



# PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

**AFTERNOON SESSION: 5.00 p.m. – 7.43 p.m.**

**Gibraltar, Thursday, 30th June 2016**

## **Contents**

<b>Questions for Oral Answer .....</b>	<b>3</b>
Chief Minister .....	3
Q432/2016 Gibraltar Visa Waiver Cards – Recipient details .....	3
Q433/2016 Gibraltar Music Festival 2015 – Donation to charity .....	13
Q434/2016 Naval Ground coach and car park – Increase in cost .....	13
Q435/2016 Project and development updates – Bluewater, Coaling Island and Rooke development.....	13
Q436-437/2016 Personal or Corporate Tax Refunds – Monies paid or due .....	14
Q438/2016 Dog section in HM Customs – Plans for reintroduction .....	15
Q439/2016 The Fishing Report – Extension of BGTW .....	16
Q440-447/2016 Civil Service, Public service – Details.....	16
Q448/2016 Ombudsman System – Plans for reform .....	20
Q449-450/2016 Immigration Asylum and Refugee Act – Sex discrimination .....	20
Q451/2016 Tax Debtors – Name and shame publication .....	28
Q452/2016 Failure to file Annual Returns – Enforcement action taken .....	29
Q453/2016 Capital projects – Expenditure since 2012 .....	30
Q454/2016 Government contracts – Details of allocations valued over £20,000 .....	32
Q455/2016 Government consultants – Names and remuneration.....	33
Q475/2016 NASUWT – Social partnership agreement with Government .....	34

Q476-478/2016 Tragedies and atrocities – Flags at half mast and lighting as public tributes .....	36
Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB .....	41
Q407/2016 Gibraltar Savings Bank deposits – Supplementary question .....	41
Q410/2016 Sale and leaseback finance agreements – Details .....	42
Q411-412/2016 Barclays and NatWest loan facilities – Maturity dates.....	42
Q413/2016 Interest rate swaps – Details.....	43
Q421/2016 Gibraltar Home Loans Company Ltd – Loans and mortgages granted .....	44
Q422/2016 LED lighting – Joint venture details.....	45
Q423-425/2016 New technologies – Skills and training .....	46
Q426/2016 Government-approved contractors – List.....	53
Q427/2016 Government workers– Increase in numbers since 2011 .....	59
Deputy Chief Minister .....	60
Q428/2016 Former King George V Hospital – Expressions of interest .....	60
Q429/2016 The Mount – Expressions of interest .....	60
Q430/2016 Old Central Police Station at Irish Town – Government plans.....	60
Q431/2016 Gibraltar London Office– Plans for Head .....	61
Procedural .....	63
<i>The House adjourned at 7.43 p.m.</i> .....	64

# The Gibraltar Parliament

*The Parliament resumed at 5.00 p.m.*

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: P E Martinez Esq *in attendance*]

## Questions for Oral Answer

**CHIEF MINISTER**

**Q432/2016**

**Gibraltar Visa Waiver Cards –  
Recipient details**

**Clerk:** We continue with questions to the Chief Minister.  
Question 432, the Hon. L F Llamas.

5 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide details of Gibraltar Visa Waiver Cards issued by the CSRO since 31st December 2011, disclosing the date and nationality of recipient?

10 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, Her Majesty's Government of Gibraltar amended the Immigration, Asylum and Refugee Act in March 2013 to enable Moroccan nationals to hold multiple-entry Schengen visas to enter Gibraltar for 21 days without the need for a separate visa.

15 The Immigration, Asylum and Refugee Act was further amended in October 2013 to extend these visa waiver arrangements to Chinese, Mongolian, Indian and Russian nationals who hold multiple-entry Schengen visas, so they can also enter Gibraltar for 21 days without the need for a separate visa.

20 Furthermore, Her Majesty's Government of Gibraltar has administratively relaxed the visa requirements for all visa-requiring nationals who hold UK multiple-entry visas valid for six months or more, UK biometric residence permits valid for six months or more and EU-issued family permits valid for 12 months or more. Her Majesty's Government has also agreed to waive the visa requirements for cruise passengers. The waivers are all listed in the website of the Government of Gibraltar and the Civil Status and Registration Office – Visas and Immigration.

25 I now hand over three appendices which I will be referring to in the context of the rest of this answer. I will just wait for the hon. Member to get the handout.

Mr Speaker, the Civil Status and Registration Office has issued 1,030 visa waiver cards since 31st December 2011. The cards were issued to Moroccan pensioners to enable them to enter Gibraltar to collect their old age pensions locally and to the Moroccan wives and minor children

30 of residents to enable them to visit their respective families without the need for visas. Those  
are detailed in Appendix 1 which the hon. Gentleman has just received from me.

The issuance of the cards was discontinued in April 2014. The cards were replaced with a visa  
waiver stamp affixed to the Moroccan passports. The Civil Status and Registration Office issued  
35 753 visa waiver stamps to the same category of persons, i.e. Moroccan pensioners and  
Moroccan wives and children of residents. And that, Mr Speaker, is detailed in Appendix 2 which  
the hon. Gentleman has from me.

In January 2015 the stamps were replaced with visa waiver vignettes. These vignettes were  
issued to all visa-requiring nationals who are either residing in Gibraltar, frontier workers, non-  
resident pensioners or family visitors. Appendix 3 lists the vignettes issued to persons under the  
40 same category shown in Appendices 1 and 2 and the hon. Gentleman now has that information.

# GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT, THURSDAY, 30th JUNE 2016

The Gibraltar Parliament - Question 432/2016 (page 1 of 9)

**APPENDIX 1**

Details of Visa Waiver Cards issued since 31 December 2011  
By Date and Nationality

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day
19/01/2012	1		1
24/01/2012	2		2
22/02/2012	2		2
03/04/2012	1		1
12/04/2012	2		2
13/04/2012	3		3
23/04/2012	1		1
24/04/2012	1		1
02/05/2012	2		2
03/05/2012		1	1
04/05/2012		2	2
08/05/2012		3	3
09/05/2012		2	2
11/05/2012	1	3	4
14/05/2012		3	3
15/05/2012		4	4
21/05/2012	4	1	5
21/05/2012		1	1
23/05/2012		3	3
24/05/2012		3	3
26/05/2012		2	2
28/05/2012		2	2
29/05/2012	1		1
30/05/2012	1	3	4
05/06/2012		1	1
07/06/2012		3	3
14/06/2012		1	1
20/06/2012		11	11
21/06/2012		1	1
26/06/2012		12	12
28/06/2012	34	3	37
29/06/2012	6		6
02/07/2012	3		3
03/07/2012	11	8	19
04/07/2012	1	4	5
05/07/2012	6		6
06/07/2012	4		4
09/07/2012		1	1
10/07/2012	11	2	13
11/07/2012	3	7	10
12/07/2012	1		1
16/07/2012	11	1	12
17/07/2012	2	3	5
18/07/2012	2	2	4
19/07/2012	8	1	9
20/07/2012	2	1	3
23/07/2012	2		2
24/07/2012	2	1	3
25/07/2012	3		3
30/07/2012		2	2
31/07/2012	2	1	3
Total c/f	136	99	235

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day
Total b/f	136	99	235
01/08/2012	9		9
03/08/2012	5	1	6
06/08/2012		1	1
07/08/2012	9	3	12
09/08/2012	1	1	2
13/08/2012	2	1	3
14/08/2012	3	1	4
17/08/2012	1	2	3
21/08/2012	1		1
22/08/2012	2		2
29/08/2012		2	2
31/08/2012	1		1
03/09/2012	1	5	6
04/09/2012	4	3	7
05/09/2012	2	3	5
07/09/2012	3	8	11
12/09/2012		3	3
13/09/2012	3	4	7
14/09/2012	1	2	3
17/09/2012	1		1
18/09/2012		1	1
20/09/2012		2	2
21/09/2012	2		2
25/09/2012		1	1
26/09/2012		3	3
27/09/2012		1	1
02/10/2012		4	4
05/10/2012	3	2	5
15/10/2012	1	11	12
16/10/2012	3		3
17/10/2012	2	2	4
24/10/2012	2	3	5
25/10/2012	2		2
26/10/2012	1		1
30/10/2012	1		1
02/11/2012	1		1
07/11/2012	1	1	2
12/11/2012	1		1
12/11/2012		3	3
14/11/2012		5	5
16/11/2012		2	2
22/11/2012		4	4
23/11/2012	3		3
26/11/2012	1	1	2
29/11/2012	2	3	5
30/11/2012	1	2	3
04/12/2012	2	2	4
05/12/2012		3	3
06/12/2012		2	2
07/12/2012	1		1
Total c/f	215	197	412

The Gibraltar Parliament - Question 432/2016 (page 2 of 9)

Details of Visa Waiver Cards issued since 31 December 2011  
By Date and Nationality

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day
Total b/f	215	197	412
11/12/2012		1	1
13/12/2012		1	1
14/12/2012		5	5
18/12/2012	2	1	3
19/12/2012		1	1
20/12/2012	1	2	3
21/12/2012	1		1
02/01/2013		4	4
07/01/2013	2	5	7
09/01/2013	4	4	8
14/01/2013	2	1	3
16/01/2013		2	2
17/01/2013	1	2	3
24/01/2013		4	4
25/01/2013	1		1
29/01/2013	4	1	5
01/02/2013	4	1	5
04/02/2013		2	2
05/02/2013	5		5
08/02/2013	1		1
11/02/2013	3		3
12/02/2013	2		2
14/02/2013		1	1
15/02/2013		1	1
21/02/2013	1	5	6
25/02/2013	3		3
01/03/2013		2	2
04/03/2013	3		3
06/03/2013		5	5
07/03/2013		1	1
14/03/2013	3		3
18/03/2013	3	5	8
19/03/2013		5	5
20/03/2013	2	3	5
25/03/2013	4	2	6
26/03/2013	3	1	4
27/03/2013	1	2	3
28/03/2013	1		1
03/04/2013	1	3	4
05/04/2013	6	2	8
08/04/2013	1		1
09/04/2013	3		3
10/04/2013	7	2	9
11/04/2013		1	1
15/04/2013	2		2
17/04/2013	4		4
18/04/2013	4	2	6
22/04/2013		4	4
24/04/2013	1		1
30/04/2013		3	3
Total c/f	301	284	585

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day
Total b/f	301	284	585
02/05/2013	2	1	3
06/05/2013	2	6	8
08/05/2013		3	3
09/05/2013		4	4
10/05/2013	3		3
13/05/2013		3	3
15/05/2013		3	3
16/05/2013		1	1
21/05/2013	3	1	4
23/05/2013	1	3	4
27/05/2013	1		1
03/06/2013	3	3	6
04/06/2013	1	7	8
06/06/2013	4	1	5
07/06/2013		4	4
10/06/2013	1	7	8
11/06/2013		1	1
19/06/2013	2	1	3
20/06/2013	3	1	4
25/06/2013	9	1	10
26/06/2013	4	1	5
01/07/2013	3		3
02/07/2013	7	4	11
03/07/2013	1	6	7
04/07/2013	6	1	7
05/07/2013	1		1
10/07/2013		4	4
12/07/2013	11		11
15/07/2013	4		4
16/07/2013	3	3	6
17/07/2013	4		4
18/07/2013	5		5
23/07/2013	3	1	4
24/07/2013		2	2
26/07/2013	3		3
30/07/2013	2	2	4
31/07/2013	7		7
05/08/2013	1	1	2
06/08/2013	2	1	3
13/08/2013		1	1
15/08/2013	5		5
18/08/2013		1	1
21/08/2013	7	5	12
22/08/2013	4		4
27/08/2013	2		2
29/08/2013	9	5	14
30/08/2013	3		3
04/09/2013	3	2	5
05/09/2013	9		9
11/09/2013	9	3	12
Total c/f	454	378	832

## GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT, THURSDAY, 30th JUNE 2016

---

The Gibraltar Parliament - Question 432/2016 (page 3 of 9)

Details of Visa Waiver Cards issued since 31 December 2011  
By Date and Nationality

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day
Total b/f	454	378	832
16/09/2013		2	2
17/09/2013	1		1
18/09/2013	10	3	13
19/09/2013		1	1
20/09/2013		2	2
21/09/2013	1	5	6
24/09/2013	2		2
30/09/2013		3	3
01/10/2013	3	3	6
04/10/2013		1	1
10/10/2013	6	7	13
23/10/2013		4	4
04/11/2013		8	8
07/11/2013	1		1
12/11/2013	2	1	3
16/11/2013		3	3
21/11/2013		2	2
26/11/2013		4	4
29/11/2013		2	2
04/12/2013	5	3	8
10/12/2013	5	3	8
14/12/2013	1	1	2
16/12/2013		3	3
17/12/2013	2		2
18/12/2013	1	2	3
09/01/2014	1	8	9
13/01/2014	4	3	7
15/01/2014	5		5
16/01/2014		3	3
20/01/2014	1		1
23/01/2014		2	2
24/01/2014	1		1
28/01/2014		1	1
29/01/2014	1	1	2
04/02/2014	1		1
05/02/2014		1	1
06/02/2014	2		2
07/02/2014	1		1
10/02/2014		1	1
13/02/2014	1		1
19/02/2014		2	2
26/02/2014	1	3	4
03/03/2014		1	1
06/03/2014		4	4
18/03/2014	1	5	6
21/03/2014	4		4
31/03/2014	4	7	11
01/04/2014	2	2	4
08/04/2014	1	2	3
12/04/2014		2	2
Total c/f	525	489	1014

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day
Total b/f	525	489	1014
17/04/2014		2	2
24/04/2014	2	7	9
12/05/2014		5	5
Total	527	503	1030

The Gibraltar Parliament - Question 432/2016 (page 4 of 9)

**APPENDIX 2**

Details of Visa Waiver Stamps issued since 31 December 2011  
By Date and Nationality

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day
14/03/2014	1		1
10/04/2014	1		1
14/04/2014	1		1
16/04/2014	2		2
22/04/2014	2		2
23/04/2014	1		1
24/04/2014		5	5
25/04/2014		4	4
02/05/2014	2		2
03/05/2014	3		3
05/05/2014	1		1
06/05/2014	1		1
07/05/2014	4		4
08/05/2014	4		4
11/05/2014	1		1
12/05/2014	7		7
15/05/2014	2	5	7
16/05/2014	1	13	14
19/05/2014	1		1
20/05/2014		4	4
21/05/2014	2		2
22/05/2014	1		1
26/05/2014	2		2
27/05/2014	4		4
28/05/2014	1	5	6
29/05/2014	2		2
30/05/2014	2	1	3
01/06/2014	1		1
02/06/2014	2	5	7
03/06/2014	1		1
04/06/2014	2	3	5
05/06/2014	2		2
06/06/2014	2		2
09/06/2014	5		5
10/06/2014	4	5	9
11/06/2014	3		3
12/06/2014	3		3
13/06/2014	4	1	5
16/06/2014	2		2
17/06/2014	7		7
19/06/2014	1		1
20/06/2014	24	2	26
21/06/2014		1	1
22/06/2014		1	1
23/06/2014	50		50
24/06/2014	28		28
25/06/2014	8	3	11
26/06/2014	3		3
27/06/2014	7		7
28/06/2014	1		1
29/06/2014		1	1
Total c/f	209	59	268

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day
Total b/f	209	59	268
30/06/2014	5	1	6
01/07/2014	21		21
02/07/2014	6		6
03/07/2014	6	1	7
04/07/2014	6		6
05/07/2014		3	3
07/07/2014	8	3	11
08/07/2014	10		10
09/07/2014	8	1	9
10/07/2014	4		4
11/07/2014	6		6
13/07/2014	1		1
14/07/2014	9		9
15/07/2014	4	1	5
16/07/2014	7	1	8
17/07/2014	7		7
18/07/2014	7	1	8
21/07/2014	3	1	4
22/07/2014	8		8
23/07/2014	4		4
24/07/2014	1	1	2
25/07/2014	3		3
28/07/2014		1	1
29/07/2014	1		1
31/07/2014	2	2	4
01/08/2014	1		1
03/08/2014	3		3
04/08/2014	3		3
05/08/2014	10		10
06/08/2014	3	2	5
07/08/2014	1		1
08/08/2014	1	1	2
11/08/2014	1	1	2
12/08/2014	1	2	3
13/08/2014		1	1
18/08/2014		2	2
19/08/2014	1	1	2
21/08/2014		3	3
26/08/2014	1		1
27/08/2014	2		2
01/09/2014		1	1
02/09/2014	3	1	4
03/09/2014	1		1
04/09/2014		4	4
05/09/2014	6	1	7
06/09/2014		1	1
08/09/2014	1	1	2
09/09/2014	1	4	5
11/09/2014	1		1
12/09/2014	1	3	4
Total c/f	388	105	493



## GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT, THURSDAY, 30th JUNE 2016

The Gibraltar Parliament - Question 432/2016 (page 5 of 9)

Details of Visa Waiver Stamps issued since 31 December 2011  
By Date and Nationality

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day
Total b/f	388	105	493
14/09/2014		2	2
15/09/2014		3	3
16/09/2014	2		2
17/09/2014		6	6
18/09/2014		1	1
19/09/2014	3	2	5
22/09/2014	1		1
23/09/2014	1		1
24/09/2014	4	1	5
25/09/2014	4		4
29/09/2014	1		1
30/09/2014	1	1	2
03/10/2014	1	1	2
06/10/2014		1	1
09/10/2014	1		1
14/10/2014	1	1	2
15/10/2014	1		1
16/10/2014		7	7
17/10/2014	5		5
19/10/2014	1	2	3
20/10/2014	1		1
21/10/2014		1	1
22/10/2014		4	4
23/10/2014		2	2
24/10/2014	1		1
27/10/2014		2	2
29/10/2014		1	1
03/11/2014	3		3
04/11/2014	4		4
06/11/2014		4	4
07/11/2014		1	1
08/11/2014		1	1
10/11/2014	1		1
11/11/2014	1		1
12/11/2014	1	1	2
13/11/2014	1	1	2
14/11/2014		1	1
16/11/2014		2	2
17/11/2014		1	1
19/11/2014		1	1
20/11/2014		1	1
21/11/2014	1		1
24/11/2014	1		1
25/11/2014	1	5	6
27/11/2014		1	1
28/11/2014	1	2	3
30/11/2014	1		1
01/12/2014	4	1	5
02/12/2014	3		3
03/12/2014	1		1
Total c/f	441	166	607

