



PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

MORNING SESSION: 10.13 a.m. – 12.55 p.m.

Gibraltar, Wednesday, 20th September 2017

Contents

Order of the Day	3
Suspension of Standing Orders	3
Suspension of Standing Order 7.1 – Social Security (Open Long-Term Benefits Scheme) Act 1997 – Social Security (Open Long-Term Benefits Scheme) (Amendment of Benefits) Order 2017 – Motion carried	3
Questions for Oral Answer	4
Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.....	4
Q463/2017 Bluefin tuna – Tonnage caught last season	4
Q464/2017 Gibraltar Nature Reserve – Removal of invasive species	5
Q465/2017 Dog fouling – DNA test samples and resulting fines	5
Q466/2017 Sewage outflow at Europa – Bacteriological samples.....	6
Q467/2017 Climate change – Programme and action plan	9
Q468/2017 Climate and Clean Air Coalition – Local initiatives	10
Q469/2017 'In Town Without My Car' day – 2017 and 2018.....	11
Q470-471/2017 Black carbon – Monitoring and results	11
Q472/2017 Cooking oil – Volume recycled	12
Q473/2017 Energy efficient home improvements – Fund and grants.....	13
Q474-476/2017 Production of electricity – Monthly fuel burned by power stations; Commission of new power station.....	13

Q477/2017 Littering offences – Fines and prosecutions	14
Q478-479/2017 T levels – Proposed introduction	15
Q480/2017 Energy drinks – Age restrictions	16
Q481/2017 Cinema under the Stars – Event not held	17
Q482/2017 Waterport Fountain – Inactivity	19
Q483/2017 Swift bird nest webcam – Installation costs	19
Q484/2017 Medusa nets – Purchase costs since 2011	19
Q485/2017 Fix my Street app – Launch and cost	20
Q486/2017 Dumping of household refuse – Main Street and surrounding streets	21
Q487-492/2017 Public area cleaning – Schedule of flushing down; Government rental estates; Contract with Master Services	22
Q493/2017 Project Search – Progress report	33
Q494/2017 School classrooms – Class sizes, children with special education needs, learning support assistants	34
Q495-506/2017 St Martin’s School – Portacabins, new school buildings and bus	38
Q507/2017 School classrooms – Adequate heating	43
Q508/2017 School lunches – Update	43
Q509/2017 Supply teachers – Government policy	44
Q510, Q522-528, Q535-537/2017 Health care – Hospital escalator; Septicaemia cases; GHA Tertiary Referrals Board and sponsored patients; Cancellation of medical procedures; Chemotherapy treatment; UK GMC registration	44
Q511-520, Q531-533/2017 Police and judicial matters – Parole drug tests; Release of Isaac Marrache; Judicial Services Commission; Director of Public Prosecutions; Trial waiting times; Civil claims and criminal actions before the Supreme Court; Police manning levels; Armed patrol boat officers; Supreme Court Judge’s contract; Young offenders	55
Q521/2017 Social care abroad – Repatriation of service users	62
Q529-530 and Q534/2017 Primary Care Centre – Online appointment cancellation; Calls to the centre; New health visitor	63
<i>The House adjourned at 12.55 p.m.</i>	65

The Gibraltar Parliament

The Parliament met at 10.13 a.m.

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: P E Martinez Esq *in attendance*]

Order of the Day

SUSPENSION OF STANDING ORDERS

**Suspension of Standing Order 7.1 –
Social Security (Open Long-Term Benefits Scheme) Act 1997 –
Social Security (Open Long-Term Benefits Scheme) (Amendment of Benefits) Order 2017 –
Motion carried**

Mr Speaker: The Hon. Gilbert Licudi.

Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, I beg to move under Standing Order 7(3) to suspend Standing Order 7(1) in order to proceed with a Government motion.

Mr Speaker: Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.
The Hon. Gilbert Licudi.

Hon. G H Licudi: Mr Speaker, I have the honour to move the motion standing in my name which reads as follows:

“That this House approve by Resolution, pursuant to section 46 of the Social Security (Open Long-Term Benefits Scheme) Act 1997, the making of the Social Security (Open Long-Term Benefits Scheme) (Amendment of Benefits) Order 2017.”

5 Mr Speaker, this Order seeks to amend the Social Security (Open Long-Term Benefits Scheme) Act 1997 by increasing the rates of Survivor’s Benefits, Guardian’s Allowance and Old Age Pensions by 2.7%, with effect from 1st August 2017, which represents the annual increase for that year.

10 These increases are in line with the announcements made by the Chief Minister in his Budget address. In that address, the Chief Minister said:

Old Age Pensions will increase this year in line with a rate of inflation of 2.7% so that the single rate for Old Age Pension would increase from £440.54 by £11.90 to £452.44 and the couple rate would increase from £660.85 by £17.85 to £678.70. The dependent rate will grow from £220.31 by £5.95 to £226.26, and the same cash differentials will be maintained with a Minimum Income Guarantee as in previous years.

As required by the Act, these changes can only be given effect by order which follows a motion which is approved by resolution of this House.

Mr Speaker, I commend the motion to the House.

15 **Mr Speaker:** I now propose the question in the terms of the motion moved by the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port. Does any Member wish to speak on the motion?

I now put the question in the terms of the motion proposed by the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port. Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.)
20 Those against? Carried.

Questions for Oral Answer

ENVIRONMENT, ENERGY, CLIMATE CHANGE AND EDUCATION

Q463/2017

Bluefin tuna – Tonnage caught last season

Clerk: We now return to answers to Oral Questions. We commence with Question 463 and the questioner is the Hon. T N Hammond.

25 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for the Environment state what has been the tonnage of Bluefin tuna caught during this last season?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

30 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the decision to halt the tuna fishing season was taken on Wednesday 13th September when the total was reported at 15.662 tonnes. The necessary administrative time to give effect to the closure of the season resulted in the final total being 16.109 tonnes.

35 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, I thank the Minister for his response. I do note this year, due to the process, we are a tonne over and of course we have already increased the limits during this year by three tonnes, I believe.

40 Does the Minister consider in future – because we understand now, or we are starting to understand, that the time of closure of the season to the time of the reaction to that closure ... there is an interval – whether the dates should be anticipated in a way that may allow us to come closer to the actual figure that is permitted to be fished?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, the amount caught is 0.6 tonnes over the 15.5 tonnes total allowable catch. It is very difficult to tell because, as in everything else in nature, it is not totally
45 predictable and there will be varying sizes of fish in the area at any given time and the weather will make fishing more or less possible. So it is very difficult to predict and therefore we always run the risk – you are never going to hit exactly 15.5 tonnes; we always run the risk that at the end of a particular day when the totals are tallied up you are going to be just over. Had the limit when this was reported on the 13th been, 15.4 tonnes, a similar decision would have been taken
50 and then if the weather had been bad the next day no more would have been caught.

So obviously we will try to fine tune, but because of the nature of the game it is difficult to hit exactly 15.5 tonnes.

55 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Could the Minister just provide me with his view reference to the overall figure and whether it would be better to always be a little under than a little over, if possible?

60 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, it would be nicer to be a little under than a little over, but it is not possible to fine tune it to that extent. One can only react to the figures that are ... obviously not me personally, but the team, when it arrives at a figure which is close or just over would report to me because I then have to issue the order to close the season.

So hopefully, as I say, in future, it may be possible to hit it a little under, but I cannot guarantee that 100%. I am just being honest about the reality.

Q464/2017
Gibraltar Nature Reserve –
Removal of invasive species

65 **Clerk:** Question number 464, the Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, what work has been carried out by Government towards the removal of invasive species within the Gibraltar Nature Reserve?

70 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the removal of invasive species has continued as part of the routine operations carried out by the Nature Reserve Management Team. Areas that have been targeted recently include the main roads and firebreaks in the Upper Rock and Europa Advance Road.

75

Q465/2017
Dog fouling –
DNA test samples and resulting fines

Clerk: Question number 465, the Hon. T N Hammond.

80 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, how many samples of dog fouling have been collected for DNA testing and how many fines have been issued following on from such testing?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

85 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, a total of 67 samples have been collected for DNA testing. No fines have been issued to date as we are currently waiting for the laboratory results.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, what is a normal turnaround time for the laboratory to provide the results?

90

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: We are told it is up to six weeks, but unfortunately the lab was closed during the month of August, which explains the delay in getting the results back in the time that we had expected. The collections are batched, so it is not that if you collect a sample today it is sent today; they are batched for a couple of weeks so that you have enough to send over to make it obviously more economic. But the delay has been that the laboratory in question was closed for the month of August.

95

Hon. T N Hammond: Forgive me, the Minister may have answered this but I did miss it. When do you anticipate then the results coming back to us?

100

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Sorry, we should get the first batch of the first sent over, I would have assumed, within the next week or two.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q466/2017
Sewage outflow at Europa –
Bacteriological samples

105

Clerk: Question number 466, the Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, further to question 324 of 2016, can the Minister say how many bacteriological samples have been collected from around the sewage outflow at Europa, from where those samples were collected and describe the results of that sampling?

110

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the monitoring programme for the Europa Point outfall consists of five sampling points at different distances from the outfall. The locations are depicted in the schedule that I now hand over, for ease of communication. It is a map of Gibraltar with the sites. These consist of three investigative and two surveillance monitoring sampling points.

115

One hundred and two investigative monitoring samples have been collected since 2015. All investigative results obtained were within the applicable standards under the Bathing Water Directive.

120

In turn, 135 surveillance monitoring samples have been collected since 2015. One sample collected failed the applicable standards in December 2016, but it was not possible to attribute the exact source of this exceedance.

125

Q466 Schedule:



130 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, could the Minister just clarify, I am not entirely clear of the difference between the investigative and the monitoring methodology.

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Certainly, sorry, apologies if that was not clear.

135 The monitoring ones are the ones that are done continuously and regularly through the year. The surveillance monitoring are those that appear yellow in the attachment; they are routine. They are the Little Bay and Sandy Bay, and those are done throughout the year.

The other ones are additional ones that are carried out in order to see whether there is a problem with the sewage outfall. Those are done in batches, so if there has not been anything adverse over a period of time then we may not collect for the next couple of months and then we start again.

140 So we have got the routine ones. If the routine ones should show any higher than normal then we trigger off the others to see whether there is a problem. So they both work in tandem.

Hon. T N Hammond: I do thank the Minister for that answer and I note that there do not appear to be any collections points or monitoring points either to the south of the outfall, or indeed within 500 m. I presume there is a reason for that, but could the Minister explain?

145

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Yes, the experts tell me that the currents tend to move, on most occasions – obviously there will be occasions when things are different, but routinely would move – the outflow away; and clearly what we are doing here is monitoring. Any negative results would more likely affect bathers and therefore our main concern is what is working its way up the east side to our beaches, which is why the three points are between Europa Point and Sandy Bay, because we want to see if there is anything happening, we want to catch it on the way and that is why it is skewered to that direction.

150

It is most likely that the currents would move any water which was not acceptable in that direction, which is why we do it ... We obviously cannot sample continuously along so we have to pick and that is done in order to catch any problem that there might be making its way from the sewage outflow to the beaches. As you have seen, fortunately, there does not appear, certainly when we have done the monitoring, to be such a problem.

155

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, I fully accept that the primary reason for monitoring would be to protect public health and the beaches and the bathing laws, to understand if there are any issues arising there.

160

But I would ask: would the Minister consider carrying out sampling perhaps at one or two points to the south for a more general understanding of the impact of our sewage outflow and its impact on the environment in general, rather than just on bathers.

165

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: I do not think we have to take samples to know that there is faecal matter going into the sea. Therefore, clearly, if you sample just at the outflow you are going to get a high count, further away it is going to be less, and we know that there is going to be sewage there. All we are going to do is prove what we already know. We know that there is a problem there; we know we are committed to tackling it, as I repeatedly said, here and in other venues.

170

So the resources are going into seeing whether it is causing, or potentially causing, a problem to bathers. Clearly, there are other environmental issues which concern me as much as anybody else and probably more than a lot of others, but it would not be necessary because we know there is sewage going out there. So all we are going to do is show what we already know. I do not think that it would be an efficient use of our resources.

175

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, I do not entirely agree with the Minister.

Clearly, we do know that there is sewage and faecal matter going into the sea. The reason I ask whether monitoring would be worthwhile in those other areas or areas to the south is more to do with an understanding of how those dispersal patterns happen, as you would with a smoke plume, perhaps, in an area. You want to know how quickly it disperses, whether it remains concentrated for longer, whether tides and currents affect it in a certain way, and really for scientific purposes in order for us to understand the impact on the environment.

180

I would again ask whether the Minister would consider allotting some resource – I am not suggesting we allocate the same resource, but some resource – to conduct in the scientific work that would be necessary – perhaps it is something the University can help with, I do not know – to better understand the environmental impact of that sewage outflow.

185

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, it would be wonderful to have data on everything and clearly anybody who wants to undertake a scientific study would be more than encouraged to do so. Whether doing work which will state the obvious is a legitimate use of Government funding, is the question – particularly when it is a problem we know we will be solving. If it were in order to justify not wanting to treat sewage, that is one thing, but we are not in that game. Therefore,

190

195 obviously I will discuss it with my team if they see there is any value to it, but at the moment I think our resources would be better used elsewhere. That is just the view that I hold.

Mr Speaker: Before we move on, the last word that the Minister uses in his answer is 'exceedance'. I have always been very interested in correct English usage. I cannot find the word in any of these two small dictionaries. I would be grateful if he would let me know privately what
200 is the source of that word, 'exceedance'.

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, I will let you know publicly. It was drafted by the people who drafted my answer so I will pass the question on to them.

205 **Mr Speaker:** Maybe they found it in some American dictionary!

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Possibly, Mr Speaker.

Mr Speaker: Next question.
210

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, my prize possession is the 24-volume Oxford English Dictionary, which is now in its last edition in print and I find, in particular when playing scrabble, that any word one can come up with you will find exists – especially if it has an 'x' or a 'z' in it, will produce a lot of points. I shall look when I get back at the lunchtime adjournment in that volume to see whether 'exceedance' is there and, if not, I shall ensure that the hon. Gentleman corrects those who have come up with a new word or submit it for inclusion in the
215 next edition! (*Banging on desks*)

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, if I may, having access, as one has now, to Oxford Dictionary online ...
220

Mr Speaker: I am informed by the Clerk that 'exceedance' is now in the Oxford Dictionary!

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: He beat me to it, Mr Speaker, and I will now not have to reprimand the
225 people who drafted my answer!

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q467/2017
Climate change –
Programme and action plan

Clerk: Question number 467, the Hon. T N Hammond.

230 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, I was going to ask for the definition, if you did not mind, of 'exceedance', but as it is in the public domain, I suppose I will have to look it up myself! (*Interjections and laughter*)

Question 467. Mr Speaker, further to question 325 of 2016, has the Government published a climate change programme and an associated action plan?
235

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):
240 Mr Speaker, the revised draft plan will be discussed by the Climate Change Forum, at its meeting
on 19th October; and before the questioner asks me, the meeting had been scheduled before I
actually had sight of the questions.

Mr Speaker: Next question.
245

Q468/2017
Climate and Clean Air Coalition –
Local initiatives

Clerk: Question number 468, the Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, further to question 20 of 2017, can the Minister say if any
250 local initiatives have been derived from the participation in the Climate and Clean Air Coalition?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and
Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):
255 Mr Speaker, no, they have not, as the initiatives at the moment focus on projects in developing
countries. This said, the Department continues to keep an eye out for initiatives that would be
relevant to Gibraltar.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, could the Minister just clarify what he means by ‘keep an
260 eye out’?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: We are in contact with the organisation. The Department receives emails
and links and so on, so when there is a problem ... At the moment, the Clean Air Coalition is
265 mainly concentrating in developing countries where people who live in conditions which are,
shall we say, not to Western standards, with open fires within the household and so on, and
they are exposed to a lot of fumes and so on from fires, and that is where they are concentrating
their efforts now.

