

# PROCEEDINGS OF THE

## GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

AFTERNOON SESSION: 3.00 p.m. – 6.55 p.m.

## Gibraltar, Thursday, 19th February 2015

### **Business transacted**

Questions for Oral Answer
Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change
Q93-97/2015 ERDF Operational Programme 2014-20 – Renewable Energy Action Plan
Q98/2015 New power station – Payments to successful contractor
Q99/2015 Cycling related injuries – A&E figures for last five years
Q100/2015 Mount Alvernia balconies – Safety
Q101/2015 Abdominal aortic aneurism screening – Commencement and eligibility9
Q102/2015 Sponsored Patients Scheme – Review
Q103/2015 Consultants' contract – Negotiations
Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services
Q104/2015 Cruise liner arrivals – January 2015 numbers
Standing Order 7(3) suspended to proceed with a Government Statement
Statement by the Chief Minister
Questions for Oral Answer (continued)
Chief Minister
Q181/2015 Central Register of Ultimate Beneficial Ownership – Correspondence with UK Leader of Opposition
Q182/2015 Joe Carseni – Payments made by Government
Q183-184/2015 Chief Minister's talk in Madrid – Invitees; associated costs
Q185/2015 Plans for GBC – Update
Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services
Q105/2015 Upper Rock Nature Reserve – Visitor numbers, January 201525
Q106-107/2015 Mid-Harbour Estate- CCTV and garage barriers
Q108/2015 Weather damage to rental homes – Details

## GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT, THURSDAY, 19th FEBRUARY 2015

Q109/2015 Government co-ownership housing projects – Unsold homes	28
Q110 & 117/2015 Government rental homes – Unpaid rents	28
Q111/2015 Reallocation of empty homes – Expenditure and details	29
Q112/2015 Urgent decanting from homes – Details	29
Q113/2015 Housing Works Agency – Seconded Building Surveyor and M/T Driver	30
Q114/2015 Government rental homes – Eviction of squatters	30
Q115/2015 Vacant flats – Details	30
Q116/2015 Governor's Meadow House, Alameda Estate - Cost of resurfacing work	31
Question 88/2015 continued – Supplementary information	31
Q118-119/2015 Disability – Definition and review in law	31
Q120/2015 St Bernadette's Resource Centre – Plans to increase places	32
Q121/2015 Supported Employment Scheme – Participating companies	32
Q122/2015 Dr Giraldi Inquiry – Final cost	32
Financial Services and Gaming	33
Q159/2015 Flagship events – Business development goals	33
Q160/2015 Finance Centre Department travel expenses – Details	34
Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information	35
Q161/2015 Supply teachers and/or support auxiliary staff – Details	35
Q162/2015 Government subsidised students outside Gibraltar – Full details	36
Deputy Chief Minister	47
Q180/2015 European Single Skies – Gibraltar's inclusion	47
Question 184/2015 continued – Supplementary information	48
Questions for Written Answer	48
The House recessed for 20 minutes.	49
Order of the Day	49
Bills	49
First and Second Reading	49
Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – First Reading approved	49
Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved	49
Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Committee Stage and Third Reading to be ta at this sitting	
Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 – First Reading approved	51
Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved	51
Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 – Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting	52
Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 – First Reading approved	52
Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved	53
Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 – Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting	54
International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014 – First Reading approved	54
International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014 - Second Reading approve	d54
International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014 – Committee Stage and The Reading to be taken at this sitting	
Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – First Reading approved	55

## GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT, THURSDAY, 19th FEBRUARY 2015

Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved	55
Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 - Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at	this sitting 55
Committee Stage and Third Reading.	56
Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 - Clauses considered and approved	56
Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 - Clauses considered and approved	57
Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 – Clauses considered an	
International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2009 – Clauses consider approved	
Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Clauses considered and approved	59
Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014; Tobacco (Amendment) Bill 2014; Cr Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014; International Co-operation (Tax (Amendment) Bill 2014; and Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Third Readings appropassed	Information) oved: Bills
Government Motion	60
Royal Anglian Regiment – Conferring of Freedom of the City of Gibraltar – Motion carr unanimously	
Personal Statement by the Leader of the Opposition	62
Adjournment	62
The House adjourned at 6.55 p.m.	62

## The Gibraltar Parliament

The Parliament resumed at 3.00 p.m.

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE in the Chair]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: P E Martinez Esq in attendance]

## Questions for Oral Answer

#### HEALTH, THE ENVIRONMENT, ENERGY AND CLIMATE CHANGE

#### Q93-97/2015 ERDF Operational Programme 2014-20 – Renewable Energy Action Plan

**Mr Speaker:** In the absence of the Chief Minister, we are going to proceed with questions to the Hon. the Minister for Health and the Environment.

5 Ouestion 93.

30

Clerk: Question 93, the Hon. J J Netto.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Environment say if the Gibraltar Climate Change
Taskforce has now finalised the Renewable Energy Action Plan as stated in the new ERDF programme plan
and if so, will the Hon. Minister provide a copy to Parliament?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 94 to 97.

Clerk: Question 94, the Hon. J J Netto.

- Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Environment state from which renewable sources we are currently obtaining 3.1 MW/year of renewable energy as stated on page 5 of the ERDF Operational Programme 2014-20 stating the individual amounts by each source and whether this is produced by the Government or privately?
- 25 **Clerk:** Question 95, the Hon. J J Netto.
  - **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, given the statement on page 11 of the ERDF Operational Programme in which it states that Gibraltar is an excellent for placing solar and wind production, can the Minister for the Environment say if any wind turbines are envisaged to be erected during this new programme and if so, provide a statement to Parliament?

Clerk: Question 96, the Hon. J J Netto.

**Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Environment say if we have already had a project that has been partly funded or in the process of being funded through the new ERDF programme. If so, could the Hon. Minister provide details of such?

Clerk: Question 97, the Hon. J J Netto.

**Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Environment say if the Government or any other organisation working for the Government is likely to obtain any funding from the new ERDF programme as a result of the new power station to be built?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

45

50

55

60

65

70

75

80

85

90

95

100

40

Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, in answer to Question 93 yes, Mr Speaker. A copy of the plan will be provided electronically during the course of this afternoon.

The figure included in the ERDF Programme Report indicating that 3.1 MW/year was being generated from renewable sources was based on a previously estimated forecast base line that Gibraltar would be generating approximately 0.002% of its total electricity requirement from renewable energy sources. The figure should have been correctly expressed as 310,000 kWh per year.

Moreover, it should be stressed that the figure used was an estimate since forecasting the actual electrical output from renewables per annum is as difficult – particularly in solar power – as trying to forecast the weather for a whole year.

The actual recorded production of renewable energy fed into the network in 2014 – and this is the first time this has ever been done – was 123,880.5 kWh. With the exception of the solar photovoltaic systems set up in Sir William Jackson Grove and the swimming pool, which are operated by private companies all the remaining sources were produced by the Gibraltar Electrical Authority. The complete breakdown is as follows: the GSLA Swimming Pool – 85,218 kWh; bus stops – 17,798 kWh; King's Wharf Car Park – 2,706 kWh; the Frontier – 1,503 kWh; various street lights – 601 kWh; Sir William Jackson Grove – 16,054.5 kWh.

The Government is currently investigating the feasibility of installing wind turbines in both onshore and/or offshore environments. It is currently not possible to ascertain whether any wind turbines will be erected during the new programme period until all the required assessments are carried out.

It is nevertheless the Government's desire to generate renewable energy from wind turbines by the year 2018 as highlighted in Gibraltar's National Renewable Energy Action Plan of which a copy, as I said earlier, will be forwarded this afternoon.

To date there are no projects that have been partly funded or in the process of being funded under the new ERDF programme and finally, Mr Speaker, there is no present intention for ERDF money to be used in the funding of the new power station.

**Hon. J J Netto:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Hon. Minister for the information given and also indeed for providing the report I have asked for.

In relation to one of the questions that deals with the possibility of introducing wind turbines, I think the Minister said that they were looking at a number of places both onshore and offshore. Could perhaps the Minister elaborate a bit more in relation to the specific areas they are looking as to see whether it is feasible or not, at this stage anyway?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, the wind turbine technology is progressing and now it is increasingly possible to generate a considerable amount of wind energy from smaller plants and also plants that rotate on a vertical access rather than a horizontal access, which obviously means there is no danger to birds which is a concern that I have often had and we have had this conversation before, when the hon. Member opposite was Minister.

Therefore, because of the possibility of smaller, non-dangerous wind turbines, there are a number of possibilities in Gibraltar which would have to be assessed from the point of view of the wind and also the visual impact. There are in fact some wind turbines now that almost look like artificial trees and there are a number of locations, possibly the Europa Point area for that sort of thing.

As far as offshore wind turbines are concerned, we are beginning a number of studies to ascertain wind velocity and reliability of wind and these would clearly likely be, but this is not a commitment, off the east side of Gibraltar. But it is very early stages yet but because this technology is progressing, it is something that we need to look into for the future.

**Hon. J J Netto:** I am grateful, Mr Speaker. Could the Minister perhaps indicate whether any sort of feasibility study has been provided to the Government and to the Department of the Environment in relation to the possibility of installing some wind turbines at the Detached Mole and in the Upper Rock Nature Reserve?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I will start with the last one. The Upper Rock Nature Reserve to my mind is not a suitable location because of the other types of environmental impact. There have been studies

carried out in the past on the Detached Mole and that is one area that one will have to consider. But I recall those studies from quite a way back and those are obviously still there but we are looking at other areas because we know the Detached Mole has other possibilities as well for the future.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, exactly, that is precisely what I was thinking about when I was listening to the exchanges between the Hon. Minister and my colleague Mr Netto, that there are studies that indicate that actually the best place to site wind turbines – and now even more so because you have got these vertical ones that operate almost like a corkscrew technology – is in the Detached Mole.

Bearing in mind that the Government – any Government, it does not matter whether it is them or us – will have to have 20% renewable energy by 2020, it does seem to us like a waste of space actually locating the liquefied natural gas there.

I have to say that if we were to win the next election that is precisely what we would be looking to use, the Detached Mole, in order to build these wind turbines because it is the ideal location. Does he not agree with me that there are these studies that appear to indicate that that is the best location in Gibraltar for wind technology?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** If the Member opposite were to win the next election, I can assure you, Mr Speaker, that there will be less renewable energy than if I am in the winning team next time. But anyway there we are, I could not resist that one, Mr Speaker. (*Laughter*)

The studies at the time indicate that of the areas studied, the Detached Mole did in fact seem to be one of the best locations. I cannot confirm whether it is the best because my recollection is not as acute as that, it is a little while since I read the report and clearly that is a possibility.

At the time I am not sure whether offshore wind farms were being considered, these are obviously very expensive and you have to measure up the investment and the return of that investment and as technology progresses it will be better. So that is a possibility.

I will not comment on the location of liquid natural gas because the final decision on that and where that will go has not been taken and obviously it is not a supplementary to this particular question but it is a supplementary to other exchanges that there has been over the last few days.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, bearing in mind that on this side of the House we have been publishing our policies in relation to a number of areas where in our view, we have been breaking away from past practices of keeping cards close to one's chest and publishing a policy that people can see what the GSD is about and what the GSD is going to be doing if it were to get into Government, well in advance of the General Election, may I invite him to consider this policy that we feel is an attractive one and would help in assisting the Government to meet, any Government, to meet its 20% quota by 2020?

It is having a system whereby private residences can plug into the distribution network and incentivise through tax incentives for example, those private residences building say for example solar panels, so that if there is a net production of electricity by the private individual within his home, they can then effectively plug that into the system so that they are net producers of electricity, those homes, and then the Government will give them some kind of credit for example in relation to electricity. Is that something that the Government can consider as a policy and adopt themselves?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I claim some credit for the conversion of the Members opposite to the environmental movement (*Laughter*) and you cannot deny that. (*Interjection*)

Anyway, Mr Speaker, it is a very good idea but it is not exclusively the idea of the Member opposite. We are in fact currently discussing the question of feed-in tariffs for this sort of initiative. In fact already, there is, as I have said, some solar power being fed into the grid for the first time but these are in Government buildings so obviously there is not the same need for a feed-in tariff. But absolutely, this will probably be rolled out I suspect before the next election, so he will not be able to get the credit for it, whether or not he wins it. (*Laughter*)

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I have to say that I did not know that the Government was thinking of doing this. It seemed to me to be a good idea just based on my reading that other jurisdictions were doing it and I am delighted that the Government has, as it were, decided to adopt this particular policy, which is a policy that we were in fact going to be announcing ourselves when we announce how we would meet the 20% requirement by 2020.

Now, Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman has spoken about wind turbines. The hon. Gentleman has spoken and indeed the Government has installed solar panels as well. What other forms of renewable energy does the Government envisage it will be adopting in order to meet this 20% requirement by 2020?

160

155

105

110

115

120

125

130

135

140

145

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I have to be careful because if I give too much away, I may actually be writing the hon. Member's manifesto. (*Laughter*)

The sea is clearly one. As we have announced we have one initiative which is looking at wave energy and we have one or two others and I say one or two because I am not sure whether one of those two is still on the cards in which we are looking at the use of marine currents. The technology there is much newer and it is not completely tried and tested, but we are encouraging developers of this technology to come and use Gibraltar to carry out these tests and we will shortly be carrying out some marine current surveys off the south west of Gibraltar, to see if there is enough to generate electricity from that source.

So the wind, the sun and the sea are the three main ones that I think will be applicable to Gibraltar.

170

175

180

185

165

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I agree entirely with him that those are the three areas. May I invite the hon. Gentleman that perhaps he might meet myself and also the Shadow Minister for the Environment Mr Netto, because it strikes me that this is one of those areas where perhaps – it does not matter what Government or what political persuasion there may be after the next election – that we could do with continuity of policy irrespective of who is in Government. There is an obligation –

I will give way to Mr Licudi – do you want me to give way?

Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Yes, Mr Speaker, I am very happy for him to give way.

I can confirm that there will be continuity of policy, because we will win the next election. (Laughter)

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, thank you very much for that comment. Since the hon. Gentleman was stripped away from his most important portfolios, he has obviously got very little to say. (**Several Members:** Ooh!)

May I return to the main purpose of this supplementary, and it is an invitation to meet with myself and his Shadow on this side of the House, to perhaps try and pool ideas so that there is continuity of policy in terms of the environment looking towards 2020, where there is clearly this requirement for there to be the provision of 20% renewable energy. It is an invitation I make publicly to the hon. Gentleman as a sign of good faith and also as a sign of the constructive politics that we are certainly about, particularly in this area.

190

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I have been teaching the Members opposite about the environment for several decades. I have no problem in continuing to do so.

A Member: Hear, hear. (Laughter and banging on desks)

#### Q98/2015 New power station – Payments to successful contractor

195

200

Clerk: Question 98, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, I think we might be less constructive on this question.

Mr Speaker, how much has the Government paid the successful contractor thus far, in respect of the contract to build the new power station?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr
Speaker, no payments have yet been made.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is the reason for that because effectively the Government only has £52 million (*Laughter*) worth of reserves, Mr Speaker, (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) and in fact can only borrow another £51 million before it reaches the legal borrowing limit – therefore this Government is yes, skint and does not have the money in order to pay for the £77 million for the power station before the end of the financial year?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** No, Mr Speaker, not at all. The first payment as far as the agreement is concerned is not due until April.

215

- **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is that pursuant to a request that the Government has made of this particular company that no invoices are submitted until after 31st March because prior to 31st March the Government is skint and does not have the money to pay for outlays of this nature?
- Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, the Member opposite will remember that I became Minister responsible for energy two days before we signed the contract so it took me very little time to sort that one out, didn't it?

So the arrangements were made prior to that but I am absolutely certain that this was just part of what was programmed and that the relevance of what the hon. Member opposite has said is just non-existent.

225

230

235

- **Hon. D A Feetham:** And, Mr Speaker, can he confirm that the £77 million for this particular power station and indeed, it is going to be nearer £140 million actually slightly more than £140 million for a variety of reasons, but let us just concentrate on the £77 million that the £77 million is going to be paid out of the Consolidated Fund and that no monies that have been deposited by the Government, or caused by the Government from Credit Finance to Gibraltar Investment Holdings Limited is going to be used in order to pay for this particular project?
- **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I would have thought so but I have answered the question. This is a supplementary that I do not think I have to answer but I do not think it is relevant. No payments have been made and the intricacies of how the payments are being made do not fall under my area of responsibility. Therefore I think that should be asked more specifically again on a future occasion.

#### Q99/2015 Cycling related injuries – A&E figures for last five years

Clerk: Question 99, the Hon. S M Figueras.

Hon. S M Figueras: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Health provide details of the number of cycling related injuries dealt with by the A&E department at the Hospital on a month by month basis for the last five years?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

245

- Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the information is not accessible as it is recorded as a road traffic accident and is not specifically recorded as a cycling accident. So I am not able to provide that information.
- Hon. S M Figueras: Mr Speaker, just one supplementary. In the context of everything that we were discussing this morning and we are not going to labour the point at all this afternoon, is looking at the possibility of somehow categorising incidents in that way something that the Government might look at? Thank you.
- Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Yes, Mr Speaker, on receiving this answer, it became apparent that there are some categories that could be subdivided more greatly. Clearly, we do not want the staff at A&E to spend too much time on recording and less time on treating, but with the advent of the electronic health record and the A&E module is due to come on line in just a couple of months, we are looking at actually being able to key in more categories so that more information will be accessible in the future.

#### Q100/2015 Mount Alvernia balconies – Safety

260

**Clerk:** Question 100, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister responsible for Elderly Care advise whether the newly refurbished balconies at Mount Alvernia are safe and are open for use by the service users and their families?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, yes sir, the refurbishment of Mount Alvernia balconies and façades received their approval notice and certificate of completion, number 7229, from the Department of Planning and Building Control. The Health and Safety Plan was approved by the Planning Supervisor of Technical Services.

Mobile residents and relatives can enjoy the use of the balconies whenever they wish. The balustrades have been designed to a height to maintain safety measures and all risk assessments have been carried out by the Health and Safety Officer.

Presently we are in the process of implementing disabled accessible ramps for balcony access for those in wheelchairs. However, the premises were completed in the 1960s when no requirement for disability was in place and therefore we have issues that are being assessed in order to find the best option for wheelchair users.

All balconies have awnings for the summer period which is the best time for residents to enjoy the sunshine and view. Residents are happy that finally they now have a splendid view of the bay, resplendent in the beautiful light of the new dawn that this Government has brought about, (*Laughter*) as they have previously had the scaffolding blocking their view and making their rooms dull for more than 12 years. (*Applause*)

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, when have these particular balconies been opened for members of the public and also for service users? The hon. Lady has said the summer, but I have been there visiting a relative of mine and I was told that the balconies were not accessible to service users because the Government was still assessing whether it was safe for service users to be able to use them.

Now that was in December and those reports are actually coming to us thick and fast and that is the reason why this particular question has been asked. Is he aware that service users are being prevented from going onto those balconies because there is this impression on the part of staff, that it is unsafe and that the Government is looking at safety issues in relation to the balconies?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, obviously a service user with certain conditions like dementia, or whatever, would not be allowed out on their own and unescorted. I have not had this information passed to me, I have consulted my hon. Friend who was previously Minister with responsibility for the elderly and she shares that view.

I will, however, be there tomorrow afternoon – I go there as often as I can – and I will myself assess it and attempt to step onto the balcony. If there is that kind of issue I will certainly deal with it right away, but the prepared reply that I have from the officials responsible is the one that I have mentioned, clearly with a little bit of flourish added, and therefore that is the information that I have.

#### Q101/2015 Abdominal aortic aneurism screening – Commencement and eligibility

Clerk: Question 101, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul Hammond.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Health say when the abdominal aortic aneurism screening will be starting and who will be eligible for it?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Yes, Mr Speaker. The hon. Lady will be very happy to learn that the programme will be launched on 25th February – the prepared answer says 24th but actually it is 25th February – and is due to commence in March. Screening will be for men approaching their 65th birthday.

The hon. Lady will no doubt wish to congratulate the Government for this great innovation. (Banging on desks)

285

290

265

270

275

280

295

300

305

310

#### Q102/2015 Sponsored Patients Scheme – Review

Clerk: Question 102, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

320

330

- Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond: Very welcome news, the AAA screening.
- Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Health say at what stage the review of the Sponsored Patients Scheme is?
- 325 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.
  - Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Apologies, Mr Speaker, the actual green paper was not in front of me so I thank the Deputy Chief Minister for loaning me his iPad so that I can reply from here. Oh, it has just been found, thank you. It was buried under other green papers!

Mr Speaker, yes sir, I have this week had what will have been the final meeting of the working group and I now have proposals ready for discussion and approval by Cabinet.

#### Q103/2015 Consultants' contract – Negotiations

Clerk: Question 103, the Hon. Mrs I M Elul-Hammond.

335

- **Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Health say what stage the negotiations for the consultants' contract are at?
  - Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

340

Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, yes sir, the negotiations are at an advanced stage with the final draft contract having just been reviewed by the GHA's legal advisers. It will be presented to Unite for final discussions within weeks.

#### TOURISM, HOUSING, EQUALITY AND SOCIAL SERVICES

#### Q104/2015 Cruise liner arrivals – January 2015 numbers

- 345 **Clerk:** Question 104, the Hon. D J Bossino.
  - **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Hon. Minister for Tourism please provide details of the number of cruise liner arrivals for the month of January, 2015?
- 350 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.
  - Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, two cruise ships arrived in Gibraltar during January 2015.
- Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, I am simply making a direct comparison to the position as it was last year, I have not had the opportunity of looking at previous seasons and years and to see whether this is a trend and which direction it is going. But certainly, the difference between January 2014 and January 2015 is in effect three less.
- Does she have an explanation as to why that is the case? Had she prepared that as an expected supplementary from me?

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, I do have the figures for the expected annual figures which we expect during the course of the year, not just the month, and we have an additional 216 ships expected in 2015, no sorry 216 ships are expected in total which is 35 more than last year.

I would like to add to that that passenger numbers will also be up.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Yes Mr Speaker, that is the expectation but does she have an explanation as to why there were three less from last year?

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, this is a fluid arrangement so companies' itineraries fluctuate from time to time.

# Standing Order 7(3) suspended to proceed with a Government Statement

**Mr Speaker:** The Hon. the Chief Minister.

375 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I beg to move under Standing Order 7(3), to suspend Standing Order 7(1) in order to proceed with a Government Statement.

**Mr Speaker:** Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye) Those against? Carried. The Chief Minister.

#### STATEMENT BY THE CHIEF MINISTER

380

385

390

395

400

405

410

365

370

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, as hon. Members are aware, the Foreign Secretary, the Right Hon. Philip Hammond MP, is today in Madrid for the purposes of meeting with the Spanish Foreign Secretary Sñr Garcia Margallo y Marfil. I have this afternoon heard from the Foreign Secretary after he has finished his meeting with Sñr Margallo.

As hon. Members will also be aware, the Foreign Secretary has in the past months, been embarked on a tour of European Capitals holding talks with all EU partners in respect of EU reform. This visit was part of that tour and included discussion of the Foreign Policy challenges the UK and Spain share, including continuing Russian-backed aggression in Ukraine and the threat of global terrorism.

The Foreign Secretary has confirmed that during the course of the meetings with his Spanish counterpart, he also took the opportunity – as we had agreed that he would – to raise the concerns of the UK Government and those of HM Government of Gibraltar.

In particular, the Foreign Secretary raised the issue of the continued incursions by Spanish state vessels into British Gibraltar Territorial Waters which he told Sñr Margallo are illegal under international law and therefore unacceptable.

He also raised the continued delays at the frontier between Gibraltar and Spain.

The Foreign Secretary has also confirmed that he told his Spanish counterpart, as we had agreed, that Spain needs to address delays at the border, which the European Commission has already found to be disproportionate.

Further, and also as agreed between us, Mr Hammond raised our joint disappointment at Spain's holding up EU aviation legislation by seeking to exclude Gibraltar, in a blatant further breach of the Córdoba Agreements, which the UK and Gibraltar continue to honour, and are EU law.

Mr Hammond restated our common call for a return to dialogue in order to deal with these and all other issues and matters of mutual interest to people who live and work on both sides of the frontier.

Mr Speaker, the House will be pleased to note that, in that context, the Foreign Secretary reminded Sñr Margallo that the UK remains strongly committed to the Trilateral Forum for dialogue. He also told him that until we can return to that forum, we in the United Kingdom and Gibraltar will continue to work towards ad hoc talks, involving all relevant parties, on issues of mutual interest.

The Foreign Secretary informed me that Sñr Margallo has made a further proposal in this respect today which the Government will now be further considering with UK colleagues.

Mr Speaker, no-one should confuse, or allow anyone else to confuse them into thinking that the raising of the issues about Gibraltar today amounted in any way to a bilateral negotiation about Gibraltar. No such negotiation will be acceptable to the people or Government of Gibraltar and this House.

Indeed the UK, through its Foreign Secretary, has confirmed again today in Madrid, its strong commitment to the Trilateral Forum and its and our hopes to return to that forum whenever possible.