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day
Total b/f	441	166	607
05/12/2014	1		1
06/12/2014	1	1	2
07/12/2014		1	1
08/12/2014		1	1
10/12/2014	2		2
11/12/2014	2	4	6
12/12/2014	4	1	5
14/12/2014	1		1
15/12/2014	4	1	5
16/12/2014		2	2
17/12/2014	1		1
18/12/2014	5	2	7
19/12/2014	2		2
21/12/2014		2	2
23/12/2014	1		1
01/01/2015	1		1
05/01/2015		2	2
06/01/2015	5	3	8
07/01/2015	2		2
09/01/2015	3	6	9
10/01/2015	1		1
12/01/2015	2		2
13/01/2015	4		4
14/01/2015		1	1
15/01/2015		1	1
16/01/2015		1	1
19/01/2015	1	1	2
20/01/2015	7	4	11
21/01/2015	3	1	4
22/01/2015	7		7
23/01/2015		1	1
25/01/2015	1		1
27/01/2015	4	1	5
30/01/2015	2		2
02/02/2015		2	2
03/02/2015	2		2
05/02/2015	5		5
06/02/2015	1		1
09/02/2015	3	1	4
10/02/2015	1	2	3
11/02/2015	1		1
12/02/2015		2	2
16/02/2015	1	1	2
17/02/2015		5	5
18/02/2015	1		1
19/02/2015	1	1	2
20/02/2015		2	2
22/02/2015	1		1
23/02/2015		1	1
24/02/2015	2		2
Total c/f	527	220	747

The Gibraltar Parliament - Question 432/2016 (page 6 of 9)

Details of Visa Waiver Stamps issued since 31 December 2011  
By Date and Nationality

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day
Total b/f	527	220	747
25/02/2015	3		3
26/02/2015	1		1
22/03/2015	1		1
20/11/2015		1	1
Total	532	221	753

The Gibraltar Parliament - Question 432/2016 (page 7 of 9)

**APPENDIX 3**

Details of Visa Waiver Vignettes issued since 31 December 2011  
By Date and Nationality

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day	Nationality	Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day	Nationality
12/01/2015	1		1		Total b/f	75	49	124	
25/01/2015	1		1		20/05/2015	1	2	3	
28/01/2015	1		1	1 Filipino	21/05/2015	1	2	3	1 Panamanian
25/02/2015	1		1		26/05/2015	1	1	2	
02/03/2015	3		3	1 Chinese + 1 Indian	28/05/2015	1	5	6	
03/03/2015	1		1		29/05/2015	5		5	1 Ukrainian
04/03/2015	2	1	3		01/06/2015		2	2	
05/03/2015		2	2		02/06/2015	5	1	6	
06/03/2015	3	4	7		03/06/2015	3	4	7	
11/03/2015	1		1		04/06/2015		3	3	
12/03/2015		2	2		05/06/2015	3	3	6	
13/03/2015		2	2		08/06/2015	1		1	
16/03/2015	1	1	2		09/06/2015	1	1	2	
17/03/2015	1		1		10/06/2015	4	4	8	
18/03/2015	1	4	5		11/06/2015	3	1	4	
20/03/2015	3		3		12/06/2015	2	1	3	
24/03/2015	1	2	3		15/06/2015	2		2	
26/03/2015	2	1	3		16/06/2015	4	2	6	
27/03/2015	5	1	6		17/06/2015	10	1	11	
30/03/2015	1	1	2		18/06/2015	4		4	
31/03/2015	3		3	1 Serbian	19/06/2015	13	1	14	
01/04/2015	3	1	4		20/06/2015	1		1	
02/04/2015	1		1		22/06/2015	5		5	
08/04/2015	1		1		23/06/2015	1		1	
10/04/2015		2	2		24/06/2015	10		10	
14/04/2015		1	1		25/06/2015	7	1	8	1 Filipino
15/04/2015		5	5		26/06/2015	2		2	
16/04/2015	2	1	3	1 South African	29/06/2015	14	2	16	
17/04/2015	2		2	1 Indian	30/06/2015	5	2	7	1 Ukrainian
20/04/2015	1	1	2		01/07/2015		1	1	
21/04/2015	2		2		02/07/2015	4		4	
22/04/2015	1		1	1 Ukrainian	03/07/2015	11	1	12	
23/04/2015	3	2	5		06/07/2015	5		5	
24/04/2015	3		3		08/07/2015	4		4	
28/04/2015	1	1	2	1 Thai	09/07/2015	4	1	5	
30/04/2015	5		5	2 South Africans + 1 Thai	10/07/2015	3		3	
04/05/2015	2	1	3		12/07/2015	1		1	
05/05/2015	1		1		13/07/2015	6		6	
06/05/2015	2	5	7		14/07/2015	1		1	
07/05/2015	2	1	3	1 South African	15/07/2015	12		12	
08/05/2015	1		1		16/07/2015	2		2	
10/05/2015		1	1		20/07/2015	4		4	
11/05/2015	1		1		22/07/2015	4	1	5	
12/05/2015	3	3	6		23/07/2015	1	1	2	
13/05/2015	3		3		24/07/2015	2		2	
14/05/2015		1	1		27/07/2015	15	2	17	
15/05/2015	1		1		28/07/2015	7		7	
19/05/2015	2	2	4		29/07/2015	5	1	6	
Total c/f	75	49	124		Total c/f	275	96	371	

## GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT, THURSDAY, 30th JUNE 2016

The Gibraltar Parliament - Question 432/2016 (page 8 of 9)

Details of Visa Waiver Vignettes issued since 31 December 2011  
By Date and Nationality

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day	Nationality	Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day	Nationality
Total b/f	275	96	371		Total b/f	338	162	500	
30/07/2015	2		2		22/10/2015	1	1	2	
31/07/2015	2		2		23/10/2015	2	2	4	
01/08/2015	5		5		27/10/2015	1	2	3	
03/08/2015	5	1	6		29/10/2015	1		1	
04/08/2015	2		2		01/11/2015		3	3	
05/08/2015	2	1	3		02/11/2015	1		1	
06/08/2015	1	1	2		03/11/2015		1	1	
07/08/2015	1		1		04/11/2015		2	2	
10/08/2015	2	6	8		05/11/2015	2		2	
11/08/2015	5	1	6		09/11/2015	3		3	
12/08/2015	5	2	7		10/11/2015	2	2	4	
13/08/2015	1		1		11/11/2015	1	1	2	
14/08/2015	2		2		12/11/2015		1	1	
16/08/2015	1		1		16/11/2015	1	2	3	
17/08/2015		1	1		17/11/2015	2		2	
18/08/2015	2	2	4		18/11/2015	2	3	5	
19/08/2015	1	1	2		20/11/2015		1	1	
20/08/2015	2	1	3		24/11/2015	2	1	3	
21/08/2015		1	1		26/11/2015	8	2	10	
23/08/2015		1	1		27/11/2015		1	1	
25/08/2015	2	1	3		30/11/2015	1	2	3	
28/08/2015		1	1		01/12/2015	1	1	2	
31/08/2015	1		1		02/12/2015	2	3	5	
03/09/2015	1		1		03/12/2015	2	1	3	
04/09/2015		1	1		04/12/2015	1	1	2	
06/09/2015	2		2		05/12/2015		1	1	
08/09/2015	2		2		07/12/2015	3	2	5	
09/09/2015		1	1		08/12/2015		3	3	
10/09/2015	1		1		09/12/2015	3		3	
14/09/2015		1	1		10/12/2015	3		3	
15/09/2015	2	2	4		11/12/2015	3		3	
17/09/2015	2	5	7	1 Ukranian	14/12/2015	1	2	3	
18/09/2015		6	6		15/12/2015	4	10	14	
23/09/2015		3	3		17/12/2015	1	1	2	
25/09/2015		1	1		18/12/2015	2		2	
26/09/2015	1		1		21/12/2015	1	1	2	
28/09/2015		2	2		22/12/2015	2	2	4	
30/09/2015		1	1		23/12/2015	4		4	2 Indian
01/10/2015	1	1	2		05/01/2016	1		1	
04/10/2015	2		2		06/01/2016		3	3	
05/10/2015	1	3	4		07/01/2016	1	1	2	
06/10/2015		3	3		08/01/2016	1		1	
07/10/2015		2	2		11/01/2016	2		2	
08/10/2015		3	3		12/01/2016		7	7	
09/10/2015	1		1		14/01/2016	2	1	3	
15/10/2015	1		1		15/01/2016		2	2	
16/10/2015		1	1		19/01/2016	4	1	5	
19/10/2015	1	5	6		20/01/2016	9	2	11	1 Dominican
20/10/2015	1	1	2		21/01/2016	2		2	
21/10/2015		3	3		24/01/2016	2		2	
Total c/f	338	162	500		Total c/f	425	234	659	

# GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT, THURSDAY, 30th JUNE 2016

The Gibraltar Parliament - Question 432/2016 (page 9 of 9)

Details of Visa Waiver Vignettes issued since 31 December 2011  
By Date and Nationality

Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day	Nationality	Date	General Visitors	Pensioners	Total Per Day	Nationality
Total b/f	425	234	659		Total b/f	480	315	795	
26/01/2016	1		1		11/05/2016	2	1	3	
27/01/2016	1		1		12/05/2016		1	1	
28/01/2016	2		2		16/05/2016		1	1	
29/01/2016	2		2		17/05/2016		4	4	
01/02/2016	1	3	4		20/05/2016	2	4	6	
03/02/2016	5	1	6		23/05/2016	2	2	4	
05/02/2016		1	1		26/05/2016	2		2	1 Ukranian
10/02/2016	2	2	4		27/05/2016	1		1	
11/02/2016	1		1		31/05/2016	1	3	4	
12/02/2016		2	2		01/06/2016		3	3	
15/02/2016		2	2		02/06/2016	1		1	
17/02/2016	1	8	9		03/06/2016	4	1	5	
18/02/2016		1	1		06/06/2016		1	1	
22/02/2016	1		1		07/06/2016	1	1	2	
24/02/2016	1		1		09/06/2016	1		1	
25/02/2016		1	1		10/06/2016	1	1	2	
01/03/2016	3	4	7		14/06/2016		1	1	
02/03/2016	1	1	2		15/06/2016	1	4	5	
03/03/2016		1	1		16/06/2016		1	1	
04/03/2016	2	2	4		17/06/2016	1	1	2	1 Filipino
07/03/2016		4	4		20/06/2016	4		4	
08/03/2016		1	1		Total	504	345	849	
09/03/2016	1		1						
16/03/2016	4	6	10						
17/03/2016		3	3						
18/03/2016	1	1	2						
21/03/2016	2	1	3						
22/03/2016	3	1	4						
23/03/2016	1	2	3						
24/03/2016	1		1						
29/03/2016		5	5						
30/03/2016		1	1						
05/04/2016	2	2	4	1 Fijian					
06/04/2016	2	1	3						
11/04/2016	1	1	2						
12/04/2016	2		2						
13/04/2016	1	1	2						
18/04/2016	1	2	3						
19/04/2016	1	2	3						
21/04/2016		2	2						
22/04/2016	2	1	3						
26/04/2016	2	3	5	1 Filipino					
27/04/2016	1	2	3						
29/04/2016		1	1						
03/05/2016		4	4						
04/05/2016	2	2	4						
05/05/2016	1		1						
06/05/2016		1	1						
09/05/2016		1	1						
10/05/2016		1	1						
Total c/f	480	315	795						

**Q433/2016**  
**Gibraltar Music Festival 2015 –**  
**Donation to charity**

**Clerk:** Question 433, the Hon. R M Clinton.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister advise if the Government has made a decision to donate the Gibraltar Music Festival 2015 wrist band money of sterling £23,250.67 to charity?  
45

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I think the hon. Gentleman has read the *Chronicle*!  
50

The hon. Member opposite will be pleased to know that the money was donated to Calpe House at their charity event on Saturday, 26th June at the luxury five star Sunborn Hotel.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I am gratified for the Chief Minister's answer. It is a shame about the 67p but, hey, who is counting?  
55

**Q434/2016**  
**Naval Ground coach and car park –**  
**Increase in cost**

**Clerk:** Question 434, the Hon. R M Clinton.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, further to Question 253/2016 can the Minister for Public Finance explain why the cost of the coach and car park has increased by £3.8 million from £17.5 million stated in the GSLP/Liberal election manifesto to £21.3 million in answer to Question 253/2016?  
60

**Clerk** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, the £21.3 million refers to the estimated cost of the coach and car park.  
65

Gibraltar Car Parks Limited, however, will acquire the coach and car park for a net cost of around £15 million, in fact less than the amount we thought it was going to be, after taking into account the sales value of the private car parking spaces.

**Q435/2016**  
**Project and development updates –**  
**Bluewater, Coaling Island and Rooke development**

**Clerk:** Question 435, the Hon. R M Clinton.  
70

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Chief Minister please provide Parliament with an update in respect of the Bluewater Project, Coaling Island development and reclamation project

75 and proposed Rooke development and any premiums received, due or contractually agreed but not yet due?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

80 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, negotiation on these projects are currently ongoing and are at an advanced stage. Details will be provided once the contracts have been finalised.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, if I may ask the Chief Minister, when he says negotiations, would I be correct in assuming that will be for all three developments?

85 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Yes, Mr Speaker.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, if I may finally ask the Chief Minister: has any premium in respect of land deals been received in the last day or so, or at least in the last six months?

90 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, many premiums in respect of land sales will have been received in the last six months.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Chief Minister, specifically in respect of these projects?

95 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, I do not feel comfortable dealing with the detail of that question today but I am going to feel very comfortable dealing with it when I come back to present the Budget.

100 The hon. Gentleman has the estimates for next year which will show him already as he will no doubt have poured over them, some of the details of what has and has not been received in the last six months, and we will go through the detail of that during the context of the debate to be had next week.

**Q436-437/2016**  
**Personal or Corporate Tax Refunds –**  
**Monies paid or due**

**Clerk:** Question 436, the Hon. R M Clinton.

105 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Public Finance please advise how much money has been paid out in April and May 2016 in respect of personal or corporate tax refunds and to which year of assessments do they relate?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

110 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I will answer with Question 437.

**Clerk:** Question 437, the Hon. R M Clinton.

115 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Public Finance please advise how much money is due to taxpayers in respect of refunds for completed assessments prior to 31st March 2016 that are currently pending issue?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

120

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, a total of £1.53 million has been paid in tax refunds during the months of April and May 2016. There is an analysis of the refunds paid in the year of assessment that they relate to in the sheet that I have been given, broken down between individuals and corporate. I will not read them out I will just ask one of the clerks to make a copy of this front page and let him have it.

125

Mr Speaker, also in relation to Question 437, as at 31st March 2016 the total due to taxpayers in respect of refunds for completed assessments not yet issued, was as follows: in respect of Individuals £19.55 million, and in respect of Corporate £10.61 million.

Individuals

Year of Assessment	April 2016 £	May 2016 £
Up to 2009/2010	107,139	1,089,844
2010/2011	49,052	33,521
2011/2012	15,181	15,664
2012/2013	5,115	10,881
2013/2014	10,153	24,647
2014/2015	31,510	68,744
2015/2016	6,789	4,097

**Q438/2016**

**Dog section in HM Customs –  
Plans for reintroduction**

**Clerk:** Question 438, the Hon. E J Phillips.

130

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, are there plans to reintroduce a dog section in HM Customs?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

135

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, as I think I have repeatedly already said, a dedicated Customs dog section will be introduced as the restructure takes shape to adjust to developing operational needs.

The final structure as agreed with the Government is still not in place as we are awaiting final accommodation relocations to be agreed.

140

The dog section will be manned by one Executive Customs Officer and two Customs Officers. A senior Customs Officer (Operations) will have overall day to day responsibility for the unit.

Provision has been made in this year's Estimates of Expenditure, as the hon. Gentleman will know, to deal with certain aspects of this which we will debate in greater detail during the course of next week.

**Q439/2016**  
**The Fishing Report –**  
**Extension of BGTW**

145

**Clerk:** Question 439, the Hon. T N Hammond.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, the report 'The Management of Marine Living Resources in the Waters around Gibraltar' otherwise known as the Fishing Report, commissioned by Government and published in December 2012, recommends that consideration be given to the extension of BGTW to 12 miles.

Has Government considered this and what conclusions have they drawn?

155

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, as the Government has previously announced, we are pursuing with the United Kingdom the extension of BGTW as recommended in the report referred to in the hon. Gentleman's question.

**Q440-447/2016**  
**Civil Service, Public service –**  
**Details**

160

**Clerk:** Question 440, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, are there any non-civil service secondments within the Department of the Environment?

165

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 441 to 447.

170

**Clerk:** Question 441, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** How many employees in the public sector are currently waitlisted for promotion, detailing the grade they have been found suitable to, and since when?

175

**Clerk:** Question 442, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** In each financial year since 31st March 2012, how many people have been recruited into the public sector, Government-owned companies, agencies and/or authorities without advertising the vacancy to the general public?

180

**Clerk:** Question 443, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Government state which employees in the public sector, Government-owned companies, authorities and/or agencies are currently temporarily promoted, detailing acting post, date temporarily promoted and Department?

185

**Clerk:** Question 444, the Hon. D A Feetham.



**Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Government state which Heads of Department are currently being substituted and why?

190 **Clerk:** Question 445, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Can the Government disclose the allowances given to union conveners detailing the name of the convener, the value of the allowance and the union they represent?

195 **Clerk:** Question 446, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** In each financial year since 31st March 2012, how many people have been promoted in the public sector, Government-owned companies, agencies and/or authorities without advertising or circulating a bulletin in this respect?

200 **Clerk:** Question 447, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Further to Question 267/2016, can Government provide an updated list, together with additional information such as grade, post and Department for each vacant post?

205 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, there are currently two non-civil servants seconded within the Department of the Environment.

210 I will now hand the hon. Member a schedule with the information requested for Questions 441 to 447, Mr Speaker; but I will highlight to him that in respect of 442, 443, 445, 446 and 447 the answer that he is going to be given is that it has not been possible to provide the answer in the time available.

215 I expect to be able to provide the answer if the same question is asked for the next sitting, as a compilation of data should by then be ready.

