



PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

MORNING SESSION: 10.34 a.m. – 1.00 p.m.

Gibraltar, Friday, 20th October 2017

Contents

Prayer	3
Confirmation of Minutes	3
Questions for Oral Answer	3
Deputy Chief Minister	3
Q577/2017 The Mount – Update and proposed future use	3
Commerce	4
Q578/2017 UK Dormant Bank and Building Society Accounts Act 2008 – Plans for similar legislation for Gibraltar	4
Q579-80/2017 e-Gov – Cost to date; expected live dates for services	5
Infrastructure and Planning	6
Q581/2017 Vehicles emissions testing as part of MOT – Number of vehicles failing	6
Q582/2017 Electric car charging – MidTown car park facilities	7
Q583/2017 Varyl Begg Estate – Loading/unloading bay for residents of Royal Sovereign House	8
Q584/2017 Speed cameras – Repairs following failure	11
Q585/2017 Development and Planning Commission – Submission of Government projects for approval	11
Q586/2017 Private parking spaces – Planning applications	12
Q587/2017 Redibikes – Service user information	13
Q588/2017 Storm drains – Maintenance	13
Q589/2017 Foreign licensed vehicles – Numbers towed for parking in restricted areas	18

Q590/2017 Electric hoverboards and scooters – Update re regulation	21
Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport	22
Q591/2017 Gibraltar Music Festival – Vehicles hired by Government.....	22
Q592/2017 Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority – Vacancies	22
Q593/2017 Sports-related grants – Payments made	23
Q594/2017 Cultural grants – Details of awards.....	25
Q595/2017 Europa Point shooting facilities – Plans for relocation	28
Q596/2017 Victoria Stadium – Government/GFA negotiations re sale.....	29
Q597/2017 Island Games – Building of sporting facilities	29
Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education	29
Q598/2017 Camp Bay – Remedial works.....	29
Q599/2017 Laguna Estate – Problems with apes	30
Q600/2017 New and refurbished schools – Locations and sizes.....	32
Q601/2017 Educational establishments – Number of students registered	32
Q602/2017 Applications moved from discretionary to mandatory awards – Cost of courses	33
Q603/2017 New Schools – Details of courses	35
Q604/2017 Moorish Castle – Plans and progress update.....	43
Q605/2017 Chewing gum and cigarette butt littering – Plans to tackle problem.....	46
Q606/2017 Lighthouse at Europa Point – Plans and estimated cost.....	47
Q607-608/2017 Maintenance of green and planted public areas – Contracts and payments to entities	48
Q609-10/2017 O’Hara’s Battery and Mount Misery Glass Lookout – When open to the public.....	50
Q611/2017 Moorish Castle, Great Siege Tunnels and St Michael’s Cave – Visitor numbers	51
Q612/2017 Class sizes – Projected numbers	52
Q613/2017 Schools – Annual health and safety checks	59
Q614/2017 Two-story portakabins – Modifications	61
<i>The House recessed at 1.00 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 2.30 p.m.</i>	63

The Gibraltar Parliament

The Parliament met at 10.34 a.m.

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: P E Martinez Esq *in attendance*]

PRAYER

Mr Speaker

CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

Clerk: Meeting of Parliament, Friday, 20th October 2017.

Order of Proceedings: (i) Oath of Allegiance; (ii) Confirmation of Minutes – the Minutes of the last meeting of Parliament, which was held on 15th and 20th September and 10th October 2017.

5

Mr Speaker: May I sign the Minutes as correct? (**Members:** Aye.)

Mr Speaker signed the Minutes.

Questions for Oral Answer

10

DEPUTY CHIEF MINISTER

Q577/2017

The Mount –

Update and proposed future use

Clerk: (iii) Communications from the Chair; (iv) Petitions; (v) Announcements; (vi) Papers to be laid; (vii) Reports of Committees. (viii) Answers to Oral Questions.

We commence with Question 577/2017. The Hon. L F Llamas.

15

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide an update on the Mount and its proposed future use?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

20

Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia): Yes, Mr Speaker. The Government is currently in discussions with an interested party.

Hon. L F Llamas: Can the Hon. Minister explain or expand a little bit further as to what the proposed usage the interested party would be proposing to develop the area?

25

Hon. Deputy Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, the Government is not able to do that at the moment because obviously the discussions are ongoing, but the information will be made available to the public as soon as there is something concrete to make public. We do not have enough detail to be able to do that yet.

COMMERCE

Q578/2017

UK Dormant Bank and Building Society Accounts Act 2008 – Plans for similar legislation for Gibraltar

30 **Clerk:** Question 578. The Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, does the Government intend to introduce legislation along the lines of the UK Dormant Bank and Building Society Accounts Act 2008?

35 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Commerce.

Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola): Mr Speaker, the Government has no present intention to introduce such legislation.

40 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, is the Minister aware that the lack of legislation in this area has created a problem for a number of banks, particularly in a sector that is going through some reorganisation with some banks taking over other banks – there have been banks that have also exited Gibraltar – and during the course of that activity it has become clear that there are bank accounts, going back sometimes decades, where they have not been able to trace the holder of
45 the bank account and therefore those banks are then left with a situation where they need to go to court in order to get directions from the court and sometimes, for example, setting up trusts?

Let me explain to the hon. Member – if I may, with the indulgence of the Chair – by way of a practical example the difficulty in this area. I have recently been involved in a case – and it has been made public, which is why I refer to it – where there are three bank accounts going back to
50 the 1980s. The sums are relatively small: in total £115,000. The bank has been forced to go to court in order to obtain directions to set up a trust specifically in relation to these three bank accounts. You may say that banks make a lot of money, therefore what is the problem, but actually the problem is this: that under the UK Act, that money would have been, for example, donated to charity, so you could have had – *(Interjection)* Yes, after a process the money could
55 be donated to – *(Interjection)* Absolutely, after a process the money is donated to charity if you cannot locate these individuals through advertising etc. All that has been done by the bank in my example. The legal costs have been upwards of £60,000. There is a clause – *(Interjection)* Well, before my hon. Friend Mr Clinton says ‘Sixty thousand pounds!’ I have been involved in another case where a counsel has been charging £250,000 a week. The problem is that these types of
60 orders include a clause, for example, where there is then clawback in favour of the bank if these individuals are not traced. So, effectively, the bank comes out not a loser, it comes out the winner at the end of the day, and I just think that in this kind of situation it would have been painless and it would have been far more efficient for the bank just simply to go through the process that it has and then to have donated the money to charity, rather than ending up in the
65 pockets of lawyers and then, through a clawback, back in the pockets of the bank.

Therefore, does the Hon. Minister agree with me that there are distinct advantages in having legislation of this kind here in Gibraltar and that perhaps the Government ought to consider it?

70 Can I also say that I have drafted already a draft Act based on the UK and it is my intention to send a copy to the hon. Gentleman and then perhaps he can consider that legislation, because it is really painless from the Government's point of view – it is legislation that will have a positive effect with very little downside indeed.

Hon. A J Isola: Mr Speaker, the position, as far as the Government is concerned, is that we are not aware of a problem. It has not been raised with Government by either the Gibraltar Bankers Association or indeed the Finance Centre Council. It is an issue that has never arisen before; this is the first time I hear it is a problem for us in Gibraltar.

75 I think the difficulty with taking the process that the hon. Member refers to is that it is very easy to pass legislation, but then it needs to be administered, managed and looked after. The way that the system works in the United Kingdom is that there is a not-for-profit organisation which is in charge of receiving the money, managing the money, investing the money and dealing with claims. The company is actually called Reclaim Fund Ltd – in 2014. When you have got the amounts of money that you are talking about in the United Kingdom, you may have sufficient critical mass of cash to be able to make that cost effective, but in Gibraltar, with the amounts that the hon. Member has conceded are particularly small, the cost of setting up this machinery to manage these funds could put that beyond the risk of reasonableness and common sense.

80 And so the question is not that we do not want to do it; the question is (1) that we have not had any approach from anyone in the private sector to do it, and (2) from our limited understanding – and it is limited – the cost of setting this machinery up would way exceed the benefit that it would deliver.

90 I think these systems make sense but the charitable donation, which is a little bit of a carrot, comes at the end of the rump, and even after the money has been taken into this Reclaim Fund Ltd and held, it is still able to be clawed back should a family relative or somebody with the legal right to that money make a claim at some stage in the future. So it is not just as simple as receiving money – not heard from them for 20 years, give it to the charitable fund and it is spent. There is a clawback from the individual who may be related to the very original account holder that they have not heard from for 20 years. So it is actually quite complicated and the extent of the work involved in doing this, in our view, at this stage, is that it is not worth pursuing at this stage, but I would be very happy to hear from the hon. Member and explore it further.

Q579-80/2017

e-Gov –

Cost to date; expected live dates for services

Clerk: Question 579. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a schedule of money spent on e-Gov in each financial year to date since December 2011?

105

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Commerce.

Minister for Commerce: (Hon. A J Isola): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 580/2017.

110

Clerk: Question 580. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a road map of which e-Gov services are expected to be live and when?

115

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Commerce.

Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola): Mr Speaker, we are unable to accurately provide the schedule requested within the limited time because what constitutes e-Government is extremely wide and could comprise software, hardware, websites, portals, design work, ITLD time and technical consultants. For example, servers and hardware are essential elements of e-Gov but they have not been purchased specifically for e-Gov, and the same applies to each of the other ones that I have detailed above.

120
125 With regard to Question 580/2017, our plans for e-Government are significant and exciting. They build on the successful introduction of the e-ID card in our first term, perhaps one of the most ambitious projects to hit the public service in a generation. I could spend a significant amount of time just going over the different facets of the project; however, in general terms we are focusing our efforts in two main areas: e-Administration and e-Services.

130 Mr Speaker, e-Administration is about investing in technology and innovation to create better and more efficient systems at the workplace, automating core business processes and repetitive tasks that can streamline procedures, minimise errors and facilitate better use of existing resources. We are developing the following systems, which are all at different stages of implementation: Source to Contract, or e-Procurement, which is at an advanced stage and we hope to complete by December of this year; Purchase to Pay, e-Invoicing, which we hope to test and roll out by March 2018; Enterprise Resource Planning, which is integrated finance, payroll and HR systems, which we will begin to implement in January 2018 and complete the entire rollout within 18 months; the central database – work has already commenced on the architecture and design but we do not yet have an estimated implementation date, but certainly within the next 12 months.

135
140 e-Services are about bringing Government services online. Government proposes to develop a new concept of e-Services, which will make public information and Government services available anytime, anywhere to citizens, businesses and officials alike. This is still work in progress. I can say that we are working on two systems, which again are at different stages of implementation: the e-Government portal and customer relationship management systems.

145 Mr Speaker, where I have given dates, at this stage these are best estimates on the information available today, but they may move – hopefully forward.

INFRASTRUCTURE AND PLANNING

Q581/2017

Vehicles emissions testing as part of MOT – Number of vehicles failing

Clerk: Question 581. The Hon. T N Hammond.

150

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, is vehicle emissions testing conducted as part of the MOT; and, if so, how many vehicles have failed this part of the test since 1st January 2012?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Infrastructure and Planning.

155 **Minister for Infrastructure and Planning (Hon. P J Balban):** Indeed, Mr Speaker, vehicle emissions testing is conducted as part of an MOT. This is a legal requirement.

DVLD has never kept statistics of specific vehicle failures as a result of mechanical faults or any other reason for failure. It would be a very laborious task to keep these sort of statistics, requiring extra human resources.

160

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, I have recently put two vehicles through the MOT testing requirements and neither was tested for its emissions, so I am slightly baffled to understand that it is a legal requirement to undertake such testing – unless I was very fortunate, or unfortunate, to be the only person not to receive testing. So could the Minister just clarify that every vehicle, regardless of its age, once it is subject to MOT testing must be emissions tested?

165

Hon. P J Balban: Mr Speaker, that is in fact correct and if the hon. Gentleman's vehicle was not tested ... I would need to check that, but it is a legal requirement and all vehicles should be tested for emissions.

Q582/2017
Electric car charging –
MidTown car park facilities

170 **Clerk:** Question 582. The Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, can the Government say whether there have been any unserviceabilities or failures of the electric car charging facilities at MidTown car park; and, if so, how often and for how long?

175

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Infrastructure and Planning.

Minister for Infrastructure and Planning (Hon. P J Balban): Mr Speaker, the electric charging points at MidTown car park have not been commissioned yet. No interest has yet been shown. As part of the requirements of the STTPP and the environment, Government is, however, currently planning on commissioning a few parking bays for this purpose in the very near future.

180

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, I am somewhat taken by surprise by the answer. My understanding was that the provision of such bays was to incentivise people to buy electric vehicles, in which case, if the facility is not available there is no incentive to buy, or there is less incentive, to buy the electric vehicle. My understanding was the commissioning of this would take place with the opening of the car park, which has now been open for well over a year and yet there is still no facility.

185

When does Government plan to introduce that facility and will an announcement be made accordingly?

190

Hon. P J Balban: Mr Speaker, as far as I am being told, there has been no interest shown. It would seem an awful shame to have – I do not know whether it is 15 or 20 spaces perhaps which are dedicated for this purpose ... to have them empty and not used, just waiting for an electric vehicle to turn up. Therefore, this is the reason why they have not been commissioned.

195

As part of the original reply, we are now going to be commissioning just a few for this purpose, again based on the fact that our policy is that we want to incentivise people to buy

200 them. People are not not buying electric vehicles because there is nowhere to charge them; that
is not the case. MidTown has nothing to do with that – it is not the reason for it. As part of our
policy – our environmental policy and our STTPP policy – we will not only be commissioning
some of the electric points within the car park, a limited number as I have mentioned, but we
are also looking at places on the public highway itself to try to encourage this. But again, a very
limited amount of parking spaces because we do not want to get rid of parking spaces for the
regular user. That is the intention and hence that is why we will be commissioning these quite
205 soon. In fact, I am working together with the Ministry for the Environment for this purpose.

The actual machines in MidTown are ready to go, the system is in place and if anyone were to
come in and request the facilities then this would have been accelerated and would have been
done earlier. But I can guarantee the hon. Gentleman that that is the reason why and they will
be rolled out very, very, shortly.

210 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, with your indulgence – it arises out of the answer the hon.
Gentleman has provided.

I understand the dilemma that the Government has, that if you are going to have 16 spaces
at MidTown dedicated to electric cars, it is 16 spaces less for people to park.

215 I have noticed in recent times that the top two floors in MidTown car park have not been
open for public parking for some reason. Has that been a recent policy change? I tell you why I
am asking the question: in fact, I park at MidTown car park, in the public car parking spaces, and
in the mornings, right up to quarter past nine, normally you can find parking at the MidTown car
park. I think it is a wonderful resource, I have to say that to the Minister, but over recent times
220 there has been a difficulty, over the last week or so, with the public car parking spaces there,
and I did notice for the very first time that on the last two floors there is a makeshift sign that
basically says that those are private car parking spaces. They are not marked in red, as the ones
below, and I just wondered whether there had been a change in policy in relation to those two
floors; and if it has changed, when did it change?

225 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, the very top two floors are monthly rentals and those are as a
result of what used to be there before 2011 – the cars actually parked in that area when it was
the old makeshift multi-storey car park. When the construction began, those cars were then
moved on into the ICC and then brought back. So the top two floors of that parking area are for
monthly rentals and have been like that for quite a while now.

230 The makeshift sign, if there is a sign there, could be because if cars have mistakenly made
their way up there without reading the signage and have parked in someone's private space
which is a rental space, and then you come along and want to use it and you are not able
because there is another vehicle in your space ... That is probably the reason why there is a
235 makeshift sign, but the signage is extremely clear, or should be extremely clear, and these signs
are to make things even clearer in that respect.