As Ministers have already stated, Spain is a key partner for the UK, as it is for Gibraltar, but the UK/Spain bilateral relationship is not as strong as it could be due to recent Spanish actions towards Gibraltar and its people.

415

420

425

Mr Speaker, in that context, the Government is pleased that the position set out by the Foreign Secretary in Madrid is exactly in keeping with what was agreed between us and entirely represents the position of the Government and people of Gibraltar.

Mr Speaker, I trust that this statement will assist in informing the House as to the events of today in Madrid. This is what has delayed me from arriving in time for three o'clock this afternoon.

- Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, Mr Speaker, certainly from this side of the House, 'no to bilateralism, yes to trilateralism' is our policy and has been our policy for over 16 years. So in that sense, Mr Speaker, we associate ourselves with the sentiments expressed by the Chief Minister and we certainly welcome that that is the position that has been made clear by the Foreign Secretary to the Foreign Secretary of Spain in Madrid
- But, Mr Speaker, the Hon. the Chief Minister spoke about further proposals being made by Sñr Margallo and I wonder whether in the interests of providing a full statement to this House about the report that has been provided to him of that meeting in Madrid, if he can give us some further information about what that further proposal from the Spanish side entails?
- Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, not at this stage. The Government is considering the proposal made, it has literally just come in and I do not think it is in the interests of the community that without having an opportunity to consider something that we should make a statement about it, it is literally less than half an hour since I have had the benefit of communications from the Foreign Secretary in respect of the subject.
- Hon. D A Feetham: Well, Mr Speaker, is he prepared to brief me in private as to the proposal that has been made. I am not asking the Government to comment on the proposal, to say whether the proposal is good or bad, but at the very least for the Government to brief the Opposition on what is that proposal that has been made by the Spanish Foreign Secretary to his counterpart, Mr Hammond?
- Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, as he knows, I am quite happy to brief him in private if he wishes, on the basis of complete confidentiality. We have business to be getting on with now and I will be quite happy to brief him afterwards. That is why this Government is the one that is going to pursue the establishment of the Chief Minister's Consultative Council, to enable that sort of communication to occur, but it will be on the basis of strict and utter confidentiality.
- 450 **Mr Speaker:** We will now proceed with questions to the Chief Minister. Question 181.

# Questions for Oral Answer (continued)

#### **CHIEF MINISTER**

Q181/2015 Central Register of Ultimate Beneficial Ownership – Correspondence with UK Leader of Opposition

Clerk: Question 181, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Chief Minister state whether he has received a reply to his letter to the UK's Leader of the Opposition in relation to comments regarding the implementation of a Central Register of Ultimate Beneficial Ownership?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, yes sir.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I have had the opportunity of reading the Hon. the Chief Minister's letter, I think I saw it posted on Twitter and I have also had the benefit of reading some details in a press release he issued in relation to this point, so I know what he said. But can he give me an indication of what the Right Hon. UK Leader of the Opposition told him in response?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I had various conversations with the Leader of the Opposition since he received my letter, and I think he now understands why it was that Gibraltar felt it was important that he should understand the issues relating to the Central Register, the progress Gibraltar in particular makes together with the United Kingdom and all other 28 member states of the European Union in respect of financial services matters, where we stand on whether such a register should be public or not.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Do I take it that the reply has not been done formally in writing but by way of telephone conversations? Is that what he is telling me? I have a further supplementary, just that detail.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well I do not think there is any formality that is attributed to something which is in writing which is not attributed to something which happens on the telephone or in conversation. It was a formal response to the issues that I put in writing.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, he I am sure will agree with me when I say that this was a matter of crucial importance for Gibraltar and the way that the Right Hon. the UK Leader of the Opposition represented Gibraltar's status with regard to this in particular misstated the position in relation to Gibraltar's position in relation to this matter.

Is there, as a result of those conversations, any possibility of the Labour Party in the United Kingdom, particularly its leader, to retract publicly the statement it has made, at least insofar as it affects Gibraltar's position in relation to this point? Is there any possibility of that happening? I was pretty shocked, I am sure as he was, when – I think it was on a Sunday – the report of this policy was made in the news media in the UK, and Gibraltar featured very much in it when I went through all the different Overseas Territories. I think it did quite a lot of unfair damage in terms of what he said.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, which part is it that he thinks should be retracted? It is up to you. The hon. Gentleman has asked me whether I think any part of it is going to be retracted. Which part of the letter from the Leader of the Opposition is it that he is asking me there is a chance would be retracted? If he does not want to answer that to enable me to answer his question it is up to him, but I mean...

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I have asked the question and I expect an answer from the Chief Minister. Certain disparaging comments were made in relation, not just to the Overseas Territories, but Gibraltar within the Overseas Territories, which caused him to come out in I think in *Sky News* and various other news media outlets to defend Gibraltar's position and made him write a letter, quite a strongly worded letter, to the Leader of the Opposition.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I have been asked a question, which was is there a chance that the Leader of the Opposition in the UK is going to retract any part of his letter, and I am saying which part of the letter is it that the hon. Gentleman is asking me is there a chance he will retract?

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, generally the statements that he made, the policy statement in relation to the blacklisting of Gibraltar in relation to the OECD. It was a threatening letter which he certainly sent to at least one of the Overseas Territories, published in Twitter, I think by the editor of the *Gibraltar Chronicle*. I am not sure that the Hon. the Chief Minister received a similar letter to that. I assume he did but I am not sure whether he did, but certainly he threatened that unless the Overseas Territories got their act in order in relation to central registers, he would ask the OECD to blacklist us.

In relation to that, I would have thought that if there has been a clarification at least as far as Gibraltar is concerned of its position, that the Right Hon. Gentleman should retract the issue publicly, at least in relation to that specific issue.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, look, I am afraid the hon. Gentleman needs to show this Parliament an element of respect by at least coming a bit more prepared for these sessions.

The letter that the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition in the United Kingdom sent to all the Leaders of the Overseas Territories was published in generic form in *The Guardian*. It was published on Saturday, Mr

490

485

460

465

470

475

480

495

505

500

515

Speaker, not on Sunday, although I acknowledge that he might not have picked that up until I replied to it, which was during the course of Sunday.

The letter, Mr Speaker, talks not about the issues so much of central registers but much more about the issue of whether beneficial ownership, which is what the central registers are about, will be available publicly if those registers are to be accessed publicly.

What the Leader of the Opposition in the UK said was that if within six months of their being elected the territories had not agreed to have these central registers made public, then he would ask the OECD to blacklist those territories.

He was not making any allegations, Mr Speaker, about Gibraltar which he could retract, so if the hon. Member looks at my letter, what I am telling the Leader of the Opposition in the United Kingdom is what is wrong with that policy. But it is not something he said about Gibraltar which requires retraction. Of course, as a result of his letter a lot of other people have commented about the Overseas Territories, whether we are tax havens or not and whether the issue of central registers, etc is one that is determinative of whether one is a tax haven or not. But he will have seen that my letter sets out the Gibraltar position.

The Gibraltar position is that we will be complying with the Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive within the transitional provision provided in the directive, once it is published, and publication is expected during the course of September of this year, with a transitional provision of two years. Now, is he asking me, have I managed to get the Leader of the Opposition to change his Party's policy in that respect? Is that the question?

#### Q182/2015 Joe Carseni – Payments made by Government

540 **Clerk:** Question 182, the Hon. D A Feetham.

525

530

535

545

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Government please state how much it has paid either directly or indirectly, and either in money or benefits, to Joe Carseni since it took office, divided into calendar years?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I now hand the hon. Member a schedule with the information requested.

#### **ANSWER TO QUESTION 182**

in the second	Amount Paid	
2012 (w.e.f. 1st Sept 12)	£11,145.98	
2013	£32,079.98	
2014	£34,802.34	
2015 (up to Feb-15)	£5,105.21	

550 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

#### Q183-184/2015 Chief Minister's talk in Madrid – Invitees; associated costs

Clerk: Question 183, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister provide a list of all people invited by Government to his recent talk in Madrid?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, we are unable to provide the details requested at this time. The information requested requires that all accounts be reconciled.

To date we have still not received – (*Interjection*) Oh sorry, the first answer, yes. I will answer together with Ouestion 184.

Clerk: Question 184, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

565

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister provide a breakdown of all costs associated with his recent talk in Madrid, including the cost of accommodation, travel and expenses of anyone travelling with or invited by the Government to that event?

570 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, now, we are unable to provide the details requested at this time as the information requested requires that all accounts be reconciled. To date we have still not received all invoices in order for us to complete this exercise.

In any event, Mr Speaker, the information will not be publicly provided. The costs of my travel, however, will be set out in the Government website when available.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister provide a reason why he cannot provide me with a list, first of all, of people that had been invited to this event in Madrid by the Government of Gibraltar and also, secondly, the people that have been paid for by the Government to go to Madrid in order to attend this talk?

Surely that information ought to be disclosable by the Government as something for which the Government is accountable for. This is effectively Taxpayers' money which the Government is using in order to invite people to attend this talk in Madrid and he is accountable to this House and I cannot see any conceivable reason why this information is not to be provided to this House.

585

590

575

580

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, he must not have read a Spanish newspaper in the past few weeks then or is it that he does not know that at every turn, the Spanish Foreign Ministry has been trying to suggest that the opportunity afforded to the Chief Minister of Gibraltar to address a number of prominent people in Madrid – not five or six people; a very large number of prominent people in Madrid – was simply engineered and paid for by the Government of Gibraltar as a stage show.

s f t

Now, I have been very careful what I have told him. I have told him what I have told him before. I have said I will not give the information publicly, Mr Speaker. Now, of course we are accountable in this House for every penny of Taxpayers' money that we spend. I am quite happy to give him the information and have the discussion with him, Mr Speaker, but it is quite another for me to stand in this House and give him all the information of all the money that we have to spend in Spain, given the hostility that we face from that Government there, in order to be able to get across the message of the people of Gibraltar.

600

595

I have told him before in relation to another matter and I will tell him again. I am happy to give him the information, but if he does not see that it is not in the public interest of Gibraltar for that information to be, not bandied across the House, it is not just the 17 of us here, but to be made publicly available in order to have thrown in our face, then he has never heard the Spanish Foreign Minister talk about how Gibraltar uses its economic power in order to be able to get its message across.

It was something that was done by the previous Administration when they needed to do it in the early part of the last decade when Gibraltar faced the issue of joint sovereignty, it is something that we are having to do today in order to ensure that all of the lies and all of the defamation that there is about Gibraltar does not find itself uncounted in the Spanish press and in the Spanish media and in Spanish public opinion, but we are doing it now.

610

605

Now, Mr Speaker, he can have the information if he likes behind the Speaker's Chair. I am not suggesting he cannot have it and I was very careful about what I said, I will not make the information publicly available, but I am not, Mr Speaker, going to be persuaded that that is information for which there is any benefit in making public in this House to the world at large.

615

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I am afraid that he continuously uses and demeans debates and sessions in this House by constantly playing this particular card every time we ask what is a legitimate question.

Look, unless the Government effectively has engineered an attendance at the Madrid talk, by paying dozens of Spaniards accommodation and subsistence in order to get them to attend, it cannot possibly be an issue, Mr Speaker, the provision of this information.

Now in order to make it easier for the Hon. the Chief Minister, well look do not provide me with the information of those in Spain that have been invited at Government expense to attend that Madrid talk, but at least provide me with the information of those who are Gibraltar residents that have travelled to Madrid at public expense for the purpose of that talk. That surely cannot be of any sensitive nature and it would at least allow us to see whether the Taxpayers' money is being properly spent.

Because look, if what you have is a situation that out of 100 people attending that Madrid talk, 80 are from Gibraltar and they have been subsidised by the Government to go up to Madrid, then all he is doing is paying for cheerleaders to go with him to Madrid and we would say I am afraid that is not good use of Taxpayers' money.

So in order to assist him, I am drawing that distinction and perhaps he can provide me with the information as far as the local contingent is concerned.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman opposite does not care about the national interest of Gibraltar. He has given a mischievous Spanish headline writer two great opportunities to score, or attempt to score a goal against the Government of Gibraltar, which we will not have an opportunity to reply to.

The first is: 'Feetham pregunta si Picardo invita a docenas de españoles sin que tengan que pagar sus gastos para su discurso en España' Feetham suggests that the Chief Minister of Gibraltar engineered dozens of Spaniards, all expenses paid, to his talk in Spain. The headline is enough, Mr Speaker, to damage Gibraltar. The headline is enough: he plays directly into the hands of Gibraltar's enemies, Mr Speaker.

The next one: 'Is the Chief Minister of Gibraltar paying for cheerleaders to go with him up to Spain, to Madrid?' – another *gift* to a Spanish headline writer, regardless of what the national interests of Gibraltar may be.

Such is his ambition, Mr Speaker, that he does not even see, in an infantile question like this, the potential dangers for Gibraltar. All he wants to do is to score a goal, now Mr. Speaker, on expenses because everything is now about expenses. Mr Speaker, I heard him say a moment ago before I came into the House, that Gibraltar is skint. That is the first time in the history of Gibraltar that a Leader of the Opposition has suggested that Gibraltar is bankrupt – that is what skint means.

What will Mr Margallo make of that, what will Mr Margallo make of that, or any one more of our enemies, because even in 1992 and 1996, even at every time when the dispute between this side of the House and that side of the House has been at its worst, nobody has ever suggested that Gibraltar is bankrupt, like he has this afternoon. The absolute irresponsibility of the man is just incredible, Mr Speaker.

Look, skint we are Mr Speaker: skint in this House of a good Opposition. Skint of an Opposition that knows what it is doing and skint of an Opposition that discharges its obligations loyally to Gibraltar. Absolutely skint and bankrupt, because what he is telling us, Mr Speaker, is that he wants information which he could have by simply turning on his television and watching the magnificent recording that our media made of that excellent opportunity I had in Madrid to deliver the Gibraltar point of view.

He can see who was there from Gibraltar and who was not. He can see, Mr Speaker, that there were not 80 from Gibraltar who were cheerleaders; there was actually a huge majority of people who were Spaniards, leading politicians, Mr Speaker. Not one or two, Mr Speaker. Leading politicians – people who are today in the Parliament, people who are opinion formers, people who speak for their party, not regional or municipal individuals who do not speak for their party. Leading individuals in their party who have restated at last the policy of the party in Opposition to continue committed to the Trilateral Forum. That is the level of achievement that the Chief Minister's speech in Madrid two weeks ago finally delivered for Gibraltar.

Not a question of taking cheerleaders anywhere. I do not need to take cheerleaders anywhere, Mr Speaker – thank goodness, I have got supporters in the places that he might least expect!

But, Mr Speaker, to hear that the first argument is that Joe Bossano, who has given his life to Gibraltar, Joseph Garcia who has given the past 30 years of his life to Gibraltar, who they used to say were so in love with Gibraltar that they could not be objective when it came to sitting down perhaps with Spaniards and considering talking about our future with them, that we all collectively want to bankrupt Gibraltar... But actually not even *want* to, Mr Speaker; today we have been told that we *have* bankrupted Gibraltar because we are skint. That we are going to blow up the whole of the western face of this Rock. And not just Bossano and Garcia, but also Cortes, Mr Speaker, the environmentalist who cared about smoke but is not going to care about a huge explosion that is going to deliver us into the Neolithic age. And that now finally, skint as we are, I am paying for the croissants and orange juices of cheerleaders, Mr Speaker.

What a pity that we are so skint of an Opposition in this House.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, the Hon. Chief Minister had shown signs that the pressure was getting to him, (*Laughter*) even before this question and answer session. But that answer demonstrates to me, just

635

630

620

625

640

645

650

655

660

665

675

the extent to which the pressure is getting to him. It really is proving far too much, he is carrying the office in which he serves on his shoulders. It really is bearing down on him and he cannot take the pressure.

Now, Mr Speaker, he plays on the ambition card. First it was the nationalistic card, now it is Daniel Feetham being too ambitious. I am playing to a Spanish gallery. Well, Mr Speaker, barely a few weeks after we have had the Dr Giraldi Home, where Ministers opposite participated in a programme –

**Mr Speaker:** No, no. The Dr Giraldi Home is a separate matter. There is a motion on the Order Paper and you can say whatever you want in that regard but I am not going to allow you to anticipate that motion.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, absolutely, I think the people of Gibraltar get the drift of where I was going in the light of the comments made by the Chief Minister that we on this side of the House, that we on this side of the House are playing to Spanish galleries. I have not participated in any Spanish television programme, doing the people of Gibraltar down, Mr Speaker. That is the point that I was going to be making.

But, Mr Speaker, does he not realise, the Hon. the Chief Minister, that it is actually he, with the way that he has answered this particular question, a fairly innocuous question, designed to deal with, designed to show how much the Government has actually spent on this particular event, but the way that he has answered it, he is giving ammunition does he not realise to our critics in Spain by making a mountain out of a molehill because it looks as if the Government has got something to hide.

Now I repeat, Mr Speaker, will he not at the very least provide me with the information of who exactly on the Gibraltar side went to this particular event and at what cost. There cannot possibly be any national interest in the provision of that information and that is a legitimate question, bearing in mind that he is accountable for the Taxpayers' money to this House and that goes to expenditure that the Government is incurring.

I will leave for the moment, and he can give me the information behind the Speaker's Chair if he wants to, the Spanish contingent and how much he has paid in relation to that, but surely there cannot be any excuse for the hon. Gentleman not providing me with the information in respect of whom from Gibraltar went to this event at the invitation of the Government and paid for by the Government. That is what I am interested in.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I will happily give him the information, behind the Speaker's Chair. I am not going to give him the information here, publicly. Now, Mr Netto, Mr Speaker has been overheard to use rather unparliamentary language to describe what I am full of. It is just that, the feeling is so mutual Mr Speaker, that perhaps we do not need to understand what the words used were.

Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman needs to understand what it is that he is doing. He needs to read a bit more, he needs to be a little bit more concerned about Gibraltar and a little bit less concerned about himself. I heard him say the other afternoon, Mr Speaker, in one of his - I do not know if it was the podcast which they themselves characterised as comedy when they put it up on YouTube or whether it was one of his interviews on GBC, Mr Speaker, that when he talks about things people do not realise the importance initially, but then eventually everybody realises how he has been right from the beginning and he uses an example of public finances.

You see, Mr Speaker, he said on *Newswatch*, 'I am talking about the power station now and you think this is not so important, but eventually everyone will agree with me, as they all – everyone – now agrees with me on the issue of public finances.' Well, Mr Speaker, I do not know where he gets that from! Maybe he is relying on the last poll. We do not comment on polls but maybe he is relying on the last poll that gave him an extraordinary lead of 20% over our 74% if you took out the undecided. But anyway, if that is what he is taking comfort from, maybe that is what he is working out is everybody who agrees with him in relation to public finances.

But he needs to read a bit more around the issues because you see, Mr Speaker, on that subject what he was doing in relation to the answer I am giving him about why things matter in Spain and why we should not share them, and why he should be a bit more circumspect when he says things – even things as adventurous as the fact that we might want to be reckless as to whether we blow up the western side of Gibraltar. It is that there is a huge confluence – to such an extent I wonder whether they speak every night, Mr Speaker – between what the hon. Gentleman says and the things that Sñr Landaluce says; what the hon. Gentleman says and the things that Sñr Margallo says when they are criticising the Chief Minister of Gibraltar and the Government of Gibraltar.

Sñr Landaluce said recently that the power station, because it was gas and because it was going to be on the area of the reclamation on the North Mole, was a danger to the whole of the Campo de Gibraltar. Now, Mr Speaker, I switch on my television and I see Daniel Feetham saying the same thing.

Mr Speaker, Sñr Margallo says the Government of Gibraltar uses its economic power in order to be able to address the media and the public opinion formers in Spain. Then the Leader of the Opposition in

17

685

680

695

690

700

705

710

715

720

725

730

73

Gibraltar asks me, oh yes, how much of that economic power have you invested in this particular speech? Mr Speaker, look, the hon. Gentleman may want to be Chief Minister more than he cares about Gibraltar –, that is obvious to most who are following his political career – but he needs to be a little bit more careful about the way he goes about things.

Even, Mr Speaker – let me give him this little tip – even if he were to think, 'Well actually, maybe if I am saying the same things as Landaluce and Margallo all the time, it may not suit me so much so perhaps I should try a different tack.'

So I will give him the information behind the Speaker's Chair, I will not give it to him otherwise. If he looks at the video of who was in Madrid then he will be able to see for himself. It is, Mr Speaker, available. I thought it was fantastic that it was available to the people of Gibraltar when the Broadcasting Corporation put it on *Viewpoint*. I think it is available on their website and all he needs to do is sit down and watch it.

Now if it is that he cannot bear to hear my voice on television and he does not want to sit and watch the video and does not want to watch the camera pan to show him who was there and who was not, well look, so be it. I will tell him for nothing, Mr Speaker, that the Nueva Economía Fórum provides the orange juice, the croissants, the hot chocolate and the coffee for everyone who turns up. So everyone he sees on camera, he can work out, have their coffee, their orange juice, their hot chocolate and their croissants paid for by the Government of Gibraltar. What more does he need? Why is it so important?

Or perhaps, Mr Speaker, it is that he has persuaded himself that we are in fact skint and that we cannot even afford the orange juice. What a pity Mr Speaker, that there might actually be a Leader of the Opposition who fails to understand the economics, the public finances and the reality of Gibraltar to such an extent that he might actually believe that.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, we will see who understands the economics of the public finances of Gibraltar when he and I participate in the debate on GBC, unconstrained by the Rules of this House. And then we will see who understands the public finances of Gibraltar and who does not.

Because I have to say, I concluded a long time ago that he certainly does not and that is precisely the reason why his erstwhile leader, the Hon. Minister Bossano, answers every single session of the House, answers questions on the economy of Gibraltar and the public finances of Gibraltar, instead of him. He does not; it is Mr Bossano because he understands them and the hon. Gentleman, the Chief Minister does not.

And talking about ambitions, Mr Speaker, and talking about bankruptcy and being skint, was it not the hon. Gentleman that for months before the last General Election was telling the people of Gibraltar that the GSD was addicted to debt, that we were very close to bankruptcy and that they needed a saviour in the form of a New Dawn Government? Well look, he is accusing me of precisely what he did prior to the 2011 election. I do not understand how an earth he can criticise me in those terms when he did it to a greater extent when he was trying to become Chief Minister of Gibraltar.

But, Mr Speaker, how – (Interjection) Indeed, he was successful absolutely, his arguments were successful. We will see whether my arguments are successful or not, but that is democracy. But, Mr Speaker, he has talked about how much economic power is used by the Government to invite people from Spain to his talks. He has also said during the course of his answers that in fact this was a very, very successful meeting for him and I am glad that if it was a very successful meeting for Gibraltar, I really am glad.

But look, at the end of the day I am entitled to know, and I am entitled to assess that information that he is providing, by asking questions in this House and I just do not understand why he is not prepared to provide me with the information as to how much he has paid for example, a particular trade unionist to go to Madrid in order to listen to his speech. At first blush I do not understand what the benefit of that to Gibraltar is. I can understand the benefit of going to Spain and addressing a Spanish audience and I can understand at a push that he may not want to give me information – I do not agree with it but I can understand it – as to exactly who on the Spanish side had been invited by the Government of Gibraltar – at Government expense, I am talking about – at Government expense, because they might be criticised there.

Look, I can understand that argument. But who an earth from Spain is going to criticise Victor Ochello or who or earth from Spain is going to criticise Mr Buttigieg of the Self Determination Group for going with the Gibraltar delegation to Madrid? What I want to know is what the Government has spent in inviting those people – and surely, that is not something that the Chief Minister ought to refuse to provide across the floor of this House.

Hon. Chief Minister: Well, Mr Speaker, so what is next? So he cannot win the debate as he has accepted because he is looking forward to it being a debate unconstrained by the Rules of the House. He cannot win the debate constrained by the Rules of the House because of course the only way that he can win a debate is by saying, 'You are lying, you are lying, you are lying' or using another insult. He cannot use that insult here so therefore he wants to have the argument unconstrained by the Rules of the House

765

760

745

750

755

770

775

780

785

795

because I do not find the Rules of the House constraining when it comes to having any debate on any particular issue.

But I very much look forward to having the debate on public finances on GBC, not because it will be unconstrained by the Rules of the House but because we might be unconstrained by the timing of the House, the fact that people might not be available to watch us at three or four o'clock in the afternoon and everybody will be watching us at 9.30. Well, 'everybody' – maybe people who might have better interest and may be doing something else, but at 9.30 they might actually listen to the debate and he might not get away with pretending that the Government does not give information, that the Government is pretending to keep things hidden when it comes to public finances etc, because people will see the Government giving the information and debating it with me embodying the Government in that debate.

But then if he does not win it unconstrained by the Rules of the House because he will be on television, is it that he is going to say that he wants to win it unconstrained by the rules of human decency and he wants to go outside GBC and have a slap up, like he challenged the Hon. the Father of the House to do at the beginning of the lifetime of this Parliament? Why does he have to be -?