ANSWER TO QUESTION 447/2016

Answer to Question 441/2016

Civil Service

Grade	Number of Waitlisted Officers	Wait list With Effect From
Higher Executive Officer	9	26/03/2015
Executive Officer	8	30/09/2015
Sub Officer (Operations)	1	04/12/2015
Leading Firefighter	1	06/04/2016
Fire Control Operator	1	06/04/2016
Driving & Vehicle Examiner	1	30/03/2016
Prison Officer (Trades)	1	04/12/2015
Qualified Teacher	59	20/07/2015

Agencies, Authorities & Government Owned Companies

Department / Grade	Number of Waitlisted Officers	Wait list With Effect From
Air Field Rescue Service - Leading Firefighter	1	01/10/2015
Boards & Coastguard Agency - SBCO	4	06/03/2016

Answer to Question 444/2016

GRADE/ DEPARTMENT	REASON
Senior Officer - Director of Social Security	Government currently looking into the possibility of restructuring the department
Senior Officer - Director of Employment	Government currently looking into the possibility of restructuring the department
Senior Officer - Head of Civil Status & Registration Office	Recruitment to commence shortly
Senior Officer - Human Resources Manager	Recruitment process currently ongoing
Senior Officer - Principal Housing Officer	Recruitment to commence shortly
Senior Officer - Commissioner of Income Tax	Recruitment to commence shortly (Present incumbent due to retire in October 2016)

220 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, rather than ask the question, because obviously I have asked it at this session – 442, 443, 445 and 447. Will the Hon. the Chief Minister undertake for the civil servants within his Department to provide me with the answer in writing and that will satisfy me at the end of the day, as long as I have the information?

225 What I do not want to do is come back next session and basically ask the same questions when that can be dealt with just by writing to me and providing me with the information.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, I am loath to undertake to do that.

230 The Hon. the former Chief Minister always used to say to me that he was loath to undertake to do things because an undertaking means something to him and to me because we are lawyers, and the hon. my predecessor used to say that it is very easy for things to slip under the net and then I have undertaken to do something and I will not be able to achieve the effect of the undertaking.

In particular now, Mr Speaker, I am loath to give an undertaking but what I will tell him is, that if he writes to me then I will certainly get them to respond with the information when it is ready in the context of my seeing the information and being able to provide it.

235 I am not asking him to put the question again next time for any reason other than because I know that by next time it will be ready, but if it is ready before then and he writes to prompt the answer to be provided then I am happy for it to be sent to him in time for him to then base questions next time on the answer, rather than to have to ask the question again.

240 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I understand that there may be some of these questions where I am asking for numbers that go back to 2012.

There is a reason for that because I want to undertake an analysis of the period from March 2012 until obviously now, that because the hon. Gentleman may have been in the UK perhaps taking senior civil servants with him – I do not know, there may be a reason, I understand that.

245 Rather than have a situation where I will write to him, I will just simply refile the same questions and hopefully by next time round he can provide me with the answers.

250 But for example, 445 which is a question that is not statistical in nature, it is a question that asks: can the Government disclose the allowances given to union conveners, detailing the name of the convener, the value of the allowance and the union they represent. I mean, that is not difficult information for the Government to collate and to provide.

I wonder why the Hon. the Chief Minister is not in a position to provide that information which, as I say, I distinguish from the other statistical information where I am asking the Government to provide statistics going back to 31st March 2012?

255 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, for a simple reason because that is a question which is statistical in nature; and I will tell him why.

First of all he is not going to get the names of people from me across the floor of the House – that he can be absolutely certain of because it is our practice not to do so. There are data protection rules and we are not going to be providing names; and I am surprised he is asking for names, which suggests to me there is a small ‘p’ political reason why he is seeking the information in that way.

And when I say ‘small p’ I mean of course petty, because if he is asking for the names of people and he wants to know what that person earns or has as an allowance, it cannot be for any macro-political reason that he is seeking the information.

265 This is information which requires the collation of data from salaries, it requires collation against posts, etc. and it has not been possible to give me the information in the way that I am able to hand it over. That is the answer he was given and it is exactly the same whether it relates to his questions for his stated analysis in respect of the period since 2011 or for this one. I must tell him that I am doing the same analysis, although I think we are going to reach starkly different conclusions.

270 But given that I had one ear to what was happening in the House this morning and another to the many things that are happening elsewhere at the moment, and I heard this morning that we were being encouraged by some to take more people in the public sector; and I imagine it is because he wants to tell us that we have not taken *enough* people into the public sector that he is doing the analysis.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, yes, the hon. Gentleman and I are not going to agree in relation to the analysis that at the end of the day emerges. Who is right and who is wrong will obviously be settled once and for all over the next three years and we will see who is right and who is wrong about the debate that we have been having over the last three years.

280 But yes, absolutely right, the questions that I do ask *are* political in nature; that is what I am doing here. I am asking political questions and there is a political purpose behind the questions that I ask. It is not petty, it is political and that is what I am here to do.

Now, Mr Speaker, obviously I am not going to be able to move the hon. Gentleman, I am just going to have to re-ask the question. But let me ask this by way of a supplementary: how many conveners are there to which this question would apply?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I assume the hon. Gentleman’s reference to three years is until the next general election which is due in three and a half years. I just wish my mind was where his is, thinking about general elections and what we are going to do then.

290 My mind is on the problems that Gibraltar has today and navigating a serious course through it, which enables our community to reach the next general election in a way that we can listen to all the arguments that he wants to put – and give him all the air time he wants to have to tell us about all of these conclusions that he is going to reach.

295 For now, if he does not mind, I am just going to concentrate on the matters at hand and rely on the fact that if he determines that people are deciding who is right and who is wrong at general elections, then less than seven months ago they certainly decided that we were emphatically right about the arguments that were being put.

300 And, Mr Speaker, if I had the information about the conveners etc. I would be close to being able to give him the information that he wants. I do not have it in a way that is reliable and I am not able to give it to him.

**Clerk:** Question 448.

305 **Hon. E J Reyes:** May I?

**Mr Speaker:** Yes?

310 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Thank you, Mr Speaker, may I ask the Chief Minister, in the answer he provided for Question 441, which was worded 'public sector employees currently waitlisted for promotion', he lists 59 qualified teachers.

What grade is it that they are waiting to be promoted, because there are obviously many grades above that and it could either be a deputy headship or an allowance or ... Perhaps he can enlighten me a bit further what he means by that?

315

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, the question sounds right, there must be different levels at which people are qualified to promote, but I do not have the information with me, and neither have I seen anything to suggest that the information has been provided because I do not think it is something that ... well it does actually arise from the question, the hon. Gentleman is right, it arises from the question.

320

If he writes to me asking about those 59 I will get people to do a breakdown of the 59 identifying what it is that they are becoming eligible for.

**Q448/2016  
Ombudsman System –  
Plans for reform**

**Clerk:** Question 448, the Hon. D A Feetham.

325 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, does the Government intend to reform the Ombudsman system?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

330 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, the Government does not currently intend to reform the Ombudsman system.

**Q449-450/2016  
Immigration Asylum and Refugee Act –  
Sex discrimination**

**Clerk:** Question 449, the Hon. D A Feetham.

335 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, does the Government accept that Section 15 of the Immigration Asylum and Refugee Act discriminates against Gibraltarian men and homosexual women?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

340 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I will answer together with Question 450.

**Clerk:** Question 450, the Hon. D A Feetham.

345 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, does the Government accept that Sections 16, 26 and 27 of the Immigration Asylum and Refugee Act discriminates against Gibraltar men?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

350 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the Government does not provide legal opinions in answers to questions in this House.

If the hon. Member has any concerns relating to any issue of any particular case, I invite him to write to me so that I might assist him in resolving it.

The Government is already, in any event, working on a new Immigration Act.

355 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker, it is something I have raised in the past. Without mentioning names I did raise a particular matter across the floor of the House and the Hon. the Chief Minister said that it was being dealt with and the matter is still pending. But I do not want to look at specifics, I just want to concentrate on generalities and the Act itself.

360 I note that the Hon. the Chief Minister says that the Act is going to be reformed but let me read, for the purposes of the House, so they understand what this particular section says.

It is the 'Rights of residence of men married to Gibraltar women or civil partners', and it says this in section 15:

Subject to the provisions of this section, a man who is married to a Gibraltar woman or has a Gibraltar civil partner shall have the right to a permit of residence if his wife is living in Gibraltar.

365 In other words, if you are a woman married to a Gibraltar man you do not have the same right and so there is, in my view, a discrimination against Gibraltar men; and indeed there is a discrimination as well in relation to Gibraltar men.

If one then looks at section 16:

The child under the age of eighteen of a Gibraltar woman shall have a right to reside within Gibraltar if his mother resides within Gibraltar and he is residing with her.

Again, there is a discrimination against Gibraltar men inherent in these sections.

And then if we go to sections 26 and 27, section 26 says:

The Governor ...

370 And, in my view, it must mean the Governor on advice and it must be in right of the Government of Gibraltar because this is an area that would be within the competence of the Government of Gibraltar. But it says:

The Governor may, in his absolute discretion, grant a certificate of permanent residence to the child of a Gibraltar woman or any person who is the civil partner of a Gibraltar person notwithstanding that such a child is not entitled to a certificate of permanent residence under section 25.

And then section 27 says –

The Governor may, in his absolute discretion, grant a certificate of permanent residence to any man who is or has been married to a Gibraltar woman.

375 So there is inherent in these four sections, a discrimination against a Gibraltar man. It is a discrimination that does not exist in relation to a Gibraltar woman but actually does not exist in relation to somebody who is homosexual who is in a civil partnership – and that cannot possibly be right. We are effectively discriminating against a Gibraltar man that is married to a foreign woman, or a Gibraltar man that has a child with a non-EU foreign woman. It cannot be right.

380 I would urge on the Government that when it undertakes this reform of the Immigration Act,  
that it deals with this particular issue and I would ask the Hon. the Chief Minister for his view  
and for an assurance that the Government of Gibraltar is going to end what is a quite blatant  
discrimination against Gibraltarian men.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the Government has already said that it is producing a new  
385 Immigration Act. But certainly the sort of discriminations that the hon. Gentleman is talking  
about are not discriminations that are tolerated by my Government.

When things are brought to our attention we demonstrate that we deal with them, although  
it is the case also sometimes that some people want to go beyond what the law deals with, even  
if the law were gender neutral. Some people ask for things which are prohibited both to  
390 Gibraltarian men and Gibraltarian women if their partners are to be with them, or their spouses  
are to be with them, or their children are to be with them.

But be that as it may, Mr Speaker, any discrimination is an odious discrimination. And in  
Gibraltar we have a number of ways in which we deal with that, not just by the Opposition  
having to urge the Government to resolve things, although this Government has self-urged itself  
395 to do so and it is for that reason already in the process of a new Immigration Act.

We have something called the Interpretation and General Clauses Act and we have  
something called the Constitution.

Now, Mr Speaker, this odious discrimination I am told, having now had a chance to peruse  
the matter, comes from 1962. If it is such an odious discrimination – one which I had occasion to  
400 raise when I was on that side of the House in respect of the odious discrimination that was then  
ongoing – I am surprised that when he was Minister for Justice with *responsibility* for our laws,  
he did not resolve it, or that he did not even take another sort of measure.

I have now been Chief Minister for five years and set in train the process of amending the  
Immigration Act about four years ago, although it is a very complex Act to amend and it is taking  
405 a very long time indeed to produce the amendments.

But if I could just help him with perhaps something that could be of assistance in terms of the  
analysis of odious discriminations Mr Speaker, clause 7 of the Interpretation and General Clauses  
Act says this:

In any Act, unless the contrary intention appears, -  
(a) words importing the masculine gender include females; and  
(b) words in the singular include the plural, and words in the plural include the singular.

Now, Mr Speaker, hon. Members might note that in relation to numbers, the Interpretation  
410 and General Clauses Act requires us to treat the singular as the plural and the plural as the  
singular. But it strikes me that there is an odious discrimination in the Interpretation and  
General Clauses Act, which only requires us to treat the masculine genders including the  
feminine, but not the feminine to be inclusive in the masculine.

But of course, Mr Speaker, there is a principal and overriding enactment; and that principal  
415 and overriding enactment is not the Interpretation and General Clauses Act but the Constitution.  
And I am going to assume that a former Minister for Justice – who is not Mr Licudi, but is a  
*former* Minister for Justice, of which there could only then be two ... that the former glorious,  
greatest Chief Minister of all time in the opinion of some, or himself, would not have felt the  
need to act against such an odious discrimination which was so obvious that it would have  
420 jumped out of the page – in particular, given that I was raising it from those benches.

We have in our principal and overriding enactment, and in Clause 14 of the Constitution, a  
clear protection from discrimination on the grounds of race, etc.; and the 'etc.' means that when  
any interpretation is to be done of any Act – including in my respectful submission, the  
Interpretation and General Clauses Act, let alone the Immigration Act – there should be no  
425 discrimination on the grounds of sex, Mr Speaker.

Now, in our interpretation at the time that there were negotiations for the Constitution, the Constitution should have gone on to say ... 'or sexual orientation'. But as the hon. Gentleman knows, we did not have the support of that side of the House when it was on this side of the House, and believed different things, in order to come back with the principal and overriding enactment from the United Kingdom that provided for that. But at least we got sex.

430 So, Mr Speaker, in my view any odious discrimination in respect of sex, if it still exists somewhere in our laws from 1962 – but in a way that was not dealt with appropriately before, or has not yet been dealt with appropriately – is one to be dealt with in keeping with the provisions of Section 14 of the Constitution in what is known as the 'blue pencil test' that not just judges can use, but also Administrators.

435 And whenever these matters are brought to my attention they are dealt with in that way. So the hon. Gentleman can rest assured that even if the Immigration Act is not yet fixed, we will not tolerate these odious discriminations because the law so requires.

440 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, I am extremely grateful for that analysis because, in actual fact it happens to be in respect of the Constitution – and I will deal with some other points in a moment. But it happens to be in respect of the Constitution, my own analysis to public servants in respect of two cases that I am representing where the civil servants in question are taking a quite different view to the Hon. the Chief Minister.

445 So all that I will do in my next letter, is just simply refer to *Hansard* and say, 'But the Chief Minister does not agree with your interpretation; this has got to be interpreted in the light of the Constitution', because quite rightly when this particular section discriminates against a Gibraltar man, that is absolutely wrong because it is a discrimination on grounds of sex. And it is also, Mr Speaker, actually interfering with that person's right to family life, one that the Hon. the Chief Minister did not mention during the course of his intervention.

450 But, Mr Speaker, during the constitutional talks, and the reason why the Constitution was not amended to include sexual orientation as well as sex – and he must know this – is because there is a case from the European Court of Human Rights that already interprets sex as including sexual orientation. So it did not need amendment and that was the point that both the former Chief Minister and greatest Gibraltar man of his time, made at the time, and it was the point that I also made.

455 And also, Mr Speaker, of course this is something that dates back to 1962, I accept that; but the Hon. the Chief Minister must also know that it was his own Government that amended this in order to include rights to homosexual women in this particular case to have the same rights as women who have more rights than men – and yet the Government did not amend it to end the discrimination against Gibraltar men.

460 And I do not want to say that and, believe me, I am not saying that because I want to really criticise the Government; this is not about criticism, these are genuine questions, not about criticisms of the Government, but just simply to ask for assurances from the Government so that I can then go back to my constituents and I can say, 'Well, look, it is well in hand.' Because if it is not well in hand then of course what I intended to do was to present a Private Member's Bill, a Private Member's Motion beforehand, in order to amend the legislation to end the discrimination.

465 And finally – and I am grateful for the indulgence of the hon. the Speaker in relation to this, because I know that I have probably exceeded the bounds of what is acceptable, and I apologise in my intervention – but can the Hon. the Chief Minister provide me with a timeframe in relation to which this particular Act is going to be reformed, so that again I can go back to two people in particular who are concerned about this and feel discriminated about this, so that I can say, 'Well, look, it is well in hand and it is probably going to be dealt with by x date'?

475 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, I am grateful that the hon. Gentleman has said that what he is trying to do is not criticise the Government but I am not surprised at that because,

given that there is nothing to criticise the Government about, it would be a fool's errand to try and do so.

480 Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman has said that he is writing about two cases to civil servants. I wonder whether he will let us know whether he is writing in his capacity as a legal practitioner in which case it is absolutely appropriate for him to write to whoever he likes. But if he is writing as a Member of this House, then I would suggest to him that what he needs to do is write to me, because I am the Minister with this responsibility, and if he writes to me he may find that by  
485 going to the policy maker he gets a clearer position as to the policy.

It is not unusual that a policy is sometimes not clear to some people, especially when you have had changes in Departments and we have had recently a change in the Department which is the CSRO.

490 Mr Speaker, he referred to the right to family life. I did not refer to that but I actually take a different view, because I have dealt with a lot of these cases in Opposition and I have dealt with a lot of these cases in Government, and I think the clue here is that he is dealing with two and I have dealt with many hundreds of them. The reason he is dealing with two, and not with many hundreds of them, is because most of them have been resolved.

495 They have been resolved because I do not consider this just as an interference with family life; this is an interference with a person's ability to love and there is nothing more sacred than somebody's ability to love. And if somebody has fallen in love with someone and is in a marriage or a civil partnership with them, or is in a common law partnership where that may be appropriate, or if somebody has a child with someone then, if the State in Gibraltar should be standing in the way of them being able to come here or somehow seeks to apply an external test  
500 to that, it is in my view wholly inappropriate.

Now, he will bear with me whilst I tell him that that is the situation we inherited. We inherited a situation where the former Chief Minister – the greatest Gibraltarian now, apparently, of *his* time rather than of *all* time, this keeps changing at least in the opinion of some – tried to determine whether marriages were real or sham, *himself*. So there was an objective  
505 criteria – the Caruana, test if we can call it that – which was, 'Have you been married for three years? When did the marriage occur? Let me see photographs of the individuals.'

Because this is what I was told I needed to do, to determine whether the partnerships or the relationships looked like they may be real – or was this somebody in Gibraltar being duped by somebody who wanted simply to come to Gibraltar? Well, I do not consider that is a test that I  
510 should be involved in, because if somebody has fallen in love with me then people can fall in love with anybody, whatever they look like; and I do not think it is right that there should be a test of whether one Gibraltarian's love is stronger than another Gibraltarian's love, just because they may have fallen in love with somebody from beyond our shores.

And, Mr Speaker, the amendments that were required were the amendments that were made because our laws – because of the failure to come back from the United Kingdom with a provision as to sexual orientation in our Constitution – actually required that amendment ... and I am going to come back to the issue that he dealt with before. They *required* that amendment and that is why the amendments we did make were the amendments which were required.

515 You see, Mr Speaker, the case that the hon. Gentleman refers to – the Austrian case – is a case which deals with there being an inclusive reference to sexual orientation in the word 'sex' *in communities where that is appropriate*. And what the hon. Gentleman is forgetting is that he was sitting here close to the former Chief Minister – greatest Gibraltarian of his time and of all time, depending on who he is trying to curry favour with in a particular week – and said from  
520 *here*, that in Gibraltar he thought that test was not passed, and if anybody thought it was they could go to the Supreme Court and test it. That is exactly what the hon. the former Chief Minister said.