Q583/2017

Varyl Begg Estate –

Loading/unloading bay for residents of Royal Sovereign House

Clerk: Question 583. The Hon. T N Hammond.

240 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, on behalf of a constituent, can the Minister say if he would
consider the placement of a loading and unloading bay in Varyl Begg Estate adjacent to Royal
Sovereign House where there are currently red lines painted, in order to allow residents, many
of whom are pensioners, greater facility in getting their shopping to their homes?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Infrastructure and Planning.

245 **Minister for Infrastructure and Planning (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, the existing red lines were painted following the completion of the resurfacing works at Varyl Begg Estate as a result of representations received from the tenants' association on behalf of garage owners who were then encountering problems entering and exiting their private garages.

250 I am advised that more recently the tenants of the estate approached the Traffic Commission directly and, as a result, a site meeting was held, including the Chairman of the Traffic Commission and the Highways Engineer, to consider how loading and unloading bays could be demarcated in the area of Royal Sovereign House to serve the needs of residents.

255 All requests of this nature are assessed by the Traffic Commission, who then advise on the viability of any proposal. The Traffic Commission have now identified several different locations where they propose loading and unloading bays could be demarcated in the future.

The Government would not have any objections to the provision of loading and unloading bays in this area, provided that the advice received is that this would be possible and not have a negative impact on garage owners – but the decision is one for the Traffic Commission.

260

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, I thank the Minister for his answer.

To put this in context, I was actually invited to attend that particular site meeting and that took place nearly 18 months ago now, so I think the Minister will appreciate the frustration of some of the tenants who are waiting and waiting and are being, frankly, put off by the Traffic Commission.

265 I did write to the Traffic Commission over a year ago, encouraging them also in the same direction. The response I got was that, because the letter had come from me on parliamentary letterhead, the matter was now political and I should refer it to the Minister, which is why I have raised this question.

270 I am pleased to hear that there appears to be progress, but could I ask whether the Minister could look into the matter and just ensure that it is dealt with in as expeditious a fashion as is possible from this point forward, bearing in mind the length of time that some of these residents have waited for an outcome to this particular issue?

275 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, although it affects, obviously, the people who live there are negative, it is quite a minor issue on which the hon. Gentleman could have picked up the phone and given me a call, and we could have perhaps discussed where it was or whatever and then I would have been able to perhaps give it a push in the right direction.

280 But having said that, it is not Government's intention to make life difficult for anyone, as you obviously can understand, and the reason why these red lines were placed there originally was because cars indiscriminately, unfortunately, parked opposite the garages, and while they are not being used there is absolutely no problem whatsoever but if you are unlucky and the moment you want to take your car out you cannot and you have to do a five-point turn to get out ... It is always that 'a *momentito*' in terms of approach – 'I'm just going to be a few minutes and take my food home' – but that can affect someone, and in fact we had a complaint from someone who had a member of the family who was very unwell, constantly unwell, a permanent issue that the person had, and they could not get out of the garage to get the person to their medical appointment, and that created trouble. That is why the red lines were placed there, to avoid this sort of thing from happening in the future.

290 Obviously, I can understand now that the other half of the coin says, 'Well, how can I take my food home?' and that is a thing that we live with on a daily basis. We do want to get our cars as close to the place we are going as soon as possible and as quickly as possible – that is the convenience part of things – but we are looking ... The reason why it has taken so

295 long is because the car parking spaces there are allocated to individuals and we obviously
need to make sure that they do not affect ... there is always moving from one parking space
and LPS manages that for us.

But as I said, it has got to be a happy balance – the bays that we find could well be too far
away for this purpose. So it is not as simple as we get the bays closest to this property,
300 because there are other blocks which will also want the same thing. So it is a bit complicated
in that respect as there are two sides of the coin, each requiring different things, and that is
why I think we have been stuck on this for a short while.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, again I thank the Minister for his comprehensive
305 answer and I fully understand why the lines were painted originally; the irony is that now
garage users are actually taking advantage of the situation – I have seen it for myself – and
parking vehicles directly outside their garages, occupying an extra space, which defeats the
object and actually is unfortunate and obviously creates further frustration for those who
simply wish to have an unloading bay.

310 That is what we are speaking about. We are not talking about someone who has ... People
should be fined if they park in the unloading bay and choose it as an overnight parking, but
this is very much just for people to take their shopping or whatever other items out of their
vehicle somewhere closer to their house, as I say, bearing in mind many are pensioners who
may have parking spaces 100 metres or 200 metres away in the estate, and obviously that is
315 undesirable. At present, the red line means no waiting, which means if you stop at all, as the
Minister knows, it is a £100 fine, which is quite concerning for those residents.

So, if the Minister can assure me, so that I can go and assure the people who have
approached me, that the matter is being looked into as a matter of urgency, I will take that
back to those residents and provide that assurance.

320 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, the only thing I can assure the hon. Gentleman about is that
there is a procedure, there is a way of doing things and it is via the Traffic Commission, which is
the authority which will make the decisions, so obviously that is in course.

To touch upon a few of the things that you have mentioned, the red line is a red line for
325 everyone, regardless of whether the red line is outside your garage and you are the owner of the
garage and you wish to park outside your garage to obstruct your own garage. It is still an
offence. Red lines mean red lines for all. Obviously it is something that is quite naughty, to park
your car outside your garage, because you are causing an obstruction, even if it is to your own
property. If the authorities come round at that moment in time they will be dealt with, but
330 obviously we cannot have people everywhere at the same time and now, obviously, many
people, the majority of people would get away with it – let's be frank.

A £100 fine: yes, the Traffic Commission decided that that should be the offence because that
would disincentivise people from doing not to do that, because if you say it is just a regular FPN,
and because you are caught so infrequently – because obviously you would have to have a
335 policeman there all the time – then it is well worth the gamble, whereas if it is £100 and you are
caught once, you will say, 'Well, I'm never going to do that again.' So that is the reason for that.

Just to complete the circle, there is a Commission that deals with these things and obviously I
will see where that is, but they will come back to me in a timely manner, I will ensure, and we
will see what the way forward is.

340

Q584/2017
Speed cameras –
Repairs following failure

Clerk: Question 584. The Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, can the Government say whether there have been any unserviceabilities or failures of the speed cameras since their introduction; if so, how many and how long was it before repairs were effected, if those repairs were covered by warranty and, if not, what was the cost of the repairs?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Infrastructure and Planning.

Minister for Infrastructure and Planning (Hon. P J Balban): Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is provided in the schedule which I will now hand over.

Mr Speaker: I will give the hon. questioner an opportunity to look at the schedule and you can ask supplementaries later on, if you so wish.

ANSWER TO QUESTION NO 584/2017

Speed Cameras Down Time Log

Camera Serial No.	Date of purchase	Out of service Date	Reason Transcript as per reporting officer	Back in service Date	Total days out of service	Cost of repair	Warranty Y/N
		08-May-17	Went live with cameras. Started issuing fines				
1174	06-Mar-15	09-May-17	Camera constantly beeping and we cannot connect to it. Sent to the UK for repairs	02-Jun-17	24	£0	N
1174 / 1173	03-Jun-17	03-Jun-17	Camera 1174 was replaced by camera 1173 at no cost to us.				
1173	06-Mar-15	03-Jun-17	Camera seems to have problem with motherboard. We received a new replacement camera under the terms of the guarantee	13-Jun-17	10	£0	Y
1179	06-Mar-15	11-Jul-17	Camera by Europa Advance Road had loose cable	13-Jul-17	2	£0	N
1173	06-Mar-15	08-Sep-17	Camera sent to the UK for repair. Problem with the Security System	26-Sep-17	18	£0	Y
1223	01-Aug-17	08-Sep-17	Motherboard needed changing. Camera sent to UK for repair	06-Oct-17	28	£0	Y

Q585/2017
Development and Planning Commission –
Submission of Government projects for approval

Clerk: Question 585. The Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: When will the Government submit Government projects to approval of the DPC rather than for advice and guidance?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Infrastructure and Planning.

365 **Minister for Infrastructure and Planning (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, contrary to the advice received from Members opposite, who repeatedly urged us not to even submit Government projects for guidance and advice, the new Town Planning Act which is currently being drafted requires Government to obtain approval from the DPC and not just recommendations.

370 **Hon. D A Feetham:** That is certainly welcome news from this side, ignoring the barbed comment that he made to start his answer, but can he give some kind of a timeline as to when that legislation will be completed and will be published?

Hon. P J Balban: Mr Speaker, without actually wishing to pin myself down to a specific date – clearly, for obvious reasons – the Act is at the final stages. I can comfortably say it is virtually finished, but we are awaiting a response from the Government Law Officers on one aspect and there are also a few minor amendments that will need to be made before it is finally ready.

375 At the same time, they are also at the final stages of the draft and the regulations that will accompany this Act. So again, without wishing to say dates, I am told that ... again the word 'soon' is the word that we debate about, but it will be soon.

Q586/2017
Private parking spaces –
Planning applications

Clerk: Question 586. The Hon. L F Llamas.

380 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, since December 2011, can the Government provide a schedule with details of how many planning applications to build private parking spaces or garages on private properties have been approved or refused, including (a) the area in Gibraltar, (b) the reason for approval or refusal and (c) the number of public parking lost?

385 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Infrastructure and Planning.

Minister for Infrastructure and Planning (Hon. P J Balban): Mr Speaker, this is publicly available information.

390 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, unfortunately, when you go on the Government portal, or even sometimes in the minutes, you do not actually get to see what parts of the application have been approved and which parts have not. That is the only reason why I have brought this question to the House, because there are aspects of the application which get refused but do not get recorded.

395 Is there any way that the Government could look into this and perhaps email in the future with a potential answer to this question?

400 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, the answer provided is what is available: it is actually publicly available information. What is there is what is available for us to be able ... When the hon. Member asked the question I asked my staff to look for a reply and the reply is that. What is available publicly is the only information that we have to be able to give to the hon. Member.

Q587/2017
Redibikes –
Service user information

Clerk: Question 587. The Hon. L F Llamas.

405 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, since the Redibikes came into operation, can the Government provide a daily schedule with a number of users who use the service?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Infrastructure and Planning.

410 **Minister for Infrastructure and Planning (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is detailed in the schedule that I will now hand over.

Mr Speaker: Let's move on to the next question and come back to the previous one, if necessary.

Answer to Question 587/2017											
May		June		July		August		September		October	
Day	Rentals	Day	Rentals	Day	Rentals	Day	Rentals	Day	Rentals	Day	Rentals
1		1	11	1	6	1	4	1	2	1	11
2		2	5	2	5	2	3	2	2	2	4
3		3	7	3	5	3	0	3	5	3	1
4		4	4	4	2	4	4	4	4	4	1
5		5	12	5	10	5	6	5	4	5	2
6		6	4	6	6	6	16	6	1	6	3
7		7	0	7	6	7	9	7	0	7	9
8		8	10	8	7	8	7	8	4	8	7
9		9	7	9	1	9	15	9	2	9	6
10		10	4	10	2	10	4	10	2	10	3
11		11	5	11	0	11	5	11	3	11	2
12		12	9	12	2	12	4	12	1	12	2
13		13	2	13	16	13	55	13	0	13	2
14		14	7	14	8	14	54	14	2	14	6
15		15	5	15	3	15	0	15	2	15	
16	6	16	1	16	11	16	28	16	0	16	
17	6	17	4	17	1	17	93	17	2	17	
18	10	18	1	18	6	18	15	18	2	18	
19	6	19	2	19	2	19	7	19	1	19	
20	4	20	3	20	4	20	3	20	2	20	
21	8	21	2	21	1	21	17	21	0	21	
22	3	22	1	22	4	22	4	22	0	22	
23	5	23	3	23	9	23	3	23	5	23	
24	4	24	3	24	5	24	6	24	7	24	
25	8	25	9	25	0	25	2	25	8	25	
26	6	26	5	26	6	26	1	26	7	26	
27	10	27	1	27	7	27	10	27	0	27	
28	13	28	1	28	2	28	8	28	1	28	
29	16	29	7	29	4	29	2	29	1	29	
30	2	30	5	30	8	30	9	30	7	30	
31	1			31	5	31	13			31	

Q588/2017
Storm drains –
Maintenance

415 **Clerk:** Question 588. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, is the Government carrying out year-round maintenance on storm drains? If not, when was the last time they were surveyed and resolved their conditions?

420 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Infrastructure and Planning.

Minister for Infrastructure and Planning (Hon. P J Balban): Mr Speaker, yes, sir.

425 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, I am sure the Hon. Minister is aware – and I did file this question before we had the little downpour the other day – within 20 minutes many of the areas in Gibraltar started to flood and I am sure if you do take a walk around you will see that many of the storm drains are actually clogged up with sand, dirt, cigarette butts and what have you. Clearly, many of them do not seem to have had any maintenance in quite some time – years, or God knows how long.

430 Has an actual survey been carried out throughout the last year, or at least in the dry months, in order to prepare for the upcoming wet winter months?

435 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, this is done by routine. There is year-round maintenance of storm drains, the sewers and the culverts within the public highway. This also includes the cleansing of road gullies. Regular inspections do take place and that is carried out by the infrastructural section of Technical Services department. So, regardless of whether there is ... When it rains in Gibraltar it tends to rain quite aggressively for a short period of time, and even with the best of drainage there will always inevitably be some accumulation of water, especially at the beginning of the year. But rest assured that there is a very detailed maintenance scheme and the works that are carried out are extremely extensive. Whether a particular drain has had extra leaf fall, that could happen, but the maintenance is there and it is carried out on a routine basis.

445 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** I do not know whether it is helpful for me to rise and just assist in this respect, and I do not know whether the hon. Gentleman watched the scenes on the Spanish news bulletins in the past days – and I find the Spanish news bulletins these days compulsive viewing, not necessarily because of the meteorological occurrences – but he might have seen that in Jerez and in Malaga cars were floating in the streets. We live in a part of the world where it is such a privilege to live, but we suffer the same meteorological events as those towns around us, and although on particularly bad days the Rock acts like a storm culvert itself – and there is an area at the entrance to Main Street that no Government in our history has ever been able to deal with, other than perhaps thinking about the conversion to a swimming pool between the months of November to February – we have never seen cars floating in the streets in Gibraltar.

455 Our systems, which are dealt with by the Technical Services department, as the Hon. Minister has said, ensure that we have the ability to get as much storm water out into the sea as possible so that those events do not occur. So, where we have perhaps a couple of inches of annoying water above the soles of our shoes when the water is not moving as quickly as perhaps we would all like it to, in the towns next door vehicles made of metal are floating because that level of water is falling. So I do think we need to keep in perspective and understand the excellent job that is being done by the Technical Services department to ensure that Gibraltar has the benefit that it has in such meteorological events.

465 **Hon L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful for that answer and I do understand, obviously, that we do deal relatively well in terms of flooding. I am just saying that there could be more to mitigate, because it is not an isolated storm drain in the south district or the north district – there seem to be many which would possibly prevent ... and resource us better, so that we would never have to see those sorts of scenes that we see on Spanish TV.

470 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I do not agree, because we have never seen those scenes in Gibraltar. That demonstrates that the work that is being done is the right work.

A few cigarette butts and a few leaves do not mean that a drain is blocked. The first rains sometimes just completely deal with that. A packet of crisps on the street is an annoyance, it is litter and it should not be there, but it does not make for a blocked drain. I think this is what is important, that we put into perspective what it is that the issues in Gibraltar may be, we understand where we may be able to improve but we do not denigrate that which is being done, which ensures that we do not have problems of that sort. If our storm water drains were blocked, as the hon. Member is suggesting that they are, we would have those scenes, and not of a few centimetres of water sometimes at worst – we would have cars floating on our streets, which is something we do not have in Gibraltar. We do not have rubbish bins floating on our streets.

