



PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

AFTERNOON SESSION: 3.30 p.m. – 6.45 p.m.

Gibraltar, Wednesday, 17th June 2015

Business transacted

Prayer	3
Confirmation of Minutes	3
Papers to be laid.....	3
Questions for Oral Answer	4
Business AND Employment.....	4
Q401/2015 Health and safety – May 2015 statistics	4
Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change	7
Q402/2015 Estimates Book – Breakdown of expenditure	7
Q403/2015 Estimates Book – Provision of reports	7
Q404-406/2015 Commonwealth Park project – Services provided by Wildlife Gibraltar Ltd, Comofco Consultants and JLC consulting.....	8
Q407/2015 Macaques – Monitoring of illegal feeding	9
Q408/2015 LED lighting – Use in Government buildings.....	10
Q409/2015 Solar panels – Contract details re installation and maintenance.....	13
Q410/2015 New power station at North Mole – Problems re foundations	14
Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services	14
Q411/2015 Mid Harbour Estate garage barriers – Date when operational	14
Q412/2105 Squatters in Government rental homes – Costs re eviction.....	14
Q413/2015 Decanting of tenants – Numbers and details	15
Q414/2015 Preparation of homes for reallocation – Expenditure and details of work undertaken.....	15
Q415 and Q420/2015 Government rental homes – Unpaid rents	15
Q416/2015 Government rental homes – Allocations and assignments	16
Q417/2015 Government rental homes – Numbers vacant	17
Q418/2015 Housing waiting lists and pre-list – Breakdown of applicants	19

Q421/2015 Lifts – Installation and maintenance contracts	20
Q422/2015 Gibraltar Bus Company – Payments for advertisements on buses	22
Q423/2015 Advertising on bus stops – Maintenance management.....	24
Q424/2015 Government car fleet – Figures and emissions.....	25
Q425/2015 Hybrid car purchase – Public and private sector figures	27
Financial Services and Gaming	28
Q426/2015 Financial Services Ombudsman – Plans for creation of office.....	28
Q427/2015 Gibraltar Deposit Guarantee Scheme – Revision of legislation	28
Q428/2015 FSC supervisory activities – Independent review team.....	30
Q429/2015 Bermuda Captive Conference – Gibraltar insurance professional attendees	31
Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information	31
Q430/2015 Students dropping out of school – Numbers	31
Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.....	32
Q385/2015 WOPS – Government manifesto commitment	32
Q386/2015 Employees in public service – Permanent increases in numbers.....	33
Q393-397/2015 Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited – Fixed Rate Notes	33
Q431/2015 Maritime Cadet Training Scheme – Student details	41
Q432/2015 Dual-fire Waterport power station – Requirement to borrow re construction costs	43
Q433/2015 Government cash reserves and debt.	43
Deputy Chief Minister	47
Q438/2015 Northern Defences regeneration scheme – Cost of phase 1	47
Q439/2015 Gibraltar Airport – European Transfer Commissioner’s comments.....	47
Q440/2015 EU Parliament Petitions Committee Chairman – Recent visits.....	48
Q441/2015 Gibraltar House, Brussels – Cost and staffing.....	49
Chief Minister.....	50
Q442/2015 Moneylending licensees – Provision of mortgage facilities	50
Q443/2015 <i>Sunborn</i> Floating Hotel – Nature Group claim against Government	51
Q444/2015 Naturalised British in Gibraltar – Number; Government housing.....	52
Questions for Written Answer	53
Adjournment.....	53
The House adjourned at 6.45p.m	53

The Gibraltar Parliament

The Parliament met at 3.30 p.m.

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: P E Martinez Esq *in attendance*]

PRAYER
Mr Speaker

CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

Clerk: (i) Oath of Allegiance; (ii) Confirmation of Minutes – the Minutes of the last meeting of Parliament, which was held on 20th and 21st May 2015.

5 **Mr Speaker:** May I sign the Minutes as correct? (**Members:** Aye.)

Mr Speaker signed the Minutes.

PAPERS TO BE LAID

Clerk: (iii) Communications from the Chair; (iv) Petitions; (v) Announcements; (vi) Papers to be laid – the Hon. the Chief Minister.

10 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay on the table the Gibraltar Annual Policing Plan for 2015-2016; and, in respect of section 12 of the Public Finance (Borrowing Powers) Act 2008, the Revolving Facility between HM Government of Gibraltar and Royal Bank of Scotland International Ltd, trading as NatWest, dated 22nd May 2015.

15 **Mr Speaker:** Ordered to lie.

Clerk: The Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

20 **Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay on the table the Air Traffic Survey Report 2014.

Mr Speaker: Ordered to lie.

25 **Clerk:** The Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB.

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano): I have the honour to lay on the table the Census of Gibraltar 2012.

30 **Mr Speaker:** Ordered to lie.

Clerk: The Hon. the Minister for Business and Employment.

35 **Minister for Business and Employment (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay on the table the Employment Survey Report 2014.

Mr Speaker: Ordered to lie.

Clerk: The Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

40 **Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):**
Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay on the table the Tourist Survey Report of 2014 and the Hotel Occupancy Survey 2014.

Mr Speaker: Ordered to lie.

45 **Clerk:** (vii) Reports of Committees; (viii) Answers to Oral Questions.

Questions for Oral Answer

BUSINESS AND EMPLOYMENT

Q401/2015 Health and safety – May 2015 statistics

Clerk: Question 401, the Hon. J J Netto.

50 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Health and Safety provide the Health and Safety statistics for the month of May 2015, as these were not available on the Government website at the time when notice for questions was issued?

55 Can I say that subsequently... I am not going to pre-empt the answer of the Hon. Minister, but subsequent to the question being laid, that I have seen the information. In fact, I got a printed version this morning of it.

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Business and Employment.

60 **Minister for Business and Employment (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, I now hand over to the hon. Gentleman the information requested.

SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 401/2015

Table HS.1
Monitoring Activities, 2015

Industry Sector	May							Total
	Meetings	Advice	Complaints	Inspections	Follow-ups	Accident Investigations	Site Visits	
Air Transport Related								-
Bank, Finance, Insurance								-
Construction	2	11	9	12	1	1	15	51
Education								-
Electricity Supply/Related	2							2
Horticulture								-
Hotel Trade								-
Manufacture								-
Medical & Health Services								-
Police, Security, Fire Services								-
Post & Communications								-
Public Admin & Natl Defence	2							2
Repairs Consumer Goods				1				1
Restaurants, Bar etc								-
Retail Trade								-
Road Transport Related								-
Sanitary Services								-
Sea Transport Related		1						1
Shipbuilding/Marine Repairs								-
Water Supply/Related								-
Wholesale Trade		1						1
Total	6	13	9	13	1	1	15	58

Updated 1 June 2015

Source: Ministry for Business and Employment

CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 401/2015

Table HS.2
Occupational Reportable Accidents, 2015

Industry Sector	January			February			March			April			May		
	Minor	Major	Fatal	Minor	Major	Fatal	Minor	Major	Fatal	Minor	Major	Fatal	Minor	Major	Fatal
Air Transport Related	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-	-	-	-
Bank, Finance, Insurance	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Construction	3	-	-	3	-	-	1	-	-	3	1	-	-	2	-
Education	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Electricity Supply/Related	-	-	-	2	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Horticulture	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Hotel Trade	1	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Manufacture	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Medical & Health Services	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Police, Security, Fire Services	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Post & Communications	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Public Admin & Natl Defence	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Repairs Consumer Goods	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Restaurants, Bar etc	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Retail Trade	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Road Transport Related	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Sanitary Services	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Sea Transport Related	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Shipbuilding/Marine Repairs	1	-	-	1	-	-	1	1	-	1	-	-	-	2	-
Water Supply/Related	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Wholesale Trade	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total	5	-	-	6	-	-	3	1	-	4	2	-	2	2	-

Updated 1 June 2015

Source: Ministry for Business and Employment

CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 401/2015

Table HS.3
Enforcement Activities, 2015

Industry Sector	January		February		March		April		May	
	PN	IM	PN	IM	PN	IM	PN	IM	PN	IM
Air Transport Related	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Bank, Finance, Insurance	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Construction	-	-	1	-	-	-	1	-	-	-
Education	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Electricity Supply/Related	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Horticulture	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Hotel Trade	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Manufacture	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Medical & Health Services	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Police, Security, Fire Services	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Post & Communications	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Public Admin & Natl Defence	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Repairs Consumer Goods	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Restaurants, Bar etc	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Retail Trade	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Road Transport Related	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Sanitary Services	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Sea Transport Related	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Shipbuilding/Marine Repairs	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Water Supply/Related	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Wholesale Trade	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total	-	-	1	-	-	-	1	-	-	-

Updated 1 June 2015

Note:
PN: Prohibition Notices Served
IM: Improvement Notices Served

Source: Ministry for Business and Employment

CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 401/2015

Table HS.4¹

Number of times legal advice has been sought during the month in relation to the number of inspections conducted, 2015

As at	Advice
January	-
February	-
March	-
April	-
May	-
Total	-

Updated 1 June 2015

Source: Ministry for Business and Employment

CONT. SCHEDULE TO QUESTION NO 401/2015

Table HS.5¹

Reasons for Factories Inspectors issuing Improvement and Prohibition notices, 2015

As at	Industry Sector	Improvement Notices	Prohibition Notices	Reason
31 January	-	-	-	-
28 February	Construction	-	1	The company failed to provide a structure of suitable and sufficient strength and rigidity for the purpose for which it is being used.
31 March	-	-	-	-
30 April	Construction	-	1	The company failed to provide CDM Notification of Project, Asbestos Survey, Risk Assessments, Method Statement, Health and Safety Plan.
31-May-15	-	-	-	-

Updated 1 June 2015

Source: Ministry for Business and Employment

65 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, if I may, as I said in my preliminary question, I do have the information because I actually printed it this morning.

70 Could I, in terms of a supplementary question, ask the Hon. Minister, in relation to reportable accidents, in the table on reportable accidents, I have noticed that there were two major accidents in the shipbuilding/marine repair industry group? Can perhaps the Minister provide us with some information as to the nature of those two major accidents?

75 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the supplementary information that I have brought with me this afternoon relates to the reasons for the factories inspectors issuing improvement and prohibition notices. I have not brought any supplementary information on the question he specifically asks; but as I ask the hon. Gentleman every time, if he has questions on any specifics arising from any of the statistics, I will be more than happy to either answer him in this House, were he to give notice, or to write to him – however he pleases to proceed.

80 **Hon. J J Netto:** Well, really, so long as one gets the information, that is what is the important part. I do not know how quickly... Can the hon. Member perhaps get some of his staff to get the information and just give a very brief summary, really, of the nature of the accidents, and if he can later on provide the information in Parliament, with the indulgence of Mr Speaker, that will be fair enough, really.

85 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, ordinarily my staff, who are extremely nimble on their feet, would have provided me with the information, but it is summer hours so I do not think I will have much luck today. So,

again, I can either write to him or, if he were to ask me specifically at the next session of Parliament, I will be more than happy to provide him with the information.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, I am quite happy for the hon. Gentleman to write to me and provide me with the information. That is, at the end of the day, what I really wanted to have.

Hon. N F Costa: I will do so, Mr Speaker. I am grateful.

HEALTH, THE ENVIRONMENT, ENERGY AND CLIMATE CHANGE

Q402/2015 Estimates Book – Breakdown of expenditure

Clerk: Question 402, the Hon. J J Netto.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, further to the answer given to Written Question 41/2015, can the Minister for Utilities provide details of the expenditure of item 2, Fire Prevention and Detection; item 11, New Power Station – Tender Evaluation Cost; item 12, Replacement of Sub-Stations; and item 15, Infrastructure – New Power Station?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, details of expenditure for these items are as follows.

Item 2: £764.50 – and this is ongoing – refers to the purchase of flame detectors to replace detectors damaged by the Waterport fire.

Item 11: £106,354.22 – complete – refers to the technical, legal and cost evaluation that was paid to external consultants for the new power station tender evaluation. These were paid to Mott MacDonald, TSN and Bartons Surveyors.

Item 12: £194,154.49 – ongoing – refers to various items associated with the replacement of substations and includes switchgear, transformers, ring main units and low voltage boards to replace Maida Vale and Rosia substations, Network Mimic diagram upgrade, power system analyser for network and substation locks.

Item 15: £269,252 – ongoing also – refers to infrastructure works to connect the new power station to Mid Harbour's distribution centre.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, given the amount of information that the Hon. Minister has just provided, I wonder whether he will be kind enough to provide a copy – I am obliged.

Q403/2015 Estimates Book – Provision of reports

Clerk: Question 403, the Hon. J J Netto.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, further to the answer to Written Question 43/2015, can the Minister for the Environment provide Parliament with copies of the following reports: (a) ADCP survey by Van Oord; (b) City level greenhouse inventory by Ricardo-AEA; (c) Climate change strategy and implementation by Geoff Lye; (d) Energy efficiency target and action plan by ECOFYS UK Limited; (e) Solar thermal pilot study by E M Consulting; (f) Renewable energy strategy by New Resource Partners; (g) Transport climate change strategy project by Mott MacDonald Limited; (h) Implementation of renewable energy and energy efficiency projects by Jon Orpin?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

130 **Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change: (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I will provide the hon. Member with electronic copies of the documents available, as I have done before, with the exception of the following three.

(1) The Renewable Energy Strategy drafted by NRP. This is currently being reviewed by the Department and will be published shortly. In lieu of this the National Renewable Energy Action Plan has been submitted.

135 (2) The Implementation of Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency projects by Jon Orpin. Unfortunately, Mr Jon Orpin passed away recently and was unable to complete a report of the consultancy works carried out for the Department of the Environment and the Gibraltar Electricity Authority.

(3) The Transport Climate Change Strategy by Mott MacDonald, which is not yet finished and published.

140 But all the others will be with the hon. Member I would say within the next 24 hours, if not sooner.

Hon. J J Netto: Well, certainly I am grateful for the information and I am grateful for the number of reports that he is going to pass on for my perusal.

145 In relation to the Transport Climate Change Strategy report, can the Hon. Minister explain the delay? This is very much intertwined with information that was collated with the... I cannot remember the actual name now... with another report to do with renewable energy in terms of setting the targets for the Government for 2020. So could perhaps... Is this, the delay on the figures on the transport climate change strategy, is that delaying other Government reports in relation to climate change and renewable energy?

150 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I am not completely sure as to why this is not yet finished, but it is not, in my view, holding up any other report or the development of any other policy which we are on track to, as I think I said at the last meeting of Parliament, to present from the Climate Change Taskforce to the Climate Change Forum shortly.

155 I believe that this was asked for subsequently to Mott MacDonald carrying out the Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan, so it would not have been ready at the same time. I can look into whether there is any knock-on effect or anything else, but I am not aware, and if there was anything serious I daresay I would be.

160 **Hon. J J Netto:** I have been lucky and just remembered, Mr Speaker, that the actual report I was referring to, but I could not remember the name, was the National Renewable Energy Action Plan for Gibraltar, which the hon. Gentleman actually gave me, I think it was last month or the month before. Just to look at one particular page, page 9, within the tables there it is all... the tabulation... there are a lot of asterisks there, and if you go down to the bottom here it is basically talking about that the figures for the completion of the Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan 2015 are still not yet done, or in whatever form it is, therefore delaying the actual report itself. So this is why I am saying whether the delays on some aspects of some reports are actually holding back the Government broader picture for Renewable Energy and Action Plan for Gibraltar?

170 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I do not have a copy of that plan because all I was asked in this question was whether we would hand over these documents, and in fact that plan is not one of the documents listed so I do not have it to hand, but I will try and assist.

175 If the asterisks refer to the Sustainable Traffic, Transport and Parking Plan, that is not the same document as we are talking about –the Transport Climate Change Strategy – so it maybe that we are talking about two different documents. But in any case I will seek clarification from the Members of the Department and I am happy to respond to see whether there are any implications.

Q404-406/2015

Commonwealth Park project –

Services provided by Wildlife Gibraltar Ltd, Comofco Consultants and JLC consulting

Clerk: Question 404, the Hon. J J Netto.

180 **Hon. J J Netto:** Mr Speaker, further to the answer to Written Question 44/2015, can the Minister for the Environment state what were the services that Wildlife Gibraltar Ltd provided to the Commonwealth Park project during the financial year 2014-15?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 405 and 406.

185

Clerk: Question 405, the Hon. J J Netto.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, further to the answer to Written Question 44/2015 can the Minister for the Environment state what were the services that Comofco Consultants Ltd provided to the Commonwealth Park project during the financial year 2014-15?

190

Clerk: Question 406, the Hon. J J Netto.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, further to the answer to Written Question 44/2015 can the Minister for the Environment state what were the services that JLC Consulting provided to the Commonwealth Park project during the financial year 2014-15?

195

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Yes Mr Speaker, Wildlife Gibraltar engaged professional design services for the Commonwealth Park project. These were in various disciplines, including lighting and landscaping, through the use of specialist consultants engaged for this purpose. They also carried out management duties.

200

Comofco Consultants provided professional engineering services to the Government in relation to mechanical, electrical and utility services. There was an element of consultation in relation to the proposed new park to the north.

205

JLC Consulting provided professional project management services to the Government for the Commonwealth Park project.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, could I ask the Hon. Minister whether, in his view, some of these particular payments, whether it is Wildlife Gibraltar Ltd or the other two in relation... Does he think that they are kind of payments that may be of a recurrent expenditure in the future; and if so, obviously one would have to look at the actual contract in itself to see whether that should be incorporated or not?

210

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: No, Mr Speaker, these were one-off payments relating to the design of the park and therefore they are not recurrent in any way. The specialists that were engaged were Landform Consultants, who are multi-prizewinners in the UK, to design lighting and landscaping; Comofco did the mechanical-electrical services; and the other was for management services. So they were one-off for the construction of the project and are not recurrent in any way.

215

**Q407/2015
Macaques –
Monitoring of illegal feeding**

Clerk: Question 407, the Hon. J J Netto.

220

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, further to the answer to Written Question 46/2015, can the Minister for the Environment state if there has been any monitoring for illegal feeding of macaques during 2015, either by the Environmental Protection Officers or the Environmental Security Officers?

225

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Yes, Mr Speaker, both the Environmental Protection Officers and Environment Security Officers have been monitoring for illegal feeding of macaques.

230

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, could the Hon. Minister perhaps provide Parliament with some more details of the occurrence and type of monitoring taking place?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: I can provide details of what their general duties are. Obviously, I do not have details of where they are at every specific moment. Essentially, they will patrol or they will be stationed at

235

particular sites on the Upper Rock or in the town, where macaques have been known to visit in the past, in order to point out to people that it is illegal to feed them and it is unwise to feed them because, as we all know, they lose their fear of humans, which can lead to possible interaction, or they get used to being fed in particular places and then they tend to congregate there.

So it is a monitoring, a dissuasive tactic. If anybody then were to proceed or to be seen actually feeding them, then they would either issue a warning or a ticket, or whatever they felt at that time was appropriate.

