary of Spain in Madrid.

But, Mr Speaker, the Hon. the Chief Minister spoke about further proposals being made by Sñr Margallo and I wonder whether in the interests of providing a full statement to this House about the report that has been provided to him of that meeting in Madrid, if he can give us some further information about what that further proposal from the Spanish side entails?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, not at this stage. The Government is considering the proposal made, it has literally just come in and I do not think it is in the interests of the community that without having an opportunity to consider something that we should make a statement about it, it is literally less than half an hour since I have had the benefit of communications from the Foreign Secretary in respect of the subject.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, is he prepared to brief me in private as to the proposal that has been made. I am not asking the Government to comment on the proposal, to say whether the proposal is good or bad, but at the very least for the Government to brief the Opposition on what is that proposal that has been made by the Spanish Foreign Secretary to his counterpart, Mr Hammond?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, as he knows, I am quite happy to brief him in private if he wishes, on the basis of complete confidentiality. We have business to be getting on with now and I will be quite happy to brief him afterwards. That is why this Government is the one that is going to pursue the establishment of the Chief Minister's Consultative Council, to enable that sort of communication to occur, but it will be on the basis of strict and utter confidentiality.

**Mr Speaker:** We will now proceed with questions to the Chief Minister.  
Question 181.

## Questions for Oral Answer (continued)

### CHIEF MINISTER

Q181/2015

#### Central Register of Ultimate Beneficial Ownership – Correspondence with UK Leader of Opposition

**Clerk:** Question 181, the Hon. D J Bossino.

455 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Chief Minister state whether he has received a reply to his letter to the UK's Leader of the Opposition in relation to comments regarding the implementation of a Central Register of Ultimate Beneficial Ownership?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

460 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, yes sir.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I have had the opportunity of reading the Hon. the Chief Minister's letter, I think I saw it posted on Twitter and I have also had the benefit of reading some details in a press release he issued in relation to this point, so I know what he said. But can he give me an indication of what the Right Hon. UK Leader of the Opposition told him in response?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I had various conversations with the Leader of the Opposition since he received my letter, and I think he now understands why it was that Gibraltar felt it was important that he should understand the issues relating to the Central Register, the progress Gibraltar in particular makes together with the United Kingdom and all other 28 member states of the European Union in respect of financial services matters, where we stand on whether such a register should be public or not.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Do I take it that the reply has not been done formally in writing but by way of telephone conversations? Is that what he is telling me? I have a further supplementary, just that detail.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well I do not think there is any formality that is attributed to something which is in writing which is not attributed to something which happens on the telephone or in conversation. It was a formal response to the issues that I put in writing.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, he I am sure will agree with me when I say that this was a matter of crucial importance for Gibraltar and the way that the Right Hon. the UK Leader of the Opposition represented Gibraltar's status with regard to this in particular misstated the position in relation to Gibraltar's position in relation to this matter.

Is there, as a result of those conversations, any possibility of the Labour Party in the United Kingdom, particularly its leader, to retract publicly the statement it has made, at least insofar as it affects Gibraltar's position in relation to this point? Is there any possibility of that happening? I was pretty shocked, I am sure as he was, when – I think it was on a Sunday – the report of this policy was made in the news media in the UK, and Gibraltar featured very much in it when I went through all the different Overseas Territories. I think it did quite a lot of unfair damage in terms of what he said.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, which part is it that he thinks should be retracted? It is up to you. The hon. Gentleman has asked me whether I think any part of it is going to be retracted. Which part of the letter from the Leader of the Opposition is it that he is asking me there is a chance would be retracted?

If he does not want to answer that to enable me to answer his question it is up to him, but I mean...

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I have asked the question and I expect an answer from the Chief Minister. Certain disparaging comments were made in relation, not just to the Overseas Territories, but Gibraltar within the Overseas Territories, which caused him to come out in I think in *Sky News* and various other news media outlets to defend Gibraltar's position and made him write a letter, quite a strongly worded letter, to the Leader of the Opposition.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I have been asked a question, which was is there a chance that the Leader of the Opposition in the UK is going to retract any part of his letter, and I am saying which part of the letter is it that the hon. Gentleman is asking me is there a chance he will retract?

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, generally the statements that he made, the policy statement in relation to the blacklisting of Gibraltar in relation to the OECD. It was a threatening letter which he certainly sent to at least one of the Overseas Territories, published in Twitter, I think by the editor of the *Gibraltar Chronicle*. I am not sure that the Hon. the Chief Minister received a similar letter to that. I assume he did but I am not sure whether he did, but certainly he threatened that unless the Overseas Territories got their act in order in relation to central registers, he would ask the OECD to blacklist us.

In relation to that, I would have thought that if there has been a clarification at least as far as Gibraltar is concerned of its position, that the Right Hon. Gentleman should retract the issue publicly, at least in relation to that specific issue.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, look, I am afraid the hon. Gentleman needs to show this Parliament an element of respect by at least coming a bit more prepared for these sessions.

The letter that the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition in the United Kingdom sent to all the Leaders of the Overseas Territories was published in generic form in *The Guardian*. It was published on Saturday, Mr

520 Speaker, not on Sunday, although I acknowledge that he might not have picked that up until I replied to it, which was during the course of Sunday.

The letter, Mr Speaker, talks not about the issues so much of central registers but much more about the issue of whether beneficial ownership, which is what the central registers are about, will be available publicly if those registers are to be accessed publicly.

525 What the Leader of the Opposition in the UK said was that if within six months of their being elected the territories had not agreed to have these central registers made public, then he would ask the OECD to blacklist those territories.

He was not making any allegations, Mr Speaker, about Gibraltar which he could retract, so if the hon. Member looks at my letter, what I am telling the Leader of the Opposition in the United Kingdom is what is wrong with that policy. But it is not something he said about Gibraltar which requires retraction. Of course, as a result of his letter a lot of other people have commented about the Overseas Territories, whether we are tax havens or not and whether the issue of central registers, etc is one that is determinative of whether one is a tax haven or not. But he will have seen that my letter sets out the Gibraltar position.

530 The Gibraltar position is that we will be complying with the Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive within the transitional provision provided in the directive, once it is published, and publication is expected during the course of September of this year, with a transitional provision of two years. Now, is he asking me, have I managed to get the Leader of the Opposition to change his Party's policy in that respect? Is that the question?

**Q182/2015**

**Joe Carseni –**

**Payments made by Government**

540 **Clerk:** Question 182, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Government please state how much it has paid either directly or indirectly, and either in money or benefits, to Joe Carseni since it took office, divided into calendar years?

545 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I now hand the hon. Member a schedule with the information requested.

**ANSWER TO QUESTION 182**

	Amount Paid
2012 (w.e.f. 1st Sept 12)	£11,145.98
2013	£32,079.98
2014	£34,802.34
2015 (up to Feb-15)	£5,105.21

550 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q183-184/2015**

**Chief Minister's talk in Madrid –**

**Invitees; associated costs**

**Clerk:** Question 183, the Hon. D A Feetham.

555 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister provide a list of all people invited by Government to his recent talk in Madrid?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.



560 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, we are unable to provide the details requested at this time. The information requested requires that all accounts be reconciled.

To date we have still not received – (*Interjection*) Oh sorry, the first answer, yes. I will answer together with Question 184.

565 **Clerk:** Question 184, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister provide a breakdown of all costs associated with his recent talk in Madrid, including the cost of accommodation, travel and expenses of anyone travelling with or invited by the Government to that event?

570 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, now, we are unable to provide the details requested at this time as the information requested requires that all accounts be reconciled. To date we have still not received all invoices in order for us to complete this exercise.

575 In any event, Mr Speaker, the information will not be publicly provided. The costs of my travel, however, will be set out in the Government website when available.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister provide a reason why he cannot provide me with a list, first of all, of people that had been invited to this event in Madrid by the Government of Gibraltar and also, secondly, the people that have been paid for by the Government to go to Madrid in order to attend this talk?

580 Surely that information ought to be disclosable by the Government as something for which the Government is accountable for. This is effectively Taxpayers' money which the Government is using in order to invite people to attend this talk in Madrid and he is accountable to this House and I cannot see any conceivable reason why this information is not to be provided to this House.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, he must not have read a Spanish newspaper in the past few weeks then or is it that he does not know that at every turn, the Spanish Foreign Ministry has been trying to suggest that the opportunity afforded to the Chief Minister of Gibraltar to address a number of prominent people in Madrid – not five or six people; a very large number of prominent people in Madrid – was simply engineered and paid for by the Government of Gibraltar as a stage show.

590 Now, I have been very careful what I have told him. I have told him what I have told him before. I have said I will not give the information publicly, Mr Speaker. Now, of course we are accountable in this House for every penny of Taxpayers' money that we spend. I am quite happy to give him the information and have the discussion with him, Mr Speaker, but it is quite another for me to stand in this House and give him all the information of all the money that we have to spend in Spain, given the hostility that we face from that Government there, in order to be able to get across the message of the people of Gibraltar.

600 I have told him before in relation to another matter and I will tell him again. I am happy to give him the information, but if he does not see that it is not in the public interest of Gibraltar for that information to be, not bandied across the House, it is not just the 17 of us here, but to be made publicly available in order to have thrown in our face, then he has never heard the Spanish Foreign Minister talk about how Gibraltar uses its economic power in order to be able to get its message across.

605 It was something that was done by the previous Administration when they needed to do it in the early part of the last decade when Gibraltar faced the issue of joint sovereignty, it is something that we are having to do today in order to ensure that all of the lies and all of the defamation that there is about Gibraltar does not find itself uncounted in the Spanish press and in the Spanish media and in Spanish public opinion, but we are doing it now.

610 Now, Mr Speaker, he can have the information if he likes behind the Speaker's Chair. I am not suggesting he cannot have it and I was very careful about what I said, I will not make the information publicly available, but I am not, Mr Speaker, going to be persuaded that that is information for which there is any benefit in making public in this House to the world at large.

615 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I am afraid that he continuously uses and demeans debates and sessions in this House by constantly playing this particular card every time we ask what is a legitimate question.

Look, unless the Government effectively has engineered an attendance at the Madrid talk, by paying dozens of Spaniards accommodation and subsistence in order to get them to attend, it cannot possibly be an issue, Mr Speaker, the provision of this information.

Now in order to make it easier for the Hon. the Chief Minister, well look do not provide me with the information of those in Spain that have been invited at Government expense to attend that Madrid talk, but at least provide me with the information of those who are Gibraltar residents that have travelled to Madrid at public expense for the purpose of that talk. That surely cannot be of any sensitive nature and it would at least allow us to see whether the Taxpayers' money is being properly spent.

Because look, if what you have is a situation that out of 100 people attending that Madrid talk, 80 are from Gibraltar and they have been subsidised by the Government to go up to Madrid, then all he is doing is paying for cheerleaders to go with him to Madrid and we would say I am afraid that is not good use of Taxpayers' money.

So in order to assist him, I am drawing that distinction and perhaps he can provide me with the information as far as the local contingent is concerned.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman opposite does not care about the national interest of Gibraltar. He has given a mischievous Spanish headline writer two great opportunities to score, or attempt to score a goal against the Government of Gibraltar, which we will not have an opportunity to reply to.

The first is: '*Feetham pregunta si Picardo invita a docenas de españoles sin que tengan que pagar sus gastos para su discurso en España*' Feetham suggests that the Chief Minister of Gibraltar engineered dozens of Spaniards, all expenses paid, to his talk in Spain. The headline is enough, Mr Speaker, to damage Gibraltar. The headline is enough: he plays directly into the hands of Gibraltar's enemies, Mr Speaker.

The next one: 'Is the Chief Minister of Gibraltar paying for cheerleaders to go with him up to Spain, to Madrid?' – another *gift* to a Spanish headline writer, regardless of what the national interests of Gibraltar may be.

Such is his ambition, Mr Speaker, that he does not even see, in an infantile question like this, the potential dangers for Gibraltar. All he wants to do is to score a goal, now Mr. Speaker, on expenses because everything is now about expenses. Mr Speaker, I heard him say a moment ago before I came into the House, that Gibraltar is skint. That is the first time in the history of Gibraltar that a Leader of the Opposition has suggested that Gibraltar is bankrupt – that is what skint means.

What will Mr Margallo make of that, what will Mr Margallo make of that, or any one more of our enemies, because even in 1992 and 1996, even at every time when the dispute between this side of the House and that side of the House has been at its worst, nobody has ever suggested that Gibraltar is bankrupt, like he has this afternoon. The absolute irresponsibility of the man is just incredible, Mr Speaker.

Look, skint we are Mr Speaker: skint in this House of a good Opposition. Skint of an Opposition that knows what it is doing and skint of an Opposition that discharges its obligations loyally to Gibraltar. Absolutely skint and bankrupt, because what he is telling us, Mr Speaker, is that he wants information which he could have by simply turning on his television and watching the magnificent recording that our media made of that excellent opportunity I had in Madrid to deliver the Gibraltar point of view.

He can see who was there from Gibraltar and who was not. He can see, Mr Speaker, that there were not 80 from Gibraltar who were cheerleaders; there was actually a huge majority of people who were Spaniards, leading politicians, Mr Speaker. Not one or two, Mr Speaker. *Leading* politicians – people who are *today* in the Parliament, people who are opinion formers, people who speak for their party, not regional or municipal individuals who do not speak for their party. *Leading individuals in their party* who have restated at last the policy of the party in Opposition to continue committed to the Trilateral Forum. That is the level of achievement that the Chief Minister's speech in Madrid two weeks ago finally delivered for Gibraltar.

Not a question of taking cheerleaders anywhere. I do not need to take cheerleaders anywhere, Mr Speaker – thank goodness, I have got supporters in the places that he might least expect!

But, Mr Speaker, to hear that the first argument is that Joe Bossano, who has given his life to Gibraltar, Joseph Garcia who has given the past 30 years of his life to Gibraltar, who they used to say were so in love with Gibraltar that they could not be objective when it came to sitting down perhaps with Spaniards and considering talking about our future with them, that we all collectively want to bankrupt Gibraltar... But actually not even *want* to, Mr Speaker; today we have been told that we *have* bankrupted Gibraltar because we are skint. That we are going to blow up the whole of the western face of this Rock. And not just Bossano and Garcia, but also Cortes, Mr Speaker, the environmentalist who cared about smoke but is not going to care about a huge explosion that is going to deliver us into the Neolithic age. And that now finally, skint as we are, I am paying for the croissants and orange juices of cheerleaders, Mr Speaker.

What a pity that we are so skint of an Opposition in this House.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, the Hon. Chief Minister had shown signs that the pressure was getting to him, (*Laughter*) even before this question and answer session. But that answer demonstrates to me, just

the extent to which the pressure is getting to him. It really is proving far too much, he is carrying the office in which he serves on his shoulders. It really is bearing down on him and he cannot take the pressure.

Now, Mr Speaker, he plays on the ambition card. First it was the nationalistic card, now it is Daniel Feetham being too ambitious. I am playing to a Spanish gallery. Well, Mr Speaker, barely a few weeks after we have had the Dr Giraldi Home, where Ministers opposite participated in a programme –

**Mr Speaker:** No, no. The Dr Giraldi Home is a separate matter. There is a motion on the Order Paper and you can say whatever you want in that regard but I am not going to allow you to anticipate that motion.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, absolutely, I think the people of Gibraltar get the drift of where I was going in the light of the comments made by the Chief Minister that we on this side of the House, that we on this side of the House are playing to Spanish galleries. I have not participated in any Spanish television programme, doing the people of Gibraltar down, Mr Speaker. That is the point that I was going to be making.

But, Mr Speaker, does he not realise, the Hon. the Chief Minister, that it is actually he, with the way that he has answered this particular question, a fairly innocuous question, designed to deal with, designed to show how much the Government has actually spent on this particular event, but the way that he has answered it, he is giving ammunition does he not realise to our critics in Spain by making a mountain out of a molehill because it looks as if the Government has got something to hide.

Now I repeat, Mr Speaker, will he not at the very least provide me with the information of who exactly on the Gibraltar side went to this particular event and at what cost. There cannot possibly be any national interest in the provision of that information and that is a legitimate question, bearing in mind that he is accountable for the Taxpayers' money to this House and that goes to expenditure that the Government is incurring.

I will leave for the moment, and he can give me the information behind the Speaker's Chair if he wants to, the Spanish contingent and how much he has paid in relation to that, but surely there cannot be any excuse for the hon. Gentleman not providing me with the information in respect of whom from Gibraltar went to this event at the invitation of the Government and paid for by the Government. That is what I am interested in.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I will happily give him the information, behind the Speaker's Chair. I am not going to give him the information here, publicly. Now, Mr Netto, Mr Speaker has been overheard to use rather unparliamentary language to describe what I am full of. It is just that, the feeling is so mutual Mr Speaker, that perhaps we do not need to understand what the words used were.

Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman needs to understand what it is that he is doing. He needs to read a bit more, he needs to be a little bit more concerned about Gibraltar and a little bit less concerned about himself. I heard him say the other afternoon, Mr Speaker, in one of his – I do not know if it was the podcast which they themselves characterised as comedy when they put it up on YouTube or whether it was one of his interviews on GBC, Mr Speaker, that when he talks about things people do not realise the importance initially, but then eventually everybody realises how he has been right from the beginning and he uses an example of public finances.

You see, Mr Speaker, he said on *Newswatch*, 'I am talking about the power station now and you think this is not so important, but eventually everyone will agree with me, as they all – everyone – now agrees with me on the issue of public finances.' Well, Mr Speaker, I do not know where he gets that from! Maybe he is relying on the last poll. We do not comment on polls but maybe he is relying on the last poll that gave him an extraordinary lead of 20% over our 74% if you took out the undecided. But anyway, if that is what he is taking comfort from, maybe that is what he is working out is everybody who agrees with him in relation to public finances.

But he needs to read a bit more around the issues because you see, Mr Speaker, on that subject what he was doing in relation to the answer I am giving him about why things matter in Spain and why we should not share them, and why he should be a bit more circumspect when he says things – even things as adventurous as the fact that we might want to be reckless as to whether we blow up the western side of Gibraltar. It is that there is a huge confluence – to such an extent I wonder whether they speak every night, Mr Speaker – between what the hon. Gentleman says and the things that Sñr Landaluce says; what the hon. Gentleman says and the things that Sñr Margallo says when they are criticising the Chief Minister of Gibraltar and the Government of Gibraltar.

Sñr Landaluce said recently that the power station, because it was gas and because it was going to be on the area of the reclamation on the North Mole, was a danger to the whole of the Campo de Gibraltar. Now, Mr Speaker, I switch on my television and I see Daniel Feetham saying the same thing.

Mr Speaker, Sñr Margallo says the Government of Gibraltar uses its economic power in order to be able to address the media and the public opinion formers in Spain. Then the Leader of the Opposition in

740 Gibraltar asks me, oh yes, how much of that economic power have you invested in this particular speech? Mr Speaker, look, the hon. Gentleman may want to be Chief Minister more than he cares about Gibraltar – that is obvious to most who are following his political career – but he needs to be a little bit more careful about the way he goes about things.

745 *Even*, Mr Speaker – let me give him this little tip – even if he were to think, ‘Well actually, maybe if I am saying the same things as Landaluce and Margallo all the time, it may not suit me so much so perhaps I should try a different tack.’

So I will give him the information behind the Speaker’s Chair, I will not give it to him otherwise. If he looks at the video of who was in Madrid then he will be able to see for himself. It is, Mr Speaker, available. I thought it was fantastic that it was available to the people of Gibraltar when the Broadcasting Corporation put it on *Viewpoint*. I think it is available on their website and all he needs to do is sit down and watch it.

750 Now if it is that he cannot bear to hear my voice on television and he does not want to sit and watch the video and does not want to watch the camera pan to show him who was there and who was not, well look, so be it. I will tell him for nothing, Mr Speaker, that the Nueva Economía Fórum provides the orange juice, the croissants, the hot chocolate and the coffee for everyone who turns up. So everyone he sees on camera, he can work out, have their coffee, their orange juice, their hot chocolate and their croissants paid for by the Government of Gibraltar. What more does he need? Why is it so important?

755 Or perhaps, Mr Speaker, it is that he has persuaded himself that we are in fact skint and that we cannot even afford the orange juice. What a pity Mr Speaker, that there might actually be a Leader of the Opposition who fails to understand the economics, the public finances and the reality of Gibraltar to such an extent that he might actually believe that.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, we will see who understands the economics of the public finances of Gibraltar when he and I participate in the debate on GBC, unconstrained by the Rules of this House. And then we will see who understands the public finances of Gibraltar and who does not.

765 Because I have to say, I concluded a long time ago that he certainly does not and that is precisely the reason why his erstwhile leader, the Hon. Minister Bossano, answers every single session of the House, answers questions on the economy of Gibraltar and the public finances of Gibraltar, instead of him. He does not; it is Mr Bossano because he understands them and the hon. Gentleman, the Chief Minister does not.

And talking about ambitions, Mr Speaker, and talking about bankruptcy and being skint, was it not the hon. Gentleman that for months before the last General Election was telling the people of Gibraltar that the GSD was addicted to debt, that we were very close to bankruptcy and that they needed a saviour in the form of a New Dawn Government? Well look, he is accusing me of precisely what he did prior to the 2011 election. I do not understand how an earth he can criticise me in those terms when he did it to a greater extent when he was trying to become Chief Minister of Gibraltar.

775 But, Mr Speaker, how – (*Interjection*) Indeed, he was successful absolutely, his arguments were successful. We will see whether my arguments are successful or not, but that is democracy. But, Mr Speaker, he has talked about how much economic power is used by the Government to invite people from Spain to his talks. He has also said during the course of his answers that in fact this was a very, very successful meeting for him and I am glad that if it was a very successful meeting for Gibraltar, I really am glad.