Hon. D A Feetham: A Point of Order, Mr Speaker.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Why does he have to be...Why does he have to be...Let me finish the phrase, let me finish the phrase –

820 **Mr Speaker:** A Point of Order.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** On a Point of Order. Mr Speaker, he has to make himself responsible for the accuracy of the information that he provides to this House.

I never challenged the Hon. Mr Bossano; Mr Bossano challenged me to the Antechamber, so it was the reverse.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I do not accept that. I believe that the hon. Gentleman challenged the Hon. the Father of the House to a *mano a mano* and this is very simple: he can just go into *Hansard* and he can look at what he said at the time, whether he likes it or not.

I know that he hates, Mr Speaker, (*Interjections*) I know that he hates *Hansard*, Mr Speaker, that little liar that reminds him of the truth, that little *chivatito* that reminds him of the things he used to say, (*Interjections*) that little *chivato* that does not lie, Mr Speaker!

Mr Speaker: Order! Order!

835

805

810

815

825

830

840

845

850

**Hon.** Chief Minister: Of course I know he hates to be told about *Hansard*, but it is all in *Hansard*, Mr Speaker.

So I do not fear a debate constrained or unconstrained by the Rules of the House because in a proper debate, the Rules actually help to get to the nub of the issue.

But, Mr Speaker, why is it that the Hon. the Father of the House answers questions that he puts about the debentures issued by the Gibraltar Savings Bank, etc? Well there was a small matter of a Government reshuffle, Mr Speaker, in the early weeks of December last year, where the Hon. the Father of the House took specific ministerial responsibility for the Gibraltar Savings Bank. Mr Speaker, that is why he now answers those questions.

Perhaps, Mr Speaker, the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition was not alive to that and he might still be calling us by our old ministerial names. Mine still happens to be Chief Minister; the Hon. Minister now includes in his title the words 'Gibraltar Savings Bank'. That is why he answers those questions, nothing to do with competence. But of course, the hon. Gentleman has to always comment on people's competence because he cannot talk about issues, he has to comment about competences.

Well, Mr Speaker, you know it is not unlike what his predecessor used to be, it is the one thing which he is actually, quite remarkably similar to Sir Peter, when Sir Peter was Chief Minister. Because as Chief Minister, Sir Peter spent a lot of time telling me that I was unfit to govern. Well, Mr Speaker, people took a different view.

He just commented on my competence and this is not a place, Mr Speaker, where we come to comment on each other's competence. We should come to look for information and to comment on information and give our opinions on information. But look, given that what is good for the goose is good for the gander and he likes to comment on my competence, I will tell him one thing and he will be very happy to hear me. He will be very happy to hear me on this because I am going to actually credit him. I used to think, Mr Speaker, that he was quite an unbalanced individual but I am clearly wrong, Mr Speaker. He has got a chip on both shoulders, Mr Speaker, not just one. Whether it comes to ambition or whether it comes to his ability

860

to understand public finances, he has got enough chips that he cannot be unbalanced – he has really managed to get that exactly right, 50/50.

Mr Speaker, I did not spend the run-up to the last General Election saying that Gibraltar was bankrupt and as ever, Mr Speaker, the devil is in the detail, something that perhaps the hon. Gentleman does not have the time these days to try and look at. All I did in the run-up to the General Election, Mr Speaker, was take the language that had been used by the GSD in 1996 and say to the then Chief Minister, Sir Peter Caruana, this is what you said in 1996 and if we apply the same standard, although we did not share your view in 1996, look at how things have developed.

Now if only he had looked at that level of detail, he might not have made the monumental mistake he has made today and it will come back to him as a monumental mistake eventually, Mr Speaker, to be the only Leader of the Opposition, in fact probably the only Gibraltarian politician in our history, to say that our community, that our country, that our nation, our public purse and our exchequer is bankrupt. Nobody has ever said that before until he got up here just before I arrived and said we are skint and that is why you cannot pay for the power station.

But never mind, there is, not on this Order Paper but shortly to come on an Order Paper, a Bill known as an Appropriation Bill on which we can have a debate which will demonstrate that he is absolutely wrong.

Mr Speaker, he talks about the trade unions and Victor Ochello. I am surprised that a man of his socialist convictions should be picking Victor Ochello out for criticism for a croissant, an orange juice and a hot chocolate. Why is it that he does not talk about the Chairman of the Chamber of Commerce or the Federation of Small Businesses? Why is it that he, the perennial socialist, he who is redder than red but not so red that the Chamber might not want to vote for him, the socialist who the conservatives should choose – the man should be permanently be wearing purple, for goodness' sake, he is so red and blue! – why is it that he chooses to pick out Victor Ochello and not anybody else?

Well, Mr Speaker, you know I am now clearer in my view as to why it was this morning that he was talking about this fictional figure of 513 more people in the public sector, because today although he is wearing red, he is trying to appeal to the blues. So, he is trying to get the Chamber on side, the Federation on side and trying to control public expenditure and very concerned about the rising numbers in the public sector, I think that is obvious in the way that he has addressed the whole debate. I mean why would he care that I am paying for the orange juice of a trade unionist and not care that I am paying for the orange juice of a captain of industry like the Chairman of the Chamber of Commerce?

Well, to come to the nub of the issue, Mr Speaker, is it that he does not know that in every other state, money is used for purposes of promoting that state in circumstances such as these where there is not a debate across a parliamentary floor about how that money is used? There is actually a debate behind closed doors, like the one I have offered him, which provides oversight on the spending of that money by those elected by the people, Government and Opposition, but is not public.

In Spain, Mr Speaker, that debate happens very often and there is a lot of loyalty about the way that people approach those debates. In other words, they keep very confidential, despite their huge differences, what that money has been spent on and why it has been spent. In some instances, it is known as the *fondos reservados*, for example in Spain or Intelligence Committees, Mr Speaker. Or is it that he can point me to any part of the *Hansard* of the Spanish Cortes which sets out what the cost of gathering intelligence on Gibraltar is costing the Spanish State? Does he know what the cost of listening, observing, him, me – I suppose he is their blue-eyed boy and me, their nemesis – is costing the Spanish State? The Spanish Taxpayer pays for that, there is oversight by the elected people of the Kingdom of Spain, but behind closed doors. What I have offered him... and there is oversight of all the spending that is used against us but not all of it – some of it yes, but not all of it is debated across the floor of any parliament.

That is what I am offering him, that is mature. Well, Mr Speaker, if he does not want that information or he does not want the information for that purpose, if all he wants, Mr Speaker is to be able to criticise the cost of having invited the trade unionist to Madrid, there is a way out. It is the way out that he always takes and I am offering it to him.

Look, I have already told him the video exists. I have already told him that he can sit down and look at who was there. He has already obviously spotted someone who he wants to point out and it happens to be Mr Ochello, so be it. I do not know what problem he has with Mr Ochello but he has picked him out, so Mr Ochello, the others who he can see on the video and then he can do, Mr Speaker, the exercise that he did this morning, he can work it out for himself and come back here with a figure.

So this morning he said you have employed 513 new members of the public sector, which at the lowest wage in the public sector at an average of blah, blah is £8 million more to the bottom line each year in recurrent expenditure which you have added. Absolute and utter nonsense, but never mind, let him sit down, let him -

Look, Mr Speaker, there is a button that says 'mute' on the remote control: he can press the mute button and he can watch the whole episode of an hour of *Viewpoint* and see the events in Madrid without having to

875

870

865

885

880

890

895

900

905

910

920

hear me. I know that obviously my voice grates and he does not want to hear it. Fair enough, I do not like hearing myself either, especially in Spanish, and then he can work it out, Mr Speaker.

**Mr Speaker:** I do not know whether the Hon. the Chief Minister and the Leader of the Opposition realise, but they have been hammer and tongs for 55 minutes on two questions. I would like them to tell me whether they think there is any parliament in the Commonwealth where the Speaker would allow that. If so, if they think that is the case, they can carry on. If not, I would suggest to them that we move on.

Important as these matters are, but there is a limit and now they are both debating and they have been hammer and tongs at it. By all means bring a motion and I will sit here for as many hours as you like, but not under the guise of two questions. That is a transgression of the fundamental Rules of this House. If that is the way that they want to continue, well look, I may have to think again myself.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, you are absolutely right. As far as I am concerned I am here to answer questions but when one is baited as one is baited one has no alternative but to reply. This morning I cannot remember how long you took on the few questions that were on the cycle path, but I think we all feel exactly the same way and we have better things to do.

**Mr Speaker:** There were about 15 or 20 questions on cycling and I thought I was going to leave the House on a bicycle at that rate (*Laughter*) and they took about 50 or 60 minutes – yes nearly an hour, we were all cycling for about an hour. (*Laughter*)

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, I am quite happy to get off this tandem now and move on.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, I have been very patient in listening to the Hon. the Chief Minister with an answer that has taken him...

**Mr Speaker:** The only person who has been patient is me. (Laughter and banging on desks)

**Hon. D A Feetham:** – taken him 20 minutes.

Mr Speaker: I am the one who is patient with hon. Members. I am the one who is patient.

Hon. D A Feetham: Well may I indulge your –

**Mr Speaker:** I say that because I follow politics in Gibraltar, as you can imagine, and I know that since the last meeting of the House, outside this House hon. Members have been at it in an *explosive* situation. I know. So it has been debated out there for ages and now it comes here today. Two questions, 55 minutes – come on now.

The Hon. the Leader of the Opposition.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I mean the reality is that I have listened to the Hon. the Chief Minister for the last 20 minutes go on and ramble and waffle about this and about that and about the other, and I do have one final supplementary and then I will listen to his rambling and waffling answer for as long as he wants, but I think that I ought to ask him to correct the record in a number of respects.

Look, I think, Mr Speaker, that the pressure is really now fogging his memory, I really do think that. Because the Hon. the Chief Minister (*Interjection*) because the Hon. the Chief Minister, he said that the only reason why the Hon. Mr Bossano is answering questions on the public finances of Gibraltar is because there has been a reshuffle. But the Hon. Mr Bossano has been answering my questions on the economy and the public finances of Gibraltar for the last two years, Mr Speaker and I would ask the Hon. the Chief Minister, for the sake of accuracy and because he has to make himself responsible for the answers or for the statements that he makes to this House, to at the very least correct the record in that regard.

The questions have always been answered by Mr Bossano because it is Mr Bossano that really understands the public finances of Gibraltar, can speak authoritatively about them to the extent that he can authoritatively say it, Mr Speaker, that Government Ministers, including the Chief Minister of Gibraltar is being brainwashed by consultants to spend too much money. Now, Mr Speaker, if that is not an indictment much more powerful than any indictment or any criticism that I could make of the Government benches, if that is not an indictment, Mr Speaker, what is?

And I just again for the sake of accuracy because I know he is not going to provide me with the information that I seek, which is innocuous information but I think one that I am entitled, which is a list of the locals that attended the Madrid event and the cost to the Taxpayer for taking those locals to Madrid. It has nothing to do with Victor Ochello, it is no criticism of Victor Ochello at all or anybody else,

980

975

925

930

935

940

950

955

960

965

(Interjection) none at all, my comment, Mr Speaker, was that there cannot be any national interest in not telling me how much he has paid for Victor Ochello or anybody else in the Gibraltar delegation from going to Madrid.

But if I can demonstrate to him, if I can demonstrate to him that I never challenged Mr Bossano to a fisticuffs or anything of the sort, will he stand in this House – because again he is responsible for the accuracy of the information he provides – and apologise to this House for misleading this House by saying that I challenged Mr Bossano, which is certainly not true?

What happened there was, that Mr Bossano challenged me and I stood up and I said I have never been challenged to a fisticuffs, to a *mano a mano* by anybody in my life in Parliament and I did not expect it. That was the comment.

He should make himself responsible for the comments that he makes. I know that he is under a lot of pressure; I know that the pressure is getting to the Hon. the Chief Minister, but I think that despite pressure, in the interests of fairness, he ought to be able to correct the record so that it is accurate.

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, on a Point of Order.

I do not accept that I challenged the hon. Member to a *mano a mano*, which is not terminology that I would use, since I avoid the Spanish language at all costs. If I had decided to take him on outside, I would not have told him about it; it would have happened. (*Laughter*)

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, (*Interjections and laughter*) I am a fan of parliamentary democracy and I believe that Prime Minister's Question Time in the United Kingdom, although a bear pit, is an important part of democracy. Therefore, Mr Speaker, the fact that the hon. Gentleman gets up and says things that are really quite fanciful and have nothing to do with the original question, is not something that shocks me but frankly, it is really quite outside of the Rules.

But anyway, Mr Speaker, you know why is it that the hon. Gentleman thinks he is going to get up and get an answer about a question which is supposed to be important to our community when he starts talking about my condition. You see, Mr Speaker, he does not get up and say can the Chief Minister say x, y or z. He gets up and he says you have a condition; you are suffering because of the pressure. Anybody who knows me knows how much I am enjoying doing this work knows that I am probably one of the people that least suffers pressure in the context of stress that they might come across.

But whether or not I am suffering pressure is totally irrelevant to our democracy and to our community. It might be relevant to my physician and my family, but it is completely irrelevant to our politics and to what decision people are going to make when they decide who is going to be allowed to continue running our community for the next four years once an election is called, one that of course, Mr Speaker, I do not intend to cut and run to as the hon. Gentleman predicted in one of his recent speeches. But then again, most of his predictions are wrong, like the prediction he made during the course of the by-election that we were going to have a huge turnout and he was going to win by 10% which turned out to be a very low turnout but an election that we won by 10%.

But never mind that, Mr Speaker, always he says, Mr Bossano has answered these questions. That is not the case. Once again, Mr Speaker, *Hansard* will demonstrate that that is not the case. But this is now just arguing about an argument. This is no longer about the nub of the issue. But the hon. Gentleman said something which is important in his question and I want to deal with it. He said that Mr Bossano understands the public finance and can talk authoritatively about it. Absolutely true, Mr Speaker and the ten people, or rather the nine people sitting on this side of the House with Mr Bossano, have always accepted that and believe in Mr Bossano's ability to understand public finance. In fact, Mr Speaker, I think he used to be one of the people who used to do that before he turned Labour, then turned GSD.

But so be it, we still believe in that, Mr Speaker, we have never changed our opinion in that. I did not, Mr Speaker, when I became Leader of the Gibraltar Socialist Labour Party; take a new degree in economics. I took, or rather the Chairman of the Party, took a vote based on a simple majority of those present in the room as to who should be the Leader of the Party and starting from my left, Mr Speaker, let me just describe us in academic or in qualification terms. Lawyer, Lawyer, Dietician, Economist, Lawyer, Historian, Lawyer, Environmentalist/Botanist, Doctor of all things he surveys and Lawyer and Teacher. Teacher, Trade Unionist, Journalist/Teacher, Lawyer, Lawyer/Friend, Lawyer and Lawyer.

Only one economist, Mr Speaker. Only one person who can speak authoritatively on the public finances of Gibraltar as an economist because he, Mr Speaker, certainly the Leader of the Opposition certainly on the day that that deal was done where there was neither a show of hands or a secret ballot as there should have been, but some sort of other executive manoeuvre when he became Leader of the Opposition, did not take a degree in economics either. So he is still as much a lawyer as I am. But of course he says as he always likes to say during the course of these debates that I Fabian am cleverer than you and I can speak

995

985

990

1005

1000

1010

1015

1020

1025

1030

1035

better on these subjects than you can. Well fine, okay if you do not have a grandmother, you do not have a grandmother, what can you do?

But he says, speaking authoritatively on that subject as he did, Mr Bossano said that the Ministers are capable of being brainwashed. That is not what Mr Bossano said, Mr Speaker. He is traducing what Mr Bossano says. Mr Bossano said, that consultants *might try to brainwash* Ministers. (*Laughter*) He cannot even do a false laugh in a way that is convincing, Mr Speaker. (*Laughter*) Consultants might try to brainwash Ministers.

Well, Mr Speaker, in this context what Mr Bossano was saying is, they might try, we will not allow it, it is not going to happen and we will be better guardians of the public finance than ever anyone has been before. Why did he say that and why did he say quite rightly, we will not give political cover to those who try and get away with spending more of the public finances than the Parliament? Not just us, the Parliament has voted because at the last minute when they were about to not vote in favour of the budget, Sir Peter Caruana stepped into the room and said, 'Do not commit political suicide, no Opposition has ever not voted in favour of a budget. The Parliament votes in favour of the budget.'

Why do we say that and why are we better guardians of that purse than anybody ever has been? Because, Mr Speaker, the hon. Member himself cannot have been brainwashed when he was Minister for Justice and responsible for the spending on the new courts and the new prison. The spending of which went through the roof contrary to the estimates. Even Sir Peter cannot have been –

Mr Speaker: May I ask the Chief Minister please to come to a conclusion?

Hon. Chief Minister: Yes, thank you and I will, Mr Speaker.

Even Sir Peter cannot have been brainwashed and I am dealing with his putting to me this statement from Mr Bossano, when he was dealing with the airport which was quoted at £24 million and came in at £84 million. They must have been absolutely, permanently bleeding lobotomised because the spending was in the order of three times what the estimate was on the airport. So it is not a question of attempted brainwashing which we are stopping and quite right too, there are incidences of absolute total lobotomy of the Members opposite, which is why we find the public finance mess that we found when we were elected and by the end of that financial year, the last financial year they were in office, there was £2 million left in the kitty. As close to skint as this community is ever going to come, under them, Mr Speaker. (Banging on desks)

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, my final supplementary. But, Mr Speaker, it is a supplementary that I cannot allow the Hon. the Chief Minister to get away with whitewashing the comments of the Hon. Minister Bossano. Because I am going to quote exactly what Minister Bossano said, quote, 'The guys that have been brought in as consultants and are still there, are responsible for a lot of projects and they seem to think that they have a free hand to spend money and maybe they go to their Minister and they sort of brainwash him into thinking it without being conscious.'

They brainwash him, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, you cannot air brush away interviews that have been given by his Ministers to GBC which are then reported in the press. That is a quote and it is a quote from the *Gibraltar Chronicle* of what Mr Bossano said and Mr Speaker, that is the worst indictment the worst possible indictment of this Government's runaway expenditure, runaway expenditure that anybody could have possibly come up with and it does not come from the Opposition benches, it comes from one of his own on his own benches. That is a terrible indictment, Mr Speaker.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, the position –

**Mr Speaker:** This is the last intervention from the Chief Minister.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Thank you.

**Mr Speaker:** I am bringing these exchanges to a conclusion.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman just gets up full of enthusiasm, thinking he has won the point, reads the quote and realises as he is half way through it, it says *maybe*. 'Oh damn it, it says maybe. It says maybe, but I had better not repeat that bit when I go back and say the bit that I want Bossano to be indicting them all for.'

So maybe this happens and so we are going to stop it and he does not like that, he does not like that Mr Speaker, so he only repeats the bit he likes which may be unconstrained by the rules of debate in this House. If we were actually slightly more constrained by the rules of the court, he might find the judge asking him to repeat. The judge might say, 'Well actually Mr Feetham, can you just repeat that? Does it

1100

1045

1050

1055

1060

1065

1070

1075

1080

1085

1090

1095

actually say "maybe"? Does it actually say "maybe"? (Laughter) And there is no need Mr Speaker for him to repeat it again for a very simple reason: because as I told him a moment ago, there is that *chivatillo* which is *Hansard* which will have chapter and verse recorded, what he already read a moment ago. So it was all in the context of 'maybe' – therefore no indictment.

But look, Mr Speaker, if he wants to talk about indictments and talk about runaway expenditure well, Mr Speaker, that is not what is happening but this is not a debate on public finance, the Appropriation debate is coming and we will see who is right on all of these issues just like we will see in the fullness of time when we sit back and look at all of his predictions, where exactly it is that they all end up. The last one was that I was going to cut and run and have an early election. I guess it is because it is all about running. I do not know whether the hon. Gentleman has decided to become a jogger these days. He talks about runaway expenditure, my cutting and running to go to an election, all of which his predictions will prove to be entirely wrong.

He said during the course, Mr Speaker, of his earlier supplementary that the information that he was seeking was innocuous and could he please have it. Well Mr Speaker, you said 55 minutes, it may be even longer, for innocuous information. If it is so innocuous why bother to insist on it? Why not say to me, 'Well, Fabian, let me have it behind the Speaker's Chair and I will take a view', if it is so innocuous? If it is so innocuous and whether he likes it or not, I am the Chief Minister of Gibraltar, just like whether Mr Margallo likes it or not, Gibraltar is not Spanish. There is a treaty that makes it British *de facto*. It is not Spanish and *de jure* it is not Spanish and today I am the Chief Minister of Gibraltar, however much it hurts. However much it grates, that is the reality. He has to deal with it every morning I know, but it is the reality.

I am therefore saying to him, I believe it is not in the public interest of Gibraltar to do this. Look at what the newspapers say, look at what Mr Margallo is saying in the newspapers, let me give you the information behind the Speaker's Chair. If it is so innocuous the information that he is seeking, why does he not accept it in that way? Or is it perhaps, Mr Speaker, that the information is not so innocuous, as he knows?

Mr Speaker: Question 185.

1105

1110

1115

1120

1125

1145

1150

1155

#### Q185/2015 Plans for GBC – Update

1130 **Clerk:** Question 185, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please state whether he considers the plans he announced for GBC in 2012 are still on course to be achieved?

1135 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, yes sir.

Hon. D A Feetham: Well, Mr Speaker, he may recall that in relation to those plans when he made the announcement, he said that GBC would be self-funding and profitable through use of the company which GBC was to have a 50% shareholding. That was from recollection, Gibraltar Networks or Gibraltar Entertainment Networks Limited where another UK company, an entertainment company, had the other 50% and that they would have premises at Europa Point and that those premises would be completed by 2015.

So does his prediction that his plans are on course, include the fact that those premises are going to be built in effect for GBC and also for this particular company?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, those premises have already been provided, at one stage GN was operating from premises in Europa Point, I think it was one of the MOD properties that were there. But I am very confident that our overall plan for GBC is moving in the direction in which we want to move it. It may have different permutations but my plan for GBC is on course to be achieved.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, just to be clear, the plan included for GBC to be self-funding and the way that the Government was going to make GBC self-funding was through this subsidiary company, which was going to be attracting productions to Gibraltar using Gibraltar's beneficial tax system in order for those productions to be done here in Gibraltar, to generate profits so that GBC could then become self-funding, presumably through the profits paid up from the subsidiary company to GBC.

#### GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT, THURSDAY, 19th FEBRUARY 2015

Is he saying that those plans of self-funding for GBC via this particular company are still on course to be achieved?

1160

1165

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am saying that my plans that GBC should eventually become self-funding are on course to be achieved, they continue to be the view of the Chief Executive of GBC and my view and we think we stand a very good chance of actually making something of GBC rather than consider it just something that costs the community money to provide a service, it could actually be an engine of growth for the community.

1170

**Hon. D A Feetham:** And that is going to take place, or the plan is that the way that GBC would become profitable, would be through this particular subsidiary company generating those kind of profits through local productions. That is still the plan.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the plan is that it should become self-financing. The route to that, whether it is through this particular subsidiary or others or in fact through even new and more exciting opportunities, is something that is constantly being worked on by the Chief Executive and by the management of GBC and by us.

1175

I mean what could be better than to achieve that and why shouldn't we want to keep on track, in that respect? I would have thought that we would have enjoyed support from the Opposition in this respect, except of course that they did not think of it when they were in power. Maybe that is why they do not want to be supportive.

1180

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, it is not about the Opposition not being supportive. I am asking him questions. I know that it irritates him when I ask him questions, but that is my job. My job is to hold the Government to account on its policy, to enquire as to whether its policy is being successful or is not being successful so that something can be done about it. It should not irk the Hon. the Chief Minister that I am on this side of the House asking questions. It should not at all.

1185

Now, Mr Speaker, Gibraltar Entertainment Networks, I think that is the name of the company. Has this company been profitable? Has it been making profits and has it been making the kind of profits that will allow GBC to be well on the road to self-sufficiency or is Gibraltar Entertainment Networks, has it not been successful and the Government is really looking at other avenues of making GBC self-sufficient?

1190

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am sorry to have to get up to say these things because they are not pertinent to our democracy or our politics, but I cannot allow things that the hon. Gentleman says to go unanswered so I am going to deal with that point. If he were prevented from saying these things, I would not have to reply to them.

1195

Mr Speaker, I do not find his questions irritating or irksome; I actually find them quite amusing. Mr Speaker, especially in the context of what it is that he is hopefully trying to achieve, I find most amusing much of what he does and how he goes about things. So he need not concern himself about irritating me or irking me.

1200

Mr Speaker, GEN: I cannot tell him what the balance sheet of GEN is without notice, but I can tell him that GEN involves certain individuals who continue to work in part with GBC but not all of them with GBC and therefore that the original concept of GEN is not actually one that is likely to be progressing into the future but the ideas behind GEN and how that would lead to GBC being eventually, we hope self-financing, does continue to be something that we are pursuing very enthusiastically.