Q408/2015
LED lighting –
Use in Government buildings

Clerk: Question 408, the Hon. J J Netto.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Environment state if all Government buildings are now using LED lighting; and if not, please state which ones do, what percentage of the total this represents and when does the Hon. Minister think that this goal will be achieved?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, not all Government buildings – sadly, if I may add – are yet currently using LED. LED lighting and/or other low-energy lighting is being installed when there is a requirement to replace light fittings in Government buildings. The work is currently ongoing. Previous records held by the GEA did not specify actual light fittings installed, therefore an accurate percentage of the total lights changed is presently not available.

Having said this, now, a register was created by the GEA in March 2014, namely the Energy Savings Replacement Log, in order to record all LED installations. I hand over a copy of the Energy Savings Replacement Log, which specifies the location, quantity and type of lighting changed. I repeat, because there is no previous record, I cannot give a percentage, but that is what has been done.

As stated, works are carried out as required and therefore it is not possible to provide a definite timescale at this stage. It should nevertheless be noted that our policy is to install low-energy or LED lighting whenever Government buildings undergo any refurbishment works, and this will certainly help attain our goal of switching to more energy-efficient lighting systems in Government buildings.

Answer to Question 408 of 2015.

Date	Area/Location	Specification, Type, Wattage,	Quantity	Number & Type Of Old Fitting Removed & Wattage	Reduction of Watts
4.3.14	MID HARBOURS	50W LED FITTING	1	150w fitting	100w
6.3.14	6 CONVENT PLACE	LED PANELS 600X600 38w	4	4x 58w Flo Tube	80w
11.3.14	ST MICHALS CAVE	30W LED FITTING	1	150w Metal high light	120w
12.3.14	HOLYLAND TUNNELS	JCC 14W LED	6	60w Bulb	276w
13.3.14	ALBERT RISSO	20W ROUND FITTING DELUXE LED	2	60w Bulb	20w
18.3.14	HOLYLAND TUNNELS	30W LED FITTING	1	150w Metal high light	120w
17.3.14	HOLYLAND TUNNELS	8W LED EMERGENCY FITTING	12	8w flo tube	N/A but same cost as standard
17.3.14	GLACIS EST	IP65 282MM BULHEAD FITTING 24w	80	60w Bulb	3360w
17.3.14	GLACIS EST	8W LED EMERGENCY FITTING	40	8w flo tube	N/A but same cost as standard
17.3.14	HOLYLAND TUNNELS	IP65 282MM BULHEAD FITTING 14w	50	60w bulb	2300w
4.4.14	ST MICHALS CAVE	10W FITTING REMOTE	1	100w halogen flood light	90w
14.4.14	MID HARBOURS	50W LED FITTING	9	N/A	N/A (New Installation)
23.4.14	GASA Pool	14W LED Fitting with sensor	1	60w Bulb	46w
12.5.14	PORT	JCC 14W LED	2	N/A	N/A
16.5.14	CUSTOMS	70W LED FITTING	6	250w Flood Light	1080w
16.5.14	BOARDER AND COASTGUARDS	70W LED FITTING	10	250w Flood Light	1800w
22.5.14	CUSTOMS	30W LED FITTING	3	250w Flood Light	360w
27.5.14	GALLERIES	10W FITTING	1	100w halogen flood light	70w
11.6.14	HOLYLAND TUNNELS	10W FITTING	1	100w halogen flood light	70w
13.6.14	HOUSING F.B.R	JCC 23W	4	100w bulb	77w
20.6.14	HOUSING NEW OFFICES	JCC 23W	2	100w bulb	154w
20.6.14	GASA Pool	JCC 14W SENSOR	1	jcc 14w sensor (def)	N/A
24.6.14	KENT HSE BIN STORES	JCC 14W	1	36w flo Fitting	22w
25.6.14	38 FLAT BASTION RD	JCC 23W	7	60w Bulb	N/A
25.6.14	HOUSING NEW OFFICES	LED PANELS 600X600 38w	38	N/A	N/A
25.6.14	HOUSING NEW OFFICES	EMERGENCY FITTINGS	5	N/A	
3.6.14	CONSTITUTION HSE	20W ROUND FITTING DELUXE LED	2	60w Bulb	40w
7.7.14	BLEAK HOUSE	50W LED FITTING	4	N/A	N/A
10.7.14	RETRENCHMENT BLOCK	EMERGENCY FITTINGS	5	N/A	N/A
10.7.14	RETRENCHMENT BLOCK	JCC 23W	4	N/A	N/A
31.7.14	RETRENCHMENT BLOCK	JCC 23W SENSOR	5	N/A	N/A
1.8.14	RETRENCHMENT BLOCK	EMERGENCY FITTINGS	2	N/A	N/A
7.8.14	GASA Pool	70W LED FITTING	4	400w	1320w
11.8.14	DR GIRALDI HUT	JCC 20W	2	60w Bulb	80w
13.8.14	SORTING OFFICE	30W LED FITTING	2	58w flo tube	56w
26.8.14	POST OFFICE	JCC 23W	1	60w Bulb	37w
28.8.14	VICTORIA STD	EMERGENCY FITTINGS	3	flo tube emergency	N/a
9.9.14	6 CONVENT PLACE	JCC 14W	2	60w Bulb	92w
30.9.14	ALBERT RISSO	JCC 23 W	2	100w bulb	154w
2.10.14	SAVINGS BANK	LED PANELS 600X600 38w	1	600x600 flo tube panels 100w	62w
11.10.14	KINGSWAY HSE	JCC 14W	3	60w Bulb	138w
11.10.14	KINGSWAY HSE	JCC 20W	7	60w Bulb	280w
17.10.14	PORT AUTH	50W LED FITTING	4	250w Flood Light	800w
21.10.14	KINGSWAY HSE	JCC 14W	4	60w Bulb	184w
21.10.14	KINGSWAY HSE	JCC 23W	7	60w Bulb	259w
24.10.14	GSLA	JCC 14W SENSOR	2	60w Bulb	92w
11.11.14	CFB	5FT LED FITTING	7	58w flo tube	240w

Cont...

Contd Answer to Question 408 of 2015.

19.11.14	CFB	5FT LED FITTING	2	58w flo tube	70w
14.11.14	SAVINGS BANK	LED PANELS 600X600 38w	7	600x600 flo tube panels 100w	434w
20.11.14	RETRENCHMENT BLOCK	JCC 23W	30	60w Bulb	1110w
20.11.14	CONSTITUTION HSE	JCC 23W	1	60w Bulb	37w
22.11.14	WILLAM THOMPSON	JCC 23W	32	60w Bulb	1184w
24.11.14	WILLAM THOMPSON	JCC 20W	8	60w Bulb	320w
24.11.14	WILLAM THOMPSON	JCC 14W	3	60w Bulb	138w
24.11.14	WILLAM THOMPSON	JCC 23W	1	60w Bulb	37w
24.11.14	WILLAM THOMPSON	JCC 20W	1	60w Bulb	40w
1.12.14	KINGSWAY HSE	JCC 14W	4	60w Bulb	184w
3.12.14	WILLAM THOMPSON	JCC 14W	14	60w Bulb	644w
4.12.14	KINGSWAY HSE	JCC 14W	16	60w Bulb	736w
4.12.14	KINGSWAY HSE	JCC 23W	12	60w Bulb	444w
16.12.14	DR GIRALDI	JCC 14W SENSOR	1	60w Bulb	46w
7.1.15	BUS TERMINAL	50W LED FITTING	4	250w Flood Light	800w
7.1.15	BUS TERMINAL	30W LED FITTING SENSOR	2	250w Flood Light with sensor	440w
7.1.15	ALBERT RISSO	JCC 20W	2	100w light Fitting	160w
12.1.15	WILLAM THOMPSON	JCC 14W	14	32w flo fitting	252w
16.1.15	RETRENCHMENT BLOCK	JCC 23W EMERGENCY	10	60w Bulb with emergency	370w
16.1.15	RETRENCHMENT BLOCK	JCC 23W	2	60w bulb	74w
23.1.15	GREAT SIEGE TUNNEL	JCC 14W	12	38w light fitting	288w
24.1.15	GREAT SIEGE TUNNEL	JCC 14W	12	38w light fitting	288w
27.1.15	GREAT SIEGE TUNNEL	JCC 14W	12	38w light fitting	288w
29.1.15	MAGARET GREWELL	JCC 20W	1	60w bulb	40w
30.1.15	WESTSIDE SCHOOL	50W LED FITTING	4	250w Flood Light	800w
2.2.15	GREAT SIEGE TUNNEL	JCC 14W	7	38w light fitting	168w
2.2.15	GREAT SIEGE TUNNEL	JCC 23W SENSOR	1	60w bulb	37w
2.2.15	CAVE	JCC 14W	5	38w light fitting	120w
11.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 14W	8	60w Bulb	368w
11.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 23W	2	60w Bulb	74w
11.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 20W	2	60w Bulb	74w
14.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 20W	14	60w Bulb	560w
14.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 23W	4	60w Bulb	148w
14.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 14W	12	60w Bulb	552w
17.2.15	MOORISH CASTLE	30W LED FITTING	1	250w Flood Light	220w
18.2.15	EU BUILDING	JCC 23W	2	60w Bulb	74w
20.2.15	ALBERT RISSO	JCC 20W 23028	25	70w flo tube fittings	1250w
20.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 14W	36	60w Bulb	1656w
20.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 23W 23202	8	60w Bulb	296w
24.2.15	ALBERT RISSO	JCC 20W 23028	7	70w flo tube fittings	350w
25.2.15	CITY UNDER SIEGE	30W LED FITTING PIR	4	150w floodlight	480w
26.2.15	ALBERT RISSO	JCC 23W SENSOR	1	70w flo tube fittings	47w
26.2.15	MILITARY HERITAGE	30W LED FITTING PIR	6	150w floodlight	720w
26.2.15	WESTSIDE SCHOOL	50W LED FITTING	2	250w Flood Light	400w
26.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 14W	12	60w Bulb	552w
27.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 23W 23202	6	60w Bulb	222w
27.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 20W 23028	10	60w Bulb	400w
27.2.15	GREAT SIEGE TUNNEL	30W LED FITTING PIR	1	150w floodlight	120w
27.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 23W	6	60w Bulb	222w
27.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 14W	36	60w Bulb	1656w

Cont...

Contd Answer to Question 408 of 2015.

27.2.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 20W 23028	10	60w Bulb	400w
3.3.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 20W 23028	10	60w Bulb	400w
10.3.15	HEATHFIELD HSE	30W LED FITTING	2	150w floodlight	240w
13.3.15	EDINGBURGH EST	JCC 14W	1	60w Bulb	46w
17.3.15	NORTH MOLE POST OFFICE	JCC 14W	1	60w Bulb	46w
23.3.15	BUS TERMINAL	50W LED FITTING	1	250w Flood Light	200w
23.3.15	ENVIRONMENTAL AGENCY	30W LED FITTING PIR	1	250w Flood Light	220w
25.3.15	GREAT SIEGE TUNNEL	10W LED FITTING	3	100w floodlight	270w
7.4.15	JEWS GATES	30W LED FITTING	2	150w floodlight	240w
10.4.15	CAVE	30W LED FITTING	1	150w floodlight	120w
10.4.15	BISHOP CANILLA HSE	JCC 23W 23202	18	36w flo Fitting	232w
22.4.15	RODNEY HSE	30W LED FITTING	1	150w floodlight	120w
22.4.15	RODNEY HSE	JCC 14W	6	60w Bulb	276w
24.4.15	REDSANDS	JCC 14W	17	60w Bulb	782w
24.4.15	GASA Pool	JCC 14W 23211	2	60w Bulb	92w
6.5.15	REDSANDS	JCC 14W	24	60w Bulb	1104w
21.5.15	TSD GARAGE	50W LED FITTING	1	250w Flood Light	200w
27.5.15	ST MICHALS CAVE	10W LED FITTING	3	100w floodlight	270w
27.5.15	ST MICHALS CAVE	30W LED FITTING	1	150w floodlight	120w
27.5.15	ST MICHALS CAVE	JCC 23W SENSOR	2	60w Bulb	92w
1.6.15	RODNEY HSE	JCC 14W SENSOR	3	60w Bulb	138w

Q409/2015

Solar panels –

Contract details re installation and maintenance

265 **Clerk:** Question 409, the Hon. D A Feetham.

270 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Government please provide details of all contracts relating to the installation and maintenance of solar panels awarded by it or any Government Company or Authority since they were elected, identifying the name of the contractor, the contract price, whether that contract went out to tender and whether it was the cheapest tender for the taxpayer?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

275 **Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the solar thermal pilot installations at the Tercentenary Sports Hall and Tangier Views went out to tender as part of the same tender award. These works were awarded to Deselec Ltd at a cost of £33,841 and £72,754.51 respectively. This tender was not the cheapest but, in accordance with the report prepared by independent consultants, they were the most economically advantageous since they submitted a very focused and rigorous tender submission having scored higher overall than any other.

280 The solar installations at the GSLA swimming pool was commissioned by the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority. These works did not go out to tender since they formed part of a wider project carried out by GJBS involving a complete upgrade of the GSLA swimming pool complex. The works were allocated to GJBS at a cost of £292,950.09.

285 The proposed solar installation at GHA went out to tender. This tender was awarded to Green Resources Ltd in the sum of £210,048, being the lowest tender received.

Q410/2015

**New power station at North Mole –
Problems re foundations**

Clerk: Question 410, the Hon. D A Feetham.

290 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm whether there have been any reports or communications post the award of the tender for the Waterport Power Station from anyone associated with that project, suggesting that there are technical problems with the construction of the foundations for the new power station in the North Mole area?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change.

295 **Minister for Health, the Environment, Energy and Climate Change (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the Government has not received any information post award of the tender for the Waterport power station – or for the ‘new power station’, I think the question should have been worded, and in fact the answer – suggesting that there are technical problems with the construction of the foundations for the latter.

300 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, so just to be absolutely clear about this: the original plans for the foundations of the new power station at the North Mole continue to be the plans that are extant at the moment and there has had to be no variation of those plans in relation to the foundations because of anything that was uncovered post the award of the tender?

305 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, that is not the same question. I am not aware of any, I am not aware of any, but I have not asked that question because whether there have been any material changes to any plans as a result of anything uncovered is not exactly the same as saying whether there were any technical problems with the construction of the foundations. It may be that... I am not aware of any. Certainly none have been brought to my attention, so that is what I can answer.

TOURISM, HOUSING, EQUALITY AND SOCIAL SERVICES

Q411/2015

**Mid Harbour Estate garage barriers –
Date when operational**

310 **Clerk:** Question 411, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, further to the answer provided to Question 354/2015, can the Minister for Housing indicate to this House by when the garage barriers at Mid Harbour Estate will be operational on a permanent basis?

315 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, the barriers at Mid Harbour Estate became operational on 2nd June 2015.

Q412/2105

**Squatters in Government rental homes –
Costs re eviction**

320 **Clerk:** Question 412, the Hon. E J Reyes.

325 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing say how much expenditure has been incurred in respect of legal costs relating to the eviction of squatters from Government rental homes since the answer provided to Question 356/2015, providing a breakdown showing the number of homes involved and to whom payments were made?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

330 **Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):**
Mr Speaker, none.

Q413/2015
Decanting of tenants –
Numbers and details

Clerk: Question 413, the Hon. E J Reyes.

335 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide details of how many tenants required urgent decanting from their homes since the answer to Question 358/2015, indicating the reason why, the date when said decanting became necessary and the date when the tenants were able to return to their home?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

340 **Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):**
Mr Speaker, none.

Q414/2015
Preparation of homes for reallocation –
Expenditure and details of work undertaken

Clerk: Question 414, the Hon. E J Reyes.

345 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide details in respect of all expenditure incurred since the answer to Question 359/2015 in respect of contracts awarded for making empty homes suitable for reallocation, stating to whom payments were made, how much has been paid, the number of residential homes pertaining to each payment, as well as indicating the type and nature of repair works or cleaning services undertaken?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

350 **Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):**
Mr Speaker, AJEC was paid £12,945 in relation to works to one property: general refurbishment works including works to walls, ceilings, taking down walls, paintwork, replacing floor tiles, door, plumbing and electrical works.

355 Avanti was paid £17,869 in relation to works to one property: general refurbishment works, including works to walls and ceilings, taking down walls, paintwork, replacing floor tiles, door, plumbing and electrical works.

There were no cleaning services contracted.

Q415 and Q420/2015
Government rental homes –
Unpaid rents

Clerk: Question 415, the Hon. E J Reyes.

360 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide full details of how much has been written off in respect of unpaid rents pertaining to Government rental homes since the answer provided to Question 360/2015?

365 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question with Question 420.

370 **Clerk:** Question 420, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Housing provide details of arrears in respect of unpaid rents pertaining to Government rental homes as at 31st May 2015?

375 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, in answer to Question 415, none yet. Work continues on reconciling the amounts due and collectable.

380 In answer to Question 420, the total of arrears in respect of unpaid rents as at 31st May 2015 was £5,500,459.77.

Q416/2015

Government rental homes – Allocations and assignments

Clerk: Question 416, the Hon. E J Reyes.

385 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Government state how many rental homes have been allocated and/or assigned to applicants other than on the direct advice of the Housing Allocation Committee from January 2012 to date, stating on whose authority these allocations and/or assignments were made?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

390 **Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, a total of 155 flats have been allocated and/or assigned to applicants other than on the direct advice of the Housing Allocation Committee.

395 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, the final part of that question requests stating on whose authority these allocations and/or assignments were made. I have not heard a reply in respect of that data requested.

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Sorry, Mr Speaker, yes, it is on the authority of the Minister for Housing.

400 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, so that I have it clear in my mind and so that the public has it clear in their minds, 155 flats have been allocated on advice of the hon. Lady, as Minister for Housing, thereby circumventing the housing allocation process, which is that apartments or flats are allocated on the advice of the Housing Allocation Committee. How does the hon. Lady justify that?

405 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Because, Mr Speaker, I did not say... What I said was, Mr Speaker, that flats have been allocated not on the advice of the Housing Allocation Committee – allocated by myself but not necessarily on my advice, Mr Speaker. The difference in the nuance is that not all allocations have to be on the advice of the Housing Allocation Committee. The majority of the allocations in question, Mr Speaker are when there is either an exchange or decanting of property.

410 So he can rest assured that I have not circumvented the advice of the Housing Allocation Committee; it is that the Housing Allocation Committee does not have to advise on each and every occasion.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker – (*Interjection*)

415 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, if I can add to that, that is the same procedure that has always been in place and it is the same procedure that they applied when they were in Government, Mr Speaker.

420 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, when we were in Government and there was any kind of allocation circumventing the Housing Allocation Committee there was criticism from this side of the House at that kind of allocation, and now we see 155 flats have been allocated effectively directly by the hon. Lady.