780 But look, at the end of the day I am entitled to know, and I am entitled to assess that information that he is providing, by asking questions in this House and I just do not understand why he is not prepared to provide me with the information as to how much he has paid for example, a particular trade unionist to go to Madrid in order to listen to his speech. At first blush I do not understand what the benefit of that to Gibraltar is. I can understand the benefit of going to Spain and addressing a Spanish audience and I can understand at a push that he may not want to give me information – I do not agree with it but I can understand it – as to exactly who on the Spanish side had been invited by the Government of Gibraltar – at Government expense, I am talking about – at Government expense, because they might be criticised there.

790 Look, I can understand that argument. But who an earth from Spain is going to criticise Victor Ochello or who or earth from Spain is going to criticise Mr Buttigieg of the Self Determination Group for going with the Gibraltar delegation to Madrid? What I want to know is what the Government has spent in inviting those people – and surely, that is not something that the Chief Minister ought to refuse to provide across the floor of this House.

795 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, so what is next? So he cannot win the debate as he has accepted because he is looking forward to it being a debate unconstrained by the Rules of the House. He cannot win the debate constrained by the Rules of the House because of course the only way that he can win a debate is by saying ‘You are lying, you are lying, you are lying’ or using another insult. He cannot use that insult here so therefore he wants to have the argument unconstrained by the Rules of the House

800 because I do not find the Rules of the House constraining when it comes to having any debate on any particular issue.

But I very much look forward to having the debate on public finances on GBC, not because it will be unconstrained by the Rules of the House but because we might be unconstrained by the timing of the House, the fact that people might not be available to watch us at three or four o'clock in the afternoon and everybody will be watching us at 9.30. Well, 'everybody' – maybe people who might have better interest and may be doing something else, but at 9.30 they might actually listen to the debate and he might not get away with pretending that the Government does not give information, that the Government is pretending to keep things hidden when it comes to public finances etc, because people will see the Government giving the information and debating it with me embodying the Government in that debate.

810 But then if he does not win it unconstrained by the Rules of the House because he will be on television, is it that he is going to say that he wants to win it unconstrained by the rules of human decency and he wants to go outside GBC and have a slap up, like he challenged the Hon. the Father of the House to do at the beginning of the lifetime of this Parliament? Why does he have to be – ?

815 **Hon. D A Feetham:** A Point of Order, Mr Speaker.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Why does he have to be... Why does he have to be... Let me finish the phrase, let me finish the phrase –

820 **Mr Speaker:** A Point of Order.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** On a Point of Order. Mr Speaker, he has to make himself responsible for the accuracy of the information that he provides to this House.

I never challenged the Hon. Mr Bossano; Mr Bossano challenged me to the Antechamber, so it was the reverse.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I do not accept that. I believe that the hon. Gentleman challenged the Hon. the Father of the House to a *mano a mano* and this is very simple: he can just go into *Hansard* and he can look at what he said at the time, whether he likes it or not.

830 I know that he hates, Mr Speaker, (*Interjections*) I know that he hates *Hansard*, Mr Speaker, that little liar that reminds him of the truth, that little *chivatito* that reminds him of the things he used to say, (*Interjections*) that little *chivato* that does not lie, Mr Speaker!

**Mr Speaker:** Order! Order!

835 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Of course I know he hates to be told about *Hansard*, but it is all in *Hansard*, Mr Speaker.

So I do not fear a debate constrained or unconstrained by the Rules of the House because in a proper debate, the Rules actually help to get to the nub of the issue.

840 But, Mr Speaker, why is it that the Hon. the Father of the House answers questions that he puts about the debentures issued by the Gibraltar Savings Bank, etc? Well there was a small matter of a Government reshuffle, Mr Speaker, in the early weeks of December last year, where the Hon. the Father of the House took specific ministerial responsibility for the Gibraltar Savings Bank. Mr Speaker, that is why he now answers those questions.

845 Perhaps, Mr Speaker, the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition was not alive to that and he might still be calling us by our old ministerial names. Mine still happens to be Chief Minister; the Hon. Minister now includes in his title the words 'Gibraltar Savings Bank'. That is why he answers those questions, nothing to do with competence. But of course, the hon. Gentleman has to always comment on people's competence because he cannot talk about issues, he has to comment about competences.

850 Well, Mr Speaker, you know it is not unlike what his predecessor used to be, it is the one thing which he is actually, quite remarkably similar to Sir Peter, when Sir Peter was Chief Minister. Because as Chief Minister, Sir Peter spent a lot of time telling me that I was unfit to govern. Well, Mr Speaker, people took a different view.

855 He just commented on my competence and this is not a place, Mr Speaker, where we come to comment on each other's competence. We should come to look for information and to comment on information and give our opinions on information. But look, given that what is good for the goose is good for the gander and he likes to comment on my competence, I will tell him one thing and he will be very happy to hear me. He will be very happy to hear me on this because I am going to actually credit him. I used to think, Mr Speaker, that he was quite an unbalanced individual but I am clearly wrong, Mr Speaker. He has got a chip on both shoulders, Mr Speaker, not just one. Whether it comes to ambition or whether it comes to his ability

to understand public finances, he has got enough chips that he cannot be unbalanced – he has really managed to get that exactly right, 50/50.

Mr Speaker, I did not spend the run-up to the last General Election saying that Gibraltar was bankrupt and as ever, Mr Speaker, the devil is in the detail, something that perhaps the hon. Gentleman does not have the time these days to try and look at. All I did in the run-up to the General Election, Mr Speaker, was take the language that had been used by the GSD in 1996 and say to the then Chief Minister, Sir Peter Caruana, this is what you said in 1996 and if we apply the same standard, although we did not share your view in 1996, look at how things have developed.

Now if only he had looked at that level of detail, he might not have made the monumental mistake he has made today and it will come back to him as a monumental mistake eventually, Mr Speaker, to be the only Leader of the Opposition, in fact probably the only Gibraltarian politician in our history, to say that our community, that our country, that our nation, our public purse and our exchequer is bankrupt. Nobody has ever said that before until he got up here just before I arrived and said we are skint and that is why you cannot pay for the power station.

But never mind, there is, not on this Order Paper but shortly to come on an Order Paper, a Bill known as an Appropriation Bill on which we can have a debate which will demonstrate that he is absolutely wrong.

Mr Speaker, he talks about the trade unions and Victor Ochello. I am surprised that a man of his socialist convictions should be picking Victor Ochello out for criticism for a croissant, an orange juice and a hot chocolate. Why is it that he does not talk about the Chairman of the Chamber of Commerce or the Federation of Small Businesses? Why is it that he, the perennial socialist, he who is redder than red but not so red that the Chamber might not want to vote for him, the socialist who the conservatives should choose – the man should be permanently be wearing purple, for goodness' sake, he is so red and blue! – why is it that he chooses to pick out Victor Ochello and not anybody else?

Well, Mr Speaker, you know I am now clearer in my view as to why it was this morning that he was talking about this fictional figure of 513 more people in the public sector, because today although he is wearing red, he is trying to appeal to the blues. So, he is trying to get the Chamber on side, the Federation on side and trying to control public expenditure and very concerned about the rising numbers in the public sector, I think that is obvious in the way that he has addressed the whole debate. I mean why would he care that I am paying for the orange juice of a trade unionist and not care that I am paying for the orange juice of a captain of industry like the Chairman of the Chamber of Commerce?

Well, to come to the nub of the issue, Mr Speaker, is it that he does not know that in every other state, money is used for purposes of promoting that state in circumstances such as these where there is not a debate across a parliamentary floor about how that money is used? There is actually a debate behind closed doors, like the one I have offered him, which provides oversight on the spending of that money by those elected by the people, Government and Opposition, but is not public.

In Spain, Mr Speaker, that debate happens very often and there is a lot of loyalty about the way that people approach those debates. In other words, they keep very confidential, despite their huge differences, what that money has been spent on and why it has been spent. In some instances, it is known as the *fondos reservados*, for example in Spain or Intelligence Committees, Mr Speaker. Or is it that he can point me to any part of the *Hansard* of the Spanish Cortes which sets out what the cost of gathering intelligence on Gibraltar is costing the Spanish State? Does he know what the cost of listening, observing, him, me – I suppose he is their blue-eyed boy and me, their nemesis – is costing the Spanish State? The Spanish Taxpayer pays for that, there is oversight by the elected people of the Kingdom of Spain, but behind closed doors. What I have offered him... and there is oversight of all the spending that is used against us but not all of it – some of it yes, but not all of it is debated across the floor of any parliament.

That is what I am offering him, that is mature. Well, Mr Speaker, if he does not want that information or he does not want the information for that purpose, if all he wants, Mr Speaker is to be able to criticise the cost of having invited the trade unionist to Madrid, there is a way out. It is the way out that he always takes and I am offering it to him.

Look, I have already told him the video exists. I have already told him that he can sit down and look at who was there. He has already obviously spotted someone who he wants to point out and it happens to be Mr Ochello, so be it. I do not know what problem he has with Mr Ochello but he has picked him out, so Mr Ochello, the others who he can see on the video and then he can do, Mr Speaker, the exercise that he did this morning, he can work it out for himself and come back here with a figure.

So this morning he said you have employed 513 new members of the public sector, which at the lowest wage in the public sector at an average of blah, blah, blah is £8 million more to the bottom line each year in recurrent expenditure which you have added. Absolute and utter nonsense, but never mind, let him sit down, let him –

Look, Mr Speaker, there is a button that says 'mute' on the remote control: he can press the mute button and he can watch the whole episode of an hour of *Viewpoint* and see the events in Madrid without having to

hear me. I know that obviously my voice grates and he does not want to hear it. Fair enough, I do not like hearing myself either, especially in Spanish, and then he can work it out, Mr Speaker.

925 **Mr Speaker:** I do not know whether the Hon. the Chief Minister and the Leader of the Opposition realise, but they have been hammer and tongs for 55 minutes on two questions. I would like them to tell me whether they think there is any parliament in the Commonwealth where the Speaker would allow that. If so, if they think that is the case, they can carry on. If not, I would suggest to them that we move on.

930 Important as these matters are, but there is a limit and now they are both debating and they have been hammer and tongs at it. By all means bring a motion and I will sit here for as many hours as you like, but not under the guise of two questions. That is a transgression of the fundamental Rules of this House. If that is the way that they want to continue, well look, I may have to think again myself.

935 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, you are absolutely right. As far as I am concerned I am here to answer questions but when one is baited as one is baited one has no alternative but to reply. This morning I cannot remember how long you took on the few questions that were on the cycle path, but I think we all feel exactly the same way and we have better things to do.

940 **Mr Speaker:** There were about 15 or 20 questions on cycling and I thought I was going to leave the House on a bicycle at that rate (*Laughter*) and they took about 50 or 60 minutes – yes nearly an hour, we were all cycling for about an hour. (*Laughter*)

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am quite happy to get off this tandem now and move on.

945 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, I have been very patient in listening to the Hon. the Chief Minister with an answer that has taken him...

**Mr Speaker:** The only person who has been patient is me. (*Laughter and banging on desks*)

950 **Hon. D A Feetham:** – taken him 20 minutes.

**Mr Speaker:** I am the one who is patient with hon. Members. I am the one who is patient.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well may I indulge your –

955 **Mr Speaker:** I say that because I follow politics in Gibraltar, as you can imagine, and I know that since the last meeting of the House, outside this House hon. Members have been at it in an *explosive* situation. I know. So it has been debated out there for ages and now it comes here today. Two questions, 55 minutes – come on now.

960 The Hon. the Leader of the Opposition.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I mean the reality is that I have listened to the Hon. the Chief Minister for the last 20 minutes go on and ramble and waffle about this and about that and about the other, and I do have one final supplementary and then I will listen to his rambling and waffling answer for as long as he wants, but I think that I ought to ask him to correct the record in a number of respects.

965 Look, I think, Mr Speaker, that the pressure is really now fogging his memory, I really do think that. Because the Hon. the Chief Minister (*Interjection*) because the Hon. the Chief Minister, he said that the only reason why the Hon. Mr Bossano is answering questions on the public finances of Gibraltar is because there has been a reshuffle. But the Hon. Mr Bossano has been answering my questions on the economy and the public finances of Gibraltar for the last two years, Mr Speaker and I would ask the Hon. the Chief Minister, for the sake of accuracy and because he has to make himself responsible for the answers or for the statements that he makes to this House, to at the very least correct the record in that regard.

970 The questions have always been answered by Mr Bossano because it is Mr Bossano that really understands the public finances of Gibraltar, can speak authoritatively about them to the extent that he can authoritatively say it, Mr Speaker, that Government Ministers, including the Chief Minister of Gibraltar is being brainwashed by consultants to spend too much money. Now, Mr Speaker, if that is not an indictment much more powerful than any indictment or any criticism that I could make of the Government benches, if that is not an indictment, Mr Speaker, what is?

980 And I just again for the sake of accuracy because I know he is not going to provide me with the information that I seek, which is innocuous information but I think one that I am entitled, which is a list of the locals that attended the Madrid event and the cost to the Taxpayer for taking those locals to Madrid. It has nothing to do with Victor Ochello, it is no criticism of Victor Ochello at all or anybody else,

(Interjection) none at all, my comment, Mr Speaker, was that there cannot be any national interest in not telling me how much he has paid for Victor Ochello or anybody else in the Gibraltar delegation from going to Madrid.

But if I can demonstrate to him, if I can demonstrate to him that I never challenged Mr Bossano to a fisticuffs or anything of the sort, will he stand in this House – because again he is responsible for the accuracy of the information he provides – and apologise to this House for misleading this House by saying that I challenged Mr Bossano, which is certainly not true?

What happened there was, that Mr Bossano challenged me and I stood up and I said I have never been challenged to a fisticuffs, to a *mano a mano* by anybody in my life in Parliament and I did not expect it. That was the comment.

He should make himself responsible for the comments that he makes. I know that he is under a lot of pressure; I know that the pressure is getting to the Hon. the Chief Minister, but I think that despite pressure, in the interests of fairness, he ought to be able to correct the record so that it is accurate.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, on a Point of Order.

I do not accept that I challenged the hon. Member to a *mano a mano*, which is not terminology that I would use, since I avoid the Spanish language at all costs. If I had decided to take him on outside, I would not have told him about it; it would have happened. (Laughter)

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, (Interjections and laughter) I am a fan of parliamentary democracy and I believe that Prime Minister's Question Time in the United Kingdom, although a bear pit, is an important part of democracy. Therefore, Mr Speaker, the fact that the hon. Gentleman gets up and says things that are really quite fanciful and have nothing to do with the original question, is not something that shocks me but frankly, it is really quite outside of the Rules.

But anyway, Mr Speaker, you know why is it that the hon. Gentleman thinks he is going to get up and get an answer about a question which is supposed to be important to our community when he starts talking about my condition. You see, Mr Speaker, he does not get up and say can the Chief Minister say *x, y or z*. He gets up and he says you have a condition; you are suffering because of the pressure. Anybody who knows me knows how much I am enjoying doing this work knows that I am probably one of the people that least suffers pressure in the context of stress that they might come across.

But whether or not I am suffering pressure is totally irrelevant to our democracy and to our community. It might be relevant to my physician and my family, but it is completely irrelevant to our politics and to what decision people are going to make when they decide who is going to be allowed to continue running our community for the next four years once an election is called, one that of course, Mr Speaker, I do not intend to cut and run to as the hon. Gentleman predicted in one of his recent speeches. But then again, most of his predictions are wrong, like the prediction he made during the course of the by-election that we were going to have a huge turnout and he was going to win by 10% which turned out to be a very low turnout but an election that we won by 10%.

But never mind that, Mr Speaker, always he says, Mr Bossano has answered these questions. That is not the case. Once again, Mr Speaker, *Hansard* will demonstrate that that is not the case. But this is now just arguing about an argument. This is no longer about the nub of the issue. But the hon. Gentleman said something which is important in his question and I want to deal with it. He said that Mr Bossano understands the public finance and can talk authoritatively about it. Absolutely true, Mr Speaker and the ten people, or rather the nine people sitting on this side of the House with Mr Bossano, have always accepted that and believe in Mr Bossano's ability to understand public finance. In fact, Mr Speaker, I think he used to be one of the people who used to do that before he turned Labour, then turned GSD.

But so be it, we still believe in that, Mr Speaker, we have never changed our opinion in that. I did not, Mr Speaker, when I became Leader of the Gibraltar Socialist Labour Party; take a new degree in economics. I took, or rather the Chairman of the Party, took a vote based on a simple majority of those present in the room as to who should be the Leader of the Party and starting from my left, Mr Speaker, let me just describe us in academic or in qualification terms. Lawyer, Lawyer, Dietician, Economist, Lawyer, Historian, Lawyer, Lawyer, Environmentalist/Botanist, Doctor of all things he surveys and Lawyer and Teacher. Teacher, Trade Unionist, Journalist/Teacher, Lawyer, Lawyer/Friend, Lawyer and Lawyer.

Only one economist, Mr Speaker. Only one person who can speak authoritatively on the public finances of Gibraltar as an economist because he, Mr Speaker, certainly the Leader of the Opposition certainly on the day that that deal was done where there was neither a show of hands or a secret ballot as there should have been, but some sort of other executive manoeuvre when he became Leader of the Opposition, did not take a degree in economics either. So he is still as much a lawyer as I am. But of course he says as he always likes to say during the course of these debates that I Fabian am cleverer than you and I can speak



better on these subjects than you can. Well fine, okay if you do not have a grandmother, you do not have a grandmother, what can you do?

1045 But he says, speaking authoritatively on that subject as he did, Mr Bossano said that the Ministers are capable of being brainwashed. That is not what Mr Bossano said, Mr Speaker. He is traducing what Mr Bossano says. Mr Bossano said, that consultants *might try to brainwash* Ministers. (*Laughter*) He cannot even do a false laugh in a way that is convincing, Mr Speaker. (*Laughter*) Consultants might try to brainwash Ministers.

1050 Well, Mr Speaker, in this context what Mr Bossano was saying is, they might try, we will not allow it, it is not going to happen and we will be better guardians of the public finance than ever anyone has been before. Why did he say that and why did he say quite rightly, we will not give political cover to those who try and get away with spending more of the public finances than the Parliament? Not just us, the Parliament has voted because at the last minute when they were about to not vote in favour of the budget, Sir Peter Caruana stepped into the room and said, 'Do not commit political suicide, no Opposition has ever not voted

1055 in favour of a budget. The Parliament votes in favour of the budget.'

Why do we say that and why are we better guardians of that purse than anybody ever has been? Because, Mr Speaker, the hon. Member himself cannot have been brainwashed when he was Minister for Justice and responsible for the spending on the new courts and the new prison. The spending of which went through the roof contrary to the estimates. Even Sir Peter cannot have been –

1060

**Mr Speaker:** May I ask the Chief Minister please to come to a conclusion?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Yes, thank you and I will, Mr Speaker.

1065 Even Sir Peter cannot have been brainwashed and I am dealing with his putting to me this statement from Mr Bossano, when he was dealing with the airport which was quoted at £24 million and came in at £84 million. They must have been absolutely, permanently bleeding lobotomised because the spending was in the order of three times what the estimate was on the airport. So it is not a question of attempted brainwashing which we are stopping and quite right too, there are incidences of absolute total lobotomy of the Members opposite, which is why we find the public finance mess that we found when we were elected

1070 and by the end of that financial year, the last financial year they were in office, there was £2 million left in the kitty. As close to skint as this community is ever going to come, under them, Mr Speaker. (*Banging on desks*)

1075 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, my final supplementary. But, Mr Speaker, it is a supplementary that I cannot allow the Hon. the Chief Minister to get away with whitewashing the comments of the Hon. Minister Bossano. Because I am going to quote exactly what Minister Bossano said, quote, 'The guys that have been brought in as consultants and are still there, are responsible for a lot of projects and they seem to think that they have a free hand to spend money and maybe they go to their Minister and they sort of brainwash him into thinking it without being conscious.'

1080 They brainwash him, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, you cannot air brush away interviews that have been given by his Ministers to GBC which are then reported in the press. That is a quote and it is a quote from the *Gibraltar Chronicle* of what Mr Bossano said and Mr Speaker, that is the worst indictment the worst possible indictment of this Government's runaway expenditure, runaway expenditure that anybody could have possibly come up with and it does not come from the Opposition benches, it comes from one of his own on his own benches. That is a terrible indictment, Mr Speaker.

1085

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, the position –

**Mr Speaker:** This is the last intervention from the Chief Minister.

1090

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Thank you.

**Mr Speaker:** I am bringing these exchanges to a conclusion.

1095 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman just gets up full of enthusiasm, thinking he has won the point, reads the quote and realises as he is half way through it, it says *maybe*. 'Oh damn it, it says maybe. It says maybe, but I had better not repeat that bit when I go back and say the bit that I want Bossano to be indicting them all for.'

1100 So maybe this happens and so we are going to stop it and he does not like that, he does not like that Mr Speaker, so he only repeats the bit he likes which may be unconstrained by the rules of debate in this House. If we were actually slightly more constrained by the rules of the court, he might find the judge asking him to repeat. The judge might say, 'Well actually Mr Feetham, can you just repeat that? Does it

actually say “maybe”? Does it actually say “maybe”? (*Laughter*) And there is no need Mr Speaker for him to repeat it again for a very simple reason: because as I told him a moment ago, there is that *chivatillo* which is *Hansard* which will have chapter and verse recorded, what he already read a moment ago. So it was all in the context of ‘maybe’ – therefore no indictment.

