



PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

MORNING SESSION: 10.39 a.m. – 1.03 p.m.

Gibraltar, Wednesday, 21st June 2017

Contents

Tribute to Juan Carlos Perez	3
Questions for Oral Answer	7
Deputy Chief Minister	7
Q337-339/2017 Gibraltar Wine Vaults – Tourism; beneficial owners; consideration and alternative use of site	7
Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.....	8
Q340/2017 Gibraltar Talking Plaques – Government involvement	8
Q341/2017 Visit Gibraltar website – Relaunch	9
Q342/2017 Pleasure craft – Licensing criteria.....	9
Health, Care and Justice	11
Q343/2017 Hillsides – Permanent residents	11
Q344/2017 Hillsides residents – Selection criteria.....	11
Q345/2017 Alzheimer’s and dementia patients – Numbers resident in DHA facilities	12
Q346-347/2017 Dementia Day Centre and Hillsides – Invitations to care providers	12
Q348-2017 Subcontracted nurses – Payments to care providers.....	13
Q349-350/2017 Subcontracted care workers and nurses – Payments to care providers	14
Q351/2017 Ocean Views – Re-admission rate	16
Q352/2017 St Bernard’s Hospital, Mount Alvernia and Ocean Views – Average daily bed costs	17
Q353/2017 Health centre cards – Renewal by self-employed individuals.....	17

Q354-355/2017 Law Reform Commission – Sentencing reforms; appointments to Commission	19
Q356-358/2017 RGP investigations of fraud and dishonesty cases – Number; criminal proceedings; duration.....	20
Q359/2017 Human Resources Manager – Substitute post holder	24
Q360/2017 ERS Facilities Manager – Recruitment process	25
Q361/2017 Primary Care Clinic Health Visitor – Recruitment process.....	26
Tribute to victims of attacks in London, Manchester and Brussels and Grenfell Tower fire	27
<i>The House recessed at 11.55 a.m. and resumed its sitting at 12.06 p.m.</i>	28
Q361/2017 continued	28
Q362/2017 St Bernard’s Hospital – Press officer.....	30
Q363/2017 GHA Heads of Department – Meeting with Minister to discuss concerns	30
Q364/2017 Patients requiring mental health assistance – Out-of-hours arrangements	31
Housing and Equality	33
Q365/2017 Government dwellings – Number vacant and/or derelict.....	33
Q366-367/2017 Laguna, Glacis and Moorish Castle Estates – Completed and pending refurbishment works	34
Q368/2017 Government rental housing estates – Intended new refurbishment works	35
Q369/2017 Alameda House – Works re fresh water system.....	35
Q370/2017 Homeless and drug-dependent ex-offenders – Access to Government accommodation	36
Q371/2017 Assisted living flats – Allocation to old age pensioners	37
Q372/2017 Government rental housing – Policy re arrears agreements and parking spaces.....	39
Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.....	40
Q373/2017 Ince’s Hall mural – Cost and selection of artist.....	40
Q374-375/2017 Gibraltar Football Association – Arrangements re purchase or lease of facilities	42
<i>The House recessed at 1.03 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 3 p.m.</i>	43

The Gibraltar Parliament

The Parliament met at 10.09 a.m.

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: P E Martinez Esq *in attendance*]

Tribute to Juan Carlos Perez

Clerk: Wednesday, 21st June, Meeting of Parliament.
The Hon. the Chief Minister.

5 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, before the House continues its ordinary business, this is the first time that we meet after the passing of Juan Carlos Perez, who was a long-time Member of this House.

10 In fact, he was a Member of this House from 1984 until 2003. In that time, in those just shy of 20 years of membership of this House, Juan Carlos Perez became an essential part of the way that debates were carried out, of the rigor with which Opposition did its job at the time that he was a Member of the GSLP Opposition and of the way that Government did its work in the time that he was an essential part of the GSLP Government from 1988 to 1966, and no less rigor was applied by him as a Member of Opposition between 1996 and 2003.

15 A lot of things have been said about Juan Carlos since he passed away. The Hon. Joe Bossano and I have had opportunity to reflect publicly, as many of us on this side of the House have done publicly and privately, on the impact that Juan Carlos has had on our community, on his human qualities and on his political qualities. But today in this House I would just pause for a moment before I ask the House to observe a minute's silence for the passing of one of its longstanding Members to reflect on Juan Carlos the parliamentarian.

20 He was always robust in debate but always highly well prepared. Juan Carlos was not a man whose arguments would fail for lack of understanding or lack of preparation. If there was a person who has not been Leader of this House but who has had the political acumen, who has had the depth of understanding of the politics of this community, it is certainly Juan Carlos Perez.

25 Perhaps the biggest accolade I can pay him, Mr Speaker, is to reflect on the things that the Hon. the former Chief Minister and Leader of the House Sir Peter Caruana said of Juan Carlos during the course of a particularly prickly exchange with me after Juan Carlos had left, commending me to learn from Juan Carlos Perez and telling me that whilst I might be talking nonsense – which was the usual term of endearment that the former Chief Minister used to apply to me – he might say Juan Carlos Perez was, in parliamentary terms, much missed. When
30 your opponents recognise your contribution like that, I think you show what you have given your community.

So I would call on the House, Mr Speaker, before we hear other tributes from Members who might wish to speak, to observe a minute's silence in honour of Juan Carlos Perez.

Members observed a minute's silence.

35 **Mr Speaker:** The Hon. Mr Bossano.

Minister for Economic Development, Telecommunications and the GSB (Hon. J J Bossano):
Mr Speaker, of all of us here I shared more of my life with Juan Carlos than anybody else, both as a trade unionist and as a Member of Parliament and in everything to do with Gibraltar's political life.

40 He was not a politician, he was somebody who had politics flowing through his veins instead of blood, so there was no time in the day or the night or a day of the week when politics did not enter into his life and mine. Everything that I have been able to contribute, both in Government and in Opposition and in the trade union, would have been much less effective and much less likely to have been successful had it not been for the fact that I had him on my side, constantly
45 working with me, learning from me and teaching me. We made a team that was totally dedicated – as parliamentarians, as trade unionists, as political activists – to the welfare of Gibraltar as we saw it and in the best interest of all sectors of our community.

Juan Carlos, notwithstanding the fact that we had to argue a point, had no problem in being forceful, but had friends across this House ever since we first became involved. That is he had
50 close friends in the AACR when we were the Opposition, he had close friends in the GSD when that was the party opposite us, and of course in the GSLP family he was the life of the party. It is a life that is now gone and we are going to miss it. (*Banging on desks*)

Mr Speaker: The Hon. Edwin Reyes.

55

Hon. E J Reyes: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I echo the words of the Father of the House: Juan Carlos certainly did have friends on both sides of this House – he even had friends from those who liked to hang around outside this House. He was one of those gentlemen who had that ability, like the members of his party are
60 saying, to be able to fight a point to the end but always be respectful, and that does not come easy.

I remember – I am sure Mr Speaker does as well – I first came across Juan Carlos in the late 1960s when we were mere young schoolchildren, when you were the deputy headteacher, Mr Speaker, and there was the tail-end of debating societies in school. Names were picked out
65 of a hat for which side you were on and I remember really rejoicing that I was on Juan Carlos's side because boy did you have a tough time if you were ever to speak against his arguments! He used to prepare himself well. How many hours he spent one can only guess, but he had that ability of having very well-argued points of view to put forward. Like I said before, with respect he could fight his point.

70 Having left school and having done the many things that he did, I also had some brief contacts with him in the trade union, although I was not in the T&G – being a civil servant I was with the GGCA. He was someone who actually inspired enthusiasm, and Joe Bossano is completely correct – he was very much always involved in that big battle for parity in the early 1970s and a certain percentage of that success must be attributed to Juan Carlos for either
75 whatever he did directly or his mere support for the main negotiators such as the Branch Officer Mr Bossano was at the time.

Mr Speaker, he then – I have fond memories – held the portfolio as Minister for Government Services. At one stage when Steven Linares and I were involved with the Teachers' Association we used to have meetings with him – I think it was somewhere in Europort he had his office, yes
80 – and if you went well prepared he did actually acknowledge when you were right. He was very honest and very frank and I think our best successes at the time, if Steven remembers correctly, were when we were fighting the points of excellence and so on and his trade union background I think made him manage to convince Joe Bossano that the teachers should be paid. So, Joe, Juan Carlos I know must have given you as well a bit of a tough time because he was always a true
85 representative of the workers. Even though he had the responsibility of looking after the Government's purse, he never betrayed what was, as the Chief Minister rightly said, running through his veins – that fight for the workers.