#### TOURISM, HOUSING, EQUALITY AND SOCIAL SERVICES

Q105/2015 Upper Rock Nature Reserve – Visitor numbers, January 2015

1205

Clerk: Question 105, the Hon. D J Bossino.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Tourism please provide details of the number of Upper Rock Nature Reserve visitors for the month of January 2015?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, 18,774 visitors entered the Upper Rock Nature Reserve during the month of January 2015.

Hon. D J Bossino: Just to point out, Mr Speaker, in fact on the day that I filed the question, which was the Wednesday, it was actually updated on line but I am grateful for the reply in any event.

Mr Speaker, just to ask, that figure is actually slightly higher than the figure in 2014 and indeed in 2013 although it still represents quite a significant reduction from the position in 2011-12.

Does she have – and probably not a question which can be answered – but does she have any indications from within the Department as to whether this is likely to go in an increasing upward trend over the next few months? I know it is difficult to predict but perhaps she can do something, make an attempt at replying to the question if she can.

Hon. S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, the figures show that the visitors in January this year are up by 306 from January last year and on the basis that we expect more cruise ships in this year, then that will I think relatively have a knock-on effect of increasing the number of tourists that we will have.

#### Q106-107/2015 Mid-Harbour Estate-**CCTV** and garage barriers

Clerk: Question 106, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, further to the answer provided to Question 40/2015, can the Minister for Housing inform this House by when it is estimated that the recently installed CCTV project and garage barriers at Mid-Harbour Estate will be operational on a permanent basis?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1235 Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 107.

Clerk: Question 107, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Housing provide details in respect of any maintenance 1240 programme which has been established in respect of the recently installed CCTV project and garage barriers at Mid-Harbour Estate, indicating who will carry out these tasks and their respective cost?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, as previously informed, the CCTV project is complete. The maintenance of the CCTV project in Mid-Harbour Estate is being carried out by Sheriff Electrical Contractors on a reactive basis.

The maintenance is within the two-year warranty as stipulated in the contract documentation and there is no current financial implication as this was covered under the original contract sum.

In relation to the garage barriers the Housing Department has written to all tenants at Mid-Harbours, advising them of the procedure to be issued with the relevant permits and fobs and that barriers will be operational as soon as this is completed.

Insofar as the maintenance, there are plans to engage the services of an electrical contractor to adopt a maintenance programme.

Hon. E J Reyes: Sorry, Mr Speaker, I did not quite catch the very last part, something in respect of the fobs and talking to the tenants. Could the hon. Lady, because of my hearing problems, please repeat the last part?

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: What I said, Mr Speaker, was that we have written to the tenants advising them of the procedure to collect the fobs and given them a deadline in which to do so. Once that deadline has passed then the barriers will be operational. It should be by next week or the week after.

1230

1215

1220

1225

1245

1250

1255

- Hon. E J Reyes: Thank you, I was going to jump in, by when the deadline?. So, therefore, Mr Speaker is the hon. Lady confident that probably within the next month or so we should have everything now fully operational?
- **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, tenants were written to last week and the deadline for applications for that is 20th February so it should be operational by the end of the month.

#### Q108/2015 Weather damage to rental homes – Details

- 1275 **Clerk:** Question 108, the Hon. E J Reyes.
  - **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide full details of the extent of damages, inclusive of locations, caused to rental homes as a result of inclement weather during the ongoing refurbishment works at any housing estate, since the answer provided to Question 746/2014?
    - Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.
- Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):Mr Speaker, up to 9th February, 14 flats have been affected throughout the 1,547 flats in the three estates, of which nine have been affected through the roof, four via the stairwell and one via the window.
  - Further protective measures and minor repairs are currently being undertaken.
  - **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, I can understand the question was submitted on its deadline which was last Thursday morning but the Hon. Minister said up to 9th February that is over a week prior to that. Surely the information, Mr Speaker, could have been provided up to last Thursday.
    - I will tell you why: because one of the things that I was hearing and so on, seems to have happened just in the days or in that same week prior to the deadline of the question and with the Minister only being able to provide information up to 9th February, it means that one is now delayed until the latter part of March in order to be able to get any information on something that really happened within the first few days of the first week of February.
    - Does the Minister require a bit more time and perhaps she can at least get the information up to at least the question deadline time which was Thursday morning. I do not know, Mr Speaker, if she can be helpful on that.
- Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, I did urge the Department to provide me with as much information as possible, right up to the latest deadline that they could provide. Of course, Mr Speaker, you can appreciate we have the whole internal mechanism and everything for production of answers. In any event, Mr Speaker, the question can be put to me again next month so that the Department can have sufficient time to answer this.
- In any event, Mr Speaker, the answer will not change. There is only a month delay, Mr Speaker, now that thankfully we sit in Parliament every month. The hon. Gentleman only has to wait a question of a couple of weeks, four weeks in fact for that answer.
  - I can only provide as much information as the Department provides to me; though I did ask for as much information as possible, Mr Speaker, I want to make that clear.
  - **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, if the Minister does not have the information, if need be, Mr Speaker, I will consult you so that by wording the question, I do not infringe the rules of repeating the question and so on, so any information that refers to anything after 9th February then that might, if need be with your guidance, we can do it in such a manner, Mr Speaker.
  - Mr Speaker: No problem.

1280

1290

1295

1310

#### Q109/2015 Government co-ownership housing projects – Unsold homes

Clerk: Question 109, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, further to the answer provided to Question 749/2014, can the Minister for Housing provide revised and updated details of how many homes still remain unsold in respect of Government's new co-ownership housing projects, giving the room size composition in each case?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1325

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, the Government's new co-ownership housing projects are a huge success and there are no homes remaining unsold.

#### Q110 & 117/2015 Government rental homes – Unpaid rents

1330 **Clerk:** Question 110, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide details of how much has been written off in respect of unpaid rents pertaining to Government rental homes, since the answer provided to Question 35/2015?

1335

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 117.

1340

Clerk: Question 117, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon.** E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Housing provide details of arrears in respect of unpaid rents pertaining to Government rental homes as at 31st January 2015?

1345

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, nothing has been written off since the answer provided to Question 35/2015 because work in respect of these areas continues.

The total of arrears in unpaid rent as at 31st January 2015 is £5,368,606.27. From that figure we need to deduct the amounts that are older than six years, which are not therefore recoverable.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, again I lacked a bit of hearing at the end. The figure of £5,368,606 I think the Minister said. What did she end up saying, Mr Speaker – that it does not include something that has been written off because time has expired? Can I have a repetition of that please?

Mr Speaker: More than six years.

1360 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Has anything been written off because it has been more than six years?

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: No.

#### Q111/2015 Reallocation of empty homes -**Expenditure and details**

Clerk: Question 111, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1365

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Housing provide details in respect of all expenditure incurred since the answer to Question 36/2015 in respect of contracts awarded for making empty homes suitable for re-allocation, stating to whom payments were made, how much has been paid, the number of residential homes pertaining to each payment, as well as indicating the type/nature of repair works, or cleaning services undertaken?

1370

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1375

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, information for the month of January 2015 is as follows, in relation to one property awarded to AJEC at a cost of £8,444 and to E Lopez and Sons Limited £4,450.

Hon. E J Reyes: And the nature type of work undertaken, Mr Speaker?

1380

Miss S J Sacramento: Sorry, Mr Speaker, all services contracted were for repairs and none were for cleaning.

Hon. E J Reyes: And what type of repairs, Mr Speaker? What nature, what type of repairs? Was it repairs to the roof, to electrical installations? I amended the wording from last month on your suggestion, Mr Speaker, because I just said repairs and I want to know a bit further, the type of repairs.

1385

Hon. S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, the only information I have been provided with is that they were general repairs. I imagine that when a property is repaired we will have different issues, Mr Speaker. They are not huge repairs because the figures are not that big.

1390

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, they may not be huge repairs but I have taken on board the advice given to me and that is why I have said indicating the type and nature. I would like to know, Mr Speaker, whether it was to do with plumbing works or do with electrical works or roof repair please, Mr Speaker.

1395

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, I am sorry I do not have any further information because the officials have not provided the information.

Mr Speaker: Will the hon. Lady please instruct her officials to look at the question carefully because it does say type or nature of repairs.

> Q112/2015 Urgent decanting from homes -

1400

Clerk: Question 112, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1405

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Housing provide details of how many tenants required urgent decanting from their homes since the answer to Question 37/2015, indicating the reason why, the date when said decanting became necessary and the date when the tenants were able to return to their home?

**Details** 

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1410

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, three tenants have required decanting from their homes for the following reasons: on account of a fire since 23rd January 2015; two on account of works, on 12th February and one on 13th February, and no set date for return has yet been established for any of the three.

1415 **Hon. E J Reyes:** I am going to try my luck, Mr Speaker. Any idea what type of work?

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: No, Mr Speaker, I am afraid I do not have that level of detail.

#### Q113/2015 Housing Works Agency – Seconded Building Surveyor and M/T Driver

Clerk: Question 113, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1420

- **Hon. E J Reyes:** Further to the answer provided to Question 39/2015, can the Minister for Housing now state if the Building Surveyor and M/T Driver listed under 'seconded' in the schedule provided were either seconded 'out from' or 'into' the Housing Works Agency?
- 1425 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, the building surveyor and driver were seconded 'out' of the Housing Works Agency.

#### Q114/2015 Government rental homes – Eviction of squatters

1430 **Clerk:** Question 114, the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing say how much expenditure has been incurred in respect of legal costs relating to the eviction of squatters from Government rental homes, since the answer provided to Question 41/2015, providing a breakdown showing the number of homes involved and to whom payments were made?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, there has been no expenditure incurred since the answer provided to Question 41/2015.

#### Q115/2015 Vacant flats – Details

Clerk: Question 115, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, further to the answer provided for Written Question W17/2015, can the
Minister for Housing provide details showing which of the five collective reasons listed in the schedules
corresponding to flats which are currently vacant; apply in each individual case, together with details of the
room composition of each individual home?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1450

1435

- **Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, of the 159 pre-war flats, the ones that are beyond economical repair are: 12 x 1RKBs; 29 x 2RKBs; 25 x 3RKBs; 7 x 4RKBs; 6 x 5RKBs; 3 x 6 RKBs.
- Of those considered possible for sale or tender, there are: 5 x 1RKBs; 16 x 2RKBs; 23 x 3RKBs; 10 x 4RKBs; 7 x 5RKBs and 1 x 7RKB.

Of those ready for allocation now, there are: 1 x 1RKB; 2 x 4RKBs and 1 x 9RKB.

Refurbished but not yet allocated: there are 3 x 1RKB; 4 x 3RKBs; 2 x 4RKBs and 2 x 5RKBs.

In relation to the 58 post-war flats the breakdown is as follows.

Of those which are beyond economical repair: 8 x 1RKBs; 3 x 2RKBs; 3 x 3RKBs.

For those considered possible for sale or tender there are none.

Those that are in-house and ready for allocation, there are: 4 x 1RKBs; 4 x 2RKBs; 4 x 3RKBs; 3 x 4RKBs.

Refurbished are: 7 x 1RKBs; 6 x 2RKBs; 9 x 3RKBs; 6 x 4RKBs and 1 x 5RKB.

1465

1460

#### Q116/2015 Governor's Meadow House, Alameda Estate – Cost of resurfacing work

Clerk: Question 116, the Hon. E J Reyes.

- Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Housing provide the breakdown of costs in respect of the recent resurfacing works at the upper entrance to Governor's Meadow House in Alameda Estate, stating which company carried out the works and indicating if these are now complete and approved by Government's Quality Control officials?
- 1475 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, the works were awarded and completed by Limatron Company Limited for the sum of £3,500 and GGCC staff has supervised the works.

1480

Clerk: Question 118, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

# **Question 88/2015 continued – Supplementary information**

**Minister for Sports, Culture, Heritage and Youth (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, if I may with your indulgence since the hon. Member was the one that asked the question –

1485

1490

Mr Speaker: Yes, please do.

**Hon. S E Linares:** – and he has finished today so I would like just to say to him that the £2,088 that he asked in the previous question as to the Re-Enactment Society and Association, was exactly what I said to him they were, on uniforms.

#### Q118-119/2015 Disability – Definition and review in law

Clerk: Question 118, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Social Services say when the definition of 'disabled' will change to ensure that all those who suffer a disability, at whatever stage in their lives, will be entitled to disability benefits, what criteria will be used to define disability and at what stage is Government in the review of disability in our laws?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1500

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 119.

Clerk: Question 119, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Social Services say when the Government will legislate to further protect disabled people, ratifying and using the terms of the United Nations Convention on the rights of disabled persons as a model?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

1510

- Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, insofar as changing the definition in relation to disability allowance, this forms part of a wider review of the Benefit System and is work in progress.
- Legislation to ratify the UN Convention is drafted and is in the final stages of review and about to go to consultation very, very shortly.

#### Q120/2015 St Bernadette's Resource Centre – Plans to increase places

Clerk: Question 120, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Social Services say if there are plans to increase the number of sheltered flats and respite places for the disabled and service users of St Bernadette's Resource Centre.

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, St Bernadette's Resource Centre is a day centre for adults with learning disabilities and does not provide flats or respite.

The provision of disability services is continuously under review and is monitored depending on demand.

#### Q121/2015 Supported Employment Scheme – Participating companies

1530

1535

Clerk: Question 121, the Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond.

**Hon. Mrs I M Ellul-Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Social Services say how many companies in Gibraltar form part of the Supported Employment Scheme which offers sheltered employment for service users of St Bernadette's Resource Centre and the Dr Giraldi Home.

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, there is one company.

#### Q122/2015 Dr Giraldi Inquiry – Final cost

Clerk: Question 122, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is the figure of £2.6 million the final cost of the Dr Giraldi Inquiry or does the Government envisage the figure will increase?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, £2.6 million is not the final cost of the inquiry. Government expects to receive further invoices and will make a statement once the final cost has been determined.

Mr Speaker: Question 159, the Hon. Mr Bossino, it is on financial services.

1555

#### FINANCIAL SERVICES AND GAMING

#### Q159/2015 Flagship events – Business development goals

Clerk: Question 159, the Hon. D J Bossino.

1560

**Hon. D J Bossino:** I am sure he is enjoying whatever he is eating (*Laughter*)

Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Financial Services provide details of the business development goals which the Flagship events have?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services and Gaming.

1565

Minister for Financial Services and Gaming (Hon. A J Isola): Yes, Mr Speaker, as the hon. Member will be aware, 'Flagship Events' are those at which Gibraltar Finance arranges a central event with private meetings previously arranged around them and timed to coincide with international conference events in each of the jurisdictions.

1570

The reason for this is simply to enable professionals in the private sector to attend the international conference, attend the flagship event and also where appropriate, participate in the private meetings arranged during that visit.

1575

Further, we always take the opportunity during these events, to engage with the international media in order to further raise the profile of Gibraltar as a quality and reputable financial services centre. This initiative has led to engagement with Swiss local media and on our recent visit with a Bloomberg Interview, in Hong Kong with CNBC Asia and RHK, a major Hong Kong radio station, both with live interviews. In London with a live interview on Sky News on their Business Today programme and in Bermuda with both TV and newspaper interviews.

1580

Our goal in all of the above is, of course, to promote Gibraltar as a quality and reputable international financial services centre in partnership with the private-sector firms, by proactively marketing the benefits of our proposition and stressing that Gibraltar offers a well regulated transparent and internationally cooperative jurisdiction, with access to financial markets including the right of access to the EU single market in financial services

1585

The recently released Business Development Plan of 2015 details the precise events and conferences we will be supporting this year which exceed 30 different events across the spectrum of our financial services community. The programme has been discussed with and considered by the Finance Centre Council, who have warmly welcomed the Development Plan and are actively supporting our efforts to promote the jurisdiction.

With respect to the flagship events, I would comment as follows:

1590

These past 12 months we have organised Gibraltar Day Lunches in five different cities, being Bermuda, Hong Kong, Geneva, Zurich and London and hosting over 910 guests, including some 200 local professionals supporting these initiatives. These numbers give you an indication of the magnitude of the project we have embarked on and the extent of the support that we have received from those attending and of course, our local firms.

1595

The opportunity to engage directly with professionals in each of these jurisdictions and address them on the benefits of our jurisdiction, hand in hand with the private sector, is an effective and efficient means of promoting business links in these financial hubs with our professionals.

1600

These events, together with attending conferences and road shows and engagement with media, are all part of the programme of increasing serious awareness of our jurisdiction and catching up on the many years of a lack of investment in this area. In addition, our senior executives are constantly engaging with professionals in these and other markets promoting the Gibraltar proposition.

I would like to sincerely thank the entire team of Gibraltar Finance for their conscientious work and attention to detail in ensuring that whatever functions we organise or attend, we always do so perfectly prepared and our presence professionally delivered.

#### Q160/2015 Finance Centre Department travel expenses – Details

1605

Clerk: Question 160, the Hon. D J Bossino.

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Minister for Financial Services provide details of his Department's travel expenses to date for 2015?

1610

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services and Gaming.

Minister for Financial Services and Gaming (Hon. A J Isola): Yes, Mr Speaker, the travel expenses for the Finance Centre Department paid to date for 2015 are Hotel £4,029; Flights £10,461.28; Subsistence and Expenses £903.

These costs relate to invoices paid in 2015 up to 16th February 2015. If I might just add, Mr Speaker, included within those numbers is one visit to London which was cancelled due to my inability to go through serious neck pains, which we are in the process of recovering the cost of through an insurance claim.

1620

**Hon. D J Bossino:** I am grateful for that reply, Mr Speaker. Just to be clear in my own mind, he has given me a set of figures because in fact when information has been uploaded – he and I have had this debate across the floor of the House in relation to asking questions in respect of matters which are available in the internet on the Government website – the information which I thought I was seeking in the question has actually been provided on line, it was updated I think on 16th February which post-dates the filing of the question, Mr Speaker.

1625

Now that information online relates to four specific events which took place, two in January and two in February, the total amount of which I calculated to be about  $\pounds 9,350$  – well, the specific figure is  $\pounds 9,351.30$ . Now the information he has given me is not in tandem with this. Can he explain why? Basically, I was really wanting this updated information but he has given me different information.

1630

**Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Speaker, there may be a difference because what you have on the website will be, I think, ministerial travel and the question is phrased in the Department's travel. So I am including Gibraltar Finance which includes, for example, the members of the Gibraltar Finance Team, Nadiuska and Joanne who travelled to set up an exhibition in London and Zurich, so there are different expenses so you will not be able to relate the information I have given directly to the one you have got from the website because there are different people involved. The Gibraltar Finance Team is not on the website on the same page that you are referring to.

1635

**Hon. D J Bossino:** But the information he has given me, would it include this information that is on the website, because it is his personal expenses I want, as Minister?

1640

**Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Speaker, from the information I have been provided, the breakdown for the numbers that I have just given you, which total I think £10,129 – no they do not – so what they have done is they have extracted my costs and given you the Ministry's costs. For example it includes the cost of a visit to Madrid for a LEIROC Conference of £95 and £179 of hotel. That is not on my website but that is included in these numbers.

1645

If the hon. Member would like to have more details, I am happy to let him have them by letter, giving a breakdown of the specific costs relating to each member of Gibraltar Finance in respect of each of those visits which may be of more use to him than the generic total breakdowns.

1650

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Yes, I probably will be seeking that information from him. Well, I will get the information from the prepared answer once it is on *Hansard* in any event and then I will take a decision once I have had a proper chance of reading it and comparing it with this information. But he has been helpful in his reply.

1655

Now, I have noticed that in terms of making comparisons to how much was spent last year and this year and in terms of his travel expenses there is a three-fold increase. So for example up until March, his travel

expenditure all told, was about £3,500 whilst the information provided on the website suggests he has already spent £9,300. There was a visit to Hong Kong for example which was not included previously.

But, and this is where I am leading to, does he envisage that the overall annual cost, given that he must have a plan and in fact it is published in the Development Plan, the overall annual cost is going to be higher and if so, does he have an idea of how much higher, overall annual for 2015?

**Hon. A J Isola:** Yes, Mr Speaker, the difference between last year and this year obviously is that there was a visit to Hong Kong in January this year and there was not a visit to Hong Kong in January of last year.

In terms of the overall spending, the Business Development Plan which we issued in January has been costed, the expenditure that was in last year's estimate was below the amount that was required to meet the Business Development Plan. So there has been a supplementary funding request made through the Financial Secretary this year and we are within the Budget in terms of what the original estimate was and the supplementary funding request which covers the entirety of the Business Plan. Does that answer your question? (Interjection by Hon. D J Bossino) It is above the estimated amount last year but within the budget that we set through the supplementary funding process.

# EDUCATION AND JUSTICE & INTERNATIONAL EXCHANGE OF INFORMATION

## Q161/2015 Supply teachers and/or support auxiliary staff – Details

Clerk: Question 161, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1675

1660

1665

1670

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Education provide details of any changes there may have been since the answer to Question 54/2015 in respect of supply teachers and/or support auxiliary staff, currently engaged by the Department of Education?

1680 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information.

1685

Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, in respect of my answer to Question 54/2015, the only change to report is that out of the 10 supply cleaners mentioned, eight have been made permanent and the other two are in the process of being recruited, one at Bayside School and one at Bishop Fitzgerald Middle School.

The hon. Member will recall that in one of the schedules to Question 54, in particular Table 4, there was a reference to 10 part-time cleaners with a remark column saying 'in the process of being recruited'. Eight of those have now been recruited and two are in the process of being recruited.

1690

The only other change, Mr Speaker, in respect of the tables previously given, is not a change in actual circumstances but simply the filling of a gap which the hon. Member will recall in Table 1 he saw that under the reasons for cover – this is of supply teachers – there was a gap in one of the teachers covering at the college.

1695

I now have that information and can report that the reason for the cover is an SEN Life Skills Course, which I know that the hon. Member will recognise as ASDAN, and that is a specific Life Skills Course which has been delivered over the course of this year for pupils of special educational needs and that is a temporary cover which has been done over the whole of the academic year.

Those are the only two changes to report, Mr Speaker.

1700

**Hon. E J Reyes:** I am really grateful, Mr Speaker, for the updated information. I know it is just a month since the last time but I posed this question now because it has given the Department of Education enough time to consolidate any information or any amendments required from the start of the term. Therefore, I am satisfied now that I have a complete picture at least for the remainder of this term.

Thank you.

#### Q162/2015 Government subsidised students outside Gibraltar – Full details

Clerk: Question 162, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1710

- **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, please provide a full breakdown of what every Government subsidised student studying outside Gibraltar is studying, broken down by (a) course; (b) university; (c) whether the course is an undergraduate or postgraduate course and (d) the cost of each course.
- 1715 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information.

Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, the information requested is set out in the schedule which I now hand to the hon. Member.