But look, Mr Speaker, if he wants to talk about indictments and talk about runaway expenditure well, Mr Speaker, that is not what is happening but this is not a debate on public finance, the Appropriation debate is coming and we will see who is right on all of these issues just like we will see in the fullness of time when we sit back and look at all of his predictions, where exactly it is that they all end up. The last one was that I was going to cut and run and have an early election. I guess it is because it is all about running. I do not know whether the hon. Gentleman has decided to become a jogger these days. He talks about runaway expenditure, my cutting and running to go to an election, all of which his predictions will prove to be entirely wrong.

He said during the course, Mr Speaker, of his earlier supplementary that the information that he was seeking was innocuous and could he please have it. Well Mr Speaker, you said 55 minutes, it may be even longer, for innocuous information. If it is so innocuous why bother to insist on it? Why not say to me, ‘Well, Fabian, let me have it behind the Speaker’s Chair and I will take a view’, if it is so innocuous? If it is so innocuous and whether he likes it or not, I am the Chief Minister of Gibraltar, just like whether Mr Margallo likes it or not, Gibraltar is not Spanish. There is a treaty that makes it British *de facto*. It is not Spanish and *de jure* it is not Spanish and today I am the Chief Minister of Gibraltar, however much it hurts. However much it grates, that is the reality. He has to deal with it every morning I know, but it is the reality.

I am therefore saying to him, I believe it is not in the public interest of Gibraltar to do this. Look at what the newspapers say, look at what Mr Margallo is saying in the newspapers, let me give you the information behind the Speaker’s Chair. If it is so innocuous the information that he is seeking, why does he not accept it in that way? Or is it perhaps, Mr Speaker, that the information is not so innocuous, as he knows?

**Mr Speaker:** Question 185.

**Q185/2015  
Plans for GBC –  
Update**

**Clerk:** Question 185, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please state whether he considers the plans he announced for GBC in 2012 are still on course to be achieved?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, yes sir.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, he may recall that in relation to those plans when he made the announcement, he said that GBC would be self-funding and profitable through use of the company which GBC was to have a 50% shareholding. That was from recollection, Gibraltar Networks or Gibraltar Entertainment Networks Limited where another UK company, an entertainment company, had the other 50% and that they would have premises at Europa Point and that those premises would be completed by 2015.

So does his prediction that his plans are on course, include the fact that those premises are going to be built in effect for GBC and also for this particular company?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, those premises have already been provided, at one stage GN was operating from premises in Europa Point, I think it was one of the MOD properties that were there. But I am very confident that our overall plan for GBC is moving in the direction in which we want to move it. It may have different permutations but my plan for GBC is on course to be achieved.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, just to be clear, the plan included for GBC to be self-funding and the way that the Government was going to make GBC self-funding was through this subsidiary company, which was going to be attracting productions to Gibraltar using Gibraltar’s beneficial tax system in order for those productions to be done here in Gibraltar, to generate profits so that GBC could then become self-funding, presumably through the profits paid up from the subsidiary company to GBC.

Is he saying that those plans of self-funding for GBC via this particular company are still on course to be achieved?

1160

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am saying that my plans that GBC should eventually become self-funding are on course to be achieved, they continue to be the view of the Chief Executive of GBC and my view and we think we stand a very good chance of actually making something of GBC rather than consider it just something that costs the community money to provide a service, it could actually be an engine of growth for the community.

1165

**Hon. D A Feetham:** And that is going to take place, or the plan is that the way that GBC would become profitable, would be through this particular subsidiary company generating those kind of profits through local productions. That is still the plan.

1170

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the plan is that it should become self-financing. The route to that, whether it is through this particular subsidiary or others or in fact through even new and more exciting opportunities, is something that is constantly being worked on by the Chief Executive and by the management of GBC and by us.

1175

I mean what could be better than to achieve that and why shouldn't we want to keep on track, in that respect? I would have thought that we would have enjoyed support from the Opposition in this respect, except of course that they did not think of it when they were in power. Maybe that is why they do not want to be supportive.

1180

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, it is not about the Opposition not being supportive. I am asking him questions. I know that it irritates him when I ask him questions, but that is my job. My job is to hold the Government to account on its policy, to enquire as to whether its policy is being successful or is not being successful so that something can be done about it. It should not irk the Hon. the Chief Minister that I am on this side of the House asking questions. It should not at all.

1185

Now, Mr Speaker, Gibraltar Entertainment Networks, I think that is the name of the company. Has this company been profitable? Has it been making profits and has it been making the kind of profits that will allow GBC to be well on the road to self-sufficiency or is Gibraltar Entertainment Networks, has it not been successful and the Government is really looking at other avenues of making GBC self-sufficient?

1190

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am sorry to have to get up to say these things because they are not pertinent to our democracy or our politics, but I cannot allow things that the hon. Gentleman says to go unanswered so I am going to deal with that point. If he were prevented from saying these things, I would not have to reply to them.

1195

Mr Speaker, I do not find his questions irritating or irksome; I actually find them quite amusing. Mr Speaker, especially in the context of what it is that he is hopefully trying to achieve, I find most amusing much of what he does and how he goes about things. So he need not concern himself about irritating me or irking me.

1200

Mr Speaker, GEN: I cannot tell him what the balance sheet of GEN is without notice, but I can tell him that GEN involves certain individuals who continue to work in part with GBC but not all of them with GBC and therefore that the original concept of GEN is not actually one that is likely to be progressing into the future but the ideas behind GEN and how that would lead to GBC being eventually, we hope self-financing, does continue to be something that we are pursuing very enthusiastically.

## TOURISM, HOUSING, EQUALITY AND SOCIAL SERVICES

Q105/2015

Upper Rock Nature Reserve –  
Visitor numbers, January 2015

**Clerk:** Question 105, the Hon. D J Bossino.

1205

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Tourism please provide details of the number of Upper Rock Nature Reserve visitors for the month of January 2015?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1210

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, 18,774 visitors entered the Upper Rock Nature Reserve during the month of January 2015.

1215 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Just to point out, Mr Speaker, in fact on the day that I filed the question, which was the Wednesday, it was actually updated on line but I am grateful for the reply in any event.

Mr Speaker, just to ask, that figure is actually slightly higher than the figure in 2014 and indeed in 2013 although it still represents quite a significant reduction from the position in 2011-12.

1220 Does she have – and probably not a question which can be answered – but does she have any indications from within the Department as to whether this is likely to go in an increasing upward trend over the next few months? I know it is difficult to predict but perhaps she can do something, make an attempt at replying to the question if she can.

**Hon. S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, the figures show that the visitors in January this year are up by 306 from January last year and on the basis that we expect more cruise ships in this year, then that will I think relatively have a knock-on effect of increasing the number of tourists that we will have.

1225

**Q106-107/2015**  
**Mid-Harbour Estate–**  
**CCTV and garage barriers**

**Clerk:** Question 106, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1230 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, further to the answer provided to Question 40/2015, can the Minister for Housing inform this House by when it is estimated that the recently installed CCTV project and garage barriers at Mid-Harbour Estate will be operational on a permanent basis?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1235 **Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 107.

**Clerk:** Question 107, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1240 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide details in respect of any maintenance programme which has been established in respect of the recently installed CCTV project and garage barriers at Mid-Harbour Estate, indicating who will carry out these tasks and their respective cost?

1245 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, as previously informed, the CCTV project is complete. The maintenance of the CCTV project in Mid-Harbour Estate is being carried out by Sheriff Electrical Contractors on a reactive basis.

1250 The maintenance is within the two-year warranty as stipulated in the contract documentation and there is no current financial implication as this was covered under the original contract sum.

In relation to the garage barriers the Housing Department has written to all tenants at Mid-Harbours, advising them of the procedure to be issued with the relevant permits and fobs and that barriers will be operational as soon as this is completed.

1255 Insofar as the maintenance, there are plans to engage the services of an electrical contractor to adopt a maintenance programme.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Sorry, Mr Speaker, I did not quite catch the very last part, something in respect of the fobs and talking to the tenants. Could the hon. Lady, because of my hearing problems, please repeat the last part?

1260

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** What I said, Mr Speaker, was that we have written to the tenants advising them of the procedure to collect the fobs and given them a deadline in which to do so. Once that deadline has passed then the barriers will be operational. It should be by next week or the week after.

1265 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Thank you, I was going to jump in, by when the deadline?. So, therefore, Mr Speaker is the hon. Lady confident that probably within the next month or so we should have everything now fully operational?

1270 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, tenants were written to last week and the deadline for applications for that is 20th February so it should be operational by the end of the month.

**Q108/2015**

**Weather damage to rental homes –  
Details**

1275 **Clerk:** Question 108, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide full details of the extent of damages, inclusive of locations, caused to rental homes as a result of inclement weather during the ongoing refurbishment works at any housing estate, since the answer provided to Question 746/2014?

1280 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, up to 9th February, 14 flats have been affected throughout the 1,547 flats in the three estates, of which nine have been affected through the roof, four via the stairwell and one via the window.  
Further protective measures and minor repairs are currently being undertaken.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, I can understand the question was submitted on its deadline which was last Thursday morning but the Hon. Minister said up to 9th February – that is over a week prior to that.  
Surely the information, Mr Speaker, could have been provided up to last Thursday.

1290 I will tell you why: because one of the things that I was hearing and so on, seems to have happened just in the days or in that same week prior to the deadline of the question and with the Minister only being able to provide information up to 9th February, it means that one is now delayed until the latter part of March in order to be able to get any information on something that really happened within the first few days of the first week of February.

1295 Does the Minister require a bit more time and perhaps she can at least get the information up to at least the question deadline time which was Thursday morning. I do not know, Mr Speaker, if she can be helpful on that.

1300 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, I did urge the Department to provide me with as much information as possible, right up to the latest deadline that they could provide. Of course, Mr Speaker, you can appreciate we have the whole internal mechanism and everything for production of answers. In any event, Mr Speaker, the question can be put to me again next month so that the Department can have sufficient time to answer this.

1305 In any event, Mr Speaker, the answer will not change. There is only a month delay, Mr Speaker, now that thankfully we sit in Parliament every month. The hon. Gentleman only has to wait a question of a couple of weeks, four weeks in fact for that answer.

I can only provide as much information as the Department provides to me; though I did ask for as much information as possible, Mr Speaker, I want to make that clear.

1310 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, if the Minister does not have the information, if need be, Mr Speaker, I will consult you so that by wording the question, I do not infringe the rules of repeating the question and so on, so any information that refers to anything after 9th February then that might, if need be with your guidance, we can do it in such a manner, Mr Speaker.

1315 **Mr Speaker:** No problem.

**Q109/2015**  
**Government co-ownership housing projects –**  
**Unsold homes**

**Clerk:** Question 109, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1320 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, further to the answer provided to Question 749/2014, can the Minister for Housing provide revised and updated details of how many homes still remain unsold in respect of Government's new co-ownership housing projects, giving the room size composition in each case?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1325

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, the Government's new co-ownership housing projects are a huge success and there are no homes remaining unsold.

**Q110 & 117/2015**  
**Government rental homes –**  
**Unpaid rents**

1330 **Clerk:** Question 110, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide details of how much has been written off in respect of unpaid rents pertaining to Government rental homes, since the answer provided to Question 35/2015?

1335

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 117.

1340

**Clerk:** Question 117, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide details of arrears in respect of unpaid rents pertaining to Government rental homes as at 31st January 2015?

1345

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, nothing has been written off since the answer provided to Question 35/2015 because work in respect of these areas continues.

1350

The total of arrears in unpaid rent as at 31st January 2015 is £5,368,606.27. From that figure we need to deduct the amounts that are older than six years, which are not therefore recoverable.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, again I lacked a bit of hearing at the end. The figure of £5,368,606 I think the Minister said. What did she end up saying, Mr Speaker – that it does not include something that has been written off because time has expired? Can I have a repetition of that please?

1355

**Mr Speaker:** More than six years.

1360 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Has anything been written off because it has been more than six years?

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** No.

**Q111/2015**  
**Reallocation of empty homes –**  
**Expenditure and details**

**Clerk:** Question 111, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1365

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide details in respect of all expenditure incurred since the answer to Question 36/2015 in respect of contracts awarded for making empty homes suitable for re-allocation, stating to whom payments were made, how much has been paid, the number of residential homes pertaining to each payment, as well as indicating the type/nature of repair works, or cleaning services undertaken?

1370

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, information for the month of January 2015 is as follows, in relation to one property awarded to AJEC at a cost of £8,444 and to E Lopez and Sons Limited £4,450.

1375

**Hon. E J Reyes:** And the nature type of work undertaken, Mr Speaker?

**Miss S J Sacramento:** Sorry, Mr Speaker, all services contracted were for repairs and none were for cleaning.

1380

**Hon. E J Reyes:** And what type of repairs, Mr Speaker? What nature, what type of repairs? Was it repairs to the roof, to electrical installations? I amended the wording from last month on your suggestion, Mr Speaker, because I just said repairs and I want to know a bit further, the type of repairs.

1385

**Hon. S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, the only information I have been provided with is that they were general repairs. I imagine that when a property is repaired we will have different issues, Mr Speaker. They are not huge repairs because the figures are not that big.

1390

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, they may not be huge repairs but I have taken on board the advice given to me and that is why I have said indicating the type and nature. I would like to know, Mr Speaker, whether it was to do with plumbing works or do with electrical works or roof repair please, Mr Speaker.

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, I am sorry I do not have any further information because the officials have not provided the information.

1395

**Mr Speaker:** Will the hon. Lady please instruct her officials to look at the question carefully because it does say type or nature of repairs.

**Q112/2015**  
**Urgent decanting from homes –**  
**Details**

1400

**Clerk:** Question 112, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Housing provide details of how many tenants required urgent decanting from their homes since the answer to Question 37/2015, indicating the reason why, the date when said decanting became necessary and the date when the tenants were able to return to their home?

1405

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, three tenants have required decanting from their homes for the following reasons: on account of a fire since 23rd January 2015; two on account of works, on 12th February and one on 13th February, and no set date for return has yet been established for any of the three.

1410

1415 **Hon. E J Reyes:** I am going to try my luck, Mr Speaker. Any idea what type of work?

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** No, Mr Speaker, I am afraid I do not have that level of detail.

**Q113/2015**  
**Housing Works Agency –**  
**Seconded Building Surveyor and M/T Driver**

**Clerk:** Question 113, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1420

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Further to the answer provided to Question 39/2015, can the Minister for Housing now state if the Building Surveyor and M/T Driver listed under ‘seconded’ in the schedule provided were either seconded ‘out from’ or ‘into’ the Housing Works Agency?

1425 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, the building surveyor and driver were seconded ‘out’ of the Housing Works Agency.

**Q114/2015**  
**Government rental homes –**  
**Eviction of squatters**

1430 **Clerk:** Question 114, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing say how much expenditure has been incurred in respect of legal costs relating to the eviction of squatters from Government rental homes, since the answer provided to Question 41/2015, providing a breakdown showing the number of homes involved and to whom payments were made?

1435

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, there has been no expenditure incurred since the answer provided to Question 41/2015.

1440

**Q115/2015**  
**Vacant flats –**  
**Details**

**Clerk:** Question 115, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, further to the answer provided for Written Question W17/2015, can the Minister for Housing provide details showing which of the five collective reasons listed in the schedules corresponding to flats which are currently vacant; apply in each individual case, together with details of the room composition of each individual home?

1445

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1450

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, of the 159 pre-war flats, the ones that are beyond economical repair are: 12 x 1RKBs; 29 x 2RKBs; 25 x 3RKBs; 7 x 4RKBs; 6 x 5RKBs; 3 x 6 RKBs.

Of those considered possible for sale or tender, there are: 5 x 1RKBs; 16 x 2RKBs; 23 x 3RKBs; 10 x 4RKBs; 7 x 5RKBs and 1 x 7RKB.

1455

Of those ready for allocation now, there are: 1 x 1RKB; 2 x 4RKBs and 1 x 9RKB.

Refurbished but not yet allocated: there are 3 x 1RKB; 4 x 3RKBs; 2 x 4RKBs and 2 x 5RKBs.



In relation to the 58 post-war flats the breakdown is as follows.

Of those which are beyond economical repair: 8 x 1RKBs; 3 x 2RKBs; 3 x 3RKBs.

1460 For those considered possible for sale or tender there are none.

Those that are in-house and ready for allocation, there are: 4 x 1RKBs; 4 x 2RKBs; 4 x 3RKBs; 3 x 4RKBs.

Refurbished are: 7 x 1RKBs; 6 x 2RKBs; 9 x 3RKBs; 6 x 4RKBs and 1 x 5RKB.

1465

**Q116/2015**

**Governor's Meadow House, Alameda Estate –  
Cost of resurfacing work**

**Clerk:** Question 116, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1470 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide the breakdown of costs in respect of the recent resurfacing works at the upper entrance to Governor's Meadow House in Alameda Estate, stating which company carried out the works and indicating if these are now complete and approved by Government's Quality Control officials?

1475 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, the works were awarded and completed by Limatron Company Limited for the sum of £3,500 and GCCC staff has supervised the works.

1480

**Clerk:** Question 118, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

**Question 88/2015 continued –  
Supplementary information**

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, if I may with your indulgence since the hon. Member was the one that asked the question –

1485

**Mr Speaker:** Yes, please do.

**Hon. S E Linares:** – and he has finished today so I would like just to say to him that the £2,088 that he asked in the previous question as to the Re-Enactment Society and Association, was exactly what I said to him they were, on uniforms.

1490

**Q118-119/2015  
Disability –  
Definition and review in law**

**Clerk:** Question 118, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

1495 **Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Social Services say when the definition of 'disabled' will change to ensure that all those who suffer a disability, at whatever stage in their lives, will be entitled to disability benefits, what criteria will be used to define disability and at what stage is Government in the review of disability in our laws?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1500

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 119.

**Clerk:** Question 119, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

1505 **Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Social Services say when the Government will legislate to further protect disabled people, ratifying and using the terms of the United Nations Convention on the rights of disabled persons as a model?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1510

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, insofar as changing the definition in relation to disability allowance, this forms part of a wider review of the Benefit System and is work in progress.

1515 Legislation to ratify the UN Convention is drafted and is in the final stages of review and about to go to consultation very, very shortly.

#### Q120/2015

##### St Bernadette's Resource Centre – Plans to increase places

**Clerk:** Question 120, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

1520 **Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Social Services say if there are plans to increase the number of sheltered flats and respite places for the disabled and service users of St Bernadette's Resource Centre.

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1525

**Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, St Bernadette's Resource Centre is a day centre for adults with learning disabilities and does not provide flats or respite.

The provision of disability services is continuously under review and is monitored depending on demand.

#### Q121/2015

##### Supported Employment Scheme – Participating companies

1530

**Clerk:** Question 121, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

1535 **Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Social Services say how many companies in Gibraltar form part of the Supported Employment Scheme which offers sheltered employment for service users of St Bernadette's Resource Centre and the Dr Giraldi Home.

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1540 **Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, there is one company.

#### Q122/2015

##### Dr Giraldi Inquiry – Final cost

**Clerk:** Question 122, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1545 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is the figure of £2.6 million the final cost of the Dr Giraldi Inquiry or does the Government envisage the figure will increase?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1550 **Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, £2.6 million is not the final cost of the inquiry. Government expects to receive further invoices and will make a statement once the final cost has been determined.

**Mr Speaker:** Question 159, the Hon. Mr Bossino, it is on financial services.

1555

## FINANCIAL SERVICES AND GAMING

**Q159/2015**

### **Flagship events – Business development goals**

**Clerk:** Question 159, the Hon. D J Bossino.

1560 **Hon. D J Bossino:** I am sure he is enjoying whatever he is eating (*Laughter*)  
Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Financial Services provide details of the business development goals which the Flagship events have?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services and Gaming.

1565

**Minister for Financial Services and Gaming (Hon. A J Isola):** Yes, Mr Speaker, as the hon. Member will be aware, 'Flagship Events' are those at which Gibraltar Finance arranges a central event with private meetings previously arranged around them and timed to coincide with international conference events in each of the jurisdictions.

1570 The reason for this is simply to enable professionals in the private sector to attend the international conference, attend the flagship event and also where appropriate, participate in the private meetings arranged during that visit.

1575 Further, we always take the opportunity during these events, to engage with the international media in order to further raise the profile of Gibraltar as a quality and reputable financial services centre. This initiative has led to engagement with Swiss local media and on our recent visit with a Bloomberg Interview, in Hong Kong with CNBC Asia and RHK, a major Hong Kong radio station, both with live interviews. In London with a live interview on Sky News on their Business Today programme and in Bermuda with both TV and newspaper interviews.

1580 Our goal in all of the above is, of course, to promote Gibraltar as a quality and reputable international financial services centre in partnership with the private-sector firms, by proactively marketing the benefits of our proposition and stressing that Gibraltar offers a well regulated transparent and internationally co-operative jurisdiction, with access to financial markets including the right of access to the EU single market in financial services.

1585 The recently released Business Development Plan of 2015 details the precise events and conferences we will be supporting this year which exceed 30 different events across the spectrum of our financial services community. The programme has been discussed with and considered by the Finance Centre Council, who have warmly welcomed the Development Plan and are actively supporting our efforts to promote the jurisdiction.

With respect to the flagship events, I would comment as follows:

1590 These past 12 months we have organised Gibraltar Day Lunches in five different cities, being Bermuda, Hong Kong, Geneva, Zurich and London and hosting over 910 guests, including some 200 local professionals supporting these initiatives. These numbers give you an indication of the magnitude of the project we have embarked on and the extent of the support that we have received from those attending and of course, our local firms.

1595 The opportunity to engage directly with professionals in each of these jurisdictions and address them on the benefits of our jurisdiction, hand in hand with the private sector, is an effective and efficient means of promoting business links in these financial hubs with our professionals.

