



# PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

**MORNING SESSION: 10.09 a.m. – 12.55 p.m.**

**Gibraltar, Friday, 18th November 2016**

## Contents

Prayer .....	4
Confirmation of Minutes .....	4
Papers to be laid .....	4
<b>Questions for Oral Answer .....</b>	<b>5</b>
Housing and Equality .....	5
Q771/2016 Glacis Estate – Letterboxes.....	5
Q772/2016 Decanting of tenants from homes.....	5
Q773/2016 Eviction of squatters – Legal costs incurred .....	6
Q774/2016 Update re pending repairs.....	6
Q775/2016 Expenditure incurred.....	7
Q776/2016 Housing stock – Properties vacated by senior citizens .....	8
Q777/2016 New affordable homes purchased from Government – Complaints re defects ...	8
Q778/2016 Government estate lifts – Timescale for completion .....	12
Q779/2016 Fire in Government rented accommodation – Care plans re tenants .....	13
Q780/2016 Health and Safety Advisory Council – Number of meetings .....	14
Q781 and 783/2016 Bruce’s Farm – Admissions since January 2012; number of relapses ...	15
Q782/2016 Bruce’s Farm – Drugs detoxification programme first stop .....	16
Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport .....	17
Q732/2016 Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority – Vacant posts .....	17
Q733/2016 Sports-related grants – Update re payments made.....	18

Q734/2016 Cultural grants – Update re awards made.....	20
Q735/2016 Play parks – Maintenance programme.....	21
Q736/2016 Queens Cinema and Hotel – Update re plans for future use.....	22
Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.....	23
Q786-787/2016 Disability tax allowance – Number of claimants; beneficial value.....	23
Q788/2016 Gibraltar Tourist Board – Workers not directly employed by GTB.....	24
Q789/2016 Gibraltar Tourist Board – Subcontracted workers.....	24
Q790/2016 Tourist information and survey officers – Numbers employed.....	25
Q791/2016 Cruise ships – Number of disembarkations and total number of passengers....	26
Q792-793/2016 <i>Sunborn</i> Hotel – Current total workforce; number of Gibraltarians employed.....	47
Q737/2016 Beaches and bathing facilities – Maintenance costs.....	49
Q738/2016 Floating attractions on beaches – Cost; confirmation of condition.....	51
Q739/2016 Jellyfish nets – Cost of provision.....	51
Q740-741/2016 Gibraltar Tourist Board – Arrears owed by tourist sites.....	52
Q742/2016 Principal Auditor’s Report – Clarification re paragraphs 3.7.13 and 14.....	53
Q743-747/2016 Mount Misery glass lookout; Royal Anglian Way – Updates.....	54
Q748-753 and 769/2016 Gibraltar Nature Reserve – Draft management plan, implementation of measures, cost of implementation; management board meetings; management team resources; Europa Foreshore dog fouling; Upper Rock tourist facilities	56
Q754/2016 North Front Cemetery – Expressions of interest re maintenance.....	59
Q755/2016 Thinking Green Digest 2015 – Publication date.....	60
Q756/2016 Lift to Parliament – Heritage licence.....	60
Q757/2016 Fishing nets – Use in British Gibraltar territorial waters.....	61
Q758-760/2016 Macaques – Spaying.....	62
Q761-763/2016 Learning Support and Special Education Needs facilities – Statistics re use	63
Q764/2016 St Martin’s School – Statistics re attendance.....	66
Q765/2016 Special Education Needs students leaving education – Policy for assistance....	67
Q766-767/2016 Working Committee on Co-Education – Members of Committee; Bayside School.....	67
Q768/2016 Comprehensive schools – Security.....	71
<i>The House recessed at 12.55 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 3.03 p.m.</i> .....	72
Q791/2016 Cruise ships – Number of disembarkations and total number of passengers....	26
Q792-793/2016 <i>Sunborn</i> Hotel – Current total workforce; number of Gibraltarians employed.....	47
Q737/2016 Beaches and bathing facilities – Maintenance costs.....	49
Q738/2016 Floating attractions on beaches – Cost; confirmation of condition.....	51
Q739/2016 Jellyfish nets – Cost of provision.....	51
Q740-741/2016 Gibraltar Tourist Board – Arrears owed by tourist sites.....	52

Q742/2016 Principal Auditor's Report – Clarification re paragraphs 3.7.13 and 14.....	53
Q743-747/2016 Mount Misery glass lookout; Royal Anglian Way – Updates .....	54
Q748-753 and 769/2016 Gibraltar Nature Reserve – Draft management plan, implementation of measures, cost of implementation; management board meetings; management team resources; Europa Foreshore dog fouling; Upper Rock tourist facilities	56
Q754/2016 North Front Cemetery – Expressions of interest re maintenance .....	59
Q755/2016 Thinking Green Digest 2015 – Publication date .....	60
Q756/2016 Lift to Parliament – Heritage licence .....	60
Q757/2016 Fishing nets – Use in British Gibraltar territorial waters .....	61
Q758-760/2016 Macaques – Spaying.....	62
Q761-763/2016 Learning Support and Special Education Needs facilities – Statistics re use	63
Q764/2016 St Martin's School – Statistics re attendance .....	66
Q765/2016 Special Education Needs students leaving education – Policy for assistance.....	67
Q766-767/2016 Working Committee on Co-Education – Members of Committee; Bayside School .....	67
Q768/2016 Comprehensive schools – Security .....	71
<i>The House recessed at 12.55 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 3.03 p.m. ....</i>	<i>72</i>

# The Gibraltar Parliament

*The Parliament met at 10.09 a.m.*

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: P E Martinez Esq *in attendance*]

## PRAYER

*Mr Speaker*

## CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

**Clerk:** Meeting of Parliament, Friday, 18th November 2016.

Order of Proceedings: (i) Oath of Allegiance; (ii) Confirmation of Minutes – the Minutes of the last meeting of Parliament, which was held on 20th, 21st, 26th, 27th, 28th October and  
5 8th November 2016.

**Mr Speaker:** May I sign the Minutes as correct? (**Members:** Aye.)

*Mr Speaker signed the Minutes.*

## PAPERS TO BE LAID

**Clerk:** (iii) Communications from the Chair; (iv) Petitions; (v) Announcements. (vi) Papers to be laid – the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

10

**Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay on the table the Report of the Principal Auditor on the Accounts of the Gibraltar Culture and Heritage Agency for the financial year ending 31st March 2012.

**Mr Speaker:** Ordered to lie.

## Questions for Oral Answer

### HOUSING AND EQUALITY

#### Q771/2016 Glacis Estate – Letterboxes

**Clerk:** (vii) Reports of Committees; (viii) Answers to Oral Questions.  
We commence with Question 771 and the questioner is the Hon. E J Reyes.

15

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Housing indicate by when the pending repairs or replacement of letterboxes at Glacis Estate will be undertaken?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

20

**Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, the letterboxes that have been procured have a lead-in period of nine weeks. Once received, the installation is estimated to take four weeks to complete.

25

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.  
The Minister said there is a lead-in period of nine weeks. Are we talking that she is expecting the stocks nine weeks from now, or...? Just for my own clarification.

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Yes, Mr Speaker.

#### Q772/2016 Decanting of tenants from homes

30

**Clerk:** Question 772. The Hon. E J Reyes.

35

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide details of how many tenants required urgent decanting from their homes since the answer to Question 601/2016, indicating the reason why, the date when said decanting became necessary, and the date when the tenants were able to return to their home?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

40

**Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, no tenants have required any decanting from their homes since the answer to the last question.

45

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Thank you, Mr Speaker. I do not know if you would allow me, as a sort of a possible lead-up... In the past, the Minister has given me the information of those who have required to return and so on. In most cases, by the time she has given me the answer the majority of them have returned home, but would have she happen, by chance, to be aware of any tenants still outstanding – for example like those of the last couple of months who, for some sort of delay in the repair works, have not been able yet to return to their home? Is she aware?

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, I am not aware, but I recall from the question last month that there were only a couple who had not returned in any event. As per my question last month, of those I do not know who has now returned and who has not.

**Q773/2016**  
**Eviction of squatters –**  
**Legal costs incurred**

**Clerk:** Question 773. The Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing say how much expenditure has been incurred in respect of legal costs relating to the eviction of squatters from Government rental homes since the answer to Question 602/2016, providing a breakdown showing the number of homes involved and to whom payments were made?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

**Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, there has been none.

**Q774/2016**  
**Update re pending repairs**

**Clerk:** Question 774 the Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Further to the exchanges of information during Question 603/2016, can the Minister for Housing please now provide a revised answer with updated details in respect of all pending repairs, i.e. still not fully completed jobs to rental homes, indicating the dates when these reports were first made by tenants and stating how many will be repaired by: (a) the Housing Works Agency; (b) subcontractors; and (c) the assigned tenants themselves?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

**Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, to date there are 241 pending repairs to rental homes. The dates on which these were reported are as follows. There were 20 in May, 28 in June – these are remaining figures, Mr Speaker, since the last answer – 20 in July, 25 in August, 19 in September, 57 in October, 72 in November.

Thirty-eight of these will be repaired by the Housing Works Agency and 203 will be repaired by subcontractors. Three are on a self-repair basis.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can I then ask the Minister: from the information she has given me, it follows that there are no jobs pending to be completed which were reported prior to 20th May this year – is that correct?

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Yes, Mr Speaker, that is the information that has been provided to me by the Department. When we were here last month the hon. Gentleman told me that he had spoken to someone and that he thought the works were outstanding for a period longer than that, and I did invite the hon. Gentleman, if he did have details, to let me know. I have not had

any of these details, but because of this, in any event I have asked the Department to undertake a sweep just to make sure that nothing has fallen through the cracks. Sometimes there may be human error or something, so they sweep in case there is anything pending that may have been forgotten or maybe hanging on a computer or something is underway in any event. But certainly this is the information that has been provided to date.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I did say to the Minister that I could collate some information and pass it on to her. However, the notice for questions came so soon that we have not had the opportunity to do that. I know the Minister ... I pose the question because it will give her the chance to go back and discuss, obviously, with the staff from the Housing Works Agency and update the information.

I do have at least 10 and a couple more that need further clarification, but I do have information that shows that some repair works are pending now for a period of around two years. In one particular case, someone was even claiming it was reported four years ago, and so on.

Would the Minister think it is best if perhaps we agreed on a mutual date and we met, rather than end up in longwinded correspondence and might clarify better? I am interested in solving the problem for the tenants more than anything, and I am sure the Minister would like to join me in that exercise. So, if she agrees to that and confirms it via you, we can then, when we have a suitable break, look at our diaries and find a convenient date as soon as possible.

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, I think I made it very clear last month that if there is information which may have fallen through the cracks that I was of course very happy to receive it. Of course, what I said last month stands. If the hon. Gentleman has ... And I see that he has some letters there. If he were to give them to me later on when we have a break, I would certainly send them up to Housing immediately for them to be investigated. And my offer stands, of course, Mr Speaker. I am asked to confirm it here before you, but I have this invitation open in any event.

As I said last month and as I have always said before, Mr Speaker, it is about helping people. If there is something that the system may have missed, then of course, as the person with the responsibility, I would like to know about it. So, if the hon. Gentleman has this information, I would be very grateful to receive it.

Thank you.

#### Q775/2016

#### Expenditure incurred

**Clerk:** Question 775. The Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide details of all expenditure incurred since the answer to Question 604/2016 in respect of contracts awarded for making empty homes suitable for reallocation, stating to whom payments were made, how much has been paid, the number of residential homes pertaining to each payment, as well as indicating the type/nature of repair works or cleaning services undertaken?

**Clerk:** Answer the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

**Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, one contract has been awarded. This has been to Ace Plumbing for £10,380 for one property.

The works carried out by this company was general refurbishment works, which included plastering walls and ceilings, painting, replacing floor tiles, doors, plumbing, electrical work.

**Q776/2016**  
**Housing stock –**  
**Properties vacated by senior citizens**

**Clerk:** Question 776. The Hon. E J Reyes.

135

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Housing provide details of how many rental homes have been allocated and/or assigned by Government, inclusive of room composition of said homes, from the stock returned or earmarked to be returned by the new tenants who have moved or will be moving into the newly built senior citizens' rental homes?

140

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

**Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, the elderly citizens' flats have not yet been handed over to them, which means that these occupants' flats have not been vacated and, as such, their flats cannot be returned to the housing stock for allocation to new tenants yet.

145

**Hon. E J Reyes:** I can understand from that, Mr Speaker, yes, it is probably an ongoing exercise.

150

To avoid me posing the question next month if it is still not going to be ready, would the hon. Lady please give me an indication by when this exercise will be complete and I can then – with your permission, Mr Speaker – time the question to be repeated at that stage?

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** In terms of Parliament Questions, Mr Speaker, I think that it would be safe to say, for an accurate answer, not before the January session.

155

**Q777/2016**  
**New affordable homes purchased from Government –**  
**Complaints re defects**

**Clerk:** Question 777. The Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, how many complaints have been received from the purchasers of new affordable homes from Government in relation to defects in those homes or the estate in which those homes are located, listing the defects complained of?

160

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

**Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, any defects arising from the sale of the new affordable homes are tackled as part of the snagging process when the sales are completed. These are not considered complaints, as such. Most defects or snags have now been rectified and only a few remain to be rectified, mainly in the case of the more recent completions.

165



**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, does she have a list of defects? That is the question.

170

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Well, Mr Speaker, my answer to the question was that they are not defects, they are snags. In relation to concerns or snags, there have been some concerns that have been raised.

175

There have been things like security issues raised because of the barriers of Beach View Terraces. These have been replaced.

There have been concerns and snags in relation to the communal water pumps, and this is something that we have referred to those who installed the water pumps for maintenance.

180

We have had reports in relation to the lifts. These have been looked at. We have had advice in relation to the lifts that this was on account of the speed and the power setting to which they were set during the time that people were moving in, given the volume of traffic that we would have had on the lifts and because unfortunately some people were inappropriately using the lifts, but that is something that is not really relevant now because the bulk of the people have moved in.

Mr Speaker, those are generally the concerns that have been brought to our attention.

185

I met with the committee of Beach View Terraces two weeks ago with the Chief Minister, where we looked at the concerns that they had raised, so anything that may be pending is of course going to be tackled with the team, and I will be meeting with the caretaker committee of the Mons Calpe Estate very shortly.

190

**Hon. D A Feetham:** So, Mr Speaker, apart from the 'snags', as she calls it, that she has listed, there are no other issues that have been notified to the Minister by GRP in relation to this estate?

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Not beyond the general snagging, Mr Speaker.

195

I have outlined some of the issues in relation to Beach View that we have had so far ... had complaints from Mons Calpe Mews, which was some noisy communal mechanical extractors, and these are currently being addressed by the contractor.

200

What we have, Mr Speaker, at the moment is the general teething problems that one would very reasonably expect from an estate that has just been completed and given the size of the estate, but as soon as these are reported through GRP we are looking at the appropriate remedial action, most of which is to refer it to the contractor.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is it the case that a lift in one of these blocks fell two floors down from where it was positioned?

205

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, there was a post on Facebook insofar as the lift, and of course I asked for this to be investigated. There is CCTV both inside the lifts and in the estates, and having checked this what happened was that a trigger in the lift was set, which means that the lift, when the trigger is set, will take the lift and any passengers to the ground floor. It is not as if the lift fell. It is part of the general mechanics of the lift and it is standard safety procedure. That is what happened, and having checked the CCTV we are satisfied that what happened was what should happen in the general course of things. Of course, Mr Speaker, we have checked this and verified it with the Fire Brigade and there have been all sorts of checks.

210

Because of course the hon. Gentleman saw it on Facebook, which is where it was, it was brought to my attention and I immediately checked it. In fact, because people had raised issues about the lift, I rode in the lifts myself quite a number of times, Mr Speaker, just to check that they were fine and I am satisfied that they were.

215

220 **Hon. D A Feetham:** The hon. Lady said that she was currently discussing with the management committee or a committee of tenants certain issues that have arisen. What are those issues that she is now discussing with those tenants?

225 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Well, Mr Speaker, they are in fact the issues that I just read out. These are issues which are generally latent defects from the construction, which the caretaker committee wanted to discuss with the Government and give our assurance that we would deal with these appropriately with the contractor.

230 Of course, Mr Speaker, if Government has dealt with the defects that unfortunately the tenants at Nelson's View, Bayview and Cumberland inherited – and that is something that we inherited as a Government because those defects were not dealt with by the administration at the time and it is something that we committed to remedy – then of course we are going to remedy any latent defects which may arise from these construction projects, and we have of course given those assurances.

235 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, the reason why I asked that particular question was because the hon. Lady divided her answer into two stages. She said there are defects – or 'snags', as she called them – that have already been dealt with, and there are defects that have been left over that are now being discussed with the management or the committee that she mentioned, and it is in relation to those ones that I am asking.

240 Can she give more details in relation to which ones? Because of course, she has in her answer mentioned a number of issues. She then said they had been dealt with, and she then mentioned later on that there have been these conversations, an ongoing dialogue with this committee of tenants in order to deal with outstanding issues. I just want to know what are the outstanding issues, because the hon. Lady saying, 'Well, I have already referred to it.' Yes, you have referred to it, but there are two types: ones that the Government have already dealt with; and I am interested in the ones that are still outstanding.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman – the whole House – will be very happy to hear that we are dealing with really very, very, very, very minor issues.