1 .	Schedule to Question 16 QUALIFICATION			·	4 6
1 .	IOHAI IEICATION		<u> </u>		
2 .	BSc	UNIVERSITY Aberdeen University	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	ŲG/PG
2	BSc .	Aberystwyth University	Psychology	29,000,00	UG
	BA .	Academy of Contemporary Music	Creative Sound Design/Music Production	£7,995.00	UG ·
	BMUS ·	Academy of Contemporary Music Guildford Academy of Creative Training	Professional Music Performance Actor Training	£7,995.00 £9,000.00	UG
	BSc/ACCA	Leeds Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000,00	UG PG
		Anglia Ruskin University	History	£8,549.00	UG
	BA	Anglia Ruskin University Anglia Ruskin University	Drama & Film Studies Crime & Investigative Studies	£8,549.00 £9,000.00	ŲĠ
11	BSc	Anglia Ruskin University	Forensic Science	£8,549.00	UG
	BSc	Anglia Ruskin University	Accounting & Finance	£8,549.00	UG
	BA BA	Arts University College Bournemouth Arts University College Bournemouth	Arts & Events Management Architecture	£8,600.00 £9,000.00	UG
15	Foundation Degree	Askam Bryan College, York	Animal Management	£6,000.00	ÜĞ
	BA	Bangor University	History	.00.000,03	UG
	BA BA	Bangor University Bangor University	Linguistics and English Language Criminology & Criminal Justice	£9,000,00 £9,000,00	UG .
0	BSc . ·	Bangor University	Psychology · ·	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc BA	Bangor University	Geography	00,000,02	UG
	MEng	Bath Spa University Cardiff University	Business & Management Civil Engineering	£9,000.00 £3,465,00	UG PG
4	MEng	Cardiff University	Civil Engineering	£3,465.00	PG
	BMus/MA	Berkeley College of Music Boston	Music	£9,000.00	ŲG
	BA HNC	BIMM Brighton BIMM Manchester	Professional Musicianship Artist Development Diploma in Modern Music	£5,950.00 £4,950.00	UG
8	HNC	BIMM Manchester	Artist Development Diploma in Modern Music	£4,950.00	UG
9	BA	Birbeck, University of London	Philosophy	£8,000.00	ŲG
	BA BA	Birmingham City University Birmingham City University	Visual Communication (Illustration) . Theatre Performance & Event Design	£8,200,00	UG
		Blackpool & Fylde College	Musical Theatre	£8,200.00 £1,500.00	UG
3	BA	Blackpool College	Performing Arts	£6,000.00	UG
	HNC BA	Bournemouth & Poole College	Art & Design Events Management	£9,000.00	UG
	BA	Bournemouth University Bournemouth University	Events Management Events Management	£9,000.00 £9,000.00	UG
7	BPS QSEP	University of Northumbria	Sports & Exercise Psychology	£5,450.00	PG
	BPTC	BPP Law School, Leeds	Law	£14,240.00	PG
	BPTC BPTC	City University, London University of Exeter	Law	£17,000.00 £12,240.00	PG PG
	BPTC	University of Exercis	Law	£13,575.00	PG
2	BPTC	University of Northumbria	Law	£11,725.00	PG
	BA	Bradford University College	Performing Arts ( Production)	£9,000.00	UG
	CertMus :	Brighton Institute of Modern Music Brighton Institute of Modern Music	Professional Musicianship Professional Musicianship	£5,950.00 £5,950.00	UG
	BSc	Brunel University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
	BA	Buckinghamshire New University	Event and Festival Management	£9,000.00	UG
	BA BSc	Buckinghamshire New University Buckinghamshire New University	Sports Development & Coaching Criminology	£9,000.00 £9,000.00	UG
	BSc	Buckinghamshire New University	Psychology & Criminology	£9,000.00	UG
		Buckinghamshire New University	Music Management Branding & PR	£9,000,00	UG
	HND BA	Buckinghamshire New University Canterbury Christchurch University College	Health & Social Care American Studies	£7,500.00 £9,000.00	UG UG
	BA	Canterbury Christchurch University College	Events Management	29,000,00	UG
	BSc	Canterbury Christchurch University College	Business Studies with Politics	£9,000.00 .	UG
	BSc LLB(BA)	Canterbury Christchurch University College Canterbury Christchurch University College	Accounting & Finance Law with Business	£9,000.00 £9,000.00	UG
	BA ·	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Accounting Economics & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
9	BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	International Tourism Management	£9,000.00	UG
	BA BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University Cardiff Metropolitan University	Tourism Management Educational and Early Childhood Studies	00.000,03	UG
	BA BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Events Management	£9,000.00	UG
3	BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Business & Management Studies	00,000,03	UG ·
	BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	29,000.00	UG ·
	BA BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University Cardiff Metropolitan University	Events Management Accounting & Finance	00.000 e3	UG
7	BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Business & Management Studies with Marketing	9,000.00	UG
	BA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Educational Studies & Early Childhood Studies	£9,000.00	UG
	BA ·	Cardiff Metropolitan University Cardiff Metropolitan University	Business & Management Accounting & Finance	00.000,03	UG
1	BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sports Coaching	00.000,03	UG
2	BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Computing	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sport & Exercise Science Sports Biomedicine & Nutrition	£9,000.00 £9,000.00	ÜG
	BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Environmental Health	£9,000.00	UG
3	BSc ·	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Computing	£9,000.00	. UG
	BSc ·	Cardiff Metropolitan University Cardiff Metropolitan University	Psychology Computing	00.000,03	UG
	BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University  Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sports Management	£9,000.00	UG
)	BSc .	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Business Management .	£9,000.00	UG
	Foundation Degree Foundation Degree	Cardiff Metropolitan University Cardiff Metropolitan University	Psychology Health & Social Care	£9,000.00 £9,000.00	UG
	Foundation Degree Foundation Degree	Cardiff Metropolitan University	International Tourism Management	19,000.00	UG
4	Foundation Degree	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Health & Social Care	£9,000.00	UG
5	HND	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sports Development & Coaching	£7,800.00	UG ·
	HND LLB	Cardiff Metropolitan University Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sports Development and Coaching  Law	£7,800.00 £9,000.00	UG
	BA	Cardiff University	Spanish & Italian	9,000,000	UG
9	BSc	Cardiff University	Sociology	00.000,03	UG
	BSc	Cardiff University	Optometry	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc MEng	Cardiff University Cardiff University	History & Sociology Civil Engineering	£9,000.00 £3,465.00	UG
	MScD HNC/NVQ	Cardiff University	Orthodontics (PG Training)	£12,486.00	PG

	COUNTRICATION :	Line			
06:	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE ·	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PC
	MBBS BSc	Charles University Faculty of Medicine, Czech Ro Charles University Faculty of Medicine, Czech Ro		9,000,00	UG
	MBBS BSc	Charles University Faculty of Medicine Czech Re		00.000,03	UG
	MBBS BSc	Masaryk University Faculty of Medicine Czech Re		00.000.02	UG
99	BA	Chester University	History	£9,000.00 £9,000.00	UG
00		City & Guilds of London Art School	Fine Art, Painting	£6,000,00	ÜĞ
	Foundation Degree	City College Plymouth	Accounting & Finance	£5,950.00	UG
	BSc	City University London	Speech & Language Therapy	29,000.00	UG
	BSc	City University London	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
	MSC/DPsych	City University London	Counselling Psychology	£7,000.00	PG
05	BSc	Coventry University	Geography & Natural Hazards	£9,000,00	UG
06	BSc · .	Coventry University	Environmental Health	£9;000.00	UG
	BSc	Coventry University	Occupational Therapy	£9,000,00	ŲG.
	Foundation	Coventry University	Law & Practice	£9,000.00	UG
09	BSc ·	Dalhousle University Canada	Geology/ Petrology	29,000,00	UG
	BSc Econ	David Game College	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
11	DipCounselling Psych	City University London	Counselling Psychology	£7,200.00	PG
	BA	De Montfort University	Drama Studies	29,000,00	UG
13	BA	De Montfort University	Performing Arts	29,000,00	UG
	BA	De Montfort University	Accounting & Economics	£9,000.00	UG
15	BSc	De Montfort University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
16	BA	Derby University	Fine Art	£9,000,00	UG
	MA	Dundee University	Architecture	No fees - Scotland	UG
18	BA	Durham University	Ancient History .	29,000,00	UG
19	BA	Durham University	History	£9,000,00	UG
	BA	Durham University	Social Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc	Durham University .	Economics .	£9,000,00	UG
	BA	Edge Hill University	Dance & Theatre Arts	£9,000,00	ŲG
	BA	Edgehill University	TV &Film Production	£9,000,00.	ŲG
	Diploma in Ballet	English National Ballet School	Dance	£17,000.00	UG
	BSc	Essex University	Nursing .	£9,000,00	UG
	BA	Exeter College	Film & TV Practice	£9,000.00	ŲG ·
	BA	Exeter University	History & International Relations	29,000,00	UG
	LLB	Exeter University	Law	£9,000,00	UG
	LLB	Exeter University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
	BA	Franciscan University of Steubenville	Theology	£9,000.00 ·	UG
	GDL .	BPP University College, Waterloo	Law	£9,990,00	PG '
32		Gateshead College	Humanities	£7,810.00	UG
	BA ·	Gateshead College	Humanities	£7,810.00	UG
	BA	Gateshead College	Humanities .	£7,810.00	UG
	BA	Goldsmith's University of London	Journalism	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc	Goldsmith's University of London	Management & Entrepreneurship	£9,000.00	UG
	BA	Greenwich University	International Business with language (2yrs top up)	£9,000,00	UG
	BA	GSM London (Plymouth University)	Accounting & Finance	£6,000.00	UG
39		Guildford College .	Counselling :	£6,000.00	UG
40		Hertfordshire University	Graphic Design & Illustration	£8,700.00	UG
	MBBS	Hull York Medical School	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
42	MBBS	Humanities University, Milan, Italy	Medicine	. 00.000,02	UG
	MBBS	Imperial College London	Medicine -	£3,465.00	UG
	MBBS	Imperial College London	Medicine	£3,465.00	UG
45		Keele University	Geography with Sociology	£9,000,00	UG
46		Keele University	English Literature & History	29,000,00	UG
	BSc	Keele University	Psychology & Criminology	£3,465.00	UG
	BSc	Keele University	Psychology & Mathematics	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc	Keele University	Psychology	£9,000,00	UG:
	LLB ·	Keele University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
	LLB	Keele University	Law	£9,000,00	UG
	MBChB	Keele University	Medicine	£3,465.00	UG
	BSc	Kings College London	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
	MB BS	Kings College London	Medicine	£3,465.00	UG
	PG Dip .	Kings College London	Nursing Studies with Registration - Adult	£8,980.00	UG
	BA	Kings College London	Dance	£4,850.00	UG
	BA	Kings College London	Art & Design	£6,000,00	UG
	HE Diploma	Kings College London	Applied Computing	£1,950,00	UG
59	BA .	Kingston University	English Language & Communications & English Literature	£9,000.00	
OU.	BA · ·	Kingston University	Human Resource Management	£9,000.00 £9,000.00	UG
	BA	Kingston University	Accounting & Finance Business Management	£9,000.00	UG
	BA .	Kingston University Kingston University	Politics & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
	BA .	Kingston University	Politics & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
	BA		Economics .	£9,000.00	UG
	BA ·	Kingston University Kingston University	Business & Law	£9,000.00	UG
	BA BA	Kingston University  Kingston University	Business & Law Business Management	£9,000.00	UG
	BA	Kingston University	English Language & Communication & International Relation		UG
	BA:	Kingston University	Criminology & Social Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
	BA(QTS)	Kingston University	Primary Teaching	£9,000.00	UG
	BA(Q15)	Kingston University  Kingston University	Accounting & Finance	29,000,00	UG
	BA	Kingston University	Illustration & Visual communication	£9,000.00	UG
	BA .	Kingston University	Photography	£9,000.00	UG
	BA	Kingston University	Sociology & Business	£9,000.00	UG
	BA	Kingston University	Journalism & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
	BA · · ·	Kingston University	Business Management	£9,000.00	ŲĠ
	BSc	Kingston University	Sport Science -	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc	Kingston University	Computer Studies	£9,000,00	UG
	BSc	Kingston University	Mental Health Nursing	£9,140.00	UG
	BSc	Kingston University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc	Kingston University	Psychology & Politics	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc	Kingston University	Computer Networks	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc	Kingston University	Psychology with Spanish	29,000,00	UG
	BSc	Kingston University	Business Economics	£9,000.00	UG ·
	BSc	Kingston University	Psychology	9,000,00	UG
	BSc	Kingston University	Biological Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
		Kingston University	Creative Technologies	9,000.00	UG
87	BSc	Kingston University	Midwifery	£10,010.00	UG

QUALIFIC	ATION UNIVERSITY	COURSE TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG
190 HND	Kingston University	Business & Finance £6,000,00	UG
191 HND 192 LLB	Kingston University Kingston University	Business & Finance £6,000.00  Law £9,000.00	UG
193 BSc	Kingston University	Mental Health Nursing £9,140.00	ÜĢ
194 HND	Lancaster & Morecambe The (		UG
195 BSc 196 BSc	Lancaster University  Lancaster University	Geography         £9,000.00           Maths & Statistics         £9,000.00	UG .
197 BSc	Lancaster University	Geography £9,000.00	UG
198 BA	Leeds Beckett University	Entertainment Management £3,465,00	UG
199 BA 200 Foundation	n Degree Leeds City College	Business & Management	UG
201 HND	Leeds College of Building	Construction & The Built Environment £4,000.00	ŲG
202 HND 203 BA	Leeds College of Building Leeds College of Music	Construction & The Built Environment	UG
204 BA	. Leeds Metropolitan University	Design £3,465.00	UG
205 BA	Leeds Metropolitan University	Accounting and Finance £9,000.00	UG.
206 BA · 207 BA	Leeds Metropolitan University Leeds Metropolitan University	Sociology £9,000.00 History £9,000.00	UG ·
208 BA	Leeds Metropolitan University	French & Tourism Management £9,000.00	UG
209 BA	Leeds Metropolitan University	Business & Management £9,000.00	UG
210 BA 211 BA	Leeds Metropolitan University Leeds Metropolitan University	Law, Social Science and Communication Studies £9,000.00  Landscape, Architecture & Design £9,000.00	UG
212 BSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Quantity Surveying £3,465.00	UG
213 BSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Music Technology £9,000.00	UG
214 BSc 215 BSc	Leeds Metropolitan University Leeds Metropolitan University	Biomedical Science	UG
216 BSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Psychology £9,000.00	UG
217 BSc	Leeds Metropolitan University Leeds Metropolitan University	Construction Management £9,000,00 Computing £9,000,00	UG
218 BSc 219 BA	Leeds Metropolitan University  Leeds Metropolitan University	Computing   £9,000.00     Sociology   £9,000.00	UG
220 LLB	Leeds Metropolitan University	Law £9,000.00	UG
221 LLB	Leeds Metropolitan University	Law £9,000.00 Law £9,000.00	UG ·
222 LLB 223 BA	Leeds Metropolitan University  Leeds University	Law £9,000,00 Graphic & Communication Design £9,000,00	UG
224 BA	Leeds University	Business & Management £3,465.00	UG
225 BEng	Leeds University	Mechanical/Automotive Engineering	UG
226 BA 227 HNC	Liverpool Community College	Graphic Design   £9,000.00     Fashion & Clothing   £3,477,20	UG
228 BA	Liverpool Hope University	Music with Education £9,000.00	UG
229 BA(QTS)	Liverpool Hope University	Primary Teaching with Special Educational Needs £9,000.00  Sports & Exercise Science £9,000.00	UG
230  BSc 231  LLB	Liverpool Hope University Liverpool Hope University	Sports & Exercise Science   £9,000.00	UG
232 BA	Liverpool John Moore Univers	Architecture £9,000.00	UG
233 BA	Liverpool John Moore Univers		UG
234 BA 235 BA	Liverpool John Moore Univers Liverpool John Moore Univers		UG
236 BA	Liverpool John Moore Univers	Early Childhood Studies £9,000,00	UG
237 BA	Liverpool John Moore Univers		UG
238 BA 239 BA	Liverpool John Moore Univers Liverpool John Moore Univers		UG
240 BA	Liverpool John Moore Univers	r Fine Art £9,000.00	UG
241 BA	Liverpool John Moore Univers		UG
242   BSc 243   BSc	Liverpool John Moore Univers Liverpool John Moore Univers		UG
244 BSc	Liverpool John Moore Univers	Accounting & Finance £9,000,00	UG
245 BSc	Liverpool John Moore Univers		UG
246 BSc 247 BSc	Liverpool John Moore Univers		UG
248 BSc	Liverpool John Moore Univers	Construction Management £9,000.00	UG
249 BSc 250 Foundation	Liverpool John Moore Univers		UG
251 Foundation			UG
252 MSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	ACCA Professional (Embedded) £3,500.00	PG
253 LLM	University College, London	Corporate Law £12,900.00 International & Comparative Law £9,000.00	PG PG
254 LLM 255 LLM	University of Derby University of Leeds	International & Comparative Law £5,000,00 International Business Law £7,000.00	PG
256 LLM	University of Northumbria	International Commercial Law £4,905.00	PG
257 LLM	University of Nottingham	International Commercial Law £6,010.00	PG UG
258 Certificate 259 Foundation		Juction         Sound Engineering         £1,298.00           Interior Design Access Course         £9,000.00	UG
260 Foundation	n Year London Art Portfolio	Art & Design £9,000.00	UG ·
261 BA	London College of Fashion	Fashion Illustration £9,000.00	UG
262  BA 263  BSc	London Metropolitan Universit  London Metropolitan Universit	Architecture	UG
264 BSc	London Metropolitan Universit	Sports Science & Physical Education £7,100.00	UG
265 BSc	London Metropolitan Universit	Computing £7,140.00	· UG
266 BSc 267 RIBA	London Metropolitan Universit  London Metropolitan Universit	Computer Games Programming £6,600.00.  Professional Diploma in Architecture £3,465.00	UG PG
268 BSc	London School of Business ar	Finance Business Management £7,500.00	UG
269 BSc		nd Political Scient International Recreation & History £8,500.00 Psychology £9,000.00	UG
270 BSc 271 Foundation	London South Bank University n Degree London South Bank University	Psychology £9,000.00  Baking Technology Management £9,000.00	UG
272 BEng	London Southbank University	Mechanical Engineering £8,450.00	UG
273 BA	London Studio Centre	Dance Theatre £9,000.00	UG
274 BA 275 BA	Loughborough University  Loughborough University	Graphic Design & Visual Communications £9,000.00 History & Politics £9,000.00	UG
276 BEng (Ho	ns) Loughborough University	Mechanical Engineering £9,000.00	UG
277 BSc	Loughborough University	Accounting & Financial Management £9,000.00	UG
	Loughborough University.	Sociology £9,000.00	. UG
	Loughborough University	Computer Science 159,000,00	UG
278   BSc 279   BSc 280   BSc	Loughborough University  Loughborough University	Computer Science   £9,000.00	UG UG
279 BSc 280 BSc 281 BSc	Loughborough University Loughborough University	Physics & Mathematics         £9,000.00           Geography         £9,000.00	UG
279 BSc 280 BSc	Loughborough University	Physics & Mathematics £9,000,00	UG

	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG
	MA	Cardiff Metropolitan University	Sports Management & Leadership		PG .
286		City College Brighton	Food & Culinary Arts	£9,000.00	PG
287	MA ··	City University London	Human Centred Systems	£9,000.00 ·	PG '
288		Kings College, London	Child Studies	26,000,00	PG
289		Lancaster University	Human Resources & Counselling	£9,500.00	PG:
290		Leeds Beckett University	Graphic Arts Design	00.000,63	PG
291 292		Leeds Metropolitan University	Human Resource Management		PG . PG
293		London College of Fashion  London Metropolitan University	Fashion Marketing Counselling Psychology		PG ·
294		London South Bank College	Education		PG
295		National Film & TV School	Composition for Film & TV	£11,800.00	PG
296		Royal Central University of London	Drama & Movement Therapy		PG
297	MA	St Mary's University College	International Tourism Development	£4,410.00	PG
298	MA	St Mary's University College	International Tourism Development	£4,410.00	PG
299		The Institute of Music Performance, London	Popular Music Performance		PG
300		University of Bangor	History		PG
301		University of Bangor	Creative Studies	£3,996.00	PG
302		University of Bournemouth University of Durham	Model Making International Relations	£9,000.00 £6,200.00	PG PG
304		University of Durham	Museum & Artefact Studies	£6,200.00	PG
305		University of East Anglia	Counselling & Psychotherapy	£6,900.00	PG
306		University of Edinburgh	French & Spanish	£9,000.00	PG
307		University of Glasgow	English Language & Italian	£1,820.00	PG
308	MA	University of Kent	Religion	£5,100.00	PG
309.		University of Loughborough	Sports Management	£5,900.00	PG
310		University of Missouri	Studio Art Graphic Design	£9,000.00	PG
311		University of Newcastle	Human Resources Management	£8,500.00	PG
312		University of Newcastle	Latin American & Interdisciplinary Studies	£5,000.00	PG PG
313 314		University of Portsmouth University of Sheffield	Communication & Language Skills Sociology	£5,000.00 £5,140.00	PG
314		University of South Wales	Public Services	£9,000.00	PG
316		University of Warwick	Continental Philosophy	£7,050.00	PG
317		University of York	English Literary Studies	£6,200.00	PG
318		University of York	Criminology & Social Research	£6,200.00	PG
319	MA .	Wimblemdon College of Arts	Drawing	£3,465.00	PG .
320		Manchester College	Musical Theatre	£8,400.00	UG
321		Manchester Metropolitan University	Philosophy	00.000,83	UG
322		Manchester Metropolitan University  Manchester Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00 £8,000.00	UG
323 324		Manchester Metropolitan University	Accountancy & Finance	£8,000.00	UG
325		Manchester Metropolitan University	Art & Design	£9,000.00	UG
326		Manchester Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
327	BA ·	Manchester Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
328		Manchester Metropolitan University	International Business & Spanish	£9,000.00	UG
329		Manchester Metropolitan University	Events Management	£8,000.00 £9,000.00	UG
330 331		Manchester Metropolitan University  Manchester Metropolitan University	Primary Education Psychology / Sociology	£2,250.00	UG
	BSc	Manchester Metropolitan University	Accounting & Finance	£8,000.00	UG
	BSc	Manchester Metropolitan University	Geography	£3,465.00	UG
334		Manchester Metropolitan University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc .	University of Lancaster	Mathematics	£4,321.00	PG
336		Mc Gill University Montreal, Canada	History & Economics	£3,465.00 £10,800.00	UG PG
	MCLinDent MCLinDent	Cardiff University University College London	Orthodontics Orthodontics	£10,800.00	PG .
	MEng .	Oxford Brookes University	Mechanical Engineering ·	£9,000.00	PG
340		University of Bath	Mechanical Engineering	£9,000.00	PG
	MEng	University of Lancaster	Computer Science	£3,996.00	PG
	MEng	University of Leeds	Computer Science	£9,000,00	PG
	MEng	University of Leicester	Aerospace Engineering	£3,465.00	PG
344	MEng	University of Newcastle	Chemical Engineering	£3,465.00	PG
	MEng	University of Northumbria	Electrical Engineering	£9,000.00	PG
	MEng ·	University of Southampton	Ship Science .	£9,000.00	PG
	MEng	University of Southampton Middlesex University	Civil Engineering  Business Management	£4,500.00 £9,000.00	UG
348 349		Middlesex University Middlesex University	Music & Arts Management	£9,000.00	UG
	BEng	Middlesex University  Middlesex University	Network Management & Security	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc	Middlesex University	Computer Science	£9,000.00	UG
352	LLB	Middlesex University	Law	£9;000.00	UG
353	MMath	University of Loughborough .	Mathematics	£3,465.00 ·	PG
	MMath	University of Newcastle	Mathematics	£9,000.00	PG
	MMATH	University of York	Mathematics Ethnomysics loss	£13,380.00	PG
	MMus Foundation Degree	University College, London  Montessori Centre International, London	Ethnomusicology  Early Childhood Practice	£4,500,00 £8,270.00	UG
	DipHE	Leeds Metropolitan University	Osteopathy	£3,465.00	PG
359		Mount Batten Institute	International Business Practise	£9,000.00	PG
360		Mount Batten Institute	International Business Practise	£9,000.00	PG
	MPhil	University of Cambridge	Clinical Neuroscience	£18,774.00	PG
	MPhil	University of Westminster	Research into Life Sciences	£4,037.50	PG
	MPhys	Imperial College, London	Physics .	£9,000,00	PG
	MPhys	University of Sheffield	Physics	. 00.000,03	PG
	MSc	Franciscan University in Steubenville	Science in Education	00,000,00	PG
	MSc	Imperial College, London	Economics & Strategy for Business	£22,000.00	PG
	MSc	Kings College London	Early Intervention in Psychosis	£9,200.00	PG
	MSc	Kings College London	Science Technology& Medicine in History International Marketing	£8,250.00 £10,500.00	PG
	MSc MSc	Kings College London Kings College London	Analytical Toxicology	£10,500.00	PG
	MSc	Kingston University, London	Psychology	£5,800.00	PG
	MSc	Kingston University, London	Financial & Business Management	£9,800.00	PG
	MSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Psychology with Sociology	£13,180.00	PG
	MSc	Leeds Metropolitan University	Sports & Exercise Nutrition	£5,000.00	PG.
374					
	MSc	Manchester Metropolitan University  Nottingham Trent University	Exercise & Sport Psychological Well Being & Mental Health	£4,200.00 £5,350.00	PG