1600 These events, together with attending conferences and road shows and engagement with media, are all part of the programme of increasing serious awareness of our jurisdiction and catching up on the many years of a lack of investment in this area. In addition, our senior executives are constantly engaging with professionals in these and other markets promoting the Gibraltar proposition.

I would like to sincerely thank the entire team of Gibraltar Finance for their conscientious work and attention to detail in ensuring that whatever functions we organise or attend, we always do so perfectly prepared and our presence professionally delivered.

**Q160/2015**  
**Finance Centre Department travel expenses –**  
**Details**

1605 **Clerk:** Question 160, the Hon. D J Bossino.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Financial Services provide details of his Department's travel expenses to date for 2015?

1610 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services and Gaming.

**Minister for Financial Services and Gaming (Hon. A J Isola):** Yes, Mr Speaker, the travel expenses for the Finance Centre Department paid to date for 2015 are Hotel £4,029; Flights £10,461.28; Subsistence and Expenses £903.

1615 These costs relate to invoices paid in 2015 up to 16th February 2015. If I might just add, Mr Speaker, included within those numbers is one visit to London which was cancelled due to my inability to go through serious neck pains, which we are in the process of recovering the cost of through an insurance claim.

1620 **Hon. D J Bossino:** I am grateful for that reply, Mr Speaker. Just to be clear in my own mind, he has given me a set of figures because in fact when information has been uploaded – he and I have had this debate across the floor of the House in relation to asking questions in respect of matters which are available in the internet on the Government website – the information which I thought I was seeking in the question has actually been provided on line, it was updated I think on 16th February which post-dates the filing of the question, Mr Speaker.

1625 Now that information online relates to four specific events which took place, two in January and two in February, the total amount of which I calculated to be about £9,350 – well, the specific figure is £9,351.30. Now the information he has given me is not in tandem with this. Can he explain why? Basically, I was really wanting this updated information but he has given me different information.

1630 **Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Speaker, there may be a difference because what you have on the website will be, I think, ministerial travel and the question is phrased in the Department's travel. So I am including Gibraltar Finance which includes, for example, the members of the Gibraltar Finance Team, Nadiuska and Joanne who travelled to set up an exhibition in London and Zurich, so there are different expenses so you will not be able to relate the information I have given directly to the one you have got from the website because there are different people involved. The Gibraltar Finance Team is not on the website on the same page that you are referring to.

1635 **Hon. D J Bossino:** But the information he has given me, would it include this information that is on the website, because it is his personal expenses I want, as Minister?

1640 **Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Speaker, from the information I have been provided, the breakdown for the numbers that I have just given you, which total I think £10,129 – no they do not – so what they have done is they have extracted my costs and given you the Ministry's costs. For example it includes the cost of a visit to Madrid for a LEIROC Conference of £95 and £179 of hotel. That is not on my website but that is included in these numbers.

1645 If the hon. Member would like to have more details, I am happy to let him have them by letter, giving a breakdown of the specific costs relating to each member of Gibraltar Finance in respect of each of those visits which may be of more use to him than the generic total breakdowns.

1650 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Yes, I probably will be seeking that information from him. Well, I will get the information from the prepared answer once it is on *Hansard* in any event and then I will take a decision once I have had a proper chance of reading it and comparing it with this information. But he has been helpful in his reply.

1655 Now, I have noticed that in terms of making comparisons to how much was spent last year and this year and in terms of his travel expenses there is a three-fold increase. So for example up until March, his travel

expenditure all told, was about £3,500 whilst the information provided on the website suggests he has already spent £9,300. There was a visit to Hong Kong for example which was not included previously.

1660 But, and this is where I am leading to, does he envisage that the overall annual cost, given that he must have a plan and in fact it is published in the Development Plan, the overall annual cost is going to be higher and if so, does he have an idea of how much higher, overall annual for 2015?

1665 **Hon. A J Isola:** Yes, Mr Speaker, the difference between last year and this year obviously is that there was a visit to Hong Kong in January this year and there was not a visit to Hong Kong in January of last year.

1670 In terms of the overall spending, the Business Development Plan which we issued in January has been costed, the expenditure that was in last year's estimate was below the amount that was required to meet the Business Development Plan. So there has been a supplementary funding request made through the Financial Secretary this year and we are within the Budget in terms of what the original estimate was and the supplementary funding request which covers the entirety of the Business Plan. Does that answer your question? (*Interjection by Hon. D J Bossino*) It is above the estimated amount last year but within the budget that we set through the supplementary funding process.

## EDUCATION AND JUSTICE & INTERNATIONAL EXCHANGE OF INFORMATION

**Q161/2015**

**Supply teachers and/or support auxiliary staff –  
Details**

1675 **Clerk:** Question 161, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Education provide details of any changes there may have been since the answer to Question 54/2015 in respect of supply teachers and/or support auxiliary staff, currently engaged by the Department of Education?

1680 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information.

1685 **Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, in respect of my answer to Question 54/2015, the only change to report is that out of the 10 supply cleaners mentioned, eight have been made permanent and the other two are in the process of being recruited, one at Bayside School and one at Bishop Fitzgerald Middle School.

The hon. Member will recall that in one of the schedules to Question 54, in particular Table 4, there was a reference to 10 part-time cleaners with a remark column saying 'in the process of being recruited'. Eight of those have now been recruited and two are in the process of being recruited.

1690 The only other change, Mr Speaker, in respect of the tables previously given, is not a change in actual circumstances but simply the filling of a gap which the hon. Member will recall in Table 1 he saw that under the reasons for cover – this is of supply teachers – there was a gap in one of the teachers covering at the college.

1695 I now have that information and can report that the reason for the cover is an SEN Life Skills Course, which I know that the hon. Member will recognise as ASDAN, and that is a specific Life Skills Course which has been delivered over the course of this year for pupils of special educational needs and that is a temporary cover which has been done over the whole of the academic year.

Those are the only two changes to report, Mr Speaker.

1700 **Hon. E J Reyes:** I am really grateful, Mr Speaker, for the updated information. I know it is just a month since the last time but I posed this question now because it has given the Department of Education enough time to consolidate any information or any amendments required from the start of the term. Therefore, I am satisfied now that I have a complete picture at least for the remainder of this term.

1705 Thank you.

**Q162/2015**  
**Government subsidised students outside Gibraltar –**  
**Full details**

**Clerk:** Question 162, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1710

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, please provide a full breakdown of what every Government subsidised student studying outside Gibraltar is studying, broken down by (a) course; (b) university; (c) whether the course is an undergraduate or postgraduate course and (d) the cost of each course.

1715

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information.

**Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, the information requested is set out in the schedule which I now hand to the hon. Member.

Schedule to Question 162 of 2015					
QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG	
1 BSc	Aberdeen University	Genetics	£9,000.00	UG	
2 BSc	Aberystwyth University	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG	
3 BA	Academy of Contemporary Music	Creative Sound Design/Music Production	£7,995.00	UG	
4 BMUS	Academy of Contemporary Music Guildford	Professional Music Performance	£7,995.00	UG	
5 Diploma	Academy of Creative Training	Actor Training	£9,000.00	UG	
7 BSc/ACCA	Leeds Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	PG	
8 BA	Anglia Ruskin University	History	£8,549.00	UG	
9 BA	Anglia Ruskin University	Drama & Film Studies	£8,549.00	UG	
10 BSc	Anglia Ruskin University	Crime & Investigative Studies	£9,000.00	UG	
11 BSc	Anglia Ruskin University	Forensic Science	£8,549.00	UG	
12 BSc	Anglia Ruskin University	Accounting & Finance	£8,549.00	UG	
13 BA	Arts University College Bournemouth	Arts & Events Management	£8,600.00	UG	
14 BA	Arts University College Bournemouth	Architecture	£9,000.00	UG	
15 Foundation Degree	Askam Bryan College, York	Animal Management	£6,000.00	UG	
17 BA	Bangor University	History	£9,000.00	UG	
18 BA	Bangor University	Linguistics and English Language	£9,000.00	UG	
19 BA	Bangor University	Criminology & Criminal Justice	£9,000.00	UG	
20 BSc	Bangor University	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG	
21 BSc	Bangor University	Geography	£9,000.00	UG	
22 BA	Bath Spa University	Business & Management	£9,000.00	UG	
23 MEng	Cardiff University	Civil Engineering	£3,465.00	PG	
24 MEng	Cardiff University	Civil Engineering	£3,465.00	PG	
25 BMus/MA	Berkeley College of Music Boston	Music	£9,000.00	UG	
26 BA	BIIMM Brighton	Professional Musicianship	£5,950.00	UG	
27 HNC	BIIMM Manchester	Artist Development Diploma in Modern Music	£4,950.00	UG	
28 HNC	BIIMM Manchester	Artist Development Diploma in Modern Music	£4,950.00	UG	
29 BA	Birbeck, University of London	Philosophy	£8,000.00	UG	
30 BA	Birmingham City University	Visual Communication (Illustration)	£8,200.00	UG	
31 BA	Birmingham City University	Theatre Performance & Event Design	£8,200.00	UG	
32 CertHE	Blackpool & Fylde College	Musical Theatre	£1,500.00	UG	
33 BA	Blackpool College	Performing Arts	£6,000.00	UG	
34 HNC	Bournemouth & Poole College	Art & Design	£9,000.00	UG	
35 BA	Bournemouth University	Events Management	£9,000.00	UG	
36 BA	Bournemouth University	Events Management	£9,000.00	UG	
37 BPS QSEP	University of Northumbria	Sports & Exercise Psychology	£5,450.00	PG	
38 BPTC	BPP Law School, Leeds	Law	£14,240.00	PG	
39 BPTC	City University, London	Law	£17,000.00	PG	
40 BPTC	University of Exeter	Law	£12,240.00	PG	
41 BPTC	University of Birmingham	Law	£13,575.00	PG	
42 BPTC	University of Northumbria	Law	£11,725.00	PG	
43 BA	Bradford University College	Performing Arts (Production)	£9,000.00	UG	
44 CertMus	Brighton Institute of Modern Music	Professional Musicianship	£5,950.00	UG	
45 CertMus	Brighton Institute of Modern Music	Professional Musicianship	£5,950.00	UG	
46 BSc	Brunel University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG	
47 BA	Buckinghamshire New University	Event and Festival Management	£9,000.00	UG	
48 BA	Buckinghamshire New University	Sports Development & Coaching	£9,000.00	UG	
49 BSc	Buckinghamshire New University	Criminology	£9,000.00	UG	
50 BSc	Buckinghamshire New University	Psychology & Criminology	£9,000.00	UG	
51 BSc	Buckinghamshire New University	Music Management Branding & PR	£9,000.00	UG	
52 HND	Buckinghamshire New University	Health & Social Care	£7,500.00	UG	
53 BA	Canterbury Christchurch University College	American Studies	£9,000.00	UG	
54 BA	Canterbury Christchurch University College	Events Management	£9,000.00	UG	
55 BSc	Canterbury Christchurch University College	Business Studies with Politics	£9,000.00	UG	
56 BSc	Canterbury Christchurch University College	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG	
57 LLB(BA)	Canterbury Christchurch University College	Law with Business	£9,000.00	UG	
58 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Accounting Economics & Finance	£9,000.00	UG	
59 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	International Tourism Management	£9,000.00	UG	
60 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Tourism Management	£9,000.00	UG	
61 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Educational and Early Childhood Studies	£9,000.00	UG	
62 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Events Management	£9,000.00	UG	
63 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Business & Management Studies	£9,000.00	UG	
64 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG	
65 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Events Management	£9,000.00	UG	
66 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG	
67 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Business & Management Studies with Marketing	£9,000.00	UG	
68 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Educational Studies & Early Childhood Studies	£9,000.00	UG	
69 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Business & Management	£9,000.00	UG	
70 BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG	
71 BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sports Coaching	£9,000.00	UG	
72 BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Computing	£9,000.00	UG	
73 BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sport & Exercise Science	£9,000.00	UG	
74 BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sports Biomedicine & Nutrition	£9,000.00	UG	
75 BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Environmental Health	£9,000.00	UG	
76 BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Computing	£9,000.00	UG	
77 BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG	
78 BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Computing	£9,000.00	UG	
79 BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sports Management	£9,000.00	UG	
80 BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Business Management	£9,000.00	UG	
81 Foundation Degree	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG	
82 Foundation Degree	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Health & Social Care	£9,000.00	UG	
83 Foundation Degree	Cardiff Metropolitan University	International Tourism Management	£9,000.00	UG	
84 Foundation Degree	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Health & Social Care	£9,000.00	UG	
85 HND	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sports Development & Coaching	£7,800.00	UG	
86 HND	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sports Development and Coaching	£7,800.00	UG	
87 LLB	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Law	£9,000.00	UG	
88 BA	Cardiff University	Spanish & Italian	£9,000.00	UG	
89 BSc	Cardiff University	Sociology	£9,000.00	UG	
90 BSc	Cardiff University	Optometry	£9,000.00	UG	
91 BSc	Cardiff University	History & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG	
92 MEng	Cardiff University	Civil Engineering	£3,465.00	UG	
93 MScD	Cardiff University	Orthodontics (PG Training)	£12,486.00	PG	
94 HNC/NVQ	Central Sussex College	Professional Cookery	£5,000.00	UG	

	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG
95	MBBS BSc	Charles University Faculty of Medicine, Czech R	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
96	MBBS BSc	Charles University Faculty of Medicine, Czech R	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
97	MBBS BSc	Charles University Faculty of Medicine Czech R	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
98	MBBS BSc	Masaryk University Faculty of Medicine Czech R	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
99	BA	Chester University	History	£9,000.00	UG
100	BA	City & Guilds of London Art School	Fine Art, Painting	£6,000.00	UG
101	Foundation Degree	City College Plymouth	Accounting & Finance	£5,950.00	UG
102	BSc	City University London	Speech & Language Therapy	£9,000.00	UG
103	BSc	City University London	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
104	MSC/DPsych	City University London	Counselling Psychology	£7,000.00	PG
105	BSc	Coventry University	Geography & Natural Hazards	£9,000.00	UG
106	BSc	Coventry University	Environmental Health	£9,000.00	UG
107	BSc	Coventry University	Occupational Therapy	£9,000.00	UG
108	Foundation	Coventry University	Law & Practice	£9,000.00	UG
109	BSc	Dalhousie University Canada	Geology/ Petrology	£9,000.00	UG
110	BSc Econ	David Game College	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
111	DipCounselling Psych	City University London	Counselling Psychology	£7,200.00	PG
112	BA	De Montfort University	Drama Studies	£9,000.00	UG
113	BA	De Montfort University	Performing Arts	£9,000.00	UG
114	BA	De Montfort University	Accounting & Economics	£9,000.00	UG
115	BSc	De Montfort University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
116	BA	Derby University	Fine Art	£9,000.00	UG
117	MA	Dundee University	Architecture	No fees - Scotland	UG
118	BA	Durham University	Ancient History	£9,000.00	UG
119	BA	Durham University	History	£9,000.00	UG
120	BA	Durham University	Social Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
121	BSc	Durham University	Economics	£9,000.00	UG
122	BA	Edge Hill University	Dance & Theatre Arts	£9,000.00	UG
123	BA	Edgehill University	TV & Film Production	£9,000.00	UG
124	Diploma in Ballet	English National Ballet School	Dance	£17,000.00	UG
125	BSc	Essex University	Nursing	£9,000.00	UG
126	BA	Exeter College	Film & TV Practice	£9,000.00	UG
127	BA	Exeter University	History & International Relations	£9,000.00	UG
128	LLB	Exeter University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
129	LLB	Exeter University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
130	BA	Franciscan University of Steubenville	Theology	£9,000.00	UG
131	GDL	BPP University College, Waterloo	Law	£9,990.00	PG
132	BA	Gateshead College	Humanities	£7,810.00	UG
133	BA	Gateshead College	Humanities	£7,810.00	UG
134	BA	Gateshead College	Humanities	£7,810.00	UG
135	BA	Goldsmith's University of London	Journalism	£9,000.00	UG
136	BSc	Goldsmith's University of London	Management & Entrepreneurship	£9,000.00	UG
137	BA	Greenwich University	International Business with language (2yrs top up)	£9,000.00	UG
138	BA	GSM London (Plymouth University)	Accounting & Finance	£6,000.00	UG
139	BA	Guildford College	Counselling	£6,000.00	UG
140	BA	Hertfordshire University	Graphic Design & Illustration	£8,700.00	UG
141	MBBS	Hull York Medical School	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
142	MBBS	Humanities University, Milan, Italy	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
143	MBBS	Imperial College London	Medicine	£3,465.00	UG
144	MBBS	Imperial College London	Medicine	£3,465.00	UG
145	BA	Keele University	Geography with Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
146	BA	Keele University	English Literature & History	£9,000.00	UG
147	BSc	Keele University	Psychology & Criminology	£3,465.00	UG
148	BSc	Keele University	Psychology & Mathematics	£9,000.00	UG
149	BSc	Keele University	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
150	LLB	Keele University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
151	LLB	Keele University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
152	MBChB	Keele University	Medicine	£3,465.00	UG
153	BSc	Kings College London	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
154	MB BS	Kings College London	Medicine	£3,465.00	UG
155	PG Dip	Kings College London	Nursing Studies with Registration - Adult	£8,980.00	UG
156	BA	Kings College London	Dance	£4,850.00	UG
157	BA	Kings College London	Art & Design	£6,000.00	UG
158	HE Diploma	Kings College London	Applied Computing	£1,950.00	UG
159	BA	Kingston University	English Language & Communications & English Literature	£9,000.00	UG
160	BA	Kingston University	Human Resource Management	£9,000.00	UG
161	BA	Kingston University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
162	BA	Kingston University	Business Management	£9,000.00	UG
163	BA	Kingston University	Politics & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
164	BA	Kingston University	Politics & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
165	BA	Kingston University	Economics	£9,000.00	UG
166	BA	Kingston University	Business & Law	£9,000.00	UG
167	BA	Kingston University	Business Management	£9,000.00	UG
168	BA	Kingston University	English Language & Communication & International Relation	£9,000.00	UG
169	BA	Kingston University	Criminology & Social Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
170	BA(QTS)	Kingston University	Primary Teaching	£9,000.00	UG
171	BA	Kingston University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
172	BA	Kingston University	Illustration & Visual communication	£9,000.00	UG
173	BA	Kingston University	Photography	£9,000.00	UG
174	BA	Kingston University	Sociology & Business	£9,000.00	UG
175	BA	Kingston University	Journalism & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
176	BA	Kingston University	Business Management	£9,000.00	UG
177	BSc	Kingston University	Sport Science	£9,000.00	UG
178	BSc	Kingston University	Computer Studies	£9,000.00	UG
179	BSc	Kingston University	Mental Health Nursing	£9,140.00	UG
180	BSc	Kingston University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
181	BSc	Kingston University	Psychology & Politics	£9,000.00	UG
182	BSc	Kingston University	Computer Networks	£9,000.00	UG
183	BSc	Kingston University	Psychology with Spanish	£9,000.00	UG
184	BSc	Kingston University	Business Economics	£9,000.00	UG
185	BSc	Kingston University	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
186	BSc	Kingston University	Biological Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
187	BSc	Kingston University	Creative Technologies	£9,000.00	UG
188	BSc	Kingston University	Midwifery	£10,010.00	UG
189	Foundation Degree	Kingston University	Environmental Hazards & Disaster Management	£4,600.00	UG