525 So, Mr Speaker, it was wrong not to include sexual orientation as a ground for discrimination explicitly in our Constitution; it was wrong, Mr Speaker, to apply an objective test which the Hon. the former Chief Minister was the person who was responsible for applying; and it was



530 wrong to interfere in people's right to love those people who they wanted to love and were in relationships with.

We have fixed that, we have gone beyond and are dealing with matters relating to sexual orientation, we have made specific amendments and where there does not need to be specific amendments the policy is that you blue pencil the words to include both the masculine and the feminine and *vice versa*.

535 And I cannot give him a timeframe in relation to which we will bring in a new Immigration Act because at the moment I am finding it difficult to give a timeframe for anything. But it will be brought as soon as possible.

In relation to the two cases he is dealing with, I think it would be better for him instead of waiting for *Hansard* which is now produced very quickly indeed compared to the six months we used to have to wait, to just write to me and I will make sure people understand what the policy is from the policy maker himself.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker -

545

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Can I, sorry -

**Hon. D A Feetham:** I will give way to the hon. Lady, this is going to be my last supplementary.

550 Mr Speaker, the former Chief Minister of Gibraltar, Sir Peter Caruana, may have or may not have taken a particular view on these particular issues. But actually, my own record stands comparable to the record of anyone in this Parliament in standing up for the rights of minorities and for the rights of gay people, and in defence of sexual orientation and the right to express and the like, in relation to sexual orientation.

555 May I remind the Hon. the Chief Minister, that it was *me* that presented a Private Member's Bill in order to equalise the age of consent for homosexuals with heterosexuals, by bringing the age of consent for homosexuals from 18 to 16, an age that had been at 18 for over a hundred years – well, no, I beg your pardon, it had been at 16 for heterosexuals for over a hundred years, but it had been unlawful to be homosexual for many, many years and then it was set at 18.

560 The Hon. the Chief Minister, who was not the Leader of the Opposition at the time as far as I recall, together with everybody on the Opposition side, voted against it. Now they may have had their own reasons (*Interjection*) and *yes*, the Hon. the Chief Minister at the time, Sir Peter Caruana, voted against it as well and we were in a minority on my side – but it is a matter of pride to me that I stood in a minority of four – four Mr Speaker, in this House. Four for on my side, six against on my side and everybody on the Opposition, including the Hon. the Chief Minister, voting for something as basic as the equalisation of the age of consent.

565 So, Mr Speaker, I quite frankly will not accept lessons on sexual orientation and defence of the rights of gay people from the Hon. the Chief Minister. And *every single time* that I have been called upon in order to express my own views of Government measures to advance the rights of minorities, again I have not been found wanting. And again, in relation – may I remind the Hon. the Chief Minister – to the Government's plans for gay marriage, I said at the beginning of this year that although a free vote would be given to everybody on this side of the House because it was not GSD policy, it was a matter of conscience. That is the policy of the GSD – allowing people to vote their conscience in these matters – my hon. Colleagues had indicated to me that they were all going to be supporting that particular measure.

575 And, Mr Speaker, it really is a matter of regret for me that, on something like this on sections 15, 16, 26 and 27, where all that the Hon. the Chief Minister really had to say is, 'It is in hand, we will deal with it' that it has developed into this kind of exchange. And I urge upon the Hon. the Chief Minister -

580 **Mr Speaker:** I could not agree more. (*Laughter*)

It is a matter for regret and it is a matter for regret for me to tell the Chief Minister and the Leader of the Opposition who today, and in the last few days, have been involved in matters of earth-shattering importance for Gibraltar, that you should allow yourselves to get down to this level.

585

**Hon. Chief Minister:** But, Mr Speaker –

**Mr Speaker:** For me, it is a matter of shame to hear you *here*, getting down to this level on two questions –

590

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, with respect –

**Mr Speaker:** On two questions when all that the Leader of the Opposition needed to do was to ask, ‘Will the Government consider amending section such and such, and section such and such?’

595

That is all. (*Interjection by Hon. D A Feetham.*)

No, that is not what you asked, you asked for a legal opinion, you asked for an opinion which is not in the rules, because the rules do not accept that, and I let it go, but you asked for an opinion and the rules are clear (*Interjection Hon. D A Feetham*) when you should have asked ‘Will the Government consider bringing amending legislation to such and such?’

600

And half an hour ago you might have got an answer, ‘Yes, the Government will look at this.’ And that would have been the end of the matter.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** No, Mr Speaker, I do not accept that that would be the end of the matter – with respect to him. I do not accept that.

605

**Mr Speaker:** Both of you go on and on and on. Do you not realise what you are doing? You are once again engaging in the Punch and Judy show and I tell you that as an independent person; and if you do not like what I am telling you, well *you know what you have to do*.

610

But honestly you are getting out of hand. The answers to questions could not be longer; and the Rules, you are not having any account to the Rules whatsoever.

You introduce whatever you think you ought to introduce into supplementaries and the answers go on and on and on, and we get a debate again and again and again.

I am very sorry but I sit here for very many hours; you people are able to go in and out, and I sit here for very many hours – and it is tiresome to hear this Punch and Judy show.

615

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I do not know if it is the right time but I wanted to ask a supplementary. (*Laughter and interjections*) I am also an independent here, by the way.

I wanted to say that I have no doubt that the hon. Member, the Chief Minister, believes what he has been saying about love and equality and everything, but it did remind me that if that is the case – which I have no reason not to believe – why is the Government dragging their feet on the issue of equal marriage; and why are we going round in circles with consultations or the possibility of a referendum and different things?

620

Why is it not an easy step to take if you are so convinced on the value of this fundamental right of equality?

625

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, I note what you said in relation to the earlier exchanges. Well, as a politician in this House I come to give answers; I give answers and when my record is attacked I respond in respect of my record.

630

Mr Speaker, dealing with the issues that the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition raised, he can say what he likes; and in fact he was allowed to speak for about ten minutes on his record in

respect of these matters. He knows, although he has mischaracterised what happened, that we did not vote against his Private Member's Bill, we abstained – so he got that wrong, Mr Speaker.

635 But he wanted to use our votes in order to get through this House a measure that in our view, as we expressed it, was a matter that – (*Interjection by Hon. D A Feetham*) no, it should come as a Government Bill. (*Interjection by Mr Speaker*) No, Mr Speaker, as a Government Bill and not something that should have come as a Private Member's Bill, Mr Speaker. (*Interjection by Hon. D A Feetham*) Yes, we abstained on the Act, that is what mattered.

640 Mr Speaker, the issue for us is a simple one. I have expressed the position of the Government, and I do not think that anybody could suggest that we are anything other than entirely consistent with our approach against discrimination. But if in the process of giving those answers you think that I have been less than short and sharp, Mr Speaker, then I shall bear that in mind of course, because Mr Speaker's guidance is always important to us on this side of the House.

645 But I am reminded, Mr Speaker, of the fact that watching Prime Minister's Questions every week, as I do – and even watching other questions which are not so high profile – questions, Mr Speaker, tend to last less than thirty seconds to a minute, whilst questions in this House tend to last sometimes up to five or ten minutes.

650 So Mr Speaker should not be surprised if answers then last ten minutes. But I would urge Mr Speaker to rightly pursue the rules of the House, as he suggests that we should.

**Mr Speaker:** The Hon. the Chief Minister will agree with me that for three and a half years I have been commending to Members, particularly Members of the Opposition, that questions should be short, sharp and to the point.

655 That is my view, that is my philosophy that is how it should be.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Yes, Mr Speaker, absolutely.

660 **Mr Speaker:** And sometimes the subject is important and I am liberal – but not in all cases, for heaven's sake!

665 **Hon. Chief Minister:** But, Mr Speaker, if I may say so, you are absolutely right and you have been saying that for three and a half years to the Opposition. The Opposition have ignored you for three and a half years, Mr Speaker, (*Interjections and banging on desks*) and I think it is absolutely right that you should pursue that.

670 But, Mr Speaker, if I may say so, here the rule offends the practice. Every question is long in the supplementary, Mr Speaker. There may be some reasons why in particular areas some questions should be long, Mr Speaker, but here every question is long; and the supplementaries that I have been subjected to by the hon. Member have been long speeches about his record which I do not think are in any way relevant to the issue that we were dealing with.

675 Mr Speaker, if I may deal with the hon. Lady, whose questions I answer for the first time today since she is an independent Member, I recognise that she is sitting in a chair which has the history of being the chair that propels independent Members to greater things. I hope it does not propel her too quickly otherwise she might be propelling me out of where I am. But it was the chair occupied by Peter Montegriffo, by Peter Caruana – and by Joe Bossano for many years, before achieving the many things that he achieved. So she may be sitting on a rocket to greatness, Mr Speaker.

680 If I may say so, she is wrong, however, to suggest that we are doing anything (*Interjection*) that is contrary to the commitments we have entered into in respect of equal marriage, because our commitment in our manifesto could not have been clearer. It was to conduct a consultation to make an announcement in June.

Now, we all I think were expecting to be able to do that until in February a man who has now resigned as Prime Minister, decided to call a referendum which did not go quite the way any of

685 us expected; and I may have to beg the indulgence of the whole community, as we may need an extra week or two beyond June in order to be able to make our announcement.

But I think we are doing *exactly* what we committed ourselves to do and we are doing it in *exactly* – except for that particular extension necessary – in the timetable we agreed to do it; and I hope that, depending on the result, we may be able to count on the full support of the hon. Lady for the Bills that we may bring to this House as a result of that consultation.

690 She has already seen what we have published in terms of the consultation that was already a piece of law which people have been giving us their feedback on.

But it will be entirely the fault of the Government if we need an extra two weeks as a result of not having had June as we thought we might have had it, when we were designing the timetable we were dealing with.

695

**Mr Speaker:** Before we proceed, I am going to read out two short Rules:

A supplementary question must not introduce matter not included in the original question.

A question must not be made a pretext for debate.

Next question.

**Q451/2016**  
**Tax Debtors –**  
**Name and shame publication**

**Clerk:** Question 451, the Hon. Member D A Feetham.

700

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker, certainly we accept your ruling and if you think that for whatever reason myself and the Chief Minister – certainly on this side I speak only for myself – have overstepped the mark, my apologies and we move on.

705 What has happened to the name and shame publication of tax debtors which was being prepared during the last year's budget?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

710 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, the Income Tax Act requires that defaulting taxpayers be notified in writing of the Commissioner's intention to publish details of their failure to comply with their statutory obligations.

This administrative process in itself often yields positive results in the form of the taxpayer establishing contact with the Tax Office with a view to regularising their position.

715 On the expiration of the 30-day notice period, a number of taxpayers on the June 2015 'Name and Shame' list responded positively to the Commissioner's notification and actively engaged with the Tax Office in order to redress their default.

As a result of this favourable response the list was not published.

The Tax Office is currently in the process of formally notifying current defaulting taxpayers and it is the Commissioner's intention to publish their details if they do not respond positively.

720

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful.

725 As I understand it, what the Hon. the Chief Minister is saying is that relevant tax debtors were actually notified. Can he give a date, more or less, as to when these tax debtors were actually notified so I can have an idea of how long it has actually taken for matters to get to the stage that we are now?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** No, Mr Speaker, I do not have that information with me. It does not arise from the question.

**Q452/2016**  
**Failure to file Annual Returns –**  
**Enforcement action taken**

**Clerk:** Question 452, the Hon. D A Feetham.

730 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, what enforcement action is being taken under the Companies Act against companies who fail to file annual returns accounts with Companies House?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

735

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo)** Mr Speaker, the filing fee of an annual return for the current year is £75. The fees for lodging late annual returns are as follows: late in the first year, £105; late in second year, £135; late in the third year, £165; late after three years; £195 each.

The filing fee for accounts is £15.

740

If it is a late filing of more than 12 months, but not more than 24 months after the end of the financial period for which they relate it is £65. If it is late more than 24 months after the end of the financial period to which they relate, it is £115.

A company that is not up to date with its statutory filing obligations will not be issued with a Certificate of Good Standing. A Certificate of Good Standing is heavily relied on for most business transactions.

745

The Registrar has the power, pursuant to section 411 of the Companies Act, to strike off companies who have not filed annual returns in three years. Companies House is running monthly strike-offs to this effect.

Furthermore Companies House is exercising its discretion quarterly, pursuant to section 412 of the Companies Act and where there is a reasonable cause to believe that the company is not carrying on business or is not in operation because it has not filed a single document in the last three years, by sending a registered letter by post to the company enquiring whether the company is carrying on business or is not in operation and stating that, if an answer is not received to the letter within one month from the date on which the letter was sent, a notice will be published in *The Gazette* with a view to striking the name of the company off the register.

755

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, does this apply to Government-owned companies too?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** It is a specific question and I need notice of it to be able to reply.

760

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, of course, the reason I am asking this particular question is because there are Government-owned companies. Certainly Credit Finance, until very recently – well, in fact, the answer that the Hon. the Father of the House gave this morning was that accounts were being prepared in relation to Credit Finance.

765

I think I asked the particular question in relation to Gibraltar Investment Holdings Limited, and in relation to Gibraltar Investment Holdings Limited there has also been a late filing for some time as well.

That is the reason I am asking and obviously I will bring the question back to the House so that I can have an answer here in relation to that, because it is obviously in the interests of everybody that Government-owned companies also comply, if it is the requirement that they

770

comply; and, if it is not the requirement, then I believe there ought to be something that requires Government-owned companies to also comply with these rules.

775 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, you see, again he has just got up and given a speech and you have not stopped him. Therefore I am going to reply to the speech because he has made allegations in the context of that speech which suggests that the Government somehow is failing to deal with its responsibilities in respect of its companies.

Mr Speaker, all I would do is to say that if that is the case then he was a Member of a Government that had been defaulting for some time because the GSD did not file accounts in respect of the Government companies in the time that they were in office.

780 And, Mr Speaker, perhaps it is that they have now taken the attitude as he took earlier in relation to the issue of sexuality, that they are not here to defend anyone's record, the past is the past – something which I heard verbatim this morning from Mr Phillips in relation to another matter.

**Q453/2016**  
**Capital projects –**  
**Expenditure since 2012**

785 **Clerk:** Question 453, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, what is the amount that (a) the Government; (b) Government-owned companies; (c) authorities; (d) agencies has spent on capital projects from 790 31st March 2012 to 31st March 2016?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

795 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, the expenditure on capital projects by the Government, authorities and agencies is reflected fully in the Improvement and Development Fund as shown in the published estimates.

The capital projects which are funded through the Government-owned companies are not included in the published estimates. These include projects which are partly funded from the sale of assets such as the 50/50 Home Ownership properties and the various car parking facilities.

800 This information has never been provided by any Government in this House and in order to be accurate could not, in any event, be prepared in the time available.

805 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Just in relation to the last part of the answer where the Hon. the Chief Minister has said it has never been provided before, and it could not be provided in the time available. Is this another question that the Hon. the Chief Minister is prepared to answer if I ask it next time round?

810 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, well, I will have to look at the logic that they applied when they did not answer those questions before making a determination.

815 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, and at risk of Mr Speaker accusing us of 'Punch and Judy', (*Interjection by Mr Speaker*) Mr Speaker, the Hon. the Chief Minister spent 16 years while he was in this House – since 2003 so it was not 16 years – but certainly criticising the practice of the GSD Government.

Now can I urge upon him and will he accept perhaps a different way of doing things and not just simply looking back and looking at the GSD and using that almost as the political smoke screen for just continuing to do things, that he will just simply do the right thing, be open, transparent and provide the information?

820

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, there are many answers to that question. First of all, the GSD spent many years in opposition saying that the GSLP should publish the accounts of the companies, promptly to become elected in 1996 and not publish the accounts of the companies.

825

At least if he looks at everything I said whilst I was in Opposition, I never said that the Government should publish accounts of the Government companies, because that had been the practice that had been established by the GSLP of which he was a member at the time, as he sometimes wishes to remind us or sometimes wishes *not* to remind us. I don't know – this morning it looked as if he had been; sometimes it looks as he has never been, I do not know, Mr Speaker. I do not know how he turned up at executive meetings and they allowed him in, because sometimes it seems he was never a member.

830

And in any event, it was not just the practice of the GSLP; it was the practice of all Governments when there were Government companies. In fact there was one before the GSLP and its accounts were also not published as far as I understand it. So, Mr Speaker, it happens to be the practice that has built up. He has asked me a question as to whether I will change the practice of Governments for the past 25 years and I have said to him I will have to look at the logic that they used when they were elected and they decided not to publish companies. I have not told him I will not; I have said I will look at their logic.

835

**Hon. D A Feetham:** This question does not relate to the accounts of Government-owned companies. It seeks how much has been spent in capital projects *inter alia* – amongst other things – Government-owned companies, so just so that the Chief Minister is aware of the focus of my question.

840

And of course in 1996 I was not here in Gibraltar, I only came back in 2000. So all those statements that the Hon. the Chief Minister delights in making about how I campaigned for the GSLP in 1996, at least it is not factually accurate, so he should be factually accurate.

845

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** No, Mr Speaker, again he has not asked a question and you have not stopped him from doing so and therefore I feel compelled that I have to answer the statements that are put out into the public domain, otherwise it would be a gross unfairness, Mr Speaker, that somebody is allowed to break the Rules of the House as the hon. Gentleman has done during Question Time, get up and make a statement and that I am not able to reply to him.

850

Mr Speaker, I did not say that the hon. Gentleman campaigned for the GSLP in 1996. He is hearing things now. Mr Speaker, what I said was that he defended those things because when he was back in 2000 he was defending the record of the GSLP before 1996 – or is it that he is telling us that he was never a member of the GSLP?

855

Look, Mr Speaker, that is frankly irrelevant. What is clear is that he supported the party and was a member of it that did not publish accounts of companies and then he was a member of a party and he was in fact a Minister in a Government that did not publish accounts of Government companies, and he thought that was the right thing to do.

860

Today he is asking me to reveal a part of the accounts of a Government company and I have not said I will not. I have said I will go back and look at the logic they used to decide whether or not to publish the accounts, and therefore the information that he is asking for, and I will make a determination, Mr Speaker.

865

**Mr Speaker;** Question 454.

**Q454/2016**  
**Government contracts –**  
**Details of allocations valued over £20,000**

**Clerk:** Question 454, the Hon. D A Feetham.

870

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Government please provide details of persons and companies who since 31st March 2012 have been awarded contracts for goods or services by direct allocation, worth in excess of £20,000?