250 The hon. Lady and I attended the magnificent development at Beach View Terraces, which is now the happy home of so many hundreds of Gibraltarian couples and homeowners, and we found that there is in fact very little of any concern. What we are dealing with are, for example: a fascia that may have not been screwed down properly – it was something that was added after snagging, it needs a little bit of tightening; some of the external doors, because of people having – as we all know Gibraltarians do – done so much work when they have moved in, some doors to the rubbish area have been damaged. Those are the sorts of things that we are looking at. In one particular corridor there was a lot of wind because it is a windy area and water may flow in, when it rains, with the wind, so we are looking at whether it is possible to create some short walls by the doors so that water does not flow into homes – very minor issues that are being dealt with, that the Government is very happy to deal with; the sorts of things that any developer would be delighted to be dealing with after a new project has been completed. Having been involved in my professional career with private developments, very, very minor issues to deal with, compared even to some of the top residential estates developed in Gibraltar for much more expensive accommodation.

260 So, working with the caretaker committee, I think that we have made huge progress already in the work that GRP has done in dealing with the snagging issues, huge progress already in dealing with the minor defects that are left, and the Minister and I were delighted to attend to be able to see for ourselves what the remaining minor issues were. I am happy to tell the House that I committed myself there, having received such a warm and enthusiastic welcome on my arrival at the estate from the happy purchasers, to return before Christmas to see whether these minor issues that remained outstanding had been dealt with. So the House will no doubt be very

happy to see that the investment made by these Gibraltarians in their new homes is one that is not subject to any major problems whatsoever and the Government is committed to dealing with the minor issues that remain.

275 **Hon. D A Feetham:** So can I take it from the answer the hon. Gentleman has given that these issues will be dealt with by the end of the year – or does he envisage any further timescale for dealing with these issues?

280 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, there are some issues that will not be dealt with by the end of the year. For example, one of them is the movement of a vehicle barrier where the tenants want to talk to GRP about the possibility of placing it somewhere else to provide a different sort of security. We have tried two types of barriers: one of them does not have a scissor system underneath, and one does. They appear to prefer the scissor system and one of the barriers that goes out onto Eastern Beach Road may be moved because it may be a better traffic management issue for the estate. We are happy to look at that. That, for example, will not be dealt with by the end of the year; it will require a design and it will require procurement if the tenants decide that they want to go down that route. Other issues will very likely be dealt with long before the end of the year if they are minor and the materials necessary are available; otherwise, they will be dealt with very, very quickly after the New Year.

290 Again, as I say to the hon. Gentleman, I will continue to visit the estate and to ensure that everything has been dealt with and to continue to receive the enthusiastic and warm welcome that I receive when I visit these estates – and not just the ones developed by my administration; also the ones developed by former administrations, where I have sorted out the problems and I have received just as enthusiastic a welcome.

295 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, I am glad to hear that the Chief Minister and the Minister for Housing have attended on site and are going to return.

Can I ask the Chief Minister ... Maybe he was aware, or if not, on his next visit can he please look out on the actual landings on each floor – so it may have missed the snagging list that the individual tenant or the individual purchaser fills in. It is a communal area along the corridors. If one looks up to the roof, the sort of covering that has been made to the concrete is made of a material that, in my unprofessional opinion, I saw starting to become rusty. It coincides with what the Chief Minister was trying to say that the committee had explained to him – that there is some water that comes in from the side that is going to be tackled, but once a piece of material gathers rust one knows from experience that it just continues, and if we can nip it in the bud ... Perhaps the Chief Minister can commit himself to be in the look out and look up and just ensure that those ... They seem to be a corrugated type of sheets ... so we can tackle that and avoid future problems for purchasers.

310 **Hon. Chief Minister:** I am grateful for the hon. Gentleman's unprofessional opinion.

Mr Speaker, it is an issue that was pointed out to us at the time that we were there. We were with the contractor, with JBS, who demonstrated that it is not rust; it is actually dirt and it comes off, and the mechanism for dealing with it was explained to the members of the committee. If in some areas it has progressed to rust – and I have no reason to believe that it has – it will of course be dealt with, but it would be covered by the warranty of the material used, and a lot of what we are talking about is going back to the warranty for those who provided the material and they will be the ones replacing any of those sheets or doors that may have suffered rust, if they are in fact suffering rust. But there were very few incidences of that. In a huge estate, as that is, I saw two or three doors which were suffering rust because of the weathering in the area lower down on the beach, which is closer to the saltwater spray, and which had been damaged – therefore the paint had been damaged – as a result of people doing their own DIY etc. The

saltwater was then able to get in and create an element of rust, but it is in within warranty and it will be dealt with on a warranty basis.

325 So those are the issues, Mr Speaker. Given the sorts of issues this House has in the past heard referred to in respect of serious defects in other estates, I think the whole House will be very happy indeed that we are dealing with very, very minor issues here and, very will want to congratulate ... I will not say the Government, because the House never wants to congratulate the Government unanimously; it tends to only want to do so on a division of 10-7, or at least 10-6, but will want to congratulate the contractor for the excellent work that they have done in this  
330 estate and will want to wish well to all the purchasers who are enjoying the benefit of these affordable homes, a place in which they will build their families and homes which they will enjoy, I hope, for many years.

**Q778/2016**

**Government estate lifts –  
Timescale for completion**

**Clerk:** Question 778. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

335 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Is there a timescale for completion of installation of lifts in Government estates?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

340 **Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Yes, Mr Speaker, this goes hand in hand with the refurbishment programme. The programme is currently being revised and will factor the infrastructure works required for the lift installation.

**Clerk:** Question 779.

345 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, this is a question that was asked at the beginning of ... well, certainly I think it was March or April – not March or April, because we had the Referendum, but it was either before March or after the Referendum – and the answer that came back at the time was that there were various phases in relation to the development, certainly in the Moorish Castle, Laguna and also Glacis Estates.  
350

The first phase for completion was September. Now that has not still been completed, and can the Government now give a different completion date, bearing in mind that obviously the answers that were given prior to the summer have proved to be inaccurate, or at the very least the Government has obviously not been able to keep to that?  
355

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, the completion of the estates was to be phased, and I have provided dates in Parliament in the past. However, completion of the phases is ... What we do is we look at the completion of the estate in percentage terms, and in each phase the majority of the refurbishment is complete, and while there are – (*Interjection*) Mr Speaker, in any event the dates that I have provided in the past need to be revised. I do not know what the revised dates for some of them are. Not all need to be revised, just some of them, and I do not know what those dates are until I am advised. I am waiting for the outcome of the revision.  
360

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, could the Minister advise whether the Government is looking at whether there has been any breach of contract in the supply of these lifts or the installation of these lifts?  
365

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, no, because it is not relevant.

370 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Well, Mr Speaker, there is a delay and there is obviously a delay in the installation of the lifts. How can breach of contract not be relevant?

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, for a simple reason: because it is not about the supply of the lifts.

375 **Hon. R M Clinton:** I am grateful for the Chief Minister's intervention. Perhaps just for my information and perhaps for the general public, who is responsible for the installation of the lifts?

380 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I do not think that is a question that arises from this original question, but to go back to where we were in respect of the question that the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition referred to, if he goes back and looks at the *Hansard* he will understand then, after reading of the *Hansard*, why it was that the delay arose, and it relates to the installation of the three-phase supply, which is a matter for the Gibraltar Electricity Authority.

#### Q779/2016

#### Fire in Government rented accommodation – Care plans re tenants

385 **Clerk:** Question 779. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** What policy is in place with regard to taking care of individuals and families when there is a fire in a Government rented accommodation?

390 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

**Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, when individuals and families are required to be decanted from their homes, alternative accommodation in the form of a hotel or a self-catering apartment is obtained. If hotel accommodation is provided, then the family is given £10 per person per day food allowance, which they can claim by providing the relevant receipts.

400 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I was wondering whether it would be more cost efficient for the taxpayer to have a stock of designated flats or a couple of flats saved up for emergencies, because I can imagine that housing the victims in hotels must be quite an expense, and this was a question I wanted to ask or suggest.

405 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, the answer to whether it makes more financial sense is no, firstly and foremost because of the demand on housing stock and because we of course cannot predict when we have a need for decanting. Urgent decanting is not something that we experience often and it is not something that we can predict, because when we require urgent decanting it will be, unfortunately, on account of something that happens drastically, whether it is a fire, whether it is a flooding, and it is just an emergency situation. Usually, those situations are remedied quite quickly in order to accommodate the family. They can be accommodated in two ways, depending on the damage. It is whether we can repair the damage quickly enough for them to return to the original tenancy, or it maybe that we can accommodate them elsewhere,

410 but we are always looking at the most cost-effective way of providing it. The period during which

they stay in accommodation is relatively short, so this is the most cost-effective way of providing it in terms of the bigger picture, because it would not be practical or practicable really to have empty flats just lying empty, lying dormant just waiting for cases such as these, and it may be that these cases do not happen.

**Clerk:** Question 780 – sorry.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Thank you very much.

Mr Speaker, can the Minister outline what is Government policy in this area? If there is a fire, for example, or if there is a flood but the fault lies with the tenant, does the Government still decant even in those circumstances?

And then, with the next question – I will ask it now, rather than stand up, with your leave Mr Speaker, if I can ask another supplementary – is: does the policy apply, for example, to a situation where somebody is a co-owner in one of the co-ownership estates? It strikes me that you could have a situation where somebody who is a co-owner in a co-ownership estate may, through tragic circumstances, have a fire in their flat and they are not decanted, and somebody in a Government estate who may be at fault for the fire, for example, is decanted. I am just trying to explore with the hon. Lady what the policy is in relation to Government estates and also compare to co-ownership estates.

**Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, I will take the last question first in relation to someone in a co-ownership estate, because, when someone is an owner in a co-ownership estate of course the Government is holding the co-ownership part on trust. Those people are private tenants of their properties, so that is not something that the Government would step in... The Government has no duty to step in and decant in those cases.

Now, the Government's policy in relation... The Government has a duty to decant in Government rental estates. Decanting is one thing, and then the expenditure as a result of the decanting is a different thing. It may be that in some cases people need to subsequently reimburse any expenses as a result of the decanting, but that is subject to evidence and police investigations etc.

#### Q780/2016

#### Health and Safety Advisory Council – Number of meetings

**Clerk:** Question 780. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** How many times has the Health and Safety Advisory Council met since its inception this year?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

**Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, the Health and Safety Advisory Council has not met since its inception this year.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I do understand that the Health and Safety Advisory Council has been in inception since May, and if it has not met since, how seriously is the Government taking this Council if in the last seven months it has not met?

**Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, perhaps I may assist the hon. Lady, as I was the Minister for Health and Safety before the new allocation of responsibilities.

460 The hon. lady may recall that the Government introduced an entirely new policy document that had been worked out particularly with Unite the union, which had been driving the agenda in respect of health and safety in the workplace. There had been consultation, of course, with other stakeholders, and there was the original Health and Safety Advisory meeting where the different stakeholders to that Advisory Council met and who are all able to set out their own particular concerns in respect of health and safety.

465 From memory, the Advisory Council agreed that they would nominate certain additional people whom they thought may be important to add to the work and deliberations of that committee. And, again from memory, if I recall correctly I also asked, as chair of that meeting, for the participants to set out in writing and to distribute by e-mail the different objectives, in addition to the ones that had been identified by the Government.

470 In addition to the Advisory Council meeting, I did meet then separately with some of the stakeholders that were the Advisory Council for them to provide me with some additional names. The hon. Lady has a draft additional policy that deals with how management can best address health and safety issues in the workplace, so I think that the next stage would be for the hon. Lady to be able to be briefed as to the different names that the stakeholders have proposed to be included in the Advisory Council to see what participation there has been from the existing members as to what objectives should be met by the Advisory Council, and then at that point be able to progress to the second meeting.

I hope that was of assistance to the hon. Lady.

480 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Thank you for the information. So, based on the information that I have been given, can the Government, or the two hon. Members, envisage when and how long, more or less, they expect to have another meeting?

485 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, having taken over this responsibility just recently, now of course I am at a stage where, having had the benefit of the information, I really intend to call a meeting of this Council very shortly to make sure that it is something that continues to be live.

**Q781 and 783/2016**  
**Bruce's Farm –**  
**Admissions since January 2012; number of relapses**

**Clerk:** Question 781. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

490 **Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Can the Government provide statistics of how many people have been admitted to Bruce's Farm since January 2012?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

495 **Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 783.

**Clerk:** Question 783. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

500 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Is the Government aware of how many people who have undertaken the rehabilitation programme since January 2012 at Bruce's Farm have relapsed into their addiction?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

505 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, 206 people have been admitted to Bruce's Farm since January 2012. Of these, 73 have relapsed.

**Q782/2016**  
**Bruce's Farm –**  
**Drugs detoxification programme first stop**

**Clerk:** We now move back to Question 782. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

510 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** How many addicts have started their drugs detoxification programme at Bruce's Farm as opposed to the first stop at Ocean Views?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

515 **Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, three people.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, may I ask the reason why, despite the policy – which, as I remember, we discussed in fact last month – of the first stop needing to be Ocean Views, why these three cases would have started instead at Bruce's Farm?

520 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Because, Mr Speaker, what we were discussing last time was having Bruce's Farm as a substitute to Ocean View. They are not mutually exclusive, but what we cannot have, Mr Speaker, is someone going through clinical withdrawal up in Bruce's Farm, where we do not have the clinical staff to ensure that we do so in a safe environment. If three  
525 people have undertaken detox at Bruce's Farm it is because they have been deemed to be able to detoxify in Bruce's Farm safely.

When we look at addiction, there is a wide range of addiction and there is also a wide range of level of substance abuse. Some substance abuse is complicated. Some substance abuse can be polysubstance abuse, because some people can take tranquilisers mixed with alcohol; other  
530 people can be addicted to cocaine, to cannabis. Some detoxification requires a long period of supervision. Some may require a two-week detoxification process at Ocean View and some may require just a day or two detoxification, where literally, because of the nature of the addiction and the substance that is being used, what they require is maybe a day or two to sleep it off under supervision. It all depends on the nature of the drug or the substance that is being taken.

535 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Thank you for that information.

Who is the team or the body exactly that takes this decision as to where the patient goes? I understand that the bulk do start in Ocean Views, but who takes the decisions for those who do not?

540 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** The bulk does not necessarily have to start at Ocean View – I need to correct the hon. Lady. Again, depending on the substance and depending on the level, there will always be a medical professional involved, but it will depend on the circumstances and it will also depend on whether the person is known to Bruce's Farm or not. People relapse but a



545 relapse is not necessarily a really bad thing, because some people relapse and are readmitted. A  
relapse is not a failure; a relapse is a normal... sometimes, unfortunately. Addiction is not an  
exact science, and nor is rehabilitation – it will depend on the person, it will depend on the  
550 circumstances, and sometimes people need to go to rehabilitation facilities three or four times  
before it is successful. But some people may, for example, be free from addiction for a while,  
may relapse, and because they are already known to Bruce’s Farm and their personality will be  
known and their drug of choice is known, in some circumstances it may be deemed to be safe to  
admit them following an assessment by the Bruce’s Farm team in conjunction with the GP. In  
555 other circumstances we may require the GHA psychologist to assess the person, but there will  
always be medical professionals involved. But it depends on the person, because it is, of course,  
a person-centred system.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Thank you.

The only confusion I have here is that the Minister corrected me when I said that the bulk, as  
per previous discussions, start at Ocean Views, and the hon. Lady says that that is not necessarily  
560 the case. I do not understand how it is not when we talk about... I have been told that, since  
2012, 206 have ended up in Bruce’s Farm. If we are talking about two or three people that the  
Lady has mentioned starting at Bruce’s Farm, is it not the case that the bulk do start at Ocean  
Views?

565 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Only, Mr Speaker, if they require detoxification, because not  
everybody who requires rehabilitation therapy will require detoxification. Some people, actually,  
who enter Bruce’s Farm... Yes, a lot of people do go to Ocean View – they need to go to Ocean  
View because of the detoxification – but it will depend on the person, and the statistics vary  
570 from year to year. But some people call to be admitted to Bruce’s Farm because they may be  
people who have been undergoing the programme for a while and they feel that they are going  
to relapse and therefore ask for admission, so they have not actually been using. And not all  
drugs require detoxification. It all depends on the nature of the drug, it depends on the nature  
of the person, it depends on the level and the extent of the problem.

## CULTURE, THE MEDIA, YOUTH AND SPORT

Q732/2016

### Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority – Vacant posts

575 **Clerk:** We now move to Questions to the Hon. the Minister for Culture, Media, Youth and  
Sport. We start with Question 732. The Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, following on from the answer provided to Question 617/2016,  
can the Minister for Sports inform this House if the three vacancies within the Gibraltar Sports  
and Leisure Authority have now been filled?  
580

**Clerk:** Answer the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

**Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the  
vacancy for Assistant Sports Development and Training Officer has been filled with a successful  
candidate starting employment with the GSLA on the 1st December 2016.

The closing dates for the other two internal vacancies, namely the Centre Manager, grade 5, and Assistant Administration Manager, grade 4, have now elapsed. Candidates will be interviewed in the very near future.

585 **Hon. E J Reyes:** I am a bit lost, Mr Speaker. Perhaps the Minister can clarify where my error is. Last month I was told that there were three vacancies and that interviews were taking place as we spoke. I am now informed that two appointments have been made with the successful applicants taking posts on 1st December, and there seem to be another two internal... Two and two is four, so perhaps the Minister can explain where I have mistakenly understood his figures.