So, Mr Speaker, on behalf of this side of the House we offer our condolences to his mother Angeles, to his sister and to all those close relatives of his and the overall family of the GSLP.

90 May he rest in peace, Mr Speaker. *(Banging on desks)*

Mr Speaker: The Hon. Marlene Hassan Nahon.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, it is with great sadness that we once again find ourselves paying tribute to a departed colleague from the world of Gibraltar politics.

To describe Juan Carlos Perez only as a founding member of the GSLP does a disservice to the countless hours that Mr Perez dedicated himself to his particular political cause, from almost his constant presence in the party's office to his long tenure as editor of the GSLP's newspaper.

100 There is, I am sure, no political development over the last 40 years in Gibraltar that has not warranted his astuteness nor his opinion, and I am sure that the Members opposite all feel greatly indebted to his advice and guidance.

105 Like Robert Mor, Joshua Gabay and Charles Bruzon, who all sadly left this world before him, Juan Carlos Perez was a committed socialist who always had Gibraltar's interests at heart and, like theirs, his loss will be keenly felt. It must be remembered, Mr Speaker, that in the late 1980s and 1990s Mr Perez played a significant role in developing the necessary telecommunications infrastructure to support Gibraltar's burgeoning economy, and this important contribution for our community deserves all of our appreciation.

110 Of course Mr Perez was a political adversary of my father and his party, but he always treated him with the respect and admiration that was mutually reciprocated and which I can remember since a very young age. I personally always found Mr Perez willing to give me much of his time and we both enjoyed many discussions in the Piazza, which was very much his political turf. I liked being in the company of this larger-than-life personality and I am very saddened by the loss of such a strong political presence.

115 I would like to convey my most heartfelt condolences to his family, his friends and all his political colleagues, while offering the consolation that Juan Carlos's legacy in this House will live on for many generations. *(Banging on desks)*

Mr Speaker: And one of the great joys of teaching –

120 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, Mr Speaker... The Deputy Leader of the party.

Mr Speaker: Okay. The Hon. Dr Joseph Garcia.

Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia): Mr Speaker, I first met Juan Carlos as a family friend, so he was somebody I would see on a regular basis in the days of the Spinning Wheel and the Old Rock, which probably most people here are too young to remember – and I think that says something!

125 In 1999 when I was first elected I had the pleasure of serving with him in the House for that short period of time. Indeed, my election was due to the tragic death of Robert Mor; it followed Mr Mor's death. I had the pleasure of serving with him in this House from then until 2003. He was an expert teacher, a political strategist who had a brilliant political mind. I think that has already been said and certainly his performances in this Chamber speak for themselves – the fact that he was admired and liked by friends and by political opponents alike.

130 So I would like to express my most sincere condolences to his mother Angeles and to his friends and family. *(Banging on desks)*

Mr Speaker: Let me not jump the gun: does anybody else wish to pay tribute? The Hon. Mr Albert Isola.

135

Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Juan Carlos and the Father of the House were the two individuals who welcomed me into this GSLP family many, many years ago – and I enjoyed *many*, many a night at the Old Rock, which my colleague has just mentioned, sharing his company, his intelligence and his wit. I do not think I have ever met somebody who had the same level of political intelligence that he had, and to boot with a wit that was pretty much unbeatable, a speed of tongue which was really quite terrifying.

But I think for me the one thing I take from Juan Carlos is not that he did 20 years of politics, which of course we all know and that is well documented, but he spent a life of giving. That is what I think is really quite incredible: he has given his entire life to helping, giving and serving the people of this community in any walk of life. It was not just with the union; anybody who needed help had an open door and he was there to greet, to welcome and to help in whatever way he possibly could. For me the biggest thing about this huge political giant of a man was his ability and his sheer desire to help and give to others throughout the entirety of his life, and for that I think he should be well remembered.

I also join in offering my sincerest condolences to Angeles and of course his family and all of his friends.

Thank you, sir. (*Banging on desks*)

Mr Speaker: One of the great joys of teaching in a secondary school in Gibraltar is the fact that many of your former pupils become in later life your closest friends, and that was very much the case with Juan Carlos Perez, as far as I am concerned. Politically we were opponents but always friends. Politics never divided us.

I would like to recall the young man that Maurice Xiberras and I taught in the Grammar School. Juan Carlos was mischievous with a great sense of fun and he was never afraid to question and to stand up to the teachers if he felt that an injustice had been committed. But there is an incident that I always remember very, very fondly. The school was staging the play *A Man for All Seasons* by Robert Bolt, and Juan Carlos was cast as Everyman – Everyman is effectively the prologue of the play – and when the curtains parted, Juan Carlos walked on to the middle of the stage. He paused. He was dressed in a black leotard and, looking at himself, he uttered those immortal words of the opening of the play:

Is this a costume? Does this say anything? It barely covers one man's nakedness!

I will always remember him and I always used to chide him about it. I always remembered it in particular when I used to put on the mayoral robes, which was a different sort of costume if you like.

It is a very sad year, I think, for this Parliament; 2017 is proving to be a very, very sad year. We have lost more than one former parliamentarian and I am sorry to say that, being in contact with some of the other former Members, we should prepare ourselves for even further sad news before the year is out; that is the way of the world.

And so, back to business. (*Banging on desks*)

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, can I, on behalf of this side of the House, thank Members opposite for their very kind words.

Without prejudice to the characterisation of *The New People*, can I just say that if Juan Carlos were here I think he would probably say, 'Look, this is too many eulogies – you go to Parliament to do politics, just get on with it!'

Thank you. (*Banging on desks*)

Questions for Oral Answer

DEPUTY CHIEF MINISTER

Q337-339/2017

Gibraltar Wine Vaults –

Tourism; beneficial owners; consideration and alternative use of site

Clerk: We now continue with answers to Oral Questions.

We commence with Question 337. The questioner is the Hon. L F Llamas.

185 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government disclose what tourism expectations have been projected for the Gibraltar Wine Vaults?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

190 **Deputy Chief Minister (Dr J J Garcia)** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 338 and 339.

Clerk: Question 338. The Hon. L F Llamas.

195 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, who are the beneficial owners of Gibraltar Wine Vaults?

Clerk: Question 339. The Hon. L F Llamas.

200 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, what consideration is being paid by Gibraltar Wine Vaults and did the Government consult or advertise the site for alternative usage?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister.

205 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the operators of the Wine Vaults have told the Government that they expect to provide a tourism facility as part of the overall wine package experience, not only to see the wine storage facility but also to experience the World War II tunnels and chambers. This will not, however, be organised or controlled by the Government. It is an integral part of the wine storage operation. The operators expect that the combination of wine tasting and visit to the World War II experience could attract tours from cruise liners.

210 The beneficial owners are Gibraltar Wine Vaults Limited.

The consideration already paid by Gibraltar Wine Vaults for the ex-WT Station is £350,000. The Government did not consult or advertise the site for alternative usage. Gibraltar Wine Vaults approached the Government on this project. It was felt that this was a unique project perfectly suited for those chambers, which have little other use, and which will provide Gibraltar with economic activity and employment and could attract wealthy wine connoisseurs and tourism in general.

215
220 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, could I ask the Government: is there a set lease or a control mechanism whereby the Government will be able to monitor the success of this project; and in any event, if it seems that the project is not returning the economic activity that is envisaged, it can call back the land and offer it for an alternative use?

225 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, this is not land in the normal sense. These are tunnels inside the Rock itself. There is a lease which regulates the activity and which the operators have to abide by. I do not have the terms of the lease with me, but obviously there is a lease which they obtained in exchange for the premium.

230 **Hon. L F Llamas:** One final question, Mr Speaker: has the Government been consulted on what the entrance fee to the tunnels in this site will be?

Hon. Deputy Chief Minister: No, Mr Speaker, there has been no consultation certainly that I am aware of.

235 **Hon. Chief Minister:** There does not have to be.

Hon. Deputy Chief Minister: And obviously the option is open to them not to have a fee if they so wish it – they are the operators.

240 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Sorry, one final supplementary, Mr Speaker: does the Minister know for how long the lease will run, off the top of his head? I know it is a supplementary maybe not arising from these questions.