Can she give us, for example, a breakdown of how many flats have had to be awarded due to somebody being decanted, how many flats have had to be awarded simply because the hon. Lady has, in her wisdom and subjectively on her view, decided that somebody at whatever point on the housing waiting list ought to be awarded a flat directly and not go through the Housing Allocation Committee?

425

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, he can rest assured and sleep soundly tonight. I appreciate the fact that he accepts that I have wisdom. I have not applied that wisdom subjectively at all. If I would, I would apply it objectively, but I have not exercised it at all because there has not been a single circumstance where I, as Minister for Housing, have said, 'I am going to go to a number, a person who is 100 on the list, and I am going to give them a flat today.' Because I have not done that, Mr Speaker. It is just that there are occasions where people may unfortunately suffer a flooding in their premises and they have to be decanted immediately. That is not something that has to go on the advice of the Housing Allocation Committee.

430

He asked me how many circumstances of decanting there had been and I think there have been 36 flats allocated on that basis. There may be flats for example, Mr Speaker, that, when they become vacant, are used strategically by Government for other purposes, and we have allocated quite a substantial number of flats to the Royal Gibraltar Police for them to use as outposts. As certain flats become available in certain areas they may be allocated to charities who then use it, such as Women in Need for example, and that is what is happening.

435

So if the allegation is that I am choosing people on the list randomly, subjectively or whatever, then Mr Speaker that is not the case and I have not done that on a single occasion, Mr Speaker.

440

Hon. D A Feetham: Well, Mr Speaker, it is not me whose concerns have got to be alleviated or satisfied; it is all those hundreds of people on the housing waiting list who are patiently waiting for a flat, who then see that the hon. Lady is effectively allocating these flats outside the normal procedure, which is on advice of the Housing Allocation Committee.

445

Can the hon. Lady, bearing in mind that first of all she said that these people had been decanted, or the impression she was giving was that most of them had been decanted, and now we know that only 38 have been decanted... Can she give an exact breakdown of how many people, apart from the 38 decanted, have been awarded flats directly by the hon. Lady and for what reason, so that we can effectively examine the reasons to see whether indeed it is based on the subjective judgement of the hon. Lady or whether there is any objective reason why these flats ought to have been allocated in this particular way?

450

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, I have already answered the question that was asked of me, in that when these flats are allocated it is in the circumstances where the advice of the Housing Allocation Committee is not applicable because it is not relevant, Mr Speaker.

455

Q417/2015
Government rental homes –
Numbers vacant

Clerk: Question 417, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Housing say how many Government rental homes are currently vacant, providing details in chronological order and showing the date from which such homes have been unoccupied, stating how many of these are pre-war or post-war homes, together with reasons for their continued non-occupation or allocation as well as indicating estimated dates when these will be ready for reallocation?

460

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

465

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, there are 138 pre-war flats and 14 post-war flats. The reason for their non-occupation or allocation is either because they are beyond economical repair or are being considered for possible sale or tender and therefore no dates are available for their reallocation.

470

I will now hand the hon. Member a schedule listing the dates from which such homes have been unoccupied.

Answer to Question 417 of 2015

Pre-war	
2	2003
25	2004
2	2005
5	2006
1	2007
3	2008
1	2009
4	2010
8	2011
21	2012
18	2013
48	2014

Post-war	
1	1998
2	2004
1	2005
3	2008
1	2011
3	2013
3	2014

475 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, whilst I am waiting for the schedule to arrive, in the answer the Minister was explaining that it had been considered non-economical and so on. Does that apply, just for clarity, both to the pre-war and the post-war? Because normally, post-war, one tends to think they are still within a certain degree of repair.

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Yes, and you will notice from the figures that there are considerably less post-war flats than there are pre-war. But unfortunately there are flats which have been vacant or in this condition for so long and been allowed to remain in disrepair for so long that unfortunately we are now in the situation where it is beyond the economical case to do them. If we look at it, you know, flats have been vacant since 1998, 2004, 2005, 2008, they have been left vacant/dormant for a long time and unfortunately that is what happens and that is the result.

480 **Hon. E J Reyes:** And just for my own clarification, Mr Speaker, what we are in summary saying is that, then there are currently no vacant homes that just require a little bit of refurbishment or fixing up to be allocated. On that one, the balance would be zero. There is zero in the stock, nothing in the pipeline that within a very reasonable length of time should be ready?

485 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, I am very happy and very proud to report that, given this Government's policy of the way that we deal with repairs to homes, that we now have a systematic method where as soon as houses become vacant and they need repairing they are repaired. Therefore we have none that are just sitting vacant and sitting dormant and not occupied by anybody, just because we are waiting for people to undertake the works. It maybe that some flats are in transition, that the works are being
490 undertaken and we are waiting for someone to move in or whatever, but it is not the case anymore that we just have flats that are vacant and just lying empty around Gibraltar.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, could I ask the hon. Lady in relation to the pre-war dwellings, which obviously is a greater figure, I wonder whether the Government has done some kind of a study to determine
495 whether there may be a number of them close together in a particular area, and given the caveat that the hon. Lady said, that from a Government point of view it is uneconomical to repair, whether a study by the Government or even the Housing Department has been carried out to say, 'Well, in such and such a location, which might be in the Upper Town, it is worth perhaps putting out to tender and perhaps allowing a number of people to either refurbish it or to demolish it and build a new one.' Has that been considered or
500 is it in the pipeline, Mr Speaker?

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, it is a study that I have already requested, actually, and I am waiting for the report back. So, I do not know how long it is going to take because it is not a study that I am undertaking, but it is certainly one that I have requested.

Q418/2015
Housing waiting lists and pre-list –
Breakdown of applicants

505 **Clerk:** Question 418, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Housing provide updated details in respect of the number of applicants on the housing waiting lists, inclusive of a separate breakdown for the medical and social list, showing the dates when they joined said lists?

510

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 419.

515

Clerk: Question 419, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Housing provide updated details in respect of the number of applicants on the housing pre-list?

520

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, there are 1,321 applicants on the waiting list, of which 187 are also on the medical and/or social lists. I will now hand the hon. Member a schedule containing the information requested.

525

In answer to Question 419, there are 588 applicants.

ANSWER TO QUESTION 418 OF 2015

Medical

2	2004
3	2006
1	2007
3	2008
5	2009
4	2010
24	2011
21	2012
31	2013
8	2014

Social

1	2000
1	2001
1	2005
3	2006
3	2007
3	2008
8	2009
10	2010
15	2011
18	2012
15	2013
7	2014

530

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, from my first look at the schedule, which refers obviously to the answers to the two questions bunched together, the Hon. Minister has provided me with the dates when the applicants – I gather I have made the right deduction – the dates when the applicants were placed either on the medical or the social list, but does that information not provide for when these applicants joined the general housing waiting list? Am I missing a page or the Minister has not got the information with her?

535 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, I think that when preparing the answer, they must have taken it – and I took it as well – as asking when people joined the social and medical lists, because that is in the information in relation to the social and medical list.

Mr Speaker, if that is the intention of the question, then that is further information that I can provide the hon. Member.

540 **Mr Speaker:** It seems as if the person who drafted the answer has only given the dates in respect of social and medical categories and not the general waiting list. I think it is the way that the question has been read. It could otherwise have been read as including, obviously, the general housing waiting list, but clearly that information is not available at the moment, but it is possible to obtain it.

545 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** It is not information that I have. The hon. Member can ask me on the next occasion or I can ask someone to prepare it. I certainly interpreted it in the way that it has been answered; otherwise, I would have asked for it to be amended, as I do with many other answers.

550 **Hon. E J Reyes:** No, Mr Speaker, I confirm it is my intention to have the dates for all the lists. The main thrust of the question was all the applicants on the housing list, a minor part of which, only 187, are also included in the medical and social list. But in the same way that one, at a glance, can deduct from here that for medical reasons there are people waiting *x*-number of years, we do not know how long really they have been waiting for that.

555 I appreciate and I accept that the hon. Lady does not have the answer with her now, but perhaps, Mr Speaker, during the course of this particular Parliament, if her Department could provide me with the information she could then table it through the Chair. I think we have done it in the past. It does get recorded in *Hansard* and it does provide me with the information that I really require.

Mr Speaker: The only thing of course is that it is a more exhaustive exercise.

560 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, I will make it available before the end of this Parliament.

Q421/2015

Lifts –

Installation and maintenance contracts

565 **Clerk:** Question 421, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, can the Government please provide details of all contracts relating to the installation and maintenance of lifts awarded since they were elected in existing Government estates and co-ownership estates currently being built by the Government identifying the name of the contractor, the contract price, whether that contract went out to tender and whether it was the cheapest tender for the taxpayer?

570

Clerk: Answer, the Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services.

575 **Minister for Tourism, Housing, Equality and Social Services (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, new lifts are being installed in the existing Government estates as part of HM Government of Gibraltar's refurbishment programme. The main contractor awarded the lift installation sub-contract packages to General Lifts Ltd. The award was made after the main contractor followed their own internal sub-contract tender and selection process, which is based on commercial decisions. It is not possible at this stage to provide the contract price due to commercial considerations, but it will be provided at the end of the works. The hon. Member should note that the price was considerably below the amounts paid previously for the same product to suppliers from outside Gibraltar.

580

No new maintenance contracts for existing Government estates have been awarded since coming into office.

585 In relation to the new co-ownership estates, Beach View Terraces and Mons Calpe Mews, the construction company have awarded the lift installation sub-contract packages to General Lifts Ltd for Beach View Terraces and to OTIS (Gibraltar) Limited for Mons Calpe Mews. These awards have been made after the main contractors have followed their internal sub-contract tender and selection processes and are based on commercial decisions. It is not possible to provide the contract prices at this stage due to commercial considerations, but the information will be provided at the end of the works.

590 There are no maintenance contracts for these developments either.

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, Mr Speaker, and were they the lowest? First of all, did they go out to tender? I do not think the information... Well, if she has provided it I apologise to the hon. Lady, but can she confirm that both of these went out to tender and also whether it was the lowest tender that won the award?

595

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman may have missed it when I said that the award was made after the main contractor followed their own internal sub-contract tender and the selection process is based on commercial decisions, and the same process applied the other ones.

600

I do recall saying somewhere that the price is considerably less than...where are we... Here, I did say, Mr Speaker, that the price was considerably below the amounts paid previously for the same product to suppliers from outside of Gibraltar.

605

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, Mr Speaker, but that is not exactly the question that I have asked. I have asked whether it was the cheapest tender, not whether the previous contract was more expensive, this being cheaper – the cheapest tender; because there may have been others who may have tendered and provided... I do not know – it may well be that this is the cheapest tender. That is what I am asking, which is information, I may add, that the Hon. the Minister for the Environment provided when I asked the mirror image of this question but in relation to solar panels, and he had no difficulty in providing me with the information that that was the lowest tender. *(Interjection and laughter)*

610

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, what the questions are about and what is behind them is transparent. I at least commend the hon. Gentleman in his commitment to transparency in that respect. *(Laughter)*

615

As I understand it, Mr Speaker, this was the lowest tender in any event in respect of each of the lifts – the ones for the Aerial Farm and the ones for the Coach Park. I believe in both instances they were the lowest tender.

620

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, the Hon. the Chief Minister has spoken about the Aerial Farm and the Coach Park. I think the hon. Lady mentioned – *(Interjection)* It is the same thing? Both of them are exactly the ones the Hon. the Chief Minister has provided, yes?

625

Hon. Chief Minister: One, the Aerial Farm, is Beach View Terraces, and the Coach Park is Mons Calpe Mews. We have done so many housing estates, Mr Speaker, in four years I forget whether this is Hassan Centenary Terraces, Bob Peliza House or one of...

630

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, in relation to Government estates, housing estates, which also forms part of this question – and I note that of course Laguna in particular and also Moorish Castle, there are installations of lifts there – that then has not been... there is no answer in respect of that part, or has he, because that is a...

635

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Yes, Mr Speaker, what I did say was that it is not possible at this stage to provide the contract price due to commercial considerations, but it will be provided at the end of the works.

640

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, Mr Speaker, that is exactly what I understood. The first part of the question related to Government estates, the second part of the question related to the new affordable homes being built by the Government, and in both these the answer was General Lifts... In relation to the second... The first one is General Lifts and the second one is General Lifts and Otis. That is why I have come back again at this, because I did understand the Chief Minister was... Because the Chief Minister was referring to something different.

645

Now in relation therefore to the allocation of the contract for lifts at Laguna and also Moorish Castle, which is different to the information provided by the Hon. the Chief Minister, was that also the cheapest tender? Because of course he has only addressed the question of the affordable homes.

650

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, I think that is the first time the hon. Gentleman has asked that particular supplementary, and the answer is yes: in relation to the refurbishment of the Government estates, it was the cheapest of all the tenders proposed. The reason behind not giving him the exact price at this stage is because there are other refurbishments envisaged and we want to keep our powder dry on costs because we are still going to try and drive an even better bargain for the taxpayer. But this was the cheapest of all the tenders and, given statements made by Mr Netto in the past about what the cost of a lift was, I think hon. Members will be surprised, when we are able to make the information available, that the cost of

a lift these days is very, very considerably less than it used to be – almost a third of what it was before and what hon. Members thought the cost of a lift had to be.

655 **Hon. J J Netto:** Does that include the building of a shaft as well, apart from the equipment of the lift? You see, what I am talking about, when I used to talk about the cost of the lift I was not just talking about the equipment of the lift in itself but the actual construction of the walls round it as well, so it was a complete package. So are we comparing like for like, or are we just comparing one aspect of the construction against what I used to say before?

660 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I think what the hon. Gentleman said at the time that he was explaining the cost of lifts as far as he was concerned is very clearly set out in *Hansard* and I am very confident that we are comparing apples and apples and not apples and pears.

Q422/2015
Gibraltar Bus Company –
Payments for advertisements on buses

Clerk: Question 422, the Hon. S M Figueras.

665 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Transport now provide this House with details of the amounts payable to the Gibraltar Bus Company by Big Publications Limited in respect of advertising on the buses sold by them, further to answers to Question 376/2015?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

670 **Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, the final amount has not yet been agreed by the directors of Big Publications Limited who are still reconciling it with their accounts. What has been agreed is that the amount due once reconciled and agreed will be paid by Big Publications as an amount due.

675 I invite the hon. Member to revisit this matter again at the next Question Time in this House.

Hon. S M Figueras: I suppose the lift contracts have to come in.

680 Mr Speaker, we have been at this particular issue for a while and I understand that the Minister can very simply dismiss the questions in saying this still has not been agreed. But does the Minister have any idea of what the figure that the Government expects it should receive is and give some indication, though I expect it might be difficult, of why it is that this is in dispute? Surely the tender process for the award of this contract was described by the Hon. the Minister for Employment when he had charge of this portfolio at the time, and he explained that Big Publications Limited tender was in fact the most sophisticated one in terms of pricing and in delivering revenue to the Government. As sophisticated as it is, it seems to be that there is a hesitance or a resistance to putting out there how much advertising they actually sold and therefore how much revenue is owing to the Government. I would ask the Minister whether perhaps he can give us an indication of the ball park we are talking about and why the difference exists in respect of a contract that was based on such a specific and sophisticated pricing system.

690 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, this is being handled by my office because it is a debt due to the Government.

695 Mr Speaker, the fact that it was a sophisticated equation is why it is taking time to ensure that both sides are agreed as to what the sum outstanding is. Now because we are at the stage where this has been negotiated to what I hope will be a very favourable conclusion indeed for the taxpayer we do not want to give any numbers out, but we are inviting the hon. Gentleman to ask us this question again with the caveat that what is now agreed, and which has been shared with Members across the floor, is that Big accept that there is a liability and they accept that once agreed... and the parameters not even in dispute but just being looked at by the parties to ensure that the account is agreed... is not a great disparity, and therefore there will be an amount agreed and paid or an agreement to pay it very shortly.

700 Things do not always happen in 30-day cycles. Now that we are all beneficiaries of monthly meetings of the House, and a meeting of the House is due again next month and not in six months as might have been the case in what I should just non-pejoratively for now call 'the old days', the hon. Gentleman can then ask the question again at the next Question Time and hopefully we will be able to give him the exact agreed amount and tell him when the commitment to pay will bite.

705 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, with all due respect to the Chief Minister and I am grateful for his intervention, there has been plenty of debate across the floor of this House as to the real benefit of coming here every month in the context of how the Opposition views the answers to some questions that the Government gives. **(Several Members:** Hear, hear.)

I am grateful, as I said, for the intervention but, Mr Speaker, the reality is that we have been here since
710 September last year and it is a substantial amount of time later and I have been very patient certainly and at every session where I have been invited to ask the question again, I have asked the question.

Is it possible for the Hon. the Chief Minister, who is dealing with this matter, to guarantee that we will in fact have that answer, that in fact the process is near enough completion that we can expect the answer to be given to us in July, post the Budget session, Mr Speaker?

715

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman asked me to do something which I would do for him as a friend if he needed to take a small loan, which is to guarantee his borrowing, but not something I am going to do when something is outside of my control.

I am pushing very hard indeed to have this amount agreed and paid as soon as possible and I sincerely expect – and that is why I have told him – that it is very likely to be possible by the next meeting of the House. In fact I had hoped it would be ready by this meeting of the House that is why we told him last month to do so. He has indicated that this has now taken some time and he is right, it has taken some time, and it needs to be resolved and we are keen to see it resolved, but he should not be surprised that issues like this take time.

720 For example, there is a £4 million loan which the previous Administration made to a company called OEM which we did not find out about, because even though there were meetings of this House less infrequently than there are now, the hon. Members when they were sitting on this side of the House gave even less information than they allege they get now.

725 That £4 million loan to OEM which I found out about after I became Chief Minister has not been repaid and is now one of the claims in the liquidation. So he should not be surprised that things are taking long, we are going to resolve this matter with Big in a much more satisfactory way than it would ever be possible to resolve the £4 million that they lent to a company that resulted in its directors... first off, buying themselves a Bentley before they did anything else with that money. *(Laughter)*

735 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker, let's not talk about £200,000 Bentleys because that is going to take us down a road that we do not want to go.

But, Mr Speaker, if the hon. Gentleman talks about loans that were provided and they only discovered but, Mr Speaker, they are completely and utterly opaque about £354 million that the Gibraltar Savings Bank, through Credit Finance, has in fact lent Gibraltar Investment Holdings –

740

Mr Speaker: Come now, come now! You are deviating completely from the subject matter and I will now allow any further supplementaries, or answers from the Government on any subject other than the question of the Gibraltar Bus Company and what it is owed. For heaven's sake!

745 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker.

Well, Mr Speaker, returning back to Big Publications, can he at the very least give us a finite date by when he will be in a position to provide an answer to this question, bearing in mind that some of the interests behind this particular company are also, obviously, very close to the Government, members of the GSLP; and indeed some of these interests are also the same interests behind the people that are being awarded the lifts – my previous question – and indeed some of them as well behind those who have been awarded the solar panel contracts, which I asked earlier as well.