	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG
190	HND	Kingston University	Business & Finance	£6,000.00	UG
191	HND	Kingston University	Business & Finance	£6,000.00	UG
192	LLB	Kingston University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
193	BSc	Kingston University	Mental Health Nursing	£9,140.00	UG
194	HND	Lancaster & Morecambe The College	Public Services	£3,500.00	UG
195	BSc	Lancaster University	Geography	£9,000.00	UG
196	BSc	Lancaster University	Maths & Statistics	£9,000.00	UG
197	BSc	Lancaster University	Geography	£9,000.00	UG
198	BA	Leeds Beckett University	Entertainment Management	£3,465.00	UG
199	BA	Leeds Beckett University	Business & Management	£9,000.00	UG
200	Foundation Degree	Leeds City College	Applied Computing	£6,200.00	UG
201	HND	Leeds College of Building	Construction & The Built Environment	£4,000.00	UG
202	HND	Leeds College of Building	Construction & The Built Environment	£4,000.00	UG
203	BA	Leeds College of Music	Popular Music	£9,000.00	UG
204	BA	Leeds Metropolitan University	Design	£3,465.00	UG
205	BA	Leeds Metropolitan University	Accounting and Finance	£9,000.00	UG
206	BA	Leeds Metropolitan University	Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
207	BA	Leeds Metropolitan University	History	£9,000.00	UG
208	BA	Leeds Metropolitan University	French & Tourism Management	£9,000.00	UG
209	BA	Leeds Metropolitan University	Business & Management	£9,000.00	UG
210	BA	Leeds Metropolitan University	Law, Social Science and Communication Studies	£9,000.00	UG
211	BA	Leeds Metropolitan University	Landscape, Architecture & Design	£9,000.00	UG
212	BSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Quantity Surveying	£3,465.00	UG
213	BSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Music Technology	£9,000.00	UG
214	BSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
215	BSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Computing	£9,000.00	UG
216	BSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
217	BSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Construction Management	£9,000.00	UG
218	BSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Computing	£9,000.00	UG
219	BA	Leeds Metropolitan University	Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
220	LLB	Leeds Metropolitan University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
221	LLB	Leeds Metropolitan University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
222	LLB	Leeds Metropolitan University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
223	BA	Leeds University	Graphic & Communication Design	£9,000.00	UG
224	BA	Leeds University	Business & Management	£3,465.00	UG
225	BEng	Leeds University	Mechanical/Automotive Engineering	£9,000.00	UG
226	BA	Lincoln University	Graphic Design	£9,000.00	UG
227	HNC	Liverpool Community College	Fashion & Clothing	£3,477.20	UG
228	BA	Liverpool Hope University	Music with Education	£9,000.00	UG
229	BA(QTS)	Liverpool Hope University	Primary Teaching with Special Educational Needs	£9,000.00	UG
230	BSc	Liverpool Hope University	Sports & Exercise Science	£9,000.00	UG
231	LLB	Liverpool Hope University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
232	BA	Liverpool John Moore University	Architecture	£9,000.00	UG
233	BA	Liverpool John Moore University	International Journalism	£9,000.00	UG
234	BA	Liverpool John Moore University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
235	BA	Liverpool John Moore University	Education with Special Inclusive Needs	£9,000.00	UG
236	BA	Liverpool John Moore University	Early Childhood Studies	£9,000.00	UG
237	BA	Liverpool John Moore University	Business Management	£3,465.00	UG
238	BA	Liverpool John Moore University	History	£9,000.00	UG
239	BA	Liverpool John Moore University	Criminology & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
240	BA	Liverpool John Moore University	Fine Art	£9,000.00	UG
241	BA	Liverpool John Moore University	Events Management	£8,420.00	UG
242	BSc	Liverpool John Moore University	Construction Management	£9,000.00	UG
243	BSc	Liverpool John Moore University	Environmental Health	£9,000.00	UG
244	BSc	Liverpool John Moore University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
245	BSc	Liverpool John Moore University	IT & Multimedia Computing	£9,000.00	UG
246	BSc	Liverpool John Moore University	Software Engineering	£9,000.00	UG
247	BSc	Liverpool John Moore University	Applied Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
248	BSc	Liverpool John Moore University	Construction Management	£9,000.00	UG
249	BSc	Liverpool John Moore University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
250	Foundation Degree	Liverpool John Moore University	Business Law & Social Studies	£4,800.00	UG
251	Foundation Degree	Liverpool John Moore University	Inclusive Sport Development	£4,800.00	UG
252	MSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	ACCA Professional (Embedded)	£3,500.00	PG
253	LLM	University College, London	Corporate Law	£12,900.00	PG
254	LLM	University of Derby	International & Comparative Law	£9,000.00	PG
255	LLM	University of Leeds	International Business Law	£7,000.00	PG
256	LLM	University of Northumbria	International Commercial Law	£4,905.00	PG
257	LLM	University of Nottingham	International Commercial Law	£6,010.00	PG
258	Certificate	London Academy of Music Production	Sound Engineering	£1,298.00	UG
259	Foundation Year	London Art Portfolio	Interior Design Access Course	£9,000.00	UG
260	Foundation Year	London Art Portfolio	Art & Design	£9,000.00	UG
261	BA	London College of Fashion	Fashion Illustration	£9,000.00	UG
262	BA	London Metropolitan University	Architecture	£8,240.00	UG
263	BSc	London Metropolitan University	Social Science & Humanities	£5,360.00	UG
264	BSc	London Metropolitan University	Sports Science & Physical Education	£7,100.00	UG
265	BSc	London Metropolitan University	Computing	£7,140.00	UG
266	BSc	London Metropolitan University	Computer Games Programming	£6,800.00	UG
267	RIBA	London Metropolitan University	Professional Diploma in Architecture	£3,465.00	PG
268	BSc	London School of Business and Finance	Business Management	£7,500.00	UG
269	BSc	London School of Economics and Political Science	International Recreation & History	£8,500.00	UG
270	BSc	London South Bank University	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
271	Foundation Degree	London South Bank University	Baking Technology Management	£9,000.00	UG
272	BEng	London Southbank University	Mechanical Engineering	£8,450.00	UG
273	BA	London Studio Centre	Dance Theatre	£9,000.00	UG
274	BA	Loughborough University	Graphic Design & Visual Communications	£9,000.00	UG
275	BA	Loughborough University	History & Politics	£9,000.00	UG
276	BEng (Hons)	Loughborough University	Mechanical Engineering	£9,000.00	UG
277	BSc	Loughborough University	Accounting & Financial Management	£9,000.00	UG
278	BSc	Loughborough University	Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
279	BSc	Loughborough University	Computer Science	£9,000.00	UG
280	BSc	Loughborough University	Physics & Mathematics	£9,000.00	UG
281	BSc	Loughborough University	Geography	£9,000.00	UG
282	BA	Loughborough University	Accounting	£9,000.00	UG
283	LPC	BPP Law School, London	LPC	£9,740.00	PG
284	MA	Canterbury Christchurch University College	Theology	£3,996.00	PG

	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG
285	MA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sports Management & Leadership	£9,000.00	PG
286	MA	City College Brighton	Food & Culinary Arts	£9,000.00	PG
287	MA	City University London	Human Centred Systems	£9,000.00	PG
288	MA	Kings College, London	Child Studies	£6,000.00	PG
289	MA	Lancaster University	Human Resources & Counselling	£9,500.00	PG
290	MA	Leeds Beckett University	Graphic Arts Design	£9,000.00	PG
291	MA	Leeds Metropolitan University	Human Resource Management	£6,000.00	PG
292	MA	London College of Fashion	Fashion Marketing	£7,500.00	PG
293	MA	London Metropolitan University	Counselling Psychology	£7,200.00	PG
294	MA	London South Bank College	Education	£9,000.00	PG
295	MA	National Film & TV School	Composition for Film & TV	£11,800.00	PG
296	MA	Royal Central University of London	Drama & Movement Therapy	£10,148.00	PG
297	MA	St Mary's University College	International Tourism Development	£4,410.00	PG
298	MA	St Mary's University College	International Tourism Development	£4,410.00	PG
299	MA	The Institute of Music Performance, London	Popular Music Performance	£6,450.00	PG
300	MA	University of Bangor	History	£4,250.00	PG
301	MA	University of Bangor	Creative Studies	£3,996.00	PG
302	MA	University of Bournemouth	Model Making	£9,000.00	PG
303	MA	University of Durham	International Relations	£6,200.00	PG
304	MA	University of Durham	Museum & Artefact Studies	£6,200.00	PG
305	MA	University of East Anglia	Counselling & Psychotherapy	£6,900.00	PG
306	MA	University of Edinburgh	French & Spanish	£9,000.00	PG
307	MA	University of Glasgow	English Language & Italian	£1,820.00	PG
308	MA	University of Kent	Religion	£5,100.00	PG
309	MA	University of Loughborough	Sports Management	£5,900.00	PG
310	MA	University of Missouri	Studio Art Graphic Design	£9,000.00	PG
311	MA	University of Newcastle	Human Resources Management	£8,500.00	PG
312	MA	University of Newcastle	Latin American & Interdisciplinary Studies	£5,000.00	PG
313	MA	University of Portsmouth	Communication & Language Skills	£5,000.00	PG
314	MA	University of Sheffield	Sociology	£5,140.00	PG
315	MA	University of South Wales	Public Services	£9,000.00	PG
316	MA	University of Warwick	Continental Philosophy	£7,050.00	PG
317	MA	University of York	English Literary Studies	£6,200.00	PG
318	MA	University of York	Criminology & Social Research	£6,200.00	PG
319	MA	Wimbledon College of Arts	Drawing	£3,465.00	PG
320	BA	Manchester College	Musical Theatre	£8,400.00	UG
321	BA	Manchester Metropolitan University	Philosophy	£8,000.00	UG
322	BA	Manchester Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
323	BA	Manchester Metropolitan University	Accountancy & Finance	£8,000.00	UG
324	BA	Manchester Metropolitan University	History	£8,000.00	UG
325	BA	Manchester Metropolitan University	Art & Design	£9,000.00	UG
326	BA	Manchester Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
327	BA	Manchester Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
328	BA	Manchester Metropolitan University	International Business & Spanish	£9,000.00	UG
329	BA	Manchester Metropolitan University	Events Management	£8,000.00	UG
330	BA	Manchester Metropolitan University	Primary Education	£9,000.00	UG
331	BSc	Manchester Metropolitan University	Psychology / Sociology	£2,250.00	UG
332	BSc	Manchester Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£8,000.00	UG
333	BSc	Manchester Metropolitan University	Geography	£3,465.00	UG
334	BSc	Manchester Metropolitan University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
335	BSc	University of Lancaster	Mathematics	£4,321.00	PG
336	BA	Mc Gill University Montreal, Canada	History & Economics	£3,465.00	UG
337	MCLinDent	Cardiff University	Orthodontics	£10,800.00	PG
338	MCLinDent	University College London	Orthodontics	£10,800.00	PG
339	MEng	Oxford Brookes University	Mechanical Engineering	£9,000.00	PG
340	MEng	University of Bath	Mechanical Engineering	£9,000.00	PG
341	MEng	University of Lancaster	Computer Science	£3,996.00	PG
342	MEng	University of Leeds	Computer Science	£9,000.00	PG
343	MEng	University of Leicester	Aerospace Engineering	£3,465.00	PG
344	MEng	University of Newcastle	Chemical Engineering	£3,465.00	PG
345	MEng	University of Northumbria	Electrical Engineering	£9,000.00	PG
346	MEng	University of Southampton	Ship Science	£9,000.00	PG
347	MEng	University of Southampton	Civil Engineering	£4,500.00	PG
348	BA	Middlesex University	Business Management	£9,000.00	UG
349	BA	Middlesex University	Music & Arts Management	£9,000.00	UG
350	BEng	Middlesex University	Network Management & Security	£9,000.00	UG
351	BSc	Middlesex University	Computer Science	£9,000.00	UG
352	LLB	Middlesex University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
353	MMath	University of Loughborough	Mathematics	£3,465.00	PG
354	MMath	University of Newcastle	Mathematics	£9,000.00	PG
355	MMATH	University of York	Mathematics	£13,380.00	PG
356	MMus	University College, London	Ethnomusicology	£4,500.00	PG
357	Foundation Degree	Montessori Centre International, London	Early Childhood Practice	£8,270.00	UG
358	DipHE	Leeds Metropolitan University	Osteopathy	£3,465.00	PG
359	MA	Mount Batten Institute	International Business Practise	£9,000.00	PG
360	MA	Mount Batten Institute	International Business Practise	£9,000.00	PG
361	MPhil	University of Cambridge	Clinical Neuroscience	£18,774.00	PG
362	MPhil	University of Westminster	Research into Life Sciences	£4,037.50	PG
363	MPhys	Imperial College, London	Physics	£9,000.00	PG
364	MPhys	University of Sheffield	Physics	£9,000.00	PG
365	MSc	Franciscan University in Steubenville	Science in Education	£9,000.00	PG
366	MSc	Imperial College, London	Economics & Strategy for Business	£22,000.00	PG
367	MSc	Kings College London	Early Intervention in Psychosis	£9,200.00	PG
368	MSc	Kings College London	Science Technology & Medicine in History	£8,250.00	PG
369	MSc	Kings College London	International Marketing	£10,500.00	PG
370	MSc	Kings College London	Analytical Toxicology	£10,500.00	PG
371	MSc	Kingston University, London	Psychology	£5,800.00	PG
372	MSc	Kingston University, London	Financial & Business Management	£9,800.00	PG
373	MSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Psychology with Sociology	£13,180.00	PG
374	MSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Sports & Exercise Nutrition	£5,000.00	PG
375	MSc	Manchester Metropolitan University	Exercise & Sport	£4,200.00	PG
376	MSc	Nottingham Trent University	Psychological Well Being & Mental Health	£5,350.00	PG

	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG
377	MSc	Nottingham Trent University	Sports Law	£6,420.00	PG
378	MSc	St Mary's University College	Sport Rehabilitation	£4,860.00	PG
379	MSc	Teesside University	Forensic Psychology	£4,500.00	PG
380	MSc	Teesside University	Crime Scene Science	£8,450.00	PG
381	MSc	University College London	Clinical Mental Health	£8,500.00	PG
382	MSc	University College London	Pharmacology	£9,000.00	PG
383	MSc	University of Chichester	Physical Education	£8,500.00	PG
384	MSc	University of Huddersfield	Network Technology & Management	£4,460.00	PG
385	MSc	University of Leeds	International Business Law	£7,000.00	PG
386	MSc	University of Loughborough	Sports Management	£6,250.00	PG
387	MSc	University of Northampton	Counselling & Psychotherapy	£5,500.00	PG
388	MSc	University of Northumbria	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	PG
389	MSc	University of Reading	Plant Diversity	£5,500.00	PG
390	BA	New York University	Economics	£9,000.00	UG
391	BSc	Newcastle College	Nursery Nurse	£9,000.00	UG
392	DipHE	Newcastle College	Hair and Media Makeup	£9,000.00	UG
393	CertHE	Newcastle College	Retail & Enterprise	£9,000.00	UG
394	CertHE	Newcastle College	Hairdressing & Barbering	£9,000.00	UG
395	BTEC	Newcastle Under Lyme College	Working with Children and Young People	£9,000.00	UG
396	BA	Newcastle University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
397	BA	Newcastle University	Town Planning	£9,000.00	UG
398	BA	Newcastle University	International Business Management	£9,000.00	UG
399	BA	Newcastle University	Business Accounting & Finance	£6,333.00	UG
400	BA	Newcastle University	Accounting and Finance	£9,000.00	UG
401	BA	Newcastle University	Modern Languages & Business Studies	£9,000.00	UG
402	BA	Newcastle University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
403	BA	Newcastle University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
404	BA	Newcastle University	Politics & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
405	BEng	Newcastle University	Civil Engineering	£9,000.00	UG
406	BSc	Newcastle University	Business Accounting & Finance	£6,333.00	UG
407	BSc	Newcastle University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
408	BSc	Newcastle University	Economics & Management	£9,000.00	UG
409	BSc	Newcastle University	Zoology	£9,000.00	UG
410	BSc	Newcastle University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
411	Foundation Degree	Northampton Moulton College	Sports Therapy & Sports Injuries	£9,000.00	UG
412	BA	Northampton University	Interior Design	£9,000.00	UG
413	BA	Northampton University	Drama & English	£9,000.00	UG
414	BA	Northampton University	Advertising	£9,000.00	UG
415	BA	Northampton University	Creative Writing	£9,000.00	UG
416	BA	Northampton University	Primary Education	£9,000.00	UG
417	BA	Northampton University	Interior Design	£9,000.00	UG
418	BSc	Northampton University	Human Geography	£9,000.00	UG
419	LLB	Northampton University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
420	BA	Northern School of Contemporary Dance	Contemporary Dance	£9,000.00	UG
421	BA	Northern School of Contemporary Dance	Contemporary Dance	£9,000.00	UG
422	BA	Northumbria University	History & Politics	£9,000.00	UG
423	BA	Northumbria University	Accounting	£9,000.00	UG
424	BA(QTS)	Northumbria University	Early Primary Education	£9,000.00	UG
425	BA	Northumbria University	Spanish with Business	£3,465.00	UG
426	BA	Northumbria University	Graphic Design	£9,000.00	UG
427	BA	Northumbria University	History & Politics	£9,000.00	UG
428	BA	Northumbria University	Business & Finance	£3,465.00	UG
429	BSc	Northumbria University	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
430	BSc	Northumbria University	Biomedical Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
431	BSc	Northumbria University	Geography	£9,000.00	UG
432	BSc	Northumbria University	Biomedical Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
433	BSc	Northumbria University	Computer Science	£9,000.00	UG
434	BSc	Northumbria University	Architectural Technology	£3,465.00	UG
435	BSc	Northumbria University	Electrical Engineering	£9,000.00	UG
436	BSc	Northumbria University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
437	BSc	Northumbria University	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
438	BSc	Northumbria University	Communication & Public Relation	£9,000.00	UG
439	LLB	Northumbria University	Law	£9,475.00	UG
440	LLB	Northumbria University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
441	LLB	Northumbria University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
442	GDL	Nottingham Law School	GDL	£8,160.00	UG
443	BEng (BA)	Nottingham Trent	Civil Engineering	£9,000.00	UG
444	BA	Nottingham Trent	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
445	BA	Nottingham Trent	Fashion	£8,750.00	UG
446	BA	Nottingham Trent	Modern Languages	£9,000.00	UG
447	BA	Nottingham Trent	Media & International Relation	£8,500.00	UG
448	BA	Nottingham Trent	Criminology	£9,000.00	UG
449	LLB	Nottingham Trent	Law	£9,000.00	UG
450	LLB	Nottingham Trent	Law & Business	£9,000.00	UG
451	LLB	Nottingham Trent	Law with Criminology	£9,000.00	UG
452	BSc	Nottingham Trent	Wildlife Conservation	£8,500.00	UG
453	BA	Oxford Brookes University	Business Management & Communication	£6,000.00	UG
454	BA	Oxford Brookes University	History & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
455	BA	Oxford Brookes University	History & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
456	BA	Oxford Brookes University	Education	£9,000.00	UG
457	BA	Oxford Brookes University	City & Regional Planning	£9,000.00	UG
458	BA	Oxford Brookes University	Business Management & Spanish	£9,000.00	UG
459	BA	Oxford Brookes University	History of Art	£9,000.00	UG
460	BSc	Oxford Brookes University	Sport & Exercise Science	£9,000.00	UG
461	BSc	Oxford Brookes University	Business Management	£9,000.00	UG
462	BSc	Oxford Brookes University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
463	BSc	Oxford Brookes University	Computer Science	£9,000.00	UG
464	BSc	Oxford Brookes University	Psychology & Human Biosciences	£9,000.00	UG
465	BSc	Oxford Brookes University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
466	LLB	Oxford Brookes University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
467	LLB	Oxford Brookes University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
468	LLB	Oxford Brookes University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
469	BA	Oxford University	Psychology & Philosophy	£9,000.00	UG
470	BA	Parsons The new School for Design USA	Communication Design	£9,000.00	UG
471	PG Dip	University of Cardiff	Conscious Sedation in Dentistry	£9,000.00	PG



	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG
472	PGCE	Bath Spa University	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
473	PGCE	Canterbury Christchurch University College	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
474	PGCE	Kingston University, London	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
475	PGCE	Leeds Metropolitan University	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
476	PGCE	Leeds Metropolitan University	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
477	PGCE	Manchester Metropolitan University	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
478	PGCE	Oxford Brookes University	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
479	PGCE	St Mary's University College	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
480	PGCE	University of Brighton	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
481	PGCE	University of Cambridge	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
482	PGCE	University of Cambridge	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
483	PGCE	University of Cambridge	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
484	PGCE	University of Chichester	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
485	PGCE	University of Creative Arts, Epsom	Fashion Design	£9,000.00	PG
486	PGCE	University of Exeter	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
487	PGCE	University of Leicester	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
488	PGCE	University of Plymouth	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
489	PGCE	University of Roehampton	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
490	PGCE	University of Sussex	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
491	PhD	University of Bristol	Theology	£3,996.00	PG
492	PhD	University of Leeds	Cancer Pharmacology	£3,975.00	PG
493	BA	Plymouth College of Art	Animation	£9,000.00	UG
494	BA	Plymouth University	Social Work	£9,000.00	UG
495	BA	Plymouth University	Early Childhood Studies	£9,000.00	UG
496	BSc	Plymouth University	Science	£3,465.00	UG
497	BSc	Plymouth University	Hospitality Management	£9,000.00	UG
498	BSc	Plymouth University	Computing	£9,000.00	UG
499	BSc	Plymouth University	Maritime Business & Logistics	£9,000.00	UG
500	HND	Plymouth University	Law	£5,950.00	UG
501	Diploma	Point Blank Music College	Music Production & Sound Engineering	£8,125.00	UG
502	Diploma	Point Blank Music College	Music Production & Sound Engineering	£8,125.00	UG
503	Diploma	Point Blank Music College	Music Production & Sound Engineering	£8,125.00	UG
504	Diploma	Point Blank Music College	Music Production & Sound Engineering	£9,000.00	UG
505	BA	Queen Margaret University	Therapeutic Radiography	£6,750.00	UG
506	BA	Queen Mary University of London	English Literature	£1,350.00	UG
507	BA	Reading University	Art	£9,000.00	UG
508	BA	Regents College	Global Business and Sustainability Management	£9,000.00	UG
509	BA	Regents College	Creative Industries	£9,000.00	UG
510	BA	Regents College	Business & Global Management	£9,000.00	UG
511	BA	Roehampton University	Philosophy	£8,400.00	UG
512	BSc	Roehampton University	Psychology	£8,400.00	UG
513	MBBCh	Royal College of Surgeons Ireland	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
514	BA	Royal Holloway University of London	Modern History & Politics	£9,000.00	UG
515	BA	Royal Holloway University of London	English	£9,000.00	UG
516	BA	Royal Holloway University of London	French & Italian	£9,000.00	UG
517	BA	Royal Northern College of Music	Popular Music Performance	£9,000.00	UG
518	BA	Royal Northern College of Music	Popular Music	£9,000.00	UG
519	BA	Royal Northern College of Music, Manchester	Popular Music Performance	£9,000.00	UG
520	BA	School of Oriental & African Studies, London	International Politics	£9,000.00	UG
521	CertHE	Sheffield City College	Animal Care	£9,000.00	UG
522	BA	Sheffield Hallam University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
523	BA	Sheffield Hallam University	Performance for Stage & Screen	£9,000.00	UG
524	BA	Sheffield Hallam University	History	£9,000.00	UG
525	BA	Sheffield Hallam University	Childhood Studies	£9,000.00	UG
526	BA	Sheffield Hallam University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
527	BSc	Sheffield Hallam University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
528	BSc	Sheffield Hallam University	Computing	£9,000.00	UG
529	BSc	Sheffield Hallam University	Mathematic with Education & QTS	£9,000.00	UG
530	BSc	Sheffield Hallam University	Hospitality Business Management	£9,000.00	UG
531	BSc	Sheffield Hallam University	Product Design	£9,000.00	UG
532	BSc	Sheffield Hallam University	Midwifery	£9,000.00	UG
533	BSc	Sheffield University	Biology	£9,000.00	UG
534	LLB	Sheffield University	Law (European & International)	£9,000.00	UG
535	BA	SIST University Tangier	Business Management	£4,038.46	UG
536	HND	Solihull College	Advanced Practice in work with Children and Families	£4,950.00	UG
537	Foundation Year	South Devon College of HE	Health & Social Care	£2,551.00	UG
538	BA	South Essex College of HE	Graphic Design	£9,000.00	UG
539	BA	Southampton Solent University	Business Management	£8,300.00	UG
540	BA	Southampton Solent University	Make-up & Hair Design	£9,000.00	UG
541	BSc	Southampton Solent University	Software Engineering	£9,000.00	UG
542	BSc	Southampton Solent University	Computing	£9,000.00	UG
543	BSc	Southampton Solent University	Construction Management	£9,000.00	UG
544	BSc	Southampton Solent University	Construction Management	£9,300.00	UG
545	BSc	Southampton Solent University	Shipping & Port Management	£9,000.00	UG
546	BSc	Southampton Solent University	Accountancy & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
547	BA	Southampton University	Politics	£9,000.00	UG
548	MBBS BSc	St George's University of London	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
549	BA	St Mary's University College	English & Creative & Professional Writing	£8,400.00	UG
550	BA	St Mary's University College	Dance & Theatre Arts	£8,400.00	UG
551	BA	St Mary's University College	Film and Popular Culture and Psychology	£8,400.00	UG
552	BA	St Mary's University College	Drama & Applied Theatre	£8,400.00	UG
553	BA	St Mary's University College	Sociology	£8,400.00	UG
554	BA Joint Honours	St Mary's University College	Drama & English	£8,400.00	UG
555	BA	St Mary's University College	Management Studies	£8,400.00	UG
556	BA(QTS)	St Mary's University College	Primary Education (QTS)	£9,000.00	UG
557	BSc	St Mary's University College	Nutrition & Health	£8,400.00	UG
558	BSc	St Mary's University College	Geography	£9,000.00	UG
559	HND	St Mary's University College	Psychology & Counselling	£4,500.00	UG
560	LLB	St Mary's University College	Law	£9,000.00	UG
561	PGCE	St Mary's University College	PGCE	£9,000.00	UG
562	BA	St Mary's University College	Management Studies	£9,000.00	UG
563	BA(QTS)	St Mary's University College	Primary Education with QTS	£8,400.00	UG
564	BA	St Mary's University College	History	£9,000.00	UG
565	BA	St Mary's University College	English & History	£9,000.00	UG