When that has happened and we have had a little bit of a few inches of rain accumulate, it has been for a short period as the water gets out through the storm drains, not because the storm drains are blocked – because the storm drains, which are relatively impossible to widen because they are laid when infrastructure is laid and roads are built, and going into the Upper Town in particular and under Queensway would be ... nothing is, in engineering terms, impossible, but almost impossible ... just cannot take that amount of water in a moment. They can take it sometimes in five minutes, they can take it in 50 minutes. The hon. Gentleman will know that Queensway, Saluting Battery, even the area in front of the old ABN AMRO premises at the entrance to Main Street, if it is flooded it is flooded for minutes, not hours, as the water goes. That demonstrates that it is not a question of a blocked drain; it is more a question of capacity and the impossibility of creating further capacity without major civil engineering works that would make it very difficult to act without seriously disrupting the life of the city. You have to put that in the balance of the context of a few minutes, on a very, very, very, rainy day, of water moving slightly more slowly than we might all like to see it moving.

But it is not blocked drains; blocked drains would not be undone. You could have an instance of a blocked drain – it is impossible to say that that is not the case – despite the maintenance schedule that we ensure is proceeded with every year.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, may I? Indeed, Mr Speaker, I do not know whether the Hon. the Chief Minister travelled, for example, just to the neighbouring town of La Línea on Wednesday and on the stretch of road towards *El Higuero* the entire area was in fact flooded because of the rain water that had actually fallen on that particular day. So, by way of supporting what the hon. Gentleman has said, by parity of reasoning, if our drains had been in exactly the same state as theirs, we would have had that kind of water in our streets and it did not happen here in Gibraltar.

Hon. Chief Minister: And if I may say so – I am grateful for the hon. Gentleman's route indication towards that particular area of the flat of La Línea – Gibraltar benefits from this beautiful, magnificent, monolithic Rock that we all call home, which in effect channels all water that falls on a particularly rainy day on the western side towards the flat. The area of *El Higuero* is completely flat and most of the water that falls is just falling straight on the flat.

We deal with the water that falls on the flat – namely Main Street, Queensway, Saluting Battery etc. – and with all of the water that falls on the Rock, which comes like a culvert down to the flat as well, and we deal with it much more efficiently than hon. Members have rightly indicated is the case in the context of the neighbouring town. And not just the neighbouring town, which hon. Members will have seen recently describe itself as long suffering and lacking in investment, but even in capitals like Malaga and Jerez. In Jerez they had to cancel operations in the hospital because their hospital was completely flooded, and they had to cancel all classes in schools *for the rest of this week*.

It is right that we want to ensure that our nation operates at the best that it can, but it is also right that we put in context a few centimetres of water. We had an incident last year where St Mary's was flooded for a day – we had never seen so much rainfall in 24 hours – but within

24 hours we were operating the school again. That was an engineering error that appeared to
525 have been made some time ago, literally a decade or so ago, when a new development was put
up and a culvert was sent the wrong way, and on this particular occasion when it rained so much
we found out where the culvert was pointing: straight at the school.

So we have to understand and put in context how we are dealing with these things. We are
dealing with them very well. Where there is a problem it is an ad hoc problem. It must be dealt
530 with as soon as possible, but we must not allow ourselves to fall into the trap of thinking that we
have a major issue here.

Hon. L F Llamas: If the Government were to simply have a look, for example, at the storm
drains at the bottom of Bell Lane and Bedlam Court, obviously Main Street is pitched towards
535 the north and if those drains which are currently clogged – and I believe they still are, and they
are full with sand and dirt so it is not just that you see it is moist, you can see it is really, really
dry and it will take a little bit of manpower to unblock them ... If that water is coming down from
Castle Steps, which is notorious for its rainfall and accumulation of water, and comes down
through Bell Lane, there is nothing there to collect it because they are blocked and it goes on to
540 Main Street and Bedlam Court, which cannot cope either, and then all that water does end up at
the north end of Main Street, for example, and instead of having five inches of rain whilst the
drains that are at the northern end of Main Street try to manage the water that is pouring in,
you have 10 inches because there is so much water coming in from different directions and
there is nothing to mitigate along the way. That is simply my question for the Government

545
Hon. Chief Minister: Well, Mr Speaker, I think his question has been asked and answered by
an act of God, because clearly his questions must have been filed before the rain, in good faith
no doubt, but his supplementary must have been thought up before the rains as well because
we had the rains this week. The water came down from what is known as *El Caño Real* – in other
550 words, it was itself the great culvert from the Rock down to that point at the bottom of Bedlam
Court etc. and Bell Lane, and there was not an accumulation of inches of water, there was not,
and there was – (*Interjection by Hon. L F Llamas*) But, Mr Speaker, this is what I am saying to
him. Those same 20 minutes was the same meteorological event: it passed here and went
eastwards, caused the flooding and the closure of the hospital in Jerez.

555 What looks to him, or whoever it is that he is working with these days, like a little bit of dry
sand and a few fags – not an attractive sight; I know there are those who photograph aircraft
and photograph trains, but I did not realise the hon. Gentleman had a fetish for the inside of
drains – it is not an attractive sight, but one minute of rain clears it and if that were not the case
we would have had a blockage, whether it was one minute, five minutes or 20 minutes of rain.

560 So I put it to him that he should go back and look at the drain which he has asked the
supplementary about and he might be satisfied to see that those 20 minutes of rain dealt with it.
Otherwise, Mr Speaker, I will be left with thinking that his next slogan should be *Aquí no se curra*
because he might like to sit for a while and think of questions but he does not follow up with the
hard work of making sure that what he is asking about is right.

565
Mr Speaker: We move on, then, from the rain in Spain, or in Gibraltar, to the next question.

Hon. T N Hammond: Thank you Mr Speaker, can I just go back to Question 587 on Redibikes?
Just looking at the figures, clearly August was a good month. The rest of the months around
570 August seem to be fairly steady. Did Government have in mind, when they introduced the
Redibikes, what would constitute a successful ... or did they have in mind a target for the
number of users on a given month? The figures are quite random, August definitely being a good
month, which I presume is tourists but obviously I guess there is no way of knowing that. But
around those months there does not seem to be any kind of rise in the use of the bikes.

575

Hon. Chief Minister: If you are so keen, we would be surprised not to see you on the bikes.

Hon. P J Balban: Mr Speaker, in my mind any usage whatsoever is one trip less that is carried out by any other means – unless it is walking, clearly – and so we did not have any idea what we would expect to see in terms of numbers but clearly, we are aiming, our aim, and, through the work that we are carrying out, our intention is to promote this means of transport and we are hopefully expecting more usage.

We have, as the hon. Member is aware, clearly, recently reviewed the prices of Redibikes in case it was that perhaps people needed that little bit of incentivisation in terms of lowering the cost of usage, so what used to be a £2 daily fee has now become a £1 daily fee. But I think more than anything it is a question of really encouraging the mode of transport and trying to encourage people to use it. That is what we need to do. I do not think this is to do with price in that respect because I do not think the reduction in price has had that effect on usage. As you rightly say, the month of August is a good month and we can assume that there are more people who come across the border or on a cruise ship etc., tourists, who may be using the bicycles more.

But I am very happy with the progress so far. Clearly I would like it to be much, much more – that is what it is all about – and our efforts now will be to try to encourage the use of bicycles. In fact, tomorrow Redibikes will be used for the Peddling for a Cure event at Casemates. As well as in support of the charity, they are also there so people can use them, because it is imperative that people start using more sustainable modes of transport.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, I certainly agree with the Minister that people should be encouraged to use other means of transport, but it does concern me that the Redibike scheme has been in place for coming up to six months now and there does not seem to be an upward trend in terms of the local usage.

The figures for July are probably slightly better than the figures for September, in fact, which seem to amount to about 70 uses of bikes for the entire month. That is just two bikes a day and, considering the number of bikes available, that would seem to me to be a very small uptake from the community. Clearly that to some extent takes into account the reduction in price, though as the Minister said, the reduction in price has not impacted.

It slightly goes back also to the question that was asked earlier reference the charging points – Government is indicating it has a policy but there is no demand. Are we in a position where we have again a policy but people are not being incentivised in a way that makes it a meaningful policy, and what does Government plan to do to further incentivise people, hopefully, to take to this mode of transport?

Hon. P J Balban: Mr Speaker, I disagree with the hon. Gentleman in terms that we are only looking at a few months' worth of statistics. I think we need to look at the much wider picture. If you look at the statistics for the month of May and June it went up in June. It was about 108 rentals in May and it went up to 140 in June, went up to 154 in July and 407 in August. So there has been an increase in usage. Now the first month has shown a decrease but if you look at this month, which is October, it seems to be on the up again because we have got statistics about midway and it is close to already reaching the full month of September. So again, I think looking at such a small window is unfair and I think we will need to have this analysis later on in the day, once we see exactly what the full year of usage is and maybe compare that in the future as well.

I myself am a cyclist, as you know. I see a lot more people out there cycling, a lot of people buying them... There is also the issue of bicycles being quite inexpensive as well, so they might try the Redibikes and say, 'Well, I'm going to buy one now, and that again will have an effect.' But I think we need to look at this in a much broader way, not just the results of a few months.

630 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, I do accept that point by the Minister. I think it is reasonable to wait longer and we have limited statistics. It was just that I was slightly disappointed by the numbers presented, which is why I asked, and the way the Minister answered the last question made me think maybe there is a target figure or something that you would like to see after a year of use of the bikes. We have seen the figures rise and fall again, perhaps rising again.

635 Can the Minister confirm that there is no ballpark figure that they would like to see as a monthly usage for the bikes for them to consider the scheme to have been a success?

Hon. P J Balban: Mr Speaker, it is very difficult. We have no value. Remember that the question that has been asked ... I think you need to look at the comparison: how many people were using bicycles before. I think just to have a ballpark figure of what we expect ... We do not know what usage is generally, so we did not pin it down to a certain usage. The fact that we had 640 407 people using Redibikes in the month of August means that there were 407 people not getting other modes of transport, be it the bus, be it a taxi, be it walking – well, walking would have been even better, but a car or private transport etc.

645 So again it is very difficult to see where these originate from. Do people come in their cars, park their cars and then get a Redibike, or do these people walk across the Frontier, or do these people come off ships? Obviously, I would like to see this becoming extremely popular and I am pretty positive it will because I can just see the number of people cycling nowadays compared to just a short while ago. Even the number of bicycles you see, the number of bicycle racks we are having to place – the demand for bicycle racks is incredible recently, and still we are struggling because still people are having to park bikes elsewhere because they cannot fit them. As I said 650 earlier, it is the whole concept of cycling. Redibikes is just one of those vehicles, but this may encourage people to purchase bicycles and I think we are achieving our aim if they do go down that route as well.

Q589/2017

**Foreign licensed vehicles –
Numbers towed for parking in restricted areas**

Clerk: Question 589. The Hon. L F Llamas.

655 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, since December 2011 can the Government provide a monthly schedule of how many foreign licensed vehicles have been towed away for being parked in a public parking during restricted times such as cleaning campaigns?

660 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. Minister for Infrastructure and Planning.

Minister for Infrastructure and Planning (Hon. P J Balban): Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is provided in a schedule that I will now hand over.

ANSWER TO QUESTION NO 589/2017

Foreign vehicles towed away*

	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
January	0	1	2	3	1	8
February	0	1	10	1	1	6
March	0	3	2	6	1	7
April	0	14	3	4	1	12
May	0	3	8	3	2	<i>101</i>
June	8	6	24	9	2	<i>38</i>
July	7	14	9	7	0	<i>34</i>
August	6	2	20	9	6	<i>40</i>
September	12	17	27	9	1	<i>25</i>
October	10	3	17	2	6	<i>14</i>
November	4	14	10	8	9	
December	8	1	5	1	0	

*The above figures pertain to foreign registered vehicles which have been towed away for being parked on the public highway during such time parking restrictions were in place specifying specific times. This includes but not limited to cleaning campaigns.

Figures in bold sourced from GCPL/DVLD records; figures in italics sourced from GPMSL records Information prior to June 2012 is not available.

665 **Mr Speaker:** Could I ask the hon. Minister at his convenience to provide an explanatory note to be included in the schedule as to what GCPL/DVLD stands for, and GPMSL, at his convenience, and we will incorporate it into the schedule.

670 **Hon. P J Balban:** Just to address that point, GCPL is Gibraltar Car Parks Ltd; DVLD is Department of Vehicle Licensing – what is colloquially known as the MOT; and GPMSL is the company that runs the parking enforcement, Gibraltar Parking Management Services Ltd.

675 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, obviously we have seen a rise in 2017 of vehicles being towed, and I can talk from experience, having seen some vehicles towed the other day. I actually asked one of the employees of one of these companies why they were towing away and it was based on the cleaning campaign so that they could clean better. I could understand it if they were properly hosing down the area with water, but given that they were simply just using a broom and passing around vehicles, which is not going to do much in terms of cleaning the atmosphere, I could not understand why, apart from having to have the Fixed Penalty Notice, these vehicles were being towed away. And, Mr Speaker, what was even worse was they were being towed
680 away whilst vehicles were returning to park in the area. I asked why, if the cleaning campaign had actually finished, why were they still being towed away – and they were unable to answer and said, ‘Oh, that’s a very good question.’

685 So I am concerned at the fact that so many tourists are actually being towed away rather than just clamped and made to pay the fee. Can the Government enlighten me as to why this policy is being implemented rather than just the clamping of vehicles?

Hon. P J Balban: Mr Speaker, vehicles are towed away if they are causing obstruction to the public highway. If it is as a result of the street-cleaning campaign, generally the principle is that an FPN is placed and, to be able to achieve that FPN and to make sure that the vehicle does not

690 go across the Frontier and abscond in that respect, then a clamp is placed. The clamp has no extra charge, it is just to ensure, and that is the same policy that was used in the past.

Again, it is only if a vehicle is causing an obstruction that the vehicle would be towed away. Other than that, it is a clamp. If it is a vehicle which is presumed ... it could be a derelict vehicle and it is not moving ... then that could be another reason why a vehicle is towed away.

695

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, unfortunately, those that I have witnessed have not been as a result of derelict ... or causing an obstruction, other than impeding the cleaning strategy at certain areas. At £60 a pop I can understand that they would have to pay the Fixed Penalty Notice, but to additionally burden and place tourists having to find where the vehicle has been

700

towed to, rather than just simply placing the clamp, as has always been the case ...
Can the Government investigate at least as to whether this is simply a one-off or whether this is happening on a weekly basis, and therefore this could seriously be impacting the tourist experience in Gibraltar?

705

Hon. P J Balban: Mr Speaker, the policy is that cars should not be towed away unless they are causing an obstruction on the public highway, so I will obviously have a look at that and see why ... If the hon. Gentleman would like to give me further details as to where it was and the date, I can then –

710

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): We do not accept the argument on its own. He has to give us the details.

715

Hon. P J Balban: Of course, he needs to give us the exact details – let me know where it was and I will look at it, but it is not something that happens. Cars are only towed away when it is absolutely necessary that they are towed away. Otherwise, either an FPN is placed or a clamp is placed to ensure that the FPN is paid for, but otherwise there is no towing away.

720

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, I shall gladly expand further behind the Speaker's Chair, but I can assure the opposite side that I could have recorded the conversation I had with the employees when I challenged it and they simply could not answer the question, other than they were doing it just to make extra money.