750

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman just tries to be pejorative in everything that he does, even something as simple as asking a question.

755

Mr Speaker, of course I cannot give him a date by when this will be done although I have encouraged them to ask us again in 30 days because I believe it will be done by then. But if there were not an agreement, then it would not be possible to say anything in 30 days.

760

But I will tell him what would happen, that we will pursue this and recover this amount because it is a debt due to the Taxpayer. And the fact that somebody may owe money to the Government that, as he says, is close to the Government and has had – also in another capacity – contracts for lifts etc. is just a very good reason for him to know that we are going to get the money back; because we are very honourable people in the GSLP, Mr Speaker. He should remember when he was a Member of the GSLP that he used to describe us all as honourable people.

765 The fact that somebody is close to the Government means that that money is definitely going to be repaid because the Government is going to ensure that the Taxpayer loses out not one penny, Mr Speaker.

Not one penny, not the £4 million that we are never going to be able to see again in the loan granted by the hon. Members when they were here, to OEM.

770 And the hon. Member's suggestion that we should not talk about the directors of that company running out and buying a Bentley because we might have something to hide, encourages me to get up and say to him, 'Say what you have to say.' The last time I checked, no Member of this Government and no supporter of this Government has gone out to buy *any* Bentley with any money that belongs to the Taxpayer.

775 But if he has an allegation to make – (*Interjection by Mr Speaker*) well, maybe, Mr Speaker, I do not know; but you see I do not get £100,000 from supporters of mine to pay for reports who I then do not disclose, (*Interjection*) but he is now making a nervous laughter about this. If he has any allegation to make about any Bentley or anything else, let him get up and have the courage of his convictions to make it. Let him get up and tell the public what it is that he is alluding to, because this sniggering and suggesting beholds him no good, Mr Speaker.

Q423/2015
Advertising on bus stops –
Maintenance management

780 **Clerk:** Question 423/2015, the Hon. S M Figueras.

Hon. S M Figueras: Can the Minister for Transport say who is managing the maintenance of advertising on bus stops?

785 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban): Mr Speaker, there is no contract currently in place for this purpose. The process discontinued following the termination of the Big Publications contract. The Gibraltar Bus Company has sought out expressions of interest and is in the process of identifying the most viable option before entering into a new contract.

790 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, can the hon. Minister say whether this is in fact currently – or going to turn out to be – a tender process of the sort that we saw in 2012?

795 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, what is going to happen is that we have actually contacted companies, in fact that we have had expressions of interest from, companies who have wanted to show their interest to Government as to advertising on bus stops.

So what the Government is doing actually at the moment, the stage we are at the moment, is seeking their expressions of interest, seeking what they have on offer and seeing what is available out there.

800 So it is still at the very, very early stages. In fact it only happened a few weeks ago, so we are waiting for them to come back to us.

805 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Can the Minister say whether the Government might be persuaded to relaunch a tender process to formally invite bids, or expressions of interest, from others who may not be as forward as the companies that he has alluded to?

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, the procedure that is being followed is that all of those who tendered the last time that the tender was put out, are being contacted and asked to resubmit because the party that was awarded the tender is no longer able to discharge its obligations.

810 So it is not a formal open tender, it is just being in contact with all those who bid. I think there were five bidders from memory, so the other four are being contacted. In fact as I told the House last time, there is that option and the option that the Government may do it itself, in-house, which is being assessed.

815 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Yes I wonder, Mr Speaker, just before moving on to the next question, whether perhaps the Government will contemplate the possibility that there may be – and there may well not be – other potential tenderers out there who might be interested in pursuing or in formulating a bid for the work. It may well be that is not the case, but I am merely urging the Government to consider it as an option, and I am certain it is not something of controversy across the floor.

Mr Speaker, the original reason behind asking this question was because I note from driving around, that bus stops are still bedecked – if that is the word – with advertising on them, and in fact I had remarked

820 a couple of weeks ago how some of the bus stops were in rather a poor state of repair in terms of the adverts being peeled off, whether by a process of nature or vandalism.

I do have to say that I have spotted that some of them are improved, but I would ask the Minister whether this is a process that the Bus Company has embarked upon of removing those adverts for which no revenue I suspect is being received any more, given that the contract ended in September, and whether it is
825 in fact something that the Bus Company is currently embarked upon in terms of making sure that the bus stops look as good as they can be, given the investment in the infrastructure that that represented?

Hon. P J Balban: Mr Speaker, as the hon. Member rightly states and has noticed himself, recently there was some maintenance that took place at the bus stops. They were cleaned and any parts of the advertising
830 that was in a bad state was removed.

Now what we are looking at is as part of the expressions of interest, we are looking at the persons interested who will eventually take up this tender to actually remove the adverts for us once they are engaged, in the hope that it will save us some money because there is some expense in removing all these adverts from the bus stops themselves.

835 So as I said, what we are trying to do as part of the negotiation with the companies, is to ask them to remove... obviously because they will have to remove them, before they affix their new adverts on the bus stops.

Q424/2015
Government car fleet –
Figures and emissions

Clerk: Question 424, the Hon. J J Netto.

840

Hon. J J Netto: Can the Government provide the figures for cars bought for its fleet of vehicles in all Government Departments, Authorities, Agencies and Government-owned companies since January 2012, broken down by the following grams of emission of CO₂ per kilometre: (a) less than 100gr/km; (b) 100-120; (c) 120-140; (d) 140-160; (e) 160-200; (f) above 200; (g) per year; and (h) per organisation?

845

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban): Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is contained in the schedule that I now hand over.

850

Mr Speaker: This is a very lengthy schedule so I suggest that we move on to the next question and I will allow the hon. Member if he has any supplementaries arising from the information he can pursue it. Okay? So Question 425.

ANSWER TO QUESTION 424/2015

Department	Reg No	DateofRegGib	Make & Model	Engine	CO2 gr/km
GIC	G1258E	10/04/2015	DAF/NTM Large Refuse Truck	6700	Above 200
Technical Services	G1716E	26/03/2015	Renault Kangoo	1500	120-140
Technical Services	G1718E	26/03/2015	Renault Kangoo	1500	120-140
Sport & Leisure Authority	G9039D	06/03/2015	DFSK V21	1300	160-200
Ministry Of Environment	G1385E	27/02/2015	DFSK Pick-Up Van	1300	160-200
Ministry Of Environment	G1386E	27/02/2015	DFSK Pick-Up Van	1300	160-200
Ministry Of Environment	G1489E	23/02/2015	VW Amarok	1968	160-200
Firebrigade	G1179E	22/01/2015	Mercedes Benz Sprinter 310 CDI Panel Van MW	2143	Above 200
Technical Services	G9922D	16/12/2014	Renault Kangoo Glass Van	1500	120-140
Technical Services	G9923D	16/12/2014	Renault Kangoo Glass Van	1500	120-140
Ministry for Housing	G9842D	15/12/2014	Renault Kangoo Glass Van	1500	120-140
Ministry Of Environment	G9839D	09/12/2014	Renault Kangoo Van	1500	120-140
Ministry Of Environment	G9840D	09/12/2014	Renault Kangoo Van	1500	120-140
Ministry Of Environment	G9841D	09/12/2014	Renault Kangoo Glass Van	1500	120-140
RGP	G9015D	21/08/2014	Mercedes-Benz E Class BT 300 Hybrid	2143	100-120
Care Agency	G8636D	15/07/2014	Renault Kangoo	1500	120-140
Care Agency	G8437D	27/06/2014	Renault Kangoo	1500	120-140
Ministry Of Environment	G8245D	05/06/2014	SSANG YONG Korando Sports	1998	140-160
Electrical Authority	G8034D	06/05/2014	Mercedes Sprinter	2143	Above 200
Care Agency	G7969D	22/04/2014	Renault Kangoo	1500	120-140
Care Agency	G7970D	22/04/2014	Renault Kangoo	1500	120-140
Care Agency	G7971D	22/04/2014	Renault Kangoo	1500	120-140
Social Security	G7836D	04/04/2014	Dacia Dokker OSDN45	1500	100-120
Care Agency	G7710D	19/03/2014	Dacia Lodgy	1500	100-120
GHA	G7517D	19/03/2014	Renault Dacia Lodge	1500	100-120
IT & Logistics Dept	G7703D	19/03/2014	Dacia Lodgy	1500	100-120
Tourist Office	G7692D	18/03/2014	Renault Traffic	1995	160-200
Ministry Of Environment	G7604D	13/03/2014	Suzuki Carry PUV	1600	120-140
Gib Car Parks Ltd	G7668D	12/03/2014	Renault Kangoo	1500	140-160
Prison	G7516D	03/03/2014	Renault Master	2299	Above 200
Ministry Of Environment	G7452D	25/02/2014	Suzuki Glass Van	1600	120-140
Electrical Authority	G7374D	17/02/2014	Ford Focus Trend	998	100-120
Customs	G7143D	30/01/2014	Renault Traffic	1995	160-200
GHA	G7144D	24/12/2013	Volkswagen Carter TDI 2.0	2000	Above 200
GHA	G7173D	24/12/2013	Volkswagen Carter TDI 2.0	2000	Above 200
Technical Services(Garage)	G5006	18/12/2013	Mercedes-Benz E Class BT 300 Hybrid	2143	100-120
Port Authority	G6862D	19/11/2013	Mitsubishi L200	2477	160-200
No 6 Convent Place	G1	15/10/2013	Tesla Model S(Electric)	0	Less than 100
Customs	G5979D	04/10/2013	Volkswagen Amarok	1968	160-200
GHA	G6483D	01/10/2013	Volkswagen Transporter	1968	160-200
GHA	G6482D	27/09/2013	Volkswagen Transporter	1968	160-200
GGCCL	G6227D	23/09/2013	Tata Indica	1400	140-160
GGCCL	G6228D	23/09/2013	Tata Indica	1400	140-160
Education	G6361D	16/09/2013	Renault Master	2299	Above 200
Technical Services(Garage)	G5001	04/09/2013	Mercedes-Benz E Class BT 300 Hybrid	2143	100-120
Technical Services(Garage)	G5002	04/09/2013	Mercedes-Benz E Class BT 300 Hybrid	2143	100-120
Technical Services(Garage)	G5003	04/09/2013	Mercedes-Benz E Class BT 300 Hybrid	2143	100-120
Technical Services(Garage)	G5004	02/09/2013	Toyota Prius Plug-in	1745	Less than 100
Technical Services(Garage)	G5005	02/09/2013	Toyota Prius Plug-in	1745	Less than 100
Treasury	G6123D	30/08/2013	Renault Kangoo Glass Van	1500	120-140
Customs	G6079D	16/08/2013	Ford C-Max Trend 1.0i	998	100-120
Customs	G6080D	16/08/2013	Ford C-Max Trend 1.0i	998	100-120
Customs	G6081D	16/08/2013	Ford C-Max Trend 1.0i	998	100-120
Customs	G6082D	16/08/2013	Ford C-Max Trend 1.0i	998	100-120
Customs	G6083D	16/08/2013	Ford C-Max Trend 1.0i	998	100-120
Tourist Office	G5905D	19/07/2013	Mitsubishi L200 Pick-Up	2477	Above 200
Border and Coastguard Agency	G4878D	19/03/2013	Renault Kangoo Glass Van	1500	140-160
GGSSL	G4792D	19/03/2013	ISUZU Skip Lorry	5193	Above 200
GHA	G4875D	08/03/2013	Renault Kangoo Glass Van	1500	140-160
Gib Car Parks Ltd	G4874D	08/03/2013	Renault Kangoo Glass Van	1500	140-160
Human Resources	G4873D	08/03/2013	Renault Kangoo Glass Van	1500	140-160
Port Authority	G4877D	08/03/2013	Renault Kangoo Glass Van	1500	140-160
Ministry Of Environment	G4876D	07/03/2013	Renault Kangoo Glass Van	1500	140-160
Tourist Office	G4671D	05/02/2013	Renault Traffic	1995	160-200
Firebrigade	G4665D	31/01/2013	Land Rover Defender Pick-Up	2198	Above 200
Electrical Authority	G4437D	20/12/2012	Suzuki Pickup Van	1600	120-140
Electrical Authority	G3678D	04/09/2012	HYUNDAI	1100	100-120
Electrical Authority	G3679D	04/09/2012	HYUNDAI	1100	100-120
Electrical Authority	G3551D	10/08/2012	Suzuki Glass Van	1600	120-140

Department	Reg No.	Date of Reg Gib	Make & Model	Engine	CO2 gr/km
Electrical Authority	G3552D	10/08/2012	Suzuki Glass Van	1600	120-140
Electrical Authority	G3553D	10/08/2012	Suzuki Glass Van	1600	120-140
Electrical Authority	G3554D	10/08/2012	Suzuki Glass Van	1600	120-140
GHA	G3226D	02/07/2012	RENAULT TRAFIC	2464	160-200
GHA	G3227D	02/07/2012	RENAULT TRAFIC	2464	160-200
GHA	G3228D	02/07/2012	RENAULT TRAFIC	2464	160-200
Tourist Office	G2671D	03/05/2012	Renault Traffic	1995	160-200
GGSSL	G2602D	26/04/2012	TOYOTA DYNA Drop Side Lorry	3000	Above 200
GGSSL	G2603D	26/04/2012	TOYOTA DYNA Drop Side Lorry	3000	Above 200
GIC	G2416D	18/04/2012	Toyota Dyna 2000	4000	Above 200
GIC	G2496D	18/04/2012	Toyota Dyna 2000	4000	Above 200
GGSSL	G2409D	20/03/2012	CARRY 1.6 PICK UP SUZUKI	1600	120-140
GGSSL	G2410D	20/03/2012	CARRY Glass Van 1.6 SUZUKI	1600	120-140
GGSSL	G2411D	20/03/2012	CARRY Glass Van 1.6 SUZUKI	1600	120-140
GGSSL	G2412D	20/03/2012	CARRY 1.6 PICK UP SUZUKI	1600	120-140
GGSSL	G2414D	20/03/2012	CARRY 1.6 PICK UP SUZUKI	1600	120-140
Ministry Of Employment	G2413D	20/03/2012	CARRY 1.6 PICK UP SUZUKI	1600	120-140
RGP	G1591D	20/01/2012	Ford Transit	2200	160-200
RGP	G1592D	20/01/2012	Ford Transit	2200	160-200
RGP	G1593D	20/01/2012	Ford Transit	2200	160-200

Q425/2015
Hybrid car purchase –
Public and private sector figures

855 **Clerk:** Question 425, the Hon. J J Netto.

Hon. J J Netto: Can the Government state how many electric and hybrid cars have been purchased in Gibraltar, broken down in the public and private sector by year since 2012?

860 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services.

Minister for Transport, Traffic and Technical Services (Hon. P J Balban): Mr Speaker, since 2012, the following cars have been registered as electric and hybrid by the public and private sector.

865 The public sector: 2012 – no hybrids; electric – no electric; 2013 – six hybrids, one electric; 2014 – no hybrids and no electric; 2015 – no hybrids and no electric. That concludes the public sector.

The private sector: in 2012, we had no hybrids, one electric; in 2013 we had one hybrid and one electric; 2014 – 19 hybrids and two electric; and 2015 – 18 hybrids and two electric.

870 **Hon. S M Figueras:** Mr Speaker, in relation to, if I may, Question 425, is the Minister able to say – and I suspect he may not, but I will ask anyway – whether he can say that of those vehicles purchased in the private sector, or rather privately because I think that is what the question was alluding to, whether these are corporate registrations versus personal registrations?

875 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, I would have no idea whether they are corporate or personal.

Hon. S M Figueras: Mr Speaker in relation to... and it arises from the reference to electric cars in the question, but it is a question which may be a little too general. With the Chair's indulgence I will ask it and it may well be that it is not allowed.

880 But is the Minister able to say whether the Electricity Authority is embarked upon any programme of delivering infrastructure that can be taken advantage of by people looking to purchase electric cars? Because of course you are going to need electricity points to plug it into, and the infrastructure currently, as far as I am aware certainly, is not in place, save for in a limited number of locations, in particular the car park down in the south district.

885 Is this something – and again, he may not have the information – is this something that the Electricity Authority is embarked upon in terms of delivering solutions to existing estates, to help people take advantage of the incentive that exists for the purchase of eco-friendly vehicles?

890 **Mr Speaker:** It does not arise from the original question, but because I am in a generous mood (*Laughter*) I will allow it if the Minister has the answer. (*Laughter*)

Hon. P J Balban: Mr Speaker, all of the garages or the car parks built recently, during our term in office, have included infrastructure for electric vehicles. In fact (*Interjection*) some of them even have the electric points available, but as yet nobody I believe has actually taken advantage of it.

895 Having said that the garages itself are all wired up. For example, Engineer Lane car park, Theatre Royal car park, so if in the future anyone decides that they want to buy an electric vehicle, they can do so.

There are, I think I am not mistaken, there may be a car park or two whereby people may need to swap from one parking bay to another, and that is clearly implicit in the contract they signed, on a monthly basis, that they may need to move in the future but most car parks have the infrastructure already installed.

FINANCIAL SERVICES AND GAMING

Q426/2015

Financial Services Ombudsman – Plans for creation of office

900 **Clerk:** Question 426, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: This question is directed to the Minister for Financial Services; is this going to be answered by Mr Licudi? Okay.

905 Does the Minister for Financial Services have any plans to create the Office of Financial Services Ombudsman?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice and International Exchange of Information on behalf of the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services and Gaming.

910 **Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, the drafting of the Bill is in its final stages.

915 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Yes, and in fact it is a... I did not realise this when I posed the question, but it is actually a manifesto commitment of the Government, it is at page 65, to set it up. I am sure the Minister had a hand in drafting that particular section of the manifesto.

Is he able to tell the House when he expects that it will be in Bill form – given that we are pretty much at the tail end of this Parliament – in Bill form to be able to have a look at it and hopefully pass it unanimously?

920 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, I am afraid I do not have that information. Although I know that the Bill is in the final stages of drafting, I am not sure what will happen in terms of possible consultation on the Bill. So there is a possibility that there may be some consultation before the Bill is actually published, and the matter then comes before Parliament. Because I am not directly handling this matter, I do not have the information available.

925 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Is he able to express any confidence as to whether he will be able to comply with the manifesto commitment which is very specific in terms of the timings, and that is that it would be up and running during the course of this Parliament?

930 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, yes we have every indication that it is going to be possible to have that legislative framework in place in time for the end of the lifetime of this Parliament, which is not as soon as some people might wish to expect it.

Q427/2015

Gibraltar Deposit Guarantee Scheme – Revision of legislation

935 **Clerk:** Question 427, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Financial Services advise whether the Gibraltar Deposit Guarantee Scheme legislation is due to be revised?

940 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information on behalf of the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services and Gaming.

Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Yes, Mr Speaker. The arrangements for the transposition of the Deposit Guarantee Scheme Directive (2014/49/EU) are in hand in keeping with our commitment to remain up to date with our EU obligations and will be given effect by regulation by 3rd July 2015.