875

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

880

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, in order to be able to answer the question, the Hon. Member will need to provide a period in respect of the sum in question. Is it a total of £20,000 since 31st March 2012 or is it £20,000 per year. With that detail it might be possible to provide an answer, although it might not be possible in five days.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I am afraid that the Hon. the Chief Minister is playing games now in relation to –

885

**Mr Speaker:** There was no need for that last comment. Next question.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I have not –

890

**Mr Speaker:** You are playing more games.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, may I ask a supplementary. It is up to you, if you do not want me to ask a supplementary question I will sit down.

895

**Mr Speaker:** What I do not want you to do is to introduce unnecessary comments. Go on, ask the supplementary. Direct and to the point.

900

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, the Hon. the Chief Minister has said that I have not defined the question correctly. That is what he has said. The question is perfectly clear: 'what contracts for goods or services by direct allocation, worth in excess of £20,000' – each contract for goods or services worth in excess of £20,000. It is perfectly clear, that is the answer.

Now if that is information that he does not have, well he should say so but the question is a perfectly clear question. And, Mr Speaker, may I add that now this is the fifth or sixth question that the Hon. the Chief Minister has not answered during the course of this afternoon.

905

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I do not think the hon. Gentleman has worked it out, so I will assist him in understanding his own question.

910

In effect, the hon. Gentleman is asking us with whom, without going through the tender process, we have spent either – let me see – £138 a week since 31st March or £555 a month since 31st March 2012 or £6,600 a year, because that is the sort of spend that could be caught by this question, if it is a total of £20,000 in the 36 – well in fact it is more – months since 31st March.

915

Mr Speaker, that is a trawl through every item of expenditure that the Government makes where we might be buying from a grocery store ham, pears and potatoes for different places and we may have spent more than £20,000 in the period and it may have been done by direct allocation. Because nobody might have asked the question, 'Shall I go to Morrison's or Eroski or



Tesco or somewhere else?’ They may have just spent that and I am not able therefore to give him a reliable answer.

920 Does he mean £20,000 a year or does he mean £20,000 in toto or does he mean £20,000 a month? If he gives us that timeframe then I will be able to answer. I think I recall I gave him that indication the last time that he put a question in this way, so that he understood why it was that we cannot answer it.

It may be, Mr Speaker, that it is the fifth or the sixth question that I have not answered, most of them – in fact, all of them I think – because it is impossible to provide the answer in the time provided.

925 If the hon. Gentleman casts such a wide net that he is going to have the Civil Service simply looking for data and trying to compile it in five days, he needs to understand that half of the time that we were in the process of dealing with his questions, we were actually in the middle of the Referendum campaign.

930 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I am afraid that really what the Hon. the Chief Minister is saying does not stack up. This is a question that asks for contracts that have been awarded for goods or service by direct allocation, worth in excess of £20,000 – a *contract* worth in excess of £20,000. Nothing to do with groceries, nothing to do with any other pettiness. Any reasonable reader of this particular question would know exactly what it is that I am asking.

935 But anyway, look, let us assume that the answer is given in good faith, and that the Hon. the Chief Minister did not understand the question. I am asking him for each contract that has been awarded by direct allocation in excess of £20,000 – a contract in excess of £20,000. That is what I am asking.

940 Now, if the Hon. the Chief Minister does not have the information, I will re-ask the question. But does he now understand the question?

945 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, not because I did not understand the question, but because of how it is phrased. But of course if he is going to think that it is unreasonable to interpret it in that way, I shall communicate his views as to reasonableness to the people who provided me with the proposed answer once they had read it carefully – the senior civil servants and the others who looked at the question and determined what it was that I was putting to him.

950 So, Mr Speaker, he does not need to worry, I understand his questions and I understand even where they are coming from, and he does not need to worry about my assuming his good faith in putting questions because I know exactly what faith he is coming from. He has now clarified that he is now talking about total contracts and not cumulative amounts which may exceed that.

So it may be that I am able to give him the answer sooner than he expects. He can write to me if he likes and I can try and provide it.

#### Q455/2016

#### Government consultants – Names and remuneration

955 **Clerk:** Question 455, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I hope that when I next ask the questions for the next session of Parliament that Mr Speaker obviously does not invoke the six-month rule –

960 **Mr Speaker:** In respect of those I would not.

**Hon D A Feetham:** I appreciate that, Mr Speaker.

Mr Speaker, please provide details of names and remuneration of all consultants currently engaged by Government, Government-owned companies, authorities or agencies whose disclosure will not damage the national interest?

965

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, it has not been possible to provide the answer in the time available.

970 I expect to be able to provide the answer if the same question is asked for the next sitting as the compilation of data should then be ready.

And I, Mr Speaker, will not be referring you to the rule on six months where I have made the invitation and the hon. Gentleman will be pleased to know this is the last question I will be answering in that way.

975

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Hon. the Chief Minister but of course the person that deals with the implementation and upholding the Rules of this House is Mr Speaker, not the Leader of the House, the Chief Minister.

980 **Mr Speaker:** I have already set a precedent in respect of one or two questions at the last meeting and that is the attitude that I will continue to adopt. There is no problem.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Yes, Mr Speaker, and we will adopt that attitude as well when we think it is appropriate, although if we think that it is not appropriate then we will simply say that we are not giving the answer because we are entitled to do that when we think it is outside the Rules as well.

985

**Q475/2016**  
**NASUWT –**  
**Social partnership agreement with Government**

**Clerk:** Question 475, the Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

990 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Over a year ago, the Government and the National Association of Schoolmasters Union of Women Teachers (NASUWT) signed a social partnership agreement. Has anything tangible been achieved so far?

995

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I had made a note to say all those things about that chair now, but given that I have said them already, I am not going to repeat myself.

Mr Speaker, the Department of Education and the NASUWT meet much more frequently since the signing of the Social Partnership Agreement over a year ago.

1000 The partnership brings together representatives from NASUWT, the Department of Education, the Government's Human Resources Department and a representative from No. 6 Convent Place.

The partnership is working closely on a range of issues such as a more robust and practical grievance procedure for teachers, a code of conduct for teachers and a survey of all the teaching staff aimed at sounding out views and opinions of how to improve the service.

1005

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** From what I understand, there have been about three or four meetings since the agreement was signed in May, which means about four meetings in 14 months.

1010 And from what I understand as well, there was a motion passed at the last AGM where the Association instructed its Executive to end this agreement if it considers that little or no progress is made on the many outstanding issues.

1015 Would the hon. Gentleman, the Chief Minister say that perhaps this motion was passed in a lack of faith in the partnership, that the GTA is safeguarding itself in view of the lack of interest in this partnership or that perhaps they do not feel there has been any tangible progress and that is why they had to pass this motion?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, I was going to say that the hon. Lady will see from what I have said that there is a resounding improvement in the progress that is being made in respect of issues with the GTA and the NASUWT and the office of the Minister of Industrial Relations, which is why No. 6 Convent Place is mentioned there because I am the Minister for Industrial Relations.

1025 There is a lot of work underway. It is not work that can be done very quickly if it is going to be done properly and it is not work that is done in the forum that the social partnership established. It is work that emanates from the forum that the social partnership established.

But I heard about the motion at the AGM, I think her answer is in the reality that the GTA has chosen not to end the social partnership agreement because they obviously think there is something positive coming out of it, they are obviously happy that the work is being undertaken that is coming out of it.

1030 I do not know how to answer the questions that the hon. Lady has put to me because she has asked me what I think they think and it is impossible for me to know what somebody else thinks. Although in some instances in this House, I have a good indication of where people are trying to go.

1035 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I am glad that the hon. Gentleman is so optimistic about why this motion was passed and I appreciate his own positive view on it.

1040 But I come as a concerned Member in the sense that it seems to me that if such a young, recent motion that was passed needed a new clause to say that it could be broken at any time, to me it does not seem as optimistic, and I would urge the Chief Minister to perhaps reconnect with them or perhaps he can even enlighten me whether the Minister meets regularly himself, perhaps the Minister for Education and whether they can connect a little bit more and see what their needs are so that these motions do not need to be passed.

1045 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, I do not know that there was actually a question in there, more than a comment, but I will try and deal with it on the basis of the enlightenment and hope that the feminine includes the masculine and the masculine includes the feminine for the purpose of the application of the Rules henceforth.

1050 But, Mr Speaker, I do not keep the diary for the Hon. the Minister for Education but I am sure that he meets regularly with the people that he has to meet and that the Director meets very often with the members of the GTA and the NASUWT that they need to meet.

1055 The social partnership was entered into at the request of the GTA and they have communicated to me how pleased they are with how it is working. You do not need a clause in a motion to say that you can bring an agreement to an end because it is not that sort of agreement that is a contract. It is really a social partnership between us and can be brought to an end by either side at any time. But from what I detect from perhaps other agents in education generally who might not be seeking to undo good work simply for reasons that might be unrelated to education, those who are in the process of working with us, not just in the fora

that the partnership creates but in the working groups that are doing the work that the partnership wants done, they are very happy with the work that is being done.

1060 It is not just about meeting; it is about meeting to get things done and setting up processes for getting things done. The social partnership has already given rise to that. I have given the hon. Lady an indication of what is already being done. That that work is taking shorter or longer is a matter that is not in my hands. It is in the hands actually of the people at the coal face who are doing it at the pace that they consider is appropriate and I would be loath to interfere with that.

1065 Look, sometimes in politics we want to run things on the basis of strict timetables, we want things done quickly. There might even be an electoral timetable that is relevant to some of us. To people at the coal face, other more real and substantial things matter more and we have to allow them to do the work that they are doing.

**Q476-478/2016**  
**Tragedies and atrocities –**  
**Flags at half mast and lighting as public tributes**

1070 **Clerk:** Question 476, the Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Can Government explain what the protocol and criteria are for flying our flags half-mast after a tragedy or atrocity?

1075 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I will answer together with Question 477 and 478.

1080 **Clerk:** Question 477, the Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Can Government explain what the protocol and criteria are for lighting up the Moorish Castle when paying tributes to tragedies or atrocities?

1085 **Clerk:** Question 478, the Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Can Government give details of what the cost is of lighting the Moorish Castle in colours whenever a tribute is paid?

1090 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, if she will allow me to say we do not ever pay tribute to tragedies or atrocities, we pay it to their victims. *(Interjection by Ms M D Hassan Nahon)* Well yes, indeed, but never to tragedies or atrocities, always to the victims.

1095 Mr Speaker, the rules adopted in respect of flags are those set out by the UK Department of Culture, Media and Sport and I hand over a copy for the hon. Lady of those rules.

1100 In addition these rules are supplemented by ad hoc decisions in other cases. She will see it is not a very good printout but I am sure that this is available on their website if she has difficulty reading it. These are quite strict rules about when things have to happen, but you can also have things happen like flags flying at half-mast which are not within those rules which are designed for specific cases.

1105 Mr Speaker, it is the Office of the Chief Minister that requests the Gibraltar Electricity Authority to light up the Moorish Castle in the appropriate manner depending on the matter being paid tribute to. It is also the case that some charity organisations contact the Gibraltar Electricity Authority directly when they wish to light up the Moorish Castle in a particular colour for a particular period of time. These requests are referred to the Office of the Chief Minister from the Gibraltar Electricity Authority.

1110 The LED lighting system to the Moorish Castle allows for its colour to be changed, therefore there is no, or very little cost to the Government when this is done. If, however, an image is to be projected onto the Moorish Castle façade the cost is in order of €2,500 for the first night and €775 per night thereafter. That has gone up 10% in the last week.

1115 Mr Speaker, I have got with me if she is interested and I can just let her have a copy rather than read it out if she prefers, as the information is given to me in case it comes out in supplementaries, the cost of the relevant occasions when the castle has been lit up in a particular way or flag. I am quite happy to let her have that instead of just reading it out to her, if she wants it.



## **RULES FOR HOISTING FLAGS ON GOVERNMENT BUILDINGS**

**The Following Regulations are Circulated by  
Her Majesty's Command  
to the Government Offices Concerned**

### **How the Union flag should be flown**

The broader diagonal white stripe should be at the top left hand side of the flag nearest the flagpole.

### **Dates on which flags are to be flown**

The dates named on the accompanying Schedule.

The Department for Culture, Media and Sport will inform you of any other occasions where Her Majesty has given a special command.

### **Provincial buildings**

The Schedule applies to Provincial as well as to London Buildings (please see notes 1 and 4). Where it has been the practice to fly the flag daily, as in the case of some Custom Houses, this may continue.

### **Occasions on which flags are to be flown at half mast (Half mast means the flag is flown two-thirds up between the top and bottom of the flagstaff)**

- (a) From the announcement of the death up to the funeral of the Sovereign, except on Proclamation Day, when they are hoisted right up from 11 am to sunset.
- (b) The funerals of members of the Royal Family, subject to special commands from Her Majesty in each case.
- (c) The funerals of foreign Rulers, subject to special commands from Her Majesty in each case.
- (d) The funerals of Prime Ministers and Ex-Prime Ministers of the United Kingdom, subject to special commands from Her Majesty in each case.
- (e) The Department for Culture, Media and Sport will inform you of any other occasions where Her Majesty has given a special command.

### **Rules when days for flying coincide with days for flying flags at half mast**

#### **To be flown**

- (a) although a member of the Royal Family, or a near relative of the Royal Family, may be lying dead, unless special commands are received from Her Majesty to the contrary;
- (b) although it may be the day of the funeral of a Foreign Ruler.

If the body of a very distinguished subject is lying at a Government Office the flag may fly at half-mast on that office until the body has left (provided it is a day on which the flag would fly, and then the flag is to be hoisted right up. On all other Public Buildings the flag will fly as usual.

Department for Culture, Media and Sport, Buildings, Architecture and Historic Environment Division, 2-4 Cockspur Street, London SW1Y 5DH. Telephone: 020 7211 6940 Facsimile: 020 7211 6961

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, if I can just draw some observations and explain it as a question, why I have been asking these questions.

1120 For example I noticed that when the late Bernard Linares passed away, the flags were not flown at half mast, yet when the late Solomon Seruya passed away, they were – two gentlemen who had been Government Ministers which made me wonder whether there was a protocol or procedural body of people who decided or kept a watch out for these things, as I think these small details can be quite important really.

1125 And also, the Chief Minister has kindly explained in the main why and when the flags go half mast but has not really explained the decisions as such for the castle. What constitutes a tragedy? For example I was made to believe that we were only looking at Europe and then of course the horrendous events that happened in Orlando would have been justified but there had been a terrorist attack in Tel A Viv three days before which we never heard of. Turkey two days ago, we have not had the castle lit, so ‘where do you draw the line?’ is what I am asking.

**Mr Speaker:** Let the Chief Minister answer.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Okay, thank you. Oh and just one more thing.

1135

**Mr Speaker:** It was ‘Where do you draw the line?’

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Just to remind that unfortunately last week on the day of the Referendum, many landmarks across Europe were actually lit up in the Union Jack and it is a shame that we did not think of lighting up the castle then.

1140

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, I think it is a very good idea, we should do it every night frankly, especially the way that some people think that the only way we are going to display flags here is by flying them, perhaps they might realise just how serious we are about keeping the Union Jack if they can see from a distance that it is going to be displayed in a much more prominent way here for many years to come – indeed, Mr Speaker, forever.

1145

Mr Speaker, let me just try and distil from what she said, the number of questions that are in there. The first one was related to Bernard Linares and Solomon Seruya. I cannot remember that we did not fly at half-mast for Bernard Linares. Certainly it is something that should have been done if it was not, but I cannot remember that we did not. Usually we do and sometimes it may not be known. The hon. Lady is insisting that is the case but absent a record that we did not, I would suggest to her that maybe we did.

1150

There are different rules, Mr Speaker, that I am not fully aware of but in some instances you are told that you fly it at half-mast on the day that you find something out and then you go full mast again and then you go half-mast on the day of the funeral. In Gibraltar, Mr Speaker, that is usually one day and then the next or sometimes even the same day, whilst in the United Kingdom for example, there may be a death one day with a funeral to follow three or four weeks later and that is why the rules are like that.

1155

The hon. Lady will know that there was a ceremony which all Ministers attended on the death of Bernard Linares. We were all very touched by that passing. Bernard was not just a Member of this House, he was a great Gibraltarian, he was a friend, he was a teacher to many of us and we all felt his passing. *(Interjection by Ms M D Hassan Nahon)* And, Mr Speaker, sometimes there is a human aspect here. Flying flags at half-mast is something that really matters to the family sometimes, because it shows the affection and respect that the community has had for a person.

1160

1165

Although you do not only show it in that way but that is the traditional way to show it and sometimes it is just somebody phoning up and getting it done. It is very difficult to ensure that the machinery of Government is fully aware of these things and acts as it should. A Chief

1170 Minister may be doing something else and finds out too late. A Chief Minister may be involved in other matters and may just at a human level also, not realise that it has to be done, right?

And the Protocol Office in No. 6 is usually very good at these things and usually does not miss a trick, but very often contact with the family is what leads to this being done.

1175 In the case of Mr Seruya, I do recall myself that I was contacted by a prominent member of our society who informed me of the death and suggested that we should fly at half mast. I spoke to Mr Seruya's daughters and I spoke to the family of the late Solomon Seruya and asked them whether they would agree that we should fly at half-mast and we did.

1180 So when we do not, it is usually – if I am allowed to say this in the way that it is intended, and it is something that is often put to us by the Foreign and Commonwealth Office when they fail to do things – it is usually cock up, not conspiracy. I would point to the fact that all of the Government attended the funeral of Bernard Linares and demonstrated our sympathy with the family and I think we said things which demonstrated that. And we have done it in other instances and perhaps we have failed to do it not just for him and for others, for which I am truly, truly sorry.

1185 Mr Speaker, dealing then with the issue of the procedure for the lighting of the castle. Mr Speaker, the expression 'it comes to the Office of the Chief Minister' is intended to convey that somebody makes a request to the Chief Minister, the Chief Minister considers it and then in his or her discretion will determine whether or not to do it. When those requests come in, we consider them and try and accommodate them where appropriate.

1190 The hon. Lady has referred to some international incidents that have given rise to the lighting of our castle in one way and some that have not. Usually we have done it when other countries have established that they are doing it and so it comes to me and I am told, 'All of Europe is lighting up a landmark in this particular colour in order to remember this or that' and I say, 'Well look, if we can do it, let us get it done and if we can announce it in time, confirm it to me quickly so that we can get it out into the media and social media so that people can see.'