245 **Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I have that information but I do not have it with me. If the hon. Member cares to ask me the question then I will be happy to answer it at a future Parliament.

TOURISM, EMPLOYMENT, COMMERCIAL AVIATION AND THE PORT

Q340/2017

Gibraltar Talking Plaques – Government involvement

Clerk: Question 340. The Hon. L F Llamas.

250 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government state what involvement it had with setting up and assisting Gibraltar Talking Plaques, together with details of any contract it may have entered into?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.

255 **Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon. G H Licudi):** Mr Speaker, Talking Plaques is a fully private concern. They approached the Gibraltar Tourist Board for assistance in 2016. The GTB assisted in marketing the service on its social media platforms, proof reading and helping with the map produced by the operators, adding details on the product to the GTB website and displaying leaflets in the GTB information
260 offices and at events. This, Mr Speaker, is similar to the assistance provided to most private concerns that take an initiative to produce a tourism-related product.

In addition, the GTB provided the sum of £4,689 to Talking Plaques Limited towards marketing material that the company produced, including leaflets and branded giveaways to include the Gibraltar branding. The sum also went towards braille signs on the posts and
265 microchips contained therein.

There is no contract entered into with the GTB. The company sought its necessary permissions from the relevant authorities to roll out their business.

270 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, is it then safe to say that the private entity can sell on the business or decide not to maintain the signs or anything, given that there is no contract; or does the Government have a way of controlling what happens with this business which is being run essentially on Gibraltar's key sites?

275 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, as I mentioned, there is no contract and there is certainly no prohibition of the company behind this initiative having its shares sold to anyone. It is, of course, subject to permissions being given by the Government and that is how it was set up: it was set up by seeking permission from the Government and the Government giving permission to place these plaques in various sites, providing certain information. Therefore, if anything which was of concern to Government were to happen, that permission can simply be withdrawn and the
280 plaques would have to be taken down, by the Government if necessary, because they are on Government property and therefore subject to, at the moment, no contract, no lease, just a licence, and therefore that licence can be terminated by the Government at will.

Q341/2017
Visit Gibraltar website –
Relaunch

Clerk: Question 341. The Hon. L F Llamas.

285 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, has the Government made any progress in relaunching a new visitgibraltar.gi website?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.
290

Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, the Gibraltar Tourist Board is now working with the current provider of the website to launch a new version of the site and this is scheduled to happen late September/early October of this year.

Q342/2017
Pleasure craft –
Licensing criteria

295 **Clerk:** Question 342. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Can Government explain what is the licensing criteria on pleasure craft?

300 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.

Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon. G H Licudi):

305 Mr Speaker, the criteria for the licensing of small pleasure craft for use within designated areas in British Gibraltar Territorial Waters is stipulated under Schedule 4 of the Small Vessels (Mooring Controls) Rules 2016 and the Seaside Pleasure Boat Rules 1989.

310 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I understand the criteria at the moment as per the law, but my question leads to ask whether the Government would be looking at perhaps making the criteria more stringent given the recent surge of pleasure craft with the new marina and also the accident that we saw a couple of weeks ago that might be telling us that our youngsters may find it very easy to get on a pleasure craft without having enough knowledge of sailing or of the pleasure craft itself. Would the Government be willing to make these laws more stringent?

315 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, the question asks about licensing criteria rather than the enforcement of the laws and whether the laws should be changed. The licensing criteria, as I have indicated, is already in the legislation.

In fact, what we did – although the hon. Member says the criteria may not be stringent enough, it depends on how one looks at it – what we did was to actually set out, for the purposes of the new marina, we set out the criteria in legislation. Under the Small Vessels (Mooring Controls) Rules 2016 we actually set out what the criteria for licensing and for permitting vessels in the small boats marina at the Mid Harbour Marina should be. That was firstly for the sake of certainty and clarity so that nobody could say, ‘Well, I’ve been treated unfairly because the criteria has been improperly applied or discretions have not been applied to the required standard or properly in my case.’ Therefore there are steps that need to be taken, documents which need to be produced and very clear certainty in the legislation as to what the criteria should be.

330 The hon. Member mentions issues about who can use these craft. Clearly the legislation sets out who can use the craft and it is a matter for enforcement. Do we need stricter controls? That is perhaps something that can be looked at. When we made the changes that we did for the purposes of the small boats marina, hon. Members will recall that I also announced changes to the Seaside Pleasure Boat Rules to do with jet-skis, to require strict criteria in relation to jet-skis, particularly in relation to age limits and proficiency certificates in relation to jet-skis. So that criteria is already there in relation to jet-skis.

335 We also introduced a new category of vessels which we have called exempt vessels, which were vessels which could be exempt from the fast launch control rules, subject to the vessels not exceeding 40 knots and subject also to the user of that vessel, the person who was being licensed, having the necessary competency certificate, which is generally an RYA motorboat handling certificate, which is required by the Captain of the Port, and also insurance in relation to that vessel.

340 I can also say that we have set up, under the legislation which we produced for the small boats marina, the Small Vessels Advisory Board. That is a board that is tasked statutorily with looking at all aspects of small vessels, including use, licensing criteria, insurance and proficiency. I have met with the board and there has been advice given to me, particularly in relation to insurance, which should cover all motorised vessels, and that is advice that I have accepted. It is a recommendation that has been made by the board to me and we are in the process of looking at the legislation that needs to be changed in order to introduce a mandatory provision, which we already have for fast launches, we already have for exempt vessels, we already have for jet-skis and we are about to introduce it for all vessels which are of a motorised nature. That legislation I hope to either bring to Parliament if we need to change an Act, and I am seeking advice at the moment on that, or introduce it by regulations and make an announcement on it; but I hope to do that very quickly in deed.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

HEALTH, CARE AND JUSTICE

Q343/2017

Hillsides –

Permanent residents

355 **Clerk:** Question 343. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government state how many residents are now permanently living at Hillsides, together with a breakdown of their long-term previous accommodation broken down into: (a) private accommodation; (b) Government rental housing;
360 (c) GHA wards; and (d) other elderly residential centres?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, there are 42 residents
365 living permanently at Hillsides. All 42 residents were transferred from GHA wards. Before admission to hospital, 28 out of the 42 residents lived in Government rented accommodation and 14 resided in private accommodation. No residents from the elderly residential centres have been transferred to Hillsides.

Q344/2017

Hillsides residents –

Selection criteria

370 **Clerk:** Question 344. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government disclose the selection criteria in choosing the residents for Hillsides?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

375 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, the criteria selection was clinically led, considering each individual's diagnosis and condition. A panel including GHA and Care Agency professionals were commissioned to assess eligibility. The same criteria for admission of dementia patients to ERS were followed. All the residents admitted to Hillsides
380 have been diagnosed with different stages of dementia.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Minister disclose whether residents of other elderly residential centres were considered as part of the changeover or the moving in into Hillsides?

385 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the admission criteria for Hillsides is the same as would be for any admission to any other ERS site, like, for instance, Mount Alvernia. The additional difference is that there is also a mental capacity because, as the hon. Gentleman knows, Hillsides is designed primarily to care for persons who suffer from dementia and Alzheimer's. The applications are assessed by the Care Agency and they prioritise individuals based on need.

390 The hon. Gentleman may also know that before, under the previous administration, there was a list and it was on a first-come first-served basis. I think it was my hon. predecessor, either Dr John Cortes, and Samantha Sacramento who decided that it made more sense, given the

progressive nature of the disease – Alzheimer’s and dementia – that there should be admissions based on the person’s need rather than on whether you were first on the list

Q345/2017
Alzheimer’s and dementia patients –
Numbers resident in DHA facilities

395 **Clerk:** Question 345. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government state how many diagnosed Alzheimer’s and dementia sufferers currently reside at each of the following: John Cochrane Ward, Calpe Ward, Mount Alvernia and St. Bernard’s Hospital?

400

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the number of residents or patients diagnosed with Alzheimer’s and dementia in the named areas is as follows: John Cochrane Ward, 16; Calpe Ward, eight; Mount Alvernia, 72; and St Bernard’s Hospital, six.

405

Q346-347/2017
Dementia Day Centre and Hillside –
Invitations to care providers

Clerk: Question 346. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government disclose the names of the care providers it invited to express interest in providing the necessary staff for the Dementia Day Centre, together with (a) the date on which the invitation was sent to each care provider and (b) the closing date or dates?