945

Hon. D J Bossino: One of the reasons why – I am grateful for the answer – I raise these points, Mr Speaker in questions is because as I understand it there was a promise by... I am not sure who the appropriate party would be, whether it is the FSC or the Government or both in relation to a consultation with the industry. I have had certain complaints coming to me that there has not been any commencement of consultation in relation to this.

950

This is an important piece of legislation which could potentially have quite significant effects on, for example, banking and I am told by those in the industry that the promised consultation has not happened. I am not sure whether the Minister is able to assist in this regard. I know he is not the Minister dealing with this and it may just not have been a promise which emanated from the Government, and in fact it came from the FSC. But if he could give an indication in relation to the point I have raised, in relation specifically to consultation?

955

Hon. G H Licudi: Mr Speaker, I am not familiar with what the hon. Member is alluding to in terms of a promise by the Government for the FSC, I just do not know whether that is in fact the case or whether either have made that promise.

960

Certainly it is the case – and it was the case, and it continues to be the case, and it was the case when I was Minister for Financial Services, and it continues to be the case – that anything that affects the industry is subject to close consultation with all industry members.

The important thing to note in this particular case is that we are talking of a Directive (**A Member: I know.**) and given that we have a Directive and there is a reference in the answer itself to 3rd July 2015 which means that – and I must assume – that is the transposition, the last transposition date, and therefore there is a commitment to give effect to this Directive by regulation by that particular date.

965

But what we are doing is giving effect to an EU obligation and therefore that is what the Government is transposing, with this transposition, by the due date which is 3rd July 2015. But I can certainly assure the hon. Member that anything that the Government does that affects the industry will be subject to consultation with industry members.

970

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, yes. Again I am grateful for the answer, but of course this is a Directive so there will be certain elements of the Directive which as I understand it – I am far from an EU expert – but given that it is not an EU Regulation which is of direct effect, it has to be passed by our national Parliament, which is this one.

975

There is a possibility through consultation to amend the Directive slightly, I think it gives you broad parameters but you then implement it in the manner and the fashion which is more appropriate to your particular jurisdiction, and in this regard I am trying to – this is really a comment, it is really not a question – so I am trying to abide by the rules of the House and transform it into a question.

980

Can I encourage the Minister to carry out the consultation? I know again he is not responsible as the Hon. Mr Isola is not in this House today to carry out the consultation, but I think it is absolutely important because this is a piece of legislation which as I said earlier, will have significant ramifications and effects.

985

Hon. G H Licudi: Mr Speaker, I personally am not familiar with this particular Directive but the hon. Member says that this is a Directive that does not have direct effect and therefore there is an element of flexibility.

That could be true in a number of respects. There are some Directives that give options... that say what needs to be implemented and give options as to how it is done and then it is up to the Member State. And it is also possible, when we implement certain Directives, that the Government as a matter of policy decides to introduce additional matters in the regulation – or, rather, in the transposition of that Directive. It is unusual if we are doing it by regulation because if we are doing it by regulation what we are doing is transposing the Directive itself.

990

All I can do, Mr Speaker, not being familiar with the particular Directive, is to say that to the extent that there are options which would make it advisable to have consultation with the industry, that consultation would certainly take effect.

995

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, bearing in mind that we are talking about a very short time span because it is 3rd July, so we are less than a month away from when the Directive has to be implemented, presumably that consultation is already taking place, otherwise it is not going to be much of a consultation exercise, bearing in mind it has got to be implemented on 3rd July.

1000

Presumably that is precisely why the Government is actually implementing this Directive by way of regulation rather than publishing a Bill, because probably it is going to be done on an urgent basis.

I wonder whether the hon. Member or the Chief Minister can help with that?

1005

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, we have a Deposit Guarantee Act which deals with the Deposit Guarantee Directive of 1994. What the Commission has done is re-issue the Directive with certain amendments. It is those amendments that now have to be given effect to and a very short time has been given for some of the amendments.

1010

A Directive which was published in April gives immediate effect to certain parts of it, effect to be given by 4th July this year to other parts of it, and effect to be given by May 2016 to other parts of the amendment.

1015

What the Government is doing is complying with the obligation to introduce the amendments necessary at this stage, and if necessary can consult further in the future in relation to the amendments that do not have to be brought in by July of this year. But there were three relevant dates in the Directive: immediately, and that relates to the parts of the Directive which were recast and had already passed their transposition deadline from the 1994 Directive; the short deadline for July; and the longer deadline for May of next year.

1020

So, Mr Speaker, the hon. Members can rest assured that the Government is not going to do anything which is going to damage an industry which we all in this House support, with our short deadlines as a need to comply, but what we will have to do here is simply amend an existing piece of legislation – an existing piece of subsidiary legislation if necessary, in order to give effect to these amendments which are externally required.

1025

This is not an area where there is much leeway for the Government to consider – as the Hon. the Minister for Justice said a few moments ago – what the national legislature or the national government may want to do. It may be that there is some leeway in some of the requirements which we still have to bring in by May 2016, but not otherwise.

Q428/2015
FSC supervisory activities –
Independent review team

Clerk: Question 428, the Hon. D J Bossino.

1030

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Financial Services please state when he expects to be in a position to advise who the independent team of professionals to carry out the review of the FSC's supervisory activities are?

1035

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information on behalf of the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services and Gaming.

1040

Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, the process was commenced some months ago and we are evaluating the various options, and we hope to be in a position to make an announcement shortly.

1045

Hon. D J Bossino: Shortly, Mr Speaker. It must be pretty soon because the announcement made by the Minister as quoted by the *Gibraltar Chronicle* is, 'I think the supervisory work is expected to start sometime in the autumn.'

So within that timeframe, is he able to give me any further assistance as to when the team is going to be announced. And as a secondary supplementary, if I may, can he at least tell this House whether these individuals are likely to be from outside Gibraltar in their entirety, or will there be a mix, or will it be exclusively from Gibraltar?

1050

Hon. G H Licudi: Mr Speaker, again I express the caveat that I am only standing in for the Minister for Financial Services who is dealing with this matter, and I have no direct knowledge other than the fact that this is clearly something that I had looked at when I was Minister for Financial Services.

1055

There are things to finalise such as terms of reference – the specific terms of reference of the individuals as to what exactly the review is going to cover – and I would expect that that is what is being finalised and therefore once the terms of reference are fully agreed with the individuals, then the announcement as to the makeup of the review team will be made.

But as the answer says, we are not yet in a position to make that announcement because those things are still being finalised.

1060 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I am not sure whether he has answered the second supplementary, which is the providence of the individuals who are likely to form part of this group.

Hon. G H Licudi: Mr Speaker, because I am not directly involved I would be speculating, but I would expect them to be individuals from outside Gibraltar.

Q429/2015

**Bermuda Captive Conference –
Gibraltar insurance professional attendees**

1065 **Clerk:** Question 429, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Minister for Financial Services please state who the Gibraltar insurance professionals who attended with him at the Bermuda Captive Conference were?

1070 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice and International Exchange of Information on behalf of the Hon. the Minister for Financial Services and Gaming.

Minister for Education and Justice and International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, the professionals were from Messrs EY, Hassans and Quest Insurance Management (Gibraltar) Limited.

**EDUCATION AND JUSTICE &
INTERNATIONAL EXCHANGE OF INFORMATION**

Q430/2015

**Students dropping out of school –
Numbers**

1075 **Clerk:** Question 430, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1080 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Education state how many students dropped out of school during the academic year 2014-15, providing a breakdown showing the pupils' school year in which they were enrolled and educational establishment?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information.

1085 **Minister for Education and Justice & International Exchange of Information (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, no pupils have dropped out of school during the academic year 2014-15.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, perhaps I have not worded my question properly. Yes, because they did not drop out during the actual academic year.

1090 Is the Minister of Education aware of any students who have dropped out on completion of year 10 and therefore did not continue education into year 11? That could have happened in the summer months, which perhaps, strictly speaking, may not be during the academic year.

1095 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Member talks of 'dropping out of school' and the question that I asked the professionals at the Department when I saw this question is: what does 'dropping out of school' mean?

'Dropping out of school', I was advised, does not mean finishing school after the age at which compulsory education has been reached, because in that case we could say pupils finish their A-levels and then drop out of school, or they finish their GCSEs and then drop out of school. I am advised that that is not

1100 what it means, that it means pupils of school age dropping out of school and not continuing their education when they have to, and that is why the answer is that no pupils have dropped out of school.

1105 If the question is how many students have stopped schooling after reaching the end of their compulsory schooling age and not completed, for example, in year 10, there are a number – I have been given some information for supplementary – there are a number that leave on year 10. But, for example, they might leave because at the end of year 10 they go to an independent school or because the family is relocating or because employment has been sought. So there are different reasons why pupils stop their school education, particularly in year 10. But it does not happen just in year 10: in year 9, year 8 you get families that relocate and pupils stop attending school in Gibraltar. It happens even in first school and middle schools, where pupils leave for the UK, leave for the Philippines, leave for New Zealand or leave for Poland. These are children who are in education in Gibraltar and stop being in education in Gibraltar at various stages. We would not describe them as school drop-outs, as the hon. Member has called them.

1110 I am certainly happy to have a further discussion with the hon. Member if there is a specific area that he wants, in particular if what he wants to know is having finished year 10 and not going on to year 11. If that is what he means then I am certainly happy to get that information for him.

1115 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, in my haste of drafting up the question I have used the words that have been used in previous questions by Members on both sides of this House going back years, but I accept and have absolutely no quarrel with the Minister's advice given by educators of what could really be understood by 'dropping out of school'.

1120 The most important part of the question, or the information I was seeking through this question, was pupils who have commenced education and have left before the completion of the academic year and therefore not sat down for what we commonly refer to as public examinations. There are at times, reasons, as I think the Minister was hinting at, that it could be that they simply move away from Gibraltar – either the family packs up and goes elsewhere and they seek a new life in another country – or some families decide to send the children to another educational establishment outside of Gibraltar. And although those do happen from year to year, the ones that I am interested in, as they were interested in when they were in Opposition, is how many students left not for reasons that they were leaving Gibraltar but having attained the age of 15, which is the age limit beyond which it is no longer compulsory in education, how many have actually left. Did they belong to year 10 or year 11? Therefore one concludes that they decided to either seek employment or do something very similar but not quite complete the whole academic process and sit for public examinations.

1130 If he does have that information that he can furnish me... If not, Mr Speaker, I can think about this properly and at the next parliamentary session draw up a question subdivided into areas, if that is what I am looking for. But if he does have something at hand that he finds could be interesting for all of us at large, I would be grateful. If not, I will have to wait.

1140 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, I have quite a lot of information, such as the examples that I have given the hon. Member. The information I do not have is by age. I have by years and by reasons like relocating, independent schools etc. I do not have the information by age, but certainly there is no problem in obtaining that information for the hon. Member now that I understand what exactly he wants.

Mr Speaker: The Leader of the Opposition gave notice under Standing Order 62 that they require Questions 385 and 386 and 393 to 397 inclusive to be postponed to this meeting of Parliament, and these are the ones that we are now going to deal with.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, TELECOMMUNICATIONS & THE GSB

Q385/2015

WOPS –

Government manifesto commitment

1145 **Clerk:** Question 385, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, Mr Speaker. Has the Government implemented its manifesto commitment on WOPS?

1150 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, the changes to the Pensions (Widows and Orphans) Act is currently drafted and it is expected to be published soon.

1155

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, can the hon. Gentleman confirm that it is going to be published in time for it to be passed by this Parliament prior to dissolution of Parliament later on this year?

Hon. J J Bossano: I would expect it to be so, yes.

Q386/2015

**Employees in public service –
Permanent increases in numbers**

1160 **Clerk:** Question 386, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, what permanent increases have there been in numbers of employees in the public service since 11th December 2011, broken down by reference to the Civil Service, the GDC, any other Government company, public authority or entity for which the Government is accountable?

1165

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, the figures for 1st April are not yet available.

1170

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, it is now 17th June. Why are the figures for 1st April not available? And indeed, as a second supplementary, what is the last date for figures that he has? If it is not 1st April, does he have 1st March for example?

1175

Hon. J J Bossano: Mr Speaker, I do not have as from 1st March because these figures are calculated on a quarterly basis – as he knows, because it was what was happening when he was in Government. The last quarter I have got is the one I have already given him, which was on 1st January. It is not ready not because I do not know what day it is; it is because the people in the Statistics Office have had more pressing matters to deal with and that is the answer that I have got.

1180

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, the figures are quarterly, so it is April. Does he know when those figures are going to be provided and can he tell somebody from his Department to provide them to me as soon as they have them ready? I presume that they are not going to be ready before the Budget. I had hoped that the hon. Gentleman would have been able to provide these figures so that I can incorporate the figures in my Budget speech. That is not going to be possible, but at the very least, will those figures be provided prior to, for example, the parliamentary break in August?

1185

Hon. J J Bossano: Mr Speaker, they will do it as soon as they can, but I cannot tell him when that will be.

Q393-397/2015

**Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited –
Fixed Rate Notes**

1190 **Clerk:** Question 393, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker: please provide details of all Fixed Rate Loan Notes issued by or other loans made to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited by Credit Finance Company Limited, including the date the note was issued or the loan made as the case may be, and the date such loan or loans was redeemed or assigned?

1195

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.

1200 **Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):**
Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 394 to 397.

Clerk: Question 394, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1205 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Please provide details of all Fixed Rate Notes issued by or other loans made to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited by the Gibraltar Savings Bank, including the date the note was issued or the loan was made as the case may be and the date they were redeemed or assigned?

Clerk: Question 395, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1210 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm that the £355 million shown as 'call deposits with Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited' in Table CF. 2 Credit Finance Company Limited, is a debt due by Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited to Credit Finance Company Limited?

Clerk: Question 396, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1215 **Hon. D A Feetham:** What security has Credit Finance Company Limited obtained in respect of any debts due to it from Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited?

Clerk: Question 397, the Hon. D A Feetham.

1220 **Hon. D A Feetham:** What equity investment out of the consolidated fund is envisaged by the Government in Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited for the forthcoming year?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.

1225 **Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):**
Mr Speaker, the FRNs issued and redeemed by Credit Finance are as follows:

Date	Issued £M	Redeemed £M
March 2013	245.390	
April	32.454	
May	12.5	
June	9	
July	12.5	
August	2.5	
September	4.5	
October	19	
November	30	10
January 2015		1
February		3
March		40

1230 In respect of FRN's issued and redeemed by the Gibraltar Savings Bank:

Date	Issued £M	Redeemed £M
March 2012	12.5	
April	37.579	12.5
May	6.719	
June	6.847	40.5
July	25.573	
August	8.925	
September	13.301	48.5
October	9.84	10.1
November	7.368	6.53
December	4.754	5.07
January 2013	42.473	
February	12.737	
March		65.416

The £355 million call deposits with GIH consists part of the pooling of cash holdings of Government Authorities, Agencies and Companies which have been traditionally managed by the Treasury.

1235 No formal security has been registered. Repayment is secured on the assets held by Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited.

A token figure is contained in the draft estimates of expenditure which the Members opposite have on a confidential basis until the estimates are debated and approved in respect of the shareholding that is.

1240 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, dealing with the answer that the hon. Gentleman has provided to Question 393 and also 394, which is the Fixed Rate Notes that are issued, in Question 393 by Credit Finance in favour of Gibraltar Investment (Holdings), for which my total is £355 million after you take into account the redemptions more or less, and then also the Fixed Rate Notes that were issued in the past by the Gibraltar Savings Bank to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings). Fixed Rate Notes are effectively loans that are
1245 being provided by Credit Finance to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited, evidenced presumably by some paper that represents the Fixed Rate Note – is that not the position?

Hon. J J Bossano: Well, it is not fixed, it is flexible, so there is not a fixed rate in fact.

1250 There is an exchange of documents. I do not do these things myself but I imagine that there is an exchange of documents. In the past what used to happen was that when there was a pooling of cash within the public sector entities this was treated as advances and deposits and there was no actual payment in respect of the value of the use of that money. That is what is different in the case of the Savings Bank and Credit Finance, because they are institutions that are expected to make a profit. But, for example, where there is money that is advanced either from the consolidated fund to companies or from authorities and
1255 agencies to companies, or vice versa, there is no rate of interest.

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, Mr Speaker, I am familiar with the term ‘Flexible Rate Notes’, and indeed had I just simply read ‘FRN’ I would have thought that is a Flexible Rate Note, because that is the type of notes that are issued by banks in particular. But of course he has answered this question in the past when he
1260 has provided me with schedules in the past about how the money of Credit Finance is invested in particular, and also the Gibraltar... Sorry, not Credit Finance – the Gibraltar Savings Bank. And in all the schedules that he has provided me with, at the very bottom, where it deals with the loan notes issued to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings), it says ‘Fixed Rate Note’. It does not say ‘Flexible Rate Note’; it says ‘Fixed Rate Note’. So the implication is that of course there is a fixed rate, probably for a fixed period of time and a
1265 fixed rate of interest that is going to be paid over a period of time.

Can he explain why it has been described as a ‘Fixed Rate Note’ in all the answers that he has given me and now, all of a sudden, it has become a *Flexible* Rate Note, which is slightly different?

1270 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, the answer is because to call it a Fixed Rate Note is wrong and they have always been flexible.

Hon. D A Feetham: Okay, Mr Speaker, so the answers that he has been providing me with over the last few years have been wrong in this regard and he is now providing me with the right answer; I accept that. But, of course, whether it is fixed or flexible there must be some rate of return that, in this case, Gibraltar
1275 Investment (Holdings) is paying Credit Finance Company Limited and was paying the Gibraltar Savings Bank before 2013. Can he provide me with some information in relation to that, please?

Hon. J J Bossano: I give it to him every month, Mr Speaker.

1280 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Can he provide me with the information again? What is the rate that is being provided, and also the period of time as well? In other words, when do these Flexible Rate Notes mature? When do they have to be repaid back? Because at some stage they are going to have to be repaid back.

1285 One does not, for example... A bank does not... Well, it could if it is a revolving loan situation. So in a revolving loan situation it might provide a revolving loan facility, but normally with these kind of things there is envisaged a period of time within which the loan has got to be repaid back – in this particular case from Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) to Credit Finance and then from Credit Finance back to the Gibraltar Savings Bank. So can he tell me what is the rate of return and for what period of time?

1290 **Hon. J J Bossano;** Mr Speaker, the rate of return is not for any given period of time and it is the rate of return that I have given him already in previous answers to the question when he has asked me to give him a breakdown of the rate of return of the different investments of the Savings Bank.

And in terms of the repayment, I have told him when amounts have been repaid and when amounts have been redeemed. This is a pool which is added to or removed from as and when required. It is what I have

1295 told him in the answer: it is the pooling of the cash available to the Government, the authorities, the agencies, the consolidated fund, the I&D, and because these institutions are institutions that are expected to earn a profit, they get paid when their money is being used but none of the others in the pool get paid.