725

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, that is, if I may say so, a ridiculous thing for an employee of a company that is not receiving remuneration based on how much money they make to give to the hon. Gentleman and for the hon. Gentleman to believe it. There is nothing about the people who are involved in parking management and nothing about their remuneration – there is no bonus structure, there is no remuneration to the company – that is based on how much they fine or clamp or tow. So, if he is told that, then he should have the presence of mind to say to them, 'It doesn't make any sense what you are saying to me,' or to record them, as he has suggested he would do, to add to the *telenovela* that he is treating us to on Facebook of his daily grind.

730

Nobody must listen to this debate and think that there is a policy on the part of the Government of towing a car that is not causing an obstruction. Only cars that cause an obstruction will be towed.

735

But I must tell him as a pedestrian that it is absolutely right that cars that are causing an obstruction should be towed, because I push a pram every morning when I walk to work and it is disgraceful the number of vehicles, which are foreign and locally registered, that are illegally parked and causing an obstruction not just for other vehicles, because we must not just look at the possibility of other vehicles being obstructed but of pedestrians being obstructed, and that means people who are pushing prams, people who are on wheelchairs and their ability to traverse a road and their ability to get into town, and they must be the ones we stand with.

740

745 There is no question of this being done for the purposes of making money or raising funds or profit, and if he has been told that I would be very grateful indeed if he indicated to the Hon. Minister when he was told and at what time, so that we can determine who said it so that we can put them bang to right, because that is not the policy of the Government, and in fact if it has happened it has happened contrary to the policy of the Government, which is entirely unacceptable to the Government.

750 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, just for clarification, the Hon. Chief Minister is referring to the public highway and I would like to support the Government in the sense that obviously anybody who is obstructing the public highway, the pavements and so forth, should be reprimanded regardless – but my question was specifically based on public parking. That is why there is a little bit of confusion.

755 **Hon. T N Hammond:** If I may just ask one supplementary, Mr Speaker, I would just like to say I do endorse, regarding the public highway where obstructions occur, that certainly the vehicle should be removed from causing that obstruction.

760 I just wonder – and I will come back with a question if he does not have the answer: there is a spike in the figures for May 2017 of 101 vehicles being towed, which is about three times more than the monthly average. Is the Minister aware of any particular event or reason why the numbers are so high in that given month? If not, I will come back with a written question.

765 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, yes, there were a number of reasons why we saw a spike. In fact, a cleaning campaign was conducted at Western Beach, Bayside Road and Grand Parade, and that resulted in around 39 vehicles being towed away. Also there were pay and display areas ... they were actually within residential estates, general obstruction and mainly red lines.

770 So, in summary, the main reason was a cleaning campaign. When there are cleaning campaigns, obviously you will see an increase. There are various cleaning campaigns in a given month and if people leave their vehicles there, then obviously you will see a spike in that respect.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q590/2017

Electric hoverboards and scooters – Update re regulation

Clerk: Question 590. The Hon. L F Llamas.

775 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide an update to Question 99/2017 relating to electric hoverboards and scooters?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Infrastructure and Planning.

780 **Minister for Infrastructure and Planning (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, Government continues to work with HM Customs, the RGP and the Gibraltar Law Officers in relation to the importation and use of hoverboards and other similar self-balancing devices.

785 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, these talks with the law enforcement agencies have been ongoing for quite some time and obviously we are seeing an increase in further scooters and electric hoverboards being used on our streets and pavements without regulation.

790 This was first chastised by the Government in December 2015, together with the drones. We have seen that the Government is taking a far more serious approach to drones, given their importance; however, I would urge the Government to look into this, especially when we know from the media that there can be issues of fire and safety with certain products which are not up to European standards, and therefore these could be being imported and end up causing a fire hazard in some of our buildings.

795 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, the position under the law is that all these devices are illegal imports. These bikes in Gibraltar are considered motor vehicles – their motor is an electric motor, but still it is a vehicle. They should not be driven. They should not be in Gibraltar in the first place, let alone be driven on a public footpath or even on the public highway. It is a matter of policing in that respect.

800 The legislation itself will see whether there is any potential use for these vehicles as part of Gibraltar. We were considering perhaps having areas for them and considering whether some could be classified as toys more than modes of transport. Some of these things really will not be able to work properly on the road because they are made for flat surfaces. Those are also illegal imports and those are generally the ones that have been accused of catching fire – the toy models.

805 But the biggest issue I think we have with the legislation is that these things are changing all the time. There is a massive evolution of types of vehicles and it is difficult to specify what these are. Recently I saw in Dubai the police testing a drone-type motorcycle, so things could even get worse if we continue down that line. But the way things are at the moment it is clear in the law that they are illegal imports, illegal on the highway and they should not be used.

CULTURE, THE MEDIA, YOUTH AND SPORT

Q591/2017

Gibraltar Music Festival – Vehicles hired by Government

810 **Clerk:** Question 591. The Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, regarding the transport arrangements in place for the GMF, can the Minister say if any vehicles were hired by Government to support the event; if so, how many, were the drivers employed Government drivers and what was the cost?

815 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, no vehicles were hired by Government.

Q592/2017

Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority – Vacancies

820 **Clerk:** Question 592. The Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, sir, can the Minister for Sport provide details of any vacancies which may currently exist within the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

825

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, at present there is an Administrative Assistant, GSLA Grade 9, vacancy within the GSLA.

830

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, can the Minister clarify: I know in the past he has informed me that they were undergoing some type of staffing review and so on – would the Minister like to enlighten us as to whether this position has not been advertised because of the still-ongoing staff review, or has that now completed and then it is just a question of starting the recruitment process to be initiated?

835

Hon. S E Linares: Mr Speaker, the restructure has already taken place, which is most of the managerial and administrative part of the GSLA. This is a post that was left vacant at the end because, as he can see, it is one of the AAs at the bottom of the scale of the management. As I understand it, we are trying to recruit someone within the GSLA itself to see if there is anybody interested in getting that post. If not, it will just go through the normal procedure that we have done with the other posts.

840

Hon. E J Reyes: So, just for clarification, Mr Speaker, when the Minister says ‘we are trying to recruit someone from within the GSLA’, am I right in concluding that an internal advertisement for the vacancy has happened and then, subsequently, subject to the interest shown and a suitable person being identified, it will become public or not?

845

Hon. S E Linares: Yes, sir.

Q593/2017
Sports-related grants –
Payments made

Clerk: Question 593. The Hon. E J Reyes.

850

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Sport provide details of all payments made during this financial year in respect of any sports-related grants?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for, Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

855

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, I now hand over to the hon. Member opposite details of all payments that have been made towards sports grants during this financial year.

I would like to inform the hon. Member that this information is updated periodically online on the HM Government of Gibraltar statistics website.

Answer to Question 593/2017

Grants Awarded for sports development projects

Pistol Shooting	709.00
Badminton Association	606.75
Rowing Association	2,881.56
Hockey Association	3,684.00
Athletics Association	3,502.30
Basketball Association	814.04
Karate Association	961.00
Taekwondo Association	311.99
Ice Skating Association	397.23

Grants Awarded for International Competitions

Island Games	98,257.67
--------------	-----------

Grants Awarded to Sporting Societies

Netball Association	13,340.51
Target Shooting	5,745.93
Shooting Association	11,933.61
Darts Association	15,812.50
Hockey Association	15,587.41
Tenpin Bowling Association	2,631.06
Athletics Association	6,302.11
Basketball Association	6,644.10
Triathlon Association	2,685.00
Rowing Association	2,381.56

Hosting of Special Sports and Leisure Events

Gibraltar Darts Trophy	132,245.20
Gibraltar Kennel Club	10,012.50
World Pool & Snooker Championships	248,176.00
Commonwealth Games	5,221.80
Gibraltar Classic Vehicle Association	1,200.00
Gibraltar Int Backgammon Tournament	37,500.00
Hockey Challenge Cup	850.00
Cleaning of Gibraltar Music Song Festival	192.00
International Bike Rally	241.64
Harley Davidson Club Rally	4,500.00
Maccabi Gibraltar International Competition	4,000.00
Cleaning of Boxing event	38.40
Eurafrica Trail	22,507.50
Gibraltar Int Junior Chess Championships	40,000.00
Bowling Tournament	16,000.00
Philharmonic reception	250.00
Squash Open	6,000.00
Queens Baton Relay catering expense	1,200.00

860 **Hon. E J Reyes:** I am grateful for the schedule, Mr Speaker.

Yes, the Minister has informed me in the past that something is available. For the record, on the day that I had to sit down and prepare this notice, the Government website said to me that it was undergoing maintenance and therefore I could not access any details whatsoever. Although I accept what the Minister has answered, he also has to accept my inability to obtain that information within the 48 hours one has in which to submit questions.

865

Hon. S E Linares: Mr Speaker, there is nothing much I can do if the IT department is doing a maintenance programme. All I am stating is that it is on the website, and if on that occasion it was not, well there is not much I can do.

Q594/2017
Cultural grants –
Details of awards

870 **Clerk:** Question 594. The Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Culture provide details of all cultural grants awarded this current financial year?

875 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, I now hand over to the hon. Member opposite the information requested.

880 I take this opportunity to remind the hon. Member opposite that it is updated and posted on the HM Government website with the proviso 'unless it is going under maintenance'!

Answer to Question 594/2017

Cultural Grants for financial year 2017-2018

MH Bland & Co Ltd - Book Grant 'What on Earth?' 'The Story of Gibraltar'	5,000.00
Gibraltar Productions - Sponsorship for the Gibraltar World Music Festival	50,000.00
State Media Ltd - The Art Bermondsey Project Space	4,000.00
M.O Productions - Organisation staging and production of the 16th Gibraltar International Dance Festival	5,000.00
Gibraltar National Dance Organisation - GNDO for IDO affiliation fee/dance workshops	11,700.00
Bayside & Westside Drama Group to travel to Medway Theatre in Rochester, UK to participate in the Duncan Youth Festival	2,000.00
Urban Dance - support to cover costs of participation at the "Vive tu Sueno" European Dance Finals in Paris	2,000.00
Gibraltar Face & Body Paint Association - Assistance for the Gibraltar Body Painting Festival 2018	3,000.00
Regina Danino - Installation costs for exhibiting work with group of artists at Bermondsey Project	3,000.00
Ayelet Shay - Book grant for the translation, production & printing of her book 'Relocation Darling Relocation'	6,250.00
Stylos Studios in support of their participation at the World Dance Movement Competition in Italy in July 17	3,000.00
Shane Dalmedo - Purchase of materials and tools for the project of the Encyclopedia of Migrants	2,000.00
Gail Francis Tiron - Book grant for the production and printing of book 'Don't You Just Love Them'	4,100.00
Sunbow Projects - Virtual Gibraltar Festival	10,000.00
Miss S A McLaren - Assistance for final year at the Northern Ballet School in Manchester, UK	4,260.00
Group 2000 - Assistance for the WW1 play presentation at the Gibraltar Garrison Library	500.00
The Gibraltar Photographic Society - Purchase of equipment	1,700.00
The Gibraltar Philharmonic Society - Support for various concerts promoting classical music	10,000.00
Gibraltar Cultural Services Ltd - Gibraltar Berlin Artist Exchange student sponsorship	6,000.00
R Barabich - The reprint of the book "The memoirs of Arnold Barabiscio"	1,320.00
Davinia Baglietto - Assistance for Return Flights post Mrs Europe Pageant	488.00
Gibraltar Cultural Services in conjunction with Leisure Cinemas Ltd - Cultural Development Programme	500.00
Gibraltar Horticultural Society - Forthcoming events and projects	2,000.00
Gibraltar Artisans Market - Support towards the Gibraltar Christmas Village 2017	5,000.00

Clerk: Question 595. The Hon. E J Reyes.

885 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, before I read out Question 595 – I know you will allow us to come back – can I ask a very quick question in respect of the schedule of 593, which was in respect of the sports grants or sports payments made.

I see here, on the second page of the schedule under the subheading ‘Hosting of Special Sports and Leisure Events’ there is an expenditure for ‘Cleaning of Gibraltar Music Song Festival’.
890 Is that just a one-off payment, or an additional payment despite some other grant that was made? I do not quite understand why the cleaning part – one takes it to be post the event – is specified here. Sometimes, for the ease of book-keeping references, it is detailed like that, but it brings that question to mind: is it an additional supplementary funding, or whatever?

895 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, I will find out exactly why that is there, but I am assuming – but I will find out – that this is because the Music Song Festival comes under the cultural grants. What has happened, I assume, is that there have been issues with how they leave the Tercentenary Hall, and therefore the GSLA has seen it fit to get it under events, albeit that they are not sporting events but it is in the Tercentenary Hall. I will find out for the hon. Member
900 exactly why it is there, but I am assuming it is that.

Hon. E J Reyes: Yes, Mr Speaker, the Minister is right and I accept that he needs to look into it. One of the reasons why I brought it up is that two or three lines further down there is ‘Cleaning of Boxing event’ and obviously boxing immediately one connects with a sporting event
905 and automatically comes to mind the use of the Tercentenary Hall, which is where I think the Minister and I both agree. It was just that the Song Festival did stick out like a sore thumb and perhaps the answer could be that it was not left clean to a satisfactory standard and in order not to delay other sporting events that have been allocated you just bring in an external cleaning company and someone has to pay.

910 But I can wait patiently, Mr Speaker, and then the Minister may want to look up as well the boxing, just to double check on the event.

Hon. S E Linares: Yes, Mr Speaker, probably the CEO will do what they call a ‘JV’ in which the account is moved to another department. He might have got the money that time from there
915 and that is why it is in the list, and now he probably will claim the cultural side, those £192. But I will find out, thank you.

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, just one supplementary.

920 The amount given by way of hosting special sports and leisure events for the world pool and snooker championships of close to £¼ million does seem in a different league to lots of the other grants – for example, Island Games, £98,000. Could the Minister explain to the House or perhaps give an explanation whether that close to £¼ million is purely costs, or was there an element of prize money in that number – and, if so, how much?

925 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, these are two major events. It is not only one, it is two. The only thing is that the company that runs these events is the same one. So probably it is one payment for two events. The hon. Member could well split that in two halves, because I do not know whether the hon. Member knows that the pool, for example, was live on Sky for four solid days and that is why it would cost around half of that. The snooker is the same, so these have a
930 lot of exposure for Gibraltar. They are very, very important tournaments, but they have been put together and that is why you are seeing it as a high expenditure. But if the hon. Member looks at, for example, the darts trophy, there is £132,000 there. These are, like I said, major events, very big events that are televised and have a lot of value. Pool and snooker I know are the same

935 company, and therefore it might have been paid together. So that is what it is, but they are two separate tournaments.

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Minister for his clarification.

940 I just have two further questions: if he would be kind enough to identify what company he is referring to; and also, would he then expect that effectively the payment will cover any prize money paid out?

Hon. S E Linares: Mr Speaker, the moneys ... there is a whole list of things that it covers. For example, I can let the hon. Member know that when a snooker tournament is done here in Gibraltar, if he cares to go down to the Tercentenary Hall, they bring all the tables, they bring up
945 all the equipment, the cameras – everything comes from abroad to the Tercentenary. They take over the Tercentenary, they convert it into the tournament area and that is all included in the price, apart from any other things like the prize money and many other things.

The hon. Member must understand that, like I said, it has got a lot of value to have these here, and like, for example, the darts, the value of the darts is that there are many people now
950 coming to Gibraltar, so it is events-led tourism, whilst for the snooker and the pool the value is the exposure on television that there is. It is not so much ... For example, not many people from the UK come for a snooker tournament to Gibraltar, but it has a value because snooker is on TV for about four solid days – many, many hours – which is worth millions in the exposure.

955 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, again I am grateful to the Minister but I did not quite catch the name of the company that I was asking for.