1195 She has referred to a number of incidents which are in my view as deserving of the community realising the importance of what is happening, thank God beyond our shores and not here, some of the other instances that have been put to us and we have therefore determined should result in the castle being lit in a particular way or in a particular colour or in a particular flag.

1200 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, if I may, I just want to clarify that the examples of the two gentlemen who passed away, I want to make it very clear that they would have both been just as deserving. I was just using them both as ex-Government Ministers, paralleling them, not suggesting that either one was more or less deserving than the other, but just trying to call for a consistency across the board.

1205 Thank you.

1210 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Again, Mr Speaker, I think that is a statement not a question and the masculine and the feminine should all be included in the application of the Rules.

But, Mr Speaker, the fact is that I think there is such a set of criteria but that does not mean that we do not sometimes get it wrong. I thank the hon. Lady for pointing this out because I shall write to the family of Bernard Linares and express my regret that it appears from what you are saying, that the flags were not flown at half-mast at the time although I will check with Protocol first, to ensure that they –

1215 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** I am a bit of an elephant: my memory serves me.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** But as I say to her, it maybe that it was flown at half-mast on one day and not on another.

1220 I will find out because I am sure that a record is kept and if it is the case that it was not, I shall write with regret to the family to express my sincere apologies for that.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, may I just ask nicely, because there is no capital *P* or small *p* involved in it.

1225 I noticed from one of the members of staff from Parliament that the Chief Minister as part of his answer to the hon. Lady passed on a bit of paper with some information and yet I do not think that, certainly not the colleagues on my side of the House, we have not got sight of that. It could be something that is either relevant and one could have asked something on it now or even for future purpose.

1230 Could I simply ask the Chief Minister could he please if not now at the end of the session just make sure that the Clerk has a copy and we can have it or if it is attached – I am asking if this is going to form part and parcel of the official answer that will come out in *Hansard*. So therefore I could be asking something in a few months' time and the Chief Minister will say I refer to the answer given to question such and such and it was not given to us. It was just given to the Lady who exercised her right not to be aligned any more to this party.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, you have to be careful in politics never to be generous. What I gave the hon. Lady was a public document but I thought I should give it to her because it set out the criteria. As I said it is the Department of Culture, Media and Sports rules which are on their website.

1240 Mr Speaker, I must say that today I have handed out a number of handouts to Members on the other side. When I have handed them out I have handed them to the person asking the question. In some instances therefore, the hon. Lady, because she is no longer aligned in a party political sense with them, will not have it. So if I were to make sure that I give every Member every handout I would find myself with 17 handouts all the time.

1245 Now I understand something was said this morning in relation to that or there has been a suggestion that we should do that. Today with the handouts if I had made 17 copies I would have come with an indictment that John Cortes would be prosecuting in respect of my failure to look out for trees.

1250 But I do have an extra copy and if the hon. Gentleman wants it I can let him have it. I assume it is specifically referred to in the answer and therefore it will form part of the *Hansard*.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** The Chief Minister is perfectly right. In fact that is why I tried to clarify, can I at least have an assurance it will form ... I do not need to have a copy now, if it will form part of the answer when it comes out on *Hansard*.

1255 But again the Chief Minister has now clarified that it is available from a website and perhaps a simple reference to the website means that at least one has access. But I needed to know what exactly the website is he was referring to.

1260 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker I do not detect a question there and hon. Members are supposed, if we are going to follow the Rules, to get up and ask short and sharp questions. But I am handing him a copy, he will have it, Mr Speaker. In any event, given his military background and his military bearing he probably knows the Rules better than I do.

1265 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Chief Minister for his answers to the questions from the hon. Lady. Since we are on the subject of protocol and I hope he will consider this question entirely in good faith, and that is when there is a moment of national grief or a moment when we want to show our collective solidarity in respect of a tragedy, I have noticed that there is a tendency to have one minute's silence outside Convent Place.

1270 I just wondered if the Chief Minister would consider inviting Parliament to attend those occasions with the Government when they occur.



Thank you.

1275 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, people go to the bottom of their place of work. At the moment, No. 6 Convent Place is my place of work and I have no desire to invite him to come and work there with me, at least whilst he maintains the attitude that he seems to maintain in respect of public finance these days.

1280 But on a more serious note, Mr Speaker, look, these are public minutes of silence and the practice everywhere is that you simply go out of your place of work and you exercise that minute's silence.

1285 In the United Kingdom, for example, Members of Parliament will observe it in Parliament or outside Parliament. Different Ministers will observe it outside different Government Departments. In the instances where we have stood together, it has usually been on a Monday and we have been in Cabinet and therefore we have all been there and have come out together to observe that minute's silence there.

1290 But you know No. 6 Convent Place, the area outside it is public and he should feel free to come and join us there whenever he wishes. I would not pretend to prevent him from doing so, at least in the public areas or to come here outside Parliament and to stand with his colleagues outside Parliament to observe the minute if he thinks that is appropriate, Mr Speaker.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I thank the Chief Minister for that. I would only ask that we be given notice of when these occasions occur.

1295 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am afraid I am not going to agree to give him notice of these things, other than the public notice that is given, because the last thing I need on my plate is to remember to give him a notice of when there is going to be a minute's silence or a two-minute silence or anything else.

Mr Speaker, these things are public and the rest of the public seems to be able to determine when to hold their peace, although I note that Members opposite sometimes do not.

## ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, TELECOMMUNICATIONS & THE GSB

Q407/2016

### Gibraltar Savings Bank deposits – Supplementary question

1300

**Clerk:** We now return to questions to the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB.

1305 **Mr Speaker:** I understand that the Hon. Roy Clinton has a supplementary question that he would have liked to have asked before we broke up at lunchtime.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Thank you, Mr Speaker, for that. Bear with me while I find it.

1310 Mr Speaker, would the Hon. Minister – just returning back to his answer to Question 407/2016 he kindly gave a breakdown of the Savings Bank deposits broken down by debentures, on call investment accounts, ordinary deposits and bonds for various dates, I could not help but notice the increase in all on-call investment accounts from about £15 million in February to £228 million in May, which more or less accounts for the bulk of increase in deposits from £942 million to £1.1 million in May.

1315 I was wondering if the Minister would be in a position to either give some indication as to the reasons for the increase other than obviously being a deposit, where that money comes from, the Government or any Government companies or agencies?

1320 **Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, I thought he knew already that the investment accounts are all public money. I mean, does he not read the estimates, it says it there.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful for the clarification. Thank you.

**Q410/2016**  
**Sale and leaseback finance agreements –**  
**Details**

1325 **Clerk:** Question 410, the Hon. R M Clinton.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Public Finance please provide details of all sale and leaseback finance agreements in place, providing details of counterparty, balance remaining, asset 'sold' and maturity date for all Government departments, agencies, authorities and companies?

1330

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB.

1335 **Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, the GSD administration entered into such arrangements in respect of the hospital building and a number of car parks.

The rental period for the hospital building ends in January 2023 and the car parks in March 2034, at which point the properties revert to the Government.

1340 There is no remaining balance as these are not loans which are being repaid, but leases in respect of which rent is paid to the Royal Bank of Scotland who is the owner of the properties.

**Q411-412/2016**  
**Barclays and NatWest loan facilities –**  
**Maturity dates**

**Clerk:** Question 411, the Hon. R M Clinton.

1345 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Public Finance please advise the current maturity dates for the Barclays loan facilities of £100 million and £50 million respectively and has Barclays given any notice of non-renewal on maturity?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB.

1350

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question with Question 412.

**Clerk:** Question 412, the Hon. R M Clinton.

1355

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Public Finance please advise the current maturity date for the NatWest loan facility of £50 million and has NatWest given any notice of non-renewal on maturity?

1360

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, the Barclays loan has a maturity date of 10th January 2019 and 29th June 2020.

1365

The NatWest loan has a maturity date of 31st March 2020.

Neither bank has given notice of non-renewal on maturity and the Government knows of no reason why the banks would wish to give Gibraltar any such notice of non-renewal. In fact, Government has no difficulty in renewing these facilities and has done so recently when the last maturity took place.

#### Q413/2016

#### Interest rate swaps –

#### Details

1370

**Clerk:** Question 413, the Hon. R M Clinton.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Public Finance please provide details of any interest swaps in place, including notional amounts, counter party, maturity, fixed payer, floating payer rates and the latest mark to market available on any interest rate swaps held?

1375

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, the arrangements entered into by the GSD are as follows:

1380

Counterparty Government: Barclays – £100 million; maturity 10/10/2019; the effective rate is 4.875%; the mark to market is £12,915,741. That is the £100 million one.

1385

The £50 million one has a maturity date of 29th June 2020; an interest rate of 4.969%; and a mark to market is £5,580,254.

The Counter Party for the car parks is GCP Investments Ltd, with Barclays. The amount is £16,925,000; the maturity is 22nd December 2025. The rate is 4.07% and the mark to market is £9,590,110.

1390

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, just to clarify for the sake of the other Members of the House, would the Minister confirm that the mark to market effectively is a negative mark to market in favour of the bank as opposed to in favour of the Government?

1395

**Hon. J J Bossano:** That would be the amount we would have to pay to break the swap at present. It can change if the variable interest changed direction.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Thank you.

Mr Speaker, has the Hon. Minister – and this may be a contentious question – considered whether these interest rate swaps were mis-sold at the time?

1400 **Hon. J J Bossano:** I think in fact the Department took legal advice on that point, as I remember it, and the advice we got was that we would not have a sufficiently strong case to invest money in fighting it.

1405 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, one final supplementary in this, coming back to the use of the sinking fund, would the interest payments for this be going through the sinking fund in terms of additional amounts being paid in support of servicing loans?

1410 **Hon. J J Bossano:** *[Inaudible]* I will say it again! The sinking fund can only do one of two things: either repay or pay interest. It has got to be one or the other. It cannot be used for anything else.

**Q421/2016**

**Gibraltar Home Loans Company Ltd –  
Loans and mortgages granted**

**Clerk:** Question 421, the Hon. R M Clinton.

1415 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Public Finance advise if the Gibraltar Home Loans Company Ltd has granted any loans or mortgages to date?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB.

1420 **Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Yes, Mr Speaker.

1425 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Hon. Minister for the answer. Can he give the House an indication of the total value of these loans and has the company now been given a credit licence, or a money-lending licence?

1430 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, I cannot confirm that they have got a money-lending licence because I have not asked whether they have, but I doubt very much that they would be lending without a licence. So I would be very surprised if they did not have it but I cannot tell him that I know that they have it because I have not asked.

I can tell him that there is only one loan and obviously I am not going to give him information on that one loan because that could identify ... I mean it is only one person. If there were 20 loans then I would be able to give a global figure but there is only one loan.

1435 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, thank you.

Would the Hon. Minister advise the House as to how one goes about getting a loan from the Gibraltar Home Loans Company Ltd?

1440 **Hon. J J Bossano:** I think he asked that before in a previous supplementary and I think I gave the answer.

1445 But anyway, the Home Loans Company is run by the same people from the Finance Department. So normally we would not have anybody approach us unless they had a specific problem in getting it from normal commercial channels. As I explained to the hon. Member at the beginning, this has not been created in order to enter the mortgage market in competition with existing lenders. This is there in order to ensure that if there are specific reasons why

somebody is not able to obtain a loan and we feel that we can provide the facility, because we want to encourage home ownership, then this is what it is there for. At the moment there has only been one case.

1450 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Thank you.

Just one final question on this, can the Minister confirm or can he advise whether the loans that are given for properties ... would the criteria be exclusively for Government developments or would they be allowable for private home ownership in any other part of Gibraltar?

I presume this is in relation to residential properties in Gibraltar.

1455

**Hon. J J Bossano:** The Government is committed to encouraging home ownership. After all, it was the GSLP in 1988 that raised the percentage of the population from 6% to 30% that were home owners.

1460 The one applicant we had was for one of the Government 50/50 homes in the new developments. We will look at the merits of any case because we do not want people who we think could be given the opportunity to become a home owner but may for a particular reason, whether it is that the bank has exhausted its quota or whatever, and we feel that it is a safe loan clearly, otherwise we would not give it, we want to be able to be there to help.

1465 But it is obvious that the market is able to provide ... At the beginning when we set this up, it was when people were expressing doubts whether there would be enough lenders in the market for the 50/50s that were coming on and we did not want anybody not to be able to buy (a) because we wanted to encourage home ownership; (b) because look if they do not buy they finish up wanting to rent.

1470 So the answer to his question is we do not discount, but if somebody comes forward, it is looked at on its merits.

**Q422/2016**  
**LED lighting –**  
**Joint venture details**

**Clerk:** Question 422, the Hon. R M Clinton.

1475 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Inward Investment please provide this House with details of the 20% joint venture in LED lighting, including the amount of money to be invested, by whom and the name of the Chinese partner and joint venture entity?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunication and the GSB.

1480

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** No, Mr Speaker.

1485 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, as the Minister will be aware, he actually made a public statement in relation to this joint venture. I am just a bit surprised that he is not willing to share the details with this House.

Is there anything at all that he can share with us?

1490 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, I can share with him that there is something called Brexit that has happened. I do not know whether he thinks that has got any relevance! But the parties that are

partners have not yet concluded what was being discussed. Whether it happens or not, I am not 100% certain now.

**Q423-425/2016**  
**New technologies –**  
**Skills and training**

**Clerk:** Question 423, the Hon. E J Phillips.

1495

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, does the Minister for ... apologies, I have got 'Business and Employment'. This was directed originally at my hon. Friend, Mr Costa.

Does the Minister agree that we need to acquire better understanding of the skills required by the new technologies and direct training in that area?

1500

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question with Questions 424 and 425.

1505

**Clerk:** Question 424, the Hon. E J Phillips.

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, does the Minister agree that in relation to technical knowledge, there is a need to acquire new skills to meet the demand?

1510

**Clerk:** Question 425, the Hon. E J Phillips.

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Does the Minister agree that the training and provision of those skills is essential to ensuring the continued success of our economy?

1515

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, as the hon. Member knows, I am responsible for supporting the acquisition of skills in the context of the relevance to Gibraltar's economic development.

1520

As the hon. Member also knows, the policy of the Government since 2012 has been to provide financial support for training leading to employment. This has been done by identifying the areas of the labour market where a skills deficit existed in 2011 as reflected by the share of jobs held by resident workers, in particular Gibraltarians.

1525

The hon. Member has previously claimed that there is a huge demand from employers in Gibraltar for taking on apprentices and although he was good enough to undertake to tell those employers that he had knowledge of, to contact the Ministry for Economic Development to pursue their requirements, no employer has done so to date. I cannot therefore agree with the three things he is asking for agreement on.

1530

Quite apart from the policy issue, I have to tell him that the way that he has drafted the questions makes no sense at all, though it is not for me to tell him how he should do it.

Question 425 asks whether I agree that the provision of 'those skills', not identified, is essential to ensuring the continued success of our economy. I do not know what are the set of skills he fails to identify, but I assume they exist. I note that according to him there is a deficit of

1535

these skills and they are essential to ensuring the continued success of the economy. I would be very interested to know what these skills are and how he has been able to determine that they are essential to the success of the economy.

1540 However, if the skills in his third question are the skills in his first and second question, then in his first question he admits that he needs to acquire a better understanding of the skills required by the new technologies. I am not sure either what the new technologies are that he has in mind. Nor am I sure what is the level of his ignorance of the skills required by the new technologies.

1545 However, whatever the shortfall in his understanding, I put it to him that the 'we' in the question can only refer to his colleagues on the Opposition benches, since he is in no position to judge whether we on this side know as little as he does about the skills required in what he calls the new technologies.

1550 As regards his other question, he claims that in relation to technical knowledge, there is a need to acquire new skills to meet the demand and he asks if I agree with him. Well, if he can tell me what the new skills are that are not in existence for which there is an unsatisfied demand, then I will investigate it and if I find there is a demand for such new skills, and that the acquisition of the new skills will assist economic growth, and that there are employers currently requiring such new skills, then I will look at the feasibility of making provision for meeting that demand.

1555 Obviously it requires being more specific than the hon. Member simply saying that the skill is new.

1560 **Hon. E J Phillips:** I am grateful for that response and I am clearly going to have to get used to the Hon. the Father of the House's responses to questions which are designed specifically to elicit a positive and constructive response from Mr Bossano, but I do not believe that he has answered that specific question.

1565 But what I would say, Mr Speaker, is that he has referred to three things. He said that my question makes (1) no sense at all; (2) that it does not identify any skills; and (3) it displays my level of ignorance. Now I would like to remind the Minister opposite of the statement he made –

**Mr Speaker:** You do not remind him, you ask him and from now on I am going to be strict. I warn hon. Members, I am going to begin to get strict.

1570 **Hon. E J Phillips:** I am grateful.

**Mr Speaker:** You do not remind him, you ask him. You had an introduction to your supplementary which I have allowed you. Now you proceed to ask a supplementary question and make it short, sharp and to the point.

1575 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

How does the Minister reconcile those three statements that I have just referred him to, to the following statement?

When it comes to technical knowledge, there is the need to acquire the necessary skills to meet the new challenges and that is essentially to ensure the continued success of Gibraltar's economy.

He added that:

The company has been a key foundation of that economy as communication in today's world plays such an important role.

1580 So effectively the three criticisms that the Minister has pointed out in relation to my questions are effectively stemming from his own statement that he made in relation to the Gibtelecom apprentices that he made on 2nd July 2015.

I would appreciate if the Hon. Minister can reconcile those statements.

1585 **Hon. J J Bossano:** Mr Speaker, his first question says 'we need to acquire a better understanding of the skills required by new technology', and he asked me whether I agree with that. My response is, if he says 'we' need to acquire a better understanding, he must be saying *he* needs to acquire a better understanding because he does not know how much my understanding is. He is certainly not entitled to assume that my understanding is as little as his, but he is clearly stating that his understanding is deficient because he needs to acquire a better understanding.

1590 If I make a statement about the nature of Gibtelecom, I do not extrapolate from what is required in Gibtelecom – which is very specific and a very narrow field – to what is required for the success of the rest of the economy. The skills in the rest of the economy are one thing and the skills in Gibtelecom are a very narrow set of skills.

1595 In fact I can tell the hon. Member that if it is about the skills in the Gibtelecom, what we have done, which regrettably has not produced a result, is that Gibtelecom has offered people who are going to university in the United Kingdom, a bursary of £1,000 over and above the Government scholarship and they have no takers.