‘Keep an eye out’ is in contact with the organisation and links to the website and so on. So if
270 they have a programme which would be relevant to Gibraltar, that is when we would link up to
it. At the moment, fortunately, we do not have that kind of problem.

Hon. T N Hammond: Is the Clean Air Coalition an organisation that can be tapped into in any
way for resource if, for instance, we wanted some independent advice on our own monitoring
275 capabilities or our own air quality?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Yes, in the sense that they are a coalition of organisations and
governments which have resources and expertise on a wide range of matters appertaining to
quality. So I think the answer to that must be yes.
280

Hon. T N Hammond: In which case, does the Minister consider it might be worthwhile being
fairly proactive and approaching the organisation to see what they can do for us, rather than
waiting to see what they might be able to do for us in the natural course of their investigations?

285 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** We are constantly in contact with organisations and bodies to see what they can do for us. In this particular case, the team has not identified anything specific, but it is something that we are routinely doing. We are in contact with many different organisations, either formally or informally. Nowadays, by accessing the internet, one can scan what other organisations do. So it is a possibility.

290

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q469/2017
'In Town Without My Car' day –
2017 and 2018

Clerk: Question number 469, the Hon. T N Hammond.

295 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister say if an 'In Town Without My Car' day took place this year or is scheduled to take place this year, and whether similar is planned next year?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

300

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Yes, Mr Speaker, an 'In Town Without My Car' day is being planned for October.

305 We are currently in discussions with our colleagues at the Ministry for Transport as well as the RGP, to finalise the details which will be made available via the press in due course. It is the Government's intention for this to be an annual event.

310 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, while I appreciate you are still in the planning phases, is it being considered to actually conduct this on a weekday this year, as opposed to a Sunday? I would have thought the effect of the day would be more effective if conducted on a day where people actually have to go to town to commute rather than on a day where they may just stay at home to watch the Formula 1?

315 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** I will need to check that. I believe the intention is to do it on the weekend. I know the point that the hon. Member is making, but I think that at this stage we are planning it on a weekend. But I would need to confirm that.

Q470-471/2017
Black carbon –
Monitoring and results

Clerk: Question number 470, the Hon. T N Hammond.

320 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, is Government conducting black carbon monitoring and, if so, when does it plan to make the results available publicly?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with question 471.

325

Clerk: Question number 471, the Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, does the Government intend to introduce real time monitoring of PM2.5 particulates in the air?

330

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, the monitoring of black carbon is not required under the Environment (Air Quality Standards) Regulations 2010 nor the Clean Air For Europe (CAFE) directive. However, we started monitoring as from 15th September 2012.

335

This information will be available online as from the New Year. I am happy to make the results public now. The annual average reading in ug m-3:

2012	2.94
2013	2.72
2014	2.49
2015	3.84
2016	1.87
2017	1.46 (so far)

340

In answer to question, 471, not at this moment in time. The Government is currently using the method approved by the EU for air quality compliance.

Q472/2017
Cooking oil –
Volume recycled

Clerk: Question number 472, the Hon. T N Hammond.

345

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, what volume of cooking oil has been collected for recycling since 1st September 2016?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

350

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the total waste cooking oil collected for recycling from authorised waste exporters since 1st September 2016 is 40,062m3.

Q473/2017

**Energy efficient home improvements –
Fund and grants**

355 **Clerk:** Question number 473, the Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, further to question 314 of 2016, has a fund for energy efficient home improvements, which should have been in place by 2014 according to the Environmental Action and Management Plan, now been established and, if so, how many grants to home owners have been provided through this fund?
360

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

365 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, funding continues to be available to residential estates in the form of soft loans, to fund projects that use solar energy to provide electricity for communal lighting, water heating and the powering of lifts and for the replacement of traditional lighting with LED.

370 Approved projects are eligible for loans of up to 10-years at an effective rate of interest of 1% per annum, with the Government funding the difference in the cost of finance by way of a grant. To date, no grants to homeowners have been provided through this fund.

Q474-476/2017

**Production of electricity –
Monthly fuel burned by power stations; Commission of new power station**

Clerk: Question number 474, the Hon. T N Hammond.

375 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, what is the total monthly fuel burned by all power stations in Gibraltar for the production of electricity since 1st September 2016?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

380 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 475 and 476.

Clerk: Question number 475, the Hon. T N Hammond.

385 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, what is the total amount of fuel burned by the temporary North Mole power station since 1st September 2016 in order to produce electricity?

Clerk: Question number 476, the Hon. T N Hammond.

390 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, when does Government believe the new power station will be commissioned and enter into service?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.
395

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the information requested is in the schedule that I now hand over. That is for Q474, Mr Speaker.

Fuel quantities per month in metric tonnes together with the corresponding kilo watt hours of electricity generated:

Total Fuel & Electrical units from Sep '16 to Aug '17		
	Fuel (MT)	Units Generated (KWh)
Sep-16	4,666	18,084,120
Oct-16	4,390	17,363,420
Nov-16	4,459	17,784,160
Dec-16	4,615	18,450,530
Jan-17	4,721	18,503,700
Feb-17	4,449	17,917,570
Mar-17	4,298	20,456,505
Apr-17	4,006	16,701,860
May-17	4,280	16,998,689
Jun-17	4,572	18,020,982
Jul-17	4,382	18,482,666
Aug-17	4,824	18,839,468

400

In answer to Q475, as from 1st September 2016 and up until 31st August 2017, the total amount of fuel burned by the Temporary North Mole Power Station has been approximately 28,649 metric tonnes of automotive gas oil.

405 The new power station is envisaged to be commissioned and enter into full operational service in 2018.

410 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Just one supplementary, Mr Speaker. For my understanding, the burn of the temporary power station, the fuel bill was 28,000 metric tonnes; the quantities for all of Gibraltar are 4,600 tonnes, for instance, in September 2016; I am just trying to understand whether these ...

I withdraw. (*Interjection*) No, I understand now. Absolutely. I understand and that is absolutely fine. Thank you.

Q477/2017
Littering offences –
Fines and prosecutions

Clerk: Question number 477, the Hon. T N Hammond.

415 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, can the Government state how many littering offences have been prosecuted and fines imposed each month since 31st July 2016?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

420 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is in the schedule that I now hand over.

Month	Issued	Paid	Passed for prosecution
Aug-16	5	4	1
Sep-16	10	9	1
Oct-16	11	6	5
Nov-16	4	4	0
Dec-16	6	3	3
Jan-17	5	1	4
Feb-17	5	2	3
Mar-17	10	5	5
Apr-17	4	2	2
May-17	1	0	1
Jun-17	3	1	2
Jul-17	2	0	0
Aug-17	2	0	0
Sep-17	2	0	0

Q478-479/2017
T levels –
Proposed introduction

Clerk: Question number 478, the Hon. E J Phillips.

445 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, what steps have the Government taken in relation to the proposed introduction of T levels?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

450 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Yes, Mr Speaker, I will answer this question with Question 479.

Clerk: Question number 479, the Hon. E J Phillips.

455 **Hon. E J Phillips:** How does the Government envisage introducing T Levels in the context of current training resources that are available?

460 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the Government is working on a parallel vocational framework to run alongside GCSEs and A-Levels. The project is well underway and obviously tied to the launch of the new schools. It is not just about T Levels, the Government is considering other options, and will be announcing these when it is in a position to do so.

470 **Hon. E J Phillips:** In so far as other measures that the Minister has alluded to, do they relate to apprenticeships?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, not in the context of this question. I am talking about training within the schools and the plan is that there will be alternatives to GCSEs and A-Levels, which can be taken within the schools for vocational subjects, in order to increase the opportunities available to young people who may not want to progress in the traditionally more academic subjects.

Hon. E J Phillips: So, just to clarify, the purpose of this is to integrate vocational training in the context of the newly built schools, as they may well be in due course?

480 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** That is what we are working towards, Mr Speaker.

If I may add, Mr Speaker, it is a reflection of something that is happening also, although it is independent of, in the UK, with introduction of T-Levels, which wants to achieve more or less the same thing.

485 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Just to come back on that, the whole purpose of ... I think, in the Chief Minister's Budget speech he made reference to T Levels and apprenticeships; that is why I asked that specific supplementary. But if the Government has now abandoned this issue of apprenticeships then I am quite happy to accept that.

490 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I am not saying that the Government has abandoned anything; I am just saying that in the context of what we are trying to do in schools, we are not talking about anything other than what I have already explained.

Q480/2017
Energy drinks –
Age restrictions

Clerk: Question number 480, the Hon. L F Llamas.

495 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, does the Government intend to regulate the age restrictions on energy drinks?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

500 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, at present, the Government has no plans to regulate the age restriction on the consumption of energy drinks.

Q481/2017
Cinema under the Stars –
Event not held

Clerk: Question number 481, the Hon. L F Llamas.

505

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government explain why the popular 'Cinema under the Stars' held at the Commonwealth Park has not been held, albeit in a different location such as the Alameda Gardens Theatre?

510

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

515

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the cinema showings had a negative impact on the park and there have been no requests for a similar regular event elsewhere.

520

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, given that the whole community was attending these events and engaged with them in such a positive manner – most of us, and especially those with young children – and it has been circulated on social media as well that the viewings and screenings of films did provide for an additional nocturnal experience throughout the summer months, together with providing an additional – *(Interjection)* Yes, it was a good idea! – providing an additional event for tourists as well, is it not possible that, at least for the next summer, the Government could consider bringing these and engaging with the public, seeing if there is a demand?

525

530

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, I am delighted that the hon. Gentleman feels so strongly about what was, in effect, an idea of this Government; and in fact – as the Hon. Minister Cortes was always keen to remind me the morning after the performances – it was my idea. When he was having to clean the park and deal with the problems of the grass, he reminded me it was my idea. I thought it would be a magnificent way of making the most of Commonwealth Park. Unfortunately, I was unable to attend any of the sessions, but I could see the benefits of watching Grease, or Airplane, or Superman, or Jaws, with a keen eye on the koi carp were doing in the pond, to make sure they were not attempting to imitate what was being shown on the wall!

535

But unfortunately the toll on the park was dramatic. In fact, at that time the party that he used to sit with started to say that we had made a mistake in the type of grass that we had chosen and that Commonwealth Park was a disaster that would not succeed because the grass could not prosper. Commonwealth Park grass was prospering perfectly well, until 2,000 people came to sit on it every Tuesday afternoon – **(A Member: And Thursday!)** and Thursday – to watch a movie.

540

545

Now, the hon. Gentleman might best understand this by reference to what happens at Wimbledon. If the hon. Gentleman watches the first round of the tennis at Wimbledon he will see the players on a pristine court which looks perfectly green, and if he watches the final he will see the players standing on a patch of sand at the back of each side of the court. Unfortunately, therefore, what I think was a magnificent idea, had a toll on the park which was just unacceptable in the context of the other use that the park has on a daily basis for all our children.

550

I am very keen to bring back cinema under the stars, but not necessarily in the park. So, to spare the Minister for the Environment the horror of the effects on his grass, it is something that the Minister for Culture and I are discussing and we would very much like to bring it back and we very much welcome his welcoming of our very welcome initiative.

Thank you. (*Banging on desks*)

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, can I just interject here?

555 I think that, from speaking to people, the issue mainly, one would say, is that when we get close to elections we see these sorts of gimmicky type of events; for example, the one on the beach where we had those jamborees in the sea that we have not seen since 2015, I think.

Would the Government not understand the electorate for wondering why these wonderful little incentives in the summer come and go once every four years?

560

Hon. Chief Minister: Mama Mia! Here we go again! Wouldn't that be a good film to show under the stars?

Well, Mr Speaker, I disagree with her, obviously, because we are not a Government of gimmicks. And the floating facilities which were provided at the beaches were provided, I believe, when Minister Costa was Minister for Tourism for two consecutive years; and on the second consecutive year they were so damaged that it was impossible to repair them for a third year and we had to make a decision about whether or not to once again invest in those facilities.

The Cinema under the Stars was unrelated to a general election and it would have gone on had it not been for the toll on the grass.

570 But, look, if what the hon. Lady is telling us is that we get better as we go along and in the fourth year of our Government we are at our peak, I think the public appreciate it and that is why, if she will allow me to remind her, she stood with the team that was massively rejected by the people of Gibraltar and by an electorate that is wise enough to look beyond a movie at a park and a floating lilo offshore. People understand why it is that they vote for the Government that they vote for and I think it has more to do with their depth of understanding of the experience and the commitment that there was in respect to the team that is now sitting on this side of the House, than there was presented by the other side, some of whom have even felt that they need to go off to further their studies instead of continuing in politics in Gibraltar.

580 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, can I just ask does the Chief Minister envisage the floating lilo to be fixed by summer 2019?

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, the current Minister for Tourism has stepped out and I do not know what it is that we will be doing in summer 2018, let alone summer 2019. But I can assure her that the Government will seek to mature all of its policies and deliver them to the electorate as soon as we are able to do so.

590 Some of them, whether in relation to lilos or otherwise, will peak in 2019. Some of them will peak after 2019, but I have no doubt that the electorate will look at what is on offer at any impending general election, and likely make the same decision, lilos or otherwise. I think, if she will allow me to say so, with respect, there are some on that side who are junior enough in this House that they still need to put their wings on before they are able to swim on their own, and I am not just referring to her, I am referring to some people who lead political parties, and who are, having said that, still very junior in parliamentary terms.

595 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

Q482/2017
Waterport Fountain –
Inactivity

Clerk: Question number 482, the Hon. L F Llamas.

600 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, since December 2011, can the Government provide details of when the Waterport Fountain has been inactive and the reasons why?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

605 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the Department does not keep a log of every time – or did not keep a log of every time – the fountain is inactive. However, I can confirm that since the fountain was refurbished in 2013, it has only been switched off for maintenance work and during National Day.

610 At this moment in time, the fountain is undergoing maintenance works to one of the pumps, and I am going to depart slightly from the prepared answer – the prepared answer said it is due to be functioning again next week, that was for last week – due to be functioning again this week but I was told on Monday that they have identified an electrical problem and it is being repaired and it should be ready in the next couple of days.

Q483/2017
Swift bird nest webcam –
Installation costs

615 **Clerk:** Question number 483, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government state how much has been paid for the setting up and installation of the swift bird nest webcam and internet site?

620 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the cost for setting up and installation of the swift bird nature cam series is £1,581.53.

Q484/2017
Medusa nets –
Purchase costs since 2011

625 **Clerk:** Question number 484, the Hon. L F Llamas.

630 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide details of how much money has been spent on the purchase of medusa nets since December 2011 per financial year, detailing for which beach each purchase was for?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

635 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the overall costs are in the schedule which I now hand over. There is no breakdown available per beach. I am told that, because of the way the work is done, it is not possible to sub-divide into each beach.

2012/2013	2013/2014	2014/2015	2015/2016	2016/2017	2017/2018
					To date
N/A	£93,230	£48,345	£30,154	£36,193	£52,584

Q485/2017
Fix my Street app –
Launch and cost

640 **Clerk:** Question number 485, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government explain why the ‘Fix my Street’ app was never launched, and the cost involved?