QUALIFIC		COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/P0
377 MSc	Nottingham Trent University St Mary's University College	Sports Law Sport Rehabilitation	£6,420.00 £4,860.00	PG
378 MSc 379 MSc	Teesside University	Forensic Psychology	£4,500.00	PG
380 MSc	Teesside University	Crime Scene Science	£8,450.00	PG
381 MSc	University College London	Clinical Mental Health	£8,500.00	PG
382 MSc	University College London	Pharmacology	00.000,03	PG
383 MSc	University of Chichester	Physical Education	£8,500.00	PG
384 MSc	University of Huddersfield	Network Technology & Management	£4,460.00	PG
385 MSc	University of Leeds	International Bussiness Law	£7,000.00	PG
386 MSc	University of Loughborough	Sports Management	. £6,250.00	PG
387 MSc	University of Northampton University of Northumbria	Counselling & Psychotherapy.  Biomedical Science	£5,500.00 £9,000.00	PG
388 MSc 389 MSc	University of Reading	Plant Diversity	£5,500,00	PG
390 BA	New York University	Economics	£9,000,00	UG
391 BSc	Newcastle College	Nursery Nurse	00.000,93	UG
392 DipHE	Newcastle College	Hair and Media Makeup	. 00.000,03	UG
393 CertHE	Newcastle College	Retail & Enterprise	£9,000.00	UG
394 CertHE	Newcastle College	Hairdressing & Barbering	£9,000.00	UG
395 BTEC 396 BA	Newcastle Under Lyme College Newcastle University	Working with Children and Young People Accounting & Finance	9,000.00	UG
397 BA	Newcastle University	Town Planning	29,000.00	UG
98 BA	Newcastle University	International Business Management	00.000,93	UG
99 BA	Newcastle University	Business Accounting & Finance	£6,333.00	UG
100 BA	Newcastle University	Accounting and Finance	£9,000.00	UG
01 · BA	Newcastle University	Modern Languages & Business Studies	9,000.00	UG
02 BA	Newcastle University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
103 BA	Newcastle University	Accounting & Finance Politics & Sociology	00,000,02	UG
104 BA 105 BEng	Newcastle University Newcastle University	Civil Engineering	£9,000.00	UG
106 BSc	Newcastle University	Business Accounting & Finance	£6,333.00	UG
07 BSc	Newcastle University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
108 BSc	Newcastle University	Economics & Management	00.000,03	UG
109 BSc	Newcastle University	Zoology	£9,000.00	UG
10 BSc	Newcastle University	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
11 Foundatio		Sports Therapy & Sports Injuries	£9,000.00 £9,000,00	UG
112 BA 113 BA	Northampton University Northampton University	Interior Design . Drama & English	£9,000.00	UG
114 BA	Northampton University	Advertising	00.000,03	UG
15 BA	Northampton University	Creative Writing	00.000.03	UG
16 BA	Northampton University	Primary Education	19,000.00	UG .
17 BA	Northampton University	Interior Design	00,000,02	UG
118. BSc	Northampton University	Human Geography	00.000,02	UG
419 LLB	Northampton University	Law .	£9,000.00	UG
120 BA	Northern School of Contemporary Dance Northern School of Contemporary Dance		00.000,03	UG
121 BA 122 BA	Northumbria University	History & Politics	00.000,02	ÜĞ
423 BA	Northumbria University	Accounting	£9,000.00	UG
124 BA(QTS)	Northumbria University	Early Primary Education	00.000,03	UG
425 BA	Northumbria University	Spanish with Business	£3,465.00	UG
426 BA	Northumbria University	Graphic Design	00.000,03	UG
427. BA	Northumbria University	History & Politics	69,000,00	UG
428 BA	Northumbria University Northumbria University	Business & Finance Psychology	£3,465.00 £9,000.00	UG
429 BSc 430 BSc	Northumbria University	Biomedical Sciences	00.000,02	UG
131 BSc	Northumbria University	Geography	00.000,03	UG
132 BSc	Northumbria University	Biomedical Sciences	00.000,03	UG
133 BSc	Northumbria University	Computer Science	£9,000.00	UG
134 BSc	Northumbria University	Architectural Technology	£3,465.00	UG
435 BSc	Northumbria University	Electrical Engineering	. 00,000,02	UG
436 BSc 437 BSc	Northumbria University Northumbria University	Biomedical Science Psychology	00.000,93	UG
137 BSC 138 BSc		Communication & Public Relation	£9,000,00	UG
139 LLB	Northumbria University	Law ·	£9,475.00	UG
140 LLB	Northumbria University	Law	29,000.00	UG
141 LLB	Northumbria University	Law	£9,000.00	UG
142 GDL	Nottingham Law School	GDL Civil Englanding	£8,160,00	UG
143 BEng (BA		Civil Engineering Accounting & Finance	00.000,03	UG
144 BA 145 BA	Nottingham Trent Nottingham Trent	Fashion Finance	£8,750.00	UG
146 BA	Nottingham Trent	Modern Languages	£9,000,00	UG
147 BA	Nottingham Trent	Media & International Relation	£8,500.00	UG
148 BA	Nottingham Trent	Criminology	£9,000.00	UG
149 LLB	Nottingham Trent	Law	£9,000.00	UG
150 LLB	Nottingham Trent	2011	00.000,93	UG
151 LLB	Nottingham Trent Nottingham Trent	Law with Criminology Wildlife Conservation	£9,000,00	UG
152 BSc 153 BA	Oxford Brookes University	Business Management & Communication	£6,000.00	UG
154 BA	Oxford Brookes University	History & Sociology	£9,000.00	· UG
155 BA	Oxford Brookes University	History & Sociology	£9,000.00	UG
156 BA	Oxford Brookes University	Education	£9,000.00	UG
157 BA	Oxford Brookes University	City & Regional Planning	£9,000.00	UG
158 BA	Oxford Brookes University	Business Management & Spanish	00.000,03	UG
159 BA	Oxford Brookes University Oxford Brookes University	History of Art Sport & Exercise Science	£9,000.00	UG
160 BSc 161 BSc	Oxford Brookes University Oxford Brookes University	Business Management	£9,000.00	UG
162 BSc	Oxford Brookes University	Accounting & Finance	29,000.00	UG
163 BSc	Oxford Brookes University	Computer Science	00.000,93	UG
464 BSc	Oxford Brookes University	Psychology & Human Biosciences	£9,000.00	· UG
465 BSc	Oxford Brookes University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
466 LLB	Oxford Brookes University	Law	9,000.00	UG
467 LLB	Oxford Brookes University Oxford Brookes University	Law	00.000,93	UG
	LUXIDIA BIDOKES UNIVERSITY			
468 LLB .		Psychology & Philosophy	1£9,000.00	. IUG
	Oxford University Parsons The new School for Design US	Psychology & Philosophy  Communication Design	£9,000.00 .	. UG

472 PG	JALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY Bath Spa University	PGCE .	TUITION (per annum) £9,000.00	UG/PC
173 PG		Canterbury Christchurch University College	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
74 PG		Kingston University, London	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG.
75 PG		Leeds Metropolitan University	PGCE	.00,000,02	PG
76 PG		Leeds Metropolitan University	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
77 PG		Manchester Metropolitan University	PGCE	29,000,00	PG
78 PG		Oxford Brookes University St Mary's University College	PGCE PGCE	00,000,03	PG PG
80 PG		University of Brighton	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
81 PG		University of Cambridge	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
82 PG	CE	University of Cambridge	PGCE :	£9,000,00	PG
83 PG		University of Cambridge	PGCE .	£9,000.00	PG
84 PG		University of Chichester University of Creative Arts, Epsom	PGCE	00,000,02	PG
85 PG 86 PG		University of Creative Arts, Epsom University of Exeter	Fashion Design PGCE	69,000,00	PG PG
	CE.	University of Leicester	PGCE	£9,000:00	PG
88 PG		University of Plymouth	PGCE	00.000,63	PG
89 PG		University of Roehampton	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
90 PG		University of Sussex	PGCE	£9,000.00	PG
91 Phi		University of Bristol	Theology	£3,996.00	PG
92 Phi 93 BA		University of Leeds Plymouth College of Art	Cancer Pharmacology Animation	£3,975,00 £9,000.00	PG UG
94 BA		Plymouth University .	Social Work	£9,000.00	UG .
95 BA		Plymouth University	Early Childhood Studies	£9,000.00	UG.
96 BS	ic ·	Plymouth University	Science	£3,465.00	UG
97 BS		Plymouth University	Hospitality Management	£9,000,00	UG
98 BS		Plymouth University Plymouth University	Computing	00,000,02	UG
99 BS		Plymouth University Plymouth University	Maritime Business & Logistics Law	£9,000.00 £5,950.00	UG
00   Dip		Point Blank Music College	Music Production & Sound Engineering	£8,125.00	UG
02 Dip	oloma .	Point Blank Music College	Music Production & Sound Engineering	£8,125.00	UG
03 Dip	oloma	Point Blank Music College	Music Production & Sound Engineering	£8,125.00	UG
04 Dip		Point Blank Music College	Music Production & Sound Engineering	£9,000.00	UG
05 BA 06 BA		Queen Margaret University Queen Mary University of London	Therapeutic Radiography English Literature	£6,750.00 £1,350.00	UG
07 BA		Reading University	Art:	£9,000.00	UG
08. BA		Regents College ·	Global Business and Sustainability Management	£9,000,00	UG
09 BA		Regents College	Creative Industries	9,000.00	UG
10 BA		Regents College	Business & Global Management	£9,000.00	UG
11 BA 12 BS		Roehampton University Roehampton University	Philosophy Psychology	£8,400.00 £8,400.00	UG
13 MB		Royal College of Surgeons Ireland	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
14 BA		Royal Holloway University of London	Modern History & Politics	£9,000.00	UG
15 BA		Royal Holloway University of London	English	£9,000.00	UG
16 BA		Royal Holloway University of London	French & Italian	£9,000.00	UG
17 BA		Royal Northern College of Music	Popular Music Performance	£9,000,00	UG
18 BA 19 BA		Royal Northern College of Music Royal Northern College of Music, Manchester	Popular Music Performance	£9,000.00 £9,000.00	UG
20 BA		School of Oriental & African Studies, London	International Politics	£9,000.00	UG
21 Cer		Sheffield City College	Animal Care	£9,000.00	UG
22 BA		Sheffield Hallam University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
23 BA		Sheffield Hallam University	Performance for Stage & Screen	£9,000.00	UG
24 BA 25 BA		Sheffield Hallam University Sheffield Hallam University	History Childhood Studies	£9,000.00	UG -
26 BA		Sheffield Hallam University	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
27 BS		Sheffield Hallam University	Blomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
8 BS		Sheffield Hallam University	Computing .	£9,000.00	UG
9 BS		Sheffield Hallam University	Mathematic with Education & QTS	£9,000.00	UG
30 BS		Sheffield Hallam University Sheffield Hallam University	Hospitality Business Management Product Design	£9,000.00 £9,000.00	UG
1 BS		Sheffield Hallam University	Midwifery	£9,000.00	UG
3 BS		Sheffield University	Biology	£9,000.00	UG
4 LLE	В	Sheffield University	Law (European & International)	£9,000.00	UG
5 BA		SIST University Tangier	Business Management	£4,038.46	UG
6 HN	ID undation Year	Solihull College South Devon College of HE	Advanced Practice in work with Children and Families Health & Social Care	£4,950.00 £2,551.00	UG
8 BA		South Essex College of HE	Graphic Design	£9,000.00	UG
9 BA		Southampton Solent University .	Business Management	£8,300.00	UG
0 BA		Southampton Solent University	Make-up & Hair Design	£9,000.00	UG
1 BS		Southampton Solent University	Software Engineering	00.000.00	UG
2 BS		Southampton Solent University Southampton Solent University	Computing Construction Management	£9,000.00 00,000,03	UG
4 BS		Southampton Solent University  Southampton Solent University	Construction Management	£8,300.00	UG
5 BS	c	Southampton Solent University	Shipping & Port Management	£9,000,00	UG
6 BS	c	Southampton Solent University	Accountancy & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
7 BA		Southampton University	Politics	29,000,00	UG
9 BA	BBS BSc	St George's University of London St Mary's University College	Medicine English & Creative & Professional Writing	£9,000.00 £8,400.00	UG
0 BA		St Mary's University College	Dance & Theatre Arts	£8,400.00	UG
1 BA	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	St Mary's University College	Film and Popular Culture and Psychology	£8,400.00	UG
2 BA		St Mary's University College	Drama & Applied Theatre	£8,400.00	UG
3 BA	1-1-111	St Mary's University College	Sociology	£8,400,00	UG
	Joint Honours	St Mary's University College	Drama & English	£8,400.00	UG-
5 BA		St Mary's University College St Mary's University College	Management Studies Primary Education (QTS)	£8,400.00 £9,000.00	UG
7 BS		St Mary's University College	Nutrition & Health	£8,400.00	UG
8 BS		St Mary's University College	Geography	£9,000.00	UG
9 HN	ID	St Mary's University College	[Psychology & Counselling	£4,500.00	UG
0 LLE	3	St Mary's University College	Law	. 00.000,03	UG
1 PG	ICE .	St Mary's University College .	PGCE	£9,000.00	UG
32 BA		St Mary's University College St Mary's University College	Management Studies	£9,000,00	· UG
		St Mary's University College	Primary Education with QTS History	£8,400.00 £9,000.00	UG
4 BA		St Mary's University College	English & History	£9,000.00	UG

QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annun	
66 BA	St Mary's University College	Drama & English	£9,000.00	UG
37 HND	St Mary's University College	Psychology & Counselling	£4,500.00	UG
88 LLB	St Mary's University College	Law	£3,465.00 .	UG
9 LLB	St Mary's University College	Law Childhood Studios	00.000,03	. UG
0 BA .	Staffordshire University	Early Childhood Studies	£8,620.00 £8,620.00	UG
1 BSc	Staffordshire University Staffordshire University	Forensic Investigation	. \$9,000.00	UG
2 LLB 3 BA	Swansea Metropolitan University	Accounting	£7,500.00	· UG
4 BEng (Hons)	Swansea Metropolitan University	Computer Systems & Electronics	£7,500.00	UG
5 HND	Swansea Metropolitan University	Tourism Management	£7,500.00	UG
6 HND .	Swansea Metropolitan University .	Building Studies	£7,500.00	UG
HND	Swansea Metropolitan University	Software Engineering	£7,500.00	UG
HND	Swansea Metropolitan University	Computer & Information Systems	£7,500,00	UG
HND	Swansea Metropolitan University	Quantity Surveying	£7;500.00	UG
O HND	Swansea Metropolitan University	Sports Management	£7,500.00	UG
1 HND	Swansea Metropolitan University .	Computing & Information Systems	£7,500.00 .	UG
BA ·	Swansea University	Philosophy Politics & Economics	£9,000.00	UG
B BA	Swansea University .	Spanish :	£9,000.00	UG
4 BSc	Swansea University	Psychology	00.000,03	UG
LLB	Swansea University	Law	. 69,000,00	UG
S LLB . ·	Swansea University	Law	00.000,03	UG
7 Diploma	Tante Marie Culinary Academy	Intensive Cordon Bleu Diploma	00,000,02	UG
8 BA	Tech Music School Fulham	Music Production	£5,950.00	
BA	Tech Music School London	Music Production	£5,950.00 £5,950.00	UG
Diploma	Tech Music School London	Music Production	£4,950.00	UG
Diploma	Tech Music School London Teesside University	Songwriting & Musical Performance	£4,950.00 £7,950.00	UG
BSc Foundation Degree		Psychology Computing	£5,500.00	UG
	Teesside University Teesside University	Social Sciences	£5,750.00	UG
HND BSc.	Teesside University  Teesside University	Sports Therapy	£7,950.00	UG
BSC.	The American University of Paris	International Relations	£9,000.00	UG
7 BTEC	The Manchester College	Children's Care Learning & Development	£9,000.00	UG
B FdA	The Manchester College	Make Up Artistry Effects	26,800.00	UG
FdA	The Manchester College	Events Management	£5,950,00 · ·	UG
) BA	The University of Arts Bournemouth	Fashion Design	£8,600,00	UG
1 BA .	The University of Bournemouth	Accounting & Finance	00.000,63	UG
2 MBChb	The University of Buckingham	Medicine	£12,000.00	UG
3 BA	The University of Gloucestershire	English Literature & Language	£8,250.00	UG
4 MBChb	The University of Liverpool	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
5 LLB	The University of Manchester	Law .	£9,000.00	UG
6 BSc	The University of Northampton	Geography (Physical Geography)	£9,000,00	UG
7 BMedSci BHBS	The University of Nottingham	Medicine	£9,000.00 0.000,03	lug.
8 BSc	The University of Sheffield	Mathematics .	£9,000.00	UG
9 MPhys	The University of Sheffield	Physics with Astrophysics	19,000.00	UG
0 BA	The University of Warwick	History of Art	29,000.00	UG
1 LLB	The University of Warwick	Applied Social Science	£9,000.00	UG
2 BA 3 BSc	The University of York Trinity College Dublin	Science -	£9,000.00	UG
14 BA	Trinity College Dublin Trinity Laban Conservatoire	Contemporary Dance Theatre	£9,048.00	UG
5 BDS	Universidad Cardenal Herrera Valencia	Dentistry	£9,000,00	UG
6 BDS	Universidad Cardenal Herrera Valencia	Dentistry .	£9,000.00	UG
7 BDS	Universidad Cardenal Herrera Valencia	Dentistry	£9,000.00	UG
19 BA	University College Birmingham	Hospitality Tourism Management	£3,465.00	UG
0 Foundation Degree	University College Birmingham	Sports Therapy	£8,282.00	UG
1 Foundation Degree	University College Birmingham	Events Management .	£8,282.00 ·	UG
2 Foundation Degree	University College Birmingham	Marketing & Events Management	£8,282,00	UG
3 BSc	University College London	Politics & Eastern European Studies	00.000,63	UG
4 BSc	University College London	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
5 BSc	University College London	Information Management for Business	29,000.00	UG
6 BA	University for the Creative Arts Canterbury	Fine Art	00.000,63	UG
7 Foundation Year	University for the Creative Arts Canterbury	Art & Design	£1,250.00	UG
8 BA	University for the Creative Arts Epsom	Fashion Design	00.000,02	. UG
9 BA	University of Bangor, Wales	Health & Social Care	00,000,03	UG
0 BA	University of Bangor, Wales	Health & Social Care	00.000,63	UG
1 BSc	University of Bath	Natural Sciences	£9,000.00	- UG
2 BSc	University of Bath	Molecular & Cellular Biology	00,000,02	UG
3 BSc	University of Bath	Accounting & Finance	29,000,00	UG
4 BA	University of Bedfordshire	Early Years Education	£9,000.00	UG
5 BSc	University of Bedfordshire	Psychology Law	129,000,00	UG
6 LLB	University of Bedfordshire	Law	00.000,02	UG
7 LLB .	University of Bedfordshire University of Brighton	Law with Business	£3,465.00	ÜĞ
8 LLB 9 BSc	University of Bristol	Mathematics	£3,465.00	UG
0 BVSc	University of Bristol	Veterinary Science	£3,465.00	UG
1 MBChB	University of Bristol	Medicine	00.000,03	UG
2 PhD	University of Bristol	Theology & Religious Studies	£3,996.00	UG
3 BA	University of Cambridge	Psychological & Behavioural Sciences	29,000.00	·UG
4 MSc	University of Cambridge	Natural Sciences	00.000,03	ŲG
5 BA	University of Cardiff	Italian	00.000,93	UG
BA	University of Cardiff	Media Journalism & Cultural Studies	£9,000.00	UG
7 BSc	University of Cardiff	Accounting	£9,000.00	UG
MBBCh	University of Cardiff	Medicine	£3,465,00	UG
9 BA :	University of Central Lancashire	Fine Art :	£9,000,00	UG
D BA	University of Central Lancashire	Social Work	£9,000.00	UG
1 BSc .	University of Central Lancashire	Psychology with Psychotherapy & Counselling	£9,000,00	UG
2 BSc	University of Central Lancashire	Physiotherapy	29,000,00	UG
3 BSc	University of Central Lancashire.	Fire & Leadership	. 69,000,00	. UG
4 BSc/BA	University of Central Lancashire	Fire & Leadership Studies	£9,000.00	UG
5 Foundation Year	University of Central Lancashire	Sports Rehabilitation & Nutritional Sciences	. £3,900.00	UG
6 BA	University of Chester	Fine Art	00,000,83	UG
57 BA .	University of Chester	Sports Journalism	28,000,00	UG
8 BA	University of Chester	Dance	£9,000.00	UG
	University of Chester	Mathematics	£3,465.00	UG
59 BSc 50 BSc	University of Chester	Psychology	£9,000.00	. luc

QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE .	TUITION (per annum)	UG/F
2 LLB · ·	University of Chester	Law	. 00,000,83	UG
3 BA	University of Chichester	Sport Development & Coaching	£8,500.00	UG
4 BSc	University of Chichester	Sports & Exercise Psychology	£8,500.00 £8,500.00	UG
55 BSc 66 BSc	University of Chichester University of Chichester	Sport & Exercise Science Sport & Exercise Science	£8,500.00	UG
7 Foundation Degree	University of Chichester	Community Sports Coaching	£8,500.00	ÜG
8 BSc	University of Colorado, Colorado Springs, USA	Golf and Sports Management	£9,000,00.	ÜG
9 BA .	University of Cumbria	Primary Education with Special Needs	£9,000.00	UG
BSc	University of Cumbria	Criminology & Social Sciences.	£7,850.00	UG
1 BA .	University of Derby	Accounting & Finance	£7,443.00	UG
2 BEd.	University of Derby	Educational and Early Childhood Studies	£9,000.00	UG
BSc	University of Derby	Mathematics	£7,938.00	UG
MBChB	University of Dundee	Medicine Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00 £9,000.00	UG
5 BA 6 BSc	University of Durham University of East Anglia	Environmental Geophysics	£9,000.00	UG
LLB	University of East Anglia	Law	£9,000,00	UG
B MBChB	University of East Anglia	Medicine	19,000.00	ÜĞ
9 BA	University of East Anglia	History	29,000.00	UG
0 BA	University of East London	Photography	19,000,00	ŲG
BSc	University of East London	Business Economics	29,000.00	UG
2 BA	University of Edinburgh	Spanish	£910.00	UG.
MA	University of Edinburgh	Divinity	£1,820.00	UG
‡ BA	University of Exeter	International Relations	£9,000.00	UG
BA ·	University of Exeter	Theology	29,000.00	UG
BA	University of Exeter	Business Management with International Studies	00.000,03	UG
BA	University of Exeter	International Relations & French	£9,000,00 ·	UG
BSc	University of Exeter	Mathematics Gastronomic Sciences	£3,465.00 £9,000.00	UG
BSc BSc	University of Gastronomic Sciences Italy University of Glamorgan	Forensic Biology	£9,000.00	UG
BSc	University of Glamorgan	Nursing	29,000.00	UG
MBChB	University of Glasgow	Medicine	£9,000.00	ÜG
3 BA	University of Gloucestershire	Graphic Design	£8,250,00	UG
BSc	University of Gloucestershire	Interactive Games Design	£8,250.00	UG
BA .	University of Herefordshire	Music & Entertainment Industry Management	£8,200.00	UG
BA .	University of Hertfordshire	Digital Animation	£9,000,00	UG
7 BA	University of Hertfordshire	Philosophy	£9,000.00	UG
B BA·	University of Hertfordshire	Animation Programme	£8,700.00	UG
9 BA	University of Hertfordshire	3D Digital Animation	£9,000.00 £8,700.00	UG
BSc	University of Hertfordshire	Songwriting and Music Production	£8,700.00	UG
BSc	University of Hertfordshire	Sports Therapy Molecular Biology & Genetics	£3,465.00	UG
BSc .	University of Hertfordshire University of Huddersfield	Music Technology & Popular Music	£8,250.00	UG
BA BA	University of Huddersfield	Fashion & Textile Design	£3,465.00	UG
MSc	University of Huddersfield	Network Technology & Management	£4,460,00	UG
3 BSc	University of Hull	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
7 BSc	University of Hull	Chemistry with Nanotechnology	£9,000.00	UG
B BA	University of Kent	Architecture	29,000.00	ÜG
9 BA	University of Kent	Law & Politics	129,000.00	UG
0 BA	University of Kent	Politics and International Relations	£3,465.00	UG
1 BA	University of Kent	Comparative Literature .	£9,000.00	UG
2 BA	University of Kent	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
3  BA	University of Kent	Business Administration	£9,000.00	UG
4 BA	University of Kent	English & American Literature	£9,000,00	UG
5 BSc	University of Kent	Anthropology Web Computing	£9,000.00 £9,000,02	UG
3 BSc	University of Kent University of Kent	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
7 BSc B BSc	University of Kent	Mathematics .	9,000.00	UG
BSc	University of Lancaster	Natural Sciences	00.000,03	UG
O BA	University of Leads	History of Art & Italian	£9,000.00	UG
1 BA	University of Leeds	Classical Civilizations	£9,000.00	UG
2 BSc · ·	University of Leeds	Economics	£9,000.00	UG
BSc	University of Leeds	Nutrition & Health	£9,000.00	UG
4 CEHO	University of Leeds	Environmental Health	9,000.00	UG
5 MBChB	University of Leicester .	Medicine	£3,465.00	UG
BA BA	University of Lincoln	Fine Art	00,000,02	UG
7 BA	University of Lincoln	English & Journalism	29,000.00	UG
B BA	University of Liverpool	Architecture Pharmacology	£9,000.00	UG
BSc	University of Liverpool University of Liverpool	Physics & Mathematics	29,000,00	UG
D BSc 1 BSc	University of Liverpool	Diagnostic Radiography	£9,000.00	UG
1 BSc 2 BSc	University of Liverpool	Diagnostic Radiography	29,000,00	UG
3 MBBS	University of Malta	Medicine	No fees - Malta	· UG
4 MD	University of Malta	Medicine	No fees - Malta	UG
5 BA	University of Manchester	Italian & Spanish	00,000,03	UG
BA BA	University of Manchester	History of Art & Spanish	£9,000.00	UG
7 BSc	University of Manchester	Biomedical Science	£9,000.00	UG
BSc .	University of Newcastle	Computing Science	£3,465.00	UG
9 LLB	University of Newcastle	Law Medicine	£9,000.00 £9,000.00	UG
MBChB	University of Newcastle	Fine Art	£9,000.00	UG
1 BA	University of Northampton	Events Management	£9,000.00	UG
2 BA	University of Northampton University of Northampton	Film & Television Studies	£9,000.00	UG
BA BSc	University of Northampton	Psychology & Counselling	£9,000.00	UG
5 HND	University of Northampton	Travel & Tourism Management	£7,250.00	UG
BA .	University of Northumbria	Business & Economics	29,000,00	UG
7 BSc	University of Northumbria	Information Technology Management for Business	£9,000.00	UG
B BSc	University of Northumbria	Sport Exercise and Nutrition	£9,000,00	UG
9 BA	University of Nottingham .	History	£9,000.00	UG
0 BA	University of Nottingham	History	£9,000.00	UC
1 BA	University of Nottingham	Law with Spanish & Spanish Law	29,000.00	_ UG
2 BSc	University of Nottingham	Psychology & Cognitive Neuroscience	29,000,00	UG
3 MBChB	University of Oxford	Medicine	£3,465.00	UC
4 BEd	University of Plymouth	Primary Education (Special Educational Needs)	£9,000.00 £9,000.00	UG
5 BA .	University of Portsmouth	Accountancy & Finance		