590 **Hon. S E Linares:** Yes, Mr Speaker, it is one and two. The vacancy that has been filled is the Assistant Sports Development and Training Officer. That one has been filled and will start on 1st December – that is one. And then there are another two – that adds up to the three that you asked last month – and the closing dates are in two internal vacancies, namely the Centre Manager and the Assistant Administration Manager, grade 4. These have now, like I said, 595 elapsed. That means that the time for applying and all that has elapsed and now they are in the interview process, which is going to happen within the next week or two, I assume.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, for the two pending vacancies the application deadline date has elapsed and therefore that is now work in progress on the internal vacancies. Then did I 600 understand the Minister correctly saying that two other posts have been filled in as of 1st December? I still end up concluding one. I have heard two were taking posts on 1st December – am I wrong, then?

**Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, for ease for the hon. Member, I said the vacancy for the 605 Assistant Sports Development and Training Officer... It is *one* post – (*Interjection*) Maybe the confusion has been because you are thinking it is one Sports Development Officer and then one Training Officer. It is *one* post.

610 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Thank you, Mr Speaker. That led me to conclude that there were two. I now seem to have up to date information and I look forward in due course to finding out when the two internal vacancies have been filled.

**Q733/2016**  
**Sports-related grants –**  
**Update re payments made**

**Clerk:** Question 733. The Hon. E J Reyes.

615 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Sports provide updated details of all payments made during this current financial year in respect of any sports-related grants since the answer provided to Question 618/2016?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

**Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, I now hand over to the hon. Member opposite an updated schedule in respect of all payments made during this current financial year in respect of sports-related grants.

I take this opportunity to remind the hon. Member that updated information is posted on the GSLA website, [www.gsla.gi](http://www.gsla.gi). These changes are effected on a monthly basis or as and when

required. If I just give a little explanation as to what 'as or when required' means, sometimes the hon. Member might see in the post that, for example, it is updated in September and it is now November and the update date is September – the hon. Member might think that it has not been updated for two months. It means that there has not been any change and therefore they do not put a date of when it is revised or looked at.

**Answer to Question 733/2016**

*Grants Awarded for Sports Development Projects.*

Athletics	4,427.71
Badminton	2,148.67
Chess	14,737.00
Hockey	2,986.50
Netball	514.48
Rhythmic Gymnastics	5,664.00
Rowing	832.53
Shooting	24,730.62
Triathlon	290.00
Backgammon	3807.10
Gibraltar Chess professional	14738.16

*Grants Awarded for International Competitions.*

Island Games	81,896.48
Straits Games	10,147.55

*Grants awarded to Sporting Societies.*

Athletics	7,718.84
Basketball	60,790.20
Darts	6,904.64
Hockey	2,0254.61
Netball	5,409.87
Pool	14,713.95
Rowing	4,615.23
Sea Angling	8,465.50
Shooting	11,090.67
Tenpin Bowling	2,028.59

*Hosting of Special Sports and Leisure Events.*

Classic Vehicle Association	1,200.00
Cleaning after Boxing event	57.60
Cleaning after Bike Rally	645.00
Cleaning after Beer festival	240.00
EHF Challenge 3 Cup	5,124.50
FIBA Senior Women's Cup	7,210.00
Backgammon Tournament	37,500.00
Gib Kennel Club	10,175.70
Gib Snooker Tournament	77,515.00
PDF Darts Trophy	34,081.60
Gibsport Sports Day	2,400.00
GMF Geotextile Flooring	4,870.00
Harley Davidson rally	4,500.00
Inauguration of Sports Complex	1,750.00
Jnr Chess Tournament	35,000.00
King's Bowl Rock Masters Tournament	16,000.00
Netball Europe U17 Champs	8,163.08
Sports Days Sound System	6,100.00
Squash Open 2015 & 2016	10,000.00
Thundercat racing event	27,950.00
UEFA Champ League	2,990.20
UEFA Futsal Comp	8,340.34
Yacht Regatta	6,528.00

620

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, that clarification does help, because I posed a question to say it has not been updated for sometime and I thought the staff had not had an opportunity to physically update it. I now understand that concept and that will guide me for future questioning.

**Q734/2016**  
**Cultural grants –**  
**Update re awards made**

625 **Clerk:** Question 734. The Hon. E J Reyes.

**Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, all further cultural grants... Sorry!

630 **A Member:** Answering the question before it is asked! *(Laughter)*

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, we are such good friends that he knows before I speak what it is I am going to say and ask! *(Laughter)* I am sure the Speaker will appreciate that friendship that we have, that we can actually mind-read each other!

635 Mr Speaker, Question 734, if I am correct: can the Minister for Culture provide updated details of any cultural grants awarded since the answer to Question 619/2016

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

640 **Hon. S E Linares:** And here goes the answer: no further cultural grants have been awarded since my answer to Question 619/2016.

I take this opportunity to remind the hon. Member that updated information is posted on the statistics section of the HMGOG website, [www.gibraltar.gov.gi](http://www.gibraltar.gov.gi) on a regular basis.

645 Again, Mr Speaker, I emphasise because it was... and this is the actual example of... You asked this last month. There has been no update, no further payments – therefore the update is shown

there – probably October or September – and therefore it is not that it has not been updated; it means that there have not been any payments and therefore there is no need to upgrade the website.

650 It could be that one way of doing it is saying ‘revised date’. I could probably tell the IT department to just say ‘revised date’, and that means that the hon. Member would know that when he goes to, for example, now, November, it has been revised and therefore that is the latest that you would get.

655 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, that is what I was thinking of, because it could so happen that for two months there have been no grants passed through Treasury and so on and therefore it cannot be updated, but I would be none the wiser whether it is because no activity has happened. But I think the Minister is starting to head in the right direction. We could ask the IT department to say ‘updated as at’, and then... We are not interested in the actual date when the payment was made, just the concept of how much has been given to a particular type of  
660 activity, so even if there is no movement, if we just put ‘updated at’, then I know that there is no need... or I could pose a question arising from the information there, but it would save some time in having to entertain my tedious requests for information.

665 **Hon. S E Linares:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I can assure you and the hon. Member that it would avoid me having to answer the questions as well, and can I also guarantee the hon. Member that I keep tabs on this so that I do not get the questions every month.

**Q735/2016**  
**Play parks –**  
**Maintenance programme**

670 **Clerk:** Question 735. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Is there a planned maintenance programme for our play parks in Gibraltar?

675 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

**Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the GSLA conducts daily checks and undertakes spot repairs on a daily basis on all parks and playgrounds under their remit.  
680

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, on issues of hygiene and health and safety... This was what made me ask this question. I frequent the parks quite often as I have young children and I find that the standard of hygiene and the rubbish left about and issues of health and safety in terms of the odd metal bar sticking out every now and then in different places can be quite a  
685 danger for children. So I ask the Minister to please either enlighten us as to whether he is satisfied with the level of supervision that there is through the GSLA, as he has mentioned, or if he would be willing so step it up a notch, because I can assure him that the things I have witnessed are not good enough for our young children.

690 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, I encourage the hon. Lady that, whenever she sees anything in a park that she is not happy with or feel that it is unsafe, there is a hotline which you can ring and I can assure the hon. Lady that within, at the maximum, 24 hours there will be a team there to tackle, either to make safe provisionally or to completely fix, whatever is damaged. And the hygiene is the same: if the hon. Lady, who says she frequents the parks, is not happy with any of

695 the services, there is a hotline because there is a team which is there specifically to look after  
the parks. I can guarantee the hon. Lady that when anybody rings the hotline it is tackled  
immediately because we do take seriously the health and safety of the parks.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I do not doubt that the Minister and any other  
700 Gibraltarian would take seriously such a crucial part of our leisure life, but if there is a hotline I  
did not know about it and I frequent the parks. Can I ask the Minister to consider, as a matter of  
priority, putting signs in different parks with the hotline so that parents can call up when they do  
see something. I do think that that would be a constructive approach.

**Hon. S E Linares:** Yes, Mr Speaker, there are in all the parks... I will have a look at it. Maybe  
705 they are not as visible as they should be, but I can honestly say that instructions were given...  
and I have gone to certain parks... maybe not in a visual place, but they are there and I can  
guarantee... I was the instigator of having a hotline there so that they have a mobile... You ring  
up and they attend to it as soon as is physically possible.

710 I will take on what the hon. Lady says and I will have a look again, because maybe it has  
either been missed or is not visible enough.

**Q736/2016**

**Queens Cinema and Hotel –  
Update re plans for future use**

715 **Clerk:** Question 736. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Are there plans for the theatre complex and other bodies which  
were planned to be housed in Queens Cinema and Queens Hotel buildings going ahead?

720 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

**Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the answer  
remains the same as set out by the Chief Minister in answer to supplementary questions, to  
Question 611/2016 last month.

725 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, at the expense of not having done my homework, I  
have to say that the main reason for my question was actually the concern that I live very close  
by and I can see it all the time. I have noticed that there have been break-ins, there has been  
vandalism and it is something that concerns me very much.

730 Of course, the manifesto commitment of completing the project goes without saying, but I  
was actually coming more from a point of safety. I am not as savvy to find this answer as quickly,  
but if the answer to that is yes and that there is something in the pipeline, can we, in the  
interim, ensure that there is some kind of fencing or security to stop any further break-ins or  
vandalism?

735 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, I am sure the hon. Lady is talking about the cinema –(**Hon. Ms  
M D Hassan Nahon:** Yes.) as opposed to the hotel, because with the hotel there are people living  
there and it is pretty safe anyway.

740 I have had a few calls to me about the safety of that. We do have GCS, who constantly go  
there and make sure that windows are closed or that, if a window is broken, there is a board put  
up. So, as far as is possible, if they call we react.

So, again, I ask the hon. Lady, or whoever is worried about that place, to call GCS and they  
will again react and do something about the safety. I understand – I have had a few phone calls

745 myself saying the window of the Queens Cinema is wide open and they have seen people going in, or youngsters going in. I can assure the hon. Lady that, again, if we get notice of what is happening we will react to as soon as is possible. (*Interjections by Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon and Hon. Chief Minister*)

**TOURISM, EMPLOYMENT, COMMERCIAL AVIATION AND THE PORT**

**Q786-787/2016**

**Disability tax allowance –  
Number of claimants; beneficial value**

750 **Clerk:** We now move to questions to the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port. We commence with Question 786 and I believe it is the Hon. Mr Trevor Hammond who is asking on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

755 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide details of how many taxpayers are currently claiming the disability tax allowance?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.

**Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 787/2016.

760 **Clerk:** Question 787.

765 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government provide details of the effective beneficial value taxpayers claiming the disability tax allowance have actually benefited from in each tax year since 2011-12?

**Clerk:** Answer the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.

770 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, under the Income Tax (Allowance, Deductions and Exemptions) Rules 1992 there is no Disability Tax Allowance. Rule 7A of the Income Tax (Allowance, Deductions and Exemptions) Rules 1992 provides an allowance for parents of disabled individuals.

In this respect there are currently 69 taxpayers claiming this allowance.

775 The total beneficial value in respect of this allowance for each tax year since 2011-12 is as follows: 2011-12, £27,771; 2012-13, £23,358; 2013-14, £44,650; 2014-15, £34,460; 2015-16, £11,350; 2016-17, nil.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

780 **Clerk:** Question 788. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Going back to the previous question, Mr Speaker, just looking at those figures – thirty-seven thousand-odd for 2012, £23,000 for 2013, £44,000 for 2014, £34,000 for 2015, and then there is a sharp decline by two thirds to £11,000 at the end of the financial year

785 ending 2016 – can the Minister afford an explanation in relation to why there is that sharp  
decline for that year, please?

**Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, the reason is quite simply that the assessments are still  
790 pending. For 2016-17 the assessments are not made. Even though the claim is made by  
taxpayers, the actual tax assessment for the individuals is not made until after the end of the  
year and after the employers provide what is called a P8 form in respect of all the employees.  
Subsequently, the assessments are made and that is why the beneficial value this year is nil –  
because those assessments have not been made, even though there are currently 69 taxpayers  
795 claiming that allowance. (**A Member:** £11k.) Well £11k is last year, so there are a number of  
assessments which are still pending. That is why you see nil this year, £11,000 and then there is  
a jump, because the further back we go the more assessments will have been made for that  
particular tax year. For this year no tax assessments have been made because the year has not  
ended.

800 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q788/2016**  
**Gibraltar Tourist Board –**  
**Workers not directly employed by GTB**

**Clerk:** Question 788. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

805 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Government disclose how many workers not  
directly employed by the Gibraltar Tourist Board are providing services to the Gibraltar Tourist  
Board during each financial year since the 30th March 2012, 2013, 2014, 2015, 2016 and during  
this current financial year?

810 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the  
Port.

**Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon. G H Licudi):**  
Mr Speaker, the information requested is as follows: 2012-13, 1; 2013-14, 11; 2014-15, 11; 2015-  
815 16, 7; 2016-17, 6.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q789/2016**  
**Gibraltar Tourist Board –**  
**Subcontracted workers**

**Clerk:** Question 789. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

820 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government disclose how many subcontracted workers are  
providing services to the Gibraltar Tourist Board during each financial year since 30th March  
2012, 2013, 2014, 2015 and 2016 to date, providing details of roles and duties assigned to each  
subcontracted worker, the entity of the employer the worker is employed by and the reason for  
825 requiring their services?



**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.

**Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon. G H Licudi):**  
830 Mr Speaker, since July 2012 the Gibraltar Tourist Board has subcontracted one worker. The individual concerned is employed as a marketing consultant specialising in airline route development. The individual is self-employed. The person was employed to help develop air services to Gibraltar, the results of which are apparent, and to support the GTB's marketing team.

**Q790/2016**  
**Tourist information and survey officers –**  
**Numbers employed**

835 **Clerk:** Question 790. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government provide statistics of how many tourist information and survey officers have been employed during each summer season, usually done by students, for 2012, 2013, 2014, 2015 and 2016?  
840

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.

**Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon. G H Licudi):**  
845 Mr Speaker, I believe the hon. Gentleman is referring to Visitor Information Patrol Officers employed in the past by the Gibraltar Tourist Board to give information to visitors during the summer months. If that is what he is referring to, I can confirm that 12 were employed in 2012, 2013 and 2014; 11 were employed in 2015; and none in 2016.

850 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Clerk:** Question 791 –

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, if I may just ask why it was decided not to employ any in  
855 2016.

**Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, this is something that was done by the students under the student scheme for the summer, which is in fact something that the Government does on a yearly basis. This year we have had less students than in previous years and the Gibraltar Tourist Board felt that this was a service which was not necessary and therefore we could dispense with this.  
860

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, in the past, when we say that students have performed this task, is it that students have directly applied to perform this task, or is it that the Government has allocated from a pool of students a number of students in order to undertake this task?  
865

**Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, I do not have the full or accurate answer to this. My understanding of the student scheme is that students apply to join the Government and then the Government decides where those students are allocated, whether it is the Income Tax Office, my office ... I have had one or two this particular year. It is not as if those students  
870

applied specifically to come to my office this particular year, but they generally apply for the scheme during the summer and the Government allocates them to the different Departments.

875 **Hon. D A Feetham:** That is my understanding too, and therefore it must follow that it is the Government that has taken the decision not to allocate any students to this particular task. Therefore there must be a reason. Could I ask the Minister for the reason?

880 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Yes, Mr Speaker, and I gave it in my original answer. The Gibraltar Tourist Board felt that this was a service, which was not necessary.

**Q791/2016**  
**Cruise ships –**  
**Number of disembarkations and total number of passengers**

**Clerk:** Question 791. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

885 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government provide a schedule of how many cruise ship passengers disembarked from each cruise ship arrival, together with the number of passengers on board each cruise ship, since January 2012?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.

890 **Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Gentleman is contained in the schedule now being handed to him.

Whilst the schedule is being taken over, can I just qualify or explain some of the information that the hon. Member will be getting.

895 The schedule contains for each month since January 2012 the cruise ships that have arrived in Gibraltar. It then contains three columns: number of passengers on board, number of crew on board and passengers of crew ashore. Although the question relates to the number of cruise ship passengers disembarked, this is not actually information that is provided by the cruise liners themselves. We have a total number of *people* who have disembarked, but amongst those  
900 people who have disembarked we will have, clearly, some crew members. So we have an initial breakdown of the number of passengers and the number of crew on board, but in respect of the numbers disembarking they are mixed together and a split is not given. Therefore, I cannot give the hon. Member the number of passengers who have disembarked. I can give the total number  
905 of people who have disembarked, but clearly, given that passengers will always be substantially more, in most cases, than members of the crew, the large percentage of the number of passengers and crew on board will in fact be passengers – but I cannot give him to the last person the exact number, because that information is simply not available.