645 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

650 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the app has not been launched because it was superseded by the Environmental Feedback Section, now back in operation, and the Environmental Agency's app ‘Gib Environ’ which has the reporting facility. It was deemed that an additional app would have been confusing.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, was there any cost involved in the preparation?

655 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, not to the Department. I believe this was an initiative together with other work that was being done for the Government. As this was not proceeded, the Department has not paid for what was not published. Obviously, the other app for the Environmental Agency would have had costs but that is not the subject of this question.

660 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Minister says that the Department has not had an incurred cost. Can he confirm that the Government has not paid, given that there was a website and a detailed availability on the internet of what the app was going to look like, and I am sure that some costs would have been involved?

665 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, my information is that the cost for that particular app, which was not processed, was not distinguishable from other work being done on that project, but I can see whether I can delve into it and see whether it can be factored out but it may not be possible because it was part of a bigger picture but I will investigate.

Q486/2017

**Dumping of household refuse –
Main Street and surrounding streets**

Clerk: Question number 486, the Hon. L F Llamas.

670

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, how does Government intend to tackle the dumping of household refuse in Main Street and surrounding streets, lanes and alleys?

675

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, there has already been considerable improvement in a number of areas which had long been hot-spots.

680

Notably, rubbish accumulations have now totally disappeared from Chatham Counterguard, Turnbull's Lane, Mess House Lane and the corner of Governor's Street at the bottom of Prince Edward's Road.

We continue to review the whole waste strategy to bring about even further improvements.

685

Clerk: Supplementary to Q484.

690

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, looking at the schedule provided by the Hon. Minister, we can see that the initial purchase of the nets back in 2013-14 was £93,000, the following year was £48,000, 2015-16 was £30,000, 2016-17 was £36,000 and 2017-18 there is a rise again going up to £52,000 which is more than half of the initial purchase back in 2013-14.

695

Can the Minister explain if all these are new purchases or if there are repairs involved and whether there is a policy that can be put in place so that we do not have to spend so much on these nets? I say this, Mr Speaker, because up at the Europa Advance Road during the summer period there has been some of those medusa nets deposited at the recycling centre and obviously they are in a bad state, and I am not sure if it is a question that they are not being maintained properly or if they are actually being neglected, or if it is a position where they do need replacing after a couple of years.

700

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, I will reply with caution, because the last time, in a constructive way, I said I thought that something was a toilet all sorts of things blew up.

A Member: Not the toilet!

705

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: No, the toilet did not, but I have to say that I am trying to reply in good will without the backing of factual information. So I am doing it with caution, because I do not then want to be challenged about saying something which I said in all honesty I thought was the case without having the information. I think I have to make that point.

710

These things clearly have wear and tear, and after a number of years there will be need for greater investment. If he wants a breakdown of exactly why it is somewhat more this year than the last couple of years, I would have to look into it. I suspect – and again with caution – that as the years go by you have to repair more. We are looking into how we can perhaps make this less expensive and hopefully will be able to do something in that respect next year. But if he wants any more detailed information then I will need to have either the question made or the hon. Member is quite welcome to write to me.

715

Q487-492/2017
Public area cleaning –
Schedule of flushing down; Government rental estates;
Contract with Master Services

Clerk: Question number 487, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a monthly schedule of locations and frequency regarding the flushing down of our public areas since December 2011?

720

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 488 to 492.

725

Clerk: Question number 488, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government disclose its public area cleaning strategy in advance of the upcoming tender?

730

Clerk: Question number 489, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government state how much it has spent in each financial year since April 2012 to date in the cleaning of public areas in Government rental estates, per estate?

735

Clerk: Question number 490, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government disclose the contract entered into between Government and Master Services?

740

Clerk: Question number 491, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a monthly schedule since December 2011 of how much has been paid to Master Services for services in addition to their original contract and what the services were for?

745

Clerk: Question number 492, the Hon. L F Llamas.

750

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a monthly schedule since December 2011 of how much has been paid to Master Services as per their original contract?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

755

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, I will be referring to three schedules which I will hand over together at the end, I think, rather than make the Clerk staff go across three times.

760

The information in relation to Question 487 requested is in the schedule I will be handing over. The tender includes a more intensive cleaning programme, details of which can clearly not be revealed at this time, but will be published shortly. In addition, we are developing a review of

waste management in general. This is part of the overall Master Service contract, Q489, and costs are not specified by area.

765 In relation to Q490, as the hon. Member is aware, the Government is in the process of issuing a tender and it would not be appropriate to disclose the current contract entered into by the GSD at this moment in time.

The information requested for Q491 and Q492 is in the schedules:

Answer to Question No 487:

	Flushing
Abecasis Passage	F3
Admiral Rooke Road	F4
Airport tunnel Access Road (from Devil's Tower Road)	F4
Alectoris Lane	F4
Ansaldo's Passage	F3
Arengo's Block Car Parks	F3
Arengo's Palace Car Park	F4
Arengo's Palace Lane	F4
Armstrong Steps	F3
Baca's Passage	F3
Bado's Pasaage	F3
Bado's Steps	F4
Baker's Passage	F3
Bayside Area Roads and Car Parks	F3 (P)
Bayside Road	F4
Bedlam Court	F3
Bell Lane	F3
Bella Vista Close	F4
Belvedere Car Parks	F4
Benoliel's Passage	F3
Benzimra's Alley	F3
Bishop Caruana Road	F3
Bishop Healy Home cul-de-sac	F4
Bishop Rapallo Ramp	F3
Bomb House Lane	F3
Booth's Passage	F3
Boschetti's Steps	F3
Boyd Street	F4
Brian Navarro Way	F4
British Lines Area	F4
Bruce's Gully	F3
Buena Vista Road	F4
Buffadero Lane	F4

Cable and Wireless Road	F4
Calpe Road	F4
Camp Bay Road and Car Parks	F2
Camp Bay Road and Car Parks	F4
Camp Bay Tunnels to Junction with Rosia	F2
Camp Bay Tunnels to Junction with Rosia	F4
Cannon Lane	F3
Carrera's Passage	F3
Casemates Gates Area	F3
Casemates Hill	F3
Casemates Road & area behind kiosks	F3
Casemates Square	F3
Castle Ramp	F3
Castle Ramp - steps leading to Lower Castle Road	F3
Castle Ramp to Road to the Lines - steps to Moorish Castle Estate	F3
Castle Road (bottom of Willis' Road to Moorish Castle Estate)	F4
Castle Road (from Prince Edward's Road to bottom of Willis' Road)	F4
Castle Road (No. 50) patio area	F3
Castle Steps	F3
Castle Street	F3
Catalan Bay Road including Car Parks	F2
Catalan Bay Road including Car Parks	F4
Catalan Bay Village main lanes	F2
Catalan Bay Village main lanes	F3
Cathedral Square	F3
Cathedral Square - Pedestrianised Areas around Holy Trinity Cathedral	F3
Cathedral Square - Streets around playground	F4
Cemetery Road	F4
Centre Pavilion Road	F4
Charles V Ramp	F3
Charles V Steps	F3
Chatham Counterguard	F3
Chicardo's Passage	F3
City Mill Lane	F4
Cloister Ramp	F3
Coaling Island Road	F4
College Lane	F4
Convent Place	F4
Cooperage Lane	F3
Cornwall's Lane	F3
Cornwall's Parade	F4

Corral Road	F4
Crutchett's Ramp	F3
Cumberland Road	F4
Cumberland Steps	F4
Customs Area (Frontier) Four Corners	F4
Danino's Ramp	F3
Demaya's Ramp	F3
Devil's Bellows Lane	F4
Devil's Gap Steps	F3
Devil's Tongue including car park	F4
Devil's Tower Road	F4
Dudley Ward Tunnel	-
Eastern Beach Road	F2
Eastern Beach Road	F4
Elliott's Close	F4
Elliott's Way	F3 (P)
Emerson's Place	F4
Engineer Lane	F4
Engineer Lane waste ground Car Park and steps/ramps leading to	F4
Engineer Road	F4 (P)
Europa Advance Road	F4
Europa Road	F4
Europa Road - Road from/to rear of Europa Mews	F4
Europort Avenue including roundabout	F4
Europort Road	F4
Fish Market Road and Car Parks	F2
Flat Bastion Road	F4
Flat Bastion Road parking spaces under flats	F4
Flint Road	F4
Forbes Road (including top area car park)	F4
Forty Steps	F4
Fountain Ramp	F3
Frazer's Ramp	F3
Frontier loop area	F4
Gardiner's Road	F4
Garrod Road	F4
George's Lane	F4
Giro's PassageF4	
Glacis Road including Fountain Roundabout	F4
Governor's Lane	F4
Governor's Parade	F3
Governor's Street	F4

Gowland's Ramp	F3
Grand Parade	F3 (P)
Gunner's Lane	F4
Halifax Road	F4
Harbour Views Road	F3 (P)
Harding's Road	F4
Hargrave's Parade	F4
Hargrave's Ramp	F3
Horse Barrack Lane	F3
Hospital Hill	F3
Hospital Ramp	F3
Hospital Steps	F3
Irish Place	F3
Irish Town	F3
Irish Town - Steps From North End to Line Wall Road	F3
John Mackintosh Ramp	F4
John Mackintosh Square	F3
John Snow Close	F4
Johnston's Passage	F3
Keightley Way Tunnel	-
King's Street	F4
King's Yard Lane	F4
Koehler Ramp	F4
Lady William's Close	F4
Lancaster Road	F4
Landport area (from Corral Road), including bridge & tunnel entrance	F3
Landport Car Park (top)	F4
Landport Ditch Car Park	F4
Landport Tunnels	F3
Lathbury Road	F4
Levant Battery Road	F4
Levanter Way including the mound	F4
Library Ramp	F3
Library Street	F3
Lime Kiln Road	F3
Lime Kiln Steps	F3
Line Wall Road	F4
Little Bay Car Park including access road	F2
Little Bay Car Park including access road	F4
Lopez Ramp	F3
Lower Castle Road	F3
Lower Witham's Road	F4

Lower Witham's Road access road to Upper Witham's Road	F4
Lynch's Lane	F3
MacPhail's Passage	F3
Maida Vale	F4
Main Street From Casemates Hill To Referendum Gates	F2
Market Lane	F3
Mess House Lane	F4
Mid Harbours Close	F3
Mid Town Coach Park (ground & level 1)	F3
Mons Calpe Road (from Emerson's Place around Waterport Terraces)	F3
Mons Calpe Road (from Emerson's Place to New Power Station)	F4
Montagu Place including Car Parks	F4
Moorish Castle Estate to Road to the Lines - Steps	F3
Morello's Ramp	F3
Mount Alvernia - Pathway to the Mount	F4
Mount Road	F4
Naval Hospital Hill	F4
Naval Hospital Road	F4
Nettle Tree Ramp	F4
New Passage	F3
New Street	F3
North Gorge access road	F4
North Mole Road	F3 (P)
North Pavilion Road	F4
Notre Dame School and Playground - pathway between	F3
Nuffield Pool Car Park	F2
Nuffield Pool Car Park	F4
Palace Gully	F3
Paradise Ramp	F3
Parliament Lane	F3
Parody's Ramp	F3
Parson's Lane	F4
Pathway seafront next to Nuffield Pool from Camp Bay to Little Bay	F2
Pathway seafront next to Nuffield Pool from Camp Bay to Little Bay	F4
Penney House - adjacent steps leading to Brympton Estate	F4
Peter Isola Promenade	F4
Pezzi's Steps	F3
Piazella - By Governor's Parade	F3
Piazza Including Parliament lobby	F3
Pitman's Alley	F3
Police Barracks Lane	F3
Prince Edward's Road (from Hargrave's Parade to junction Flat Bastion Road)	F4

Prince Edward's Road (junction Flat Bastion Road to Governor's Street)	F4
Printer's Passage	F4
Public Market Acces Area & Bus Terminus	F2
Queensway - parking spaces	F3
Queensway (up to New Harbours)	F4 (P)
Ragged Staff Car Park	F4
Ragged Staff Car Park	F3
Ragged Staff Road	F4 (P)
Reclamation area car park and access road at Catalan Bay	F4
Reclamation area car park and access road at Catalan Bay	F4
Reclamation Road	F3
Red Sands Road	F3
Richardson's Passage	F3
Road To The Lines	F3
Rodger's Road	F4
Rodger's Steps	F4
Romney Car Park	F3
Rosia Bay - steep hill and steps	F4
Rosia Lane	F4
Rosia Ramp	F4
Rosia Road	F4 (P)
Rosia Steps	F3
Saluting Battery Promenade	F3
Sandpits Road	F4
Schomberg House - steps from South Barrack Road to Witham's Road	F4
Scud Hill	F4 (P)
Scud Hill Steps	F4
Secretary's Lane	F4
Serfaty's Passage	F3
Shackleton Road	F4
Shakery's Passage	F3
Sir Herbert Miles Promenade	F3
Sir Herbert Miles Promenade - middle access to Commonwealth Park including steps	F3
Sir Herbert Miles Road including car parks	F4
Smith Dorrien Avenue	F4
Smith Dorrien Avenue path leading to Glacis Road	F4
South Barrack Close	F4
South Barrack Parade	F3
South Barrack Ramp	F4
South Barrack Road	F4
South Barrack Road - steps leading to Nettle Tree Ramp	F4
South Pavilion Road	F4

South Port Gates and surrounding area	F4
South Shed's Place	F4
St. Bernard's Road	F4
St. Christopher's Alley	F4
St. Jago's - Car Park	F4
St. Jago's - Steps	F4
St. Joseph's Road	F4
Stirling Lane	F4
Sunnyside Steps	F4
Tangier View Lane	F4
Tank Ramp	F4
Tank Ramp Steps	F3
Tankerville Road	F4
Tank Passage	F4
Tank Road	F4
Theatre Royal Park	F3
Town Range including Car Parks	F4
Trafalgar Hill	F4 (P)
Trafalgar Road	F4 (P)
Transport Lane	F4
Transport Lane triangle	F4
Transport Road	F4
Trinity House Road	F4
Tuckey's Lane	F3
Tudury's Steps	F4
Turnbull's Lane	F3
Upper Castle Road	F4
Upper Witham's Road	F4
Victualling Office Lane	F4
War Memorial Boulevard including steps	F4
Waterport Road to exit roundabout from Varyl Begg Estate	F3
Waterport Wharf	F4
Waterport Wharf Road	F3 (P)
Wellington Front - Ground & Upper level (including passageway from Queensway)	F3
Westside Road	F3
Willis' House - Service Road	F4
Willis's House Service Road	F4
Willis's Passage	F3
Willis's Road	F4
Wilson's Ramp	F3
Windmill Hill Road	F4
Winston Churchill Avenue and Sundial Roundabout	F4

Witham's - steps Upper from/to Lower Witham's	F4
Zoca Flank	F4

Flushing FI = Daily
F2 = Weekly
F3 = Monthly
F4 = Quarterly
(P) = Pavements only

Contd. Answer to Question 492

Answer to Question 491

MASTER SERVICE EXTRA PAYMENTS

Date	Description	£	Extra
-	-	£	-
F/Y 11/12			
15/11/2012	Seasonal workers & extra	£	49,941.84
19/12/2012	Seasonal workers & extra	£	12,731.04
25/03/2013	Social ins. Adj.	£	1,086.00
26/03/2013	Seasonal workers & extra	£	33,185.10
F/Y 12/13			
11/03/2014	Seasonal workers & extra	£	15,176.31
F/Y 13/14			
18/03/2015	Seasonal workers & extra	£	67,288.87
F/Y 14/15			
15/03/2016	Additional services	£	174,679.75
F/Y 15/16			
09/12/2016	Beach attendant & extra services	£	90,529.39
17/01/2017	Additional services	£	3,900.00
F/Y 16/17			
-	-	£	-
F/Y 17/18			