	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG
757		University of Portsmouth	Business & Management	£9,000.00	UG
758		University of Portsmouth	Childhood & Youth Studies with Psychology	£9,000.00	UG.
759				£9,000.00	UG .
760				£9,000.00	UG
				29,000.00	UG
762		University of Portsmouth	Mathematics	£9,000.00	UG
				£9,000.00	UG
764				£3,465.00	ÚG
765				£9,000.00	UG
766	BA . ·	University of Reading	Italian & History	£9,000.00 ·	UG
767	BA		History & Philosophy	£9,000.00	UG .
768			Art	£9,000.00	UG
769				£9,000.00 .	UG
	BSc ·			£9,000.00	UG
		University of Reading	Information Technology	£9,000.00	UG
		University of Reading		£9,000.00	ŲG
	BSc	University of Reading	Biomedical Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
		University of Reading	Biomedical Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
		University of Reading	Biomedical Sciences	£9,000.00	UG
	LLB	University of Reading .	Law with European Legal Studies	£3,465.00	UG ·
777		University of Salford		£9,000.00	UG ·
	LLB	University of Salford	Law	£9,000.00	UG
		University of Salford	Law with Spanish	£3,465,00	UG
	BA ·	University of Sheffield	Geography	£9,000.00	ŲG
781		University of Sheffield	History	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc	University of Sheffield	Computer Science	£9,000.00	UG
783		University of South Wales	English	£8,250.00	UG
784		University of South Wales	Computer Animation	£8,000.00	UG
		University of South Wales	Sociology & Criminology	28,000,00	UG
	BSc	University of South Wales	Psychology	£9,000.00	UG
	HND	University of South Wales	Public & Emergency Services	£6,750.00	UG
	HND	University of South Wales	Computing	£5,000.00	UG
		University of South Wales Glamorgan	Computer Science	£9,000.00	UG
790	MBChB	University of Southampton	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG .
	LLB .	University of Southampton	Maritime Law	£9,000.00	UG
	BA	University of St Andrews	Geography	£9,000.00	UG
	BSc	University of St Andrews	Biology	£9,000.00	UG
794	BA	University of St Mark & St John Plymouth	Primary Education	£9,000.00	UG
795	BEd	University of St Mark & St John Plymouth	Early Years with QTS	£9,000.00	UG
796	BSc	University of St Mark & St John Plymouth	Speech & Language Therapy	£9,000.00	UG
797	BA	University of Staffordshire .	Sports Public Relations & Journalism	£8,620.00	UG
798	BSc	University of Sunderland	Psychology .	£7,800.00	UG
799	BSc	University of Surrey	Mathematics	£9,000,00	UG
800	BSc	University of Surrey	Politics & Economics	£9,000.00	UG
801	BSc :	University of Surrey · ·	Accounting & Finance	£9,000,00	UG
802	BSc	University of Surrey	Mathematics	£9,000.00	UG
803	BSc	University of Surrey	Business & Retail Management	£3,465,00	UG
	LLB	University of Surrey	Law with Criminology	£9,000.00	UG
805	BA	University of the Arts London	Magazine Publishing	£9,000,00	UG
806	BA	University of the Arts London	Fine Art Photography .	19,000,00	UG
807	BA ·	University of the Creative Arts Canterbury	Fine Art	£8,500.00	UG
808	BA	University of the West of England Bristol	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
809	BÀ	University of the West of England Bristol	Business Studies	£3,465.00	UG
810	BA	University of the West of England Bristol	Tourism Management	£3,465.00	UG
811	BA	University of the West of England Bristol	Media Culture and Practice	£9,000,00	UG
812	BA ·	University of the West of England Bristol	Business with Accounting & Finance	£3,465.00	UG
813	BSc	University of the West of England Bristol	Computing	£9,000,00	UG
814	LLB	University of the West of England Bristol	Law	£9,000,00	UG
815	LLB .	University of the West of England Bristol	Law .	£9,000.00	UG
816	LLB	University of the West of England Bristol	Law	£9,000.00	UG
	BA.	University of Warwick	History of Art	£9,000.00	UG
818		University of Warwick	History & Sociology	29,000.00	UG
819		University of Warwick	Accounting & Finance	£9,000.00	UG
820	BSc	University of Warwick	Mathematics & Physics	£9,000.00 .	UG
	MBChB	University of Warwick	Medicine	£9,000.00	UG
	BA	University of West London	Events Management with Tourism	£8,500.00 £8,500.00	UG
	BSc	University of West London	Culinary Arts Management	£8,500.00	UG
	BA	University of Westminster	Commercial Music Archaeology	£8,500.00	UG
	BA	University of Winchester		£8,500.00	UG
	BA	University of Winchester	Performing Arts Graphic Design	£8,900.00	UG
	BA	University of Wolverhampton University of Wolverhampton	Business Management	£8,900.00	UG
	BA .	University of Wolverhampton	Accounting & Finance	£3,465.00	UG
	BA	University of Wolverhampton	Linguistics with TESOL	£8,900.00	UG
	BA	University of Wolverhampton	Business Management	£8,900.00	ŲG
	BA	University of Wolverhampton	Fire & Rescue	£8,900.00	ÜG
	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Fire & Rescue	£8,900.00	UG
	BSc BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Information Technology	£8,900.00	UG
	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Fire & Rescue	£8,650,00	UG
	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Fire and Rescue	£9,000.00	UG
927	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Quantity Surveying	£8,900.00	UG.
	BSc.	University of Wolverhampton	Fire and Rescue	£8,900,00	UG
	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Fire & Rescue	£6,000.00	UG
	BSc	University of Wolverhampton	Fire & Rescue	£8,900.00	UG
	Foundation Degree	University of Wolverhampton	Law, Social Sciences & Communications	£9,000.00	UG
	HND	University of Wolverhampton	Health & Social Care	£5,500.00	UG
	HND	University of Wolverhampton	Computing	£7,325.00	UG :
	HND	University of Wolverhampton	Computing	£7,325.00	UG
	BA .	University of Worcester	Digital Film Production & Screenwriting	£8,900,00	UG
	BSc	University of Worcester	Psychology	£7,290.00	UG
847	Foundation Degree	University of Worcester	Football Business Management & Coaching	00.000,03	UG
	BA	University of York	Sociology with Criminology	£9,000.00	UG
	BA .	University of York	Historical Archaeology	£9,000.00	UG
	BA	University of York	English & Related Literature	£9,000.00	UG
	BA	University of York	Social Work	£9,000.00 ·	UG

5065	QUALIFICATION	UNIVERSITY	COURSE	TUITION (per annum)	UG/PG
852	BSc	University of York	Economics & Finance	00.000,93	ŲĠ
853	BSc	University of York	Accounting Business Finance & Management	£9,000.00	UG
854	BSc .	University of York	Economics	£9,000.00	· UG
855	BSc .	University of York	Microbiology & Biotechnology	£9,000.00	· UG
856	BSc	Warsash Maritime Academy	Marine Operations	£9,000.00	ŲG
857	Marine Vessel Master I	Warsash Maritime Academy	Master Ships Master Reg	00,000,03	ŲĠ
858	BSc	Westminster University ·	Chinese Medicine; Acupuncture	. 00.000,03	⊍G
859	BSc ·	Wolverhampton University	Quantity Surveying .	28,900.00	UG
860	Foundation Degree	York College	Applied Computing	26,000.00	UG
861	Foundation Degree	York College	Media Make Up Special Effects and Hair Design	£6,000.00	UG
862	BA ·	York St John University	Creative Writing & English Literature	. 00.000,03	UG
863		York St John University	Business Management	10,000,03	UG ·
864		York St John University	Youth & Community work	£9,000.00	UG
865	BSc	York St John University	Psychology -	00.000,03	UG
	BSc	York St John University	Sports Science & Injury Rehabilitation	19,000.00	UG

1720 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, I will wait for the schedule to be handed over. Yes. I will wait for the hon. Member to see it before making a particular comment in relation to this schedule. It is a complex and –

**Mr Speaker:** The information there is in respect of nearly 900 students so I suggest we go on to the next question, 163.

**Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, can I just say –?

1725

1730

1735

1745

1765

**Mr Speaker:** Do you wish to add something to the main answer? Okay.

**Hon. G H Licudi:** Yes, just add to that answer, as the hon. Mr Speaker has mentioned, this is a list in respect of 866 students, 866 students which are this year being fully funded to study outside Gibraltar.

Mr Speaker, I can rightly say that is an extraordinary number of students (*Banging on desks*) to be funded by the Government to be studying outside Gibraltar in a small community such as ours. It includes, in that list, not just undergraduate students but also postgraduate students, including Masters and PhDs. And that to a large extent has arisen as a result of a change in policy by this Government which decided that the mandatory scholarship scheme was to apply not only to undergraduate students, but also to postgraduate students who wanted to do a Masters or further studies. (A Member: Hear, hear.) (*Banging on desks*)

Mr Speaker, can I just say that this record which is set out in this schedule is a record which Gibraltar as a community can rightly feel proud of.

Mr Speaker: Can I suggest to the Hon. Minister that the next time that he provides such a schedule, instead of referring to St Mary's University College, it should be St Mary's University Twickenham. It became a University last year; it is no longer a University College. It is listed here as St Mary's University College; it is now a University and it is called St Mary's University, Twickenham. The former Strawberry Hill College is now St. Mary's University, Twickenham.

Hon. G H Licudi: Yes, Mr Speaker. I know it is referred to as University College –

**Mr Speaker:** You are using the old terminology.

1750 **Hon. G H Licudi:** I will advise the Department of Education of that.

Mr Speaker: Is there any supplementary from the Leader of the Opposition?

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, just out of interest in the purpose of all this, there is an analytical purpose for this and I will look at it in due course when I have time. But my attention has been taken by just an entry; three pages from the back where it says University of Malta – Medicine and there are no fees for both, there are two entries for University of Malta – Medicine, no fees. Can he just explain why there are no fees in relation to the University of Malta when there are fees in respect of all the other entries?

1760 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I can certainly do that. The hon. Member will know that two weeks ago, I was in Malta meeting the Rector, Juanito Camilleri of the University of Malta itself and this is an issue that we certainly discussed.

Malta has a scheme whereby the University of Malta provides free education for its students and in providing free education for its students, it is free education not just for its students, but EU students. Therefore Gibraltar students that choose to go to the University of Malta... and in fact the University of Malta's Faculty of Medicine is a very prestigious and well-known faculty of medicine and produces some very, very good professionals from that University.

We have two of our own students in that faculty – (*Interjection*) Yes, the education is in English, absolutely and we have two of our students studying at this prestigious college at no cost to the Government because that is the model that the University of Malta or that Malta, as a jurisdiction, has decided that it provides free education for its students and by extension, it also means free education to EU students.

**Mr Speaker:** As long ago as 1975, Dr Albert GUILLEM was studying medicine at the University of Malta and I met him when I visited the island in 1975.

1775

1785

1790

1795

1805

1810

1770

- **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister confirm if the same argument applies to the entry in respect of student number 117 at Dundee University undertaking an undergraduate course in architecture? It says the same, no fees Scotland.
- 1780 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Yes, Mr Speaker, that is indeed the position although I understand that the position in Scotland has now changed and therefore students from outside Scotland do now pay a fee. I seem to recall, if the hon. Member will remind me of the... oh it says, no fees, Scotland.

My understanding is that in respect of new students going to Scotland there will be fees payable but this is one that had started already at a time when the system was that no fees were payable for studying in Scotland. I know this because it also caught my eye when I saw the list and I asked the specific question that the hon. Member has asked.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** The only one, Mr Speaker, the Minister either knows it now or may have to seek the information. The student listed on 117, the qualification is an MA which one reads as Master of Arts, normally Masters Degrees are recorded as postgraduate, rather than undergraduate and on the right-hand side column he is down as an undergraduate.

Unless nomenclatures have changed, Mr Speaker, from your time and mine, undergraduate is normally up to the obtaining of a Bachelor's Degree and anything beyond that is then considered postgraduate. The Minister may need some time to check with the Department of Education on that one, but it does seem at first glance a contradiction in terms.

Hon. G H Licudi: Yes, Mr Speaker, that is one that I missed when I went through the list and I will check.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, it is a fascinating, I have to say it is a fascinating list and hopefully it is the last supplementary we will ask on this side of the House. But 1995 to 1998 there are four entries, Faculty of Medicine in the Czech Republic and they are all studying, four students studying medicine. Is that in Czech or is it in English as well?

I understand that there is a lot of competition for medicine in the United Kingdom and people are looking for alternatives. It just strikes me the medicine in the Czech Republic and I am just asking the question whether it is in Czech or whether it is in English that the courses are provided.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I am tempted to say that I will *check* what the *Czechs* do, (*Laughter*) but I do know the answer. This is of course in English but we do have, as the hon. Member has said there is a lot of competition for medicine in UK universities and sometimes we have had – and I seem to recall one last year or the year before, a straight-A student who did not get a place for a medicine course in the UK and students over the last few years have been looking at alternatives. One of the alternatives that was looked at, apart from Malta which we have already seen, is the Czech Republic and we now actually have four in that faculty doing medicine in English, taught in English in the Czech Republic.

1815

Mr Speaker: There is one final question, which is to the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister. Mr Bossino.

### DEPUTY CHIEF MINISTER

Q180/2015 European Single Skies – Gibraltar's inclusion

Clerk: Question 180, the Hon. D J Bossino.

1820 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Deputy Chief Minister provide any updates to the House in relation to seeking Gibraltar's inclusion in the new European Single Skies Directive, having regard to recent press reports in relation to this issue?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

1825

1835

1840

1845

1850

**Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia):** Yes, Mr Speaker, the answer remains the same as given in the answer to Question 773/2014.

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, I thank the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister for that. There was a press report in the *Gibraltar Chronicle* reporting on Latvia's Presidency in relation to this saying that it was going to prioritise obviously because it was affecting all the other EU member states.

Does he get a sense as to whether there has been a change as a result of the Presidency? The last time that I asked the question I think it was an Italian Presidency in the Chair and I just wondered whether he senses any difference. Presumably the case is going to be exactly as it was when he answered the question back in, I think it was two months ago when I posed this question in the House.

**Hon. Dr J J Garcia:** Mr Speaker, I will be happy to discuss the matter with him privately, but certainly the position as regards... If he will recall the UK Foreign Secretary spoke to the Italian Foreign Secretary who then had the Presidency of the rotating Presidency of the Council of the EU. They have also spoken to the Latvian Presidency and explained what the UK position is which is that Gibraltar is entitled to be included in the legislation and that our exclusion would be illegal because the aviation law under the treaty applies to Gibraltar.

So that is the position at present, the item, the draft legislation is still held up in the European Council and once it is unblocked from the Council then it moves to discussion with the Parliament. We have not moved to that second phase yet because it is still in the Council.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I do not know whether the hon. Gentleman had the benefit of seeing the press conference held after the meeting in Madrid today, I think the Parliament might have been about to start its session when the press conference was being held.

The position of the Foreign Secretary was as set out in our press statement and in similar way to this House, the position of the Spanish Foreign Secretary was very aggressive and I commend that he should read what it was that he said in terms of understanding what their position is.

Mr Speaker: So to table the Written Questions, please.

## Question 184/2015 continued – Supplementary information

1855

1860

1865

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, before I do, can I crave the Parliament's indulgence and ask to go back to Question 184/2015 which you might recall, Mr Speaker, the very contentious question about the event in Madrid.

Simply to correct the record, the hon. Gentleman opposite said that we need to be responsible for the things that we say in this House and ensure that the record is not in any way improperly reflecting the facts.

In fact, I am going to make myself responsible for his statement as much as for mine. I am told, Mr Speaker, that Mr Victor Ochello was actually in the United Kingdom on the day that I was in Madrid and therefore we should not have been referring to him and whether he had his costs paid, as the hon. Gentleman did and that Mr Richard Buttigieg, another person who the hon. Gentleman referred to in this House, wants to make clear that he paid his own costs of travel to Madrid, having heard his name uttered over the airways.

### Questions for Written Answer

1870

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to table the answers to Written Questions W19 to W23/2015 inclusive.

**Mr Speaker:** I think the House can now recess for 20 minutes.

1875

The House recessed for 20 minutes.

### Order of the Day

1880

### BILLS FIRST AND SECOND READING

## Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – First Reading approved

**Clerk:** Order of the Day – Bills, First and Second Reading. (1) A Bill for an Act to amend the Gibraltar Regiment Act 1998.

The Hon, the Chief Minister.

1885

1890

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** I have the honour to move that the Bill for an Act to amend the Gibraltar Regiment Act 1998 be read a first time.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Gibraltar Regiment Act 1998 be read a first time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

Clerk: The Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Act 2014.

### Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved

1895

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that the Bill for the Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Act 2015 be read a second time.

Mr Speaker, this Bill updates the Gibraltar Regiment Act which is an Act that is in its current form dated back to 1998 but in fact applies the Army Act 1955.

1900

Changes to legislation concerned with the Armed Forces have been significant over the years in the United Kingdom. The Army Act 1955 is no longer in force, having been swept away by the Armed Forces Act 2006 and this Bill seeks to bring the Royal Gibraltar Regiment up to date in respect of disciplinary matters dealt with in those pieces of legislation.

Clause 2 of the Bill makes amendments to both the long and short titles of the Act so that the legislation will reflect the conferment of the Royal Prefix which was proudly awarded to the Regiment in 1999 after the Act which we are amending.

1905

Clause 3 of the Bill updates definitions within the Act.

Clause 4 replaces existing sections 3 and 4 of the Act and sets out the basis for the establishment, maintenance and disbandment of the RGR – although, Mr Speaker, nobody in Gibraltar can imagine that the RGR should ever be disbanded, but there has to be provision for it and there was in the old Act.

1910

Mr Speaker, clause 6 of the Bill renames Part II of the Act so that it is clear that the part relates to disciplinary matters.

Clause 7 inserts new sections to the Act. Section 5 sets out the purposes of the part which is to provide for a disciplinary framework on the same terms as their UK counterparts for soldiers who are members of the Regiment through Gibraltar.

1915

Section 5A relates to who the part applies to and deems that such persons to be persons subject to service law. In that context, the House will note that the Act will only apply to two classes of persons, effectively those in uniform and to a much more limited extent, to those who were in uniform but have left the Regiment. This section is important because in the UK there is a further class of persons to whom service law applies. These are described as civilians who are subject to service discipline. Such persons could include spouses, partners and other family members of enrolled persons. As far as this Act is concerned, nothing in service law can apply to such persons in Gibraltar.

### GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT, THURSDAY, 19th FEBRUARY 2015

Section 5B makes further provisions as to the application of service law and in particular restricts the application of service law if it would be contrary to the UK Constitution, the unwritten Constitution. This section also restricts the application of service law to the extent provided for in Schedule 2A. The House will note that the purpose of Schedule 2A is to restrict the implementation of service law to what we might colloquially call within the wire, i.e. the MOD Estate.

Section 5C modifies service law so that it can be applied in Gibraltar and where appropriate and in accordance with our legislation and procedures.

Section 5D provides the basis for the enforcement in Gibraltar of the outcomes of disciplinary proceedings.

Section 5E provides a regulation making power for the purposes of transfer of persons who are deprived of their liberty.

Mr Speaker, section 5F will permit the amendment of service law via subsidiary legislation albeit the House will have sight of any such amendment.

Section 5G relates to persons absenting themselves without leave and provides that warrants may be obtained if granted by a Gibraltar Justice.

Section 5H ensures that a civil criminal court does not lose the right to try a person who may have committed an offence outside of the wire.

Clause 8 of the Bill updates the provisions of section 6 of the Act in connection with the administration of the Regiment.

Clause 10 of the Bill amends section 8 of the Act in connection with the command of the Regiment.

Clause 11 re-classes the nationality requirements for entry into the Regiment in keeping with the UK law. The provisions of the Act concerning liability for service are recast in sections 15A to section 17, as set out in clause 12 of the Bill.

Clauses 12 to 16 of the Bill are minor amendments, some of a typographical nature.

Clause 13 provides a regulation making power allowing the Governor to issue regulations, etc of an administrative nature.

Clause 18 repeals Schedule 1which provides for terms and conditions of service and which in terms of maintenance updating can be better provided for outside of the confines of an Act.

Clause 19 inserts Schedules 2 and 2A and these represent service law which is to apply to RG Personnel.

Clause 21 reproduces Schedule 4 with a number of minor amendments.

Mr Speaker, I will be moving during the course of the Committee Stage some amendments to the Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill. I have a letter which will be distributed to hon. Members, but the House... Mr Speaker, in order to be of more assistance, I can offer whoever is going to speak on this subject on the other side if they wish – I do not want to make 17 copies but I will make one copy for me and one copy for Members opposite if they wish it, of both a marked up version of the Act that we are amending with the amendments and also a marked up version of the Bill to reflect the amendments that are being proposed at the Committee Stage and if anybody on that side is going to speak on the Bill wants to have a copy I am quite happy to let them have one. There is another copy to come which, I think needs to be printed and that can be circulated in time for the debate on the Committee Stage.

I commend the Bill to the House.

**Mr Speaker:** Before I put the question, does any other hon. Member wish to speak on the general principles and merits of this Bill?

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, the Opposition will be supporting the Bill. Mr Speaker, from my recollection from my time as Minister for Justice, this was something that was discussed when we were in Government, certainly we would have brought a similar Bill to this House in any event and therefore the Opposition is going to be supporting the Government in relation to this particular Bill.

**Hon.** Chief Minister: I am grateful for that indication, Mr Speaker.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Gibraltar Regiment Act 1998 be read a second time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

**Clerk:** The Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Act 2014.

1955

1950

1925

1930

1935

1940

1945

1960

1965

1970

# Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting

**Hon.** Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, I beg to give notice that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today, if all hon. Members agree.

1980

**Mr Speaker:** Do all hon. Members agree that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today? (**Members:** Aye.)

1985

## Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 – First Reading approved

Clerk: (2) A Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act 1997.

The Hon. the Minister for Education, Justice & International Exchange of Information.

1990

Minister for Education, Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, I beg to move that a Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act be read a first time.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act 1997 be read a first time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

1995

Clerk: The Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Act 2014.

### Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved

**Minister for Education, Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, I beg to move that the Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act 1997 be read a second time.

2000

2005

Mr Speaker, this Bill amends the Tobacco Act so as to clarify, for the avoidance of doubt, the situations where certain searches may be carried out under the Act. This clarification reflects the operation of the Act and the search powers thereunder since 1999 and allows for the search, without a warrant, of any vehicle in Gibraltar where a Police or Customs Officer has reasonable grounds to suspect that cigarettes in circumstances contrary to the provisions of the Tobacco Act 1997, may be found within. This amendment clarifies that officers have the same powers when dealing with locally registered vehicles as they do with foreign registered vehicles.

And just to explain the issues, if I can read what the current section says, it is section 17C(1) it says:

'Every police or customs officer shall have free access to any vessel or aircraft at the port or airport and of any vehicle brought into Gibraltar where there are reasonable grounds to suspect that cigarettes may be found in that vessel, aircraft or motor vehicle in circumstances contrary to the provisions of this Act, and may –'

and then it sets out the powers.

2010

It is a reference to 'brought into' Gibraltar that has just raised... the interpretation that has been given previously is that every vehicle has at some stage been brought into Gibraltar and therefore the powers have always existed. But given that the matter was raised, this is just an amendment for the avoidance of doubt that refers to every vehicle in Gibraltar whether it is brought in the day before or two years before is irrelevant, it now relates to any vehicle in Gibraltar, or it will when the House passes the amendment and the Bill is brought into effect.

2015

Mr Speaker I commend the Bill to the House.

**Mr Speaker:** Before I put the question, does any hon. Member wish to speak on the general principles and merits of the Bill?