410

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 347.

415

Clerk: Question 347. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government disclose the names of the care providers it invited to express interest in providing the necessary staff for the Dementia Residential Facility together with (a) the date on which the invitation was sent to each care provider and (b) the closing date or dates?

420

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

425

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, as I have previously stated, it is not the policy of the Government to publicly name any company that is approached and invited to apply for a public contract. I can confirm, however, that as I have already noted in response to previous answers to Questions 727/2016 and 51 of this year, all six known local care providers were approached in

430

respect of the Dementia Day Centre. Invitations were sent on 7th September of last year and on the closing date of 15th September of last year three applications were received. In respect of Hillside's Dementia Residential Facility, five invitations were sent on 5th June 2015 and on the closing date of 22nd June 2015 five applications were received.

Q348-2017
Subcontracted nurses –
Payments to care providers

435 **Clerk:** Question 348. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a monthly schedule since 1st April 2016 to date of how much has been paid to care providers in return for subcontracted nurses by (a) the GHA, b) the Care Agency and (c) Elderly Residential Services?

440

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the estimated information, subject to audit, is in the schedule I now hand over to the hon. Gentleman.

445

Mr Speaker: I suggest we proceed with the next question and then the hon. questioner may come back once he has had an opportunity to study the schedule.

Answer to Question 348

During the Period 1st April 2016 to 31st March 2017 the following monthly payments were made to care providers in return for subcontracted nurses.

	GHA			CARE AGENCY			ERS		
		Period (Agency 1)	Period (Agency 2)		Period (Agency 1)	Period (Agency 2)		Period (Agency 1)	Period (Agency 2)
Apr-16	£4,877.87	28/03/16-03/04/16	n/a	£1,143.00	14/03/16-25/03/16	n/a	£39,162.00	14/03/16-24/03/16	n/a
May-16	£17,788.04	04/04/16-04/05/16	n/a	£8,077.26	25/03/16-24/04/16	01/04/16-30/04/16	£0.00	n/a	n/a
Jun-16	£13,651.57	10/05/16-29/05/16	n/a	£7,632.43	25/04/16-24/05/16	01/05/16-31/05/16	£237,451.00	25/03/16-24/05/16	n/a
Jul-16	£2,175.96	28/03/16-03/04/16	n/a	£7,536.00	25/05/16-24/06/16	01/06/16-30/06/16	£0.00	n/a	n/a
Aug-16	£0.00	n/a	n/a	£8,209.50	25/06/16-24/07/16	01/07/16-31/07/16	£160,918.00	25/05/16-24/07/16	n/a
Sep-16	£6,603.61	28/03/16-26/08/16	n/a	£11,205.00	25/05/16-24/08/16	01/08/16-31/08/16	£0.00	n/a	n/a
Oct-16	£0.00	n/a	n/a	£12,538.50	25/08/16-24/09/16	01/09/16-31/09/16	£83,478.00	25/07/16-24/08/16	n/a
Nov-16	£0.00	n/a	n/a	£6,471.00	25/09/16-24/10/16	01/10/16-31/10/16	£74,565.00	25/08/16-24/09/16	n/a
Dec-16	£0.00	n/a	n/a	£3,522.00	25/10/16-24/11/16	n/a	£79,612.50	25/09/16-24/10/16	n/a
Jan-17	£0.00	n/a	n/a	£8,763.00	25/11/16-24/12/16	01/11/16-31/12/16	£78,858.00	25/10/16-24/11/16	n/a
Feb-17	£0.00	n/a	n/a	£16,762.00	25/12/16-24/02/17	01/01/17-31/01/17	£89,551.50	25/11/16-24/12/16	n/a
Mar-17	£102,419.05	01/01/17-20/02/17	n/a	£10,512.75	25/02/17-13/03/17	01/02/17-31/03/17	£176,198.90	25/12/16-13/03/17	1/2/2017-18/3/2017

450

Mr Speaker: I suggest we proceed with the next question and then the hon. questioner may come back once he has had an opportunity to study the schedule.

Q349-350/2017

**Subcontracted care workers and nurses –
Payments to care providers**

Clerk: Question 349. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a monthly schedule, since 1st April 2016 to date, of how much has been paid to each care provider in return for subcontracted care workers by (a) the GHA, (b) the Care Agency and (c) Elderly Residential Services?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 350.

Clerk: Question 350. The Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide a schedule per financial year since 1st April 2012 until 31st March 2016 of how much has been paid to care providers in return for subcontracted nurses by (a) the GHA, (b) the Care Agency and (c) Elderly Residential Services?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the estimated information, subject to audit, is in the schedule I now hand over to the hon. Gentleman.

Answer to Question 349

GHA

	Period	Grand Home Care	Period	Rainbow Services
Apr-16	n/a		n/a	
May-16	n/a		n/a	
Jun-16	n/a		n/a	
Jul-16	n/a		n/a	
Aug-16	n/a		01/05/16-12/08/16	£ 2,367.75
Sep-16	n/a		n/a	
Oct-16	n/a		n/a	
Nov-16	n/a		n/a	
Dec-16	25/08/16-24/11/16	£3,036.00	n/a	
Jan-17	22/03/16-31/12/16	£25,146.35	23/09/16-01/12/16	£ 2,984.80
Feb-17	n/a		n/a	
Mar-17	01/02/17-28/02/17	£924.00	n/a	

Care Agency

	Period	Grand Home Care	Period	Rainbow Services
Apr-16	14/03/16-25/03/16	£ 19,289.62	01/03/16-31/03/16	£ 53,137.03
May-16	25/03/16-24/04/16	£ 48,141.43	01/04/16-30/04/16	£ 68,894.16
Jun-16	25/04/16-24/06/16	£ 42,721.14	01/05/16-31/05/16	£ 54,573.66
Jul-16	25/05/16-24/06/16	£ 55,524.18	01/06/16-31/07/16	£ 179,810.18
Aug-16	25/06/16-24/07/16	£ 31,880.31	01/07/16-31/07/16	£ 28,690.20
Sep-16	25/07/16-24/08/16	£ 56,347.82	01/08/16-31/08/16	£ 136,013.39
Oct-16	25/09/16-24/09/16	£ 59,800.16	01/09/16-30/09/16	£ 290,069.75
Nov-16	25/10/16-24/10/16	£ 38,185.97	01/10/16-31/10/16	£ 121,928.60
Dec-16	25/10/16-24/11/16	£ 51,925.55	01/10/16-31/10/16	£ 84,148.13
Jan-17	25/11/16-24/12/16	£ 44,541.89	01/11/16-31/12/16	£ 71,090.10
Feb-17	25/12/16-24/02/17	£ 59,703.00	01/11/16-31/01/17	£ 184,111.40
Mar-17	25/02/17-13/03/17	£ 28,020.68	01/02/17-13/3/17	£ 223,345.99

ERS

	Period	Grand Home Care	Period	Rainbow Services	Period	Meddoc
Apr-16	01/03/17-31/03/17	£ 50,737.00	01/03/16-31/03/16	£ 11,226.60		
May-16	n/a		01/04/16-30/04/16	£ 5,492.03		
Jun-16	25/03/16-24/05/16	£ 128,548.81	01/05/16-31/05/16	£ 5,806.65		
Jul-16	25/03/16-24/05/16	£ 34,516.00	01/06/16-31/07/16	£ 4,989.60		
Aug-16	25/05/2016-24/07/16	£ 265,004.00	01/07/16-31/07/16	£ 4,992.00		
Sep-16	25/05/16-24/07/16	£ 6,751.75	01/08/16-31/08/16	£ 4,617.60		
Oct-16	25/07/16-24/08/16	£ 143,284.00	01/09/16-30/09/16	£ 5,865.60		
Nov-16	25/08/16-24/09/16	£ 157,637.78	01/10/16-31/10/16	£ 4,617.60		
Dec-16	n/a		n/a			
Jan-17	25/09/16-24/11/16	£ 277,787.91	01/11/16-31/12/16	£ 11,606.40		
Feb-17	25/11/16-24/12/16	£ 142,218.98	n/a	£		
Mar-17	25/12/16-13/03/17	£ 206,411.45	01/01/17-31/03/17	£ 22,713.60	01/01/17-31/03/17	£ 13,905.00

470 In respect to the answer to Question 350, the information requested is only available from 1st April 2015, as previously invoices submitted for the Care Agency and ERS were per service and not per grade.