Examples of additional Services Include:

Removal of Seaweed at Western Beach

Provision of Mobile recycling unit services

Additional Sunday morning collection of household waste

Changing toilet facility and general cleaners at GASA sea bathing pavilion

Cleaning of pools at GASA sea bathing pavilion

Changing room and toilet facility covering Easter period, prior to official bathing season

Mechanical removal of dried aloes and soil at Europa Advance Road

Cleaning of glass panels, lift and bandstand at Commonwealth Park

Cleaning at Wellington Front

Cleaning of Small Boats Marina

Contd. Answer to Question 492

Answer to Question 492

MASTER SERVICE PAYMENTS

Date	Description		Contract Sum
13/12/2011	Qtr 01/01/12	£	1,163,710.26
F/Y 11/12			
12/04/2012	Qtr 01/04/12	£	1,141,230.48
22/06/2012	Qtr 01/07/12	£	1,141,230.48
18/09/2012	Qtr 01/10/12	£	1,141,230.48
07/12/2012	Qtr 01/01/13	£	1,111,953.44
20/02/2013	Contract sum 11/12, 12/13 (Adj) & KPI	£	536,149.73
F/Y 12/13			
16/04/2013	Qtr 01/04/13	£	1,120,366.50
18/06/2013	Qtr 01/07/13	£	1,120,366.50
12/09/2013	Qtr 01/10/13	£	1,322,333.25
05/11/2013	KPI 12/13	£	70,000.00
10/12/2013	Qtr 01/01/14	£	1,187,688.75
20/03/2014	Loan 18-20	£	23,294.13
F/Y 13/14			
03/04/2014	Qtr 01/04/14	£	1,187,688.75
04/06/2014	Qtr 01/07/14	£	1,187,688.75
11/07/2014	Arrears 1st & 2nd Qtr	£	85,970.00
03/09/2014	Qtr 01/10/14	£	1,230,673.75
08/12/2014	Qtr 01/01/15	£	1,230,673.75
30/03/2015	KPI 13/14	£	67,000.00
F/Y 14/15			
08/04/2015	Qtr 01/04/15	£	1,230,673.75
04/06/2015	Qtr 01/07/15	£	1,230,673.75
08/09/2015	Qtr 01/10/15	£	1,230,673.75
01/12/2015	Qtr 01/01/16	£	1,230,673.75
13/01/2016	Contract sum adj. 14/15 & 15/16	£	125,625.00
F/Y 15/16			
01/04/2016	Qtr 01/04/16	£	1,262,080.00
05/05/2016	KPI 14/15	£	44,500.00
03/06/2016	Qtr 01/07/16	£	1,262,080.00
01/09/2016	Qtr 01/10/16 (includes adj. -£91,660.00)	£	1,124,590.00
01/12/2016	Qtr 01/01/17	£	1,216,250.00
12/12/2016	Wage increase Sep 16	£	47,349.93
22/02/2017	KPI 15/16	£	28,000.00
F/Y 16/17			
04/04/2017	Qtr 01/04/17	£	1,216,250.00
01/06/2017	Qtr 01/07/17	£	1,216,250.00
24/08/2017	Qtr 01/10/17	£	1,216,250.00
F/Y 17/18			

770

Mr Speaker: These are extremely lengthy schedules, so unless the hon. questioner has supplementaries on the other questions which are not the subject of the schedules ... if he has, we will proceed with that, otherwise I will allow time for the schedule to be considered.

775

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, I have a supplementary on Q490, which is not part of the schedules.

780 I understand, obviously, that the Government is unable to disclose details of the contract, but would the Minister be able to divulge or disclose to us whether within the contract does it actually specify which areas Master Services is responsible for and where the responsibility for cleaning lies?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: The contract has schedules which define areas that need to be cleaned, so in that respect, yes. I do not know what more detail he wants?

785

Hon. L F Llamas: Would the Minister be able to disclose those schedules to us? Obviously, I understand that perhaps he might not have them here today, but he could perhaps email.

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, this has not been requested. I have provided the information that has been requested, except those which at this moment have to be confidential because we are in the process of preparing a tender document with a new schedule of duties and there is information that I cannot reveal in advance of issuing that tender. So I do not think I should provide any more than the copious information that I have provided already today.

790

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, if it is of any assistance, the tender will be public and the tender will contain the list of areas to be cleaned etc. So the hon. Gentleman will see it very shortly indeed. It is just a question of dotting 'i's and crossing 't's at this point, as far as I understand.

795

Mr Speaker: Let's move on to Q493.

800

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker –

Mr Speaker: I will allow –

805

Hon. T N Hammond: ... one supplementary not subject to ... (**Mr Speaker:** Okay.)

Mr Speaker, if I may just ask: does the Minister know when the tender may be issued; where we are in that process?

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, the tender document has just been passed to my office literally, I think, overnight. It needs to be seen by the incumbent of the Office of Chief Minister just to ensure that it is in keeping with the discussion I have had with ministerial colleagues as to what we want from the new contract. Once I am satisfied of that it will go for publication.

810

**Q493/2017
Project Search –
Progress report**

Clerk: Question number 493, the Hon. L F Llamas.

815

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide details on the progress being made in relation to the Project Search including: (a) Persons pending employment; (b) Persons employed as a direct result of this initiative; (c) Number of persons identified suitable to channel through the project; and (d) Number of employees working on this initiative?

820

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):

825 Mr Speaker, the Government is following a model based on Project Search, which was founded in 1996 in the USA. The work is carried out by an officer in the Department of Education working with young people with special educational needs (SEN) across our secondary schools. At present, the main thrust of the work is to assist students with special educational needs attached to the LSFs (Learning Support Facilities).

830 The 2017-18 short/medium term plan involves working with eight Year 12+ students based at the LSF at Bayside and Westside, incorporating matched work experience placements in their free slots in their school timetables. Gibraltar College and St Martin's School are in the process of identifying which students will require work experience for 2017-18.

835 Employer engagement is accessed so that we can successfully place six LSF Year 10 students on the work experience offered to all Year 10 students as part of the curriculum. Assistance is also being provided in the transition process of four school leavers, supporting them with unemployment registration at the ETB, CV building, job applications, interviews and employer engagement. One college student has been successfully placed in employment.

840 The long-term plan is to offer a supported internship for those students who have peaked at full-time education and would now benefit from a clear-cut, year-long, work training programme.

Q494/2017

School classrooms –

Class sizes, children with special education needs, learning support assistants

Clerk: Question number 494, the Hon. L F Llamas.

845 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a schedule of the number of pupils in each class during each school year since September 2012 stating: (a) the year the class relates to; (b) the school the class belongs to; (c) the number of children with special education needs; and (d) the number of learning support assistants per class?

850 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the hon. Member demonstrates a very narrow understanding of Education – a conclusion that I come to for a number of reasons, which I will spell out.

855 I cannot provide him with such a schedule. Class sizes, issues relating to special educational needs, and indeed the consequent deployment of support are constantly changing. Classes shrink and grow, as children move across sets, enrol or leave midway through a term, complete core modules and are then subdivided to complete topics of choice. A child's needs today are different tomorrow; additional temporary help will be needed at different stages of a child's journey, and no stone is left unturned to ensure that this support is afforded every time. A snapshot of this, as requested by the hon. Member, is not only impossible but totally unnecessary and meaningless.

865 I am disappointed that such a question, which the Member opposite will have known would have required a great deal of research by many of the team in the Department of Education, should be asked at a time when the school term is starting, and professionals across our schools

and at the Department are working extremely hard to ensure that the children begin the term and are completely settled and happy.

870 Is the hon. Member therefore suggesting that I should recall headteachers and advisors from schools in an attempt to answer an impossible question? This I will not do, Mr Speaker. I will, however, say that the average classroom sizes and the provision afforded are completely in line with our manifesto commitments.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, I did not envisage this question being controversial or getting the Hon. Minister heated up on a question which was filed in good faith, I can assure him.

875 Mr Speaker, I would have thought, and I understand that classes can be expanded or smaller, depending on the time of the year, depending on the needs, I am fully aware of that; however, I do not envisage that it would be that difficult to table a schedule perhaps on the first day of each school year relating to the class sizes and the number of teachers and the number of learning support assistants in each class. I do not think it is that unreasonable of a question to
880 ask.

So, is the Hon. Minister able to answer this question if I file it next month in the next session and state that it could be a snapshot as at the first day of each educational year?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, the hon. Member has mentioned good faith and I have to
885 take that because he said it, but I think recent events would justify me in perhaps not seeing that the good faith actually shows itself in the day to day. But let's leave that to one side.

Mr Speaker, if the hon. Member thinks I was heated up he should have seen the members of staff of the Department of Education when they read the question. It is, as I have explained clearly, a well-nigh impossible task and, to me, meaningless; and perhaps if the hon. Member
890 were to explain to me, certainly not now, what he wants to get out of this and what it is that he wants to analyse, it might be easier at least to have a discussion.

But certainly, going back to September 2012, looking at the number of pupils in each class, in each Year, in each school, how many of those have special education needs – which I have explained varies – and the number of learning supports in each class, when that can vary almost
895 on a daily basis, is not reasonable and is something that I certainly will not provide.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, unfortunately, the Hon. Minister judges my faith unfairly and I am quite disappointed at that.

Mr Speaker, it is not a question of what I want this answer to provide; I am factual and I
900 would like to get the answer that I am entitled to when I file a question. What the Minister is, therefore, suggesting – and I could understand that perhaps it is an added burden to the staff of the Education Department – is that perhaps they are under-resourced and this is why they are unable to answer this question. Is that the case, Mr Speaker?

905 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Absolutely, Mr Speaker. That is absolutely right.

Every Department of Government is under-resourced for dealing with questions that simply require that staff be set aside to compile meaningless statistical data which cannot be provided with any accuracy, in some instances, other than by seeking to rely on the memory of people as to what might have been the case five years ago in respect of data which has never been
910 compiled and where people will not, therefore, be able to give accurate answers.

Every Department is going to always be undermanned if we are asked to compile a list of how many paperclips have been purchased by each Department and how many were used in each day since 10th December 2011. It is impossible, Mr Speaker, to deal with some questions and it is very easy to put a question that cannot be answered. The political art, Mr Speaker, is to put a
915 question that *can* be answered and gets to the nub of a political issue that the Member feels he must hold the Government to account for.

But if the hon. Member is not able to conject questions which require information that is available to be provided, he can expect us to tell him that we are impossibly under-resourced to come up with the answers for the speculative questions that he might try to put, which require resources which have never been available to any Government of Gibraltar or indeed any government around the world.

Because some of the things that we have been asked for, Mr Speaker – and I do not want to refer to things which are coming up in the Order Paper – the hon. Gentleman is going to get the same answer that he has been given by the Hon. the Minister for Education – a Minister who, if I may say so, Mr Speaker, does not often get het up as we have seen him this morning, given the – I am sorry to say and I say it with the greatest possible affection to the hon. Gentleman; he knows I am very pleased to see him ... since the Budget debate in this House.

But the questions are in some instances just nonsensical in the sense that the data requested is not data maintained, or that it is reasonable to have maintained. In some instances, Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman may ask us, ‘Look, I understand the position; could you kindly, going forward, keep a record of this and give me, monthly, these numbers?’ Well, that is relatively easy in some instances, Mr Speaker, but to go back and recreate from a point in time that happens to be 10th December 2011, without showing any interest in what has happened before – in any event, where things may have been worse and there may be an appreciable improvement after 10th December 2011 – is just an attempt to ask questions to show off about the numbers that have been filed, not to ask questions in a way that is designed to get to reasonably relevant information, in our view.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, I will take it as a compliment that I am asking questions which have never been asked before; that means I am actually going deeper than any other Member has gone before.

Mr Speaker, what I am not clear on, and I do not believe that this question is unreasonable, otherwise the Hon. Mr Speaker would have ruled it out –

Mr Speaker: No, I do not rule questions on whether they are unreasonable or not; I deal with questions in accordance with the Rules which are stated clearly in the Rulebook, as it were. The question of reasonableness does not come into it as far as I am concerned. There are other considerations.

Hon. L F Llamas: Fine, Mr Speaker.

Would the Government be able to supply the information as at the first day of each school year, given that there has to be a compilation of information for each school, of how many students are going to be allocated in each class, how many teachers will be allocated in each class. Somebody must prepare this, otherwise it would be impossible to run an educational system. I am actually informed that it could even be the case that some of these registers are electronic, so I am amazed that it can be so complicated to compile and supply this information.

Would the hon. Minister be able to provide an answer to this question if I come back with this question next month?

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, there is the nub of the issue. The hon. Gentleman now slowly seems to be reaching understanding. A snapshot on 1st September 2017 is probably something that can be provided. Going back and giving the snapshot may not be so easy. But he has to understand that is a snapshot and that by 15th September it may have changed, and that by 10th December the position may have changed too; and that going back is probably not something that can easily be done, or at least will not provide anything near information which is worth analysis. I think that is the point that the hon. Gentleman is trying to make.

So this is not about not giving him information which is easily possible to provide, and very likely, given where we are in the month, we could probably ask teachers to give us the start of

970 term figure and that going forward we could perhaps seek returns as to a monthly figure, or something like that.

Can I encourage the hon. Gentleman to speak to Minister Cortes offline and see what it is – as the hon. Minister has said – what it is him that he wants to understand. There may be another data collection method that may be able to assist him and which we may be able to provide which he can then put as a Written Question, or as an Oral Question if he likes, and then he can be receiving the information in a way that is meaningful to him, given what it is that he wants to provide.

975 I am not, Mr Speaker, able to say that he is going deeper than anyone has ever gone before; I think he is just going down a route that nobody has gone before, perhaps because it is statistically irrelevant to go there. I can assure him that if there was statistical relevance to a question the person sitting to my left would have been asking it since 1972.

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, if I may just add and thank the Chief Minister for that, the question is how relevant and how could you interpret the snapshot on 1st September, because particularly in the first few weeks there are going to be changes and if you are going to be wanting to compare year on year what conclusions can you reach from something which is perhaps not going to reflect the reality of the transition through the school year. I think it is a discussion that we have to have.

985 I was going to say, Mr Speaker, that I was sorry that the hon. Member was disappointed in me, but I am going to say the contrary because I was disappointed in him a couple of weeks ago. So that is one all; maybe we can make a fresh start.

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, just to facilitate and help my hon. friend in relation to this, the information I believe that the hon. Member requested is in fact online on the Government's website; however, the issue is, I think, the class size, which I think can be easily ascertained by asking the question about class sizes in reference to those particular statistics which the Government have supplied online. That would be a helpful answer from the Government's side, but I think if those numbers could be crunched one more time, rather than spending inordinate resources on this question, we could have the answer.

1000 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, if my colleagues in the Department of Education and I had wanted to come up with figures I am sure they could have come up with figures, but this goes deeper than that. Because these figures change, because it would not give an accurate representation of what the issues are with special needs, it was felt that the exercise would have been futile as well as onerous.