Jan-12			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Oriana	1718	818	2125
MSC Splendida	3813	1295	4660
Princess Danae	292	244	375
Black Watch	716	329	865
MSC Splendida	3286	1299	4211

Feb-12			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
MSC Splendida	3326	1300	4205
MSC Splendida	3595	1294	4275
MSC Splendida	3454	1282	4096

Mar-12			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Costa Victoria	1606	746	1475
Grand Holiday	257	565	595

Apr-12			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Oceana	1994	872	2445
Kristina Katarina	319	95	295
Sebourn Spirit	172	171	200
Sebourn Odyssey	436	336	585
Boudicca	825	350	750
Ventura	3412	1232	3950
Azura	3352	1220	3850
Silver Cloud	195	214	250
Corinthian II	86	71	80
Queen Victoria	1957	971	2150
Oceana	2037	881	2345
Albatros	509	349	450
Oriana	1758	804	2175
Queen Victoria	1910	967	2595
Thomson Destiny	1367	518	1528
Empress	1021	641	1401
Azura	3200	1236	3923
Oceana	1987	884	2572
Black Watch	725	341	883

May-12			
NAME OF VESSEL	PAX ON BOARD	CREW ON BOARD	PAX/CREW ASHORE
Thomson Dream	1267	614	1625
Saga Pearl II	403	265	505
Grand Holiday	549	546	884
Serenade of the Seas	2025	852	2175
Thomson Spirit	1157	483	1125
Clipper Odyssey	33	71	45
Adonia	672	380	750
Rotterdam	1351	605	1350
Brilliance of the Seas	2021	889	2250
Clipper Odyssey	40	69	88
Discovery	489	283	599
Crown Princess	2548	1193	3305
Azura	3213	1204	3975
Island Escape	1507	547	1755
Grand Princess	2586	1090	2955
Eurodam	2096	877	2255
Thomson Dream	1487	616	1275
Kristina Katarina	273	94	200
Balmoral	1259	514	1445
Independence of the Seas	3797	1349	4493
Celebrity Eclipse	2752	1211	3525
MSC Divina	3380	1351	4201
Arcadia	1948	880	2475
Black Watch	740	314	910
Boudicca	808	348	985
Queen Elizabeth	2028	973	2635
MSC Magnifica	2419	962	2975
Oceana	2070	873	2380
Athena	482	247	550
Grand Princess	2551	1088	2975
Crystal Serenity	1009	638	1230
Ventura	3260	1203	3975

Jun-12			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Independence of the Seas	3981	1368	4500
Saga Ruby	562	378	795
Riviera	1241	774	1500
Azura	3204	1194	3695
Independence of the Seas	4053	1360	4927
Grand Princess	2622	1090	3309
Ventura	3315	1210	4071
Island Escape	1561	554	1874
Ocean Countess	747	339	650
Thomson Dream	1539	617	1250
Oceana	2122	864	1950
Jul-12			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Independence of the Seas	4176	1366	4565
Independence of the Seas	4298	1344	4690
Oceana	2158	871	2655
Crystal Serenity	814	604	1295
Ryndam	1353	578	1450
Crystal Serenity	570	605	850
Independence of the Seas	4357	1334	5125
Queen Victoria	2018	970	2505

Aug-12			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Grandeur of the Seas	2267	821	2504
Island Escape	1647	554	1891
Arcadia	2922	856	3226
Azura	3440	1218	3500
Grand Princess	2884	1129	3210
Thomson Dream	1629	612	1950
Ventura	3386	1226	3750
Independence of the Seas	4264	1336	5005
Balmoral	1362	507	1619
Ventura	3381	1226	4150
Grandeur of the Seas	2294	828	2700
Kristina Katarina	323	91	365
Oceana	2162	879	2450
Grand Princess	2882	1100	3250
Queen Elizabeth	2110	983	2750
Azamara Journey	530	414	600
Independence of the Seas	3956	1348	4725
Grandeur of the Seas	2218	812	2595
Ocean Princess	664	371	875
Queen Elizabeth	2064	987	2690

Sep-12			
NAME OF VESSEL	PAX ON BOARD	CREW ON BOARD	PAX/CREW ASHORE
Adonia	687	383	780
Azura	3185	1191	3905
Independence of the Seas	3806	1353	4481
Celebrity Eclipse	2870	1183	3595
Star Flyer	139	80	187
Island Escape	1513	547	1735
Prinsendam	796	458	1070
MSC Poesia	2296	962	2715
Riviera	1228	763	1690
Braemar	880	377	950
Grand Princess	2549	1089	2950
Rotterdam	1371	596	1250
Thomson Dream	1492	614	1375
Star Flyer	125	80	150
Discovery	500	284	550
Ventura	3099	1191	3250
MSC Magnifica	2434	970	2950
Deutschland	417	247	495
Marina	1205	769	1660
Oceana	2032	859	2505
Independence of the Seas	3771	1350	4610
Celebrity Eclipse	2861	1197	3599
SS Voyager	679	446	805
Empress	1534	653	1895
Star Flyer	124	76	160
Ventura	3341	1205	4105
Saga Sapphire	550	452	855

Oct-12			
NAME OF VESSEL	PAX ON BOARD	CREW ON BOARD	PAX/CREW ASHORE
Thomson Dream	1492	605	1600
Boudicca	852	353	750
Grand Princess	2576	1083	2900
Thomson Spirit	1224	485	1375
Ocean Countess	732	331	850
Star Flyer	90	77	100
Albatros	766	342	820
Aurora	1822	824	2175
Independence of the Seas	3733	1355	4620
Star Flyer	118	81	105
Rotterdam	1392	594	1711
Saga Ruby	604	379	500
Ventura	3171	1200	3275
Balmoral	1265	505	1155
Adonia	668	383	700
Star Flyer	100	82	120
Black Watch	706	348	850
Grand Princess	2612	1077	2755
Marco Polo	765	343	850
Hanseatic	140	122	185
Ryndam	1213	559	1490
Kristina Katarina	336	94	310
Corinthian II	96	70	130
Oceana	2091	863	2675
Kristina Katarina	293	92	250
Saga Sapphire	592	450	750
Boudicca	812	353	925

Nov-12			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Arcadia	2007	851	2250
Black Watch	747	342	650
Island Sky	98	76	80
Azamara Quest	554	431	650
Saga Ruby	568	390	675
Braemar	815	381	780
MSC Fantasia	2519	1271	3175
Maasdam	1154	558	1275
Azamara Quest	546	431	750
Oceana	2036	874	2155
Arcadia	1937	840	2405
Marina	1203	765	1670
Azamara Quest	571	403	775

Dec-12			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Costa Favolosa	1812	955	2150
Azamara Quest	561	379	701
Queen Elizabeth	1984	1001	2591
Pacific Princess	637	362	709
Azura	3065	1188	3881
Black Watch	700	335	802

SCHEDULE TO QUESTION 791/2016

Jan-13			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Queen Elizabeth	1960	1004	2565
Arcadia	1926	852	2401
Saga Ruby	534	383	755

Feb-13			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Costa Magica	2870	979	3425

Mar-13			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
MSC Lirica	907	674	1250
The World	143	257	250
Oriana	1775	792	2115
Black Watch	659	346	720
Oceana	2027	863	2581
Prinsendam	527	459	804
Azamara Quest	533	407	875
Quest for Adventure	320	262	405

Apr-13			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Fram	237	79	241
Azura	3383	1178	4051
Boudicca	722	355	893
Tere Moana	85	60	100
Oceana	1934	848	2125
Braemar	754	381	875
Azamara Quest	508	398	675
Seabourn Legend	153	174	200
Azamara Quest	601	400	850
Thomson Majesty	1391	596	1701
Horizon	1541	609	1887
Balmoral	806	526	1190
Seabourn Sojourn	442	341	605
Oriana	1844	772	2310
Ryndam	984	566	1288
Celebrity Equinox	2684	1212	3420
Hamburg	328	168	250

May-13			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Azura	3072	1154	3000
Saga Sapphire	546	432	765
Quest for Adventure	379	266	475
Thomson Spirit	1192	486	1350
Mariner of the Seas	2825	1195	3500
Ruby Princess	2626	1167	3340
Saga Sapphire	663	429	805
Adventure of the Seas	3171	1151	3815
Ventura	3128	1149	3570
Horizon	1360	596	1545
Costa Voyager	526	357	650
Kristina Katarina	292	93	250
Saga Ruby	473	372	750
Braemar	864	370	985
Hanseatic	166	116	235
Oceana	2035	834	2470
Celebrity Eclipse	2831	1190	3500
Crown Princess	3026	1163	3690
Thomson Dream	1573	607	1902
Ocean Princess	624	375	891
Disney Magic	2012	1049	2500



Jun-13			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Azamara Quest	496	442	750
Crystal Serenity	713	625	950
Oriana	1827	785	2101
Arcadia	1996	837	2350
Island Escape	1552	544	1575
Azura	3080	1153	3275
Independence of the Seas	4063	1373	4965
Royal Princess	2726	1369	3275
Crystal Symphony	912	574	1125
Thomson Dream	1543	607	1875
Azura	3140	1158	3250
Ventura	3177	1154	3500
Crown Princess	3074	1150	3760

Jul-13			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Independence of the Seas	4076	1372	4922
Oceana	2079	845	2125
Island Escape	1629	539	1950
Independence of the Seas	4177	1351	4505
Ventura	3470	1170	4020
Queen Victoria	1975	975	2665
Oriana	1832	797	2395
Thomson Dream	1622	609	1950
Azura	3276	1158	3150
Adventure of the Seas	3677	1156	4125
Independence of the Seas	4225	1373	5101

Aug-13			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Oceana	2186	848	2500
Azura	3358	1181	3850
Crown Princess	3380	1154	3750
Aurora	1953	819	2175
Ventura	3426	1181	4205
Independence of the Seas	4322	1339	5095
Adventure of the Seas	3732	1183	4450
Quest for Adventure	254	259	359
Ryndam	1356	567	1671
Arcadia	2034	884	2408
Balmoral	1304	509	1450
Crystal Symphony	672	572	1050
Queen Victoria	2040	972	2175
Boudicca	843	358	950
Ventura	3396	1191	3990
Kristina Katarina	311	92	250
Azura	3323	1182	3000
Independence of the Seas	4137	1361	4675
Azamara Quest	518	416	850

Sep-13			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Queen Elizabeth	2034	1014	2250
Island Escape	1534	544	1750
Voyager	403	215	350
Oriana	1831	790	1682
Oceana	2001	855	2350
Ocean Princess	675	370	763
Crown Princess	3076	1114	3400
Star Flyer	144	73	160
Star Flyer	149	73	156
Thomson Dream	1488	614	1500
Adventure of the Seas	3198	1169	3500
Arcadia	1976	847	1850
Celebrity Eclipse	2857	1226	2900
Boudicca	726	356	700
Star Flyer	44	73	60
Rotterdam	1372	590	1500
Discovery	606	315	500
MSC Poesia	2301	960	2500
Independence of the Seas	3914	1346	3700
Riviera	1236	769	1580
Ventura	3100	1175	3150
MSC Magnifica	2474	980	2755
Empress	1571	664	1689
Star Flyer	114	78	154
Queen Victoria	1912	977	1750
Braemar	836	322	750

Oct-13			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Riviera	1226	771	1500
Celebrity Eclipse	2815	1218	3100
MSC Magnifica	2624	972	2500
Star Flyer	81	81	100
Island Escape	1539	539	1450
Oriana	1804	785	1850
Aurora	1866	824	2000
Rotterdam	1331	595	1250
Oceana	1989	860	1850
Thompson Spirit	1190	489	1000
Star Flyer	107	83	70
Crown Princess	3073	1128	2900
Saga Sapphire	563	420	675
Saga Ruby	507	361	650
Club Med II	225	183	250
Oceana	1997	864	2250
Star Flyer	84	77	90
Ventura	3106	1188	1996
Sea Dream 1	91	98	120
Albatros	595	344	750
Oriana	1699	787	1900
Seabourn Quest	454	340	500
Oceana	2051	860	2200
Tere Moana	82	59	100
Boudicca	706	376	700
Kristina Katarina	327	91	300

<b>Nov-13</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Queen Victoria	1921	993	2200
Arcadia	1957	847	2000
Horizon	1286	619	1000
Oriana	1648	797	1900
Oceana	1921	852	2200
Albatros	633	344	700
Azamara Quest	598	404	765
Black Watch	633	330	740
Quest For Adventure	296	258	365
Crystal Serenity	499	632	604
Silver Spirit	457	376	575
Saga Ruby	613	364	655
Horizon	794	616	1050
Aurora	1492	812	1267
Marina	1155	751	1500
Oriana	1608	778	1850
Massdam	1163	569	800
Queen Victoria	1522	983	1900
Oceana	1520	845	1950

<b>Dec-13</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Aurora	1657	800	2122
Queen Victoria	1487	975	1980
Hamburg	262	161	300
Queen Elizabeth	1832	984	2150
Pacific Princess	641	353	600
Saga Pearl II	295	256	300
Boudicca	606	369	720
Albatros	691	334	750
Rotterdam	1133	597	1250
Oceana	1290	849	1750
Black Watch	720	332	650
Saga Pearl II	329	250	400
Adonia	642	375	650
Saga Ruby	559	365	600
Oriana	1741	769	1900

**SCHEDULE TO QUESTION 791/2016**

<b>Jan-14</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Queen Elizabeth	1997	993	238
MSC Fantasia	3641	1308	1670
Balmoral	1000	517	800
Rotterdam	1313	591	1400
Oriana	1664	776	1900

<b>Feb-14</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Oriana	1694	781	1950

<b>Mar-14</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE*</u>
Costa Classica	1233	560	1250
Thomson Majesty	1441	566	1350
Oceana	1965	857	2150
Silver Wind	254	223	95

<b>Apr-14</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Thomson Majesty	1436	579	284
MSC Fantasia	3162	1244	809
Costa Mediterranea	1966	850	2150
Azamara Quest	604	399	400
Saga Pearl II	372	268	420
Prinsendam	426	478	625
Oceana	2049	872	2200
Island Escape	1624	538	1825
Tere Moana	77	61	80
Thomson Majesty	1550	582	1600
Nieuw Amsterdam	2033	860	2150
Zenith	1611	609	1750
Island Escape	1490	543	1626
Crystal Serenity	866	632	820
Ryndam	1184	563	1020
Ocean Dream	971	357	620
Celebrity Equinox	2674	1260	2750
Saga Pearl II	391	261	365
Funchal	81	172	125
Arcadia	2022	860	1975
Saga Sapphire	622	424	725
Voyager	461	226	375
Thomson Celebration	1184	536	1125
Azura	3086	1183	3000
Celebrity Silhouette	2786	1224	3215
Thomson Dream	1347	607	1320

<b>May-14</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Artania	1048	518	850
Star Flyer	153	79	120
Eurodam	2052	860	1950
Black Watch	647	358	560
Rotterdam	1341	594	1400
Zenith	1585	615	1475
Aurora	1825	821	1900
Prinsendam	761	473	800
Horizon	1287	657	1375
Azura	3019	1181	2800
Adventure of the Seas	3004	1179	3112
Zenith	1380	610	1512
Celebrity Eclipse	2831	1211	2765
Emerald Princess	3122	1140	3107
Black Watch	743	342	650
Thomson Dream	1611	615	1598
Azamara Journey	664	404	750

Jun-14			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Horizon	794	612	1497
Oceana	1948	870	1342
Island Escape	1518	550	1238
Independence of the Seas	3881	1369	4551
Boudicca	617	360	525
MSC Splendida	3578	1264	2900
Arcadia	2043	856	2275
Queen Elizabeth	1993	1002	2100
Independence of the Seas	3992	1367	4318
Thomson Dream	1491	616	1384
Zenith	1391	581	1400
Emerald Princess	3075	1159	2241
Azura	3088	1170	3000
Aurora	1808	811	2025

Jul-14			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Independence of the Seas	4064	1377	3871
Dawn Princess	1798	841	1850
Independence of the Seas	4185	1380	3849
Island Escape	1576	545	1193
Oceana	2017	863	2116
Arcadia	2068	848	2091
Thomson Dream	1606	615	1750
Emerald Princess	3353	1161	2400
Adventure of the Seas	3671	1164	2900
Crystal Serenity	978	628	1050
Boudicca	608	351	671
Independence of the Seas	4122	1379	3985

Aug-14			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Saga Pearl II	421	262	421
Celebrity Eclipse	3148	1213	2800
Queen Victoria	1990	1002	1750
Azura	3414	1190	2151
Aurora	1931	830	1750
Insignia	680	229	874
Independence	4120	1374	4000
Oceana	2169	871	2750
Adventure of the Seas	3281	1189	3812
Thomson Dream	1617	615	575
Insignia	635	401	750
Zenith	1800	615	1975
Tere Moana	70	62	58
Adventure of the Seas	3777	1166	2800
Tere Moana	92	41	80
Oceana	2176	873	2500
Azura	3087	1168	2350
Island Escape	1583	550	1850
Crystal Serenity	997	631	1455
Ocean Dream	1922	1027	2450

Sep-14			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Ocean Princess	697	389	512
Azura	3281	1189	3211
Azamara Journey	727	412	797
Ryndam	1253	560	1201
Sea Cloud II	92	63	127
Arcadia	2076	863	2255
Celebrity Eclipse	2918	1210	3189
SeaDream I	102	93	120
Emerald Princess	3053	1132	3082
Arcadia	2023	849	2063
Adventure of the Seas	3232	1164	2750
Braemar	843	381	650
Azura	3049	1164	2700
Prinsendam	815	467	750
Emerald Princess	3104	1131	2600
Marina	1198	769	950
Louis Aura	450	271	385
MSC Poesia	2487	951	2150
Rotterdam	1356	603	950
Bremen	128	99	75
Oceana	1974	844	2112
Independence of the Seas	3839	1354	3887
Horizon	1351	622	1250
Empress	1611	648	1510
Marina	1154	770	1020
Saga Sapphire	640	430	591
Thomson Dream	1480	623	1326