Hon. S E Linares: Match Room Sports.

960 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, still on Question 593 – the Minister may know the answer now or may wish to inform us later on – under the heading ‘Hosting of special sports and leisure events’, the fourth line down is the Commonwealth Games. Perhaps I am being over critical in my narrative but we have never hosted the Commonwealth Games in Gibraltar, so perhaps some clarification of why does it come under the heading of host.
965

Hon. S E Linares: Mr Speaker, it is the Commonwealth Games but it is the Commonwealth Games Association who brought over all the Executive Committee to Gibraltar and that is why it has been put as one of the events. So all of the executive came here, they hosted meetings of the executive here and therefore this is the expenditure. I think we had one reception and then
970 somewhere else, so basically some expenditure, which is £5,221, was what the Gibraltar Commonwealth Games Association applied to us to host these meetings here.

Hon. E J Reyes: So, Mr Speaker, then it would be correct for me if I were to amend this to either the ‘Gibraltar Commonwealth Games Association’ or ‘hosting of meeting’ or something,
975 just for any future reference? I know what can happen, Mr Speaker: come Budget time or whatever, I am looking back at some notes and then I am not clear on the actual meaning of ‘Commonwealth Games’.

Hon. S E Linares: Yes, I will do.

Q595/2017
Europa Point shooting facilities –
Plans for relocation

980 **Clerk:** Question 595. The Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Sport inform this House in respect of the Government's plans for the possible relocation of the shooting facilities presently sited at Europa Point?

985

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, the Government is working very closely with the Gibraltar Target Shooting Association to relocate the association to adequate premises. An announcement will be made once the necessary plans have been finalised.

990

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, is the Minister in a position to at least identify possible areas that are being looked at?

995

Can he confirm as well that unfortunately, in trying to identify a location, there is a stipulation from the international regulations that these shooting ranges should now be sited north-south facing as opposed to the non-restrictions before, where we ended up with east-west – because that could enlighten the situation as to why some areas cannot be looked into as feasible?

1000

Hon. S E Linares: Mr Speaker, I can tell the hon. Member that this has been a very, very challenging exercise to try and relocate the Gibraltar Target Shooting Association and it is to do precisely with what the hon. Member is saying, because not only has it got to be facing south-north – the shooters are on the south shooting towards the north – but, imagine in Gibraltar, it has to be 30 metres by 70 metres, and therefore it has been a massive challenge. We have had many areas where we have tried, we have looked at it, you say, 'Right, okay, there's 70 by 30 here ... Oh, but no, it's not facing north-south.' So it has been very, very, very challenging to try and find an area. We have identified a few, we have gone through planning and then we have had to come back because it is not quite exactly what their needs are.

1005

1010

But we are confident that, working closely with them, as in the answer to the question, we will get there and an announcement will be made very soon.

Mr Speaker: Next question. The Hon. Roy Clinton.

1015

Hon. R M Clinton: Yes. Thank you Mr Speaker. Could the Minister confirm that ... or at least advise the House if they are still seriously considering the top of MidTown car park for siting this range?

Hon. S E Linares: No, sir.

1020

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q596/2017
Victoria Stadium –
Government/GFA negotiations re sale

Clerk: Question 596, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1025 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, is the Government able to explain why the GFA and Government have not yet agreed on the sale of the Victoria Stadium.

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

1030 **Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, HM Government and the GFA are finalising lease negotiations in respect of the sale of the Victoria Stadium.

Q597/2017
Island Games –
Building of sporting facilities

Clerk: Question 597. The Hon. L F Llamas.

1035 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, is the Government confident it will be able to build the sporting facilities in time for the Island Games without the need to use taxpayers' moneys, as stated in their announcement?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

1040

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, yes, sir.

ENVIRONMENT, ENERGY, CLIMATE CHANGE AND EDUCATION

Q598/2017
Camp Bay –
Remedial works

Clerk: Question 598. The Hon. T N Hammond.

1045 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, are any improvement works planned to remedy the poor state that Camp Bay currently finds itself in?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1050 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, as in previous years, remedial works at Camp Bay and all other public beaches will be carried out prior to the 2018 official bathing season, addressing all problem areas and making these good in the best possible way.

1055 Further to this, extensive repairs and maintenance works will be carried out at the Camp Bay pools and its pumping, filtration and chlorination system. These works are scheduled to commence by the end of this month and once concluded the pools will be covered and prepared for the winter.

1060 A fully comprehensive resurfacing and refurbishment programme for the entire Camp Bay area is also being currently considered by Government. However, given the magnitude of the works required, works would probably have to be staggered over a period of at least two years.

1065 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, I fully appreciate that there is a degree of routine maintenance and works that must take place. The reason I raise Camp Bay specifically is because (a) concerns have been raised with me directly about its condition and (b) because it is one of the areas that is not just used in the summer – of course there are playgrounds there, people take their children there to ride their bicycles and there are all sorts of other activities that take place there throughout the winter as well, which is why the concern was specifically raised about Camp Bay.

1070 I can fully understand the bathing season and its applicability to the other sandy beaches, but perhaps would Government consider bringing the works forward to at least make the area, first and foremost, safe but also user friendly to the users of Camp Bay over the winter months?

1075 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Well, it is precisely because the area is used regularly throughout the year that we will have to stagger it. Clearly, we will have to carry out any major works in the winter months because at that time you could perhaps section off areas, whereas in the summer, because of the massive use, it would be less likely that that would be acceptable.

1080 As I say, we are looking at a comprehensive refurbishment and I am hopeful that we will be able to make some improvements certainly before next summer. As to whether we will be able to do anything major, the thing is that obviously we are putting resources into the pools. The pools were in need of comprehensive restoration, of pumping, filtration and chlorination equipment, and at the moment we are concentrating on that, which clearly has to be carried out in the winter months.

Q599/2017
Laguna Estate –
Problems with apes

1085 **Clerk:** Question 599. The Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, can Government provide details of what measures it intends to introduce in order to curtail the ever-increasing problems of apes roaming around the area of the Laguna Estate?

1090 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1095 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the recent arrival of a group of Barbary Macaques in the area, which includes Laguna Estate, is due to a splinter group from Rock Gun being pushed down by another group. This is part of macaque behaviour.

1100 Once at the base of the cliff, the group has been attracted by food being provided in the area near Eton Park. Steps have been taken to stop this. In addition, as part of a multi-faceted approach, the Macaque Management Team is being deployed on a daily basis to patrol Laguna Estate and push the macaques back into the nature reserve. Further to this, all the macaques that have been in Laguna Estate recently are being carefully assessed by the management team and selected individuals sterilised.

1105 **Hon. E J Reyes:** I am most grateful, Mr Speaker, that the Minister has at least informed us that the control team is there and so on.

1110 I do not think I need to stress but I want to put on the record the great concern that seems to have been expressed by residents there. There are all sorts of reports of, unfortunately, the macaques going into people's homes. As nature incites them to look for food, they seem to know their way into kitchens and parents with young children are particularly worried on this issue.

1115 I have no doubt that the team is going there on a daily basis. Could I urge the Minister and plead on behalf of the residents of Laguna Estate, if possible, to try and extend the number of hours that they attend daily, or at least go twice a day? We can comply with the letter of the law by saying 'I have been there on a daily basis', but sod's law says you go at nine o'clock and it is all fine and by quarter past nine there seems to be a disco party going on amongst the macaques themselves.

1120 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful to my friend, the Hon. Mr Reyes, for reminding me of the problem that macaques can create in urban areas. He did not need to do that, because I spent the first two years of my time as Minister trying to resolve the problem that I inherited with macaques all over the place, so I am familiar with that.

1125 We have been successful in the last two or three years. The incidents of macaques in urban areas, which will always happen as long as we have them in Gibraltar, is greatly reduced. There is this problem of a splinter group of about 10 to 12 that was forced down due to their own internal aggression between groups. Certainly we are there as much as we can be, and it does not necessarily have to be at a particular time because they do move around the area.

1130 But I am quite confident, the way that we are dealing with this, that within the next few weeks the incidences of these monkeys within Laguna Estate will be greatly reduced. It is something we have to be monitoring constantly because, as we have often said here, these monkeys are free to roam and long may they be there, but obviously we are doing all that we can to keep them away, and I think with considerable success in the last couple of years, but I have never said that we could guarantee 100% that the odd group will not appear in a few areas.

1135 The problem was that when people who were using Eton Car Park, or the car park below Eton Park, saw them here they started feeding them and we had to send our litter wardens to ensure that that stopped, but obviously they were already comfortable in the area and we have had to then deploy people to move them up. But, as I say, I am fairly confident that the problem will not be long lasting.

1140 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, just one question in relation to this point. The Minister has spoken about a multi-faceted approach – can he confirm what measures are employed by that multi-faceted approach?

1145 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Well, the deployment of staff to control the feeding is one that I have already mentioned; the litter wardens; ensuring that bin stores and so on are properly closed; being present to chase them up whenever they are in the area; and the assessment of the individuals so that we can see which of the females – and in the case of a group that you want to move away completely, it will be the majority of the females – should have contraceptive implants or should be sterilised in order that the group does not increase in size, because that

1150 would mean that we would have a larger problem in the future if they were to be chased down again. So that is four or five different aspects which are part of this multiple approach that I referred to.

1155 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Is relocation also considered in relation to the Barbary Macaques? And also just one further question that adds to that: are litter wardens also trained to deal with Barbary Macaques?

1160 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** I will answer the second one first. The litter wardens are not dealing with the macaques; the litter wardens are dealing with the people who are feeding the macaques, so they are telling people, 'Don't feed them, it's going to attract them, and if you do it again we can fine you,' which they could do on day one but we try and persuade and encourage people not to do that.

1165 The relocation, yes, ideally, and we are still trying to find other locations outside Gibraltar where we could send the group, but relocation from the point of view of trapping them and moving them to the Upper Rock is a strategy that has been used before which we still try – with limited access, because a couple of hundred metres down a cliff for a monkey is nothing, but certainly we do try that as well.

Q600/2017
New and refurbished schools –
Locations and sizes

Clerk: Question 600. The Hon. E J Reyes.

1170 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Education provide details in respect of the locations and sizes of the new schools it has announced will be built and/or refurbished?

1175 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the details for this project will shortly be presented to the public. Until then, it is premature to make any piecemeal statements.

1180 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can I possibly have an indication of how long 'shortly' would be, so that one knows whether it is a question I should pose for the November meeting?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Within the next two weeks.

Q601/2017
Educational establishments –
Number of students registered

1185 **Clerk:** Question 601. The Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Education provide details of the total number of students/pupils currently registered per school or educational establishment, broken down by individual school, school year and gender?

1190 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1195 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the information requested is set out in the schedule which I have handed over for the hon. Member's attention. This information represents the student population for this academic year.

Schedule to Question 601/2017

Total No. of Pupils at schools in Gibraltar 2017/2018

School Name	School Year 2017/18																														
	N		R		1		2		3		4		5		6		7		8		9		10		11		12		13		
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	
St Josephs First	44	41	34	44	52	42	47	53	54	54																					
St Mary's First	11	21	24	17	23	18	25	28	43	31																					
St Paul's First	20	20	33	40	40	43	29	30	35	43																					
St Bernard's First	21	20	26	17	22	14	22	24	32	13																					
Governor's Meadow	31	11	39	34	35	28	38	29	40	37																					
Notre Dame			39	28	47	44	33	34	43	41																					
Varyl Begg Nursery	19	35																													
Hebrew Primary			9	8	12	9	5	12	7	9	9	17	4	8	10	6	9	9													
St Martin's Special	11	5																											34	16	
Bishop Fitzgerald											66	44	56	64	53	48	57	44													
St Anne's											57	49	53	61	65	40	48	43													
St Bernard's Middle											40	46	37	36	43	41	34	37													
St Joseph's Middle											59	49	51	46	45	43	44	51													
Westside																			196		201		167		182		179		118		
Bayside																			216		214		190		182		157		129		
Gibraltar College																													131	187	

Q602/2017

Applications moved from discretionary to mandatory awards – Cost of courses

Clerk: Question 602, the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, thank you very much.

1200 Further to answers provided to Question 122, can the Government please provide details of the costs of courses which were moved from applications for discretionary awards to applications for mandatory awards?

1205 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the information requested is set out in the next schedule which I hand over for the

1210 hon. Member's attention. This is a list in respect of the costs of discretionary awards converted to mandatory awards in 2016 and 2017.

Schedule to Question 602/2017

2016

Application	Outcome	Tuition per annum
1	Mandatory	£0.00
2	Mandatory	£10,500.00
3	Mandatory	£0.00
4	Mandatory	£9,000.00
5	Mandatory	£9,000.00
6	Mandatory	£7,800.00
7	Mandatory	£2,310.00
8	Mandatory	£7,500.00
9	Mandatory	£0.00
10	Mandatory	£9,000.00
11	Mandatory	£4,020.00
12	Mandatory	£8,420.00
13	Mandatory	£9,000.00
14	Mandatory	£5,150.00
15	Mandatory	£1,820.00
16	Mandatory	£9,000.00
17	Mandatory	£9,000.00
18	Mandatory	£9,000.00
19	Mandatory	£9,000.00
20	Mandatory	£13,800.00
21	Mandatory	£9,000.00
22	Mandatory	£9,000.00
23	Mandatory	£4,310.00
24	Mandatory	£9,000.00
25	Mandatory	£4,500.00
26	Mandatory	£5,900.00
27	Mandatory	£12,335.00
28	Mandatory	£12,335.00
29	Mandatory	£9,000.00
30	Mandatory	£9,000.00
31	Mandatory	£15,623.00
32	Mandatory	£0.00
33	Mandatory	£9,000.00
34	Mandatory	£0.00
35	Mandatory	£14,734.09

2017

Application	Outcome	Tuition per annum
1	Mandatory	£9,250.00
2	Mandatory	£9,250.00
3	Mandatory	£5,097.34
4	Mandatory	£15,000.00
5	Mandatory	£9,250.00
6	Mandatory	£9,250.00
7	Mandatory	£8,785.00
8	Mandatory	*
9	Mandatory	*
10	Mandatory	*
11	Mandatory	£9,250.00
12	Mandatory	£8,400.00
13	Mandatory	£8,400.00
14	Mandatory	*
15	Mandatory	£8,400.00
16	Mandatory	*
17	Mandatory	£9,250.00
18	Mandatory	£3,350.00
19	Mandatory	*
20	Mandatory	£9,000.00
21	Mandatory	*
22	Mandatory	*
23	Mandatory	*
24	Mandatory	*
25	Mandatory	*
26	Mandatory	*
27	Mandatory	*
28	Mandatory	£9,820.86
29	Mandatory	*
30	Mandatory	£9,250.00
31	Mandatory	£6,350.00
32	Mandatory	*
33	Mandatory	£8,400.00
34	Mandatory	*
35	Mandatory	*
36	Mandatory	*
37	Mandatory	*
38	Mandatory	*
39	Mandatory	*
40	Mandatory	£9,000.00
41	Mandatory	£9,250.00
42	Mandatory	£6,165.00
43	Mandatory	*
44	Mandatory	£12,000.00
45	Mandatory	*

* Awaiting invoice

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, I will come back to this.

Mr Speaker: Yes. Next question.

1215

Q603/2017
New Schools –
Details of courses

Clerk: Question 603. The Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Further to the answer provided to Question 122, can the Government please provide details of the courses relating to each entry on the schedule available in the records?
1220

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):
1225 Mr Speaker, the information requested is set out in the next schedule. The hon. Member will be receiving both together. The schedule available in the records has now been updated to provide course details.