The information for the period 1st April 2015 to 31st March 2016 is as follows. GHA, £0. Care Agency: Grand Home Care, £450,974; Rainbow, £1,188,061. ERS: Grand Home Care, £1,288,237; 475 Rainbow, £87,802.

Mr Speaker: The Hon. Roy Clinton.

480 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Sorry, Mr Speaker, I have just glanced at the schedule in answer to Question 348 and I was wondering if the Minister could explain the use of subcontracted nurses in the GHA, certainly in the month of March. It obviously seems to be out of scale compared to previous months. Is there something the GHA is doing differently to what it was doing before?

Hon. N F Costa: Sorry, Mr Speaker, could Mr Clinton repeat the question, please?

485 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Certainly, Mr Speaker. If the Minister could look at the schedule in answer
to Question 348/2017, for the GHA, for the period of March 2017, there is a number there of
£102,419.05 for that particular month, but if you look at the previous month, certainly from
October to February is zero and other months certainly a figure much lower than that. Could the
490 Minister explain to the House why it is that the number is so large in March? Is the Government
or the GHA doing something different in respect of subcontracted nurses?

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, there has been no change in policy in that respect and therefore
I do not have the answers to why there was, as he rightly points out, a sizeable jump in March. I
dare say, and I will confirm this for the hon. Gentleman but I daresay that the amount reflected
495 in March ... In fact, it is the answer. If the hon. Gentleman looks at the column just next to the
amount, it says that the period relating to the £102,000 is from 1st January to 20th March, so it
includes two months of 2017, which would explain two months only, so there are three other
months which appear to be unaccounted for. So I will go back to ... In fact, I will email my office
and hopefully during the course of this session I will have an answer for him.

500 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, just a clarification, guidance from the Minister to be able to
interpret this schedule correctly, the schedule in answer to Questions 350/2017 and 349/2017.
Could the Minister clarify which table relates to Question 349 and which tables relate to
Question 350? One is for subcontracted care workers and the other one relates to
505 subcontracted nurses. If the Minister could clarify which table.

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, the answer in the tables relates to Question 349. The
information relating to Question 350 was the one that I read to him across the floor of the
House, so it should not have said 'Answer to Question 350'. Thank you for spotting that out.

510

Mr Speaker: Any other supplementary?

Q351/2017
Ocean Views –
Re-admission rate

Clerk: Question 351. The Hon. R M Clinton.

515 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Government advise the re-admission rate for Ocean
Views in the year ended 31st March 2017?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

520 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, the re-admission rate for
Ocean Views for the year ending 31st March of this year is 2.85%.

It is salient to highlight, Mr Speaker, that the NHS benchmarking report found a 9% re-
admission rate in the UK in 2015. Evidently, therefore, our excellent professionals at Ocean
Views should be congratulated for the outstanding work in ensuring such a low re-admission
rate. I will have more to say about this, Mr Speaker, in my Budget address.

525

Q352/2017

**St Bernard's Hospital, Mount Alvernia and Ocean Views –
Average daily bed costs**

Clerk: Question 352. The Hon. R M Clinton.

530 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Government advise the average cost per day per bed for each of St Bernard's Hospital, Mount Alvernia and Ocean Views in the financial year 2016-17?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

535 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, the average cost per day per bed for St Bernard's Hospital depends on the level of dependency. Therefore, the cost of a bed can vary from £340 to £515.

The average cost per day per bed for Ocean Views is £338.

The average cost per day per bed for Mount Alvernia is £192.

Q353/2017

**Health centre cards –
Renewal by self-employed individuals**

540 **Clerk:** Question 353. The Hon. R M Clinton.

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, can the Government advise what is the policy for renewal of health centre cards by self-employed individuals?

545 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the renewal of health cards for self-employed individuals is only initiated when the Department is satisfied that individuals have settled their Social Insurance contributions by the 15th of every month, as stipulated by the Social Insurance Regulations 1955.

550 If a self-employed individual is up to date with Social Insurance payments, then proof of payment and a renewal form would suffice to renew their health card.

555 The GHA ensures that a settlement agreement has been reached if the individual is in arrears. Failure to conform to the agreement will result in the GHA suspending their rights to medical care. It is important to note that the individual will still be entitled to emergency medical treatment.

As with any process, there may be cases with specific issues which may require referral to the registration board for individual consideration. This is done via an appeal.

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, I am grateful for the Minister's response.

560 I have come across a number of individuals who have approached me with varying advice that has been given to them, some of which is contradictory. I would be grateful if the Minister could clarify for the House: if a self-employed individual is entirely up to date, how long would his health centre card be valid for? Would he be issued with a five-year card?

565 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker.

Hon. R M Clinton: I am grateful for that answer and I will go back to the constituents and advise them of such. If a self-employed individual is given contrary advice, who should they contact? Who is responsible for this? Would it be the tax department or the GHA?

570

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, they can either contact me directly by email or they can contact Rose Suissa, who is the Primary Health Care Centre Manager, but either of us will attend to it straightaway.

575

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, perhaps this is not a question but he should be aware that individuals have been asked to pay in advance, either monthly or for an entire year, to get health centre cards for renewal. I am happy to share this information with him behind the Speaker's Chair later on.

580

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, that may have been in cases where the individual would have been in significant arrears for a number of years and therefore we would ask for a reasonable amount of cash payment so that we do not find ourselves in a position where a settlement arrears agreement is reached and then in the very first month we are once again in the position of arrears; and therefore, to establish trust between that particular person who owes arrears and the GHA, a reasonable amount is asked for. But if any individual feels that

585

the amount being asked for is unreasonable, they can feel free to write to me directly.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker may I, because I can give the Minister first-hand experience, having had to assist my son, who happens to be a self-employed person. Shortly after Christmas he was refused an appointment at the Health Centre because he was now self-employed and had to produce all the necessary documents for Social Insurance contributions. He was told that the card would be renewed for a month until the end of March and was therefore advised that he pay until the end of the financial year in advance, which he did until the end of June. Coming now to that expiry date, again he has been advised, as recently

590

595

as the last few days, to pay the whole of the 2017-18 year in advance of Social Insurance contributions. This is fresh as this week progresses.

So there seems to be some contradictory information feeding through from the clerical side. I would be grateful if the Minister could look at it, because there are several cases that we know of and although it makes a certain sense that the Government has to protect that payments have been made, you cannot put a heavy burden on young self-employed people, that we all encourage, to start off having to pay a whole year of Social Insurance in advance.

600

Hon. N F Costa: Yes, Mr Speaker, I agree with the hon. Gentleman that such a request would be counterintuitive and unacceptable, so I will certainly, after this session of the House, perhaps after the Budget session, call in Rose, who I have to say is formidable and very well acquainted with the work that she does. These must be individual cases which, unforgivably and unacceptably, have fallen through the net, but certainly your son should not have been put in that position. I will see to it that it is immediately rectified and I thank him for bringing it to my attention.

605

Q354-355/2017

**Law Reform Commission –
Sentencing reforms; appointments to Commission**

610 **Clerk:** Question 354. The Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, can the Government state what specific sentencing reforms it is looking to address in the context of the Law Reform Commission?

615 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the particular areas of sentencing reform to be looked at are yet to be finalised as it is my intention as Chairperson of the Commission to consult the Law Commissioners before a final decision is made.

620 I refer the hon. Gentleman to my –

Mr Speaker: He is answering the question together with Question 355.

625 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, sorry, Mr Speaker, in my eagerness I jumped the gun. I will answer this question together with Question 355.

Clerk: Question 355. The Hon. E J Phillips.

630 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Can the Government state the names of experts that will be appointed to the proposed Law Commission?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

635 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, I refer the hon. Gentleman to my previous statements on this matter, where I stated that I intend to review local sentencing laws to ensure that they cater for the needs of Gibraltar, rather than being tied to sentencing guidelines which have evolved for another jurisdiction with its own particular issues and that may not necessarily apply to us.

640 It should also be noted that I have in the past said that there appear to be a number of classes of offence where, due to local circumstances, following UK guidelines does not always produce appropriate sentences for Gibraltar. These include, for example, offences of violence and sexual offences. It is these types of offences that I think should be looked into by the Commission.