Oct-14			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Tere Moana	82	60	79
Saga Pearl II	355	268	220
Rotterdam	1281	602	950
Thomson Spirit	1201	483	1394
Oriana	1833	782	1875
Tere Moana	72	60	68
Oceana	1934	852	1850
Island Escape	1524	542	1398
Seven Seas Mariner	686	449	175
Azura	3144	1166	2637
Emerald Princess	3073	1138	2961
Saga Sapphire	652	428	525
Tere Moana	85	60	90
Boudicca	703	363	457
Adventure of the Seas	3203	1167	2650
Azura	3081	1181	2570
Oriana	1766	797	1300
Thomson Dream	1526	618	746
Tere Moana	83	63	82
Queen Victoria	1905	983	1912
Noordam	1877	805	1182
Horizon	1606	613	1550
Tere Moana	85	64	83
Oceana	2093	873	2123
Arcadia	2001	848	1975
Oriana	1837	804	1911

<b>Nov-14</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Queen Victoria	1902	991	1742
Saga Pearl II	419	265	436
Thomson Dream	1480	617	1366
Wind Star	130	98	135
Thomson Majesty	1386	594	1338
Thomson Dream	1441	621	1188
Aurora	1789	855	1634
Azamara Journey	638	396	540
Thomson Celebration	1215	547	864
Black Watch	367	206	380
Seabourn Seajourn	406	334	498
MSC Armonia	1505	733	1389
Thomson Dream	1462	635	1129
Azamara Journey	631	395	400
MSC Fantasia	3321	1263	2750
Azamara Journey	588	390	210
Costa Fortuna	2527	962	1333
Azamara Journey	1150	568	993

<b>Dec-14</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Oriana	1852	963	1951
Queen Victoria	1751	934	1785
Oceana	1634	857	1444
Albatross	671	359	581
Boudicca	709	361	758
Ocean Princess	710	329	619
Queen Elizabeth	1941	963	2125
Queen Victoria	1932	969	2075
Arcadia	1992	873	305
Marco Polo	764	343	575
Balmoral	1266	505	875

**SCHEDULE TO QUESTION 791/2016**

<b>Jan-15</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Saga Sapphire	608	423	431
Saga Pearl II	373	264	158

<b>Feb-15</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Oceana	1963	855	1900
Oriana	1796	795	1350
Oriana	1803	790	1475

<b>Mar-15</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Britannia	3497	1384	4822
Oceana	1829	848	1600
Boudicca	754	368	379

<b>Apr-15</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Corinthian	92	57	90
Prinsendam	283	464	218
Costa Mediterranea	1035	843	650
Rotterdam	1044	598	1004
MSC Sinfonia	2331	715	1950
Ventura	3343	1189	2200
National Geographic Explorer	142	98	150
Corinthian	87	59	90
Island Escape	1524	537	1064
Riviera	1115	770	871
Azamara Journey	549	404	343
Britannia	3517	1365	3113
Ventura	3079	1178	2699
Black Watch	631	367	623
Nieuw Amsterdam	1994	874	1961
Celebrity Constellation	2094	945	1758
Tere Moana	85	62	72
Thomson Majesty	1372	604	1816
MSC Splendida	3319	1246	2210
Vision of the Seas	1921	798	1500
Horizon	1168	608	1081
Azores	499	271	463
Hamburg	241	166	216
Costa Magica	2172	947	2180
MSC Sinfonia	1914	723	1588
Silver Spirit	485	371	305
Thomson Celebration	1194	537	454
Horizon	1312	622	1298
Tere Moana	76	62	76
Eurodam	2089	855	1997
Thomson Dream	1408	656	1250
Club Med II	240	176	250

<b>May-15</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Aurora	1786	831	1307
Saga Sapphire	594	439	623
Emerald Princess	2973	1169	2064
Silver Explorer	46	118	161
Corinthian	93	62	86
Tere Moana	83	62	93
Viking Star	759	473	326
Saga Pearl II	421	270	258
Anthem of the Seas	3867	1651	4268
Arcadia	2002	838	1515
Prinsendam	777	472	1021
Ryndam	1146	571	1326
Star Flyer	135	78	78
Explorer of the Seas	3105	1207	2795
Thomson Dream	1417	641	1150
Ventura	3024	1153	2492
Seabourn Quest	449	338	292
Azura	2927	1196	2467
Crystal Serenity	1031	629	768
Caribbean Princess	3148	1163	2929
Seven Seas Voyager	703	451	451
Queen Victoria	1945	966	1866
Aurora	1812	816	1843



<b>Jun-15</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Ventura	3073	1158	2700
Azamara Quest	658	392	290
Island Escape	1519	547	1048
Star Legend	194	146	188
Explorer of The Seas	3265	1215	2800
Caribbean Princess	3211	1157	2965
Queen Elizabeth	2028	1005	1600
Arcadia	2045	846	1806
Aegean Odyssey	271	168	310
Queen Elizabeth	2029	1000	1500
Saga Sapphire	562	425	618
Oriana	1811	806	1560
Thomson Dream	1480	638	1131
Anthem of the Seas	4496	1569	3685
Britannia	3617	1360	3383
Aurora	1829	837	1814

<b>Jul-15</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Explorer Of The Seas	3274	1168	2800
Ventura	3752	1208	2758
Saga Sapphire	614	431	653
Anthem of the Seas	4117	1582	2101
Star Breeze	208	150	150
Crystal Serenity	1067	628	1125
Arcadia	2033	854	1775
Star Breeze	211	149	145
Explorer Of The Seas	3860	1203	2732
Anthem of the Seas	4749	1571	3826
Azura	3307	1194	2056
Caribbean Princess	3446	1172	2800
Explorer Of The Seas	3951	1199	2900
Island Escape	1649	549	1500
Queen Elizabeth	2133	988	2100
Aurora	1923	842	1900

<b>Aug-15</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Oriana	1870	808	1258
Anthem of the Seas	4779	1579	3050
Azura	3400	1199	3260
Ventura	3401	1174	3028
Disney Magic	2576	1017	2175
Seven Seas Mariner	711	444	813
Thomson Dream	1608	647	1371
Anthem of the Seas	4791	1571	3225
Tere Moana	83	65	39
Viking Star	669	469	506
Explorer of the Seas	3888	1189	3499
Crystal Serenity	1001	625	730
Tere Moana	77	62	82
Oriana	1845	799	1644
Caribbean Princess	3503	1170	3126
Britannia	3956	1374	4923
Aurora	1945	834	1826
Horizon	1447	599	1352

Sep-15			
NAME OF VESSEL	PAX ON BOARD	CREW ON BOARD	PAX/CREW ASHORE
Celebrity Eclipse	2814	1239	2729
Sea Cloud II	89	63	89
Oriana	1831	807	1578
Island Escape	1528	551	1192
Anthem of the Seas	4259	1601	3724
Explorer of the Seas	3294	1200	3078
Azamara Quest	655	402	417
Costa Favolosa	3222	1020	2861
Celebrity Silhouette	2823	1260	2784
Ventura	3128	1168	2306
Queen Elizabeth	2037	1001	1669
Azores	498	261	181
Aurora	1843	819	1822
Horizon	1224	610	1150
Star Legend	202	144	227
Tere Moana	78	62	74
Azura	3044	1155	2606
Ryndam	1158	562	904
MSC Splendida	3393	1254	3320
Tere Moana	74	62	54
Briannia	3547	1348	4238
Costa Neo Romantic	1002	218	963
Empress	1613	650	1457
Prinsendam	790	462	649
MSC Orchestra	2581	956	2008
Thomson Dream	1496	631	1416
Queen Elizabeth	1993	993	1736

Oct-15			
NAME OF VESSEL	PAX ON BOARD	CREW ON BOARD	PAX/CREW ASHORE
MSC Sinfonia	2049	732	1973
Rotterdam	1318	606	1068
Arcadia	1991	871	2022
Celebrity Equinox	2787	1221	2485
Braemar	809	389	629
Explorer of the Seas	3188	1205	2266
Ventura	3076	1150	3000
Island Escape	1501	540	1117
Queen Elizabeth	2032	983	2024
Oriana	1792	800	1588
Ocean Dream	770	390	695
Horizon	1214	610	1069
SeaDream II	110	92	85
Seabourn Odyssey	443	347	219
Britannia	3538	1368	4344
Azura	3119	1175	3512
Tere Moana	81	61	77
Ventura	3093	1164	2752
Nieuw Amsterdam	2035	863	2623
Aurora	1808	821	1849
Empress	635	442	338
Saga Pearl II	404	271	174
Tere Moana	82	61	80
Magellan	1134	561	1117
Star Pride	185	145	176
Seven Seas Mariner	669	452	450
Balmoral	1221	525	1125
Marina	1171	771	1230
Aurora	1820	805	1765
Queen Victoria	1967	988	1328

<b>Nov-15</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Star Legend	161	134	120
Vision Of The Seas	1938	787	1500
Oceana	1993	836	1909
Queen Elizabeth	2014	979	1912
Saga Sapphire	621	430	413
Thomson Dream	1498	635	1515
Tere Moana	87	61	85
Thomson Celebration	1218	548	1532
Thomson Majesty	1414	594	1278
Oriana	1788	790	1530
Boudicca	600	400	495
MSC Opera	2136	739	1934
Crystal Serenity	988	630	946
Horizon	802	613	750
Azamara Journey	660	402	452
FTI Berlin	358	177	200
Oceana	1961	825	1705
Sovereign	332	791	346
Star Breeze	132	139	99
Ventura	3015	1174	3126
MSC Opera	2148	755	1962
Rotterdam	1362	592	1098
Tere Moana	38	68	67
Azamara Journey	593	411	452

<b>Dec-15</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Maasdam	1077	561	826
Crystal Serenity	419	460	385
Ocean Princess	622	373	537
Queen Victoria	1824	977	1758
Oceana	1903	826	981
Artania	1024	496	723
Oriana	1789	814	1723
Aurora	1802	818	1590
Magellan	1206	560	1175
MSC Fantasia	4008	1274	3105

**SCHEDULE TO QUESTION 791/2016**

<b>Jan-16</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Rotterdam	1054	597	1043

<b>Feb-16</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Berlin	379	177	221

<b>Mar-16</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Ventura	2971	1176	2682
Magellan	1173	574	950
Costa Pacifica	2631	1050	2497
Sovereign	1141	801	1250
Costa Magica	1876	967	2125
Silver Cloud	225	156	195
L'Austral	200	145	150
Oceana	2063	885	2020

<b>Apr-16</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Costa neo Romantica	1470	613	1100
Oriana	1770	818	1493
Britannia	3751	1389	3216
Horizon	1278	622	1022
Mein Schiff 4	2576	1015	2952
Zenith	117	615	168
Silver Wind	164	230	174
Corinthian	87	68	90
Seabourn Quest	452	345	250
Celebrity Constellation	2022	960	1471
Star Clipper	59	78	50
Britannia	3597	1550	3456
Costa Favolosa	2586	1018	2423
Azamara Journey	560	405	472
Corinthian	83	63	85
Variety Voyager	58	30	65
Costa Magica	2767	960	2164
Saga Pearl II	418	275	253
Ventura	3030	1165	2583
Viking Star	905	470	663
Le Lyrial	206	142	229
Star Legend	205	155	234
Eurodam	2012	854	2145
Azura	2974	1158	3351
Prinsendam	636	467	652
Riviera	1002	782	1286
Corinthian	86	64	90
Costa neo Romantica	1429	609	1525
Tere Moana	80	62	90
Thomson Celebration	1154	531	1148
Royal Clipper	194	110	150
Seabourn Quest	435	343	425
Star Flyer	110	77	95
Black Watch	467	359	327
Corinthian	84	63	110
Thomson Majesty	1465	584	1150

<b>May-16</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Rotterdam	1377	599	531
Mein Schiff 3	2480	1023	2150
Koningsdam	2292	1053	1975
Royal Princess	3486	1334	4151
Ocean Endeavour	76	109	68
Ocean Majesty	388	238	352
Brilliance of the Seas	1979	905	2159
Ovation of the Seas	4017	1689	5136
Royal Princess	3598	1324	1720
Aurora	1809	815	1274
SeaDream I	110	94	95
Jewel of the Seas	1943	892	1285
Star Breeze	200	154	175
Koningsdam	2238	1063	1788
Thomson Spirit	1219	497	1152
Ventura	3037	1163	2590
Horizon	1136	626	1062
Independence of the Seas	3804	1429	3364
Arcadia	1980	877	1615
Costa Magica	2640	956	2208
Crystal Symphony	823	569	1023
Emerald Princess	3039	1157	2873
Black Watch	664	360	622
Oriana	1751	814	1700
Oosterdam	1837	782	1745
Seven Seas Voyager	657	453	250
Thomson Spirit	1232	498	929
Queen Elizabeth	2002	992	1800
Thomson Spirit	1300	497	1152
Royal Princess	3699	1330	2963

<b>Jun-16</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Azamara Quest	642	403	370
Ventura	3062	1170	2982
Star Legend	179	155	174
Independence of the Seas	3891	1405	2756
Boudicca	767	371	748
Ventura	3075	1168	2886
Thomson Spirit	1219	191	461
Thomson Majesty	1451	584	1405
Costa Magica	2930	967	2504
Europa 2	476	360	382
Queen Victoria	1908	966	1606
Aurora	1819	813	1574
Independence of the Seas	3838	1425	3370
Royal Princess	3798	1331	2749
Queen Victoria	1984	980	2060
Thomson Spirit	1249	491	978
Royal Princess	3963	1325	3091

<b>Jul-16</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Thomson Spirit	1240	491	690
Britannia	3832	1379	3284
Riviera	1259	765	805
Celebrity Constellation	2283	980	1346
Ventura	3325	1181	3097
Independence of the Seas	4201	1408	3534
Navigator of the Seas	3793	1212	2975
Star Breeze	202	146	199
Oosterdam	2135	797	1686
Thomson Spirit	1265	493	1052
Arcadia	2025	859	1712
Tui Discovery	1976	773	1499
Royal Princess	3962	1313	2573
Queen Elizabeth	2029	986	2050
Independence of the Seas	4331	1401	2373
Costa Magica	3370	961	2909
Star Breeze	198	153	220
Sirena	682	392	464
Thomson Spirit	1303	490	1075
Azura	3335	1203	2235
Navigator of the Seas	3885	1194	3758
Saga Pearl 2	418	275	215

<b>Aug-16</b>			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Independence Of The Seas	4336	1384	2860
Emerald Princess	3537	1168	3082
Oriana	1796	805	1565
Thomson Majesty	1644	579	500
Ventura	3395	1184	974
Navigator of the Seas	3914	1191	3201
Royal Princess	4093	1339	1300
Thomson Spirit	1326	494	1125
Tui Discovery	1977	768	1713
Royal Princess	4025	1336	3023
Independence Of The Seas	4335	1373	4020
Crystal Symphony	861	572	732
Thomson Spirit	1292	489	1290
Star Legend	154	185	154
Minerva	237	180	281
Ventura	3389	1186	2715
Aurora	1943	830	963
Independence Of The Seas	4001	1395	3797
Emerald Princess	3507	1163	2979

Sep-16			
NAME OF VESSEL	PAX ON BOARD	CREW ON BOARD	PAX/CREW ASHORE
Azura	2974	1171	2828
Seven Seas Explorer	736	544	460
Ventura	3111	1155	2963
Costa Magica	3084	955	2655
Thomson Spirit	1217	486	1027
Royal Princess	3617	1356	2854
Celebrity Cruises	2836	1222	2071
Sea Cloud II	89	63	73
Oosterdam	1984	794	1796
Navigator of the Seas	3356	1221	2589
Thomson Majesty	1442	571	1305
Celebrity Silhouette	2812	1215	2521
Costaneoromantica	1791	756	1310
Tui Discovery	1485	625	1217
Queen Elizabeth	2031	999	1900
Braemar	836	387	798
Emerald Princess	3007	1184	2619
Horizon	1367	603	1309
Prinsendam	830	456	785
Pacific Princess	654	380	598
Thomson Spirit	1222	491	1138
Insignia	533	397	396
MSC Musica	2204	932	2000
Navigator of the Seas	3330	1217	2879
Independence of the Seas	3820	1396	3577
Celebrity Equinox	2764	1211	2778
MSC Opera	2105	738	1763
Thomson Spirit	1221	493	1028
Koningsdam	2587	998	1664
Mein Schiff 1	1950	813	1720
Azura	3010	1177	2579

Oct-16			
NAME OF VESSEL	PAX ON BOARD	CREW ON BOARD	PAX/CREW ASHORE
Marina	1191	771	1123
Sirena	638	405	786
Aurora	1824	809	1979
Costa Magica	2826	981	3501
Mein Schiff 1	2113	817	2000
Thomson Spirit	1230	497	969
MSC Splendida	3392	1248	3065
Hebridean Sky	104	76	100
Ventura	3012	1168	2790
Britannia	3663	1355	3125
Boudicca	710	378	650
Mein Schiff 4	2705	1014	2096
Celebrity Silhouette	2861	1229	2125
Star Flyer	157	75	125
Balmoral	1218	521	1090
Clio	79	60	98
Hamburg	304	169	216
Koningsdam	2611	991	1855
Oriana	1738	810	1447
Magellan	1230	589	1320
Brilliance of the Seas	2027	894	812
Seven Seas Navigator	474	359	475
Marco Polo	735	358	580
Thomson Spirit	1264	489	1092
Carnival Vista	3814	1443	4200
Mein Schiff 4	2715	1020	1877
Oceana	1973	866	1794
Eurodam	2136	852	1500
Oosterdam	1957	788	1332
Tui Discovery	2010	753	1350
Mein Schiff 4	2368	1017	1993
Le Lyrial	189	130	106
Clio	82	59	112
Serenissima	90	58	102
Thomson Spirit	1254	485	965
Tui Discovery	1789	737	1306

Nov-16			
<u>NAME OF VESSEL</u>	<u>PAX ON BOARD</u>	<u>CREW ON BOARD</u>	<u>PAX/CREW ASHORE</u>
Serenissima	90	58	104
Queen Elizabeth	90	58	105
Mein Schiff 5	1999	911	2005
Arcadia	2475	1025	2118
Star Breeze	2015	870	1800
	171	144	205

**Q792-793/2016**

***Sunborn* Hotel –**

**Current total workforce; number of Gibraltarians employed**

**Clerk:** Question 792. The Hon. D A Feetham

910 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, what is the current total workforce at the *Sunborn* Hotel?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.