Schedule to Question 603/2017

2017

Application	Outcome	Tuition per annum	Course
1	Withdrew	N/A	N/A
2	Withdrew	N/A	N/A
3	Withdrew	N/A	N/A
4	Successful	£9,000.00	BA Music Production
5	Successful	£9,000.00	FdA Sports Coaching
6	Successful	£7,575.00	PhD
7	Successful	£9,388.55	International Beauty Therapy Diploma
8	Successful	£800.00	MCA RYA Day Skipper / RYA Radar Course / RYA Diesel Engine Course / Maritime Radio Operators Licence
9	Successful	£11,400.00	MCA RYA / SRC VHF incl GMDSS Fast Track Yacht master Offshore Motor Course
10	Successful	£950.00	STCW
11	Successful	£18,000.00	EASA CPL/IR Air Transport Pilot License
12	Successful	£10,920.00	GDL - Graduate Diploma in Law (Conversion Course)
13	Successful	£2,292.44	Microblading Course
14	Successful	£4,050.00	Level 2 Beauty Therapist
15	Successful	£755.00	ACCA Level 2
16	Successful	£2,305.00	Advanced Diploma in Accounting AAT Level 4
17	Successful	£755.00	ACCA Level 2
18	Successful	£907.00	ACCA Level 2
19	Successful	£1,450.00	CMI Level 5 Diploma - Management and Leadership
20	Successful	£750.00	MA Conference Interpreting (Quadrilingual)
21	Successful	£9,000.00	PGCE
22	Successful	£9,000.00	PGCE
23	Successful	£9,000.00	PGCE
24	Successful	£7,575.00	PhD
25	Successful	£4,052.00	MA Social Work
26	Successful	£7,575.00	PhD
27	Successful	£9,000.00	Foundation Addictions Counselling
28	Successful	£9,000.00	BA Health and Social Care
29	Successful	£9,250.00	BSc Computer Games (Software Development)
30	Regret	£9,000.00	PGCE History
31	Regret	£9,338.55	International Beauty Therapy Diploma
32	Regret	£0.00	A Level's & 1 Vocational Level

1230

GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT, FRIDAY, 20th OCTOBER 2017

33	Regret	£1,560.00	S & C Accreditation ASCC
34	Regret	£9,975.00	MA Newspaper Journalism
35	Regret	£19,041.00	DPsych Counselling Psychology
36	Regret	£4,650.00	NCTJ Fast Track Diploma Journalism
37	Regret	£30,000.00	P/T Day MClindEnt (Implantology)
38	Regret	£8,730.00	GDL - Graduate Diploma in Law (Conversion Course)
39	Regret	£9,450.00	MSc Graduate Law and Dispute Resolution
40	Regret	£3,233.00	CFA Chartered Financial Analyst
41	Regret	£9,000.00	BA/BSc Liberal Arts
42	Regret	£7,575.00	PhD
43	Regret	£7,575.00	PhD
44	Regret	£5,421.00	Diploma in Art and Design
45	Regret	£3,345.00	Level 3 Foundation Diploma IT
46	Mandatory		Performing Arts Dance
47	Mandatory		PGCE Primary
48	Mandatory		Hairdressing; VTCT Level 2 & Level 3
49	Mandatory		MSc Finance
50	Mandatory		International Business
51	Mandatory		Dance
52	Mandatory		Global Creative and Cultural Industries
53	Mandatory		MA Social Work
54	Mandatory		MSc Project Management
55	Mandatory		MSc Human Nutrition
56	Mandatory		PGCE Secondary Art & Design
57	Mandatory		BSc Liberal Studies
58	Mandatory		BSc Liberal Studies
59	Mandatory		AAS Physical Assistant Program
60	Mandatory		BSc Liberal Arts
61	Mandatory		MA Creative & Cultural Industries Management
62	Mandatory		PGCE Physical Education
63	Mandatory		MA Drama therapy
64	Mandatory		PGCE Primary English
65	Mandatory		Diploma in Dance
66	Mandatory		PGCE Secondary History
67	Mandatory		MA Photography
68	Mandatory		BA International Tourism Management
69	Mandatory		BVetMed Accelerated Veterinary Medicine
70	Mandatory		MSc Psychology of Education
71	Mandatory		Foundation Degree in Fashion Design
72	Mandatory		Primary PGCE
73	Mandatory		MuDr Medicine
74	Mandatory		MSc Geographical Information Science
75	Mandatory		BSc Psychology
76	Mandatory		BTEC HND RQF Level 4 Business

77	Mandatory		PGCE Modern Foreign Languages (Spanish)
78	Mandatory		BSc Liberal Studies
79	Mandatory		MBA Business Administration
80	Mandatory		BSc Sports Development
81	Mandatory		MSc Management
82	Mandatory		BVSc Veterinary Science
83	Mandatory		PGCE Secondary Biology
84	Mandatory		MA History
85	Mandatory		PGCE Geography
86	Mandatory		PGCE Geography
87	Mandatory		Foundation Degree in Politics
88	Mandatory		Primary PGCE
89	Mandatory		MA Real Estate
90	Mandatory		Primary PGCE

2016

Application	Outcome	Tuition per annum	Course
1	Withdrew	N/A	N/A
2	Withdrew	N/A	N/A
3	Withdrew	N/A	N/A
4	Withdrew	N/A	N/A
5	Withdrew	N/A	N/A
6	Withdrew	N/A	N/A
7	Withdrew	N/A	N/A
8	Withdrew	N/A	N/A
9	Successful	£9,000.00	BSc Psychology
10	Successful	£2,000.00	MBA Executive Management
11	Successful	£7,303.78	Beauty Therapy Level 2 & 3 CIBTAC
12	Successful	£1,500.00	Certificate in Therapeutic Play Skills
13	Successful	£5,000.00	Grand Diplome Culinary Arts
14	Successful	£9,000.00	PGCE Education
15	Successful	£7,500.00	Foundation Fire Rescue Service Management
16	Successful	£1,470.00	PGDip Physician Associate Studies
17	Successful	£7,303.78	Beauty Therapy Level 2 & 3 CIBTAC
18	Successful	£7,890.00	BA Theatre Arts (Prop & Special Effects)
19	Successful	£9,000.00	PGCE Citizenship
20	Successful	£2,750.00	Postgraduate Diploma Clinical Dermatology
21	Successful	£7,575.00	PhD Researcher
22	Successful	£9,000.00	HNC Construction
23	Successful	£7,575.00	PhD Researcher
24	Successful	£5,100.00	MSc Biology and Control of Parasites and Disease Vectors
25	Successful	£9,000.00	MA Broadcast Journalism
26	Successful	£4,819.00	BSc Business and Marketing
27	Successful	£7,575.00	PhD Researcher Social Work
28	Successful	£7,575.00	PhD Researcher Corporate Sustainability
29	Regret	Fee not disclosed	MA Business Administration
30	Regret	£13,800.00	Advanced Complete Make-up Artist
31	Regret	£9,000.00	BA TESOL and Younger Learners Top-Up
32	Regret	£20,000.00	MSc Insurance and Risk Management
33	Regret	£2,700.00	Level 3 & 4 Diploma in Exercise Referral, Physical Activity and Lifestyle Strategies for managing lower back pain and Specialist Exercise
34	Regret	£5,198.59	BA Accounting
35	Regret	£3,600.00	Level 2 & 3 Diploma Fitness Instructing and Personal Training REPS

36	Regret	£6,300.00	ACCA
37	Regret	£9,000.00	BA Music & Education - Drums (Music Industry Practice)
38	Regret	£9,000.00	BA Architecture
39	Regret	Fee not disclosed	PhD Rationale Behind Face-to-Face Killing by the SS
40	Regret	£9,000.00	BA Linguistics and Hebrew
41	Regret	£7,575.00	PhD Researcher
42	Regret	£5,255.00	Musical Theatre
43	Regret	£12,000.00	GDL, Graduate Diploma in Law
44	Regret	£4,670.00	CACHE Level 3 Childcare and Education (Early Years Educator)
45	Regret	£7,575.00	PhD Researcher
46	Mandatory		Level 3 Diploma in Art & Design
47	Mandatory		GDL, Graduate Diploma in Law
48	Mandatory		BTEC Creative Media Production
49	Mandatory		BA Education Studies & Special Inclusive Needs
50	Mandatory		PGCE Primary Education & Spanish
51	Mandatory		MA Understanding and Securing Human Rights
52	Mandatory		MA Education: Pedagogy
53	Mandatory		BFA Computer Systems Integration
54	Mandatory		BTEC
55	Mandatory		BA Special Educational Needs & Disability Studies
56	Mandatory		PGDip/BSc Specialist Community Public Nurse
57	Mandatory		GDL, Graduate Diploma in Law
58	Mandatory		PGCE Citizenship
59	Mandatory		MSc Global Governance
60	Mandatory		BA Accounting
61	Mandatory		Foundation Psychology
62	Mandatory		BSc Liberal Arts
63	Mandatory		BSc Liberal Arts
64	Mandatory		BSc Sports and Exercise Science
65	Mandatory		Advanced Complete Make-up Artist
66	Mandatory		PGCE Citizenship
67	Mandatory		PGCE Primary Modern Foreign Languages
68	Mandatory		ACCA
69	Mandatory		BSc Sports Coaching, Science with Disability Sport
70	Mandatory		PGCE with QTS
71	Mandatory		MA International Development

72	Mandatory	Professional Yacht master Course & Yacht master Coastal Sail-Power Conversion, RYA MCA + Yacht master Coastal Power
73	Mandatory	Professional Yacht master Course & Yacht master Coastal Sail-Power Conversion, RYA MCA + Yacht master Coastal Power
74	Mandatory	BA English (Integrated Degree)
75	Mandatory	BA Politics
76	Mandatory	LLM/Law Practice Certificate
77	Mandatory	Diploma Artist Development Diploma in Modern Song writing
78	Mandatory	BA History
79	Mandatory	Higher Education Diploma Science
80	Mandatory	MA International Relations

2015

Application	Outcome	Tuition per annum	Course
1	Successful	£2,482.76	Fashion Design
2	Successful	£5,590	Electronic Music Production & Performance
3	Successful	£3,580.00	Osteopathy
4	Successful	£2,750.00	Business Growth Programme
5	Successful	£9,000.00	Early Years with QTS
6	Successful	£9,508.00	Music Production, Sound Engineering & Business & DJ Diploma
7	Successful	£0.00	Law
8	Successful	£9,000.00	Psychology
9	Successful	£9,000.00	Chinese Medicine; Acupuncture
10	Successful	£9,000.00	Business & Law
11	Successful	£5,150.00	Computer Systems & Electronics
12	Successful	£14,415.00	Law
13	Successful	£0.00	Sports
14	Successful	£9,000.00	Make Up & Hair
15	Successful	£0.00	Childcare
16	Successful	£18,000.00	City & Regional Planning
17	Successful	£3,465.00	Medicine
18	Successful	£5,590	Electronic Music Production & Performance
19	Successful	£9,000.00	Research Life Sciences
20	Successful	£9,000.00	Real Estate
21	Successful	£0.00	Accounting
22	Successful	£1,414.00	Engineering & Physical Sciences
23	Successful	£9,000.00	English Literature
24	Successful	£9,000.00	Shipping & Port Management
25	Successful	£18,000.00	Business Administration
26	Successful	£0.00	Product Design
27	Successful	£7,362.00	PHD History
28	Successful	£10,290.00	Graduate Diploma in Law
29	Successful	£9,000.00	Dance/ Performing Arts

2014

Application	Outcome	Tuition per annum	Course
1	Successful	£9,000.00	Business Management
2	Successful	£9,000.00	Fashion Design
3	Successful	£9,990.00	Law (GDL)
4	Successful	£12,000.00	International Business Practice
5	Successful	£3,476.00	Osteopathy
6	Successful	£2,551.00	Health & Social Care
7	Successful	£10,000.00	Creative Leadership
8	Successful	£7,250.00	Sports Therapy & Sports Injuries
9	Successful	£4,950.00	Artist Development Diploma in Modern Music
10	Successful	£8,960.00	Early Years with QTS
11	Successful	£4,950.00	Artist Development Diploma in Modern Music
12	Successful	£0.00	Health & Social Care
13	Successful	£6,000.00	Law, Social Sciences & Communications
14	Successful	£15,995.00	Intensive Cordon Bleu Diploma
15	Successful	£9,740.00	Law
16	Successful	£9,000.00	Psychology
17	Successful	£9,000.00	Chinese Medicine; Acupuncture
18	Successful	£9,000.00	Business & Law
19	Successful	£1,298.00	Sound Engineering
20	Successful	£0.00	Tattoo Design
21	Successful	£7,500.00	Computer Systems & Electronics
22	Successful	£8,125.00	Sound Engineering and Music Production
23	Successful	£4,950.00	Song writing & Musical Performance
24	Successful	£7,995.00	Professional Music Performance
25	Successful	£0.00	Childcare
26	Successful	£8,160.00	GDL
27	Successful	£0.00	City & Regional Planning
28	Successful	£3,465.00	Medicine
29	Successful	£13,995.00	Music Production, Sound Engineering, Business DJ
30	Successful	£8,037.50	Research Life Sciences
31	Successful	£4,460.00	Network Technology & Management
32	Successful	£1,350.00	English Literature
33	Successful	£9,000.00	Shipping & Port Management
34	Successful	£7,995.00	RYA MCA Professional Yacht master
35	Successful	£9,000.00	Product Design

2013

Application	Outcome	Tuition per annum	Course
1	Successful	£9,000.00	Business Management
2	Successful	£1,530.00	Art & Design
3	Successful	£3,780.00	ACCA
4	Successful	£4,000.00	Creative Leadership
5	Successful	£8,700.00	Early Years with QTS
6	Successful	£0.00	Health & Social Care
7	Successful	£9,000.00	PGCE
8	Successful	£8,250.00	Social & Cultural Anthropology
9	Successful	£3,022.00	Business & Law
10	Successful	£20,900.00	Veterinary Medicine
11	Successful	£7,695.00	Yacht master
12	Successful	£3,465.00	Business with Accounting & Finance
13	Successful	£7,255.00	Tourism Management
14	Successful	£7,500.00	Computer Systems & Electronics
15	Successful	£1,750.00	Animal Osteopathy Workshop
16	Successful	£2,055.00	Contemporary Music & Technology
17	Successful	£9,570.00	GDL Conversion
18	Successful	£9,000.00	PGCE
19	Successful	£500.00	Professional Music Performance
20	Successful	£3,465.00	Business Management
21	Successful	£9,000.00	City & Regional Planning
22	Successful	£3,465.00	Medicine
23	Successful	£7,800.00	Conservation & Biodiversity
24	Successful	£10,940.17	International Hospitality & Tourism Management
25	Successful	£11,088.00	Economics & Management
26	Successful	£0.00	CACHE Extended Diploma
27	Successful	£19,900.00	Practical Filmmaking
28	Successful	£9,000.00	English Literature
29	Successful	£9,000.00	Product Design

2012

Application	Outcome	Tuition per annum	Course
1	Successful	£4,300.00	Psychology Conversion Course
2	Successful	£12,950.00	Law (LPC; Law Practice Certificate)
3	Successful	£3,950.00	Osteopathy
4	Successful	£1,145.00	Media (Film & TV Practice)
5	Successful	£5,600.00	Travel & Tourism
6	Successful	£8,559.00	Registered Mental Nurse
7	Successful	£3,465.00	Web Development
8	Successful	£10,000.00	Chemistry/Biology
9	Successful	£0.00	PGCE
10	Successful	£0.00	Podiatry
11	Successful	£3,465.00	Social Work Studies
12	Successful	£20,900.00	University of Edinburgh
13	Successful	£8,500.00	Computer Systems & Electronics
14	Successful	£8,500.00	PGCE
15	Successful	£2,000.00	Contemporary Music & Technology
16	Successful	£4,050.00	Guitar Performance
17	Successful	£7,450.00	Drumming Performance
18	Successful	£0.00	Professional Catering Studies
19	Successful	£0.00	Registered Mental Nurse
20	Successful	£3,465.00	Medicine
21	Successful	£3,465.00	Accounting & Finance
22	Successful	£5,250.00	Environmental Hazards & Disaster Management
23	Successful	£6,500.00	Haematology
24	Successful	£5,000.00	Graduate Diploma in Law
25	Successful	£19,900.00	Practical Filmmaking
26	Successful	£2,450.00	Creative Writing
27	Successful	£9,000.00	PGCE

Q604/2017
Moorish Castle –
Plans and progress update

Clerk: Question 604. The Hon. D A Feetham.