645 As the hon. Gentleman will himself know, the issue of sentencing guidelines is a matter for the Hon. the Chief Justice in consultation with me. Any recommendations in this area will be communicated to the Chief Justice under section 484 of the Criminal Procedure and Evidence Act 2011 for him to take into regard when deciding whether or not to make any changes.

650 Additionally, it may be that the Commission will look into offences which have been part of our statute book for a number of years and which were legislated with maximum fines which did not refer to the standard scale of fines but rather to a set amount which with the passage of time has made the amount irrelevant. In undertaking an exercise in examining such offences, the Commission is able to propose new fines referring to the standard scale, which are more in keeping with the seriousness of each of these offences.

655 Finally, I am keen that the Commission be tasked with an examination of the parole system and the amount of time that persons serving custodial sentences must serve before being eligible to be released on licence. This is of particular relevance given the differences between the UK and local systems, which are not reflected in local sentencing practice.

660 In accordance with clause 4 of the Bill, it is intended that there will be initially appointed at least four Commissioners in addition to Her Majesty's Attorney General, who will be an ex-officio member, and the Minister with responsibility for Justice, who will act as Chairman. At least two of the Commissioners so appointed will be lawyers.

665 Of course, given the fact that the Bill will be debated in a few weeks' time, the hon. Gentleman will forgive me if I do not give the names of the persons it is intended to appoint as Commissioners today and I hope he will allow me to keep something for my Budget speech at the Bill's Second Reading.

670 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful for that response. Would the Hon. Minister agree that this is a significant undertaking in terms of the Law Commission, its constitution and also its terms of reference? It is a significant undertaking.

Hon. N F Costa: Yes, Mr Speaker, I agree that it is. At the same time we are very excited about the project and the work that would be undertaken.

675 I will tell him that the persons that we have approached to be appointed as Law Commissioners have all accepted and, as I say, I will reveal those names during the course of my Budget address.

680 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Just one further supplementary question: how long does the Government envisage this process will take? The reason why I ask the question about a significant undertaking is when we are looking at the jurisprudence and the development of precedent in the area of sentencing and sentencing notes by the judiciary, obviously there will be some inconsistency with what has been drawn from the United Kingdom in terms of their sentencing practice. Therefore, does the Government have any idea how long this process will take to develop that sentencing practice?

685 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the answer is no on the basis that, as I explained at the beginning of my answer, I intend to consult with the Law Commissioners on which tasks we should tackle first. It may be that we decide at the first meeting to deal with discreet matters that can be dealt with expeditiously and certainly during the rest of this mandate. But as I say, it will be decided by the Law Commission at the first meeting and at that point I think we will have
690 a clear idea of what we are able to realistically achieve in whatever is left of this term of office.

Q356-358/2017

**RGP investigations of fraud and dishonesty cases –
Number; criminal proceedings; duration**

Clerk: Question 356. The Hon. E J Phillips.

695 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Can the Government state the number of fraud or dishonesty cases which are currently being investigated by the Royal Gibraltar Police?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

700 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 357 and 358.

Clerk: Question 357. The Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state from the number of fraud or dishonesty cases currently being investigated by the RGP how many have resulted in criminal proceedings being brought?

705

Clerk: Question 358. The Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state from the number of fraud or dishonesty cases currently being investigated by the RGP the duration of the investigations categorised into the following: (i) one month; (ii) three months; (iii) six months; (iv) nine months; (v) 12 months; or (vi) in excess of 12 months?

710

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

715

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the Royal Gibraltar Police can confirm that there are currently 12 major fraud investigations locally in Gibraltar. This, however, does not take into account the numerous investigations that the RGP assists other jurisdictions with.

720

There are currently four major fraud cases where persons have been charged and are before the courts.

Additionally, the schedules which I am passing to the hon. Member set out the number of minor fraud and dishonesty offences which have been reported to the RGP during the last financial policing year. The second column shows the number of unresolved crimes, which means the matter is still under some form of investigation or before the courts.

725

With regard to overall crime reported to the RGP in the 2016-17 policing year and related to minor fraud and dishonesty offences, the detection rates contained in the schedule have been recorded by the RGP. A detection is recorded only once the person has been judicially dealt with by the courts and has been found to have been responsible for the crime or a police caution has been accepted.

730

The duration of current investigations by the RGP for major fraud offences is as follows: one month, one case; three months, two cases; six months, two cases; nine months, two cases; 12 months, one case; in excess of 12 months, four cases.

Mr Speaker, it is impracticable, in the sense of time consuming, for the Royal Gibraltar Police to calculate the duration of investigation for each minor fraud or dishonesty offence reported to the police.

735

Answer to Question 356

Offence	Total	Live
Fraud by Abuse of Position	2	1
Fraud by False Representation	72	55
Fraud by False Representation (attempted)	2	1
Passing, etc. of Counterfeit Notes and Coins	11	11
Using a False Instrument	2	2

Offence	Total	Live
Acquisition / Possession / Use of Proceeds of Criminal Conduct	10	1
Assisting another to Retain the Benefit of Criminal Conduct	3	2
Concealing or Transferring Proceeds of Criminal Conduct	4	3
Failing to apply Customer Due Diligence Measures	2	2
Offence	Total	Live
Going Equipped for Stealing, etc.	9	4
Interfering with Vehicles	3	3
Making Off without Payment	42	31
Taking a Conveyance without Authority	29	17
Theft: Value under £500	286	209
Theft: Value under £500 (attempted)	21	6

Offence	Total	Live
Assault with Intent to Rob	2	2
Blackmail	2	2
Burglary	67	34
Burglary (attempted)	9	8
Handling Stolen Goods	21	7
Robbery	4	3
Robbery (attempted)	1	1
Theft: Value over £500	103	90
Theft: Value over £500 (attempted)	9	3

Answer to Question 357

Offence	Investigations	Detected
False Accounting	4	4
Fraud by Abuse of Position	2	1
Fraud by False Representation	72	13
Fraud by False Representation (attempted)	2	1
Holding Out to be a Commissioner for Oaths	1	1
Passing, etc. of Counterfeit Notes and Coins	11	0
Possession of a forged instrument	1	1
Using a False Instrument	2	0

Offence	Investigations	Detected
Acquisition / Possession / Use of Proceeds of Criminal Conduct	10	9
Assisting another to Retain the Benefit of Criminal Conduct	3	1
Concealing or Transferring Proceeds of Criminal Conduct	4	1
Failing to apply Customer Due Diligence Measures	2	0

Offence	Investigations	Detected
Going Equipped for Stealing, etc.	9	5
Interfering with Vehicles	3	0
Making Off without Payment	42	11
Taking a Conveyance without Authority	29	12
Theft: Value under £500	286	77
Theft: Value under £500 (attempted)	21	15

Offence	Investigations	Detected
Aggravated Burglary	1	1
Aggravated Vehicle Taking	1	1
Assault with Intent to Rob	2	0
Blackmail	2	0
Burglary	67	33
Burglary (attempted)	9	1
Handling Stolen Goods	21	14
Robbery	4	1
Robbery (attempted)	1	0
Theft: Value over £500	103	13
Theft: Value over £500 (attempted)	9	6

740 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Just one question arising from the answer that the Hon. Minister gave, without looking at this stage at the schedule – and I will deal with that later on, if I may, Mr Speaker: insofar as the characterisation of major and minor fraud cases, can the Minister confirm that those are categorised by reference either to value and/or complexity?

745 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the RGP define a major fraud case as one assessed where the loss is in excess of £10,000. Anything under is categorised as a minor fraud or dishonesty offence. So it is a numerical value attached as to whether it is classified as one or the other.

The Speaker: Next question. We can come back to the schedules.

Q359/2017
Human Resources Manager –
Substitute post holder

750 **Clerk:** Question 359. The Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, who is performing the functions of Human Resources Manager at the GHA?

755 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, a senior official, substituting to the grade of Senior Executive Officer, presently covers this role.

760 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, I understand that the former Human Resources Manager is now in the Licensing Office. Can the hon. Gentleman explain why there has been a change in personnel occupying this particular post?

765 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I am sorry to say to the hon. Gentleman that his information is once again incorrect: the former Head of Human Resources at the GHA is not at the Licensing Office.

There has never been any comment in this House as to the movement of civil servants from one Department to another. They are interchangeable. Those are the rules of the Civil Service

770 and that is neither subject to a referendum in the Civil Service as to whether people move or do not move, in particular at that grade, or indeed to a debate in this House.