2020

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, yes, just to say that we will obviously be supporting the Bill and only to really say that it is rather curious in that it will have been an issue that had to be dealt with and it would certainly be interesting on this side of the House to understand in what circumstances it actually arose that the change has been required. But clearly it is not a point of contention at all, Mr Speaker, thank you.

Mr Speaker: I now put the question that -

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker.

Mr Speaker: Sorry, yes.

2030 Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, my officer has received representations from the Collector of Customs about the need to insert an additional power in respect of the Tobacco Act in respect of powers of stop and search in special zones. He has proposed that because of the urgency in dealing with issues which relate to Tobacco and having received these representations shortly, in fact during the space of the last 14 days from the Collector of Customs that we should take the opportunity of using this active Bill which is going to amend the Tobacco Act to make the further amendment.

A letter will be circulated to hon. Members setting out what the proposed amendment is, but they will see that it is literally something headed 'Additional powers of stop and search in special zones'. The advice that we have through the Collector and the Attorney General's Office is that this is what the previous Chief Minister used to call giving retrospective legal cover if necessary, in respect of the way that stopping and searching has been happening to date in special zones and how it might be able to continue to happen in the future, to ensure, much as the hon. Gentleman said in respect of the main amendment which was in the green copy, that nobody can make an argument to suggest that there is not a power there that nobody has previously challenged but there is advice now might be challenged in the future.

That is set out in the amendment which will be circulated.

Mr Speaker: I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act –

Hon. G H Licudi: Mr Speaker.

Mr Speaker: Yes. 2050

**Hon. G H Licudi:** As the mover of the Bill can I respond to the issue raised by the Hon. Member?

Mr Speaker, the hon. Member just asked about the circumstances which brought this about and it was simply that it was brought to my attention that someone, presumably some lawyer, might at some point raise in court, that there are no powers to search locally registered vehicles. And so as to leave nothing to chance, although we do not believe that was ever the intention of the Bill or that it has ever happened, to leave nothing to chance that somebody might raise it, it was suggested that I should make this amendment just for the sake of clarity. That is how it was brought about.

Mr Speaker: I now put the question which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act 1997 be read a second time. Those in favour? (Members: Aye.) Those against? Carried.

Clerk: The Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Act 2014.

### Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 -Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting

2065 Minister for Education, Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, I beg to give notice that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today if all hon. Members agree.

Mr Speaker: Do all hon. Members agree that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today? (Members: Aye.)

### Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 -First Reading approved

Clerk: (3) A Bill for an Act to amend the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011. The Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information.

52

2025

2035

2040

2045

2055

2060

Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that a Bill for an Act to amend the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011, be read a first time.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011, be read a first time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

Clerk: The Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment) (No.2) Act 2014.

2085

2080

## Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved

Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, I beg to move that a Bill for an Act to amend the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011 be read a second time.

2090

Mr Speaker, this Bill amends the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011 so as to ensure that when calculating the length of a sentence to be served, time spent on remand counts towards just one sentence of imprisonment.

2095

The need for this amendment follows two recent cases before the Supreme Court in Gibraltar, which have dealt with the interpretation of the current section 497 of the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011. The first of these cases was heard when an application for a writ of habeas corpus, whereas the second was due in the sentencing process.

2100

Section 497 was held to be mandatory in that the length of a sentence must be reduced by the time the person has been in custody in connection with the proceedings for that offence. This is appropriate, Mr Speaker, in circumstances where that person is solely on remand for that offence, but not where a person is serving a custodial sentence for another offence or is remanded in custody for more than one offence.

2100

In those circumstances it is only right that the time spent on remand or in Police custody should only count once towards one sentence. This is the position in the United Kingdom and one that this Government believes must have been the intention when this Act was passed.

2105

Mr Speaker, just to put that in general context, if somebody is already serving a sentence of imprisonment and goes to court and is remanded in custody in respect of another offence, that person as this has been interpreted, has the advantage of that same period in remand being counted twice: once in respect of the serving of the period he is already serving; and once in respect of the new sentence if he was to be sentenced respectively for the new offence. In one occasion, I understand the court re-sentenced the individual changed the sentence once this matter was brought to the courts attention so as not to give effect to that double counting.

2110

As I mentioned when I introduced the Bill, the position in the United Kingdom is what we consider, must have been the intention of Parliament when it passed this Act and as a result of the two cases that have arisen in court, we feel that it is only right that we should clarify that a person should not doubly benefit in this kind of situation.

2115

I commend the Bill to the House, Mr Speaker.

ar

**Mr Speaker:** Before I put the question, does any hon. Member wish to speak on the general principles and merits of the Bill?

2120

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, yes, only to confirm that the Opposition will be supporting to this Bill. We have nothing really further to add to this debate.

. . .

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011 be read a second time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

2125

Clerk: The Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Act 2014.

## Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 – Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting

**Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, I beg to give notice of the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today, if all hon. Members agree.

**Mr Speaker:** Do all hon. Members agree that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today? (**Members:** Aye.)

## International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014 – First Reading approved

2135 **Clerk:** (4) A Bill for an Act to amend the International Corporation (Tax Information) Act 2009. The Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information.

Minister of for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that a Bill for an Act to amend the International Cooperation (Tax Information) Act 2009 be read a first time.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the International Cooperation (Tax Information) Act 2009 be read a first time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

Clerk: The International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2009.

## International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014 – Second Reading approved

Minister of for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that the Bill be now read a second time.

Mr Speaker, the Act contains a definition of Minister currently as the Minister with responsibility for Finance. As the House knows, there was a reshuffle on 9th December 2011 whereby specific responsibility for international exchange of information was created and given Ministerial responsibility and I was tasked with that job.

Therefore, given that we now have a Minister with responsibility for International Exchange of Information, it is appropriate that that is the Minister that has responsibility under this Act and therefore the definition of the Minister in this Act is simply amended to reflect the change in Cabinet responsibilities in this area.

Mr Speaker: Does any other hon. Member wish to speak on the general principles and merits of the Bill?

I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the International Co-operation (Tax Information) Act 2009 be read a second time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

Clerk: The International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014.

## International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2014 – Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting

2165

2140

2145

2150

2155

2160

Minister of for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, I beg to give notice of the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today, if all hon. Members agree.

Mr Speaker: Do all hon. Members agree that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today? (Members: Aye.)

## Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – First Reading approved

Clerk: (5) A Bill for an Act to amend the Parliament Act.

The Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB. (Laughter)

2175

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** I think if I am responsible for the GSB I had better resign, Mr Speaker. (*Laughter*)

I have the honour to move that a Bill for an Act to amend the Parliament Act be read a first time.

2180

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Parliament Act be read a first time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

**Clerk:** The Parliament (Amendment) Act 2014.

### Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Second Reading approved

2185

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano): I have the honour to move that the Bill be now read a second time.

Mr Speaker, the Bill introduces in respect of Members of this House, the option of being able to commute 100% of their pension which already exists for civil servants and of course existed previously, just for the private sector when the maximum 25% which used to exist for private sector pensions was first removed under the previous Administration.

2190

As the law stands at the moment, section 94(1) has two subsections, (a) and (b). Subsection (a) is the one that limits the commutation to one quarter of the pension as the maximum; and (b) is the multiplier that produces the value of the commutation to produce a gratuity.

2195

What the new provisions do is in fact they reflect in section 1 the provisions that are there and now there is a new section 2 which simply says that the option can be to have 100% commutation and take no income at all.

I commend the Bill to the House.

2200

**Mr Speaker:** Before I put the question, does any hon. Member wish to speak on the general principles and merits of the Bill?

I now put the question, which is that a Bill for an Act to amend the Parliament Act be read a second time. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye. Those against? Carried.

Clerk: The Parliament (Amendment) Act 2014.

# Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Committee Stage and Third Reading to be taken at this sitting

2205

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, I beg to give notice that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today if all Members agree.

2210

**Mr Speaker:** Do all hon. Members agree that the Committee Stage and Third Reading of the Bill be taken today? (**Members:** Aye.)

221

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, may I ask the hon. Gentleman... or do you want me to ask it at Committee Stage?

2215

**Mr Speaker:** Well, really there is only one clause and if you do it in Committee Stage, you can come back to the charge again and again until you understand or whatever point you are making is dealt with.

2220

Hon. D A Feetham: It is about members who are only taking their pensions from –

Mr Speaker: Well, raise the matter in Committee.

#### COMMITTEE STAGE AND THIRD READING

2225

2230

Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014;
Tobacco (Amendment) Bill 2014;
Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014;
International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Bill 2014; and
Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014.

Clerk: Committee Stage and Third Reading, the Hon. Chief Minister.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move that the House do now resolve into Committee and consider the following Bills, clause by clause, namely: The Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014; The Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014; The Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014, The International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Bill 2014; and The Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014.

In Committee of the whole Parliament

2240

# Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Clauses considered and approved

**Clerk:** (1) A Bill for an Act to amend the Gibraltar Regiment Act 1998. Clause 1.

2245

2250

**Mr Chairman:** Stands part of the Bill.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, for the benefit of dealing with this issue in a way that is expeditious and given that hon. Members opposite have the Bill as amended – in other words, they have both the amendment to the principal Act that we are amending in mark-up and they have also this Bill with the amendments marked up and the letter that sets out what amendments are being proposed, which they will have seen deal with the issues I put in the speech.

If they agree, would they take those as read?

2255 **Mr Chairman:** I think it would be useful if I had a copy of the letter so that I know at which stage which clause is being amended. It makes it easier for me.

I notice therefore, for instance, that in clause 1 there is an amendment which is just a substitution of 2015 for 2014, so do all hon. Members agree with that amendment?

2260 **Members:** Aye.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, we can treat the letter as effectively he is moving the amendments and we will not have to go through the amendments for every single clause.

Mr Chairman: Right. I think procedurally they should be. What I will do is, with each clause, I will ask hon. Members to agree that the amendment of which the Chief Minister has given notice, be incorporated, be agreed to, without having to actually read it out, okay? But as I say in clause 1 there is this straightforward amendment substituting the year 2015 for 2014 agreed. Okay.

2270 Clerk: Clause 2.

**Mr Chairman:** Clause 2, do all hon. Members agree with the amendment of which the Chief Minister has given notice? No, there is no amendment to clause 2.

Clause 2 stands part of the Bill.

2275

Clerk: Clause 3.

**Mr Chairman:** There is an amendment to clause 3 the Chief Minister has circulated. Are all hon Members happy with it? Is there any point they wish to raise?

So, clause 3 as amended stands part of the Bill.

2280

Clerk: Clauses 4 to 6.

Mr Chairman: Clauses 4 to 6. Those in favour? (Members: Aye.) Those against?

Clauses 4 to 6 stand part of the Bill.

2285

**Clerk:** Clause 7 with amendments.

**Mr Chairman:** In clause 7 there is an amendment of which the Chief Minister has given notice. Are all Members supporting the amendment? (**Members:** Aye.)

So clause 7 as amended stands part of the Bill.

Clerk: Clauses 8 and 9.

**Mr Chairman:** Clauses 8 and 9 stand part of the Bill.

2295

Clerk: Clause 10 with amendments.

**Mr Chairman:** Clause 10 an amendment has been circulated by the Chief Minister. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Clause 10 as amended stands part of the Bill.

2300

Clerk: Clauses 11 to 18.

**Mr Chairman:** Clauses 11 to 18 stand part of the Bill.

2305 **Clerk:** Clause 19 with amendments.

**Mr Chairman:** Clause 19 an amendment has been circulated. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye) Those against? Carried.

Clause 19 as amended stands part of the Bill.

2310

**Clerk:** Clause 20 with amendments.

**Mr Chairman:** There is also an amendment to clause 20. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against?

Clause 20 as amended stands part of the Bill.

Clerk: Clause 21 with amendment.

**Mr Chairman:** Clause 21 there is a very simple amendment of which notice has been given. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against?

Clause 21 as amended stands part of the Bill.

Clerk: Clause 22.

2325 **Mr Chairman:** Clause 22 stands part of the Bill.

**Clerk:** The long title.

Mr Chairman: Stands part of the Bill.

## Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014 – Clauses considered and approved

2330

Clerk: (2) A Bill for an Act to amend the Tobacco Act 1997.

Clause 1.

**Mr Chairman:** Clause 1 stands part of the Bill.

2335 **Clerk:** Clause 2 with amendments.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Chairman, yes, there is an amendment that I have spoken to the Hon. Minister for Justice IN RESPECT OF, behind the Speaker's Chair a moment ago, and that is to the amendment to clause 11DA(2).

2340 The amendment currently reads:

2345

2365

'Where a person or vehicle has been stopped pursuant to subsection (1) and police or customs officer' –

I have suggested that we add a so it is 'and a police or customs officer' –

'has reasonable grounds for believing that an offence has been or is being committed, that officer may search that person, any article that person has with him...'

and then it goes on to say 'and any vehicle, including any other persons in that vehicle.'

I suggested to the Hon. Minister that we might want to make clear that it is not just any vehicle in the vicinity other than the one that has been stopped. Therefore I would suggest that it be amended to read 'that officer may search that person, any article that person has with him, the vehicle, including any other persons in that vehicle.'

I can read it again if it would assist.

2350 **Mr Chairman:** I think the hon. Member needs to write it out, the amendment that he is proposing.

**Hon. S M Figueras:** I see, Mr Chairman, it is just that we have often done quick amendments like that on the fly.

2355 **Mr Chairman:** The Government have seen the amendment?

Hon. S M Figueras: Yes, I have consulted with the hon. Member, yes.

Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):

Mr Chairman, I have discussed it with the hon. Member and I am happy. There is a slight change to the wording used by the hon. Member. Subclause (2), the last two lines should read 'been committed, that officer may search that person, any article that person has with him, the vehicle and any other persons in that vehicle'.

**Mr Chairman:** I am slightly confused because this is an amendment, I take it, to clause 2. Is that right! Is that the one that I have here from the Chief Minister?

Hon. G H Licudi: Sorry, no. It is an amendment to the current section 11DA –

Mr Chairman: Ah, there is a further amendment to that. Then the correct procedure would therefore be for the Chief Minister to move the amendment of which I have been given notice and then for the hon. Member with having that amendment before the Committee, for the hon. Member to move an amendment to this amendment. That is the correct procedure.

2375 **Chief Minister (Hon F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I think that is what we were taking as having happened, although I had not formally moved the amendment. You are right, we moved straight into it and into discussion of it (**Mr Chairman:** Right.) But I think we were all of that mind which you rightly set out now for the record.

2380 **Mr Chairman:** Okay. So, let me then put to the House the Chief Minister's amendment of which notice has been given as amended by the Hon. Selwyn Figueras amendment. Is that clear? Those in favour? **Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

So clause 2 as amended stands part of the Bill.

2385 **Clerk:** The long title.

Mr Chairman: Stands part of the Bill.

### Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014 – Clauses considered and approved

Clerk: (3) A Bill for an Act to amend the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011.

2390 Clauses 1 and 2.

Mr Chairman: Stand part of the Bill.

**Clerk:** The long title.

2395

**Mr Chairman:** Stands part of the Bill.

## International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Act 2009 – Clauses considered and approved

**Clerk:** (4) A Bill for an Act to amend the International Co-operation (Tax Information) Act 2009. Clauses 1 and 2.

2400

2415

2425

Mr Chairman: Stand part of the Bill.

Clerk: The long title.

2405 **Mr Chairman:** Stands part of the Bill.

### Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Clauses considered and approved

**Clerk:** (5) A Bill for an Act to amend the Parliament Act. Clauses 1 and 2.

2410 **Mr Chairman:** Now in respect of clause 2, I think the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition wishes to raise a matter.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, I just wanted to ask Minister Bossano whether any of these amendments affect the rights of those that have retired already. Government Ministers, Members of Parliament that have retired and are already in receipt of their pension, whether they can at some stage now take commuted pension or whether this only affects those who are not of retirement age at the present moment and are not taking any pension at the present moment.

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano): I think it is clear that it is not retrospective, just like the one for the Civil Service. I mean there were people who retired a day before the provision was introduced in the Civil Service Pensions Act and they had either elected the maximum they were then allowed which was 25% or a lower figure, but they were not able to come back and say, 'Well, I would like to make use of the new provision.' Partly because I suppose once the pension has been paid, how do you go back?

**Mr Chairman:** Clause 2 stands part of the Bill.

Clerk: The long title.

2430 **Mr Chairman:** Stands part of the Bill.

Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014; Tobacco (Amendment) Bill 2014; Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014; International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Bill 2014; and Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 – Third Readings approved: Bills passed

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, I have the honour to report that The Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014; The Tobacco (Amendment) Bill 2014; The Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014, The International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Bill 2014; and The Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 have been considered in Committee and agreed to with amendments and I now move that they be read a third time and passed.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question, which is that The Royal Gibraltar Regiment (Amendment) Bill 2014; The Tobacco (Amendment No. 3) Bill 2014; The Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment No. 2) Bill 2014, The International Co-operation (Tax Information) (Amendment) Bill 2014; and The Parliament (Amendment) Bill 2014 be read a third time and passed. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

There is no need to take an individual vote for each of the Bills, since hon. Members are all agreed.

#### **GOVERNMENT MOTION**

2445

2435

2440

Royal Anglian Regiment – Conferring of Freedom of the City of Gibraltar – Motion carried unanimously

Clerk: Government Motion. The Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo)** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move the motion standing in my name, which reads as follows:

'This House:

WELCOMES the long and historic relationship between the Royal Anglian Regiment (and its forerunner Regiments) and Gibraltar;

RECALLS that throughout the 18th and 19th centuries, regiments from the Royal Anglian counties of Essex, Northamptonshire, Suffolk, Lincolnshire and Norfolk were posted to Gibraltar to defend the Rock and its people;

RECALLS that both the XII Regiment, the forerunner of the Suffolk Regiment, and the 56th Foot, the forerunner of the Essex Regiment, defended Gibraltar during the Great Siege of 1779-1783 and that the XII Regiment formed the main body of the Grand Sortie of November 1781;

TAKES NOTE that in recognition of the efforts of the XII Regiment the "Castle and Key" and the name "Gibraltar" were taken as its crest, and that the former remains there to this day in the Royal Anglian regimental crest;

RECALLS that in May 1969 a formal affiliation was announced between the Royal Anglian Regiment and the then Gibraltar Regiment and that there have been many instances of Royal Gibraltar Regiment soldiers serving abroad with the Royal Anglians in places like Northern Ireland, Germany, Cyprus, Belize, Bosnia, Iraq and Afghanistan;

DECLARES that the Freedom of the City of Gibraltar be conferred on the Royal Anglian Regiment in view of its historic and close connection with Gibraltar and its people.'

Mr Speaker, this is a motion the text of which to a very great extent speaks for itself. The people of Gibraltar have long and historic links, not just with the United Kingdom but with the Ministry of Defence in particular and with parts of the Ministry of Defence who have been particularly responsible for the defence and protection of Gibraltar and its people at some key times in our history.

Mr Speaker, the Ministry of Defence in Gibraltar still celebrates the Grand Sortie of November 1781 in some style, as I was able to attest to this year and I think the Leader of the Opposition was with me as we enjoyed a sumptuous banquet in St Michael's Cave, demonstrating the importance of that date, even in these times of austerity for the Ministry of Defence, the Grand Sortie is an important date in history.

Mr Speaker, the Anglians were here then and they were here at other important times in the history of Gibraltar, that those who understand how it is that in military terms, the defence of this fortress has been achieved, sometimes in light of almost impossible odds, will recognise the importance of the links that we continue to enjoy with key regiments such as the Royal Anglians, one of the few Regiments that has not disappeared in recent amalgamations etc. of the UK Infantry.

Mr Speaker, in the circumstances, I do not propose to say anything more but I do understand that this motion will be enjoying the support of the whole House as it should and that we will all be very pleased indeed when we are able to make the arrangements for members of the Royal Anglian Regiment serving today to come to Gibraltar to receive the Freedom of the City on behalf of this Parliament on behalf of the people of Gibraltar and to exercise their right to the Freedom of the City of Gibraltar and parade up Main Street, whether or not they bring their sheep with them.

**Mr Speaker:** I now propose a question in the terms of the motion moved by the Chief Minister. Does any hon. Member wish to contribute?

**Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, yes, simply to associate the Opposition with the words of the Hon. the Chief Minister and to confirm that we will be supporting this motion. He is absolutely right when he says that the text of the motion speaks for itself, its contents are very clear and there is nothing really to add, other than to point out that as a result of some research that I did in preparation for the motion, that it says that the name Gibraltar was taken as its crest and that the former remains there until this day in the Royal Anglian Regimental Crest. Also to point out that the Garrison Headquarters in Suffolk, is also called the Gibraltar Barracks, so the Opposition will be supporting this particular motion.

**Mr Speaker:** Any other hon. Member wish to contribute to the motion? The Hon. Mr Bossano. (Laughter and banging on desks)

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano): Yes, Mr Speaker, I would just like to add one bit of the history of the Anglian Regiment that I do not think has been reflected, of which I have personal first-hand knowledge. That is when I did the compulsory military service in 1958, (Laughter) the 20th intake converted from being artillery to being infantry and the Royal Anglian Regiment had somebody seconded to Gibraltar to convert us into riflemen or artillery men, which you went from being gunners to being part of the regiment and therefore they made an important contribution to the transition of the Gibraltar Regiment into what it then became, an important part of the British Amy and the only thing that they failed singularly in was in converting me into a disciplined soldier. (Laughter and banging on desks) Apart from that they were...

**Hon. E J Reyes:** And shall I also add, Mr Speaker, because I have also had my service, alas way after the Hon. Minister – I did from 1974 to 1980 – and it was actually the Royal Anglians who had posted to Gibraltar a Warrant Officer First Class who served at the time as a Regimental Sergeant Major. He was instrumental in preparing the first local Gibraltarian and locally enlisted member of the Gibraltar Regiment and therefore it was enacted through Bob Randall having become the first Gibraltarian Regimental Sergeant Major thanks in many ways to the training given to him by the Royal Anglian Regiment.

Mr Speaker: Does the mover wish to reply?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, only to thank hon. Members who have spoken for their support and to say that anybody who has been able to persuade Mr Bossano of anything, even if it is just to go from Artillery to Infantry and not then to become a soldier as he suggested, deserves much more than the Freedom of the City and therefore the case is proven for the Royal Anglians to have this award.

**Mr Speaker:** I now put the question in the terms of the motion moved by the Hon. Chief Minister. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

The Hon. the Chief Minister.

2515

2460

2465

2470

2475

2480

2485

2490

2495

2500

2505

### PERSONAL STATEMENT BY THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker.

2520 Mr Speaker: Yes.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** I have given notice that I wish to make a Personal Statement before the House is adjourned.

2525 **Mr Speaker:** Please do.

2530

2535

2540

2545

2550

2555

2560

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, yes. Mr Speaker, we were on the subject matter earlier about Members of Parliament making themselves responsible for statements that they make in this House.

I have now had an opportunity of looking at *Hansard* and it is simply not the case that I challenged the Hon. Minister Bossano to a *mano a mano*, it was the reverse. I do not say that in any way criticising Minister Bossano, because from my point of view that is a matter that is in the past, but of course I need to set the record straight.

If he wants me to read from *Hansard* I can, but that is the position and I want him to know so much that it is a matter in the past for me, that actually I view it as one of those episodes in this House that I have personally taken in a light-hearted way and it has lifted some of the seriousness that we often see in this House. So much so that I have an article from the press with his head and my head over two boxes and the article next to it, on my corridor in my house. So I do not say this out of any sense of spite or anything like that, but of course I need to set the record straight, Mr Speaker, because I have had an opportunity to look at *Hansard*.

In relation to Victor Ochello, if in any way, if the Hon. the Chief Minister says that Mr Victor Ochello was not there at the Madrid event, then I apologise for having mentioned him in circumstances where he was not there. I did not mention him from a point of view of criticising Mr Victor Ochello; it was just simply an example that I used from somebody that I thought was there because I had seen photographs from the *Gibraltar Chronicle* but obviously if I am mistaken. I have absolutely no hesitation in withdrawing the reference to Mr Ochello.

But those are the two statements that I wish to make.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Well, Mr Speaker, I do not know what it is that the hon. Member says that he said which he has now clarified. I think he has just insisted that what he said was the right thing all along because his position it appears has not changed and he has just got up to tell us he was right, I think. But anyway let us take that remark in the way that I think it was intended and move on from the matter.

I am delighted to hear that he has that picture in his home, in his corridor and we all look back sometimes affectionately on things that we have said to each other in haste and in this place and we on this side have absolutely no problem in accepting that in that way because in all of those heads to heads we have always won, so it does not matter. (Laughter)

### **ADJOURNMENT**

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** And, Mr Speaker, in the same spirit, trusting that the hon. Gentleman will reflect, realise that we are not in fact skint, we can afford the electricity and we will be back here next month, I now move that the House do adjourn *sine die*.

Mr Speaker: I now propose the question, which is that the House do now adjourn sine die.

I now put the question, which is that this House do now adjourn *sine die*. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Passed.

2565 The House will now adjourn *sine die*.

The House adjourned at 6.55 p.m.