915 **Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 793/2016.

**Clerk:** Question 793. The Hon D A Feetham.

920 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, how many Gibraltarians are currently employed at the *Sunborn* Hotel?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.

925 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, as stated in answer to Questions 280-283/2016, the information the hon. Member requests is confidential by virtue of the Employment Regulations 1994.

930 **Hon. D A Feetham:** But Mr Speaker, in relation to the second question, which is the number of Gibraltarians that are currently employed at the *Sunborn* Hotel, why would that be confidential, when in fact the Government itself in the past has commented on the number of people it was sending to the *Sunborn* Hotel in order to be employed? The Government talks about the number of people that are sent to the *Sunborn* Hotel to be employed, ergo – what the  
935 Government is saying is, 'We are making an effort to send the *Sunborn* Hotel Gibraltarians to be employed by them' – is it not reasonable for me to ask how many Gibraltarians are currently employed by the *Sunborn* Hotel?

940 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, the issue is not whether it is reasonable for the hon. Member to ask or not; the issue is that regulation 3 of the Employment Regulations 1994 relates to

confidentiality and actually prevents the Government from giving this information. That is the advice that had been given to the Government previously in answer to Questions 280-283/2016. I have taken advice again and the Government simply is bound by confidentiality.

945 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, the reason why I raise this particular question is because certainly in my surgeries on a very regular basis I get people who come to see me – Gibraltarians – to tell me that they have applied for jobs at the *Sunborn* Hotel and they feel that they are being discriminated against, and that there is a preference by this particular employer to employ non Gibraltarians.

950 What is the Government doing to keep tabs on the situation in relation to how many Gibraltarians are being employed by an entity that obviously is in receipt of a substantial amount of money by way of a loan from Credit Finance – £30 million to £40 million pounds – and therefore it ought to be giving something back in employing Gibraltarians?

955 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Member seems to believe that because the information has not been provided to him it is not something that we have or that we monitor. Of course we have the numbers. Of course the Government has the numbers, but the Government is prevented through confidentiality provisions in the law. So the law prevents the Government from providing that information. So we do have Gibraltarians employed in the  
960 *Sunborn*.

The hon. Member knows the very extensive efforts that were made, particularly by my predecessor in Employment, in tackling the issue of Gibraltar unemployed and the very successful policy that this Government has pursued – not just the policy but the practice of the hon. Member, my hon. and learned colleague in the past where we have record numbers of low  
965 Gibraltarians unemployed. That must count for something. That must count for the fact that the hon. Member did an excellent job in his time as Minister for Employment, that he deployed his resources appropriately, that we deployed a lot of effort in getting Gibraltarians into employment – and those efforts have paid off, and therefore there is no question ... Certainly it  
970 would be a serious matter if the Government became aware that Gibraltarians were being discriminated against, there is no question of that either happening or being tolerated by the Government in any way. The Government would certainly take it as a very serious issue. So we are satisfied that that is not the case and we are also satisfied that the steps that the Government has taken in respect of getting Gibraltarians into employment are working and have worked, and that is why we have record low numbers.

975 **Hon. D A Feetham:** So does it follow from that answer that the Government is satisfied with the number of Gibraltarians employed at the *Sunborn* Hotel?

**Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, I am not sure what the hon. Member has in relation to the  
980 *Sunborn* Hotel – whether he really wants it to fail, whether he wants everybody to be without employment. I am not sure what his agenda is, but whether more Gibraltarians can be employed at the *Sunborn* Hotel or any other employer is something that the Government will always be striving for. Will we ever be satisfied? We will be satisfied when we have zero unemployment of Gibraltarians. Can we ever get to that? Well, that might be something of a difficult task, but  
985 what we will certainly do is continue our efforts, not just with respect to the *Sunborn* but with respect to every employer, our efforts to get Gibraltarians into employment. Those efforts have paid off in the past and will continue in the future.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** With respect to the hon. Gentleman, the answer is certainly a master  
990 class at avoiding the question and evading the question. But the question was is the Government satisfied with the number of Gibraltarians employed at the *Sunborn* Hotel, not the number of Gibraltarians employed generally. It is not about the efforts that the Government has made



generally; it is in relation to the *Sunborn* Hotel. Is the Government satisfied at the number of Gibraltarians employed by that entity?

995

**Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, does the hon. Member think that Parliament is the right place for the Government to be answerable in respect of individual employers and what they do? No, certainly not. The Government is answerable for Government policy and Government actions and Government information that it can and does make publicly available. That is what the Government is answerable for and that is what the rules provide.

1000

The hon. Member cannot ask me about the actions of a particular employer. We would be here all day if we go through employer by employer, as we could if the hon. Member was able to ask these sort of questions, because then we would be talking about the number of Gibraltarians employed by every single employer in Gibraltar, whether the Government was satisfied or not. That is not the purpose of Question Time. That is not what the rules, in my view, allow for. What I have given is Government policy, Government views and the efforts that the Government has been making in this field. I can tell him – because the hon. Member asked whether the Government is satisfied – the Government is entirely satisfied with the efforts it is making and the efforts that it has made in getting Gibraltarians into employment.

1005

1010

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, does the hon. Gentleman not recognise that there is a distinction between the average employer and this particular employer? This is a particular employer that is in receipt of a loan of between £30 million and £40 million pounds of savers' and taxpayers' money by way of Credit Finance, and therefore in those circumstances it is completely and utterly appropriate for me to come to this House and ask the Government whether it is satisfied with the level of employment of Gibraltarians by the *Sunborn* Hotel. Is that not the case?

1015

**Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, again I have to wonder what the hon. Member has in respect of the *Sunborn* Hotel, because he chooses this particular employer – he seems to have an obsession with the *Sunborn* and almost an unhealthy obsession with someone who is providing a very good service to Gibraltar – and actually failing, because that seems to be the agenda in the hon. Member's mind.

1020

The Government will not get into issues of individual employers and the actions of individual employers and whether those actions are right or not. If the Government has issues to raise with individual employers the Government will do so, but Parliament is not the right place for the Government in any way ...

1025

The hon. Member seems to be almost trying to make the Government accountable simply on the basis that someone has received a loan from a public entity. That does not make the Government accountable for all the actions of that particular individual or employer, and that is not something that we are willing to get into.

1030

#### Q737/2016

#### Beaches and bathing facilities – Maintenance costs

**Clerk:** Question 737. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government disclose the cost of maintenance in each beach or bathing facility for the financial years ending 31st March for each of the financial years since 2012 and the current financial year to date?

1035

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1040

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is in the schedule that I now hand over.

**Answer to Question 737/2016**

**Total cost of maintenance and capital investments in all beaches**

2012/2013	2013/2014	2014/2015	2015/2016	2016/2017
£248,434	£1,224,946	£531,870	£224,683	£186,612

**Total cost of maintenance and capital investments in the bathing pavilion is**

2012/2013	2013/2014	2014/2015	2015/2016	2016/2017
£0	£0	£20,820	£9,942	£9,569

**Mr Speaker:** It is not a very long schedule, so if the hon. Member wishes to ask any supplementary now, he can do so.

The Hon. Trevor Hammond.

1045

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, if I may ask the Minister the reason for the significant spike in the year 2013-14, where the costs seem to have risen to £1.2 million.

1050

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I do not have direct information – Members must recall that I have assumed responsibility for this only in recent weeks – but from memory I suspect that it is because of the marked improvements that this Government made to beaches, in what was essentially our second summer after the experience of our first summer, where we carried out considerable improvements to all beaches, including by way of accessibility and other improvements.

1055

I would have to confirm exactly what the costs were and what the money was spent on, but I suspect it was the year when our beaches were taken up to another level by the then Minister for Tourism, the Hon. Neil Costa.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Minister for his answer.

1060

In re-reading the question, I believe the question is a bit more specific in that we asked the cost of maintenance in *each* beach or bathing facility and we have a total cost in all beaches. I was wondering if the Minister would be able to provide a breakdown in due course.

1065

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the information is divided into beaches collectively and the bathing pavilion. I have not been provided with a breakdown. Whether that is because ... I seem to recall I was told that for some items they are bought collectively for all the beaches and it is not easy to break them down into particular beaches. However, I will once again ask and confirm whether that is true and I would be happy to ... There is no reason why we do not want to divide it into beaches; it is just the way, I suspect, that the information is recorded. If you buy certain items which are used across the beaches, perhaps there is not a breakdown in the book as to how many go to one beach or the other, but I will enquire and confirm that, Mr Speaker.

1070

**Q738/2016**

**Floating attractions on beaches –  
Cost; confirmation of condition**

**Clerk:** Question 738. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

1075 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Government disclose the cost of the floating attractions once enjoyed on our beaches and confirm they have all been subjected to vandalism and are beyond economical repair?

1080 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1085 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the cost was answered in Question 590/2016. Of the six attractions purchased, one is usable. The decision to discontinue their use was made due to the high cost of maintaining these, principally because they suffered from vandalism. The five that are unusable are beyond economic repair.

**Q739/2016**

**Jellyfish nets –  
Cost of provision**

**Clerk:** Question 739. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

1090 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government disclose the cost of providing jellyfish nets as at the end of each financial year since they were first installed to date?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1095 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is in the schedule that I now hand over.

**Answer to Question 739/2016**

**The total cost of providing jellyfish nets is as follows**

<b>2012/2013</b>	<b>2013/2014</b>	<b>2014/2015</b>	<b>2015/2016</b>	<b>2016/2017</b>
Nil	£93,230	£48,345	£30,154	£31,850 to date

1100 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Just for my own understanding of the answer, is it fair to say that the higher cost for the year 2013-14 was due to the purchase of the nets and then, presumably, in the years subsequent to that, the costs have been more to do with maintenance of the nets?

1105 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, essentially they had to be purchased and we needed to get an expert over to advise on the deployment and so on and so forth, whereas in subsequent years it has been replacing particular bits, repairing particular bits and more of a maintenance than the upfront purchase of the equipment.

**Q740-741/2016**  
**Gibraltar Tourist Board –**  
**Arrears owed by tourist sites**

**Clerk:** Question 740. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government explain what measures are being taken to recover the arrears due to the Gibraltar Tourist Board in respect of tourist sites?

1110

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1115 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 741.

**Clerk:** Question 741.

1120 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government disclose details of how many companies, businesses or individuals owe arrears to the Gibraltar Tourist Board in respect of tourist sites, together with the amount they each owe and amount owed by each debtor per financial year?

1125 **Clerk:** Answer the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, yes the GTB constantly monitors the amount of arrears owed by these companies and pursues payments, which are effected regularly, to recover the moneys owing.

1130 All operators buying tickets for the tourist sites enjoy a 90-day credit period.  
The specific information requested is in the schedule which I have just handed over.

**Answer to Question 741/2016**

2009/2010 Nil arrears

2010/2011 Nil arrears

2011/2012 Debtor A - £58,835.00  
Reported in Return of Arrears of Revenue on 31 Dec 2011

2012/2013 Nil arrears

2013/2014 Nil arrears

2014/2015 Debtor A - £2752.65  
Reported in Arrears of Revenue on Sep 2014, Dec 2014, Mar 2015

2015/2016 Debtor B - £119,607.90  
Reported on Arrears of Revenue on 30 Sep 2015

2015/2016 Debtor A - £2752.65  
Reported in Arrears of Revenue on 30 Sep 2015

2016/2017 Debtor A - £2752.65  
Reported in Arrears of Revenue on 30 Sep 2016

2016/2017 Debtor B - £120,940.10

Reported on arrears of Revenue 30 Sep 2016. However this now stands at £93,370.10 as further payments have been made since.

1135 Let me just say, Mr Speaker, there is a footnote in the schedule, which means that there has been a further payment, which makes one of the sums outstanding stand at £93,370.10. I am informed that as of yesterday there had been a further payment of £30,000 made against that, so that will now read £63,000 and so on, and not £93,000 and so on.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Minister for his answer.

1140 I note in the Principal Auditor's Reports for 2015, paragraph 2.12.30, page 29, he refers to the tourist site receipts arrears at 31st March 2016 increasing by £119,194 to £303,110, and then he goes onto say:

The sums of £93,437 and £2,753 owed by two companies were over the credit periods established by the Gibraltar Tourist Board. Before the sums due during the financial period 2015-16 the latter arrears debt was owed since 31st May 2014.

I wondered if the Minister could clarify why there would be a 65% increase in the arrears in one year and how it is that tourist operators are allowed to exceed their credit periods.

1145 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the answer provided has, I think, answered the question. The detail to which the hon. Member has gone in his supplementary would, I think, require notice. I would be very happy to look into the details and to tally one thing with the other, but I cannot answer that without notice, Mr Speaker.

1150 **Mr Speaker:** The hon. Member cannot expect that a question of this nature, where specific information is being requested in respect of financial ... and the information is provided, that he can then make a reference to the Principal Auditor's Report and expect an answer on the spot. That is quite impossible. Separate notice should be given of that question.

1155 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I appreciate your clarification. I guess what I was trying to do was get back to Question 740, where it says 'What measures are being taken to recover arrears?' and part of the measures to recover arrears is surely to monitor credit limits and excesses.

1160 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, and I am sure ... Again, I have only taken responsibility for this part of the former Tourism Ministry over the last few weeks, but I am certain that that has been done, and the fact that since the answer was prepared there have been two payments of approximately £30,000 each means that this is being recovered.

**Q742/2016**  
**Principal Auditor's Report –**  
**Clarification re paragraphs 3.7.13 and 14**

**Clerk:** Question 742. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

1165 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, in connection to 3.7.13 and 3.7.14 of the Principal Auditor's Report 2014-15, can the Government disclose the itemised details of the capital works the Principal Auditor is referring to, together with the three quotes received for each work and disclose the final successful contractor and successful quote?

1170 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):**  
1175 Mr Speaker, the information is commercially sensitive and cannot be made public, but I would be happy to provide it to the hon. Member on a confidential basis.

**Q743-747/2016**  
**Mount Misery glass lookout; Royal Anglian Way –**  
**Updates**

**Clerk:** Question 743. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government update this House as to when the expected opening date for Mount Misery glass lookout is?  
1180

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):**  
1185 Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 744 to 747.

**Clerk:** Question 744.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government disclose the expected final cost of the Mount Misery glass lookout?  
1190

**Clerk:** Question 745.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Has the refurbishment programme for Royal Anglian Way been completed? If not, when will they be completed, what works are pending and what is the expected additional cost?  
1195

**Clerk:** Question 746.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Does the Government intend to provide any safety measures at the Royal Anglian Way steps leading to the Windsor Bridge when walking south to north?  
1200

**Clerk:** Question 747.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government disclose the cost of the Royal Anglian Way refurbishment to date?  
1205

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.  
1210

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, in answer to Question 743, we expect to open it before next spring.

To Question 744, £1,186,772.

The original planned programme, in respect of Question 745, for Anglian Way has been completed, although further improvements are being considered.  
1215

In answer to Question 746, no, sir.

In answer to Question 747, £684,102.

1220 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, if I may, in relation to Question 746, having walked down that path myself it is quite steep and I would imagine at least perhaps the Government is considering putting in some kind of handrail next to those steps.

Also, as a supplementary, what is the provision for exiting for disabled people? There seems to be no way to exit going north to south.

1225 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the Upper Rock is a natural area and is an area which ... If we were to look at every single path and every single lookout, at every single cliff that Gibraltar has, not just on the Upper Rock but elsewhere, would we put handrails and fences throughout all the extent of all these areas?

1230 It is a difficult decision and I think that the successive Government have decided that it is a natural space ... People know they are going into a natural space where they are going to access steep paths and steps that have been hewn out of the rocks and cliffs and there are going to be edges off the cliffs and will take the necessary precautions.

If we were to start fencing off everything that could potentially be dangerous, we would end up with, firstly, an extremely expensive exercise, but also an Upper Rock which looks like anything but a natural area. So these are, I think, considerations.

1235 In regard to accessibility from the south, once again it would be well-nigh impossible, because of the lie of the land and the contours, to provide accessibility to the bridge from the south. There is a relatively smooth path to and from the north, and therefore I think that is the access that would have to be used in those circumstances.

1240 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, if I may, I thank the Minister for his answer.