	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG.
566	BA	St Mary's University College	Drama & English	£9,000.00	UG
567	HND	St Mary's University College	Psychology & Counselling	£4,500.00	UG
568	LLB	St Mary's University College	Law	£3,465.00	UG
569	LLB	St Mary's University College	Law	£9,000.00	UG
570	BA	Staffordshire University	Early Childhood Studies	£8,620.00	UG
571	BSc	Staffordshire University	Forensic Investigation	£8,620.00	UG
572	LLB	Staffordshire University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
573	BA	Swansea Metropolitan University	Accounting	£7,500.00	UG
574	BEng (Hons)	Swansea Metropolitan University	Computer Systems & Electronics	£7,500.00	UG
575	HND	Swansea Metropolitan University	Tourism Management	£7,500.00	UG
576	HND	Swansea Metropolitan University	Building Studies	£7,500.00	UG
577	HND	Swansea Metropolitan University	Software Engineering	£7,500.00	UG
578	HND	Swansea Metropolitan University	Computer & Information Systems	£7,500.00	UG
579	HND	Swansea Metropolitan University	Quantity Surveying	£7,500.00	UG
580	HND	Swansea Metropolitan University	Sports Management	£7,500.00	UG
581	HND	Swansea Metropolitan University	Computing & Information Systems	£7,500.00	UG
582	BA	Swansea University	Philosophy Politics & Economics	£9,000.00	UG
583	BA	Swansea University	Spanish	£9,000.00	UG
584	BSc	Swansea University	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
585	LLB	Swansea University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
586	LLB	Swansea University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
587	Diploma	Tante Marie Culinary Academy	Intensive Cordon Bleu Diploma	£9,000.00	UG
588	BA	Tech Music School Fulham	Music Production	£5,950.00	UG
589	BA	Tech Music School London	Music Production	£5,950.00	UG
590	BA	Tech Music School London	Music Production	£5,950.00	UG
591	Diploma	Tech Music School London	Songwriting & Musical Performance	£4,950.00	UG
592	BSc	Teesside University	Psychology	£7,950.00	UG
593	Foundation Degree	Teesside University	Computing	£5,500.00	UG
594	HND	Teesside University	Social Sciences	£5,750.00	UG
595	BSc	Teesside University	Sports Therapy	£7,950.00	UG
596	BA	The American University of Paris	International Relations	£9,000.00	UG
597	BTEC	The Manchester College	Children's Care Learning & Development	£9,000.00	UG
598	FdA	The Manchester College	Make Up Artistry Effects	£6,800.00	UG
599	FdA	The Manchester College	Events Management	£5,950.00	UG
600	BA	The University of Arts Bournemouth	Fashion Design	£8,600.00	UG
601	BA	The University of Bournemouth	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
602	MBChB	The University of Buckingham	Medicine	£12,000.00	UG
603	BA	The University of Gloucestershire	English Literature & Language	£8,250.00	UG
604	MBChB	The University of Liverpool	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
605	LLB	The University of Manchester	Law	£9,000.00	UG
606	BSc	The University of Northampton	Geography (Physical Geography)	£9,000.00	UG
607	BMedSci BHBS	The University of Nottingham	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
608	BSc	The University of Sheffield	Mathematics	£9,000.00	UG
609	MPhys	The University of Sheffield	Physics with Astrophysics	£9,000.00	UG
610	BA	The University of Warwick	History of Art	£9,000.00	UG
611	LLB	The University of Warwick	Law	£9,000.00	UG
612	BA	The University of York	Applied Social Science	£9,000.00	UG
613	BSc	Trinity College Dublin	Science	£9,000.00	UG
614	BA	Trinity Laban Conservatoire	Contemporary Dance Theatre	£9,048.00	UG
615	BDS	Universidad Cardenal Herrera Valencia	Dentistry	£9,000.00	UG
616	BDS	Universidad Cardenal Herrera Valencia	Dentistry	£9,000.00	UG
617	BDS	Universidad Cardenal Herrera Valencia	Dentistry	£9,000.00	UG
619	BA	University College Birmingham	Hospitality Tourism Management	£3,465.00	UG
620	Foundation Degree	University College Birmingham	Sports Therapy	£8,282.00	UG
621	Foundation Degree	University College Birmingham	Events Management	£8,282.00	UG
622	Foundation Degree	University College Birmingham	Marketing & Events Management	£8,282.00	UG
623	BSc	University College London	Politics & Eastern European Studies	£9,000.00	UG
624	BSc	University College London	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
625	BSc	University College London	Information Management for Business	£9,000.00	UG
626	BA	University for the Creative Arts Canterbury	Fine Art	£9,000.00	UG
627	Foundation Year	University for the Creative Arts Canterbury	Art & Design	£1,250.00	UG
628	BA	University for the Creative Arts Epsom	Fashion Design	£9,000.00	UG
629	BA	University of Bangor, Wales	Health & Social Care	£9,000.00	UG
630	BA	University of Bangor, Wales	Health & Social Care	£9,000.00	UG
631	BSc	University of Bath	Natural Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
632	BSc	University of Bath	Molecular & Cellular Biology	£9,000.00	UG
633	BSc	University of Bath	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
634	BA	University of Bedfordshire	Early Years Education	£9,000.00	UG
635	BSc	University of Bedfordshire	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
636	LLB	University of Bedfordshire	Law	£9,000.00	UG
637	LLB	University of Bedfordshire	Law	£9,000.00	UG
638	LLB	University of Brighton	Law with Business	£3,465.00	UG
639	BSc	University of Bristol	Mathematics	£3,465.00	UG
640	BVSc	University of Bristol	Veterinary Science	£3,465.00	UG
641	MBChB	University of Bristol	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
642	PhD	University of Bristol	Theology & Religious Studies	£3,996.00	UG
643	BA	University of Cambridge	Psychological & Behavioural Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
644	MSc	University of Cambridge	Natural Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
645	BA	University of Cardiff	Italian	£9,000.00	UG
646	BA	University of Cardiff	Media Journalism & Cultural Studies	£9,000.00	UG
647	BSc	University of Cardiff	Accounting	£9,000.00	UG
648	MBBCh	University of Cardiff	Medicine	£3,465.00	UG
649	BA	University of Central Lancashire	Fine Art	£9,000.00	UG
650	BA	University of Central Lancashire	Social Work	£9,000.00	UG
651	BSc	University of Central Lancashire	Psychology with Psychotherapy & Counselling	£9,000.00	UG
652	BSc	University of Central Lancashire	Physiotherapy	£9,000.00	UG
653	BSc	University of Central Lancashire	Fire & Leadership	£9,000.00	UG
654	BSc / BA	University of Central Lancashire	Fire & Leadership Studies	£9,000.00	UG
655	Foundation Year	University of Central Lancashire	Sports Rehabilitation & Nutritional Sciences	£3,900.00	UG
656	BA	University of Chester	Fine Art	£8,000.00	UG
657	BA	University of Chester	Sports Journalism	£8,000.00	UG
658	BA	University of Chester	Dance	£9,000.00	UG
659	BSc	University of Chester	Mathematics	£3,465.00	UG
660	BSc	University of Chester	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
661	BSc	University of Chester	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG

	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG
662	LLB	University of Chester	Law	£8,000.00	UG
663	BA	University of Chichester	Sport Development & Coaching	£8,500.00	UG
664	BSc	University of Chichester	Sports & Exercise Psychology	£8,500.00	UG
665	BSc	University of Chichester	Sport & Exercise Science	£8,500.00	UG
666	BSc	University of Chichester	Sport & Exercise Science	£8,500.00	UG
667	Foundation Degree	University of Chichester	Community Sports Coaching	£8,500.00	UG
668	BSc	University of Colorado, Colorado Springs, USA	Golf and Sports Management	£9,000.00	UG
669	BA	University of Cumbria	Primary Education with Special Needs	£9,000.00	UG
670	BSc	University of Cumbria	Criminology & Social Sciences	£7,850.00	UG
671	BA	University of Derby	Accounting & Finance	£7,443.00	UG
672	BEd	University of Derby	Educational and Early Childhood Studies	£9,000.00	UG
673	BSc	University of Derby	Mathematics	£7,938.00	UG
674	MBChB	University of Dundee	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
675	BA	University of Durham	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
676	BSc	University of East Anglia	Environmental Geophysics	£9,000.00	UG
677	LLB	University of East Anglia	Law	£9,000.00	UG
678	MBChB	University of East Anglia	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
679	BA	University of East Anglia	History	£9,000.00	UG
680	BA	University of East London	Photography	£9,000.00	UG
681	BSc	University of East London	Business Economics	£9,000.00	UG
682	BA	University of Edinburgh	Spanish	£910.00	UG
683	MA	University of Edinburgh	Divinity	£1,820.00	UG
684	BA	University of Exeter	International Relations	£9,000.00	UG
685	BA	University of Exeter	Theology	£9,000.00	UG
686	BA	University of Exeter	Business Management with International Studies	£9,000.00	UG
687	BA	University of Exeter	International Relations & French	£9,000.00	UG
688	BSc	University of Exeter	Mathematics	£3,465.00	UG
689	BSc	University of Gastronomic Sciences Italy	Gastronomic Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
690	BSc	University of Glamorgan	Forensic Biology	£9,000.00	UG
691	BSc	University of Glamorgan	Nursing	£9,000.00	UG
692	MBChB	University of Glasgow	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
693	BA	University of Gloucestershire	Graphic Design	£8,250.00	UG
694	BSc	University of Gloucestershire	Interactive Games Design	£8,250.00	UG
695	BA	University of Herefordshire	Music & Entertainment Industry Management	£8,200.00	UG
696	BA	University of Hertfordshire	Digital Animation	£9,000.00	UG
697	BA	University of Hertfordshire	Philosophy	£9,000.00	UG
698	BA	University of Hertfordshire	Animation Programme	£8,700.00	UG
699	BA	University of Hertfordshire	3D Digital Animation	£9,000.00	UG
700	BSc	University of Hertfordshire	Songwriting and Music Production	£8,700.00	UG
701	BSc	University of Hertfordshire	Sports Therapy	£8,700.00	UG
702	BSc	University of Hertfordshire	Molecular Biology & Genetics	£3,465.00	UG
703	BA	University of Huddersfield	Music Technology & Popular Music	£8,250.00	UG
704	BA	University of Huddersfield	Fashion & Textile Design	£3,465.00	UG
705	MSc	University of Huddersfield	Network Technology & Management	£4,460.00	UG
706	BSc	University of Hull	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
707	BSc	University of Hull	Chemistry with Nanotechnology	£9,000.00	UG
708	BA	University of Kent	Architecture	£9,000.00	UG
709	BA	University of Kent	Law & Politics	£9,000.00	UG
710	BA	University of Kent	Politics and International Relations	£3,465.00	UG
711	BA	University of Kent	Comparative Literature	£9,000.00	UG
712	BA	University of Kent	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
713	BA	University of Kent	Business Administration	£9,000.00	UG
714	BA	University of Kent	English & American Literature	£9,000.00	UG
715	BSc	University of Kent	Anthropology	£9,000.00	UG
716	BSc	University of Kent	Web Computing	£9,000.00	UG
717	BSc	University of Kent	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
718	BSc	University of Kent	Mathematics	£9,000.00	UG
719	BSc	University of Lancaster	Natural Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
720	BA	University of Leeds	History of Art & Italian	£9,000.00	UG
721	BA	University of Leeds	Classical Civilizations	£9,000.00	UG
722	BSc	University of Leeds	Economics	£9,000.00	UG
723	BSc	University of Leeds	Nutrition & Health	£9,000.00	UG
724	CEHO	University of Leeds	Environmental Health	£9,000.00	UG
725	MBChB	University of Leicester	Medicine	£3,465.00	UG
726	BA	University of Lincoln	Fine Art	£9,000.00	UG
727	BA	University of Lincoln	English & Journalism	£9,000.00	UG
728	BA	University of Liverpool	Architecture	£9,000.00	UG
729	BSc	University of Liverpool	Pharmacology	£9,000.00	UG
730	BSc	University of Liverpool	Physics & Mathematics	£9,000.00	UG
731	BSc	University of Liverpool	Diagnostic Radiography	£9,000.00	UG
732	BSc	University of Liverpool	Diagnostic Radiography	£9,000.00	UG
733	MBBS	University of Malta	Medicine	No fees - Malta	UG
734	MD	University of Malta	Medicine	No fees - Malta	UG
735	BA	University of Manchester	Italian & Spanish	£9,000.00	UG
736	BA	University of Manchester	History of Art & Spanish	£9,000.00	UG
737	BSc	University of Manchester	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
738	BSc	University of Newcastle	Computing Science	£3,465.00	UG
739	LLB	University of Newcastle	Law	£9,000.00	UG
740	MBChB	University of Newcastle	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
741	BA	University of Northampton	Fine Art	£9,000.00	UG
742	BA	University of Northampton	Events Management	£9,000.00	UG
743	BA	University of Northampton	Film & Television Studies	£9,000.00	UG
744	BSc	University of Northampton	Psychology & Counselling	£9,000.00	UG
745	HND	University of Northampton	Travel & Tourism Management	£7,250.00	UG
746	BA	University of Northumbria	Business & Economics	£9,000.00	UG
747	BSc	University of Northumbria	Information Technology Management for Business	£9,000.00	UG
748	BSc	University of Northumbria	Sport Exercise and Nutrition	£9,000.00	UG
749	BA	University of Nottingham	History	£9,000.00	UG
750	BA	University of Nottingham	History	£9,000.00	UG
751	BA	University of Nottingham	Law with Spanish & Spanish Law	£9,000.00	UG
752	BSc	University of Nottingham	Psychology & Cognitive Neuroscience	£9,000.00	UG
753	MBChB	University of Oxford	Medicine	£3,465.00	UG
754	BEd	University of Plymouth	Primary Education (Special Educational Needs)	£9,000.00	UG
755	BA	University of Portsmouth	Accountancy & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
756	BA	University of Portsmouth	Accounting with Finance	£9,000.00	UG



	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG
757	BA	University of Portsmouth	Business & Management	£9,000.00	UG
758	BA	University of Portsmouth	Childhood & Youth Studies with Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
759	BA	University of Portsmouth	Film Studies & Creative Writing	£9,000.00	UG
760	BA	University of Portsmouth	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
761	BSc	University of Portsmouth	Environmental Science	£9,000.00	UG
762	BSc	University of Portsmouth	Mathematics	£9,000.00	UG
763	BSc	University of Portsmouth	Sport & Exercise Science	£9,000.00	UG
764	BA	University of Reading	Art	£3,465.00	UG
765	BA	University of Reading	Fine Art	£9,000.00	UG
766	BA	University of Reading	Italian & History	£9,000.00	UG
767	BA	University of Reading	History & Philosophy	£9,000.00	UG
768	BA	University of Reading	Art	£9,000.00	UG
769	BA	University of Reading	History	£9,000.00	UG
770	BSc	University of Reading	Nutrition	£9,000.00	UG
771	BSc	University of Reading	Information Technology	£9,000.00	UG
772	BSc	University of Reading	Geography (human & Physical)	£9,000.00	UG
773	BSc	University of Reading	Biomedical Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
774	BSc	University of Reading	Biomedical Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
775	BSc	University of Reading	Biomedical Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
776	LLB	University of Reading	Law with European Legal Studies	£3,465.00	UG
777	BA	University of Salford	English & Drama	£9,000.00	UG
778	LLB	University of Salford	Law	£9,000.00	UG
779	LLB	University of Salford	Law with Spanish	£3,465.00	UG
780	BA	University of Sheffield	Geography	£9,000.00	UG
781	BA	University of Sheffield	History	£9,000.00	UG
782	BSc	University of Sheffield	Computer Science	£9,000.00	UG
783	BA	University of South Wales	English	£8,250.00	UG
784	BA	University of South Wales	Computer Animation	£8,000.00	UG
785	BSc	University of South Wales	Sociology & Criminology	£8,000.00	UG
786	BSc	University of South Wales	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
787	HND	University of South Wales	Public & Emergency Services	£6,750.00	UG
788	HND	University of South Wales	Computing	£5,000.00	UG
789	BSc	University of South Wales Glamorgan	Computer Science	£9,000.00	UG
790	MBChB	University of Southampton	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
791	LLB	University of Southampton	Maritime Law	£9,000.00	UG
792	BA	University of St Andrews	Geography	£9,000.00	UG
793	BSc	University of St Andrews	Biology	£9,000.00	UG
794	BA	University of St Mark & St John Plymouth	Primary Education	£9,000.00	UG
795	BEd	University of St Mark & St John Plymouth	Early Years with QTS	£9,000.00	UG
796	BSc	University of St Mark & St John Plymouth	Speech & Language Therapy	£9,000.00	UG
797	BA	University of Staffordshire	Sports Public Relations & Journalism	£8,620.00	UG
798	BSc	University of Sunderland	Psychology	£7,800.00	UG
799	BSc	University of Surrey	Mathematics	£9,000.00	UG
800	BSc	University of Surrey	Politics & Economics	£9,000.00	UG
801	BSc	University of Surrey	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
802	BSc	University of Surrey	Mathematics	£9,000.00	UG
803	BSc	University of Surrey	Business & Retail Management	£3,465.00	UG
804	LLB	University of Surrey	Law with Criminology	£9,000.00	UG
805	BA	University of the Arts London	Magazine Publishing	£9,000.00	UG
806	BA	University of the Arts London	Fine Art Photography	£9,000.00	UG
807	BA	University of the Creative Arts Canterbury	Fine Art	£8,500.00	UG
808	BA	University of the West of England Bristol	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
809	BA	University of the West of England Bristol	Business Studies	£3,465.00	UG
810	BA	University of the West of England Bristol	Tourism Management	£3,465.00	UG
811	BA	University of the West of England Bristol	Media Culture and Practice	£9,000.00	UG
812	BA	University of the West of England Bristol	Business with Accounting & Finance	£3,465.00	UG
813	BSc	University of the West of England Bristol	Computing	£9,000.00	UG
814	LLB	University of the West of England Bristol	Law	£9,000.00	UG
815	LLB	University of the West of England Bristol	Law	£9,000.00	UG
816	LLB	University of the West of England Bristol	Law	£9,000.00	UG
817	BA	University of Warwick	History of Art	£9,000.00	UG
818	BA	University of Warwick	History & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
819	BSc	University of Warwick	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
820	BSc	University of Warwick	Mathematics & Physics	£9,000.00	UG
821	MBChB	University of Warwick	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
822	BA	University of West London	Events Management with Tourism	£8,500.00	UG
823	BSc	University of West London	Culinary Arts Management	£8,500.00	UG
824	BA	University of Westminster	Commercial Music	£9,000.00	UG
825	BA	University of Winchester	Archaeology	£8,500.00	UG
826	BA	University of Winchester	Performing Arts	£8,500.00	UG
827	BA	University of Wolverhampton	Graphic Design	£8,900.00	UG
828	BA	University of Wolverhampton	Business Management	£8,900.00	UG
829	BA	University of Wolverhampton	Accounting & Finance	£3,465.00	UG
830	BA	University of Wolverhampton	Linguistics with TESOL	£8,900.00	UG
831	BA	University of Wolverhampton	Business Management	£8,900.00	UG
832	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Fire & Rescue	£8,900.00	UG
833	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Fire & Rescue	£8,900.00	UG
834	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Information Technology	£8,900.00	UG
835	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Fire & Rescue	£8,650.00	UG
836	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Fire and Rescue	£9,000.00	UG
837	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Quantity Surveying	£8,900.00	UG
838	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Fire and Rescue	£8,900.00	UG
839	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Fire & Rescue	£8,000.00	UG
840	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Fire & Rescue	£8,900.00	UG
841	Foundation Degree	University of Wolverhampton	Law, Social Sciences & Communications	£9,000.00	UG
842	HND	University of Wolverhampton	Health & Social Care	£5,500.00	UG
843	HND	University of Wolverhampton	Computing	£7,325.00	UG
844	HND	University of Wolverhampton	Computing	£7,325.00	UG
845	BA	University of Worcester	Digital Film Production & Screenwriting	£8,900.00	UG
846	BSc	University of Worcester	Psychology	£7,290.00	UG
847	Foundation Degree	University of Worcester	Football Business Management & Coaching	£9,000.00	UG
848	BA	University of York	Sociology with Criminology	£9,000.00	UG
849	BA	University of York	Historical Archaeology	£9,000.00	UG
850	BA	University of York	English & Related Literature	£9,000.00	UG
851	BA	University of York	Social Work	£9,000.00	UG

	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG
852	BSc	University of York	Economics & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
853	BSc	University of York	Accounting Business Finance & Management	£9,000.00	UG
854	BSc	University of York	Economics	£9,000.00	UG
855	BSc	University of York	Microbiology & Biotechnology	£9,000.00	UG
856	BSc	Warsash Maritime Academy	Marine Operations	£9,000.00	UG
857	Marine Vessel Master	Warsash Maritime Academy	Master Ships Master Reg	£9,000.00	UG
858	BSc	Westminster University	Chinese Medicine; Acupuncture	£9,000.00	UG
859	BSc	Wolverhampton University	Quantity Surveying	£8,900.00	UG
860	Foundation Degree	York College	Applied Computing	£6,000.00	UG
861	Foundation Degree	York College	Media Make Up Special Effects and Hair Design	£6,000.00	UG
862	BA	York St John University	Creative Writing & English Literature	£9,000.00	UG
863	BA	York St John University	Business Management	£9,000.00	UG
864	BA	York St John University	Youth & Community work	£9,000.00	UG
865	BSc	York St John University	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
866	BSc	York St John University	Sports Science & Injury Rehabilitation	£9,000.00	UG

1720 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, I will wait for the schedule to be handed over. Yes. I will wait for the hon. Member to see it before making a particular comment in relation to this schedule. It is a complex and –

**Mr Speaker:** The information there is in respect of nearly 900 students so I suggest we go on to the next question, 163.