1005 Certainly, we can look at it and I think the Hon. Mr Phillips' suggestion is helpful, but we have got to be cautious in how we interpret these snapshots, because snapshots do not reflect what is actually happening in the classroom, necessarily. That is the point I was making.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

1010

Q495-506/2017
St Martin's School –
Portacabins, new school buildings and bus

Clerk: Question number 495, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, further to the answer provided to Question 328/2017 and statements made on social media and the press, can the Minister for Education state where the toilet portacabins he referred to are?
1015

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 496 to 506.
1020

Clerk: Question number 496, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, in relation to the portacabins at St Martin's School, can the Government state for the current academic year: (a) how many children are taught in each classroom; (b) how many teachers are in each classroom; (c) how many learning support assistants are in each classroom?
1025

Clerk: Question number 497, the Hon. L F Llamas.
1030

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide details of the specifications as at 1st September 2017 of the enhanced acoustic conditions and sound insulation of each classroom at the two-storey portacabin at St Martins School (walls, ceilings and floors) and confirm they are suitable for children with special needs?
1035

Clerk: Question number 498, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm that as at 1st September 2017, a risk assessment had been carried out on the portacabins at St Martin's School?
1040

Clerk: Question number 499, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm that as at 1st September 2017, adequate internal and external lighting has been provided at the two-storey portacabins at St Martin's School, including emergency lighting?
1045

Clerk: Question number 500, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm what will be the procedure during winter for children attending the two-storey portacabin to go to the main building for scheduled activities or play time?
1050

Clerk: Question number 501, the Hon. L F Llamas.
1055

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide details of the internal area of each portacabin classroom being used at St Martin's School detailing: (a) the classroom area; and (b) the toilet area?

Clerk: Question number 502, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1060

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide the specification as purchased from the supplier of each portacabin making up the two-storey portacabin at St Martin's School?

Clerk: Question number 503, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1065

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government state the cost of each portacabin at St. Martin's School, their location, purpose and the provider?

Clerk: Question number 504, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1070

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, will the Government consider a more inclusive approach for children with disabilities short term in order to resolve the portacabin situation at St Martin's and long term so that all children are educated as per their catchment or choice rather than their abilities?

1075

Clerk: Question number 505, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government state where they intend to build St Martin's School and by when will the project be completed?

1080

Clerk: Question number 506, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Can the Government provide details of when it intends to provide a new bus as promised during the Budget of 2016 for St Martin's School?

1085

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the toilets are within the portacabin to the left as one enters the school site.

1090

There are six children per classroom, taught by one teacher who is supported by three learning support assistants in each of the portacabins.

The ground floor cabin roof has been insulated with 100 mm rigid expanded polystyrene (EPS) to improve sound proofing.

1095

In relation to 498, yes, I can confirm this.

Q499: all electrical installations, inclusive of lighting, are EU compliant and have been reviewed, and adapted, if applicable, by the Gibraltar Electricity Authority. External lighting is not required.

Protocols will be in place to guarantee the safety and wellbeing of all the children, even during transition, if this is required. Indeed, procedures are currently in place throughout our schools.

1100

The internal area of each mobile classroom is approximately 50 m². This is comprised of three modular units measuring 6.00 x 2.40 m (43 m²) and one WC disability specification toilet facility measuring 2.90 x 2.40 m (7 m²).

1105

Specifications, as in surface area etc., have already been answered in my reply to Q501. I think there is a slight repetition in Q502.

The information requested in Q502 by the hon. Member is set out in the schedule which I now hand to him; however, as additional information, I can reassure the hon. Member that the modular units comply with EU regulations and are certified under ISO 9001:2008 and ISO 1404:2004.

1110

Answer to Question 502:

General Technical Specification — Modular

Units 1.1 Modular Structure

- Totally self-supporting, constructed with UPN160 beams.
- Beams and floor joists have been factory welded.
- The structure consists of 4 x 100 x 100 columns. The roof structure has been designed with two functions, the collection of rainwater and suitable to support and stack additional units. Constructed with profiled panels.
- The above mentioned structural elements are hot dip galvanised and powder coated in white.
- Certified to conform to Building Regulations 305/2011, 9th March 2011 by AENOR quality assurance accreditation. Marked CE.

1.2 Floor

- The installation and design of the profiles together with the anchor points provide an elevated floor finish of 180 mm.
- The deck consists of a 19mm thick water-resistant board. The floor boards are lined with proprietary non-slip linoleum with a welded seal.
- The deck is designed to support a loading of 350 kg/m².

1.3 Enclosure

- The vertical enclosures on all modular units consist of sandwich panels with the following characteristics:

Composition:

2 x 5 mm hot dip galvanised zinc sheets with a powder coated paint finish (white)

Insulation:

The sandwich between the aforementioned sheets is injected with polyurethane resin, (s/norma DIN

4102), applied HCFC and CFC-141v. Density 40 kg/m³

Roof:

Constructed using the same insulated sandwich panel as the vertical walls.

The complete composition of the panels including the insulation provides a total thickness of 60 mm.

The design and composition of the panels, guarantees the insulation and waterproofing properties.

The panel's suitability is certified by ICITE in the European Union, the Construction Technical Agreement UEAtc

In relation to Question 503, the total cost of both Portman portacabins amounts to approximately £75,000. The ground floor portacabin was installed in 2016 for a total cost of £35,183. The first floor portacabin was installed in August 2017 and the total cost will be in the region of £39,000.

1115

The modular classrooms are located in the patio entrance to the school adjacent to the main building structure and serves as two classrooms with individual toilet facilities that are situated

for children with disabilities. Both projects were undertaken by GJBS Ltd and they were purchased from Portman Ltd.

1120 In relation to Q504, the Government will consider no such approach. The hon. Member clearly fails to understand the meaning of inclusive education and I would ask him to read up on the literature. The Government will not deviate from the path it has traced out in terms of delivering a new St Martin's. We also make absolutely sure that the needs of current children at the school are met.

1125 In relation to Question 505, the Government will be making the pertinent announcements when it is in a position to do so. And in relation to Q506 – the bus – the procurement process is underway.

1130 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, just turning to the first question which is Question 495, the Hon. Minister has said that the portacabin that he was referring to was the first on the left, which I presume is the two-storey portacabin. Can he confirm this?

1135 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I have said where the toilets are and they are the ones that he has referred to, yes.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, I ask this because obviously I took in good faith what he had replied to in answer to a question prior to the Budget; however, it does not coincide with what he has said on social media. I will read what he said on social media, which is why I am particularly confused, Mr Speaker:

Now on the subject of the new pre fab extension. Incidentally, the toilets I referred to in Parliament were another building altogether and had nothing to do with this.

1140 Can he confirm then, if the toilets and the prefab extension he was referring to have nothing to do with the two-storey building – at the time it was a portacabin classroom and now it is a two-storey portacabin classroom – where the prefab extension he was referring to in Parliament is?

1145 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, absolutely, because the toilet I referred to at the time had nothing to do with that. That is where the toilets are, which is what I have answered today.

If you recall, Mr Speaker, the thing is I think so much has been made ... this is why I have to be cautious, because I try to offer assistance. If we go back to *Hansard*, this was in relation to a question on increases in St Martin's School and then I am asked:

Mr Speaker, I would like to ask one supplementary. Therefore, the portacabin that has been placed in the car park, I take it that is for toilet facilities or is it for classroom facilities?

1150 I did not know what he was referring to and I said:

Mr Speaker, specifically which portacabin is he referring to? There are several on the site.

– which is not so; there are prefab buildings, but I was working from memory. Right. So I was referring to prefab buildings. Then he said:

I believe it is the one where the bus usually did a three-point turn just as you go in in the main entrance.

At the time, I thought he was referring to the outbuilding on the right-hand side, which I believed was the toilets. Then I said:

The portacabin at that level, I believe, is a toilet facility.

1155 This was a totally noncommittal answer in good faith, answering a question which had nothing to do with the original question, and I have clarified where the toilets actually are, and therefore I think that is all I can add.

1160 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, just for clarification before I proceed with another supplementary, the original question, Q328, had nothing to do with students and pupils; it was actually:

What modifications to St Martin's School and Early Birds Nursery are being carried out or being planned in preparation for September 2017?

So, Mr Speaker, the question I did propose originally was relating to any extensions or works being carried out, rather than –

1165 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, if I may clarify, the supplementary was referring to the increase because in my reply to the supplementary I referred to the increase in pupil numbers.

Hon. L F Llamas: In any event, Mr Speaker, regarding the lighting, the Minister has said there is no need for external lighting in the portacabin; is that correct?

1170 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** That is the advice that we have been provided. It appears that the lighting that is there anyway through other external lighting is such that it does not specifically require its own dedicated light. Should it be found that it is necessary then clearly that will be provided at very short notice. But that is the advice that I have.

1175 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, I would like the Hon. Minister to please reconsider that. Having looked at the Department of Education in the UK, 'Advice on standards for school premises,' issued in March 2015, I will quote what they had to say on lighting for pupils with special educational needs, and that is, Mr Speaker, that:

Pupils with special educational needs, including visual impairment or other disabilities, may have additional lighting requirements and specialist advice may be needed.

1180 Mr Speaker, given that this is a building which has steps which are external, it would seem that it is pretty obvious that this staircase, in particular, has to be illuminated and floodlights to the area have to be provided in order to increase the accessibility and the procedure in arriving into the classrooms.

1185 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, specialist advice has been given and if the specialist advice changes and I am told that we have to provide additional lighting I have said this will be provided. The advice that we have at the moment is that, clearly, there is sufficient lighting for that purpose.

1190 General advice is not relevant to specific locations. I will, myself, go there. I go there regularly, but I will, myself, go there after dark to ascertain it for myself, but that is not specialist advice. I am not a specialist.

Q507/2017
School classrooms –
Adequate heating

Clerk: Question number 507, the Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

1195 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Will an audit be carried out before the cold weather starts to ensure that all schools have adequate heating in all classrooms?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1200

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, we continuously monitor this and, consequently, there is no need for a formal audit.

1205 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, there were many complaints last year about the heating. If there will not be an audit, what other solution does the Minister propose?

1210 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** No, precisely because of the fact that there were complaints, we have been monitoring this and the team is preparing an assessment. It is not going to be a formal audit because we are getting information from the teachers and so on. But, as I say, we are monitoring this and we are hoping that the problems that apparently occurred in some classrooms last year will not occur again.

Q508/2017
School lunches –
Update

Clerk: Question number 508, the Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

1215 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Can Government give this House an update on the matter of school lunches?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1220

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, an implementation model is being discussed to coincide with the launch of the new schools.

1225 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Can the Minister give us any idea by when this launch will happen?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: The eternal word 'soon'! But it is soon. We are developing the presentation and you will hear about it, Mr Speaker, very soon indeed.

Q509/2017
Supply teachers –
Government policy

1230 **Clerk:** Question number 509, the Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: What is this Government's policy in connection with the supply cohort of teachers?

1235 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):
1240 Mr Speaker, I am not entirely clear about what the hon. Member is attempting to ascertain. Government policy on the supply cohort is based on demand across sectors and subjects. We added 47 new teachers to the complement when we were elected in 2011.

But I am not sure whether that is the information that she was requesting.

1245 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I was asking the question in relation to the fact that, from what I understand, the supply teachers are tied down to waiting to hear when they need to step up, while at the same time they are on a zero-hour contract and, basically, I know that many of them feel like they are tied down without being able to pursue other jobs by being on standby daily and they are not earning or having anything to do.

1250 So my question really was getting at whether there are any other jobs in Government Departments; would that be a possibility so that they do not go stale, as such, waiting for that phone call to supply teach? These are young teachers who might be losing time and experience in waiting.

1255 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, that second part of that question is not something that I can answer, but clearly there would be difficulties in having people on standby, but that is something that I think would have to be addressed separately.

1260 In relation to people being on standby, that is the nature of being on a supply list. It is not a comfortable thing to be on, but obviously the Department of Education has to have a policy by which it has people available to call in at short notice. If we did not have such a supply list then, clearly, we would be failing the education of our young people. There is a policy on when supply teachers are called in and I would be very happy to share that, but I do not think that is the point the hon. Member is making. I think that anybody on a supply list, not just teachers, would have to be conscious of the fact that it is a supply list and that this is the nature of such an arrangement.

Q510, Q522-528, Q535-537/2017

Health care –

**Hospital escalator; Septicaemia cases; GHA Tertiary Referrals Board and sponsored patients;
Cancellation of medical procedures; Chemotherapy treatment; UK GMC registration**

1265 **Clerk:** Question number 510, the Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, can the Minister provide details on the periods during which the escalator outside the hospital has been unserviceable since 1st January 2017?

1270 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with questions 522 to 528 and 535 to 537.

1275 **Clerk:** Question number 522, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government disclose since December 2011 how many cases of septicaemia have been reported together with (a) the hospital where first diagnosed and (b). period person was hospitalised?

1280

Clerk: Question number 523, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government disclose since April 2012 a breakdown of each sponsored patient sent outside Gibraltar including: (a) the hospital centre attended; (b) the length of stay; (c) the care received; (d) the cost of the trip; (e) whether it was a first visit or first review?

1285

Clerk: Question number 524, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm that the GHA Tertiary Board consults with physicians in charge of sponsored patients outside Gibraltar when taking a decision?

1290

Clerk: Question number 525, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1295

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm that all patients who have not been approved to be reviewed outside by the GHA Tertiary Board have had their medical cases formally handed over by the hospital or clinic they had been attending?

1300 **Clerk:** Question number 526, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government explain on what basis does their GHA Tertiary Board can conclude that a specialised consultant's surgeon patient care plan in a leading hospital in London, 'does not provide the optimal treatment for the patient's condition'?

1305

Clerk: Question number 527, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a monthly schedule of formal complaints filed against the GHA as from April 2012?

1310

Clerk: Question number 528, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm how many medical procedures have been cancelled since April 2012, and the reasons why?

1315

Clerk: Question number 535, the Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: What is this Government's policy with regard to where patients are entitled to have their chemotherapy treatment since the opening of the Ayling Buttigieg Chemotherapy Suite?

1320

Clerk: Question number 536, the Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

1325 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Where does the GHA stand at present with the new regulation regarding the registration of doctors with the UK GMC?

Clerk: Question number 537, the Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

1330 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, if I may, given that these questions are bunched up can I just say that I found out some of the answers to these questions in the press a couple of days after I had submitted the questions, which took me by surprise. I did not expect to find these answers in the press, but nonetheless I continue to ask them now.

1335 How is registration with the UK GMC going to benefit the population of Gibraltar when many specialists who are well experienced may not be eligible to register and revalidate?

Clerk: Answer the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

1340 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, the two escalators outside the hospital were unserviceable between 1st January 2017 to 15th February 2017. Currently, one of the escalators remains unserviceable since 31st August 2017.

1345 Mr Speaker, it is a disproportionately lengthy task to provide, since December 2011, the cases of septicaemia that have been reported together with (a) the hospital where first diagnosed and (b) the period a person was hospitalised, as this data would have to be manually retrieved and this would entail going manually through thousands of records.

1350 I hope the hon. Gentleman understands that, given the laborious exercise, it would have taken staff away from their principal role in the laboratory where these cases are recorded. I will, however, provide the hon. Gentleman with the information that has been retrieved over the last four days: there were 212 patients admitted via A&E between August 2015 and August 2017 with potential sepsis.

1355 In relation to the breakdown of each sponsored patient sent outside since April 2012, including (a) the hospital centre attended, (b) length of stay, (c) care received, (d) cost of trip and (e) first visit or review per individual, I am providing the hon. Gentleman with the only information the Sponsored Patients Department has been able to compile over the last four days. Once again, Mr Speaker, it would be a disproportionately lengthy task to provide the information that the hon. Gentleman requests.