1300 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I understand all that and in fact I am very appreciative of that particular piece of information, because it happens to conflict and indeed provides far more light than the answers provided, or the information – not the answers, because he is providing the answers; the information provided by the Chief Minister on public television that none of the moneys from Credit Finance were being used for Government expenditure. And of course, as he has confirmed in the past to me, this money is effectively being pooled, as he said now, with all those moneys being made available to Government authorities etc – in this particular case it is Government-owned companies – which are being used in order to fund the cashflow requirements of Government-owned companies. I appreciate that, and indeed if I am critical of anybody it is not of him. If I am critical it is of the Chief Minister, who unfortunately did not provide the correct information when he addressed the nation during his broadcast on New Year’s Eve.

1310 But what I am getting at is every loan has got to be repaid – and this is a loan; it has *got* to be repaid. So at some stage Credit Finance – which, as the hon. Gentleman has always told me is managed by independent directors and senior civil servants – presumably would not have provided a loan of £355 million to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) on an open-ended basis without knowing when that money is going to be repaid, particularly when the money is going effectively into a ‘hole’. I do not use that in a derogatory way, but effectively it is being used to fund the cashflow requirements of Government-owned companies and it is not being invested in anything that will provide a return. So it is going to have to be repaid by the Consolidated Fund eventually and I just want to know when the Government envisages that this money, that £355 million, is going to be repaid.

1320 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Member gets the figures of the repayments that are taking place every month. It is no longer £355 million. It has been coming down every single month. The figure is not going up and it is not static; it is actually coming down every month.

1325 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, it may have come down by one or two million pounds. Again, I accept that and I stand corrected. I am using figures that perhaps I had at the beginning of this month. I stand corrected on that, but you have not answered my question. My question is when that loan of £350-something million is going to be repaid. That is the question. How is it going to be repaid? Because if it is being used in order to fund the cashflow requirements of Government-owned companies and it is not being invested in an investment producing a return, then it is going to be the Government, and I want to know when the Government is going to pay effectively what is a loan by Credit Finance to Government-owned companies in order to help fund Government expenditure.

1330 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Member knows that for years the system that I am talking about now operated, because it was introduced by the GSD, and the answer that I got when I was in Opposition was that the different companies and authorities and agencies did not have separate accounts and banked separately. All the money was deposited with the Treasury and whether the money started from an authority or an agency or the I&D or the Consolidated Fund, that pool of money was operated by the Treasury and therefore there was a daily ebb and flow. As money comes in through... If tomorrow there is a payment of land into the I&D, the amount that is credited to the account of the I&D does not sit in the I&D, it sits in this pool of money, and the position is that the money that has been made available by Credit Finance and previously by the Savings Bank earns interest precisely because these are entities that use their money to invest at a profit. Therefore it is not the same as the money that is being made available to the pool by the public sector entities that have got surplus cash at any given time.

1340 What I can tell him is that the direction in which this is going is down and it will continue going down. What I cannot tell him is when we will reach zero.

1345 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, no, it has never... it has not happened in the past. What we are effectively seeing now... Well, let’s take what happened in the past. What happened in the past was that Gibraltar Investment (Holdings), which is the company that sits at the very top of all Government-owned companies, which funds all other Government-owned companies, projects undertaken by those companies, the wage bill of those companies etc is funded by Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited, which in turn in the past has been funded from the Consolidated Fund. In other words, the Government takes taxpayers’ money, places it in Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) and that money then trickles down to all Government-owned companies.

1355 What is happening now, which is a departure from the past, is that credit savers' money, savers' money which is by law not even effectively Government debt, although it is guaranteed by the Government, that is now being used via Credit Finance in order to fund Gibraltar Investment (Holdings). So it is not from the Consolidated Fund; it is being funded from savers' money.

1360 Now, Mr Speaker, he still has not answered the question. How is that £355 million going to be repaid? Because once the £355 million, or £353 million, trickles all the way down to those Government-owned companies to fund their cashflow requirements, that money will go. It is going to be used. How is it going to be paid up? It is not an investment at all in the real sense of the word. The Gibraltar Savings Bank to Credit Finance may be an investment, but Credit Finance to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) is not an investment and I want to know how the Government is going to repay that money, because that is important when one looks at and when one analyses and one tests the future solvency of this community, Mr Speaker.

1365 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, Mr Speaker, it may be important for him to test the solvency that way but it is not important for me to do it the way he wants it done. The answer is that I am telling him that the £355 million has been coming down every month and will keep on coming down every month and will be repaid fully. It will be paid in cash, in pounds, shillings and pence, and that is how it is going to be paid.

1370 **Mr. Speaker:** No.

Hon. D A Feetham: Well, Mr Speaker, he obviously is not going to give me an answer so I will move on to something else.

1375 Mr Speaker, this money is obviously being loaned from Credit Finance to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings), as indeed beforehand it was being loaned from the Gibraltar Savings Bank to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings), evidenced by Flexible Loan Notes. So it is effectively a debt of Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) to the Gibraltar Savings Bank, now Credit Finance.

1380 Mr Speaker, on 3rd July 2013, which was the day before the by-election, the day before the by-election, the Gibraltar Savings Bank issued Press Release 1/2013 –indeed, as far as I am aware it is the only press release ever issued by the Gibraltar Savings Bank; certainly there was no number 2 or number 3 in 2013 and I think the number has stayed static at number 1 since 2013 – and it said this:

‘The Gibraltar Savings Bank is not a credit institution and does not provide any loans.’

1385 Let me just repeat that: ‘and does not provide any loans.’ Does he accept that that statement, issued by the Gibraltar Savings Bank the day before the by-election, was false, untrue and misleading in the light of the fact of the information that we now know, that in fact the Gibraltar Savings Bank has been lending money to the Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) company since 2012, a year earlier, or over a year before that press release was issued?

1390 **Hon. J J Bossano:** No.

Hon. D A Feetham: Well Mr Speaker, how could he possibly say no? We know, as a matter of fact... Let's take *facts*. Facts. Fact number one –

1395 **A Member:** He just said no.

1400 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Fact number one. Let me just... I do not want to mislead the House. Fact number one: in March 2012 the Gibraltar Savings Bank issued a Flexible Rate Note providing a loan of £12.5 million to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited, and indeed in April 2012 there was a loan of £37 million, in May £6 million, in June £6 million, in July £25 million, in August £8 million, in September £13 million, in October £9 million, November £7 million and December £4 million. It is a lot of loans provided to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited by the Gibraltar Savings Bank – and I have not even finished. I am not going to bore people to death – those listening. But Mr Speaker, how on earth, in the light of that, could he possibly have issued a press release the day before the by-election, in the name of the Gibraltar Savings Bank, saying that the Gibraltar Savings Bank does not issue any loans, Mr Speaker? Either the information he has provided to me today is wrong or the press release that was issued the day before the by-election was wrong. It cannot be that both of them are correct, Mr Speaker.

1405 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, if he wants to know how I am able to say no, it is by putting my lips to form an ‘en’ sound and an ‘oh’ sound, which produces the sound ‘no’. That is how I do it; I do not know how he does it. (*Laughter*)

1415 If he considers that there is an inconsistency, then it is quite simple. As well as Flexible Rate Notes from GIH the fund, which is a Government fund, where the Savings Bank puts the money from the depositors, and it is a special fund under the Act that deals with all Government special funds, has Flexible Rate Notes from the Republic of Finland, from private quoted companies and from public utilities, and none of them are considered by the Savings Bank Fund to be notes; they are investments. He chooses to call it a loan and we choose to call it an investment, and therefore I am telling him there are no loans, there are investments.

1420 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, he now calls it ‘investments’! What is it about the term ‘Fixed Rate Loan Note’ that is ambiguous, Mr Speaker? It is a *loan*! It is money that has been loaned out to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited, not an investment. It is a loan, and in the light of that, then the press release that was issued a day before the by election was not correct and misled the people of Gibraltar at a critical time in the democratic process, Mr Speaker.

1425 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, I do not think it was a critical time in the democratic process because I think the result was a foregone conclusion: we were going to win the by-election with Fixed Rate Notes, or Flexible Rate Notes, or without them. But the fact is that the hon. Member only seems to object to the money being made available to a Government-owned company controlled by the Treasury and he is quite happy to have the money being made available to the Government of Finland, where there are Fixed Rate Notes or Flexible Rate Notes held by the Savings Bank now, with the fund having held similar investments when he was in Government. That did not mean that he went round the world saying, ‘Well, look, we are lending money to Finland,’ and ‘How is Finland going to pay us back?’ and ‘What if Finland goes bust?’

1430 The incredible thing is that the hon. Member puts these arguments, and so do his recently acquired experts, which shows the concern that they have that if the Government has a position where, instead of doing what they used to do... They used to get money from the Gibraltar Savings Bank and borrowing as debentures the same as we do, but then they did something else: they actually increased the money that they were borrowing and they borrowed from banks and deposited the money in banks. They informed this House that as a matter of social policy they had borrowed hundreds of millions of pounds at 4½% or 5% from banks and then the money was not going to be used for anything – it was going to be deposited back in the bank, which paid them 1%, and that that would cost the taxpayer £9 million a year, which was the difference between what the bank was paying them in interest and what they were paying bank interest. Now, he may think that is a wiser use of taxpayers’ money than what we are doing now. We disagree with him. Obviously they were entitled to do it that way, and if they ever get back into government they can stop doing it the way we are doing it and go back to losing £9 million a year – it is their prerogative, but we are not going to copy them.

1445 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker –

1450 **Mr Speaker:** I think I should warn both hon. Members that they are now getting into the realms of a debate and therefore I shall be more strict in implementing the rules where supplementaries are concerned.

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes, Mr Speaker. Thank you very much for Mr Speaker’s helpful intervention. Mr Speaker, you see, the answer that the hon. Gentleman has provided gives it away. He is talking about... because we have lent the Bank of Finland, we have lent x amount of money to x person, we have also lent money to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings). But, you see, even by his nomenclature, even the words that he uses – ‘lent’ – it is a loan.

1460 Now I cannot see how on earth the hon. Gentleman could accept that effectively the money is being loaned to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) and then defend that press release – presumably and I am asking him this in my supplementary – which presumably he procured the issue of the day before the by-election, saying that the Gibraltar Savings Bank provided no loans when quite clearly that was not the case, Mr Speaker.

1465 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, Mr Speaker, I am using the word ‘loan’ in order to meet his use of the terminology but not because I share it or agree with it. I do not see it as the money being *lent* to the Government of Finland; I see it as an investment in Flexible Rate Notes which are issued by the Government of Finland. But if he says that if it is issued by GIH it is a loan then, by definition, if it is issued by Finland it must also be a loan in his nomenclature, not in mine. And he seems to think it is alright if you lend money to Finland but it is not alright if you lend money to the Treasury in Gibraltar – by his definition of loans, not by mine.

1470 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker, well, obviously he is not going to tell me anything about the press release. He has not answered the question about whether he procured this particular press release to be issued by the Gibraltar Savings Bank, and I wonder whether he can come back on that.

1475 But let me ask this, because he really is not providing any information at all today in relation to when this money is going to be repaid. At the end of the day this is savers' money. We do not know when the money is going to be repaid, we do not know the rate of return, it is all very nebulous and he keeps on making it as nebulous as possible to avoid, really, the Opposition getting to the bottom of how the people's money is being invested, in particular savers' money, and how that money is going to be repaid at the end of the day.

1480 But, Mr Speaker, Question 396 he has answered saying that there is no formal security for the £353 million loan from Credit Finance to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited, and he says:

'Repayment is secured on the assets held by Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited.'

He must mean, in relation to that, the share capital of Gibraltar Investment (Holdings). What other assets does it have other than, presumably, other Government-owned companies which it owns in its share capital or other Government-owned companies which this particular company owns?

1485 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Mr Speaker, he should know all the assets that are held by GIH and its subsidiaries because it was his Government that put all the assets there. In property they have got a couple of hundred million pounds of assets – they put them there.

1490 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I understand. What I am asking the hon. Gentleman is... and perhaps my question was not clearly put, and I accept that. What I am asking him is: apart from its own share capital – which clearly one can secure a loan on, although there is no formal loan security here – and all the companies that are owned underneath it, there are no other assets that are being tendered as part of a formal security that has been provided for this £353 million that has been loaned by Credit Finance to Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) Limited.

1495 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Mr Speaker, the element of the pool of cash that is shared by the Government companies, the Government authorities, the Government agencies, the Improvement and Development Fund and the Consolidated Fund, does not entail any cross guarantees from anybody to anybody else.

1500 And the answer is, to the extent that one assumes that it is conceivable that GIH would default, which would be the only point in having a security... Well, look, in theory, in that absurd situation... The hon. Member argues that there is a big problem because if an investment that is made by the Gibraltar Savings Bank Fund or by the Credit Finance Company, which is predominantly owned by the Savings Bank Fund actually were not to be able to be realised and the cash refunded, then the problem would be that the savers' money would be at risk and the savers would not be paid, and that means that it would all fall back on the Government guarantee. Well look, of all the guarantees that the Government has on the £1 billion that there is in the Savings Bank Fund, the bit of the guarantee that is safest, the one that is most safe of the lot, is the one where the guarantee is only triggered if the Government defaults. So we have got this absurd circular argument that if Finland defaults it does not matter, if Rolls Royce defaults it does not matter, but if the Government defaults there is a huge problem because then the Government has to pay. Well, the security is the Government and the Government that is undertaking the guarantee of the Savings Bank is the Government that is using, as part of a cashflow base, the money. And I have demonstrated to him that, contrary to the impression that they have been given – that this money is all now spent and that we are skint... I have shown him the number of times that there has been a flow of money in the opposite direction, not from the Savings Bank fund to GIH but from GIH to the Savings Bank fund: redeemed, 1515 £12.5 million, £40.5 million, £48.5 million, £10.1 million, £6.53 million; £5.7 million. And he tells me, 'Well, how are you going to do it and when are you going to do it?' Well, the same way that it has been done between 12th March and today is the way it will be done in future: as and when other sources come in and the cash is not required the cash is repaid. It is as simple as that. That is how a cash pool works.

1520 The hon. Member wants to create the impression that somehow people's money is at risk in the Savings Bank. And at the end of the day, I am not going to be able to reassure him that they are not at risk because he has got a vested political interest in making people believe that. The only thing I can tell him is that if he is so worried about his money I hope he takes any that he has in the Savings Bank out, because I do not want him to lose his money.

1525 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes Mr Speaker, I do not have any money in the Savings Bank.

But Mr Speaker, that is, with respect to him, actually quite a helpful answer that he has provided just now. That is a very helpful answer that he has provided just now because really what he is telling me,

1530 which is what I have been trying to get to the bottom of in exchanges and in correspondence that I have written to the Chief Secretary and also to the Principal Auditor as well... What I have been trying to get to the bottom of is how is this money going to be repaid, and effectively what he is saying to me is that this money is going to be repaid by the Government. That is what he has told me. Not by Gibraltar Investment Holdings, because Gibraltar Investment Holdings is not investing that money in any investments – indeed, it is using that money in order to fund the cashflow requirements of Government-owned companies – but by the Government.

1535 Now, Mr Speaker, on that basis, does he not accept that the only possible way in which the directors of Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) could have accepted a loan of £355 million, now it has gone down, was on the basis that the Government would be repaying that loan? Ergo this is a loan, this is a debt of the Government, because the Government is making itself responsible for paying, Mr Speaker. And hence why the public debt of this community is not £375 million, which is the official figure of direct Government debt, but £375 million *plus* the £355 million that the Government is assuming responsibility for and its repayment. It is no longer a contingent liability, for anybody listening – hopefully the Financial Secretary – it is no longer a contingent liability where there is a default and then the Government pays; it is being assumed directly by the Government of Gibraltar, and therefore it is a debt of the Government.

1545 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Not ‘ergo’, Mr Speaker. He does not have a clue what he is talking about! I have not said it is being paid back by the Government. I have told him – (*Interjection*) No, I am going to repeat what I have told him. I cannot help it if he does not understand what he is talking about. I have told him £12.5 million paid back not by the Government, by GIH; £40.5 million paid back not by the Government, by GIH; £48.5 million paid back not by the Government, by GIH; £10.1 million... Do I have to go through every single figure? Every single figure in my original answer are payments by GIH.

1550 What I have told him is that the guarantee of the Savings Bank is the guarantee of the Government, which means if the Government wholly owned company defaulted and the Savings Bank had money which should be coming back but which did not, then the Savings Bank would be able to exercise the guarantee that there is in the law by the Government. That is where I said the Government would pay in respect of that guarantee, and what I told him is it is absurd, it is ridiculous to try to convince people that their money is safer with the Bank of Finland or the Bank of Greece or the government of Greece. If we buy tomorrow bonds of the Greek government, which are yielding 24%, and the money does not come back it would be the Government who would have to step in – the Government of Gibraltar would have to step in to meet the fact that the bonds of the government of Greece, the Flexible Rate Note or whatever it was that we bought, could not be cashed.

1560 Well, how can it be safer to say the Government has to guarantee the money we are investing in the government of Finland but that is alright because they were doing that for 15 years so that does not matter, but if the money is used as part of the cash pool that is used in the public sector, then that is a bigger risk. Well, it is not a bigger risk and if there was a contingent liability it is on the presumption that this money is at risk in a way that the rest of the money in the Savings Bank fund is not? We do not agree with that analysis and we think that analysis is neither correct nor anything other than a self-serving argument in order to say the Government of today has got a bigger public debt than the Government that there was before. This is what this is all about; it has nothing to do with anything else.

1570 The hon. Member says I do not answer his questions. It is not that I do not answer his questions; it is that he does not like the answers he gets unless he thinks he can somehow twist them to say I just said something that proves he is right, in which case he is grateful. If he cannot twist it he is not grateful and he is then upset because I am not giving him an answer that he can make a use of. But if I give him one that he thinks he can make use of, then he is grateful. Well look, I am not here to provide anything other than information. The information that I provide he can put to whatever use he wants, but the information I am giving him is the one he is getting. The interpretation he puts on it... He is free to put every interpretation he wants, this is a democracy; I put a different one.

1575 Time will tell whether there is any substance in what he is saying and time will prove him wrong. The whole of the money that is at the moment invested in the cash pool will all be back in Credit Finance and in the Savings Bank at an appropriate time in the future. I cannot give him the dates.

1580 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, my last supplementary. Mr Speaker, he talks about – and this is the nub of it – Gibraltar Investment Holdings Limited, which has had a loan of £355 million, £353 million now, from Credit Finance, repaying that loan. He draws a distinction between the Government on the one hand and a Government-owned company – Gibraltar Investment Holdings is a Government owned company – and it says Gibraltar Investment Holdings, not the Government, is going to be repaying back the £355 million.