1245 Would the Minister accept that this is not a general area around the Upper Rock, as we are all familiar with; this is a very new specifically designed, I presume, tourist attraction where you do want people to walk around that area in probably a higher footfall than you would have done normally. It is obvious to anybody who has been up there that the Government has made improvements in terms of safety in the area, in terms of putting up railings and safety features, and would it not be a logical extension of that work to finish that work by putting in safety features at the southern end of that path?

1250 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, as the hon. Member has rightly said, there has been a massive improvement in Anglian Way and in the safety elements. The handrails have been replaced and there is safe access from the road, particularly to the north, to the bridge and back again. So, anybody with a difficulty in tackling some of the accesses – and there are at least two others – would, to my mind, choose the safe access and not the one that they did not feel they could negotiate. I think we want a similar footfall for the whole of the Upper Rock and not necessarily more for this area. I am satisfied that you can get to and from the bridge safely from one particular direction and I think ... Next time I go there I will look at it with those eyes, but I think that providing fencing and so on to a lot of the other areas there would beg the question why not at the top of the Rock? Why not at Princess Caroline's? Why not Mediterranean Steps – which is relatively safe but not everybody can negotiate Mediterranean Steps and this is a fact.

1260 I will have a look at it again. I do not think we are failing. It is now much safer. It is safe even for people with accessibility concerns, to get them from one direction, but it is at least something that as we continue to improve the Upper Rock, as we have been doing as never before, we will obviously bear in mind.

**Q748-753 and 769/2016**

**Gibraltar Nature Reserve –**

**Draft management plan, implementation of measures, cost of implementation;  
management board meetings; management team resources; Europa Foreshore dog fouling;  
Upper Rock tourist facilities**

**Clerk:** Question 748. The Hon. T N Hammond.

1265

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, when will the consultation period be over and the final version of the draft Gibraltar Nature Reserve Management Plan be published?

1270

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 749 to 753, and Question 769, which I believe is the hon. Lady's.

1275

**Clerk:** Question 749.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** How often does the Minister expect that the Nature Reserve Management Board, as described in the draft Nature Reserve Management Plan, will meet?

1280

**Clerk:** Question 750.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** What does Government have in mind when it says in its draft Gibraltar Nature Reserve Management Plan that it will be increasing resources for the Gibraltar Nature Reserve Management team?

1285

**Clerk:** Question 751.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Would the Minister consider adding dog fouling to the list of issues affecting the Europa Foreshore Nature Reserve in the draft Gibraltar Nature Reserve Management Plan?

1290

**Clerk:** Question 752.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Does the Minister know how long it will take to implement all measures recommended in the draft Gibraltar Nature Reserve Management Plan?

1295

**Clerk:** Question 753.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Does the Minister know what will be the total cost of implementing all measures recommended in the draft Gibraltar Nature Reserve Management Plan?

1300

**Clerk:** Question 769. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Is Government looking to expand tourist facilities in the Upper Rock during this electoral term?

1305

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.



1310 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the consultation period for the Gibraltar Nature Reserve Management Plan will finalise in December.

The final version is expected to be published during the first quarter of 2017. Until such time, the details referred to in these questions cannot finally be determined.

1315 The tourist product has already been expanded by the opening of the new Windsor suspension bridge.

We expect to further expand the tourist facilities in the Upper Rock by the opening of the Mount Misery glass lookout.

1320 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, while I understand it is still a draft Plan and in consultation, is the Minister expecting the plan to be changed so radically that he can provide no information regarding Questions 749, 750, 751, 752 and 753, one of which is actually to ask him to consider adding to the plan the question of dog fouling as an issue at the Europa Foreshore?

1325 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, true consultation must be open to all kind of change, including radical change. A lot of comments have come in and the Department is discussing how it is going to adapt the plan, depending on the comments.

1330 I think we must also bear in mind that because the Government has now rearranged the responsibility for the Upper Rock sites and that passes under my Ministry, as does the Ministry for Heritage, it now adds a number of additional dimensions which perhaps we would now tackle in a different way within one Department. The whole question of resources, for example, and how we can combine those resources to be more effective and more efficient comes into play, and therefore there may be some considerable changes. I do not think I can hold myself to what is a consultation document where additional comments might still come in. Similarly for the question on Europa Point Foreshore, that might still be an issue at the time of the final plan, it might not, so we will see whether that it is incorporated or not at the correct time.

1335 So I think it would be premature to commit to any of those answers, because otherwise it would make a mockery of the word 'consultation'.

1340 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, regarding the Foreshore, I am asking the Minister whether he would consider or not. Is the Minister saying that he would not consider, or is he acknowledging that he is considering the possibility of including that in the final plan?

1345 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I think I have said that any representations will be considered. I think that was clear. Whether we include a line in the section of the management plan on the Foreshore that there is dog fouling there ... It may or may not go in. Hopefully, by that time we will have solved that problem and it will not be made into a consideration, but dog fouling is a potential everywhere. I think we are making a little bit too much ... but if it will solve the problem and save us time, clearly by just having this conversation I am considering it.

1350 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, my question was relating to basics like bathroom facilities and cafeteria, because I have had many, many tourists complaining that there are only these facilities in one part. So, considering that the Minister is assuring us about this consultation, I would hope and expect that these requests that I am putting through will be basic things that will probably be incorporated.

1355

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I am happy to respond to that. I did think that perhaps the hon. Lady was referring to major new sites, hence my answer.

1360 There are a few things that are going to be happening, like new lighting outside the Great Siege Tunnels, information panels inside St Michael's Cave and a new PA system within the Cave. Clearly, now that this has passed onto my responsibility I will be looking at all the sites and perhaps refreshing them, and certainly suggestions such as I have heard today I would be very,

very happy to consider and build into the plan so that we can have an improved product in the Upper Rock – and if the Lady wants to contact me with any further ideas I would be very happy to have the team look at those.

1365

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, following on from the hon. Lady's question, I wonder if the Minister would be amenable to answering perhaps a general question about how tourist sites are expanded in the Upper Rock in terms of the decision making process. I appreciate he is new to the Ministry, but is there such a thing as an advisory board or working group in terms of the expansion of tourist facilities in the Upper Rock? I am just curious as to what the decision process is, who decides where to site a bridge, why Mount Misery versus the Signal Station, how are these decisions arrived at.

1370

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, part of the Gibraltar Nature Reserve Management Plan does include the setting up of a board which would consider these things. At quite what level is still to be determined, as I said before, because it is a consultation document.

1375

Until very recently the different Departments – the Tourist Board and the Department for the Environment particularly – would have separate input as to what happens in the Upper Rock. Now that is all going to come under the expanded Department of the Environment, which will include the tourists sites and Heritage, and therefore it will be the team that administers that Department that would come up with the recommendations and make recommendations, I suppose ultimately to me, which then, if they have wider implications, I would refer to Cabinet. But in the first instance it would be the team working within those Departments that would come up with these ideas and discussions.

1380

1385

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, with your indulgence ... You may disallow this question, but does each project have to present a proposal with financial implications and the revenue implications for particular projects – whether it will be self-financing or anything like that? Or is it just, 'Here is a great idea – what do you think?'

1390

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, if you will allow that question then you will allow me to answer.

I am all for great ideas, but clearly every project has to have design, costing – (*Interjection*) Absolutely. As an example, for the bridge there was a proposal with sketches, then we looked into it and there was a further design with costings. So, yes, there is a process, Mr Speaker. It is not something that suddenly dawns on one and one gives an instruction. This is done in a responsible manner.

1395

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, I am pleased to hear that these projects are indeed costed. Where it comes to the recommendations that will ultimately be made in the Nature Reserve Management Plan, the finally published one, will all of those recommendations have been costed?

1400

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Some recommendations will not really have a tangible cost: what is the cost of a board meeting once, for argument's sake, every three months? Others will have long-term costs. Others will be strategies – for example, removal of invasive species – which would take a number of years. But certainly all the ones which can be costed, particularly which would have short-term costs, would be costed.

1405

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Even strategies can also be costed. Presumably man-hours to remove invasive species need to be accounted for and that has a cost. So the question is: will it all be costed, everything that can have a cost attributed to it; or will they just be aspirations and whether the money can be found for those aspirations at a future date?

1410

1415 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** There is nothing wrong with uncosted aspirations, because if we did not have uncosted aspirations then the world would not progress – let me just make that point. There will be aspirations. Those that have to be turned into operational matters, particularly in the short term, will be costed, but I am not going to now say that unless something is costed it will not go in a plan as a strategy and as a name. I am not going to say that – absolutely not.

1420 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, in similar vein, those recommendations that are contained in the finally published plan, will they have timelines associated with them and will it be clear that those recommendations have all been accepted by Government?

1425 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, if it is a Government document then one has to assume that they are accepted by Government.

1430 I forget the first part of his question. (**A Member:** Timeline.) There will be some that will have timelines and others that will not. For example, I go back to the removal of non-native species: I would like to see that, but that could take many, many years, if not decades, depending on all sorts of things. That will still be there, but there will not be a timeline and maybe not a final costing; that will be an aspiration.

**Q754/2016**  
**North Front Cemetery –**  
**Expressions of interest re maintenance**

**Clerk:** Question 754. The Hon. T N Hammond.

1435 **Hon. T N Hammond:** After issuing an invitation to tender for the maintenance of the North Front Cemetery, how many expressions of interest were received and why did Government choose not to pursue this option?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1440 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, seven companies initially expressed an interest for the tender and four offers were subsequently received. None was considered to provide what Government required.

1445 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I presume that the tenders were quite clear as to the offers. Can the Minister explain why none of the tenders were considered to be appropriate? Was it on the basis of the cost, or was it on the basis of service?

1450 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, this is obviously commercial in-confidence information, but if I may just say that it was not considered to be value for money and therefore they were not proceeded with.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can I ask the Minister whether he is aware whether the unsuccessful tenders have been notified?

1455 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I am not aware whether they have or not; that is done by Procurement and does not have direct ministerial direction. I can only assume that they have been, from the fact that the Member opposite is asking the question. It may be that he has

information that they have not and that would be taken up with Procurement, but that is something for that office to deal with.

1460

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I am not sure if you will allow this as a question or not, but can the Minister explain why it was felt necessary to issue this tender?

1465

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I have no problem with that whatsoever – without pre-empting the motion which is related to this – in order to improve the condition of the site.

**Q755/2016**  
**Thinking Green Digest 2015 –**  
**Publication date**

**Clerk:** Question 755. The Hon. T N Hammond.

1470

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, when will Government publish the Thinking Green Digest for 2015?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1475

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I expect the Thinking Green Digest to be published my mid-December, in approximately a month's time.

**Q756/2016**  
**Lift to Parliament –**  
**Heritage licence**

**Clerk:** Question 756. The Hon. R M Clinton.

1480

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Government advise if it has reached a decision as to the granting of the Heritage licence for the construction of a lift to Parliament?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1485

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the Government issued a Heritage licence on 18th October 2016 for the construction of the lift to Parliament. However, this has not been acted upon, as Government is further considering options.

1490

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, would the Minister be able to elaborate on what he means by 'considering further options'?

1495

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** No, Mr Speaker, we are considering options. I have nothing to add. I think the Chief Minister alluded to this at the last meeting of Parliament. Instead of saying I am not

answering or referring to that, I have given him that answer in good faith. We are considering options and that is why we have not acted upon the licence, even though we could have done.

**Q757/2016**  
**Fishing nets –**  
**Use in British Gibraltar territorial waters**

**Clerk:** Question 757. The Hon. D A Feetham.

1500 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, does the Government take the view that the Nature Protection Act bans the use of all types of fishing nets in British Gibraltar territorial waters?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1505

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the Government takes the view that the law is clear.

1510 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Can I just refer the hon. Gentleman to section 10, which is the operative section – it is a section that he himself amended a couple of years ago. The section now reads that there is a ban:

‘any gill net other than a trammel net’

Is it the position that trammel nets are nets that are allowable in British Gibraltar territorial waters – and what kind of nets are we talking about?

1515 Let me just explain. I have had a number of representations from people in relation to this. My understanding has always been that all types of nets have been banned in British Gibraltar territorial waters, but this was drawn to my attention and it actually does seem to me that there is a point there, in that the use of the words ‘any gill net other than a trammel net’ does appear to mean that trammel nets are basically allowed.

1520 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the Nature Protection Act bans the use of drifts, seine, and trammel and gill nets. Trammel is a type of gill net. I do not have a copy of the law in front of me, but the exclusion ... If the hon. Member, being a lawyer by profession and experience, reads what it says, it does not say that trammel nets are excluded from the ban; it just refers as to the possibility ... As I say, I do not have it in front of me. It just refers to those in one section, as opposed to in a different section, but it does not say that these nets are not banned. All drifts, 1525 seine, trammel and gill nets ... Hand nets and butterfly nets are not banned, but all others are.

1530 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, would the hon. Gentleman at some stage meet me behind the Speaker’s Chair so that I can take him through the section? My understanding was exactly the same as the hon. Gentleman’s understanding, that all these nets are banned in British Gibraltar territorial waters, but then when my attention was drawn again to section 10 I read the words ... Section 10 starts:

Subject to the provisions of this Part, if any person ... uses ... any drift net, any gill net other than a trammel net ...

he commits an offence. In the logic of what these individuals are telling me, that actually it means that a trammel net is excluded, it did seem to me to have some potency, if I can put it

1535 that way, and I would just like to be able to show the hon. Gentleman the section. Or perhaps he has an explanation now.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** No, Mr Speaker, I would want to see it in front of me. I am certain that that is not what that ... It is certainly not what it is supposed to say, but I would be very happy to have the discussion behind the Speaker's Chair to clarify the situation.

**Q758-760/2016**

**Macaques –  
Spaying**

**Clerk:** Question 758. The Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, are all macaques selected for spaying being selected by a primatologist?

1545 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 759 and 760.

**Clerk:** Question 759. The Hon. D A Feetham.

1555 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, how many macaques have been spayed in the last four years?

**Clerk:** Question 760.

1560 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, have all macaques selected for spaying had offspring in the past?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1565 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, it appears that the Leader of the Opposition is saddened by the fact that I am no longer Minister for Health after he took over responsibility. He is now assuming an environmental role so he can still ask me questions directly. I am honoured!

1570 Mr Speaker, no macaques have been spayed. (*Interjection*) (*Inaudible*). Spaying will interfere with the behaviour of the animals and the social stability of the groups and therefore has never been considered as a method for managing Gibraltar's macaque population.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** I can assure the hon. Gentleman that it is not my intention to stalk him, if that is the allegation that he has made; I am just discharging my duties as a humble Leader of the Opposition!

1575 Mr Speaker, if they have not been spayed ... Perhaps I have used the wrong terminology – sterilised ... If he could just simply substitute the word 'sterilised' for the word 'spayed' in the three questions and provide me with an answer, I would appreciate it.

1580 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, there is such a fundamental difference between the two that I should probably ask for notice, but I am not going to do that to him.

1585 Mr Speaker, there is a fundamental difference, which is relevant, because spaying is, to use a medical term, is ovariohysterectomy – it is the removal of the ovaries; whereas what is being done is a ligation of the fallopian tubes. The clear difference is that the implication of removing ovaries on the whole hormonal balance of the animal and therefore on their social status and their social interaction is such that it is much more complex, with much greater implications, than if you cut the fallopian tubes. That is the difference.

1590 In respect to this, Mr Speaker, on the question of a primatologist, a primatologist is a person who studies primates, from whichever discipline, whether it is a veterinarian, a zoologist, an animal behaviourist, an ape keeper, or even a Minister! Therefore, the selection for sterilisation and not for spaying is carried out by the team that work day to day with the macaques and therefore, by definition, they are primatologists.

1595 I think the third question was ... Yes, all the macaques had had young, except for three from the pack that frequents the incinerator, because this is a pack that is beginning to grow and although it is not causing any problems yet we are trying to pre-empt it, so we are trying to reduce the population there perhaps quicker than we need to in other areas.

**Q761-763/2016**

**Learning Support and Special Education Needs facilities –  
Statistics re use**

**Clerk:** Question 761. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

1600 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide statistics per school year and school of students attending the Learning Support facilities since September 2012?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1605 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 762 and 763.

**Clerk:** Question 762.

1610 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government provide statistics of how many students have been attending the Learning Support facilities per school year since 2012 at each individual school where the facility is provided?

**Clerk:** Question 763.

1615 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government provide statistics, of how many students have been attending the Special Education Needs facilities per school year at each individual school where this facility is provided?

1620 **Clerk:** Answer the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is set out in the schedule which I now hand to him.

Notre Dame

School year	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/6	2016/7
Reception	5	0	6	7	7
Yr1	3	11	3	7	9
Yr 2	6	8	12	4	8
Yr 3	6	4	8	11	10

Bishop Fitzgerald

School year	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/6	2016/7
Yr 4	5	8	6	6	9
Yr 5	8	4	8	7	6
Yr 6	4	2	4	8	7
Yr 7	2	3	2	5	8

Bayside

School year	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/6	2016/7
Yr8	6	4	2	3	6
Yr9	5	7	4	1	1
Yr 10	4	5	6	4	1
Yr 11	3	4	5	4	4
Yr 12	0	0	1	1	2
Yr 13	0	0	0	1	1
Yr 14	0	0	0	0	1

Westside

School year	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/6	2016/7
Yr8	1	1	2	0	1
Yr9	3	5	1	2	2
Yr 10	4	2	4	1	1
Yr 11	0	4	2	3	1
Yr 12	2	0	4	1	3
Yr 13	0	0	0	0	0

1625 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, at the risk of being accused of me stalking the hon. Gentleman, can I return to the question on the macaques? When I changed my question to the use of the word 'sterilisation' he never gave me an answer to the question of how many animals have been sterilised in the last four years.