1360 I hope that he understands that, given the high demands on the Sponsored Patients Department staff and their numerous duties, to collate the information requested would have taken them away from their principal role of ensuring safe travel and adequate care to the sponsored patient. I will, however, Mr Speaker, hand over to the hon. Gentleman a schedule with the information we have been able to retrieve:

Financial Year	Number of new patients sent	Number of review cases sent	Sum of cost for treatment and travel
2012/13	N/A	N/A	£7,922,909.51
2013/14	N/A	N/A	£10,667,162.77
2014/15	N/A	N/A	£13,094,326.65
2015/16	2624	4033	£14,372,871.97
2016/17	2786	3272	£18,085,482.18

Further, Mr Speaker, the GHA Tertiary Referrals Board makes its decisions based on all the available clinical information, which includes clinical reports, of course, from the other hospitals.

1365 It is the case, Mr Speaker, that all patients who have not been approved to be reviewed abroad by the GHA Tertiary Referrals Board have had their medical cases formally handed over by the hospitals or clinics they had been attending.

The Sponsored Patients Programme is designed to provide patients with clinical services that are not available in Gibraltar. Once patients complete their specialised treatment, follow up care will continue in Gibraltar, if the medical services are available locally.

1370 The information as to the formal complaints filed against the GHA, as from April 2012, is published on the GHA website.

1375 Mr Speaker, once again, it is a disproportionately lengthy task to provide figures for the number of medical procedures that have been cancelled since 2012, as this data would have to be retrieved from patient notes and this would entail going manually through thousands of records.

The number of medical procedures that have been cancelled since 2013, however, will be in the schedule that I will hand over to the hon. Gentleman:

	Patient Did Not Attend	Cancellations Medically unfit / Non-compliant with preparation	Cancellations Equipment Failure	Cancellations Refurbishment Works
2013	6	6	-	30
2014	12	22	10	-
2015	15	26	-	-
2016	43	15	-	-
2017	50	40	-	-

1380 I hope, once again, Mr Speaker, that the hon. Gentleman understands that, given the laborious exercise, it would have taken staff away from their principal role in the Medical Investigation Unit where these procedures are performed.

1385 Mr Speaker, the Government policy with regard to where patients are entitled to have their chemotherapy treatment is first and foremost to provide the best possible medical treatment to our patients. It is precisely for this reason that the Government has invested in setting up the specialist unit to provide chemotherapy to patients locally. The unit has been hugely popular, to the extent that we are in the process of, in fact, expanding the service even further. Patients are entitled to receive the best possible care and we are proud to say that is exactly what they are getting at the Ayling Buttigieg Chemotherapy Suite.

1390 Mr Speaker, the regulation has been implemented in respect of the GMC as from 1st April 2017 and I am informed by the Gibraltar Medical Registration Board that the vast majority of practising doctors and specialists in Gibraltar have been licensed. There are a small number of doctors who are on transitional relief, most of whom are expected to obtain their licence before the end of the year.

1395 Mr Speaker, in respect of how the GMC registration will benefit our community – and, with respect, I do not accept the hon. Lady's premise of the question – the vast majority of doctors in Gibraltar, including specialists, have already been registered and licensed with the GMC. All doctors working for the GHA, for example, have been already licensed.

1400 The Government is supporting the remaining doctors to obtain their licences through membership of the Independent Doctors Federation and by other means. When the reforms are fully implemented, all doctors holding qualifications recognised by the GMC, whether they are GPs or specialists, will continue to be supported by the Government in maintaining their licences.

1405 These reforms are greatly important, Mr Speaker, for our community, as once the reform is fully implemented the people of Gibraltar can be assured that all their doctors have committed themselves to the UK standard of good medical practice, are undertaking an appraisal every year with a trained independent medical appraiser and are having their licences revalidated every five years, just as all doctors do in the UK.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, I thank the Hon. Minister for his very courteous answer and –

1410 **Mr Speaker:** Before we deal with supplementaries there is a matter I want to clear up.

The Hon. Neil Costa spoke to me and has assured me that when his Department, the GHA, issued a press release on Tuesday – I think it was Tuesday of last week – on the question of GMC registration he had not seen that there were two questions on the Order Paper.

1415 I have accepted those assurances without reservation, but it gives me an opportunity to give Ministers some guidance. If Parliament meets on a Friday the questions are received on the previous Friday and the staff immediately email those questions to the Departments concerned. Obviously, on the first day that they are received, Ministers are not going to be working on the answers; probably civil servants in the Department will be dealing with at least the first drafts.

1420 But in order to avoid that we get a reoccurrence of when a press release is issued when there is already a question on the Order Paper, could I suggest that Ministers, that day, do have a cursory glance through the questions that they are down for answer, and that would give them an indication of the subject matter, and try to avoid issuing a press release in the interim.

1425 Having said that, there are going to be occasions when, because of an emergency, because of a question of public interest, the Government will need, on some matter or other, to deal with an issue that is the subject of a question and may have to issue a press release beforehand.

That is just by way of general guidance.

1430 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, if I may, just on a procedural point, in fact my understanding is that the questions do not go to the Department, they go to the Parliament team at No 6, that then distributes them to the Department. At least that is what I see from where I am sitting.

1435 In some instances, the procedure that the Hon. Mr Speaker sets out would be the best one to follow but, unfortunately, sometimes Ministers are busy throughout the day and will not get to see questions. But the House is ensured of the Government's goodwill in seeking to avoid issuing press statements about matters on which questions have been asked, where it is appropriate to do so.

1440 In this particular instance, I sincerely believe that there is the public interest in knowing that that particular deadline was up and that the application of rules in respect of doctors was applicable; and, as I understand it, this was something that was programmed to happen at that time regardless of the question.

1445 So I think this fits neatly within the exemption that Mr Speaker set out, which is a highly relevant one, of the public interest, where the Government cannot allow the Opposition to – and I will use language which I do not intend to be emotive or pejorative – gag the Government in respect of what the Government can say in the seven days or longer that may elapse before a question is answered, in respect of an item which may be of public interest, or which may be subject of what some people might regard as a ding-dong from Opposition to Government.

1450 So a press release is issued by the Opposition saying, 'The Government are terrible so-and-sos for a reason'; the same day the Opposition puts in a question, the Government cannot be prevented from responding that, 'Actually we are lovely blokes and not so-and-sos,' because the ding-dong is then subjected to parliamentary questions.

But other than that, I think we all endeavour not to pre-empt parliamentary questions being answered in the course of the issue of press releases.

Mr Speaker: The Hon. Neil Costa.

1455

Hon. N F Costa: Yes, Mr Speaker, just to, apart from associating myself with the explanation provided by the Hon. the Chief Minister, simply to say that certainly it was no one's fault other than entirely my own. I should have checked the questions before I issued the press release and I have no compunction in saying that I apologised to the hon. Lady when she brought it to my attention and I have no problem in doing so for the record across the floor of the House.

1460

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, thank you, I appreciate that explanation and I take it in good faith.

1465

Can I just ask a couple of supplementaries? I know that there were loads of questions bunched together, but if I just may.

On Q535, the chemotherapy arrangement, I understand that, from what I take from the answer, it seems like there is a slow process to migrate chemotherapy treatment to Gibraltar because of this new facility and I completely understand that. However, I was led to believe that at the moment existing patients had the choice as to where they took their chemotherapy treatment.

1470

I have a few constituents who have come to me saying and showing me letters where they are not being given a choice and they are, effectively, being forced to have the treatment at this new facility in Gibraltar.

1475

It is causing them a lot of grief, because of course these patients have been having their treatment specifically somewhere else, whether it is Algeciras or Marbella or whatever, and they have developed a relationship of trust with their oncologist and it has caused them a lot of grief. They are spending a lot of time with dealing with emails and so on and so forth trying to convince the GHA to let them continue having their treatment where they are.

1480

Can the Minister give some assurances or something to the effect that these people do indeed still have the choice – existing patients?

1485

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, I fully understand that a patient should wish to continue any clinical relationship with an institution abroad, but the hon. Lady should, I think, consider the context. The Government has spent capital and recurrent expenditure on repatriating certain services to be provided locally by the GHA.

1490

The reason being of course that when one is ill and has a serious illness like cancer, perhaps the last thing that one would want to do is add the unnecessary stress of travel, and it makes sense – it certainly made sense to my hon. predecessor, Dr John Cortes, and the Hon. Chief Minister – that where we can provide equal or even better services locally we should be able to do so. That was the aim of the Hon. Dr John Cortes and the Hon. Chief Minister inaugurating this particular chemotherapy centre.

1495

The hon. Lady should rest assured that any therapies that are not available in Gibraltar will continue to be provided by an institution abroad, but for those therapies, which include immunotherapies, chemotherapies, hormone treatment for adult solid tumours, that can be provided within the GHA, then it makes sense that they should be provided at the GHA.

1500

The Government having spent money on fitting out a state-of-the-art clinic and having trained and hired clinical professionals to be able to provide the service at home, it makes sense to provide it at home. Whereas, Mr Speaker, I certainly understand that each person is an entire world and some persons may prefer to go abroad, but in my experience when I had an operation my preference was to have had the operation done locally, had I had the choice, which I did not.

But it is a policy decision of the Government that if the same kind of treatment can be provided locally then we will be providing it locally.

1505 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I thank the Minister for this explanation. I just want to draw his attention to the issue of distance and making it more comfortable for the patient in Gibraltar because of lack of distance; but it is horses for courses really because there is the issue of trust versus distance. Some patients do not mind the trek to Algeciras for 20 minutes or HC, for example, in Marbella for 40 minutes, if it means they are seeing a doctor that has saved their lives over the last four years.

1510 Also I draw the Minister to a *Chronicle* article from 12th August where it says specifically that patients with cancers, including breast, prostate, stomach, lung and colon are given the choice of being treated at St Bernard's Hospital.

1515 So I think there is some sort of confusion, at least for the patient as to what the policy is. I would not be so assuming as to put myself in his shoes, but is it not obvious to perhaps take it as a policy that future patients or patients coming into the unfortunate world of cancer perhaps need to abide by this new policy, but the existing ones still should continue to have the choice until they finish their treatment?

1520 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, I note the point the hon. Lady makes in relation to trust but unless the patient with cancer actually attends the Ayling Buttigieg clinic there will be no possibility for that patient to establish a relationship of trust with the doctor and nurses in Gibraltar.

1525 I can assure the hon. Lady that the patient who is having a service repatriated from the UK or Spain to Gibraltar is fully informed and advised, and I insist when I receive an email or a telephone call or a Facebook message, when people query the reasons why a clinical decision has been made to refer treatment to Gibraltar that the clinicians meet with the patient to fully explain.

1530 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, again, I thank him for the explanation, but it is at odds with this article which talks about the local suite, for example, 'only took on new chemotherapy patients as the GHA wish to refrain from interfering with ongoing treatment abroad.' It just does not add up. The Minister is not showing consistency.

1535 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, I am afraid she is reading the article out of context. 'For those treatments that are not available locally' – she is missing the second essential element of the definition. If the GHA provides a service locally and the taxpayer pays for clinicians, specialists, doctors and nurses and pays for all the clinical treatments, it would be, I think, a dereliction of us as the holders of the public purse to pay for all of that in Gibraltar but also pay for exactly the same treatment in the UK – in addition, and quite apart from the fact that every single clinician that I have spoken to has told me that certain patients should avoid travel at all costs and for the majority of cases of persons who live with cancer, they are certainly one of the persons who should avoid travel where at all possible. *It is possible* because we have the most magnificent chemotherapy suite established within the GHA.

1545 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I continue to see that the article conflicts with what the Minister is saying, but I will let that lie for a moment.

All I ask of the Minister is perhaps to establish better lines of communication with existing patients in order to assure them that their treatment is just as viable in Gibraltar if that is the way it is going to carry on.

1550 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, I can assure the hon. Lady – I can assure her – that there is not an email or text or call that has come in to my office where I do not myself call the clinician, or my principal secretary calls the clinician, and insists that the patient and the families meet with them so that the process can be fully explained.

1555 We fully take the hon. Lady's comments that medical treatments are matters which need to be treated delicately and sensitively and compassionately, and that some persons will be happy to simply have the services repatriated from abroad to Gibraltar and there will be others who, because they have developed, as she said, a relationship of trust with an institution abroad, would prefer that the relationship continues.

1560 But, for all the reasons I have explained to her in this House, I can assure her that there is communication and if there is any example that she can point to me, either privately or across the floor of this House, where this has not happened, she only need tell me and I will make sure that a meeting is held with the relevant clinicians, the patient and the family.

1565 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, I thank the Hon. Minister for his positive approach and it is very welcome.

Mr Speaker, the answers the Hon. Minister has given seem to suggest that there could be some value in perhaps reviewing the data-gathering practices of the GHA as to ensure that such data can be easily retracted, but beyond that can easily be processed and analysed by the GHA and the Government at large. Is this something the Government is committed to looking into?

1570 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, I would not like to enter into a commitment across the floor of the House because I would first need to understand what it is that would be required. I can assure the hon. Gentleman that from the moment that we received the questions my office goes from fifth to sixth gear and have spent all week just working on the answers, and I have given him precisely all of the information that we have been able to retrieve without affecting patient care. You should not think for a second that I am trying to obfuscate or to be difficult. Indeed in one of the questions he asked from 2012 and I have given it since 2013. So it was not that back going ... but I can assure him that what we have available we do provide. I will go back and ask whether there is any way that we can better collate data to be able to provide to the hon. Gentleman.

1585 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, referring to one of the questions to do with sponsored patients and the way in which the board is analysing and deciding whether patients will be sent abroad or not, it has come to my attention, and I know the Hon. Minister is aware, that there are cases in which the patients are being declined the application to go abroad and it has come to my attention that there has been no interaction with the clinician abroad in terms of what the best way forward is, how best to treat the patient and whether they are happy to hand over the patient's care to the GHA and have a formal handover and discussion on what the care plan that the clinician in the UK, for example, had for that particular case.

1590 Is this something that is perhaps the odd case that is happening in the community or is this a policy that is being taken by the board?

1595 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, I think in the first place, given that this is a new reform – it was only started in May of this year – I think it is important to place the context. Of all the applications received for referrals to the UK, 80% have been approved – eight zero! – so the majority of referrals made by our GHA clinicians, once they reach the Tertiary Referrals Board, are actually being approved.

1600 So we are only talking about 20% of referrals that are not being approved and, as I have explained in articles in the press and also in press releases, the decision of the Tertiary Referrals Board is purely, solely and exclusively clinical. It is comprised of three senior clinicians, chaired by the Medical Director himself and basically the board considers whether or not the referral is necessary. If it is necessary then I can assure the Hon. Gentleman the cost is not an issue and the person will be referred.

1605 There will always be reports from the UK or Spanish hospital, and if there is not they would certainly request it; and if there are any questions then the board will certainly insist that the clinician calls, personally, the clinician in the UK or Spain to make additional contacts.

Indeed, it has been the case that due to further contact between the referring clinician and the UK or Spanish hospital, the GHA clinician has once again referred the matter to the Tertiary Referrals Board who have received additional information and has changed their view.

1610 So there is, in my estimation, seamless communication – although undoubtedly there will be cases where perhaps there are gaps in the data, but any gap in the data will be very easily resolved.

1615 Just one thing that he did say – and I am not trying to be picky – is that the UK or the foreign institution may or may not be happy to refer the matter to the GHA or release the care to the GHA. Remember that some hospitals to whom we refer our patients are privately run, so they will never be happy to refer the matter to us, because of course it will mean that they will stop charging us for those services.

Hon. L F Llamas: I fully understand, Mr Speaker, and the hospital I was referring to is one of the trusts with which the GHA has a reciprocal agreement.