1585 But Mr Speaker, how is the £355 million going to be repaid by Gibraltar Investment Holdings if not by funding from the Government Mr Speaker? Because Gibraltar Investment Holdings is not a trading

1590 company. It makes no money. It cannot repay back £355 million if, as he has said to this House, that £355 million is going to be spent in the cashflow requirements of Government-owned companies. That is the point, Mr Speaker. The point is that if this has been a loan provided and accepted by Gibraltar Investment Holdings on the understanding that the Government is going to be repaying it, then by any measure, by any standard, that is effectively a debt on the Government Mr Speaker.

1595 Now how is Gibraltar Investment Holdings going to be repaying the £355 million?

Mr Speaker: That is the last supplementary I am allowing on this issue and then we will move on.

1600 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well Mr Speaker, the hon. Member opposite has said if, if Gibraltar Investment Holdings has had access to this pool of money on the understanding that it is going to be repaid for by the Government, well the answer to that if, is no, that is not the understanding. It is the understanding that he has invented and is therefore the sandy foundations on which the whole edifice is built.

Hon. D A Feetham: Then how?

1605 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well I do not have to tell him how we do things; I just have to provide him with the information on what is done. He is concerned is it going to be paid back: the answer is yes. If he says it cannot be paid back, well look, I just told him that Gibraltar Investment Holdings paid back £12.5 million in April. Is he saying to me that that is impossible unless the Government gave Gibraltar Investment Holdings) £12.5 million in April? Is that what he is telling me? Well then I suggest he goes back to look at the Estimates Book and finds out where all this money from the Government went into Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) to enable this to happen. Because what he says is impossible has happened already on one, two, three, four, five, six, seven occasions. It happened in April 2012: £12.5 million. Investment (Holdings), which he says has not got any money, actually paid £12.5 million.

1615 **Hon. D A Feetham:** From where?

Hon. J J Bossano: From its own money in the cash pool. The hon. Member does not understand that –

1620 **Hon. D A Feetham:** From Government money.

Hon. J J Bossano: Well everything that is in every company ultimately belongs to the Government because the assets of all the companies are 100% Government owned. But the Government did not give Gibraltar Investment (Holdings) in April £12½ million to pay back the Savings Bank – I can guarantee that. (Interjection by the Hon. D A Feetham) No, Mr Speaker, he knows it is not possible. He knows the sums of money I have quoted him. He does not seem to understand that it is possible to have a situation where there are imbalances in cashflows, where you are expecting £10 million to come in tomorrow and you have to meet a bill today of £9 million, and that you can get an advance from the Consolidated Fund or an advance from Credit Finance and that then the money comes in and you pay. He does not understand that that is possible, even though I have given him clear evidence that there has been a flow of money in and out, in and out, over the two and a half years and that is not money transferred from the Government to Investment (Holdings) – and he knows that it is not, because I am talking about historical accounts which have been audited and which he has.

Q431/2015
Maritime Cadet Training Scheme –
Student details

Mr Speaker: Question 431.

1635 **Clerk:** Question 431, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, can Government provide details in respect of any Gibraltar students currently undertaking the Maritime Cadet Training Scheme, indicating at what stage they are in their training an estimated completion date, together with qualifications aimed to be attained?

1640 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, there is no student currently in the Maritime Cadet Training Scheme.

1645

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, in a conversation I was having with the then Minister for the Port, the Hon. Neil Costa, last summer he was indicating to me that they were in the process of advertising and going back out to try to recruit possible students interested in following the Maritime Cadet Training Scheme and so on; hence I have asked this question now. Does the hon. Member have any idea whether there were no successful applicants or that some started and then abandoned the course, or has Government now made it its policy that it does not wish to entertain sponsoring or provide facilities for the Maritime Cadet Training Scheme?

1650

Hon. J J Bossano: My understanding, Mr Speaker, is that this is not Government funded; in fact it is funded by the industry. I am told that the last intake finished in 2015 and they have not found suitably qualified candidates since then, but it is not that the Government has wanted to stop it.

1655

Hon. E J Reyes: Yes, Mr Speaker, the Minister is correct in saying – or half correct – that it was funded by the industry, and there was also some funding input as well, I know, from educational funds and so on.

1660

Obviously he has reconfirmed that there are no students, but I think in his last answer, in the supplementary, he said that the last intake finished in 2015, which is this current year. Does he have any details of how many finished now in 2015 and what qualifications they actually attained?

Hon. J J Bossano: No, Mr Speaker, because based on the original... the original is whether there was anybody currently there and there is not anyone currently there. I have given him before the numbers that were there before. I can find out what qualifications they got when they finished, but whatever numbers were there they all finished by January.

1665

Hon. E J Reyes: Thank you for that, Mr Speaker.

1670

Also I heard the Minister say that he was under the impression there was no-one interested in attending this course, and yet – I have been on the lookout – if one takes into account the academic year since last September, I have not seen any adverts or any recruitment process towards the Maritime Cadet Training Scheme. Either something has come out that I have missed or... Perhaps the Minister can enlighten me on when was the last time that a renewed effort was made to attract people to this worthy training scheme.

1675

Hon. J J Bossano: Mr Speaker, when I asked why there had been no intake, the answer I was provided with was that there were no suitable candidates. I do not know what has been done to try... The hon. Member must understand that there are less people now unemployed and less people in training because there are more people in employment, so the market is smaller than it used to be.

1680

Hon. E J Reyes: Yes, Mr Speaker, I understand that, but if one goes back to the origins of this Maritime Training Scheme there was a big emphasis being made to actually recruit school leavers upon completion of their A-levels, as an alternative to other types of formal education leading to highly recognised qualifications. So there was not the need to go to university and do a particular degree and then go into the maritime training, but rather I think we were using Warsash and Southampton where it was a course that, if I am not mistaken, it had something like six weeks of theory followed by six weeks of practice at sea and so on and you ended up getting your Junior Officer of the Watch certificate and so on, leading all the way up to those who had the ability and the inclination to actually captain a ship. In fact, I know there are a couple of Gibraltarians who followed these courses and are now working on very reputable British cruise liners as quite senior officers.

1685

So can I just leave it... The Hon. Minister may wish even to have a brief conversation with me behind the Speaker's Chair, because it could be for the benefit of school leavers, helping him not only to control or keep down his employment figures but actually encouraging people into something that... Gibraltar has always provided services to cruise ships and therefore we should provide services and get the best officers available for our own future development of the port and all its maritime-related activities.

1690

1695

Hon. J J Bossano: I am happy to talk to the hon. Member about the opportunities and the options, but it is not everybody's cup of tea. Because, you know, being at sea is not something that is the same as going to university. Some of the youngsters we have had have had problems in the time that they have been on the coal face rather than in the college in UK. But certainly I am happy to talk it over with him.

1700

Q432/2015

**Dual-fire Waterport power station –
Requirement to borrow re construction costs**

Clerk: Question 432, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm that it will need to borrow in order to pay for the construction of the dual-fire Waterport power station?

1705

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB.

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, a number of options for financing the new generating station are under consideration, including options similar to the one that was in the pipeline under the GSD Government, except that there will not be in any of the options a requirement for a commitment to raise future electricity charges as was the case with the proposal under the GSD administration.

1710

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes Mr Speaker, the reason why I ask the question... We are getting to questions about public debt in a moment, so I do not know what the up-to-date position of net debt is, but the net debt as of the last time that the hon. Gentleman answered this particular question, net debt was £375 million. The legal borrowing limit at the moment stands – I calculated it this morning – at £457 million. That is taking 80% of consolidated fund revenue, recurrent revenue. So it gives you £457 million. On that basis, the Government does not have the ability to actually borrow sufficient amounts of money, add to the public debt, to keep within those legal borrowing limits of £457 million, because this power station is going to cost substantially more than the £80 million-odd that the Government has at its disposal if it wanted to actually raise more money by way of direct borrowing.

1715

1720

That is the reason why I am asking, because it appears to me that effectively the Government, unless it is prepared to come to this House to raise the legal borrowing limit – and indeed I think that is the honest way to do it, to come to this House and raise the legal borrowing limit, not borrow indirectly; it has been borrowing through Credit Finance etc – then of course if it is not prepared or if it pays via Credit Finance etc it is going to have to borrow directly, but it cannot and that is why I am asking. and I am inviting the hon. Gentleman to effectively inform the Opposition of how it is going to be financed.

1725

1730

Hon. J J Bossano: I am sorry that the hon. Member thinks that other than raising the borrowing ceiling is a dishonest way to raise finance, because of course –

Hon. D A Feetham: Honest way.

1735

Hon. J J Bossano: He said the honest way is to raise the limit, so by definition to do it other than by raising the limit is a *dishonest* way of doing it. I am sorry that he thinks that because, in fact, the greatest ever Gibraltarian used to do it regularly before, and I do not think he was being dishonest. For example, when he got the Royal Bank of Scotland to, in theory, buy St Bernard's Hospital and then sell it back and then rent it, or when he did the same thing with the car parks, none of which were considered to be public debt or loans or requiring the raising of the limit; and certainly I do not know what they were planning to do with the generating station that was going to go up the Rock, which would have cost a fortune, but they were talking at the time about financing it in a way which would not appear as Government debt and not in the honest way that the hon. Member wants. But then of course maybe he has got such high standards of honesty that the rest of us have got a problem in keeping up with him.

1740

1745

Hon. D A Feetham: Well, Mr Speaker, can he at least confirm that this is not going to be funded out of any of the moneys that are sitting in Gibraltar Investment (Holdings)? Perhaps he can confirm that.

Hon. J J Bossano: Yes, I can confirm that – yes, yes, yes.

Q433/2015

Government cash reserves and debt.

1750

Clerk: Question 433, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please state what the Government cash reserves were as at 31st May 2015?

1755 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB.

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 434 to 437.

1760 **Clerk:** Question 434, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please give a breakdown by bank and amount of that part of the aggregate public debt which comprises bank debt, as at 31st May 2015?

1765 **Clerk:** Question 435, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister provide this House with a breakdown, by debenture issue, of that part of the aggregate public debt which comprises Government debentures, as at 31st May 2015?

1770 **Clerk:** Question 436, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please provide details of the value of Gibraltar Savings Bank debentures or other debt security as at 31st May 2015?

1775 **Clerk:** Question 437, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please provide a breakdown of where and how all the moneys deposited in the Gibraltar Savings Bank have been invested and the rate of return on each of these investments as at 31st May 2015?

1780 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB.

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano): Mr Speaker, as at 31st May the Government cash reserves were £41.01 million.

The aggregate public debt consisted of bank debt was Barclays Bank £150 million and NatWest Offshore Limited £50 million, which in fact the hon. Member will have seen today has been rescheduled on the basis that it was maturing and there is now a –

1790 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Fixed rate?

Hon. J J Bossano: No, it is a flexible rate, *[laughter]* very attractive compared to the one that was there before actually, under 2%. It is possible for that amount, for example, to be repaid at any one time so it is a loan that does not have to be all drawn. It is being drawn at the moment, but if we have the good fortune to have a lot of money coming in not only will we be able to have everything back in Credit Finance to keep him happy and everything back in the Savings Bank, but we might even be able to have everything back in NatWest.

The Government debentures, which are in fact the debentures held by the Gibraltar Savings Bank on one month's notice, are £247,700,000, the same as it was last month.

1800 The value of Gibraltar Savings Bank debentures and other debt security by maturity date is as follows:

	One month	£ 32,299,900
	Maturing in 2015 Debentures	£ 8,987,400
	Maturing in 2016 Debentures	£ 22,928,800
1805	Maturing in 2017 Debentures	£ 99,099,600
	Maturing in 2018 Debentures	£163,640,600
	Maturing in 2019 Debentures	£180,346,200
	Other Debentures	£157,556,748
	Bonds	£ 69,847,204
1810	Deposit Accounts	£209,252,660

The average yield in respect of the different categories of investment vehicles held by the Savings Bank for the month of April are as follows.

1815 On-call accounts with the Bank of England, the Crown Agents and the Gibraltar Banks had an average yield of around 0.55%. The Gibraltar Banks were the Royal Bank of Scotland, Barclays Bank, National Westminster Bank, Jyske Bank and Lloyds Bank.

1820 Floating Rates Notes had an average yield of 1.01%. These notes were issued by the following: European Investment Bank, International Bank for Reconstruction and Development, Neder Waterschapsbank, KfW, Republic of Finland, Volkswagen Financial Services, Dexia, GE Capital UK, Westpac Securities, Australia & New Zealand Banking Group, Centrica plc, ASB Finance Limited, the Royal Bank of Canada, BG Energy Capital plc, Suncorp Medway Ltd, BMW Finance and National Grid Gas plc.

1825 Monthly income debentures had a 6% return and preference shares in Credit Finance had an average dividend of 5.6%. As previously explained, the quoted stocks and the call accounts fluctuate on a daily basis but these fluctuations are not normally significant.

1830 I now hand over the Savings Bank Statement of Investments, which list the investments for the month, to the hon. Member, which of course I assume he considers to be the list of debts since he says that if the Savings Bank invests in the Government of Gibraltar it should be called a loan but if it invests in the government of Finland it does not. So if he wants, I will head it in future 'List of Debts' instead of 'List of Investments'.

A Member: Hear, hear. (*Banging on desk*)

1835 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I have no further questions, just simply to note the Freudian slip by the hon. Gentleman when he talked about investments in the Government of Gibraltar, which is precisely my point: it is the Government of Gibraltar that owes this money, not a Government-owned company.

ANSWER TO QUESTION 437

SAVINGS BANK FUND
STATEMENT OF INVESTMENTS

DESCRIPTION OF STOCK	NOMINAL VALUE	MARKET PRICE ACCRUED INTEREST %	MARKET VALUE ACCRUED INTEREST	TOTAL MARKET VALUE ON 30/04/2015
SUNCORP-METWAY LTD FRN 06/10/17	£5,000,000.00	100.122 0.074	£5,006,107.80 £3,687.09	£5,009,794.89
VOLKSWAGEN FIN SERV NV FRN 12/10/15	£5,000,000.00	99.997 0.041	£4,999,836.65 £2,026.61	£5,001,863.26
DEXIA CREDIT LOCAL FRN 15/4/16	£4,000,000.00	100.016 0.033	£4,000,650.52 £1,315.48	£4,001,966.00
AUST & NZ BANKING GROUP FRN 4/2/16	£5,000,000.00	100.144 0.194	£5,007,212.85 £9,710.96	£5,016,923.81
GE CAPITAL UK FUNDING FRN 20/3/17	£2,000,000.00	99.802 0.080	£1,996,039.06 £1,608.41	£1,997,647.47
WESTPAC SECURITIES NZ LT FRN 3/10/17	£5,000,000.00	100.000 0.079	£5,000,000.00 £3,946.85	£5,003,946.85
CANADIAN IMPERIAL BANK FRN 15/1/18	£5,000,000.00	100.000 0.031	£5,000,000.00 £1,566.02	£5,001,566.02
NATIONWIDE BUILDING SOCIETY FRN 27/4/18	£5,000,000.00	100.000 0.006	£5,000,000.00 £316.70	£5,000,316.70
ASB FINANCE LTD LONDON FRN 1/05/18	£5,000,000.00	100.000 0.000	£5,000,000.00 £0.00	£5,000,000.00
ROYAL BANK OF CANADA FRN 4/6/19	£5,000,000.00	100.076 0.150	£5,003,796.60 £7,522.28	£5,011,318.88
BMW FINANCE NV 1.75% 20/11/17	£5,000,000.00	101.870 0.772	£5,093,500.00 £38,595.89	£5,132,095.89
LVMH MOET HENNESSY VUITT 1.625% 20/12/17	£5,000,000.00	101.726 0.583	£5,086,313.90 £29,160.96	£5,115,474.86
PRUDENTIAL PLC 1.375% 19/01/18	£7,000,000.00	100.139 0.380	£7,009,716.77 £26,633.56	£7,036,350.33
ABN AMRO BANK NV 2.5% 18/12/18	£7,000,000.00	103.262 0.911	£7,228,348.61 £63,767.12	£7,292,115.73
JP MORGAN CHASE & CO 1.875% 10/02/20	£4,000,000.00	100.284 0.406	£4,011,364.72 £16,232.88	£4,027,597.60
THAMES WATER UTIL FIN 4.9% 30/6/15	£1,600,000.00	100.710 1.629	£1,611,353.70 £26,061.54	£1,637,415.24
VOLKSWAGEN FIN SERV NV 1.25% 15/12/16	£5,000,000.00	100.750 0.467	£5,037,505.75 £23,351.65	£5,060,857.40
NEDER WATERSCHAPSBANK 0.875% 07/03/18	£5,000,000.00	99.840 0.048	£4,992,000.00 £2,390.71	£4,994,390.71
KOMMUNEKREDIT 1.125 07/12/18	£5,000,000.00	99.797	£4,989,850.00	£4,989,850.00
KFW 5.5% 7/12/15	£5,000,000.00	103.086 2.185	£5,154,301.65 £109,236.11	£5,263,537.76
LLOYDS 5.5% 25/09/16	£3,000,000.00	106.236 0.542	£3,187,066.80 £16,273.97	£3,203,340.77
SCOTTISH & SOUTHERN ENERGY 5% 01/10/18	£4,000,000.00	112.402 2.890	£4,498,084.44 £115,616.44	£4,611,700.88
INTERNATIONAL BK RECON & DEV FRN 19/01/16	£2,000,000.00	100.001 0.017	£2,000,024.32 £339.04	£2,000,363.36
NEDER WATERSCHAPSBANK FRN 09/04/18	£2,200,000.00	100.000 0.043	£2,200,000.00 £949.63	£2,200,949.63
REPUBLIC OF FINLAND FRN 25/2/16	£5,000,000.00	100.020 0.108	£5,000,988.05 £5,388.54	£5,006,376.59
NET AMOUNT DUE TO BROKER IN RESPECT OF TRANSACTIONS EFFECTED IN APRIL FOR SETTLEMENT IN MAY			(£9,989,850.00) £0.00	(£9,989,850.00)
MONTHLY INCOME GOVERNMENT DEBENTURES	£247,700,000.00	100.000	£247,700,000.00	£247,700,000.00
BANK OF ENGLAND	£22,425,218.65	100.000	£22,425,218.65	£22,425,218.65
CREDIT FINANCE COMPANY LTD REDEEMABLE PREFERENCE SHARES	£400,000,000.00	100.000	£400,000,000.00	£400,000,000.00
GSBA	£11,000,000.00	100.000	£11,000,000.00	£11,000,000.00
GIBTELECOM	£37,798,895.33	100.000	£37,798,895.33	£37,798,895.33
ROYAL BANK OF SCOTLAND GBP CALL A/C	£17,013,678.59	100.000	£17,013,678.59	£17,013,678.59
LLOYDS BANK GBP CALL A/C	£409,937.76	100.000	£409,937.76	£409,937.76
BARCLAYS BANK PLC	£76,797,790.38	100.000	£76,797,790.38	£76,797,790.38
NATIONAL WESTMINSTER OFFSHORE LTD	£20,243,616.41	100.000	£20,243,616.41	£20,243,616.41
JYSKE BANK	£21,350,293.37	100.000	£21,350,293.37	£21,350,293.37
	£966,539,430.49		£958,367,341.12	£958,367,341.12
CASH	£6,064,000.00	100.000	£6,064,000.00	£6,064,000.00

DEPUTY CHIEF MINISTER

Q438/2015

**Northern Defences regeneration scheme –
Cost of phase 1**

Clerk: Question 438, the Hon. D J Bossino.