775 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, nobody is wanting to debate this particular issue; I just want an understanding of whether there are any particular policy reasons as to the transfer of this particular gentleman, who I know was occupying this particular post for some time, elsewhere. If I am mistaken that he has been transferred to the Licensing Department, in fact maybe it is the nomenclature that I have actually used, because I have dealt with this particular individual in relation to residency permits and indeed he has dealt with my queries in his new role very well indeed. It is the policy that I am interested in and whether there are any policy reasons for this particular change.

780 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the policy is that civil servants are freely transferable, and that has been not just the policy – it is the terms and conditions of engagement of civil servants. We have very effective civil servants at every grade who do a very good job where they were and where they are, and so there is no policy reason for anybody being moved, because moving people from one place to another is not a matter of policy, it is a matter of people playing to their strengths and doing the jobs that the Government needs done in order to provide the public with the service that we endeavour to provide.

785 The Department, Mr Speaker, which has not changed in nomenclature under my administration but is the same Department that would have been in place when he was in Government, is the CSRO, Civil Status and Registration Office. We do not license people in Gibraltar, Mr Speaker, we register them.

Q360/2017
ERS Facilities Manager –
Recruitment process

Clerk: Question 360. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

795 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** In connection with the appointment of the Facilities Manager or equivalent at the ERS, can the Minister for Health explain what the recruitment process has been for this post in the context of qualification and experience?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

800 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, to date there has been no appointment to this post.

805 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, can the Health Minister kindly confirm whether this post is open and will be filled, or are they looking to fill it?

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, all I can say really at this stage is that from my understanding there has been no movement in respect of this particular post since I became Minister for Health. The hon. Lady knows, because we have discussed it in the past, that we are in the process of integrating Elderly Residential Services into the GHA so are currently evaluating all posts relating to their effectiveness. But, as I say, since I was appointed Health Minister there has been no movement in relation to this post.

Q361/2017
Primary Care Clinic Health Visitor –
Recruitment process

Clerk: Question 361. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: In connection with the new appointment at the Primary Care Clinic for the post of Health Visitor, can the Minister for Health explain what the recruitment process has been for this position in the context of qualification and experience?
815

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, there has been no recruitment process for the post of Health Visitor as the post is currently filled with a contract nurse.
820

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, does the Health Minister consider it fair that there is another health visitor, because I understand there are two health visitors, or there should be two health visitors, at any time and that the other health visitor only got the job by an interview process presentation to panel, and is it fair that the latest recruit for this position has not had to go through the same channels?
825

Hon. N. F Costa: Mr Speaker, as I have told the hon. Lady, there has been no recruitment to the post. Therefore, at the point that there is recruitment the usual recruitment procedures will apply, and if that is what ordinarily happens, that the health visitor is requested to prepare a presentation and, I imagine, subject herself or himself to an interview, then that will be the process that will be followed at that time. But currently there is already a contract nurse occupying the post.
830
835

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, can the Health Minister, or perhaps the Education Minister, give us some clarification that there is currently a junior staff nurse who was sent to the UK through the Education back door, a candidate well known to the GSLP family, and will be placed in this position in a very short time frame?
840

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, the hon. Lady and I have discussed this in the bunk of No. 6, at the Piazza Grill downstairs, which we affectionately call the Lower House, and I have told her that her information is incorrect. She has written to me on the subject. I have had my principal secretary Mrs Cervan write to her. Clearly, unfortunately, on this occasion she seems not to trust what I have told her by email, but I can assure her that what I tell her in the Piazza Grill I do as if I were answering her in this House and I always live on the basis that all the decisions that I take will be subject to her scrutiny and to the scrutiny of hon. Members opposite.
845

Let me just tell her that her information is so incorrect that this lady to whom she alludes is not a junior nurse; she is a registered general nurse, which, as she will know, is higher than a nursing assistant, higher than an enrolled nurse. She is a tier-one nurse. So, please, let her leave this House in the knowledge that her information is skewed and it is incorrect. I have told her orally, I have told her by email, I have now said so under the Speaker's Chair and I can assure her that there is no explanation other than what I have already iterated to her orally and in writing and now under my responsibility in this House to give to her full and frank disclosure.
850
855

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, I thank the Minister for Health for his explanation and it is indeed true that I have been chasing this matter for many months because I and many workers within the GHA consider this situation very disconcerting. And it is true that the Minister

860 often and any time that I ask for any information can see that I have come in good faith. This is
why I have been waiting for this question. But I have to say that it is precisely because I have not
been satisfied with the answers given by his officials that I have felt a need to raise it. So perhaps
if I can ask the question: once this candidate completes her studies and comes back, should she
865 be given the position, perhaps the Minister for Health will indulge in answering whether all this
coincidence, shall we say, in placing her was in fact a *fait accompli* or not.

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, I have already told the hon. Lady that her information is
incorrect: she is already a registered general nurse. The RGN is a tier-one nurse. They undergo
what I understand to be an excruciating three-year degree and she completed her BSc (Hons) via
870 the School of Health Studies. So I can assure her that this is not a junior grade, this is a fully
qualified tier-one professional, and at the point that the contract nurse's term of engagement
expires, then, as I understand it from the supplementary information given to me, the position
will be, in the usual manner, advertised internally for people to apply.

But let me also tell her, Mr Speaker, that since I have been Health Minister, I have on many
875 different occasions seen a need for our GNs or ENs in one part of the GHA and without any
internal vacancy or without any other process I have asked the Director of Nursing whether we
could reorganise and restructure the nursing cohorts so that one ward could do with perhaps
having less particular tier nurse and move to another. In other words, what I am trying to tell her
is that it would not be at all unusual if this lady who is currently undertaking the work ... because
880 she is a fully qualified nurse, at the point that the contract nurse's contract expires I am advised
clinically by the Director of Nursing that she is suitable to carry out the post. But let me assure
her that if she were not, she would not be placed in that position, because she knows me well
enough to know that my first concern, as is the concern of every single person on this bench, is
patients' safety, dignity and compassionate care by highly qualified and skilled people.

885 Thank you.

Tribute to victims of attacks in London, Manchester and Brussels and Grenfell Tower fire

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, I do not mean to interfere in the debate of
supplementaries, but I am afraid ... If the hon. Lady will allow me just to recess the House
quickly, because we are going to pay a tribute in a moment.

If I can just ask the House to reflect as we go downstairs that this is the first meeting of the
890 House since the attack at the Manchester Arena, which incredibly is just over a month ago, the
Borough Market attack, the Finsbury Mosque attack and the tragedy at Grenfell Tower.

In relation to the Manchester Arena, I think many of us could not believe that we were
witnessing such a vicious terrorist attack at an event that was, in effect, attended by young
people and children, some of whom were just having a great night out.

895 At Borough Market, Mr Speaker, a place where people were enjoying an evening out in that
fantastic city that is London, again terrorists trying to change people's ability to enjoy freedom
and liberty, especially in a city as cosmopolitan as London.

And then only two days ago, at Finsbury Mosque, a cowardly attempt to create a conflict of
religions and civilisations where a man died because he was in the region of his place of worship
900 and his place of worship was attacked. Terrorists are terrorists, Mr Speaker, whatever religion
they may be, whatever religion, or no religion, of the persons that they kill.

And yesterday in Brussels another attempted attack, where I am sorry to say some
Gibraltarians were in the region of the attempted attack but were very lucky to be able to see
that attack thwarted.

905 It is also, Mr Speaker, exactly a week since the horrific event of the Grenfell Tower, which has
led us, of course, in Gibraltar to have to check quickly – as the Minister for Housing and the City
Fire Brigade and all the other relevant parts of Government have done – the work that has been
done on our own high-rise buildings, on which no doubt we will be saying more. We have seen
such horrific scenes. Everyone watching the news I think will have been horrified and will likely
910 have turned away to see what was happening in London.

I ask the House, Mr Speaker, to show its grief, in respect and its condolences by recessing so
that we may assemble downstairs for a minute's silence at 12 o'clock, where we will be joined
by His Excellency the Governor and by the religious leaders of our community. So I therefore
invite the House to now recess.

915

Mr Speaker: The House will now have a short recess.

The House recessed at 11.55 a.m. and resumed its sitting at 12.06 p.m.

Q361/2017 continued

Mr Speaker: We were dealing with supplementaries arising from Question 361. Any other
supplementary?