Mr Speaker, also on sponsored patients, is the Minister, in light of the answer given to question 523 in this Chamber this morning, is he comfortable with the figures in the fourth column; that is the figures given for the sum of costs?

1625 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, unfortunately, yes.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, just going back to question 522 to do with sepsis, can the Minister confirm that there is a sepsis screening policy in place within the GHA on arrival at A&E?

1630 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the GHA has up-to-date protocols for the management of patients with sepsis and has used an electronic antibiotic guideline since 2016 to standardise treatment. The care of patients with life threatening sepsis or septic shock is managed by a multi-disciplinary team including A&E, the intensive care team, the medical team, the surgical team and our microbiology consultant, Dr N Cortes, who was appointed in 2014 – (**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** No relation!) I say 2014 because he happens to be my cousin and I had nothing to do with it, and no relation to Dr Cortes.

1640 **Mr Speaker:** Any other supplementaries? The Hon. Trevor Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Yes, Mr Speaker – and I am not entirely sure why my question, which was of a very technical nature and completely non-clinical, was lumped in with a lot of clinical questions which are obviously very important to those involved in those matters.

1645 Just going back to the escalator and the very first question that was asked – and I think the Minister said the escalator was at present out of service and had been since 1st August –

Hon. N F Costa: One of them.

1650 **Hon. T N Hammond:** One of them. Was it 1st or 31st August, I am not sure which. But could the Minister perhaps ... does he have any idea of when the escalator may be returned to service?

Hon. N F Costa: Yes, Mr Speaker. Simply to repeat, one of the escalators remains unserviceable since 31st August – I am advised that spares are due to arrive imminently with

1655 rectification works to commence on delivery; and the second escalator is still in service and has been set to remain in the 'up' mode until both units are operational.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, I have a couple of supplementaries on the GMC questions.

1660 Regarding the 10% of doctors that are not yet registered, are these doctors within the GHA; what type of special assistance is going to be provided in order that they do register?

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, as I advised the hon. Lady during the course of my answer, all GHA doctors have been registered and licensed by the GMC. As I have also explained to the hon. Lady during the course of my answer, the Government is supporting the remaining doctors to obtain their licences through the membership of the Independent Doctors Federation.

1665 The press release, to which she mentioned during the course of asking me the question, actually was issued because the Independent Doctors Federation arrives in the first week of October and we are alerting all private doctors who have been unable to register and be licensed by the GMC that we have this association coming to Gibraltar precisely to be able to help them complete their registration and licensing with the GMC.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Am I correct in saying – because the Minister has just said that all the doctors in the GHA have already registered – I thought, or I was led to understand, that 2% were not registerable; is that not correct, that 2% of doctors or two doctors were not actually registerable?

Hon. N F Costa: Yes, during the course of an interview I noted that there were three doctors who had not been able to register. Those doctors are receiving our support in order to be able to be licensed, but their issues relate to language difficulties. In other words, they have the qualifications obviously from the country next to us and they would be fully registerable here with us now, except that they have an issue with the language which we are helping them with and which we are entirely satisfied the GMC will accept – although I probably have jinxed it by saying that right now, but that is our sincere hope.

1685 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Regarding the fact that a lot of our patients go to Spain to receive treatment and of course there is no GMC licensing there, and considering how much emphasis and priority the Government has given to this body, how are these doctors going to be able to match up to such a body that we have the equivalent of in Gibraltar when our patients are receiving the treatment by Spanish doctors in Spain?

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, I think it has to be put into context in the first place. The majority of doctors and specialists have already been registered and licensed by the GMC. Of course, as she will know, European Union legislation demands that a doctor's qualification in France be recognised in England and vice-versa, but each national jurisdiction has a right to add conditions which it thinks are important, such as being able to communicate in the language. So you may have the best neurosurgeon in Germany who wants to come and work in the UK, but if he cannot communicate in English then, in my estimation and indeed in the estimation of the GMC, it would make very little sense in employing the person because they would be unable to communicate with the patients.

1695 So we are in the situation which is exactly analogous to the one in the UK. A doctor who wants to register in the UK needs to become registered and licensed by the GMC and the only issue, if you are from the European Union and have a European Union doctor's qualification, is language. We would expect that doctor, whether it is in the UK or in Gibraltar, or indeed if it is a UK doctor going to France or a French doctor going to Germany or a German doctor going to the Netherlands, to speak the language.

So qualifications from Spain are entirely and automatically recognised here by virtue of our legislation and EU law, but it makes sense that they should also be able to speak in English.

1710 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Thank you for that. Another question: the time that it takes for this update and revalidation; will it have an impact on patient care, because it would take away some time from clinic work or surgical work? Has the Government put a plan in place in order for things not to end up ... there being a backlog that impacts on the patients as a result of this new requirement?

1715 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, in the first place let me provide assurance to the Hon. Lady by saying that the GMC has now been regulating UK doctors for quite a long time and there has been no case reported or no complaint lodged that, as a result of the annual appraisal by the independent doctor and the revalidation every five years, there has been any backlog built up.

1720 I expressly, in fact, asked that question to the Medical Director and he assures me that will not be the case.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: One more, if I may. Will, effectively – I suspect that the Minister for Health will say no but I need to ask – will this not perhaps have a negative impact on doctors who do want to come to Gibraltar but really do not want to bother revalidating with the GMC? Would we lose doctors of high calibre as a result of this new scheme?

1730 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the whole purpose of GMC validation and revalidation is precisely so that the community knows that these are specialists and doctors who have been able to achieve high medical standards. Each GMC registered and licensed practitioner has to comply with a whole series of conditions and, of course, with principles. So the persons that we want in Gibraltar are, in fact, the GMC registered and licensed doctors, so the GMC registration and licensing will improve the quality of the medical care that we provide. *(Interjection by the Hon. Chief Minister)*

1735 Yes. Yes, the Hon. the Chief Minister brings up an analogy, which is that we would not buy a vehicle that has perhaps suffered failure of their MOT exam. So similarly we want to make sure doctors do pass their MOT and are happy and willing to submit themselves to such independent investigation and revalidation. *(Interjection by the Hon. Chief Minister)*

1740 **Mr Speaker:** Any other supplementaries? The Hon. Trevor Hammond.

1745 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, actually I would like to thank the Minister for that last answer because it was interesting. I can see parallels in my own industry where, while you can travel anywhere in Europe with your licence, you do need to speak the language which is clearly a fundamental. So it makes perfect sense that that should be the case.

However, back to the escalators! Just with respect to the last answer the Minister gave to the supplementary, that the parts are on their way, can I ask whether the escalators are still under any warranty or whether there is any additional cost in the current maintenance that is being undertaken?

1750 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the first instance of unserviceability of the escalators in January, we have not paid for that on the basis that the damage occurred due to heavy rains and our view was that they should have been able to endure the rains and therefore we were not paying it. In any case, the escalators at that point were under warranty period. The warranty period has now expired and I have not received any costing in respect of the spares or the works that will be required to be undertaken, but if he asks me on the next occasion I will be happy to provide it to him.

1760 **Hon. T N Hammond:** And, as is typical in any household, the warranty has always just expired when it breaks. Is the Minister satisfied that such a breakdown is acceptable in what is an expensive piece of kit? I think the total cost of installation of these escalators was in the order of £200,000, including the design obviously.

1765 Does the Minister find it satisfactory that shortly after the warranty should expire we found ourselves in a position where the lifts are out of service for the best part of a month, presumably, by the time that they are reinstated, and at further cost to the taxpayer?

1770 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, anyone who knows me will know the answer to that already. I shall be exploring every single legal avenue to ensure that we do not have to pay a penny for what has happened to the escalators.

Hon. T N Hammond: From which I assume the answer to the question is he is not satisfied then?

1775 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q511-520, Q531-533/2017

Police and judicial matters –

Parole drug tests; Release of Isaac Marrache; Judicial Services Commission;

Director of Public Prosecutions; Trial waiting times;

Civil claims and criminal actions before the Supreme Court; Police manning levels;

Armed patrol boat officers; Supreme Court Judge's contract; Young offenders

Clerk: Question number 511, the Hon. E J Phillips.

1780 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, further to Questions 45 to 47/2017 can the Government state whether the Superintendent has issued the requisite notice under the Prison Act for the mandatory drugs testing of prisoners at HMP Windmill Hill?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

1785 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 512 to 520 and 531 to 533.

Clerk: Question number 512, the Hon. E J Phillips.

1790 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, further to Questions 45-47/2017 can the Government state whether the Parole Board now imposes mandatory drugs testing conditions to those persons released on parole?

1795 **Clerk:** Question number 513, the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Justice confirm the legal fees paid by the Government in the appeal by the Minister against the decision of Mr Justice Jack in respect of the decision of the Parole Board to release Mr Isaac Marrache?

1800 **Clerk:** Question number 514, the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, can the Government state on what dates the Judicial Services Commission met between 1st June 2016 and 31st July 2017?

Clerk: Question number 515, the Hon. E J Phillips.

1805

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state when it intends to appoint a Director of Public Prosecutions?

Clerk: Question number 516, the Hon. E J Phillips.

1810

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state the average time it takes from when the RGP charge an individual to full trial in proceedings before the Magistrates Court?

Clerk: Question number 517, the Hon. E J Phillips.

1815

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Minister for Justice state the number of civil claims, including family proceedings, issued at the Supreme court each of month from January 2014 to present?

Clerk: Question number 518, the Hon. E J Phillips.

1820

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Minister for Justice confirm the number of criminal actions listed before the Supreme Court each month from 1st June 2016 to 31st July 2017?

Clerk: Question number 519, the Hon. E J Phillips.

1825

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state the Royal Gibraltar Police manning levels by year from 1997 to present?

Clerk: Question number 520, the Hon. R M Clinton.

1830

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, can the Government advise whether, given the shooting incident at sea in June 2017, the RGP and other local enforcement agencies are still arming officers on patrol boats for their own personal protection?

Clerk: Question number 531, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1835

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government explain why they had communicated to the Supreme Court Judge on a three-year contract that his contract would not be renewed before the Budget, but failed to advise this House that the estimates being debated were in fact incorrect as they had been superseded by events in at least one Head?

1840

Clerk: Question number 532, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, does the Government have plans to increase manning levels at the Royal Gibraltar Police?

1845

Clerk: Question number 533, the Hon Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

Hon Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Does Government have any plans to provide alternative provision for detained young offenders other than Windmill Hill Prison?

1850

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the Prison Superintendent has not yet issued the requisite notice under the Prison Act for the mandatory drugs testing of prisoners at Her Majesty's Prison at Windmill Hill.

1855

I can confirm that the Parole Board now imposes drug testing as a condition of licence in those cases that it deems it to be necessary or desirable.

The legal fees paid by the Government in the successful appeal by the Minister in respect of the decision of the Parole Board were: his former firm, Isolas – £35,666.99; Blackstone Chambers – £68,590.

1860

Given that the Judicial Service Commission is totally independent from the Ministry of Justice, question 514 should be addressed to the Chairman of the Judicial Service Commission.

Mr Speaker, the Government will make an announcement on the appointment of a Director of Prosecutions when it is in a position to do so.

1865

The Gibraltar Courts Service does not retain information in a way that statistics can be compiled to ascertain the average time it takes from when the RGP charge an individual to full trial in the Magistrates Court.

Mr Speaker, the number of civil claims and the number of divorce, dissolution and matrimonial (DDM) cases issued at the Supreme Court each month from January 2014 to present is in the schedule I hand over to the hon. Gentleman:

1870

Answer to Question 533 of 2017

Answer to Question 517

2014	Civil Claims	DDM (Divorce Dissolution Matrimonial)	2015	Civil Claims	DDM (Divorce Dissolution Matrimonial)	2016	Civil Claims	DDM (Divorce Dissolution Matrimonial)	2017	Civil Claims	DDM (Divorce Dissolution Matrimonial)
Jan	25	9	Jan	10	6	Jan	10	9	Jan	10	7
Feb	21	7	Feb	7	11	Feb	6	7	Feb	12	10
Mar	21	8	Mar	14	4	Mar	5	11	Mar	11	11
Apr	19	11	Apr	16	7	Apr	7	12	Apr	11	10
May	17	11	May	12	6	Ma y	13	11	May	16	13
Jun	14	12	Jun	28	5	Jun	3	11	Jun	14	11
Jul	9	7	Jul	25	15	Jul	6	6	Jul	12	6
Aug	9	7	Aug	14	4	Aug	11	7	Aug	5	8
Sep t	20	17	Sept	18	14	Sep t	4	10	Up to 8 Sep t	2	1
Oct	21	12	Oct	62	13	Oct	5	13			
Nov	9	13	Nov	7	5	Nov	11	10			
Dec	10	7	Dec	18	4	Dec	19	10			

1875 The number of criminal actions listed before the Supreme Court each month from 1st June 2016 to 31st July of this year is also in the schedule I will hand over to the hon. Gentleman:

2016		2017	
Month	Number of criminal cases committed	Month	Number of criminal cases committed
June	2	January	9
July	5	February	4
August	5	March	4
September	5	April	1
October	0	May	5
November	5	June	1
December	5	July	3

The information as to RGP staffing levels is publically available information which is accessible to him in Parliament.

1880 Following a reassessment of the threat picture, the RGP reviewed its security posture and removed the armed officers on 17th July 2017.

In respect to the question the hon. Gentleman is asking on the Chief Secretary's communication to the former Supreme Court Judge, I refer the hon. Gentleman to the information already put in the public domain by press release 494/2017.

1885 Government is in receipt of a business case from the Royal Gibraltar Police, which deals with matters relating to human resources. Government is presently actively considering this business case in close consultation with the Commissioner of Police and the Royal Gibraltar Police Federation.

1890 The Government is actively looking at the possibility of alternative provisions for young offenders. Consultations are already ongoing between pertinent Government Departments and agencies with a view to finding a satisfactory solution.

At the present stage, we have identified a potential location, which we are actively considering, to determine if they are suitable to provide a secure accommodation and a detention centre.

1895 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, just before we digest some of the statistical elements that the Hon. Minister has provided, just going back to question 511, I am quite surprised that requisite notice has not been issued. The question that was asked in January of this year relates to the mandatory testing of prisoners where the Minister said in response to that supplementary question I gave to him:

In respect of the mandatory testing of prisoners, I have now spoken with the Superintendent that it is in his view that there has to be mandatory testing working in tandem with voluntary testing.

1905 Given the statement that the Hon. the Minister gave in January 2017, is there any reason why the Superintendent has not issued that requisite notice, given the strong indication given by the Minister that these two bases for testing of drugs in prison should operate in tandem; and the fact that the requisite notice has not been issued in a huge delay from January? I would be grateful for clarification.

1910 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker. Without wishing to reprise the Q&A session we had on the last occasion that the hon. Gentleman asked me the question, I think that he knows that it is my view that we should have mandatory drug testing at the same time as we have voluntary drug testing – which, as he knows, is quite a successful programme at the prison.

He can rest assured that there is no one more eager than I to make sure that the Superintendent, who is the officer under law who has the power to issue the notice, does so as soon as possible. After various discussions with him, I am regrettably satisfied that he has not been able to proceed, for good reasons, which I will explain to him now.

1915 In the first place, we now have: an MDT suite, which means that they can include samples, they can process the samples; there is a sample storing area inclusive of a secure refrigerator; there is a computer and equipment store; and an adjacent holding cell that may be used to securely hold prisoners waiting to provide the sample.