1600 What we have in Gibtelecom is a problem in that because the economy does not have a diversity of telecoms companies and you have got a dominant provider, the range of potential people with new skills have got to either acquire them in that one company or have got to be imported from outside.

1605 This is not the case in the rest of the economy. In the rest of the economy there is a situation where there is a lot of competition with a lot of other people. For example there is a range of skills that are required in the gaming companies which employ 3,000 people and which is very significant for the economy, as opposed to the 150 employed in Gibtel.

1610 So I think he was wrong to assume that the analysis that I made in respect of the requirements of Gibtel could in fact be transposed as an analysis of what is required by the whole of the economy and therefore, if he had indicated that he was addressing the issue of the requirements in the field of telephony or the new technologies being used in respect of the business that Gibtel is in, then he would have got a different answer. But he is asking me questions that can only be interpreted as a reference to skills which are new in relation to the whole of the economy without identifying where it is and that is why I am telling him that if he identifies what he means which he has now done, then of course I do not agree with anything that he is saying which is quoting me in respect of Gibtelecom, is capable of being transposed to other activities in Gibraltar which are completely different from Gibtelecom.

1620 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, that is a long answer but I will try and distil it into one question and I will be short and sharp about it.

I asked in Question 423, does he agree that we need to acquire a better understanding of the skills? In the statement he says 'when it comes to technical knowledge, there is a need to acquire the necessary skills to meet the new challenges' –

1625 **Mr Speaker:** I am sorry, I must interrupt. The Hon. Minister has given you an answer, a long answer. You are entitled to ask supplementary questions arising from that answer.

What you are not entitled to do is to debate with him.

1630 **Hon. D A Feetham:** He is not debating.



**Mr Speaker:** You are not entitled to debate. You are entitled to have a short introduction if you like, a short preamble but you ask a supplementary question.

1635 We are at Question Time. We are not at debating time. I have given the hon. Members some time, a few meetings, I have been liberal with them hoping, but today things have got out of hand completely.

Therefore, I have got to be less liberal and remind hon. Members that they are here to ask questions.

1640 I cannot control the length of the Minister's answer. I can only tell the Minister that the longer the answer, the more likely you are to be able to ask supplementaries based on that answer, but that is a matter for them and the Rules do not say anything about the length of answers. They do not. But the Rules do say a great deal about questions and supplementary questions.

1645 Now, he has given a reasonably long answer. You are entitled to ask a supplementary arising from that but it has got to be a question.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, but you did not allow him to ask the question. But, Mr Speaker, I do not want to – and I hope that Mr Speaker allows me just to make this point – I do not want to engage in any controversy with Mr Speaker or anything like that.

1650 But, Mr Speaker, I do have 23 years of interpreting rules and appearing in front of tribunals and people who adjudicate based on rules and when you have a situation where an answer is a very long answer, often there are political points that are made; at times there is political invective.

1655 I would urge upon Mr Speaker that in those circumstances, despite the fact that there is nothing that forces the Minister to keep it short, but when it is a long answer and also when there are political points, that Mr Speaker shows a little bit of discretion on our side because it becomes more difficult for us. I mean the short and sharp question is easier said than done.

Having said that, I accept that I myself this morning – and I think that also the Chief Minister, I have to say that – perhaps we overstepped the mark. But I do not think that Mr Phillips has overstepped the mark.

1660

**Mr Speaker:** I am grateful to the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition and because the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition usually is dealing with matters which are of a wider political perspective, I do allow and over the years I have.

1665 Here we are dealing with a subject which is not so political. It is a question of training, new technologies and so on. Therefore I think it should be possible to keep the supplementary questions much narrower. The difficulty ... and therefore the fact that the Hon. Mr Bossano then gives a fairly lengthy reply means that the hon. questioner is entitled arising from that, to ask perhaps more than one supplementary. Perhaps a number of supplementaries and I will allow him to do that.

1670 But what I am trying to enjoin upon him is this: please, no matter how many supplementaries you wish to ask which are relevant, I will allow. Ask a supplementary question. Do not make a statement. Try to ask a supplementary.

The Hon. Mr Phillips.

1675 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, if I might be allowed to make an intervention because I have been listening to what has been said in relation to this matter.

Mr Speaker, we have had a view expressed by you as to what the leeway you are giving etc. is and the hon. Gentleman has said 'the Hon. Chief Minister went on and I went on'.

1680 Well, Mr Speaker, I go on because I am dealing with the things that are put to me. If I am asked a short and sharp question, I will give a short and sharp reply. But the fact that matters are political or less political is not a reason why questions should be longer or shorter. Maybe we could have more short questions so that we can deal with each question, rather than –

**Mr Speaker:** This is what I would like to see.

1685 **Hon. Chief Minister:** – a very long question which is then couched in terms which are  
partisan which gives rise to answers which have to be partisan. Because what is not fair, and  
what the Government would find it difficult to tolerate, is that questions are put in a very  
partisan way with a partisan sting and the Government is supposed to stand up and not deal  
with it. And that, Mr Speaker, would be unfair to the community because they would only be  
1690 hearing one side being allowed to put that. But if we exercise discipline on each other –

**Mr Speaker:** If I may, that is what I have been trying to achieve without a great deal of  
success.

1695 Hon. Members, particularly those who have been here for some time, cannot say that when  
it comes to a debate, I do not allow all the leeway in the world. I am very liberal in the  
application because I believe in debating.

But I must confess that I have not succeeded with the previous Members of the Opposition of  
the House or the present, I am not succeeding although I did for the first two or three meetings  
soft pedal, hoping that they would and individually I have been enjoining upon them the need to  
1700 ask questions, and not to ask a number of questions together, to ask a single question and follow  
up supplementary.

I am sure that they bring material, when you ask a question you have a number of  
supplementaries which you are hoping to ask, well get on with them but do not have a speech as  
an introduction to a supplementary question. That is what I would like to achieve.

1705

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I listened to what Mr Speaker has to say but I am afraid that I  
cannot accept criticism of the Opposition and a white wash of the Government. (*Interjection by  
Mr Speaker*) But, Mr Speaker, may I say from my part and I hear what the Chief Minister has to  
say and he may not accept this from me because he may think that every time that I say  
1710 something, there are reds under the carpet or blues, whatever he may think.

But Mr Speaker, the question on sections 15, 16 and 26 which was really what sparked this  
off, the immigration, there was no inherent criticism of the Government. I was not criticising the  
Government in relation to those questions!

1715 It started with a – (*Interjection by Mr Speaker*) No, Mr Speaker, I just wanted to make that  
point because I think it is important that sometimes there is no criticism on our side, genuinely  
on that particular occasion – and there may be 90% of others that maybe different – but on that  
particular question there was no desire actually for me to criticise the Government.

But of course, the way that I see it, if then the answer is political and answers trawling back  
to GSD years, etc. then of course there is a reaction on my side.

1720 But certainly, Mr Speaker, I will attempt to obviously do everything to make Mr Speaker's life  
as easy as possible and we will all take Mr Speaker's guidance on board.

**Mr Speaker:** I am grateful.

1725 **Hon. Chief Minister:** I am grateful, Mr Speaker, and we all must, Mr Speaker. But what I want  
to get across to hon. Members, because we are just going to find ourselves here again if we do  
not do this properly and I *want* us to do this properly.

1730 If there is a long question with partisan aspects and partisan stings to it, what they are going  
to get back from the Government is a long answer dealing with all the issues they raise with  
partisan stings back.

Now, Mr Speaker, if I may also say so, with the greatest of respect and I think in this respect I  
will speak for the Leader of the Opposition and myself, I think you have been a tad unfair on us  
today to say that we are forgetting the moment in which Gibraltar finds itself, simply because  
we are having a discussion about the Immigration Act.

1735 We are very conscious of the fact that Gibraltar is where it is today and I am here, Mr  
Speaker, to answer questions because life will go on, Mr Speaker, and this parliamentary  
democracy must work. And it must also work if I may say so, subject to your discretion which  
1740 you have always exercised absolutely appropriately in the view of the Government, with an  
element of sting and party politics, because we have a confrontational system of Government  
and Opposition which all of us, even you, Mr Speaker, when you have been here, think is the  
best way to ensure that we test each other's policies and each other's arguments to the best of  
our ability.

And I think all of us, Mr Speaker, yourself included, the Leader of the Opposition and I are  
1745 very conscious of where Gibraltar is, what the moment is and the need to ensure that we deal  
with those issues. And I undertake to you, Mr Speaker, on behalf of the Government and I am  
sure on behalf of all Members, the Leader of the Opposition included, that you will best see that  
in the way that we will deal with the Budget debate this year because the Budget debate this  
year is not going to simply be an opportunity to also deal with the political points, as we  
1750 probably rightly do in a year before a general election, as we probably rightly do at normal time,  
but this is going to have to be a very serious debate with none of that and you have our  
undertaking, Mr Speaker, that we will deal with it in that way and that we have approached  
questions in that way as well.

**Mr Speaker:** I am very grateful, as the Hon. Chief Minister and Members know, I do not  
1755 pretend that I always get it right. I do not have the monopoly of the truth and I do make  
mistakes because I am only human. But I am concerned to see that the House proceeds –  
approximately 200 questions is a very large number of questions and we are spending very many  
hours here. It is our job but we ought to do it as expeditiously as possible.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman may, just on behalf of both of us, I  
1760 think that we are conscious of the fact that one of the people who works most in the context of  
a session, is actually the Speaker, the Clerk and the Officers of the House because you have to sit  
through the 200-odd questions, not just the ones that you may or may not be dealing with and  
you have to do so without a comfort break and without another break that we can enjoy.

1765 So I think it is also absolutely right to convey the gratitude of all Members and the whole  
community, for the work that you do. And, Mr Speaker, certainly in the view of the Government  
and I am sure also in the view of the Opposition, if you do not get it right nine out of ten times, it  
is because you get it right ten out of ten of times. I did not by my remarks want to suggest the  
contrary, although I think it is important for the community not to think that the Leader of the  
1770 Opposition and the Chief Minister have for one moment forgotten the moment in which we are.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, and that I think is a fair analysis. I mean I associate myself  
with certainly the last statement that the hon. Gentleman has made and also I think Mr Speaker,  
1775 that perhaps it was a tad unfair of Mr Speaker, to characterise it in that way, because there is  
not a moment that actually goes by that the Chief Minister, I am sure, and myself, were not  
actually focussing on this particular moment of where we are, where we need to go and where  
we will be.

And, Mr Speaker, actually this session this afternoon has demonstrated to people out there  
1780 that our democracy continues and that it is, as far as Government and Opposition, business as  
usual as far as that part of the democratic equation is concerned, and that is important. And in a  
democracy there is going to be cut and thrust.

The hon. Gentleman is going to make comments that I am not going to agree with, he is going  
to make comments in the reverse and, Mr Speaker, the reality is that it is *precisely* in a moment  
1785 such as this – precisely when we are facing what we are facing at the moment – that we have  
got to demonstrate to people out there and to the outside world that we have a vibrant  
democracy and it is business as usual as far as democracy is concerned.

1790 That I think is important and it does not demonstrate in any way shape or form that either the Chief Minister or myself have forgotten the moment in which we live. I can assure the community out there that not a moment goes by that the Chief Minister, I am sure, and certainly for my part and my colleagues as well, that we are not focusing on what is a very, very important moment and moments for the people of Gibraltar and this community.

**Mr Speaker:** Let us not deprive the Hon. Mr Phillips of his supplementaries.

1795 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Thank you, Mr Speaker, just one supplementary question in relation to Questions 423, 424 and 425. The very simple question I asked before and hopefully it will be allowed this time, was that in relation to his answers to those three questions, how does the Minister reconcile those answers with respect to the statement he made at the Gibtelecom apprenticeship scheme announcing the apprenticeships? Bearing in mind, of course, that when  
1800 he referred to apprenticeships he referred to it in this way: 'when it comes to technical knowledge there is a need to acquire the necessary skills to meet the new challenges.' Widely interpreted rather than the narrow interpretation that he offered before.

So I just want to know how he reconciles his statement to the public with the answers he gave to those three questions.

1805 I am grateful, Mr Speaker.

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Well, Mr Speaker, I cannot ask the hon. Member questions; he can ask me. But it is very peculiar that he wants me to explain how I reconcile answers to questions which he did not address to me in the first place about something that I said but addressed to my  
1810 colleagues.

So he asks the Minister for Business and Employment to give a view on things which it turns out are a quotation taken from something that I said in a different context about a specific industry. Now, I have answered it because I thought he had put the question to the Minister in error, not thinking that I was responsible for training and therefore I have reminded him that I  
1815 am responsible for economic development and I am responsible for training and I am responsible for the provision of skills.

But of course, if what he wanted was for me to expand on what I said to the people who are training in Gibtelecom, then he should have identified in his question that the technology that he was referring to was the skills required in the field of telecommunications and I would have  
1820 been happy to deal with it.

But if the hon. Member put a question which says 'do I agree that *we* in Gibraltar need to acquire a better understanding', or *we* in the Opposition or *we* in both sides of the House – I do not know who the 'we' is – 'need to acquire a better understanding of the skills required by the new technologies'. *Which* new technologies? Nothing in these three questions allows me to  
1825 produce a factual answer based on information, because the hon. Member deliberately chose to leave out where he was drawing the terminology from.

Now that he has told me, I have already answered the question. The answer to the first question is that what we have done to encourage direct training in the area is that the company that has the need for the skills has told people who go to university, 'We will give you £1,000 a  
1830 year on top of the Government scholarship in order to encourage you to enter this field.' This was advertised in the *Chronicle* and regrettably out of the 900-odd people that we have studying in the UK, nobody was interested in taking up the offer.

So if he had asked about Gibtelecom, that is the answer I would have given him. He has chosen to put three questions to which my response is not in providing him with information and facts to the questions but in asking him to elaborate on what is the information he is looking  
1835 for.

He says do I agree that the training and the provision of those skills, which I do not know what they are, are essential in the continued success of our economy? Well look, Gibtel is the

1840 backbone of the economy, to the extent that our economy requires that we should have  
broadband, that we should be at the forefront of the new technology because the speed with  
1845 which we process information in cyberspace is a crucial element in the globalisation of the world  
which increasingly relies ... In whatever industry you are in, whether it is banking, or gaming or e-  
commerce or e-Government, the technology of telecommunications is vital.

1845 If he had said to me, 'do I agree that acquiring skills in telecommunication is essential for the  
continued success of the economy?' the answer is yes, but he is not identifying what he had in  
mind. And given that he did not address it to me but addressed it to my colleague, how does he  
expect me to connect a question to my colleague with something that I said in a meeting with  
1850 Gibtel when I was addressing the people who had just qualified with a level of training which is  
not the level of training we are talking about here, but a level of training for the routine jobs of  
cabling and so on in the industry.

So it is not that I did not want to give him the information. It is that he put his question in a  
way that makes it impossible to answer without him giving me more information. I am happy to  
look at any area if he is specific about telling me what the area is that he has in mind.

1855 In telecommunications, it is absolutely true that we have to be at the forefront. In fact I have  
just come back from participating in a Commonwealth ministers' conference on  
telecommunications, as a result of which we will be taking up membership of international  
organisations and be more involved so that we can be up to date with exactly what is happening  
in the rest of the world and what the competition is up to.

#### Q426/2016

#### Government-approved contractors – List

1860 **Clerk:** Question 426, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Government please provide a list of approved  
contractors?

1865 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and  
the GSB.

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):**  
Yes, Mr Speaker, I will pass the list over to the Member now. (*Interjections*)

Answer to Question 426 of 2016

Company	Type of Work Provided
501 Construction	General Construction
A C Rock Construction	General Construction
A L Woodworks	Specialist - Carpentry
A&C Fitters Ltd	Specialist - Flooring/small refurbishments, partitions
A&M Scaffolding & Cradles Ltd	Specialist - Scaffolding
A. Abecasis Gonzalez Ltd	Specialist: Building Material Supplier
ABC Services	Cleaning
Ablío Rodrigues	General Construction; Specialist - Electrical
Accoria Services Co Ltd	General Construction
Ace Plumbing	General Construction; Specialist - Plumbing
Adelon Limited	General Construction
Admiral Security	Security
AJ Surfacing Ltd	Specialist: Surfacing, Roadworks, Paving; including Green Construction Paving Systems; Trenchworks and Road Marking
AJEC Ltd	Specialist: Installation and maintenance of portable generators and consequential interior decoration
AJR Window Works	Specialist - Window Manufacturer
AK General Builders Ltd	General Construction
Alizarin Ventures Ltd	General Construction
AMCO Gibraltar Ltd	General Construction; Specialist - Asphaltting works; Building Material Supplier; Plant & Equipment Supplier (Hire)
Andy Holdings Ltd	General Construction
Apli (Gibraltar) Ltd	Specialists: Architects and Engineers
Aqua Solutions Ltd	Specialist - Supply of water bottles, Water Cooler machine rental
AS Vending Ltd	Specialist - Water Filtration
ASJ Builder Company Ltd	General Construction
Atlas Building Merchants Ltd	Building Material Supplier
Aureliano Marciano	Specialist: Painting / Decorating
Avanti Construction and Maintenance Ltd	General Construction
Babytel Ltd	Specialist: Telecommunications and Electricity
Base Maintenance Services	General Construction; Specialist - Refurbishments
Basilio Guerreiro Rosa	General Construction
Bedam Electrical Contractors Ltd	Specialist - Electrical
Bexhill Holdings Ltd	Pool Maintenance
Bravo Recruitment Services Ltd	Specialist: Recruitment Agency