1725 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, can I just say – ?

**Mr Speaker:** Do you wish to add something to the main answer? Okay.

1730 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Yes, just add to that answer, as the hon. Mr Speaker has mentioned, this is a list in respect of 866 students, 866 students which are this year being fully funded to study outside Gibraltar.

Mr Speaker, I can rightly say that is an extraordinary number of students (*Banging on desks*) to be funded by the Government to be studying outside Gibraltar in a small community such as ours. It includes, in that list, not just undergraduate students but also postgraduate students, including Masters and PhDs. And that to a large extent has arisen as a result of a change in policy by this Government which decided that the mandatory scholarship scheme was to apply not only to undergraduate students, but also to postgraduate students who wanted to do a Masters or further studies. (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) (*Banging on desks*)

Mr Speaker, can I just say that this record which is set out in this schedule is a record which Gibraltar as a community can rightly feel proud of.

1740 **Mr Speaker:** Can I suggest to the Hon. Minister that the next time that he provides such a schedule, instead of referring to St Mary's University College, it should be St Mary's University Twickenham. It became a University last year; it is no longer a University College. It is listed here as St Mary's University College; it is now a University and it is called St Mary's University, Twickenham. The former Strawberry Hill College is now St. Mary's University, Twickenham.

1745 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Yes, Mr Speaker. I know it is referred to as University College –

**Mr Speaker:** You are using the old terminology.

1750 **Hon. G H Licudi:** I will advise the Department of Education of that.

**Mr Speaker:** Is there any supplementary from the Leader of the Opposition?

1755 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, just out of interest in the purpose of all this, there is an analytical purpose for this and I will look at it in due course when I have time. But my attention has been taken by just an entry; three pages from the back where it says University of Malta – Medicine and there are no fees for both, there are two entries for University of Malta – Medicine, no fees. Can he just explain why there are no fees in relation to the University of Malta when there are fees in respect of all the other entries?

1760 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I can certainly do that. The hon. Member will know that two weeks ago, I was in Malta meeting the Rector, Juanito Camilleri of the University of Malta itself and this is an issue that we certainly discussed.

1765 Malta has a scheme whereby the University of Malta provides free education for its students and in providing free education for its students, it is free education not just for its students, but EU students. Therefore Gibraltar students that choose to go to the University of Malta... and in fact the University of Malta's Faculty of Medicine is a very prestigious and well-known faculty of medicine and produces some very, very good professionals from that University.



1770 We have two of our own students in that faculty – (*Interjection*) Yes, the education is in English, absolutely and we have two of our students studying at this prestigious college at no cost to the Government because that is the model that the University of Malta or that Malta, as a jurisdiction, has decided that it provides free education for its students and by extension, it also means free education to EU students.

1775 **Mr Speaker:** As long ago as 1975, Dr Albert GUILLEM was studying medicine at the University of Malta and I met him when I visited the island in 1975.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister confirm if the same argument applies to the entry in respect of student number 117 at Dundee University undertaking an undergraduate course in architecture? It says the same, no fees – Scotland.

1780 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Yes, Mr Speaker, that is indeed the position although I understand that the position in Scotland has now changed and therefore students from outside Scotland do now pay a fee. I seem to recall, if the hon. Member will remind me of the... oh it says, no fees, Scotland.

1785 My understanding is that in respect of new students going to Scotland there will be fees payable but this is one that had started already at a time when the system was that no fees were payable for studying in Scotland. I know this because it also caught my eye when I saw the list and I asked the specific question that the hon. Member has asked.

1790 **Hon. E J Reyes:** The only one, Mr Speaker, the Minister either knows it now or may have to seek the information. The student listed on 117, the qualification is an MA which one reads as Master of Arts, normally Masters Degrees are recorded as postgraduate, rather than undergraduate and on the right-hand side column he is down as an undergraduate.

1795 Unless nomenclatures have changed, Mr Speaker, from your time and mine, undergraduate is normally up to the obtaining of a Bachelor's Degree and anything beyond that is then considered postgraduate. The Minister may need some time to check with the Department of Education on that one, but it does seem at first glance a contradiction in terms.

**Hon. G H Licudi:** Yes, Mr Speaker, that is one that I missed when I went through the list and I will check.

1800 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, it is a fascinating, I have to say it is a fascinating list and hopefully it is the last supplementary we will ask on this side of the House. But 1995 to 1998 there are four entries, Faculty of Medicine in the Czech Republic and they are all studying, four students studying medicine. Is that in Czech or is it in English as well?

1805 I understand that there is a lot of competition for medicine in the United Kingdom and people are looking for alternatives. It just strikes me the medicine in the Czech Republic and I am just asking the question whether it is in Czech or whether it is in English that the courses are provided.

1810 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I am tempted to say that I will *check* what the *Czechs* do, (*Laughter*) but I do know the answer. This is of course in English but we do have, as the hon. Member has said there is a lot of competition for medicine in UK universities and sometimes we have had – and I seem to recall one last year or the year before, a straight-A student who did not get a place for a medicine course in the UK and students over the last few years have been looking at alternatives. One of the alternatives that was looked at, apart from Malta which we have already seen, is the Czech Republic and we now actually have four in that faculty doing medicine in English, taught in English in the Czech Republic.

1815 **Mr Speaker:** There is one final question, which is to the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister. Mr Bossino.

#### DEPUTY CHIEF MINISTER

Q180/2015

European Single Skies –  
Gibraltar's inclusion

**Clerk:** Question 180, the Hon. D J Bossino.

1820 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Deputy Chief Minister provide any updates to the House in relation to seeking Gibraltar's inclusion in the new European Single Skies Directive, having regard to recent press reports in relation to this issue?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

1825 **Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia):** Yes, Mr Speaker, the answer remains the same as given in the answer to Question 773/2014.

1830 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I thank the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister for that. There was a press report in the *Gibraltar Chronicle* reporting on Latvia's Presidency in relation to this saying that it was going to prioritise obviously because it was affecting all the other EU member states.

Does he get a sense as to whether there has been a change as a result of the Presidency? The last time that I asked the question I think it was an Italian Presidency in the Chair and I just wondered whether he senses any difference. Presumably the case is going to be exactly as it was when he answered the question back in, I think it was two months ago when I posed this question in the House.

1840 **Hon. Dr J J Garcia:** Mr Speaker, I will be happy to discuss the matter with him privately, but certainly the position as regards... If he will recall the UK Foreign Secretary spoke to the Italian Foreign Secretary who then had the Presidency of the rotating Presidency of the Council of the EU. They have also spoken to the Latvian Presidency and explained what the UK position is which is that Gibraltar is entitled to be included in the legislation and that our exclusion would be illegal because the aviation law under the treaty applies to Gibraltar.

1845 So that is the position at present, the item, the draft legislation is still held up in the European Council and once it is unblocked from the Council then it moves to discussion with the Parliament. We have not moved to that second phase yet because it is still in the Council.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I do not know whether the hon. Gentleman had the benefit of seeing the press conference held after the meeting in Madrid today, I think the Parliament might have been about to start its session when the press conference was being held.

1850 The position of the Foreign Secretary was as set out in our press statement and in similar way to this House, the position of the Spanish Foreign Secretary was very aggressive and I commend that he should read what it was that he said in terms of understanding what their position is.

**Mr Speaker:** So to table the Written Questions, please.

#### Question 184/2015 continued – Supplementary information

1855 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, before I do, can I crave the Parliament's indulgence and ask to go back to Question 184/2015 which you might recall, Mr Speaker, the very contentious question about the event in Madrid.

1860 Simply to correct the record, the hon. Gentleman opposite said that we need to be responsible for the things that we say in this House and ensure that the record is not in any way improperly reflecting the facts.

1865 In fact, I am going to make myself responsible for his statement as much as for mine. I am told, Mr Speaker, that Mr Victor Ochello was actually in the United Kingdom on the day that I was in Madrid and therefore we should not have been referring to him and whether he had his costs paid, as the hon. Gentleman did and that Mr Richard Buttigieg, another person who the hon. Gentleman referred to in this House, wants to make clear that he paid his own costs of travel to Madrid, having heard his name uttered over the airways.

## Questions for Written Answer

1870 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to table the answers to Written Questions W19 to W23/2015 inclusive.

**Mr Speaker:** I think the House can now recess for 20 minutes.

1875

*The House recessed for 20 minutes.*

## Order of the Day

1880

### **BILLS FIRST AND SECOND READING**

#### **Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – First Reading approved**

**Clerk:** Order of the Day – Bills, First and Second Reading. (1) A Bill for an Act to amend the Gibraltar Regiment Act 1998.

The Hon. the Chief Minister.

1885

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** I have the honour to move that the Bill for an Act to amend the Gibraltar Regiment Act 1998 be read a first time.

1890

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Gibraltar Regiment Act 1998 be read a first time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

**Clerk:** The Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Act 2014.

#### **Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved**

1895

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that the Bill for the Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Act 2015 be read a second time.

Mr Speaker, this Bill updates the Gibraltar Regiment Act which is an Act that is in its current form dated back to 1998 but in fact applies the Army Act 1955.

1900

Changes to legislation concerned with the Armed Forces have been significant over the years in the United Kingdom. The Army Act 1955 is no longer in force, having been swept away by the Armed Forces Act 2006 and this Bill seeks to bring the Royal Gibraltar Regiment up to date in respect of disciplinary matters dealt with in those pieces of legislation.

Clause 2 of the Bill makes amendments to both the long and short titles of the Act so that the legislation will reflect the conferment of the Royal Prefix which was proudly awarded to the Regiment in 1999 after the Act which we are amending.

1905

Clause 3 of the Bill updates definitions within the Act.

Clause 4 replaces existing sections 3 and 4 of the Act and sets out the basis for the establishment, maintenance and disbandment of the RGR – although, Mr Speaker, nobody in Gibraltar can imagine that the RGR should ever be disbanded, but there has to be provision for it and there was in the old Act.

1910

Mr Speaker, clause 6 of the Bill renames Part II of the Act so that it is clear that the part relates to disciplinary matters.

Clause 7 inserts new sections to the Act. Section 5 sets out the purposes of the part which is to provide for a disciplinary framework on the same terms as their UK counterparts for soldiers who are members of the Regiment through Gibraltar.

1915

Section 5A relates to who the part applies to and deems that such persons to be persons subject to service law. In that context, the House will note that the Act will only apply to two classes of persons, effectively those in uniform and to a much more limited extent, to those who were in uniform but have left the Regiment. This section is important because in the UK there is a further class of persons to whom service law applies. These are described as civilians who are subject to service discipline. Such persons could include spouses, partners and other family members of enrolled persons. As far as this Act is concerned, nothing in service law can apply to such persons in Gibraltar.

1920

Section 5B makes further provisions as to the application of service law and in particular restricts the application of service law if it would be contrary to the UK Constitution, the unwritten Constitution. This section also restricts the application of service law to the extent provided for in Schedule 2A. The House will note that the purpose of Schedule 2A is to restrict the implementation of service law to what we might colloquially call within the wire, i.e. the MOD Estate.

Section 5C modifies service law so that it can be applied in Gibraltar and where appropriate and in accordance with our legislation and procedures.

Section 5D provides the basis for the enforcement in Gibraltar of the outcomes of disciplinary proceedings.

Section 5E provides a regulation making power for the purposes of transfer of persons who are deprived of their liberty.

Mr Speaker, section 5F will permit the amendment of service law via subsidiary legislation albeit the House will have sight of any such amendment.

Section 5G relates to persons absenting themselves without leave and provides that warrants may be obtained if granted by a Gibraltar Justice.

Section 5H ensures that a civil criminal court does not lose the right to try a person who may have committed an offence outside of the wire.

Clause 8 of the Bill updates the provisions of section 6 of the Act in connection with the administration of the Regiment.

Clause 10 of the Bill amends section 8 of the Act in connection with the command of the Regiment.

Clause 11 re-classes the nationality requirements for entry into the Regiment in keeping with the UK law. The provisions of the Act concerning liability for service are recast in sections 15A to section 17, as set out in clause 12 of the Bill.

Clauses 12 to 16 of the Bill are minor amendments, some of a typographical nature.

Clause 13 provides a regulation making power allowing the Governor to issue regulations, etc of an administrative nature.

Clause 18 repeals Schedule 1 which provides for terms and conditions of service and which in terms of maintenance updating can be better provided for outside of the confines of an Act.

Clause 19 inserts Schedules 2 and 2A and these represent service law which is to apply to RG Personnel.

Clause 21 reproduces Schedule 4 with a number of minor amendments.

Mr Speaker, I will be moving during the course of the Committee Stage some amendments to the Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill. I have a letter which will be distributed to hon. Members, but the House... Mr Speaker, in order to be of more assistance, I can offer whoever is going to speak on this subject on the other side if they wish – I do not want to make 17 copies but I will make one copy for me and one copy for Members opposite if they wish it, of both a marked up version of the Act that we are amending with the amendments and also a marked up version of the Bill to reflect the amendments that are being proposed at the Committee Stage and if anybody on that side is going to speak on the Bill wants to have a copy I am quite happy to let them have one. There is another copy to come which, I think needs to be printed and that can be circulated in time for the debate on the Committee Stage.

I commend the Bill to the House.

**Mr Speaker:** Before I put the question, does any other hon. Member wish to speak on the general principles and merits of this Bill?

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, the Opposition will be supporting the Bill. Mr Speaker, from my recollection from my time as Minister for Justice, this was something that was discussed when we were in Government, certainly we would have brought a similar Bill to this House in any event and therefore the Opposition is going to be supporting the Government in relation to this particular Bill.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** I am grateful for that indication, Mr Speaker.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Gibraltar Regiment Act 1998 be read a second time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

**Clerk:** The Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Act 2014.

**Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 –  
Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting**

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I beg to give notice that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today, if all hon. Members agree.

**Mr Speaker:** Do all hon. Members agree that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today? (**Members:** Aye.)

**Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 –  
First Reading approved**

**Clerk:** (2) A Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act 1997.  
The Hon. the Minister for Education, Justice & International Exchange of Information.

**Minister for Education, Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, I beg to move that a Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act be read a first time.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act 1997 be read a first time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

**Clerk:** The Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Act 2014.

**Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 –  
Second Reading approved**

**Minister for Education, Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, I beg to move that the Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act 1997 be read a second time.

Mr Speaker, this Bill amends the Tobacco Act so as to clarify, for the avoidance of doubt, the situations where certain searches may be carried out under the Act. This clarification reflects the operation of the Act and the search powers thereunder since 1999 and allows for the search, without a warrant, of any vehicle in Gibraltar where a Police or Customs Officer has reasonable grounds to suspect that cigarettes in circumstances contrary to the provisions of the Tobacco Act 1997, may be found within. This amendment clarifies that officers have the same powers when dealing with locally registered vehicles as they do with foreign registered vehicles.

And just to explain the issues, if I can read what the current section says, it is section 17C(1) it says:

‘Every police or customs officer shall have free access to any vessel or aircraft at the port or airport and of any vehicle brought into Gibraltar where there are reasonable grounds to suspect that cigarettes may be found in that vessel, aircraft or motor vehicle in circumstances contrary to the provisions of this Act, and may –‘

and then it sets out the powers.

It is a reference to ‘brought into’ Gibraltar that has just raised... the interpretation that has been given previously is that every vehicle has at some stage been brought into Gibraltar and therefore the powers have always existed. But given that the matter was raised, this is just an amendment for the avoidance of doubt that refers to every vehicle in Gibraltar whether it is brought in the day before or two years before is irrelevant, it now relates to any vehicle in Gibraltar, or it will when the House passes the amendment and the Bill is brought into effect.

Mr Speaker I commend the Bill to the House.

**Mr Speaker:** Before I put the question, does any hon. Member wish to speak on the general principles and merits of the Bill?

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, yes, just to say that we will obviously be supporting the Bill and only to really say that it is rather curious in that it will have been an issue that had to be dealt with and it would certainly be interesting on this side of the House to understand in what circumstances it actually arose that the change has been required. But clearly it is not a point of contention at all, Mr Speaker, thank you.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question that –

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker.

**Mr Speaker:** Sorry, yes.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, my officer has received representations from the Collector of Customs about the need to insert an additional power in respect of the Tobacco Act in respect of powers of stop and search in special zones. He has proposed that because of the urgency in dealing with issues which relate to Tobacco and having received these representations shortly, in fact during the space of the last 14 days from the Collector of Customs that we should take the opportunity of using this active Bill which is going to amend the Tobacco Act to make the further amendment.

A letter will be circulated to hon. Members setting out what the proposed amendment is, but they will see that it is literally something headed ‘Additional powers of stop and search in special zones’. The advice that we have through the Collector and the Attorney General’s Office is that this is what the previous Chief Minister used to call giving retrospective legal cover if necessary, in respect of the way that stopping and searching has been happening to date in special zones and how it might be able to continue to happen in the future, to ensure, much as the hon. Gentleman said in respect of the main amendment which was in the green copy, that nobody can make an argument to suggest that there is not a power there that nobody has previously challenged but there is advice now might be challenged in the future.

That is set out in the amendment which will be circulated.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act –

**Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker.

**Mr Speaker:** Yes.

**Hon. G H Licudi:** As the mover of the Bill can I respond to the issue raised by the Hon. Member?

Mr Speaker, the hon. Member just asked about the circumstances which brought this about and it was simply that it was brought to my attention that someone, presumably some lawyer, might at some point raise in court, that there are no powers to search locally registered vehicles. And so as to leave nothing to chance, although we do not believe that was ever the intention of the Bill or that it has ever happened, to leave nothing to chance that somebody might raise it, it was suggested that I should make this amendment just for the sake of clarity. That is how it was brought about.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act 1997 be read a second time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

**Clerk:** The Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Act 2014.

**Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 –  
Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting**

**Minister for Education, Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, I beg to give notice that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today if all hon. Members agree.

**Mr Speaker:** Do all hon. Members agree that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today? (**Members:** Aye.)

**Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 –  
First Reading approved**

**Clerk:** (3) A Bill for an Act to amend the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011.  
The Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information.

2075 **Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):**  
Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that a Bill for an Act to amend the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011, be read a first time.

2080 **Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011, be read a first time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

**Clerk:** The Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment) (No.2) Act 2014.

2085

**Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 –  
Second Reading approved**

**Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):**  
Mr Speaker, I beg to move that a Bill for an Act to amend the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011 be read a second time.

2090 Mr Speaker, this Bill amends the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011 so as to ensure that when calculating the length of a sentence to be served, time spent on remand counts towards just one sentence of imprisonment.

2095 The need for this amendment follows two recent cases before the Supreme Court in Gibraltar, which have dealt with the interpretation of the current section 497 of the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011. The first of these cases was heard when an application for a writ of habeas corpus, whereas the second was due in the sentencing process.

Section 497 was held to be mandatory in that the length of a sentence must be reduced by the time the person has been in custody in connection with the proceedings for that offence. This is appropriate, Mr Speaker, in circumstances where that person is solely on remand for that offence, but not where a person is serving a custodial sentence for another offence or is remanded in custody for more than one offence.