1920 The reason why we have a voluntary drug testing programme and not a mandatory drug testing programme, I am sure he will have alighted on in his mind already, is that in the event that a mandatory drug test comes out positive then the law, in effect, empowers the Government – the Prison – to impose disciplinary proceedings; and to that extent we therefore need to make sure that there is – as he will know from his own defence of criminal cases – continuity of evidence, security of samples, even up to and including the laboratory and coming back. In other words, if there is a positive result which is then challenged in the courts and there are issues as to any of those legal matters – which I know that he is very familiar with – then that positive result may be challenged and the whole purpose of the system defeated.

1925 To that extent, I am advised by the Prison Superintendent that he is requiring meetings with the judiciary in order to be able to brief JPs so that once the programme is up and running they will be able to call a JP to be able to attend to the processes and make sure that any disciplinary process that is metered out – which could include adding to the sentence of the prisoner – is done absolutely properly and immaculately, procedurally and substantively. This is why it has not been instituted yet.

1930 On the other hand, the voluntary programme is simply a contract entered into between the Prison and the inmate, so the reason why the inmate is incentivised to enter the programme is because he will obtain an increased grade of privileges. But when the end result of a positive result is that you may have days added to your sentence, then he will be, I am sure, realising that due to constitutional and legal reasons, the manual that has been employed in the UK, which is, if he has read it or at least looked at it, quite a thick file that needs to be implemented properly. To that extent as well, I am advised that the Home Office in the UK does have permanent officials that deal exclusively and solely with the process of monetary testing in prisons.

1935 To that extent, the Superintendent of Prisons has advised me that in order for all of this to come together they will require an MDT co-ordinator, so that none of the different legal, constitutional and procedural pieces of the jigsaw puzzle are missed and then the whole effect and purport of the system is undermined by the fact that some important evidentiary piece has been missed and the positive result cannot be taken into consideration, and the JPs are not able to analyse the case and consider what is the appropriate disciplinary consequence.

1945 **Hon. E J Phillips:** I am grateful to the Minister for that full answer to the question regarding mandatory testing. Just to get to the nub of it, clearly we have the legal framework available to us to conduct mandatory testing in prisons; the difficulty is a question of resourcing and a watertight procedure that will lead to successful prosecutions possibly and also adding on of sentences.

1950 I understand that, but this legislation has been, in my respectful view, in place for a very long time. The Superintendent has confirmed, via the Minister in Parliament, that there has to be mandatory testing running in parallel with voluntary testing. When does the Government believe it will be in a position for these two systems to run in parallel, given the clear issues that the Prison has with facilitating and underpinning this legislative framework that we have had in place for some time?

1960

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, I am afraid that I am not in a position today to be able to give him a timeframe and do not want to do so when I know that we may completely fail that deadline.

1965 What I will ask the hon. Gentleman to do is – of course if he wishes – at the next session of Parliament ask me again and I will, as I always do, I meet with the Prison Superintendent at least monthly; and I will, when I leave the House as well, email him – I am sure he is listening to the exchange that we are having – to ask him to report on progress and see whether at some point soon I will be able to tell him: this is the date by which the MDT system will be in place.

1970 **Hon. E J Phillips:** I thank you for that answer.

Just so that we get the position clear in relation to question 512, the Minister did confirm that drugs testing conditions are being added on to those that are released on parole; but I am not too sure that he used the word ‘mandatory’; is it mandatory or voluntary arrangements? I was not very clear on the conditions. Will they be, I assume, mandatory conditions that are imposed as part of the release on the licence itself? It is just a matter that the hon. Member, Mr Feetham, asked me about a couple of months ago.

1975 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman has alighted on the right answer: it is a condition of licence.

1980 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, in relation to the answer on manning levels in question 519, does the Minister agree with me that we should take seriously the statement by the Gibraltar Police Federation in respect of their statement that the RGP is woefully undermanned?

1985 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, I really do not want to seem difficult, but on the basis that the hon. Gentleman clearly does not know the increase in levels, I do not think that it lies in him to ask me a question as to whether or not I agree with that analysis.

It is interesting that the Chamber of Commerce was able to extrapolate from the publicly available information that under this Government, RGP resources on manpower have increased by – they said – 30%. But the point is that there has been an increase under this administration and if he wants to ask me that, certainly, in a further session of the House when he has been able to consider the information, he is of course perfectly entitled to do so.

1995 **Hon. E J Phillips:** It is just the genuine concern in relation to, effectively, the Police union, the Federation, and its members releasing public statements about manning levels in our community of police officers – concerns that have been alluded to by the Chamber in relation to numbers of visible police officers on our streets, and indeed the RGP themselves who have said quite publicly that they are in discussions with the Government in relation to manning levels, but see the need for that increase.

2000 I am asking a genuine question: whether the Government now accepts that an entire review of the services that are afforded by the Royal Gibraltar Police in our community generally, given the fact that the RGP is a different beast to what it was 50 years ago ... We all have to accept that. They do much more work in terms of the fraud activity that they have done in terms of questions I have asked this House before.

2005 Insofar as the explosion of the internet and the particular forensic nature of the work that they conduct, it is quite clear that many of the representations that I receive privately in relation to this issue relate to manning level resources in respect of the day-to-day work of the RGP.

2010 That is why I am asking the Minister if he would express his view, or express at least an indication of the Government’s view as to whether they agree with the Federation’s comments and also the comments by other bodies in our community.

Mr Speaker: The Minister is not required under the Rules to answer that question – whether he agrees with comments made in public. He can if he wishes to, but the Rules do not require that he do so. It is a matter for him.

2015

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, all that I will say to the hon. Gentleman is that on the basis of the fact that there has been self-evidently an increase in resources, recurrent expenditure and capital by this administration in respect of RGP resources and manpower, I think he can take comfort from the fact that when we receive representations from the RGP that different workstreams have increased or additional resources are required, that we do listen to them and it is self-evident from the amount of money that we are spending on the RGP and the increases year on year.

2020

In addition, I did say in answer to my question that we are presently actively considering the case.

2025

Hon. E J Phillips: Clearly, of course, the Superintendent himself has recently made statements in relation to the surpassing of the budget very quickly, in fact, that is provided to the RGP in relation to the funds that they have to run the RGP. That just causes many people concern about the way in which everyone is working, what we are meeting, the demands on our police service who do an excellent job in our community of keeping us all very safe. But those concerns are, with respect, quite genuine and I appreciate that the Minister may not want to answer entirely on this question, but I am grateful for his reassurance that this is under active review, given the resources that are required to man a security service that we have.

2030

Hon. N F Costa: Yes, Mr Speaker, given that the hon. Gentleman has referred to comments made by the Superintendent, I think it is important that I contextualise those remarks.

2035

The Superintendent was referring to the need to increase visible patrolling and security as a result of atrocities in different parts of the world, and therefore there was an increase in the overtime allocation. That was the only extent to which he was referring to the fact that there had been an excess in the spending of the Government on the Police for this financial year.

2040

I receive a monthly financial report from the RGP and there have only been instances following the atrocities in different parts of the world that there has been a need for an increase in presence for security and other reasons, and there has been therefore an increase in overtime.

2045

But that, as I understood the comments made by the police officer to the *Chronicle*, I believe it was, it related to the need for additional patrolling and additional security resources, and that only reflects as additional overtime. When we come to debate the estimates at the beginning of the next financial year, he will see that the increase only relates to that subhead.

2050

Hon. E J Phillips: I think one of the statements, just from memory now, is that the Superintendent himself confirmed that the redeployment in relation to unexplained deaths recently had caused an issue with that as well. I do not think it was solely related to incidents across the world relating to terrorism, but it also related to unexplained deaths, I believe is the more accurate version of that. But I am grateful for the answer and hopefully we can have further dialogue privately in relation to this matter.

2055

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman, in fact, is entirely right. From the financial report I received, there have been two occasions for overtime and for a particular investigation. He is right.

2060

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Minister for his response in respect of question 520, and that is the arming of RGP and local enforcement agencies at sea. If I

understood the Minister correctly, that actually ended on 17th July following, what I think he said was, a security review.

2065 I would be interested to hear from the Minister in terms of the protection of these law enforcement agencies at sea where perhaps the threat level is not something that is covered by intelligence, obviously it will be something that they will meet on a day-to-day basis. I think there was a report yesterday in a local paper – although the RGP have denied the veracity of that report – as to shooting incidents and whether the policy ...

2070 Again, I would be grateful if the Minister could indicate who would make that kind of decision as to whether the marine services should be armed, whether it is a preventative or reactive policy; because obviously it may be that they will not know until they get out to sea what kind of threat they are facing.

2075 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman and the whole House, I am sure, will be delighted to know that those decisions are made by the RGP and has no input from the Government.

Q521/2017
Social care abroad –
Repatriation of service users

Clerk: Question number 521, the Hon. L F Llamas.

2080 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide details as to when they expect to repatriate service users currently receiving social care abroad?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

2085 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, I do not accept the hon. Gentleman's premise of his question, because it implies that there is an expectation that all service users currently receiving social care abroad are to be repatriated. The common denominator in determining if and when a service user is repatriated is based solely on what is in their best interests.

2090 Service users in UK have an Independent Mental Capacity Advocate allocated to them, who act as a safeguard in advocating on their behalf. Independent Mental Capacity Advocates play an instrumental part in making best interest decisions for people who lack the capacity to make specific important decisions such as where the person should reside.

2095 In addition to this, a further safeguarding best interest mechanism that is in place is the input of an Independent Consultant Psychiatrist, who is also a Lead Second Opinion Appointed Doctor. Commissioning the support of a leading health care professional in the field of learning disabilities ensures that all professionals work together for repatriation plans to be implemented in a manner that is person centred.

2100 I can confirm that at present repatriation plans are underway for two service users who are currently receiving social care abroad. Both of these service users have transition plans in place, which are devised in partnership with both professionals and family members.

2105 Given the complexities of the transition process, and how each step is guided by best interest decisions, it is not possible to quantify whether this will happen. However, Mr Speaker, please rest assured that regular placement reviews, case conferences with family at a senior management level to look at short-, medium- and long-term plans for each service user periodically take place.

Q529-530 and Q534/2017

Primary Care Centre –

Online appointment cancellation; Calls to the centre; New health visitor

Clerk: Question number 529, the Hon. L F Llamas.

2110 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government explain why the online cancellation of appointments system is down, and since when?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

2115 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with questions 530 and 534.

Clerk: Question number 530, the Hon. L F Llamas.

2120 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a monthly schedule showing how many calls the Primary Care Centre has handled since April 2016 to date?

Clerk: Question number 534, the Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

2125 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Has the new health visitor at the Primary Care Centre been through the standard interview process before taking on the post?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

2130 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, the online cancellation of appointments is functioning correctly.

We are only able to provide figures for calls handled since 13th March this year, as the volume of data required to store this historical digital information is enormous and quickly exhausts our data storage capacity.

2135 The figures for March to August, Mr Speaker, are as follows:

Month (2017)	Calls handled
March (13th to 31st)	6,709
April	8,154
May	10,493
June	10,158
July	9,372
August	11,056

Mr Speaker, the notable increase in calls handled from May 2017 onwards can be explained by the positive changes in the PCC, including having up to eight clerks staffing the telephone lines during the peak periods each day, and the addition of the telephone sick certificate line.

Mr Speaker, there is no new health visitor at the Primary Care Centre.

2140

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, just coming back to question 529, with regard to the online cancellation appointments system, is it possible then that perhaps the link, the web address

given on the appointment schedules is wrong, because it does come up with an error message and it does not take you to the portal in order to cancel the appointment?

2145

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, I do not know whether perhaps we are looking at different things. We tested it, as he would have expected, and the IT Department assures me that there has been no time during the course of which there has been any interruption to the service. Even when there was a migration from the old GHA website to what I think is the vastly improved current GHA website, the online functionality, I am assured, has been maintained.

2150

So perhaps behind the Speaker's chair he can refer to me to which link he refers.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, on 21st June, me, myself and Neil Costa, the Hon. Minister for Health, had a very heated discussion about this health visitor that had not been appointed yet.

2155

Today, from my understanding, this candidate is sitting in the health centre – the old health centre, the new Primary Care Centre – and, from what I understand, the interview process has not yet taken place or rather was going to take place after she was sitting at her desk.

Is the Minister going to tell me that she was not appointed as health visitor at the time, because we are talking about the same candidate who is sitting at the Primary Care Centre prior to having had her interview?

2160

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, the question asks whether the candidate has undergone the usual process and, again, I do not wish to relive the lengthy exchange that we had on the last occasion. I even went as far, Mr Speaker, to tell her that within the GHA, having different strands, the PCC, the hospital and Ocean Views, it makes perfect sense to me that if the Director of Nursing wanted to redeploy different nurses of different grades to different parts of the GHA she should be able to do so if there were clinical demands.

2165

In other words, if a particular nurse or particular nurses were needed in one ward over another or there was a need for additional nurses in Ocean Views for any particular reason, the Director of Nursing should feel entirely comfortable and free to be able to allocate the resources of the GHA where they are best needed. After all, nurses work for the GHA; they do not work for a particular ward.

2170

But the hon. Lady should rest assured that the GHA is following, in this case of health visitor, the regular route and an advert has been issued and the closing date has already gone by and interviews will be held.

2175

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, interviews will be held but this candidate is already sitting at the post, is that right?

2180

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, once again, we have had this sort of exchange before where the hon. Lady receives information and comes to this House asking me to verify information that she has received. We are not here, with respect to her – and she knows that I have great affection for her – we are not here to comment on what people hear or do not hear.

2185

What I am telling her, Mr Speaker, in answer to the question that she posed to me, was whether or not the usual advertising procedure for the post of health visitor has been followed or will be followed, and I have assured her that, notwithstanding that the Director of Nursing has every right to be able to allocate any nurse to any part of the GHA, we are following the usual vacancy procedure, the advert has gone out, the closing date has come and gone, and there will be an interview process.

2190

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: I am sorry to labour this point, but I just want to say it for the last time, just to make myself clear that the issue that I have – and I think that most people would agree – is that it just looks like a complete mockery of the system when you have the post

2195 holder sitting at the desk prior to an interview, and let's see in a few weeks if that person gets the job. Basically, it is making a farce of the entire process. This is the question I was asking and we still do not have an answer. All we have to do, I suppose, is wait a few weeks, see if that person gets the post and then obviously will come back to the same thing.

2200 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, that was a statement and a repetition of statements, and not a question. But given that she has made statements, I will answer the assumptions that she wrongly makes.

In the first place, Mr Speaker, she is making statements on an assumption that I have not verified. I have already told her that I will not be drawn into comments and rumours that she
2205 hears in the street or whether she has heard it in the street or she has been written to.

Mr Speaker, the hon. Lady, with respect to her, should, I think, measure her words a bit more carefully. The GHA is full of consummate, dedicated, passionate, incredibly hardworking individuals and professionals, and in my 10 or 11 since that I have been the Minister for Health, and I have been honoured with that position, I can assure her that if there are people in this
2210 world who are going to go rigorously through processes and who are going to be whiter than white and above board, and follow processes, especially for the selection of candidates, it would be the GHA.

Let me state in this House, Mr Speaker, and anywhere else, that I have the fullest, the most wholesome, fulsome confidence in any person that sits at a selection board for the GHA –
2215 because I know for a fact that they will choose the best person for the job, be that person whoever he or she is.

Mr Speaker: I think as the Minister for Health has now finished answering his questions, this might be a convenient moment in which to –
2220

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Indeed, Mr Speaker. I now call on the House to recess until 3.30 p.m. this afternoon.

Mr Speaker: The House will now recess until 3.30 p.m. this afternoon.
2225

The House adjourned at 12.55 p.m.