1240 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, further to the answer to Question 120/2017, can the Government please state what plans it has for those parts of the Moorish Castle complex which formally formed part of HM Prison and/or are currently not open to the public, and what progress has the Government made with those plans?

1245 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the area of the Moorish Castle complex that formerly formed part of HM Prison is in itself made up of distinct areas with different potential, so I will deal with them separately.

1250

All areas in the complex have been cleared and asbestos removed, and this allowed for surveys of the area to be carried out.

The area containing the old dungeons and gallows is currently being considered as an extension to the tourist product. Feasibility studies have been carried out, but it is important that before final decisions are taken on its use the guarantee of throughput of tourist visitors is secured, as the site would require a substantial investment and the current trend is for few visitors to stop at the Moorish Castle complex as they tend to prioritise St Michael's Cave, the Great Siege Tunnels and Apes' Den.

1255

We are also looking at using the link as a throughput for the Northern Defences, this ensuring the sustainability of both areas and further enhancing Gibraltar's tourist offering.

1260

With regard to the old accommodation, mess halls and common areas, no decisions have been taken on their use, but one of the possibilities is as part of the World Heritage Gorham's Cave complex research facility and accommodation for visiting archaeological teams.

Government will provide further information as decisions are taken.

1265

Hon D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, just in relation to the latter part and bearing in mind that the Moorish Castle complex – and I include everything within that – is a wonderful resource and potentially a wonderful tourist attraction, those parts that are not open to the public, can the Government at least give a commitment that in principle there will be a presumption that all the areas within the Moorish Castle complex will be made open to the public at least during some months of the year and that we will not have a situation where parts of that complex are just going to be kept private for visiting professors and experts from outside Gibraltar, as indeed there are other potential tourist attractions which unfortunately are closed because of use in that respect?

1270

1275

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Yes, Mr Speaker, this is just a possibility and that would be for short periods. Different areas of the Moorish Castle complex will be suitable for different things and perhaps not all of them would be suitable for people to access on a regular basis.

Certainly the possibility of periodic opening so that people can perhaps on an accompanied basis, as was done with the Northern Defences during the course of the works that are currently still ongoing, is a possibility that I think is worth exploring.

1280

Hon. D A Feetham: And is the Government also considering retaining, for example, some of the cells that were formerly used by prisoners at HM Prison, which potentially is also a tourist attraction in itself because it shows how the complex itself has been used over the ages? I myself visited the complex when I was Minister for Justice. In fact, I visited when it had prisoners and I found it absolutely fascinating how prisoners were actually kept in the Moorish Castle – not in the best of conditions, I have to say – before we decided to build a new prison at Windmill Hill. But it is part of the history of Gibraltar and, certainly wearing my historian hat, I would think that it would be a matter of significant interest to tourists as well to see how prisoners basically lived during what was a very large period of time that this complex was used as a prison.

1285

1290

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, I am sure that can be considered.

1295

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, before we commence the next question, and whenever you consider appropriate, can I ask a supplementary in reference to Question 603, please.

Mr Speaker: Clearly the hon. Member is referring to the schedule.

1300 **Hon. E J Reyes:** The schedule, yes. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Can I ask for some clarification from the Minister for Education. I see that in the details provided for the schedule relating the parts to year 2016, areas of grants in respect of PGCEs – that is Post Graduate Certificates in Education – are recorded as mandatory. In 2017, the same thing, they are recorded as mandatory, except for application number 30 where it says
1305 ‘regret’. I interpret the word ‘regret’ to mean unsuccessful, but if they are mandatory, as the schedule shows for the previous year and for 2016 year and 2017 year, how can this one be a ‘regret’ if they were mandatory – unless there is some other information that disqualifies?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: I do not know specifically; I would have to look into it. I suspect that it
1310 probably was not mandatory or there was some other problem specific to that particular applicant, but I would need to research that and I am happy to do that and provide that information.

Hon. E J Reyes: Yes, please, Mr Speaker, whenever the Minister can, because unless there
1315 is a shift that PGCEs are not mandatory ... I am not trying to catch him out; I am just trying to be 100% clear. Are PGCEs now mandatory?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: It may be that the applicant would not fall into the category of
1320 mandatory but wants to do a PGCE maybe more years after a first degree than would normally be the case, in which case those would not be mandatory. So there may be an exception to that particular applicant who may have wanted to do teaching or maybe in a subject which was not ... I do not know the details. I can see a couple of scenarios where that could be possible, but without looking into the specifics of the case I cannot assist, and I undertake to do so.

1325
Hon. E J Reyes: Thank you, Mr Speaker, sir. I refer to you, Mr Speaker, directly now. The Minister no doubt will look into it as soon as possible. If he has an answer and is able to present it through you, Mr Speaker, during the course of this current meeting of Parliament, then it is recorded in *Hansard*. Sometimes, with the best intentions in the world, the Minister
1330 provides me on a private basis with information and then it is not recorded in *Hansard*. So, are you in agreement with me, Mr Speaker, sir, that if he does have the answer before we adjourn *sine die* it is then presented through the Chair so that it becomes part of *Hansard*?

Mr Speaker: Yes. If he can, it is obviously not a problem at all.
1335 I cannot help but comment that, really, I do not think any Members of the Opposition can expect the Minister to come to this House with detailed information about literally hundreds of scholarship awards. That is unrealistic and hon. Members of the Opposition should bear that in mind. It is unrealistic for the Minister to come with that information available, which is not in his domain in any case.

1340
Hon. D A Feetham: He did not ask that.

Hon. E J Phillips: He didn't ask that.

1345
Hon. E J Reyes: I am sorry, Mr Speaker, I certainly was not very clear. I did not have an expectation –

Mr Speaker: There is specific information that he does not have, which he can and he says
1350 he is going to make available to you. If he is able to make it available during the course of this meeting I do not mind, under the rules, allowing him to do so. That is not a problem.

Hon. E J Reyes: That is it, Mr Speaker, we are now both singing from the same hymn sheet. Thank you very much.

1355 **Hon. D A Feetham:** He is likely not to have the answer to this question, it is a long schedule, but perhaps just on the off chance that he might – and if he does not, I will look at it and ask a written question rather than an oral question next time round ... But what I do see is, for example, there are a number of entries in my area, which is law, which are discretionary grants, and you see it in 2015 at item 7, you see it at item 12, there is an item 10, and over the
1360 page again at item 3 in 2014-15. My understanding is that if you do a primary degree in law and you choose to do a Masters in law related, that would be mandatory. Does he have any information as to what this might relate to? Is this the conversion course from a primary degree, let's say in geography, and they choose to convert then to law?

1365 **Hon Dr J E Cortes:** There are various possibilities there, Mr Speaker, again without the specific detail. I am grateful to you, Mr Speaker, for your understanding of the fact that I have tried to memorise them but failed! No, but seriously, it is impossible to remember all the cases.

1370 There are a couple of scenarios. It could be a conversion from one course to another, which would need the approval of the Department, for obvious reasons.

The other thing is that postgraduate degrees and postgraduate courses as a rule are mandatory and the rule of thumb is within two years of the first degree. After two years, then they do go through a process of assessment. So, if somebody wants to do a postgraduate degree – not just in law but in general – of a subject more than two years after they have
1375 completed the first one, that is not necessarily given automatically. They tend to be given, especially if it is three years and not 10, but somebody coming back maybe 10, even 15 years afterwards would go through the selection procedure.

But again, I am happy to refer this back to the team in the Department to give me more substance in order to look at those specifics.

1380 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, I would appreciate it, and perhaps there is no need for a question if the hon. Gentleman can phone me at some stage and let me know.

The reason why I ask is because there have been parents in the past who have come to me – in fact, last year I had a number of parents telling me that the Government was not funding the conversion course from a graduate to law, which is a year's course and which in fact has
1385 always been discretionary, even in our time, and it may well be that even in our time when the GSD was in office there was a change in policy to a much more stringent look at those kinds of cases because of the number of lawyers we have in Gibraltar. But certainly I have come across it and there have been representations that have been made to me, so if the hon. Gentleman
1390 could look at that I would appreciate it.

Q605/2017

Chewing gum and cigarette butt littering – Plans to tackle problem

Clerk: Question 605. The Hon. L F Llamas.

1395 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, will the Government be looking to tackle the irresponsible littering on our streets of chewing gum and cigarette butts; and, if so, how?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):
Mr Speaker, littering is an offence and throwing chewing gum and cigarette butts in the street is no exception.

1400

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): We should ban them.

1405

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Creating awareness and, where the perpetrators can be identified, enforcement of the law will continue.

1410

I want to add that littering shows a disgusting lack of civic pride. It is imperative that every member of our community pulls their weight and ensures that they do not litter. We must do better as a nation with all aspects of litter and waste and that means primarily rediscovering our civic pride. The Government roundly condemns all those who litter, all those who do not clean up after their dogs and all those who fly tip. As a community we must mature into extending the pride we have for the inside of our homes equally to the common areas of this small but great nation we call home. That is the only long-term solution and the only way to really help the employees of Master Service, who do such a good job, as the Chief Minister, I and all the Government reflected in our motion last week.

1415

1420

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, I could not agree more with the comments made by the Hon. Minister, but could he or the Government perhaps consider encouraging people and perhaps legislating that, for example, the people who are chewing gum or smoking on our streets do carry portable disposables to then deposit them rather than be allowed to throw them in the street? Obviously, it is very difficult to patrol – you cannot be patrolling absolutely everybody – but if at least the person who is smoking is asked whether they have a portable disposable ashtray with them, then at least maybe that could be a potential idea that the Government could consider.

1425

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: This is something we should all encourage. Whether we should pass a law that makes it an offence not to carry something like this is something that should be the subject of a larger debate, but it is something we should all encourage and it is not just something that the Government should do but each of us as individuals. The people we know who do litter and drop their cigarette butts and chewing gum and so on, we should make sure that it is not acceptable to us and is something that clearly we will continue to do.

1430

Q606/2017

Lighthouse at Europa Point – Plans and estimated cost

Clerk: Question 606. The Hon. L F Llamas.

1435

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government explain what the plans are for the plot of land by the lighthouse at Europa Point and the estimated cost involved?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1440

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):
Mr Speaker, there will be a landscaped public area which will hold interpretation relevant to the World Heritage Site, as well as benches and paths. As an open area it will allow spectacular views of the Strait and will be enjoyed by residents and tourists alike.

The cost is estimated at £42,000.

1445 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, I thank the Hon. Minister for the response and especially that progress is being made to beautify the area, which was very much in need of a little bit of TLC.

Does that mean then that the Government has abandoned the expression of interest which it invited in the community and will now pursue this venture instead?

1450 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, the Government took a view that, considering the construction, albeit low-scale and low-level construction, that there is going to be in the Europa Point area towards the west with the new sporting facilities, in order to maintain the open space at Europa Point, which had been the subject of a lot of public engagement during the time of the former stadium proposal by the GFA, we would like to keep this area open and available to the public. So the Government took the view that we would not progress on that and instead open it up, landscape it and use the bunker at the moment as an area where we will be placing interpretation panels in relation to the area and to the World Heritage site, and we feel that we are giving this back to the people as an open area.

1455

Q607-608/2017

Maintenance of green and planted public areas – Contracts and payments to entities

1460 **Clerk:** Question 607. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a schedule of how much has been paid to each entity since December 2011 in relation to the maintenance of Gibraltar's green and planted public areas?

1465

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1470 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 608.

Clerk: Question 608, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1475 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, what contract exists between Government and entities for the maintenance of green planted public areas in Gibraltar, including the Upper Rock Nature Reserve?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1480

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is in the schedules which I now hand over.

1485 In relation to the second question, this is for planted areas excluding the Upper Rock as no contract exists for the maintenance of the Upper Rock other than some aspects of cleaning which are part of the overall cleaning contract that has now gone to tender. If I may just explain,

the works on the Upper Rock are carried out by a team that is directly under the Department of the Environment and is not a contracted service.

Answer to Question No.608/2017

Answer to Question No.607/2017

Schedule of payments made for each entity from December 2011 to September 2017

	ENTITY A	ENTITY B	ENTITY C
December 2011 to March 2012	£123,642.68	£26,626.35	£45.00
2012/2013	£518,631.47	£121,444.23	£180.00
2013/2014	£555,833.51	£114,747.30	£195.00
2014/2015	£573,442.83	£109,504.99	£180.00
2015/2016	£565,761.73	£110,049.72	£180.00
2016/2017	£563,278.50	£110,399.72	£180.00
2017 to date	£376,690.89	£55,669.86	£1,880.00

Information on the Contracts between GoG and entities for maintenance of green/planted public areas, excluding Upper Rock *

		Monthly Contract
Entity A	Contract 1 & 2	£37,706.40
	Contract dtd 9/2/99	£2,732.48
	Contract dtd 23/11/98	£2,351.55
	Monthly Agreements	£6,414.66
Entity B	Monthly Agreements	£9,293.31
Entity C	Monthly Agreements	£275.00

Upper Rock team carries out any maintenance within the Upper Rock Nature Reserve

£0.00

*No contract exists for the Upper Rock

Clerk: Question 609. The Hon. L F Llamas.

1490

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, before I pass on to the next question, when the Hon. Minister has answered his question on 608 and referred to entity A, B and C, is it that the Government is unable to disclose the names of these entities?

1495

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, it is normal practice when we are asked – and certainly I have done this before in relation to questions to do with the Upper Rock and people owing money and so on – not to identify the companies. I have no problem in doing that behind your Chair, Mr Speaker.

1500

Let me just, by way of clarification, say that entity A, B and C are the same entity A, B and C in the two schedules; it is not two different entities A, B and C. So it is the same companies that are identified as entities A, B and C in each of the schedules. But at this point in time and without notice to them, I would rather not mention them by name.

1505

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): There is no question, Mr Speaker, of the Government disclosing the identity of a debtor to the Government across the floor of the House.

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: No, these are not debtors.

1510

Hon. Chief Minister: Oh, sorry, I thought we were dealing with the debtors question.

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: No. If I may just clarify, Mr Speaker, the debtors were the subject of another question, where we have not identified. I am sorry if I misled the House – it was not intentional, it was just by way of example.

1515

So that is the reason. Perhaps we could do that. I would be more comfortable if I did not, but for no reason other than their own privacy and not having consulted them as to whether they particularly want this done. But it is not a secret and I am willing to share it.

Q609-10/2017

O'Hara's Battery and Mount Misery Glass Lookout – When open to the public

Clerk: Question 609. The Hon. L F Llamas.

1520

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government state since October 2016 which dates has O'Hara's Battery been open to the general public?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1525

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 610.

Clerk: Question 610. The Hon. L F Llamas.

1530

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government update this House as to when the expected opening date for Mount Misery Glass Lookout is and why the delay of over a year in opening it?

1535 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, in answer to Question 609, every day except 25th December and 1st January.