2100 In those circumstances it is only right that the time spent on remand or in Police custody should only count once towards one sentence. This is the position in the United Kingdom and one that this Government believes must have been the intention when this Act was passed.

2105 Mr Speaker, just to put that in general context, if somebody is already serving a sentence of imprisonment and goes to court and is remanded in custody in respect of another offence, that person as this has been interpreted, has the advantage of that same period in remand being counted twice: once in respect of the serving of the period he is already serving; and once in respect of the new sentence if he was to be sentenced respectively for the new offence. In one occasion, I understand the court re-sentenced the individual changed the sentence once this matter was brought to the courts attention so as not to give effect to that double counting.

2110 As I mentioned when I introduced the Bill, the position in the United Kingdom is what we consider, must have been the intention of Parliament when it passed this Act and as a result of the two cases that have arisen in court, we feel that it is only right that we should clarify that a person should not doubly benefit in this kind of situation.

2115 I commend the Bill to the House, Mr Speaker.

**Mr Speaker:** Before I put the question, does any hon. Member wish to speak on the general principles and merits of the Bill?

2120 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, yes, only to confirm that the Opposition will be supporting to this Bill. We have nothing really further to add to this debate.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011 be read a second time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

2125

**Clerk:** The Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Act 2014.

**Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 –  
Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting**

2130 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, I beg to give notice of the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today, if all hon. Members agree.

**Mr Speaker:** Do all hon. Members agree that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today? (**Members:** Aye.)

**International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014 –  
First Reading approved**

2135 **Clerk:** (4) A Bill for an Act to amend the International Corporation (Tax Information) Act 2009.  
The Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information.

2140 **Minister of for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that a Bill for an Act to amend the International Co-operation (Tax Information) Act 2009 be read a first time.

2145 **Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the International Co-operation (Tax Information) Act 2009 be read a first time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

**Clerk:** The International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2009.

**International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014 –  
Second Reading approved**

2150 **Minister of for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that the Bill be now read a second time.

Mr Speaker, the Act contains a definition of Minister currently as the Minister with responsibility for Finance. As the House knows, there was a reshuffle on 9th December 2011 whereby specific responsibility for international exchange of information was created and given Ministerial responsibility and I was tasked with that job.

2155 Therefore, given that we now have a Minister with responsibility for International Exchange of Information, it is appropriate that that is the Minister that has responsibility under this Act and therefore the definition of the Minister in this Act is simply amended to reflect the change in Cabinet responsibilities in this area.

2160 **Mr Speaker:** Does any other hon. Member wish to speak on the general principles and merits of the Bill?

I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the International Co-operation (Tax Information) Act 2009 be read a second time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

**Clerk:** The International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014.

**International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014 –  
Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting**

2165 **Minister of for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, I beg to give notice of the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today, if all hon. Members agree.

2170 **Mr Speaker:** Do all hon. Members agree that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today? (**Members:** Aye.)



**Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 –  
First Reading approved**

**Clerk:** (5) A Bill for an Act to amend the Parliament Act.

The Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB. (*Laughter*)

2175

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** I think if I am responsible for the GSB I had better resign, Mr Speaker. (*Laughter*)

I have the honour to move that a Bill for an Act to amend the Parliament Act be read a first time.

2180

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Parliament Act be read a first time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

**Clerk:** The Parliament (Amendment) Act 2014.

**Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 –  
Second Reading approved**

2185

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** I have the honour to move that the Bill be now read a second time.

Mr Speaker, the Bill introduces in respect of Members of this House, the option of being able to commute 100% of their pension which already exists for civil servants and of course existed previously, just for the private sector when the maximum 25% which used to exist for private sector pensions was first removed under the previous Administration.

2190

As the law stands at the moment, section 94(1) has two subsections, (a) and (b). Subsection (a) is the one that limits the commutation to one quarter of the pension as the maximum; and (b) is the multiplier that produces the value of the commutation to produce a gratuity.

2195

What the new provisions do is in fact they reflect in section 1 the provisions that are there and now there is a new section 2 which simply says that the option can be to have 100% commutation and take no income at all.

I commend the Bill to the House.

2200

**Mr Speaker:** Before I put the question, does any hon. Member wish to speak on the general principles and merits of the Bill?

I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Parliament Act be read a second time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye. Those against? Carried.)

**Clerk:** The Parliament (Amendment) Act 2014.

**Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 –  
Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting**

2205

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, I beg to give notice that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today if all Members agree.

2210

**Mr Speaker:** Do all hon. Members agree that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today? (**Members:** Aye.)

2215

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, may I ask the hon. Gentleman... or do you want me to ask it at Committee Stage?

**Mr Speaker:** Well, really there is only one clause and if you do it in Committee Stage, you can come back to the charge again and again until you understand or whatever point you are making is dealt with.

2220

**Hon. D A Feetham:** It is about members who are only taking their pensions from –

**Mr Speaker:** Well, raise the matter in Committee.

**COMMITTEE STAGE AND THIRD READING**

**Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014;  
Tobacco (Amendment) Bill 2014;  
Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014;  
International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Bill 2014; and  
Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014.**

**Clerk:** Committee Stage and Third Reading, the Hon. Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that the House do now resolve into Committee and consider the following Bills, clause by clause, namely: The Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014; The Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014; The Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014, The International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Bill 2014; and The Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014.

*In Committee of the whole Parliament*

**Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 –  
Clauses considered and approved**

**Clerk:** (1) A Bill for an Act to amend the Gibraltar Regiment Act 1998.  
Clause 1.

**Mr Chairman:** Stands part of the Bill.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, for the benefit of dealing with this issue in a way that is expeditious and given that hon. Members opposite have the Bill as amended – in other words, they have both the amendment to the principal Act that we are amending in mark-up and they have also this Bill with the amendments marked up and the letter that sets out what amendments are being proposed, which they will have seen deal with the issues I put in the speech.

If they agree, would they take those as read?

**Mr Chairman:** I think it would be useful if I had a copy of the letter so that I know at which stage which clause is being amended. It makes it easier for me.

I notice therefore, for instance, that in clause 1 there is an amendment which is just a substitution of 2015 for 2014, so do all hon. Members agree with that amendment?

**Members:** Aye.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, we can treat the letter as effectively he is moving the amendments and we will not have to go through the amendments for every single clause.

**Mr Chairman:** Right. I think procedurally they should be. What I will do is, with each clause, I will ask hon. Members to agree that the amendment of which the Chief Minister has given notice, be incorporated, be agreed to, without having to actually read it out, okay? But as I say in clause 1 there is this straightforward amendment substituting the year 2015 for 2014 agreed. Okay.

**Clerk:** Clause 2.

**Mr Chairman:** Clause 2, do all hon. Members agree with the amendment of which the Chief Minister has given notice? No, there is no amendment to clause 2.

Clause 2 stands part of the Bill.

**Clerk:** Clause 3.

**Mr Chairman:** There is an amendment to clause 3 the Chief Minister has circulated. Are all hon Members happy with it? Is there any point they wish to raise?

So, clause 3 as amended stands part of the Bill.

2280

**Clerk:** Clauses 4 to 6.

**Mr Chairman:** Clauses 4 to 6. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Clauses 4 to 6 stand part of the Bill.

2285

**Clerk:** Clause 7 with amendments.

**Mr Chairman:** In clause 7 there is an amendment of which the Chief Minister has given notice. Are all Members supporting the amendment? (**Members:** Aye.)

2290

So clause 7 as amended stands part of the Bill.

**Clerk:** Clauses 8 and 9.

**Mr Chairman:** Clauses 8 and 9 stand part of the Bill.

2295

**Clerk:** Clause 10 with amendments.

**Mr Chairman:** Clause 10 an amendment has been circulated by the Chief Minister. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Clause 10 as amended stands part of the Bill.

2300

**Clerk:** Clauses 11 to 18.

**Mr Chairman:** Clauses 11 to 18 stand part of the Bill.

2305

**Clerk:** Clause 19 with amendments.

**Mr Chairman:** Clause 19 an amendment has been circulated. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye) Those against? Carried.

Clause 19 as amended stands part of the Bill.

2310

**Clerk:** Clause 20 with amendments.

**Mr Chairman:** There is also an amendment to clause 20. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against?

2315

Clause 20 as amended stands part of the Bill.

**Clerk:** Clause 21 with amendment.

**Mr Chairman:** Clause 21 there is a very simple amendment of which notice has been given. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against?

2320

Clause 21 as amended stands part of the Bill.

**Clerk:** Clause 22.

2325

**Mr Chairman:** Clause 22 stands part of the Bill.

**Clerk:** The long title.

**Mr Chairman:** Stands part of the Bill.

**Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 –  
Clauses considered and approved**

2330

**Clerk:** (2) A Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act 1997.  
Clause 1.

**Mr Chairman:** Clause 1 stands part of the Bill.

2335 **Clerk:** Clause 2 with amendments.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Chairman, yes, there is an amendment that I have spoken to the Hon. Minister for Justice IN RESPECT OF, behind the Speaker's Chair a moment ago, and that is to the amendment to clause 11DA(2).

2340 The amendment currently reads:

‘Where a person or vehicle has been stopped pursuant to subsection (1) and police or customs officer’ –

I have suggested that we add *a* so it is ‘and a police or customs officer’ –

‘has reasonable grounds for believing that an offence has been or is being committed, that officer may search that person, any article that person has with him...’

and then it goes on to say ‘and any vehicle, including any other persons in that vehicle.’

2345 I suggested to the Hon. Minister that we might want to make clear that it is not just any vehicle in the vicinity other than the one that has been stopped. Therefore I would suggest that it be amended to read ‘that officer may search that person, any article that person has with him, the vehicle, including any other persons in that vehicle.’

I can read it again if it would assist.

2350 **Mr Chairman:** I think the hon. Member needs to write it out, the amendment that he is proposing.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** I see, Mr Chairman, it is just that we have often done quick amendments like that on the fly.

2355 **Mr Chairman:** The Government have seen the amendment?

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Yes, I have consulted with the hon. Member, yes.

2360 **Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Chairman, I have discussed it with the hon. Member and I am happy. There is a slight change to the wording used by the hon. Member. Subclause (2), the last two lines should read ‘been committed, that officer may search that person, any article that person has with him, the vehicle and any other persons in that vehicle’.

2365 **Mr Chairman:** I am slightly confused because this is an amendment, I take it, to clause 2. Is that right! Is that the one that I have here from the Chief Minister?

**Hon. G H Licudi:** Sorry, no. It is an amendment to the current section 11DA –

2370 **Mr Chairman:** Ah, there is a further amendment to that. Then the correct procedure would therefore be for the Chief Minister to move the amendment of which I have been given notice and then for the hon. Member with having that amendment before the Committee, for the hon. Member to move an amendment to this amendment. That is the correct procedure.

2375 **Chief Minister (Hon F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I think that that is what we were taking as having happened, although I had not formally moved the amendment. You are right, we moved straight into it and into discussion of it (**Mr Chairman:** Right.) But I think we were all of that mind which you rightly set out now for the record.

2380 **Mr Chairman:** Okay. So, let me then put to the House the Chief Minister's amendment of which notice has been given as amended by the Hon. Selwyn Figueras amendment. Is that clear? Those in favour? **Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

So clause 2 as amended stands part of the Bill.

2385 **Clerk:** The long title.

**Mr Chairman:** Stands part of the Bill.

**Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 –  
Clauses considered and approved**

2390 **Clerk:** (3) A Bill for an Act to amend the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011.  
Clauses 1 and 2.

**Mr Chairman:** Stand part of the Bill.

2395 **Clerk:** The long title.

**Mr Chairman:** Stands part of the Bill.

**International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2009 –  
Clauses considered and approved**

2400 **Clerk:** (4) A Bill for an Act to amend the International Co-operation (Tax Information) Act 2009.  
Clauses 1 and 2.

**Mr Chairman:** Stand part of the Bill.

**Clerk:** The long title.

2405 **Mr Chairman:** Stands part of the Bill.

**Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 –  
Clauses considered and approved**

**Clerk:** (5) A Bill for an Act to amend the Parliament Act.  
Clauses 1 and 2.

2410 **Mr Chairman:** Now in respect of clause 2, I think the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition wishes to  
raise a matter.

2415 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, I just wanted to ask Minister Bossano whether any of these amendments  
affect the rights of those that have retired already. Government Ministers, Members of Parliament that have  
retired and are already in receipt of their pension, whether they can at some stage now take commuted  
pension or whether this only affects those who are not of retirement age at the present moment and are not  
taking any pension at the present moment.

2420 **Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** I think  
it is clear that it is not retrospective, just like the one for the Civil Service. I mean there were people who  
retired a day before the provision was introduced in the Civil Service Pensions Act and they had either  
elected the maximum they were then allowed which was 25% or a lower figure, but they were not able to  
come back and say, 'Well, I would like to make use of the new provision.' Partly because I suppose once  
the pension has been paid, how do you go back?

2425 **Mr Chairman:** Clause 2 stands part of the Bill.

**Clerk:** The long title.

2430 **Mr Chairman:** Stands part of the Bill.

**Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014; Tobacco (Amendment) Bill 2014; Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014; International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Bill 2014; and Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 –  
Third Readings approved: Bills passed**

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to report that The Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014; The Tobacco (Amendment) Bill 2014; The Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014, The International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Bill 2014; and The Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 have been considered in Committee and agreed to with amendments and I now move that they be read a third time and passed.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that The Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014; The Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014; The Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014, The International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Bill 2014; and The Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 be read a third time and passed. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

There is no need to take an individual vote for each of the Bills, since hon. Members are all agreed.

**GOVERNMENT MOTION**

**Royal Anglian Regiment –  
Conferring of Freedom of the City of Gibraltar –  
Motion carried unanimously**

**Clerk:** Government Motion. The Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo)** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move the motion standing in my name, which reads as follows:

*'This House:*

*WELCOMES the long and historic relationship between the Royal Anglian Regiment (and its forerunner Regiments) and Gibraltar;*

*RECALLS that throughout the 18th and 19th centuries, regiments from the Royal Anglian counties of Essex, Northamptonshire, Suffolk, Lincolnshire and Norfolk were posted to Gibraltar to defend the Rock and its people;*

*RECALLS that both the XII Regiment, the forerunner of the Suffolk Regiment, and the 56th Foot, the forerunner of the Essex Regiment, defended Gibraltar during the Great Siege of 1779-1783 and that the XII Regiment formed the main body of the Grand Sortie of November 1781;*

*TAKES NOTE that in recognition of the efforts of the XII Regiment the "Castle and Key" and the name "Gibraltar" were taken as its crest, and that the former remains there to this day in the Royal Anglian regimental crest;*

*RECALLS that in May 1969 a formal affiliation was announced between the Royal Anglian Regiment and the then Gibraltar Regiment and that there have been many instances of Royal Gibraltar Regiment soldiers serving abroad with the Royal Anglians in places like Northern Ireland, Germany, Cyprus, Belize, Bosnia, Iraq and Afghanistan;*

*DECLARES that the Freedom of the City of Gibraltar be conferred on the Royal Anglian Regiment in view of its historic and close connection with Gibraltar and its people.'*

Mr Speaker, this is a motion the text of which to a very great extent speaks for itself. The people of Gibraltar have long and historic links, not just with the United Kingdom but with the Ministry of Defence in particular and with parts of the Ministry of Defence who have been particularly responsible for the defence and protection of Gibraltar and its people at some key times in our history.

Mr Speaker, the Ministry of Defence in Gibraltar still celebrates the Grand Sortie of November 1781 in some style, as I was able to attest to this year and I think the Leader of the Opposition was with me as we enjoyed a sumptuous banquet in St Michael's Cave, demonstrating the importance of that date, even in these times of austerity for the Ministry of Defence, the Grand Sortie is an important date in history.

Mr Speaker, the Anglians were here then and they were here at other important times in the history of Gibraltar, that those who understand how it is that in military terms, the defence of this fortress has been achieved, sometimes in light of almost impossible odds, will recognise the importance of the links that we continue to enjoy with key regiments such as the Royal Anglians, one of the few Regiments that has not disappeared in recent amalgamations etc. of the UK Infantry.

Mr Speaker, in the circumstances, I do not propose to say anything more but I do understand that this motion will be enjoying the support of the whole House as it should and that we will all be very pleased indeed when we are able to make the arrangements for members of the Royal Anglian Regiment serving today to come to Gibraltar to receive the Freedom of the City on behalf of this Parliament on behalf of the people of Gibraltar and to exercise their right to the Freedom of the City of Gibraltar and parade up Main Street, whether or not they bring their sheep with them.

**Mr Speaker:** I now propose a question in the terms of the motion moved by the Chief Minister. Does any hon. Member wish to contribute?

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, yes, simply to associate the Opposition with the words of the Hon. the Chief Minister and to confirm that we will be supporting this motion. He is absolutely right when he says that the text of the motion speaks for itself, its contents are very clear and there is nothing really to add, other than to point out that as a result of some research that I did in preparation for the motion, that it says that the name Gibraltar was taken as its crest and that the former remains there until this day in the Royal Anglian Regimental Crest. Also to point out that the Garrison Headquarters in Suffolk, is also called the Gibraltar Barracks, so the Opposition will be supporting this particular motion.

**Mr Speaker:** Any other hon. Member wish to contribute to the motion? The Hon. Mr Bossano. *(Laughter and banging on desks)*

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Yes, Mr Speaker, I would just like to add one bit of the history of the Anglian Regiment that I do not think has been reflected, of which I have personal first-hand knowledge. That is when I did the compulsory military service in 1958, *(Laughter)* the 20th intake converted from being artillery to being infantry and the Royal Anglian Regiment had somebody seconded to Gibraltar to convert us into riflemen or artillery men, which you went from being gunners to being part of the regiment and therefore they made an important contribution to the transition of the Gibraltar Regiment into what it then became, an important part of the British Army and the only thing that they failed singularly in was in converting me into a disciplined soldier. *(Laughter and banging on desks)* Apart from that they were...

**Hon. E J Reyes:** And shall I also add, Mr Speaker, because I have also had my service, alas way after the Hon. Minister – I did from 1974 to 1980 – and it was actually the Royal Anglians who had posted to Gibraltar a Warrant Officer First Class who served at the time as a Regimental Sergeant Major. He was instrumental in preparing the first local Gibraltarian and locally enlisted member of the Gibraltar Regiment and therefore it was enacted through Bob Randall having become the first Gibraltarian Regimental Sergeant Major thanks in many ways to the training given to him by the Royal Anglian Regiment.

**Mr Speaker:** Does the mover wish to reply?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, only to thank hon. Members who have spoken for their support and to say that anybody who has been able to persuade Mr Bossano of anything, even if it is just to go from Artillery to Infantry and not then to become a soldier as he suggested, deserves much more than the Freedom of the City and therefore the case is proven for the Royal Anglians to have this award.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question in the terms of the motion moved by the Hon. Chief Minister. Those in favour? **(Members: Aye.)** Those against? Carried.  
The Hon. the Chief Minister.

**PERSONAL STATEMENT  
BY THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION**

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker.

2520 **Mr Speaker:** Yes.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** I have given notice that I wish to make a Personal Statement before the House is adjourned.

2525 **Mr Speaker:** Please do.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, yes. Mr Speaker, we were on the subject matter earlier about Members of Parliament making themselves responsible for statements that they make in this House.

2530 I have now had an opportunity of looking at *Hansard* and it is simply not the case that I challenged the Hon. Minister Bossano to a *mano a mano*, it was the reverse. I do not say that in any way criticising Minister Bossano, because from my point of view that is a matter that is in the past, but of course I need to set the record straight.

2535 If he wants me to read from *Hansard* I can, but that is the position and I want him to know so much that it is a matter in the past for me, that actually I view it as one of those episodes in this House that I have personally taken in a light-hearted way and it has lifted some of the seriousness that we often see in this House. So much so that I have an article from the press with his head and my head over two boxes and the article next to it, on my corridor in my house. So I do not say this out of any sense of spite or anything like that, but of course I need to set the record straight, Mr Speaker, because I have had an opportunity to look at *Hansard*.

2540 In relation to Victor Ochello, if in any way, if the Hon. the Chief Minister says that Mr Victor Ochello was not there at the Madrid event, then I apologise for having mentioned him in circumstances where he was not there. I did not mention him from a point of view of criticising Mr Victor Ochello; it was just simply an example that I used from somebody that I thought was there because I had seen photographs from the *Gibraltar Chronicle* but obviously if I am mistaken. I have absolutely no hesitation in withdrawing the reference to Mr Ochello.

2545 But those are the two statements that I wish to make.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Well, Mr Speaker, I do not know what it is that the hon. Member says that he said which he has now clarified. I think he has just insisted that what he said was the right thing  
2550 all along because his position it appears has not changed and he has just got up to tell us he was right, I think. But anyway let us take that remark in the way that I think it was intended and move on from the matter.

2555 I am delighted to hear that he has that picture in his home, in his corridor and we all look back sometimes affectionately on things that we have said to each other in haste and in this place and we on this side have absolutely no problem in accepting that in that way because in all of those heads to heads we have always won, so it does not matter. (*Laughter*)

**ADJOURNMENT**

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** And, Mr Speaker, in the same spirit, trusting that the hon. Gentleman will reflect, realise that we are not in fact skint, we can afford the electricity and we will be back  
2560 here next month, I now move that the House do adjourn *sine die*.

**Mr Speaker:** I now propose the question, which is that the House do now adjourn *sine die*.

I now put the question, which is that this House do now adjourn *sine die*. Those in favour? (**Members:**  
Aye.) Those against? Passed.

2565 The House will now adjourn *sine die*.

*The House adjourned at 6.55 p.m.*