1630 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** I do apologise, it was unintentional: 29, Mr Speaker.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** And are these spread evenly over the last four years, or is there a particular concentration? Does he have the breakdown?

1635 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, these are all this year. There have been 29 this year, most of which ... I think there may have been an additional two which have been given a contraceptive implant, but these are all this year, spread throughout all the groups.

1640 **Hon. D A Feetham:** But my question relates to the last four years: does he have the figures for the previous four years, or have there been none?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** There have been ... Again, the question for sterilisation, which is the surgical interaction, which we started this year, so that there has been the use of contraceptive implants in previous years. I do not have that information, because I have collected specifically for the new procedure and that only started this year, so there is nothing in previous years.



1645 Mr Speaker, I am happy to share, if he does remind me, the information on the contraceptive implants over the last few years.

1650 **Hon. D A Feetham:** And just finally ... I recall the hon. Gentleman answering some questions in the past about this, and one of the points that he made, which perked my interest – because he knows that I share an interest in some of these issues on the Upper Rock etc. – is that no primates, no monkeys that had not had offspring were selected for sterilisation. I thought the word was ‘spayed’ but we know it is ‘sterilisation’, because it could affect that individual’s progress within the group.

1655 I am not an expert, but the answer that he has given me in relation to the question of how many have been sterilised that have not had young has been three, and three in a particular group and that is in relation to the Incinerator. The justification was that this is a big group slightly out of control – we have got to keep it under control, we are making an exception. But surely selecting just simply young females that are sterilised, that have not had babies, may not necessarily deal with the question of controlling the numbers. Well, it does control the numbers, 1660 but why couldn’t you have selected females that have already had young, because there must be females there that have had young, that come from the middle of the social structure, rather than females that have had no young and therefore is objectionable on the grounds that the hon. Gentleman has outlined in this House in the past?

1665 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** These decisions are not easy. I need confirmation as to whether in that group there have also been females with young that have been sterilised. I do not have that information here; I do not have the full breakdown.

1670 There are a couple of things here. One is that this group is not yet giving problems because it is staying within that area; but for a number of reasons, if the group splits and starts to move into other areas – and there are built-up areas in the Europa Point area – it would start giving us the kind of problems we want to pre-empt, and therefore action has got to be taken pretty quickly.

1675 There is also another problem. They are a very wild group, not in the sense of aggression but in the sense of shyness, and therefore the older females are actually very hard to catch and it is much easier to catch the younger ones, and then one has to take a decision. If we do not sterilise them now when we catch them and they are young, they may become impossible to catch when they grow older and then they will start having babies, and then we will have to be in a position either that they are creating mischief in the surrounding built-up areas ... would we have to go – God forbid, if I may say – into consideration of putting animals down, and it is much 1680 more humane, if you look at it in that context, to actually sterilise now and to assume that the fact that they are not going to have young means that they are not going to go very high in the hierarchy but it is the lesser of the evils. That is a decision that is taken based on the knowledge of the animal.

1685 **Hon. D A Feetham:** My understanding of this particular group is ... Well, not the individuals that are there, but there has been a group of monkeys in that area going back decades, if not even longer. My understanding is that all the way up to where the football pitch is now being planned to be built is one of the areas where there has been continuous habitation by monkeys going back the longest. Is he satisfied that taking into account that the sterilisation of three 1690 individuals that have not had any young, for all the reasons that he has explained to this House in the past, is not going to upset the social structure of a group that goes back so many years?

1695 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Three among that number will cause particular problems in certain circumstances to those individuals, but because it is only a small section of the group I do not think it is going to affect the group as a whole, other than to reduce the long-term number of young produced, which is something that we have to aim for because we do not want this group

to do what groups in the past have done in the Laguna area and so on. Therefore, this is certainly a better option in our mind than large-scale culling of a group.

1700 Obviously – and we are still exploring exportation and we are successful, people are interested in small numbers – if we had another situation like we had in Scotland a couple of years ago where they want a whole group, this is the group to try and catch. It is going to be difficult, but this is the kind of group that we would take as a whole group and remove the problem from the area. In the meantime, I think that sterilising a few of the young females is probably a wise move and would not have huge implications as has been mentioned.

1705

**Mr Speaker:** Are there any supplementaries arising from the schedule to Question 763? No, then Question 764.

**Q764/2016**  
**St Martin's School –**  
**Statistics re attendance**

**Clerk:** Question 764. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

1710

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government provide statistics of how many students have been attending St Martin's School, including Early Bird's Nursery, per school year since 2012, broken down by ages as at the end of each school year?

1715

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is set out in the schedule, which I now hand over.

SCHEDULE TO QUESTION 764 OF 2016

St. Martin's School Pupil Statistics

Age (years)	2012 - 2013	2013 - 2014	2014 - 2015	2015 - 2016	2016 – 2017
5	6	4	4	6	6
6	6	7	5	4	4
7	3	3	4	6	2
8	4	3	5	3	6
9	1	3	3	4	4
10	4	3	3	3	4
11	2	3	1	3	4
12	1	2	4	1	2
13	1	1	2	4	1
14	2	2	1	3	4
15	1	1	2	1	2
16	1	1	1	2	1

Early Birds Nursery Pupil Statistics

Age (years)	2012 - 2013	2013 - 2014	2014 - 2015	2015 - 2016	2016 – 2017
3	8	8	6	4	5
4	8	7	9	12	12

1720

**Mr Speaker:** Perhaps we can deal with Question 765 and come back to 764, if necessary.

**Q765/2016**

**Special Education Needs students leaving education –  
Policy for assistance**

**Clerk:** Question 765. The Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. L F Llamas.

1725 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Government explain what is the policy and procedure to assist students leaving the education system who have been attending the Special Education Needs facilities full time?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1730

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the senior leadership teams in both schools work with the students and parents to either secure a place at the college to continue their education or to find work through the Employment and Training Board. The procedure normally starts at the beginning of year 10 in preparation for them leaving at the end of year 11, but can be later as some of the students do stay on into year 12 and year 13. The schools engage with the parents and the students through a series of meetings.

1735

**Mr Speaker:** Any supplementary? No.

**Q766-767/2016**

**Working Committee on Co-Education –  
Members of Committee; Bayside School**

1740 **Clerk:** Question 766. The Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Government please reveal the identities of those individuals who are members of the Working Committee on Co-Education, together with the date when they joined the Committee?

1745

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1750 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question with Question 767.

**Clerk:** Question 767. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

1755 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Having regard to the Minister for Education's announcement regarding the appointment of a working group on co-education, can the new Bayside School that has been promised be completed within this electoral term?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1760

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the GLSP/Liberals manifesto from the 2015 elections posed the question whether co-education was a good or a bad idea for the comprehensive schools. It went on to say that this must be reviewed dispassionately and on a non-partisan basis by experts. The idea of putting together a group of experts to review co-education was therefore raised in the manifesto itself.

1765

Co-education for the Comprehensive schools was discussed between the Minister for Education at the time, the Hon. Gilbert Licudi, and senior officials at the Department of Education on several occasions both before and after the 2015 elections. In late August 2016, the then Minister for Education, my hon. Friend, was sent the interim report of 2006, which he referred to during the recent debate in Parliament on the motion on co-education. The Minister gave instructions in early September 2016 for the working group to be set up.

1770

The composition of the group is as follows: Darren Grech, Acting Director of Education; Dympna Holmes, Senior Executive Officer of the Department of Education; Stuart Borastero, President of the Gibraltar Teacher's Association; Michelle Barabich, Headteacher of Westside School; Michael Tavares, Headteacher of Bayside School; Kenneth Saez, Headteacher of St Bernard's Middle school; Stephen Reyes, parent; and Angelique Linares, parent.

1775

The Government is confident that it will be able to deliver on its commitments in respect of the new Bayside School.

1780

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Thank you for that information, but my question was mainly aimed at the logistics of how exactly can the Government commit to an expensive project of a school for boys, a manifesto commitment that will be completed supposedly within the next three years, while a debate on co-education is going on, in terms of the logistics of the school and the element of the school that will be bespoke, I imagine, for boys, whilst they have not decided yet whether co-education will be taken over.

1785

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I am confident that this can happen. I think it is interesting to note that the manifesto of the GSD at the time, which the hon. Member was a member of the last election, had planned to build a new huge co-educational school, where there had been no consultation.

1790

I have no worries at all on this. Clearly the co-education committee is going to be providing its recommendations very soon in the next few months and the planning for the new school, which has already started, will run parallel to this, and if there is a change in the policy on co-education it will be factored in at such a time. I think that the project can very easily absorb whatever the policy is determined in the end.

1795

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Thank you.

Mr Speaker, can I just remind the hon. Gentleman that it was not inconsistent for the GSD to, in its manifesto, suggest a co-education school, for example. What I am arguing is that how are we sure that we can build a new Bayside while the co-education argument is going on? But the GSD, in its manifesto, was very clear that this new school was going to be mixed, so the logistics would have taken that into account. I take into account what the hon. Gentleman says and I would just like to ask him when does he believe that this consultation process will be completed – when will we know more about what decision has been taken with regard to whether we are going to see a new high school of co-education, or not, being built within this electoral term?

1800

1805

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, as I recall, in the debate here just a couple of weeks ago I think my hon. Friend mentioned that the working group would report back in March and then there would be a wider consultation, so we will need to take a decision within this academic

1810 year and that will be plenty of time to make any adaptations to any designs should significant  
adaptations be required.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** So the Minister is saying that he is confident that in a two-year  
1815 window we will have a brand-new high school built as per the recommendations of this  
committee?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, starting now it is a three-year window. (*Interjection*) Yes, but  
the planning process is part of the process and very often is the one that is more painstaking  
1820 than the actual construction, so I am confident that we will be able to deliver in the next three  
years.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, with the exception of Mr Reyes and Ms Linares, both of  
whom I understand are accountants, everybody else is in the educational field. How were these  
1825 individuals chosen on the parents side and why was there not an advert or an attempt to cast  
the net wider in terms of participation by parents – for example, the Parents Association or  
indeed the Gibraltar Women’s Association, things of that sort?

**Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon G H Licudi):** Mr  
1830 Speaker, it seems that we are damned if we do and we are damned if we don’t. So we set up a  
working group, we set the whole process in place, we start working on the issue of whether  
there should be co-education or not, and then the hon. Member starts complaining about the  
methodology of how we have come about doing the working group.

This was not a ministerial decision. The manifesto itself made it clear that this had to be  
1835 reviewed dispassionately by experts. It was put in the hands of experts at the Department of  
Education, they made a recommendation and I accepted all the names in their list of  
recommendations. So it was not as if I went round deciding who is going to be part of this and  
who should be a parent. They were recommendations made by the experts who are  
knowledgeable in this field. They felt that these two parents were the right persons to approach  
and to recommend to the Minister that they should be included in the working group. I had no  
1840 reason to doubt that judgement, that view that was taken by the professionals, and therefore I  
approved the list that was given to me. It was as simple as that.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** If I may add, Mr Speaker – and I am grateful to my hon. friend for assisting  
1845 in the reply – I totally agree, and, having seen the professional manner in which the Department  
for Education conducts its affairs, they will have been very thorough in making a good choice of  
working group.

Let me just say that this does not mean that nobody else is going to be consulted. This is a  
1850 group that will be able to discuss and can consult, and I already myself have meetings planned  
with the Women’s Association and with representatives of the students to discuss this and other  
matters, so it does not mean that nobody else will have a say. There will be broad consultation  
and there will be broad involvement, so I do not think anybody need fear that that is not going  
to happen.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I have neither used the word ‘fear’ nor attempt to instil any  
1855 fear. Still less, Mr Speaker, does the hon. Gentleman, Minister Licudi, have to get on his high  
horse about a question that just simply seeks to enquire about Government policy.

It just strikes me that if the Government has set up a working group that it says is composed  
of experts and the only two non-experts are Mr Reyes and Ms Linares and there has been no  
1860 attempt to advertise more widely in order to seek participation in what is a recommending body  
–and indeed a very important body as far as this particular issue is concerned – I am asking why  
hasn’t the Government cast the net wider.

1865 Can I ask this: does the Government intend to? Because it is not limited to these people, does  
the Government intend to? Can I suggest to the Government that it does cast the net wider and  
perhaps include some of the parental organisations within this group, so that the  
recommendations that are made by the working group are the best possible recommendations  
in the circumstances. It is certainly my view that the wider the representation of that working  
group by reference to interested stakeholders – and parents clearly are; these are just two  
individuals who have no experience, as far as I am aware, of anything education related ... that  
1870 the wider you cast the net by reference to representational groups, the better the  
recommendations are going to be. That is the only point that I am making.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, first of all, let me say that the two parents in question may  
have their own views as to whether the fact that they are parents with children in school may  
not make them have experience in education-related matters.

1875 I do not know whether the Hon. Leader of the Opposition would have liked the Department  
of Education to have held interviews for the post of member of the working group – I think we  
are going over the top. I think we have a soundly formed working group which will reach out to  
all the parties who are interested.

1880 I here and now invite anybody who wants to make a representation on the subject to write in  
and to submit their views, and if needs be they will be called for discussion. I do not think there  
is any need to amend the composition of the working group now, but what we will ensure is that  
everybody who wants to have a say, has a say.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** And will the Government include any student organisations within this  
1885 particular working group?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I said earlier that I already have, in my diary, a meeting with  
representative of the students.

1890 **Hon. D A Feetham:** No, Mr Speaker, that is a different answer to the question that I have  
asked. The Hon. Minister may have, within his diary, a meeting with students or with student  
organisations. The question is: is he going to include within the working group, which at the end  
of the day is the body that makes the recommendations to the Government, any students or  
student organisations?

1895 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, this matter was debated at length in a full debate just two  
weeks ago or less – last week. Therefore, I would refer the hon. Member to *Hansard*. Most of  
these points have already been discussed and if there is anything, after the hon. Member has  
read *Hansard*, that he is not clear about, then I would be very happy to answer his letters or to  
1900 have further questions in Parliament, but I think we are just going over and over ground that we  
have already covered. In fact, I made a specific point at the time by reminding the House that I  
was myself Chairman of the then Gibraltar Union of Students and clearly I will ensure that  
students are involved in the discussion process.

1905 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, if I may, turning back to the original question about the  
members of the working group, can the Minister advise, given that there is quite a short  
deadline to report, being March 2017, can the Minister advise the date of the letter of  
appointment of the members of the committee? I presume the members were notified in  
writing of their appointment to this working group.

1910 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, I do not know whether there was a letter of appointment. What  
I know is that I gave an instruction and the hon. Member, my colleague Dr Cortes, has given the  
timeline of what has happened and how it happened. I gave an instruction. I was given a

1915 recommendation as to a list and I approved that list, and those people may have been called, may have been told – I just do not have the information as to how they were informed or whether there is a letter of appointment.

1920 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I do not have that information. What I do know is that on virtually day two or three of my having taken over the new responsibilities I was told about this group and its composition.

1925 If I may just comment, Mr Speaker – and this really must not become a debate when we have just had one – the Government was accused during the debate of secrecy and lack of transparency by not even wanting to present the names of the group, which I did not have at the time. Today we have done it and now faults are being picked into the composition. I really do not know where we are going to.

1930 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, if I may come back to the former Minister of Education, he said that the list was approved by him and then he presumes that the members were contacted. Can he advise the House when he approved that list?

**Hon. G H Licudi:** I just do not know. I know that the instructions were given in early September to set up the working group and at some point a list was given to me and I approved it. I certainly do not remember the date.

**Q768/2016**  
**Comprehensive schools –**  
**Security**

1935 **Clerk:** Question 768. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Is the Minister for Education aware that at present any member of the public can walk into any of the two comprehensive schools unchallenged?

1940 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1945 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, this is indeed a deficiency which needs to be and is being addressed. This said, it is a longstanding problem that existed even before this Government was elected.

1950 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful that the Minister says that he will be dealing with it. We are living in a very dangerous world, and I come from a perspective, once again, of security. I do have an interest, of course: I have two children, one in Westside and one in Bayside, and I find it amazing how I can go in and out whenever I please, yet the other two children that I have in middle schools, that is not the case. I find that generally middle schools are very well secured, but these high schools, the secondary schools are not – and not only from a point of security, but I understand that there have been moments when parents have actually gone into the schools and been rather abusive to teachers for whatever reason, so I would like to ask will this be dealt with as a matter of priority and urgency, please.

1955 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, already discussions have... even before I took over as Minister for Education I know that discussions have been held as to the way to do it. One does not want the school either to appear to shut its doors to the communities, but certainly people

1960 moving in through the school is not something that we want and different options are being considered, including access to a reception area where parents can legitimately go and not feel that they cannot go if they have any concerns, but that between there and the rest of the school where the children are, and so on, there should be some other facility. So this is being looked at and I do take the matter very seriously, so let me reassure the hon. Lady that this is being looked at.

1965

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I move that the House do now recess until 3 p.m. this afternoon.

**Mr Speaker:** The House will now recess until three this afternoon.

*The House recessed at 12.55 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 3.03 p.m.*