1840

Hon. D J Bossino: Is the Deputy Chief Minister in a position to now state what the exact cost of the phase 1 of the Northern Defences regeneration scheme will be?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

1845

Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia): Yes, Mr Speaker, the cost of phase 1 of the Northern Defences regeneration scheme was £214,735.69.

1850

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, presumably there if there is a phase 1... Thanks for the answer, but if there is a phase 1 there is a phase 2, and in that regard is he able to give me an estimate of what the costs are in relation to phase 2; and also if he could also give me details of what phase 2 is likely to entail in terms of the projects?

1855

Hon. Deputy Chief Minister: Yes, Mr Speaker, there is an estimate in the Estimates Book, which obviously is confidential until we debate it in the House. The hon. Member already has that information in the book itself.

It will entail the clearing up of the next of the King's Lines and the Princess Lines. Work has already started. The Royal Engineers were here two weeks ago and have commenced the second phase.

1860

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, maybe if he could assist me and clarify the position for me. There was, I think, in one of the earlier press statements in relation to this particular project, I think an invitation as to expressions of interest. What has happened in relation to that? Were there expressions of interest and have the contracts been awarded? Because the impression I get is that this has been done directly by the Gibraltar Government, as opposed to any other private company. Can he shed any light in relation to that?

1865

Hon. Deputy Chief Minister: Yes, Mr Speaker, there were several detailed expressions of interest put forward to the Government. The Government selected a preferred contractor, shall we say, but really the expressions of interest were more about the management of the site rather than the cleaning up and the physical work that is involved in making the site presentable. So that is what the Government is doing itself at present.

1870

Q439/2015

**Gibraltar Airport –
European Transfer Commissioner's comments**

Clerk: Question 439, the Hon. D J Bossino.

1875

Hon. D J Bossino: Can the Deputy Chief Minister please provide details of the solutions which the European Transfer Commissioner was reportedly referring to as being capable of resolving the current impasse regarding Gibraltar's airport?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

1880

Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia): Mr Speaker, the Government is not aware of what solutions the Commissioner was referring to.

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, I am sure the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister is fully aware of what quotes I am referring to. It is reported again – I refer to the *Gibraltar Chronicle* where she is reported to have said:

‘It has variously expressed its support’

– this is presumably the Commission that she is referring to –

‘for solutions that could solve the problem and would be consistent with EC law, freeing the way for the adoption of the Acts in question.’

1885 So she seems to be very specific as far as the reply which has been given on the Commission’s behalf. Is the Gibraltar Government making any enquiries in relation to what this particular Commissioner, Miss Violeta Bulc was referring to?

1890 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I met Violeta Bulc in January in Brussels and certainly there were no solutions forthcoming. I think what the Commissioner is saying is that they would like to see a solution as long as that is in keeping with EU law. I do not think they have specific solutions in mind.

1895 The view of the Government is that there was a solution on the table, it had been in effect since 2006 and in 2011 and the solution involved the inclusion of Gibraltar Airport in EU civil aviation legislation, and that position has not changed; that is the view of the Government. And may I add it is also the strongly held view of the United Kingdom, which has actually taken a very tough stand on this issue.

Hon. D J Bossino: And just by way of clarification, if I could give the Deputy Chief Minister the opportunity to set out the position, presumably what he is referring to by ‘the Gibraltar solution’ is the Cordoba Agreement of 2006.

1900 Certainly my position is that we should, as a jurisdiction, be able to enjoy these rights as a matter of right in any event, quite outside the terms of that particular agreement, but certainly the Kingdom of Spain agreed to Gibraltar’s inclusion, or at least not to object to Gibraltar’s inclusion in relation to any future measures post the agreement. But if I could just give him the opportunity to clarify that position.

1905 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, yes, the solution that Spain... Spain signed up to a solution in September 2006 and our view is that Spain must therefore honour what they signed up to. It is really as simple as that. Our view, and indeed the view of the UK, is that the exclusion of Gibraltar... There is a list of the areas of community law which do not apply to Gibraltar in Articles 28 and 29 of the UK Act of Accession – things like the Customs Union, like the Common Agricultural Policy. Aviation is not one of them, therefore the exclusion of Gibraltar from the civil aviation legislation would be contrary to the Treaty and would be illegal.

Q440/2015
EU Parliament Petitions Committee Chairman –
Recent visits

Clerk: Question 440, the Hon. D J Bossino.

1915 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Deputy Chief Minister provide a report to this House of the recent visits by the EU Parliament’s Petitions Committee Chairman?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

1920 **Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia):** Mr Speaker, the recent visit by Cecilia Wikström MEP, the Chair of the EU Parliament’s Petitions Committee, followed on from a number of petitions about Gibraltar that the Committee is dealing with. It was a fact-finding visit designed to learn more about the issues at first hand.

1925 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Again, Mr Speaker, there was a very interesting report of the visit in the local press which referred to the number of petitions which she has been in receipt of – I think there was a reference to 3,000 and approximately 100 related to Gibraltar. Is the Hon. the Chief Minister able to provide any breakdown in relation to those statistics? For example, there is another factual issue which was aired in the report which says that currently around 20 of these are open petitions that are being investigated by the Committee. I would be interested to know what happens, for example, in relation to the remaining 80. Have they gone by the wayside? And why is it that the Petitions Commission is only looking at these particular 20 and what they are related to? Does he have that information to hand?

1935 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I do not have the details or a list of the petitions here, but certainly the Chairman of the Committee indicated to us that they were mainly to do with the border and people complaining about the length of time they were made to wait at the Frontier. Others were to do with environmental matters, but essentially the point made to us was that they were mainly to do with the border delays.

1940 **Hon. Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, if I may just make an observation in relation to the issue of the Airport which the hon. Gentleman was putting to the Deputy Chief Minister a moment ago. I just wanted to confirm it, but I think it is important that it should be in the record of the House in respect of the question that the Hon. Mr Bossino and the Deputy Chief Minister were debating a moment ago, that paragraph 19 of the Cordoba Agreement in relation to the Airport, contains a statement which we have certainly brought to the attention of the Commission on a number of occasions, and of course so has the United Kingdom, which is this:

‘The commitments in this Statement’

– and this is the statement in relation to the Airport; this is not the framework, this is specifically the statement on the Airport –

‘The commitments in this Statement will be fully implemented unless the three participants agree to the contrary’

which is a way of ensuring that one participant cannot wheedle himself out of this. Of course, that is an important part of what the Deputy Chief Minister was saying was the insistence of the Gibraltar and United Kingdom governments as to Spain’s obligations under that particular aspect of the agreement.

They have not sought a renegotiation of those issues, which would have been of course an acceptable way of dealing with things – if you agree something with the other parties and you need to change it, you sit round the table and you try and negotiate a way out. They have unilaterally, as the hon. Gentleman knows, withdrawn from that, and paragraph 19 I think is the most pertinent in respect of the position of Spain today and what the position of the Commission should be as a result.

Q441/2015
Gibraltar House, Brussels –
Cost and staffing

Clerk: Question 441, the Hon. D J Bossino.

1955 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Can the Deputy Chief Minister please confirm what the costs of the purchase and any associated fitting-out expenses of the Gibraltar House in Brussels amounts to, together with the details of the staff which is manning such office?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

1960 **Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia):** Mr Speaker, the financial information is in the Draft Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure 2015-16, which has already been made available to the Opposition.

The office is managed by five persons. In addition to Sir Graham Watson it is manned by one legal officer, one administrative officer and two interns.

1965 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I think I have identified the particular place where I can find that in the Budget Book, but in terms of staffing levels is there any intention to further recruit new staff members to that particular office? Because obviously its task is quite onerous and really we need people there who have the analytical capability of identifying (*Interjection and laughter*) the trouble spots in the horizons so that they can therefore be dealt with as quickly and effectively as possible. So the question is that: does the Hon. Deputy Chief Minister have any intention of recruiting more staff to that particular office?

1970 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, there is no intention to do so at present. The office is supported from Gibraltar by my own office and by Michael Llamas, the Attorney General’s EUID as well. So at the moment it has this level of backup. It maybe that this changes in the future but at the moment we are quite happy with the position and we are waiting to see exactly how it works and how it operates.

1975

Hon. D J Bossino: Yes, Mr Speaker, of course, and I made the point recently in the 'Viewpoint' programme, where I think all three of us – well four of us, actually – were interviewed, and that is that Sir Graham Watson will undoubtedly provide tremendous support and, I am sure, very good and sound advice in relation to these matters.

1980 Mr Speaker, is he able, in terms of pounds, shillings and pence – borrowing the Minister for Business Development's phrase earlier – what the expected annual costs, running costs, of the office will be?

Hon. Deputy Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, that detail is in the Estimates. Again, I do not think we can debate those figures until the Budget debate has taken place, but it is in the Estimates Book.

CHIEF MINISTER

Q442/2015

Moneylending licensees – Provision of mortgage facilities

1985 **Clerk:** Question 442, the Hon. D J Bossino.

Hon. D J Bossino: Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please advise how many moneylending licensees are providing or intend to provide mortgage facilities?

1990 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, as discussed at the last meeting of the House, I provided the hon. Member with a list of the moneylending licensees in confidence. The Government is not aware of how many such licensees already provide or intend to provide mortgage facilities.

1995 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I can confirm that the Hon. the Chief Minister has provided me with a copy of the list, which I will consider and once I have done so I may revert to, with the Speaker's permission, to this particular question.

2000 Is that information, the one which is set out in the Order Paper there, information which the Chief Minister, as the Minister responsible for these things, is able to provide?

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman and I are both lawyers, so we both understand, but just for the purposes of members of the public... what it is that a mortgage is. A mortgage is the security given over money lent if that security is over immovable property. And therefore, the companies that we are dealing with have a licence to lend money. What security they take in exchange for that money is a matter really entirely for them; it is not something which the legislation requires them to inform the licensing authority on. So, in the same way as many of these companies, as the hon. Gentleman will know, lend in respect of motor vehicles, some of them take a charge over the vehicle, others take guarantees from the individuals who want to purchase the vehicle, some of them take both. In relation to a mortgage, they would be taking security over property. There is no requirement that they report back to the Government on what type of security they intend to take and whether their moneylending extends to that. So, short of calling each of them up and asking them whether they intend to provide such facilities, it would not be possible for the Government to provide the information. If they advertise that information then that would be publicly available information.

2015 When a bank is licensed by the Financial Services Commission they do not have to tell the FSC that they are going to give or not give mortgages. It may or may not form part of their business plan, but it is not something which is separately allowable. You do not need a licence to grant a mortgage and the same is true in respect of companies that are moneylenders – they do not need a specific permission and therefore the Government does not have the information in a way that we can look it up and give it to the hon. Gentleman.

2020 **Hon. D J Bossino:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful for the answer. What I will do is I will mull over and consider the answer that he has just given to me in relation to the point which is the subject matter of a question, but I also want to take the opportunity of considering with greater care the list that he has provided to me this afternoon. So I will just repeat the point I made earlier: I may just go back to this point if I feel it is appropriate and adequate. I am grateful.

2030 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful for that statement from the hon. Gentleman. As he knows, I have granted him the list on the basis that it is confidential at this stage. We discussed last month that I saw no reason why that should not be a list that is publicly available and he and I, I am sure, can discuss how we progress that. I think just making it public in an exchange across this House would not be fair. I think it would be proper that that list should be publicly available somewhere where the public can access it, perhaps on the Government website, and renewed every year as the licences change or do not change.

2035

Mr Speaker: Next question.

2040 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman, as I understand it – and I could be corrected if I am wrong – he is the licensing authority for these moneylenders and therefore presumably he would have seen any business plan that would have been provided by anybody when they come to apply for a moneylending licence. Can he recall whether, in relation to any applications that he has seen during his tenure in office, whether there is an intention by the applicant to offer, effectively, mortgages to members of the public?

2045 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the process which is followed is that an assessment of the business plan is made by the Office of the Financial Secretary, that then recommends approval of the licence application to the Chief Minister. I perused the documents filed and none of them indicate a desire to grant mortgages – but they do not need to. Anybody who has a licence can now grant mortgages without having to have included that as part of their business plan.

2050 Many of the licensees, as the hon. Members will see from the list I provided to them, have been licensed long before we were in office, most of them in the past 20 years or so and some of them even further than that. I think the hon. Gentleman and I were remarking privately earlier that there is one from the 1970s and one so early that there are no records available of the date when the application was made.

Q443/2015

Sunborn Floating Hotel – Nature Group claim against Government

2055 **Clerk:** Question 443, the Hon. J J Netto.

Hon. J J Netto: Mr Speaker, have the Nature Group made any claim, directly or indirectly through third parties, against the Government in respect of any work done directly or indirectly in respect of the works to enable the *Sunborn Floating Hotel* to be berthed in its current location?

2060 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

2065 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, the Government received a contractual claim for additional costs in relation to the disposal of material dredged for the berthing of the *Sunborn Floating Hotel*. This claim has now been settled.

Hon. D A Feetham: Yes Mr Speaker, can the Hon. the Chief Minister provide us the sum in respect of which this claim has been settled with the Nature Group?

2070 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, £274,000.

2075 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, was there, in that £250,000 – I do not know; I am asking the question – any credit given for the payments that were made to the families of, unfortunately, the deceased who died in the accident when the sullage plant actually blew up a number of years ago... whether there has been any credit to Nature Group provided for the settlement of their claim by taking into account that money that was paid to the relatives of the deceased?

2080 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, without meaning to be obstructive in any way, can the hon. Gentleman explain to me what he means by ‘credit of’? Because I really do not understand what he is getting at.

2085 **Hon. D A Feetham:** What I mean is, Mr Speaker, the Nature Group is owed x amount by the Government of Gibraltar, or makes a claim, let's say, for £500,000, for argument's sake, just taking a round figure; and then the Government settles it for x amount, but it is giving credit, but the Government has effectively... or in the negotiations or settlement with the Nature Group the Government has paid the deceased's family in respect of the fines that the Government basically got from... in respect of the accident, and that somehow is worked into the settlement. I am just asking whether that has been factored in; whether any credit has been given in respect of that.

2090 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the two are entirely different and not linked in any way whatsoever. Not linked in any way whatsoever.

Q444/2015
Naturalised British in Gibraltar –
Number; Government housing

Clerk: Question 444, the Hon. D A Feetham.

2095 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, how many people have been naturalised British in Gibraltar from 9th December 2011 to 31st May 2015 and (a) how many of those have applied to join the housing waiting list and (b) have obtained Government housing?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

2100 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, further to my reply in Question 273 of March 2015, a further 35 persons have been naturalised up to 31st May 2015. Of these, two have applied to join the housing waiting list and one has obtained Government housing.

2105 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Sorry Mr Speaker, can he say how many have been naturalised British from 9th December to 31st May 2015? I did not quite get the figure.

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, I have told him that this is a figure of 35 people further to my answer in March 2015. I gave him an answer in March 2015 – he needs to add 35 to that.

2110 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker, but the answer to the question in... Well, the question was different in the way I previously asked it earlier on this year, and it was about that 1,000 had been naturalised and around 200-odd had applied to join the housing waiting list. But what I did not ask then was how many people of those naturalised had actually been awarded Government housing, had been allocated Government housing. Now, is he saying that out of the 1,000 – and remember that this goes back to the time that they first got elected. Is he saying that, from 9th December 2011 to 31st May 2015, of the 1,035 people who had been naturalised during that period only two have obtained Government housing? Well, I will accept that is the answer. But otherwise, if he is giving me the answer that as from the last time that he answered this two have been awarded Government housing, well that is an incomplete answer because it does not take into account the other 1,000 where I did not ask the question. You see, this last part, 'have obtained Government housing', did not form part of the question when I first asked it in I think it was
2115
2120 January or February.

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, it was in March. The figure I gave him then was 992, the total is therefore 1,027; 192 had applied to join the housing waiting list then, a further two have applied so it is 194.

2125 The answer I have is that one has obtained Government housing. It is not clear to me from the answer I have available whether it is one of the two or one of the 194. I am quite happy to write to the hon. Gentleman and try and clarify that for him.

2130 **Hon. D A Feetham:** No, that will not be necessary. If the Hon. the Chief Minister says that out of the 1,002 only one has obtained Government housing, that is the answer that I am looking for. What I do not want is any confusion that effectively it is only out of, since March, only one. We are very clear that it is, out of the 1,002 that have been naturalised during the time that they have been in Government only one person out of those 1,002 have been awarded Government housing.

2135 **Hon. Chief Minister:** No, Mr Speaker. We are not clear on that: 1,027, not 1,002, 1,027 people have
been naturalised. Of those, 194 have joined the housing waiting list. Right? Are we clear that there are 800-
odd who have not applied to join the housing waiting list; 194 have applied? Now, what I am telling him I
am not clear about is whether there is only one out of the 194 who have applied, or one out of the two who
2140 have applied since March, and what I am offering him is to get back to him to clarify whether it is one out
of two or one out of 194. Because the way he has put the question now it is clear that that is what he is
interested in and I am quite happy to write to him and clarify that.

Mr Speaker: Or how many out of the 194.

2145 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, that is the question that I am asking, because of course whether it is
one out of two or one out of 194 is neither here nor there to me, it is one. What I am asking is: out of the
194 forming part of this pool of 1,027, but out of the 194, how many have obtained Government housing?
If the answer is one out of 194, that is it, I do not need any further information from the hon. Gentleman.

2150 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Okay, Mr Speaker, so – (*Interjection*) Yes!
Mr Speaker, I understand what the hon. Gentleman is asking. I do not have that information as
supplementary information, so therefore I am happy to write to him and tell him whether it is one out of two
or one out of 194; and, if it is not one out of 194, give him the figure out of 194.

2155 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, I am happy with that. It is the latter that I am asking, not whether it is one
out of two or one out of 194.

Questions for Written Answer

Clerk: Answers to Written Questions, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, I have the honour to table the answers to Written
Questions W73/2015 to W81/2015 inclusive.

ADJOURNMENT

2160 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, and I have the honour to move that the House do
now adjourn to Monday, 22nd June at 11.00 a.m. to consider as its first order of business the debate on the
Appropriation Bill.

2165 **Mr Speaker:** I now propose the question which is that this House do now adjourn to Monday, 22nd
June 2015 at 11.00 in the morning. I now put the question, which is that this House do now adjourn to
Monday, 22nd June 2015 at 11.00 in the morning.

Those in favour. (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

The House will now adjourn to Monday, 22nd June 2015 at 11.00 in the morning.

The House adjourned at 6.45p.m