Bright Co Ltd	General Construction; Specialist - New Build Works, Internal & External surface finishes
Brotons	General Construction
Cano Monumental	General construction, Stone Mason; Building Material Supplier
Captura Holdings Ltd	Specialist: Drain and Sewer Cleaner
Casais (Gibraltar) Ltd	General Construction
Ceprano Ltd	General Construction
Charles Anes Ltd	Specialist - Stonework; Building Material Supplier
Charnwood Furniture Factory Ltd	Specialist - Manufacturing of Furniture
Charnwood Jetsweep Limited	Specialist - Road & General Cleaning
CIAP	General Construction; Specialist - Glazing; Building Material Supplier
CK Transport Ltd	Building Material Supplier; Plant & Equipment Supplier (Hire & Sales); Transport Contractor; Labour Contractor
Clearview Windows	Specialist - Window/Office Cleaning
Cocoon Exterior Works Limited	Building and Construction
Colorworks Design Limited	Specialist - Signage
Concrete Pumping & Aggregates Ltd	Specialist: Concrete Pumping
Construcciones Alhaurin Ltd	Specialist: General Construction
Construções BT (Gibraltar) Ltd	Specialist: Labour Hire
CRJN Construction	General Construction
D & D Consulting Ltd	Specialist: Selling Equipment
D and D Services Ltd	Construction & Refurbishment, General Maintenance, Pest Control and Importation and Exportation of related goods
DesElec Ltd	Specialist - Electrical
Detectives & Security	Security
E.W.M.S	Specialist - Disposal of Hazardous and Non-Hazardous Waste
Elite Plumbing & Boiler Services	Specialist: Plumbing and Boilers
Endash Ltd	Labour Contractor
Environmental Support Services	Cleaning
Ernest Lopez & Sons	General Construction, Specialist - Interior modifications to buildings and homes
Eulogio Cruz Building Contractor	General Construction
Europort (International) Holdings Limited	
Ferrer (UK) Ltd	General Construction
Fill-A-Skip	Plant & Equipment Supplier (Hire)
Fire Security	Security
First Gib Scaffolders Co. Ltd	Specialist - Scaffolding
G&G General Construction	General Construction
Gebomsa (Gibraltar) Concrete Pumping Services Ltd	Specialist: Concrete Pumping

Genco Holdings Ltd	General Construction; Specialist - Electrical Installation; Building Material Supplier
General Lifts Ltd	Specialist - Lift Maintenance, design & installation
Gent Fire Security Limited T/A G4S (Gibraltar)	Specialist - All types of Alarm Systems; Plant & Equipment Supplier (Sales)
Gestion Y Logistica Laborales Ltd	Labour Contractor
Gibral Flora Ltd	Landscaping - Interior/Exterior
Gibraltar Roofing Company Ltd	Specialist - Roofing & Property Maintenance
GibXperience Ltd	Specialist: Tourism & Leisure Consultant
Green Resources Limited	Specialist - Solar Energy
Greenarc	Specialist - Landscaping/Horticultural
H&M Security Services Ltd	Specialist - Security Provider
Hercules Office Solutions Ltd	Specialist - Interior Works , Walls & Ceiling
Hire-U-Shop	Building Material Supplier; Plant & Equipment Supplier (Hire & Sales)
HSE Consulting Limited	General Construction; Specialist - Asbestos/Waste Removal, Demolitions
IEN (Gibraltar) Ltd	Specialist: Electrical, Mechanical and Public Health
Independent Air Conditioning Limited	Specialist - A/C
Ingemetal Limited	Building & construction
Inline Framing Ltd	General Construction; Specialist - CFS & Structural Steel, Drywall construction; Labour Contractor
Interbuild	Building Material Supplier; Plant & Equipment Supplier (Hire & Sales)
Itek Limited	Specialist - windows/doors/bathrooms/kitchens/ floors
J & J General Construction Ltd	General Construction
J B Construction Ltd	General Construction
J Balban Electrical Contractors Ltd	Specialist: Electrical Company
J I Construction Ltd	General Construction
J S Buildings Ltd	General Builders
Jamena Properties Ltd	Specialist: Impermeable Specialists
J-Cool	Specialist - Air Conditioning Installation + Maintenance
Jebel Tarik Security	Security
JFM Shine	Cleaning
Joaquim Pacheco Da Cruz	Specialist: Maintenance
Kaysam General Construction Ltd	General Construction + Specialist: Aluminium
Key Way Construction Ltd	General Construction



Koala Holdings Ltd	General Construction; Specialist - Waterproofing, Restorations, Conservations
LC Groundworks	General Construction; Labour Contractor
Leamington Ltd	Specialist: Carpentry
Leed Transport	Specialist - Demolitions, Roadworks
Liberty General Construction Ltd	General Construction
Light Industrial Activities Ltd	Specialist - Aluminium & Steel Contractors
Lights Construction	General Construction
M F Balloqui & Sons Ltd	Specialist: Upholstery, Carpets and Aluminium
M.J. Lancley Ltd	Specialist - Plastering, Painting, Tiling
MacMillan Ltd	General Construction
Marr & Co. Ltd	Specialist - Water proofing, Fire proofing, Road marking, General Painting; Building Material Supplier
MC & LS Ltd	Specialist: Gardening and Landscaping
McBa	Specialist: Interior and Exterior, Painting & Decorating
McConstruction	Specialist: Roofing and Refurbishment
Mediterranean Cleaning Services	Cleaning
Mediterranean Opportunities Ltd	General Construction
Mesbahi Carpentry	General Construction
Monteverde & Sons Ltd.	Specialist - Demolitions; Building Material Supplier; Plant & Equipment Supplier (Hire)
Multi Service Maintenance Ltd	Specialist: General Building Maintenance
N and S Services Ltd	Specialist: Interior Decorator
Nebig Construction Limited	Building Material Supplier
Noble Construction Ltd	General Construction; Specialist: Confined Spaces
NP General Builders	Specialist: Painting / Decorating and Drylining
Number One Property Maintenance Ltd	General Construction; Specialist
O to O Ltd	Specialist: E-Commerce Sales LED Lighting
Omega Property Maintenance	General Construction
On The Level Ltd	Labour Contractor
One Hundred & One Ltd	Specialist - Kitchens, floors, roofing etc; Building Material Supplier; Plant & Equipment Supplier (Sales)
OSG Blands	Security
Pascoe Holdings Ltd	Specialist - Furniture Fitters
People Skillz Limited	General Construction; Labour Contractor
Platinum Home and Office Property Maintenance Ltd	General Construction; Specialist Contractor: Roofing
Popay Procurement Ltd	Specialist: Building Material Supplier
Portman Limited	Building Material Supplier; Plant & Equipment Supplier (Hire & Sales); Transport Contractor
Premier Scaffolding Services (Gibraltar) Ltd	Specialist: Scaffolding Hire

Prestige Builders	General Construction
Pro Homes Construction Limited	General Construction
Profield Contractors Ltd	General Construction
Property Repairs Ltd	General Construction
Proseal Construction Limited	General Construction
R & J Refrigeration Ltd	Specialist: Refrigeration and Air Conditioning
R F Services Ltd	Building & Construction
Rhino Construction Ltd	General Construction
Ribeiro Decorations and Construction	General Construction
Robvia	Plant & Equipment Supplier (Hire); Transport Contractor
Rock Domestic Appliances	Sales of Commercial & Domestic Appliances
S & K Recruitment	Specialist: Recruitment Agency
Sarah Jane Construction Co Ltd	General Construction
Securitek Ltd	Security
Selina Ltd	Specialist - Fabrication & Welding
Sharrock Shand	General Construction
Silmat Engineering Ltd	Specialist: Plumbing
Site Trading Ltd	General Construction; Labour Contractor
Skybridge Ltd	Specialist: Asbestos Management
Sofycom Ltd	Specialist: Fitting Fire Alarm Equipment
Sotopool (Gibraltar) Ltd	Specialist: Swimming Pool & Architectures / Heritage Works
Sototechnic Limited	Specialist: Air Conditioning, Solar Panels, Water Heaters & Electricity
Southern Lighting Gibraltar	Construction and Data Management Company
Southern Point Roofing Ltd	Specialist - local Roofing
Star Electrical Ltd	Specialist - Motor Rewinds, Electrical
Sunlight Aluminium & PVC Ltd	Specialist: Aluminium PVC and Glass
Swift Eagle Construction & Maintenance Services Ltd	Specialist: Window Installer & Labour Contractor
Tarik Ship Agents & Bunkering Services Ltd	General Construction; Specialist - Marine; Building Material Supplier; Plant & Equipment Supplier (Sales & Hire); Transport Contractor
Techtrolec Limited	Specialist - Electrical & Air Con installation & maintenance; Plant & Equipment Supplier (Sales)
Tecniplac Ltd	Specialist: Interior and Exterior Siping and Plastering
Top Choice Appliances	Specialist: Building Material Supplier
Total Facade Industries (Gib) Ltd	Specialist - Windows, doors, walls, steel products, facades of buildings
Trafalgar Cleaning Services	Cleaning Services
Transformations Ltd	General Construction

Triangle Engineering	Specialist - Structural Steel fabrication & Erection, Roofing, Rain Water Systems, Grit Blasting, Flooring
Trotters Buidling Construction	General Construction
Vanadium Ltd	Specialist: Pladur & Dryvit
Viero (Gibraltar) Ltd	General Construction
W & N Works Company Ltd	General Construction; Specialist - Painting, Plumbing, Electrical
Wastage Product Ltd	Specialist - Sewage Waste & Waste Oil Disposal; Plant & Equipment Supplier (Sales)
Weld-It (Gibraltar) Limited	Specialist - Steelworks (Inc. Repairs)
Western Isles Ltd	Specialist - Welding, Fabricator & Erector of Steel Structures
Wilkie	General Construction
Workforce	General Construction; Labour Contractor
XL Scaffolding Limited	Specialist - Scaffolding
Zambrano (Gibraltar) Ltd	Specialist: Foundations and Structural
Zardoya Otis (Gibraltar) Ltd	Specialist: Lift Company

**Q427/2016**  
**Government workers—**  
**Increase in numbers since 2011**

1870

**Clerk:** Question 427, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** My surprise at the generosity got the better of me, Mr Speaker!

1875 By how many people have the public service, Government-owned companies, authorities and agencies, increased from 31st December 2011 to 31st March 2016?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB.

1880

**Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications & the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):** Mr Speaker, since the answer to Question 253/2015, the increase in the number of employees to March 2016 has been: Civil Service, 147; agencies, authorities and companies, 23.

1885 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, he has given a figure for Civil Service and then he has given a figure for agencies and authorities. Does the second figure include also Government-owned companies?

**Hon. J J Bossano:** Mr Speaker, I am sorry if I did not mention it. It is agencies, authorities and companies, yes.

1890

**DEPUTY CHIEF MINISTER**

**Q428/2016**

**Former King George V Hospital –  
Expressions of interest**

**Clerk:** Question 428, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1895 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can Government disclose details in relation to the expressions of interest received in connection with the former King George V Hospital and whether it has decided to pursue any of them?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

1900 **Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia):** Yes, Mr Speaker, the Government received 13 submissions in respect of the former King George V Hospital and is now in discussion with one of those entities.

1905 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, is the Hon. Minister able to disclose what the project will be or give an inkling as to what the purpose will be for that site?

**Hon. Dr J J Garcia:** Mr Speaker, I would rather not at this stage because obviously the discussions are ongoing and it may well be that this does not materialise and we have to move on to another interested party.

1910 But I do know that they will be going to Planning soon with their proposal so obviously it will become public at that stage.

**Q429/2016**

**The Mount –  
Expressions of interest**

**Clerk:** Question 429, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1915 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government disclose details in relation to the expressions of interest received in connection with The Mount and whether it has decided to pursue any of them?

1920 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

**Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia):** Mr Speaker, the Government received five submissions in respect of The Mount and has yet to determine how to proceed.

**Q430/2016**

**Old Central Police Station at Irish Town –  
Government plans**

1925 **Clerk:** Question 430, the Hon. E J Phillips.

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister provide an update as to what the Government's plans are for the old Central Police Station at Irish Town?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

1930

**Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia):** Mr Speaker, the plans are for the property to be refurbished and converted into a business and cultural centre.

1935

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, may I briefly, he has mentioned business and then cultural. The cultural side, does he intend it to be sort of run by a totally 100% private entities or in conjunction with the existing procedures and agencies that the Ministry for Culture is using nowadays?

1940

**Hon. Dr J J Garcia:** Yes, Mr Speaker, the hon. Member will recall that this went out to expressions of interest as well. There were a number of interested parties. There were six interested parties.

The Government is pursuing discussions with one that is interested in having a combined business area at the top and a cultural area at the bottom which would somehow be connected with the history of the Royal Gibraltar Police.

**Q431/2016  
Gibraltar London Office—  
Plans for Head**

1945

**Clerk:** Question 431, the Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, who is currently heading the Gibraltar London office and is this person expected to remain or be replaced?

1950

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

**Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia):** Yes, Mr Speaker, the London office is currently headed by Mr Albert Poggio who will retire as from today, 30th June 2016.

1955

I think the question has been overtaken by events.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker. I am grateful for that.

1960

Can the Government explain the reason why there appears to have been a change in direction? I recall that we have had exchanges in Parliament about the Gibraltar London Office and it was indicated at some stage during the course of last year that the person who currently heads the Hong Kong Office was the person originally intended to head the London Office as well. Can the Government explain its change in thinking in that regard?

1965

**Hon. Dr J J Garcia:** Mr Speaker, yes. I will be giving a more detailed explanation obviously during the course of the Budget next week.

But briefly, I think the Government felt that Jason Cruz was doing a very good job in Hong Kong and preferred he continue doing the job that was happening and that he was carrying out for the Government over there, and that we would deal with the London office in a different way.

1970 The Chief Minister's special representative, Dominique Searle, was already there in the London office doing some of this work so it seemed logical that he should do the representation work as well as the work of being Director of Gibraltar House.

1975 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, may I take this opportunity, because I have not had an opportunity publicly to congratulate and to thank Albert Poggio on his retirement and also thank him for the work that he has done on behalf of Gibraltar for many, many years.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker –

1980 **Mr Speaker:** Before the Chief Minister rises, since I have not got with me the answers to the questions to the Hon. Mr Paul Balban, I take it that those are not going to be answered as he is unable to be present.

1985 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I still want to deal with what the hon. Gentleman said before we move on.

1990 Mr Speaker, yesterday – no, Tuesday – in the Westminster Parliament was a time of great flux there for all the reasons that we all know, but it was also an opportunity for the Government to reflect on the work that Albert Poggio has done at a reception that was held at the Speaker's apartment there, Mr Speaker – one of the plushest areas of the Palace of Westminster, where we were able to organise a reception which was attended by many, and I gave an indication of that yesterday in my Statement to the House.

1995 Mr Speaker, I had an opportunity then of reflecting on the fantastic work that Albert Poggio has done. I have done so before when I spoke in this House in support of Albert Poggio's Gibraltar Medallion of Honour which this Government moved. It was absolutely appropriate that he should have the Medallion of Honour. It is absolutely appropriate that the Government should now reflect on the work that he has done and thank him, not just for the work that he has done but also for agreeing to continue to work with us in this time that is upon us, because he is going to continue to work with us in terms of some of the political work that he does although he is not going to run Gibraltar House.

2000 Mr Speaker, at a time when Joe Bossano called upon him in 1988, Albert Poggio was there to act on the requests of the then Chief Minister to pick up the opportunities that the London Office might present. As he explained it to us, he did it in the first years for Joe Bossano, he did it in following years for Peter Caruana and he has done it now for almost five years for me, as Chief Minister and in all of those years he has been steadfastly loyal to Gibraltar and he has been one of the most important instruments at our disposal in influencing decision makers in London.

2005 You should hear, Mr Speaker, Lindsay Hoyle talking about how he is referred to as an ambassador by everybody in the United Kingdom, and some of the stories that he regaled us with at the event last week.

2010 Mr Speaker, I think it is appropriate that there should also be an opportunity in Gibraltar to thank Albert Poggio for the work that he has done and the Government, with Albert, is organising such an event so that also not just the people he has worked with in London but the people he has served in Gibraltar have the opportunity of thanking him for the sterling work that he has done in the past, almost 28 years already and no doubt see the work that he is going to continue doing.

2015 It is my pleasure therefore to say that the Government recognises, endorses and thanks Albert for the work that he has done, not least as I said at the time of the Gibraltar Medallion of Honour, the work that he did at the time of the Joint Sovereignty Referendum. He is one of the people who was influential in changing minds in the United Kingdom in Parliament so that we had a strong parliamentary lobby and in working with those who were then in administration and everybody else who put their shoulder to the wheel to stop the joint sovereignty and he deserves huge recognition for that. *(Banging on desks)*

2020

**Procedural**

**Mr Speaker:** I think I should acquaint the new Members as to what the procedural rules are in respect of questions which remain unanswered.

2025 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Well, Mr Speaker, perhaps I can give you an indication of what I intend to do.

I intend to now adjourn, Mr Speaker, to Tuesday at 11.00 a.m. Hon. Members will know that I intended to adjourn until Monday at 10.00 a.m. for the Budget but unfortunately, because of the intervening travel and so much of what is happening at the moment, it will not be possible for me to be ready by Monday.

2030 As I told Members, I do not want to change the date of the Budget because we must progress. This is business as usual to a very great extent, but I am going to need an extra 24 hours to just ensure that I have all the data that the hon. Members will want me to be dealing with in the course of my speech.

2035 I will then suspend Standing Orders to be able to continue with Government Bills and the first Bill will be the Appropriation Bill and in that way, Mr Speaker, unless you want to indicate otherwise, it may be that Mr Balban is able to deal with his questions later on in this sitting. So there will be no need to deal with questions in any other way.

2040 **Mr Speaker:** Rule 16(2) provides that if any question remains unanswered when the Parliament adjourns on the last day of a meeting, and this is where the problem arises, today is not the last day of a meeting. The last day of the meeting will be sometime in the future. Then if it remains unanswered, a written answer shall be sent to the Member who put the question but there is a proviso.

2045 Provided that where the question has been set down for oral answer, the Member who put the question may, within three days, exclusive of Saturday, Sunday or Public Holidays, next after the adjournment of the Parliament require in writing that the question be postponed to a day at the next meeting of the Parliament.

2050 Now I do not know whether it is the intention of the Government that the Hon. Mr Balban should answer those questions at some time in the future.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Yes.

2055 **Mr Speaker:** If it is, then we wait until then.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** That is why I am going to ... We are still in Questions, but I am going to suspend Standing Orders on Tuesday to deal with Government Bills and then come back to Questions and finish Questions.

2060 **Mr Speaker:** Okay, so otherwise it would be for the Hon. Mr Hammond and the Hon. Mr Llamas to decide what they want to do. Do they want a written answer or postpone them to the next meeting? But if the Hon. Mr Balban is going to be here at some time to deal with the questions, it does not arise, okay.

2065 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thanks to the Hon. the Chief Minister. Certainly I would prefer to be able to ask the questions orally and the Chief Minister has suggested that that will be possible, or may be possible, so I am more than happy to accept what he has decided in this case.

2070 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

In that case I now move that the House do now adjourn to Tuesday at 11.00 a.m. I think that will be 5th July at 11.00 a.m. At that stage it is my intention to suspend Standing Orders and move immediately to deal with the Government's Appropriation Bill.

2075 **Mr Speaker:** The House will now adjourn to Tuesday, 5th July at 11.00 in the morning to deal with the Budget session.

*The House adjourned at 7.43 p.m.*