1540 And to Question 610, the Mount Misery Glass Lookout, known as the Skywalk, will open this year. The delay has been largely attributable to the fact that additional works have had to be carried out in the vicinity of the Skywalk in order to make the area safe for visitors.

1545 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, with regard to O'Hara's Battery, again I do not pass very often but I am told, other than when I do pass through there, that the gates have remained closed pretty much since October last year, and especially the exhibition I do not believe has ever been opened.

With regard to Mount Misery, does the Hon. Minister have an estimated date of when it will open in the coming months?

1550 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, in relation to O'Hara's Battery I am surprised that he has found the gates closed. The information that I have is that it has only closed in December and January. The exhibition specifically I will have to enquire as to that, but the question related to O'Hara's Battery as a battery and that is the answer I have prepared.

1555 With regard to the Glass Lookout, the problem there was that in assessing the surrounding area, which includes Douglas Path and some of the roadway in that area, with an expected increased throughput there were concerns expressed as to the safety of the path and we have had to carry out works, which has meant putting in some bannisters and so on just to ensure, without spoiling the natural look of the area, that it is not unsafe. I am told that most of the works on the path itself are now complete. There may be one or two other things that we need
1560 to do on the side of the road, but I could not be absolutely sure as to when that will be finished.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q611/2017

Moorish Castle, Great Siege Tunnels and St Michael's Cave – Visitor numbers

Clerk: Question 611. The Hon. L F Llamas.

1565 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, since December 2011 can the Government provide a weekly schedule with statistics relating to the amount of persons who have visited (a) Moorish Castle; (b) Great Siege Tunnels and (c) St Michael's Cave.

1570 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1575 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I am able to provide this information only for the period since April 2015, since that is the date from which computerised records are available of this statistic. Manual compilation will take more resources than it is reasonably practicable to apply to such an exercise. Therefore, Mr Speaker, we are working on getting as much as we can and when we have had some additional years then I will be providing that, but I have not been able to do so because it would

have been for a very short period. This is something that we will be taking on longer term and I have no doubt that the hon. Member will remind us if he does not receive it.

Q612/2017
Class sizes –
Projected numbers

1580 **Clerk:** Question 612. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a schedule of the projected number of pupils in each class as at the start of each academic year since December to September 2012, stating (a) the year the class relates to; (b) the school the class belongs to; (c) 1585 the number of children with special educational needs and (d) the number of learning support assistants per class?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education. 1590

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, I am handing over a schedule to the hon. Member which contains information which is relevant to his question.

1595 However, as I mentioned to the hon. Member in my reply to Question 494, class sizes, issues relating to special educational needs and indeed the consequent deployment of support are constantly changing. Classes shrink and grow as children move across sets, enrol or leave midway through a term, complete core modules and are then subdivided to complete topics of choice. A child's needs today are different from tomorrow, additional temporary help will be 1600 needed at different stages of a child's journey and no stone is left unturned to ensure that this support is afforded every time.

The schedule provided will give the hon. Member a yearly snapshot of the students in each of the years in each of our schools, the total number of students with special educational needs in each school and the number of special needs learning support assistance deployed across our schools. 1605

Pupils per Year in Gibraltar Schools: 2013/14

School Name	School Year																																	
	N		R		1		2		3		4		5		6		7		8		9		10		11		12		13		2013/14			
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F		
SEN	64	42	42	55	35	45	41	45	50	55	37																							
St Josephs First	64	29	23	28	28	25	28	27	18	21	21																							
St Mary's First	52	20	21	32	35	37	40	37	39	40	25																							
St Paul's First	60	25	9	18	14	16	11	15	15	17																								
St Bernard's First	53	27	32	33	32	37	33	29	23	32	30																							
Governor's Meadow	67	24	36	32	29	32	44	38	27	31	22																							
Notre Dame	19			9	13	5	10	13	8	7	10	5	14	13	7	8	13																	
Hebrew Primary	68	12	3																															
St Martin's Special	84																																	
Bishop Fitzgerald	70																																	
St Anne's	105																																	
Sacred Heart Middle	44																																	
St Joseph's Middle	147																																	
Westside	277																																	
Bayside																																		

Pupils per Year in Gibraltar Schools: 2015/16

School Name	School Year																																			
	N		R		1		2		3		4		5		6		7		8		9		10		11		12		13		2015/16					
	SEN	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F					
St Josephs First	74	45	31	43	47	56	51	46	52	45	43																									
St Mary's First	63	15	15	27	31	42	31	30	25	24	27																									
St Paul's First	35	21	21	35	31	35	44	36	37	37	37																									
St Bernard's First	36	20	17	23	18	29	11	20	19	18	11																									
Governor's Meadow	50	23	19	35	28	39	38	38	32	38	33																									
Notre Dame	91	25	30	34	33	38	45	39	33	37	47																									
Hebrew Primary	26			6	13	9	8	9	15	4	9	12	8	7	10	3	13	14	0																	
St Martin's Special	83	14	3																																	
Bishop Fitzgerald	108											52	46	60	44	50	53	51	54																	
St Anne's	102											63	44	50	44	69	50	58	53																	
St Bernard's Middle	110											40	43	44	44	26	31	47	39																	
St Joseph's Middle	42											44	44	46	53	56	50	47	56																	
Westside	170																			166																
Bayside	296																			195																
																					190															
																					199															
																					227															
																					220															
																					220															
																					162															
																					143															
																					173															
																					227															
																					108															
																					142															

SNLA's Employed: 78
 Long term needs of service: 16

Pupils per Year in Gibraltar Schools: 2017/18

School Name	School Year																																				
	N		R		1		2		3		4		5		6		7		8		9		10		11		12		13		2017/18						
	SEN	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F						
St Josephs First	*	44	41	34	44	52	42	47	53	54	54																										
St Mary's First	*	11	21	24	17	23	18	25	28	43	31																										
St Paul's First	*	20	20	33	40	40	43	29	30	35	43																										
St Bernard's First	*	21	20	26	17	22	14	22	24	32	13																										
Governor's Meadow	*	31	11	39	34	35	28	38	29	40	37																										
Notre Dame	*			39	28	47	44	33	34	43	41																										
Varyl Begg Nursery	*	19	35																																		
Hebrew Primary	*			9	8	12	9	5	12	7	9	9	17	4	8	10	6	9	9																		
St Martin's Special	*	11	5																															34	16		
Bishop Fitzgerald	*											66	44	56	64	53	48	57	44																		
St Anne's	*											57	49	53	61	65	40	48	43																		
St Bernard's Middle	*											40	46	37	36	43	41	34	37																		
St Joseph's Middle	*											59	49	51	46	45	43	44	51																		
Westside	*																																				
Bayside	*																																				
Gibraltar College	*																																			131	187

* SEN statistics are sent to Department for Statistics every June

SNLA's Employed: 78

Long term needs of service: 21

Mr Speaker: This is a lengthy schedule. We can come back to it, if necessary.
We move on to Question 613.

1615

Clerk: Question 613. The Hon. L F Llamas.

1620

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, could I just ask, relating to Question 612 and the schedule we have just received, whether it is possible to get a breakdown per class rather than the year itself?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, we had a fairly lengthy discussion last time. I suppose it is possible again to give a snapshot per class.

1625

I would very much appreciate, perhaps behind your Chair, if I understood what information the Hon. Mr Llamas wants to extract. If he then wants to throw something back at me, it is his perfect right to do so, but I am not sure how it would assist, and before I ask the team once again – after, despite our discussion last time, they have produced this one – to go back and divide all these into specific classes, which is again an onerous task ... I just do not understand the logic, but this is not perhaps for now.

1630

I will go back and enquire, but I am a little bit concerned, as we said last time, at the number of resources we would have to put into this at a time when we are trying to do other things with our education, even though the hon. Member clearly does not like the word ‘revolution’.

Q613/2017

Schools –

Annual health and safety checks

Clerk: Question 613. The Hon. L F Llamas.

1635

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm that as from January 2012 it has carried out annual health and safety audits of each school in Gibraltar? If so, can it provide the reports with the recommendations, including (a) recommendation resolved and (b) those which remain unresolved?

1640

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1645

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the main health and safety audit for public school buildings was completed by the Health and Safety Officer for Technical Services in January 2013 as others had been carried out by the former administration.

The recommendations have been met or are in the process of being met. Smaller-scale reviews are carried out on an ongoing basis and it is not Government policy to publish these reports, which are of an internal technical nature.

1650

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, does the Minister then confirm ... or is he saying there have not been annual reports and surveys carried out as they promised in 2011 in their manifesto?

1655

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, there was one large report – ‘large’ is probably not the right word, but an intensive report – in January 2013, and then subsequently, on an ongoing basis, using that as a basis there have been smaller scale assessments. They have not been of the same level because there was a need to establish a base line, and following on that, the smaller scale

reviews based on how we have moved on from there, what has and has not been done, are being carried out. I think that is the distinction I have to make between them.

1660

Hon. L F Llamas: And therefore, Mr Speaker, if smaller surveys have been carried out, can the Minister confirm that these have been consistently applied equally through all the schools and they have been done on more or less an annual basis?

1665

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, I am not aware of the detail. The headteachers will, in conjunction with the relevant officers in the Department of Education, review any health and safety issues that there may be in the different schools. Quite what the format of that is I do not have all the details, but this is done on an ongoing basis to ensure that our schools are safe for students and staff alike.

1670

Hon. E J Reyes: May I, Mr Speaker, refer to the schedule the Minister gave out in reply to Question 612? On that schedule, except for the year pertaining to 2017-18, the academic year, that schedule at the very bottom of 2017-18 gives me figures for the Gibraltar College, but in all the previous years, although there is a list of schools there are no statistics at all provided in respect of pupils in the college. It could be an error, just outside the page when the printing was done, or the Minister has not been provided with it.

1675

Can I ask the Minister, if possible, can he search out the information in respect of the college and provide as and when humanly possible?

1680

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Yes, Mr Speaker, it appears that the table has been truncated at some stage. The one I originally saw digitally I believe included them all. It may be that at some stage in the preparation or the printing the Gibraltar College has been left out and I will endeavour to have an amended one provided very soon.

1685

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, if I may, on the question of health and safety audits at the schools can I just ask the Minister to confirm that it is the case that, in normal circumstances, matters of health and safety at schools, and indeed in any building, are the responsibility of the management of that building and that therefore routine health and safety issues would be dealt with by the management and would certainly not be a matter that the Government would routinely have to become involved in, unless a matter of great importance or great cost were identified as being an issue?

1690

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, yes. It would be the headteacher in liaison with the Department who would deal with routine health and safety matters on a daily basis, and these things – and I am grateful to the hon. Member for having given me the opportunity to confirm this – would be dealt with on a daily basis. If any issue arises or if there was anything major which required more extensive assessment or more allocation of funds, then it would be taken at a different level, absolutely.

1695

1700

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, just in relation to the questions that have been asked in relation to education and the statistics that have been presented by the Minister, is the Minister aware, given the statistics that he has presented, what the optimum class size is for our schools?

1705

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, my hon. Friend and former teacher has assisted me in this. This was the figure that I had in my head. It is 20 for first schools, 25 for middle schools, and in secondary schools it will depend, because clearly we are looking at different options and different scenarios and you cannot have a hard and fast one. That is the optimum that we certainly aim at.

1710 **Hon. E J Phillips:** I am grateful for the answer.

I appreciate that there will be a little give in relation to those numbers, plus or minus two either way, but is the Government satisfied, is the Minister satisfied, that there is not an oversubscription in those class sizes that would cause some concern?

1715 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the information that I have provided, because it is not divided into classes, is something that I cannot give the details – I have not been asked for that information.

1720 What I can say is that the population of young people in Gibraltar is increasing. If I may just give an example, when I became Minister for Health the average birth rate was about 400 and now it is closer to 500 consistently. So clearly the population of children in Gibraltar is increasing, which is something that we will absolutely assume in the new schools because we are building them looking towards the future and we do everything we can in order to maintain these ratios. How successful we are and how many may have a slight oversubscription I am not able to say right now because I do not have those figures with me.

1725 **Hon. E J Phillips:** I appreciate the answer to that question. I think it was a question that was alluded to by my hon. Friend Mr Llamas in relation to his question on class sizes. I think his question did ask about that and I appreciate the difficulty in obtaining statistics on that.

1730 The reason why I asked this question is that many of us do have young children in schools and many people I speak to and parents I speak to are concerned about classroom sizes generally. I am not saying that there is a concern but often a question that is asked is about classroom sizes, and that is why I asked whether the Minister was satisfied with the present situation, given the increasing numbers of students and particularly given, of course, the increasing complement as per the manifesto commitment on page 69.

1735 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Well, the increase in our population of children is something that, as I have said before, we must recognise as a fact, and this is why we are doing major reforms to provide new and refurbished schools which will take this completely into account within the next two years.

Q614/2017
Two-story portakabins –
Modifications

1740 **Clerk:** Question 614. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide details and costs of modifications made to the two-storey portakabins after 1st September 2017 and when the instruction to make these modifications was given?

1745 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1750 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, works to enclose a staircase were undertaken during the beginning of September. However, these modifications were commissioned as part of the modular installation and not after it was positioned. These include: (1) the staircase enclosure with window to allow natural lighting; (2) non-slip paint on stair treads; (3) air-conditioning.

1755 The only works requested by the headteacher after the modular installation are two gates that have been placed at the top and bottom of the staircase respectively. The costs of these modifications amounts to £12,773.

1760 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, I would like to ask the Minister why, when this issue blew up, especially in the public domain, did he not provide parents and the public at large with assurances that ... not saying that I agree with the portakabins, but the main concern was the fact that the staircase was in the rain, the children were going to have to go up, it would be dark in the early hours of the morning, and more than anything the fact that obviously the staircase was in fact in the open air. Why didn't the Minister give these assurances at the time, rather than just defend the portakabins as a necessity of having to expand?

1765 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I really do not understand the question: why did I not ...? Mr Speaker, what gives the hon. Member the impression that he knows what I did or did not say to the parents when I met them?

1770 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Well, Mr Speaker, but publicly, at least, I have not been in any meetings with you and the parents, but publicly there has been no clarification on the fact that the portakabins had not yet been fully commissioned, even though they were being used, and that further modifications were on the way.

1775 When I asked last month with regard to the cost, again the Minister did not say that there was an additional expenditure pending in modifications which had to be undertaken which had yet not been finalised.

1780 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, there is a long list of things that I have not said, because I have not said more things than I have said. There are lots of things that I know about that I do day to day that I do not issue press releases on or that I do not do YouTube movies on – because I have actually got work to do. (**A Member:** Ooh!)

1785 Mr Speaker, the hon. Member is the only person who made a public condemnation of this situation and I was responding to the people who I answer to, which is the people of Gibraltar, the children and the parents of the school. I met with them – I had several meetings. I gave them my reassurances. I did not have to fall into the trap of just answering Mr Llamas on Facebook or whatever. I am satisfied that the meetings with the parents went well, they were given these reassurances and that I have executed my duties in this respect absolutely.

1790 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

Clerk: Question 615. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Does Government have any updates in connection with –

1795 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I am just conscious of the time and I wonder whether that might be a convenient moment –

Mr Speaker: There are questions for the Minister for Education – can't we deal with those?

1800 **Hon. Chief Minister:** I am afraid, Mr Speaker, that, given the time, there are other commitments on this side of the House that we have to attend to.

Mr Speaker: He has commitments now? Five minutes to answer the questions.

1805 **Hon. Chief Minister:** No, Mr Speaker, this side has –

Mr Speaker: The answers are very short.

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, I move that the House should therefore now recess to 2.30 in the afternoon.

1810

Mr Speaker: Two thirty, very well.

The House recessed at 1.00 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 2.30 p.m.