920 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I am sorry, I got cut off my line of thought a little
bit. If I can just pick myself up again ... I and the Minister for Health share a very good
relationship in the interests of this community and he knows very well that where I can get
answers privately in order to help people I try not to go public if it is not needed.

I repeat: precisely because I was not satisfied by the answers I was being given in the GHA I
925 have continued to prod on this issue. I accept that the Minister for Health is trying to be
forthcoming and from where he is standing there is nothing untoward about this appointment.
But let me just put it this way: if this candidate who has been given – by the Department of
Education, it seems – a scholarship to go and train for this post which has not been filled and
then this candidate comes back and then this candidate gets this post, can the Minister for
930 Health not understand why the public or even the staff at the GHA might find it disconcerting
that all the factors have lined up in order for this candidate to get the job?

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, I think that the hon. Lady needs to be reminded of the facts. The
first fact is that there has been no appointment. She needs to understand that. In the course of
935 her supplementary question she once again said that there had been an appointment as a fact.
There has been no appointment. There is currently a contract nurse that is filling that position.

I think it is unfair to this particular person to have suggested in her first supplementary to me
that she has somehow got in through the back door. This is a registered general nurse and I can
assure the hon. Lady that they do not gift those degrees as though they were either confetti or
940 sweets. They are hard degrees, and due to dint of her diligence and her perseverance she
qualified as a registered general nurse, which is tier one of nursing. We should congratulate our
local brothers and sisters who go to the UK to be able to qualify in professions that we can
actually give them a job in to serve our community with compassion and with skill. (*Banging on
desks*) She then, after, was successful in an application to do a further course of study for a
945 Specialist Community Public Health scholarship. She was not gifted it by the Department of
Education. She had to apply as everyone else applies and after the application, and after due
consideration by what I know are excellent professionals at the Department of Education, she
was granted the right to attend John Moores University in September of last year, to be

completed in summer of this year, to do the course of Specialist Community Public Health
950 Nursing.

Mr Speaker, further, it is important to note that in the GHA – and my hon. and illustrious
predecessor will correct me if I am wrong – there is only one other Gibraltar health visitor. In
fact, I think there are only two health visitors in the entire GHA. So we have a Gibraltar who
955 successfully completes a Bachelor of Science and becomes a top tier-one registered general
nurse. She then applies again to continue and further her education and she is successful, she is
given a scholarship, and all that we are saying to the hon. Lady opposite – and I have said this to
her in this House and previously by email and when we meet socially – is that she has not been
appointed to this. Whether or not this lady will become the health visitor in this particular post
will not be determined by me, I can assure her. It will be determined on the basis of clinical
960 advice and nothing else.

So, no, Mr Speaker, there is no back door. No, Mr Speaker, there is no hanky-panky. No, Mr
Speaker, this is being done entirely properly and everyone on this side of the House will applaud
the fact that a Gibraltar has been successful as an RGN, has been successful to get a
scholarship and we have now a second Gibraltar health visitor. And the fact that there are
965 only two health visitors out of a complement of 500 nurses has to mean, by necessity, that not
many Gibaltarians want to be health visitors, so good for her! (*Banging on desks*)

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, will the post of health visitor, given that there is a
contract nurse at the moment whose contract will be finishing in September, be opening up in
970 September?

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, as I have told her during the course of one of my answers to her
supplementary, whether or not this person is appointed to the position which is currently being
filled in by the contract nurse will be determined by the Clinical Manager in consultation with
975 the Nursing Director once the position becomes available, and whether or not she is successful
will solely depend on the advice that I receive from the Clinical Nurse Manager.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): If
I may assist – because this is nothing new, Mr Speaker – there have been similar cases going
980 back years, and I believe beyond when we came into office, in other disciplines. The only thing is
that there are so few health visitors that this may attract people's attention.

Midwives have regularly gone to study midwifery. Qualified nurses have got scholarships
through the Education Department to study midwifery and have come back and have been
slotted in to replace contract workers. This has been happening for years, there is nothing new,
985 so I do not understand why this particular young lady, who has gone out of her way, who wants
to specialist and train and take her place rightfully within the Gibraltar Health Authority, is being
singled out by the Member opposite. (*Banging on desks*)

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, can I just say that I am by no means singling out
990 anybody. I am trying to bring to light an issue that is of concern to many GHA workers and I think
that they deserve an explanation. This is not about the individual; this is about procedure and
process.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, may I?

Mr Speaker: Yes.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, just one question. In listening to these exchanges across the
floor of the House, there appears to be an assumption on the part of the Minister in his answers
1000 that this lady, who is now qualified, or has recently qualified in the United Kingdom, is actually

going to be applying for this particular post. Has the Minister received an indication that that is so, and that is why in his answers he is basically taking it as a given that this lady is going to be applying for this particular post?

1005 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the question as phrased by the hon. Lady was suggesting a back door and that is why I have answered in the way that I have. But the facts as presented to me by Mrs Cervan in the supplementary information are that this particular lady approached the Acting Director of Nursing in September 2016, that she was interested in pursuing this training, that she had been successful in obtaining the scholarship and they discussed the career opportunities and possibilities. But as I have told the hon. Lady and I will repeat to the hon. Gentleman, there has not been a determination. I promise him there has not been a determination –

Hon. D A Feetham: There is no vacancy.

1015 **Hon. N F Costa:** Absolutely. That is right. As I have also said, there is currently a contract nurse, but once the contract expires the vacancy will then be available, and then from within the GHA they will make a determination of who is suitable. But the point that I also made to the hon. Lady is that there are only two, so she will not be the only person who can apply: the other health visitor lady could also apply once the position becomes available.

1020 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

Q362/2017
St Bernard's Hospital –
Press officer

Clerk: Question 362. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

1025 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Is there a press officer stationed at the seventh floor of St Bernard's Hospital; and if so, what does his or her work entail?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

1030 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, there is no press officer stationed at the seventh floor of St Bernard's Hospital.

Q363/2017
GHA Heads of Department –
Meeting with Minister to discuss concerns

Clerk: Question 363. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

1035 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Has the Health Minister met with all Heads of Department at the GHA in order to listen to their concerns?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, yes.

1040 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, what would I tell a few of the Heads of Department who claim that they still have not met with the Health Minister and are dying for the opportunity to voice their concerns?

Hon. N F Costa: That they are not the Head of the Department.

1045 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** I believe there is some sort of discrepancy here because there are a few who claim that they have not met and are Heads of Department, so perhaps ...

1050 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, perhaps to clear up any ambiguity: I have met with the Medical Director approximately 172 times, for his sins; the Public Health Director 43 times – obviously he was good in a former life and has not been subjected to me for as much as the Medical Director; Clinical Nurse Managers, around once a month; the Acting Human Resources Manager – it says here 68, but I doubt that the poor fellow had so much luck and it is probably a lot more than that; the Director of Nursing – I just met with her this morning, I see her very regularly, I would say perhaps three or four times a week; the Director of Finance, around 16 times; Ocean Views Manager, around 43; the St Bernard's Hospital Operations Manager, around 11; the PCC Manager, truly for her sins around 172 or 173 times; and the I&T Director, around 12 or 13 times.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q364/2017

Patients requiring mental health assistance – Out-of-hours arrangements

1060 **Clerk:** Question 364. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: What 24-hour arrangements are there in place for patients who require mental assistance, especially on weekends?

1065 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

1070 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, at present, there is assistance from the Community Mental Health Team during working hours and an on-call crisis team – composed of a consultant psychiatrist, a mental welfare officer, and a registered mental health charge nurse – who deal with emergencies, assessments and admissions out of normal working hours.

1075 Mr Speaker, I am delighted to report today in this House for the first time that as from yesterday the Community Mental Health Team services will be further enhanced by the introduction of an outreach support component for community patients. The service will be provided by experienced qualified nurses who will be on call after normal working hours, including on weekends. The main aim is to offer an extra tier of support for our community patients outside normal working hours. Although still at embryonic stages, the new extension to the service will see the phased introduction of a number of new initiatives aimed exclusively at improving the quality of life for patients and carers in the community and will continue to develop as the services grow.

1080 It is important, Mr Speaker, I think, at this point to highlight the answer that I gave to the Hon. Mr Clinton that the re-admission rate is at 2.8%, and we hope that with this new community outreach service support we will be able to do even better on that figure.

1085 It is important to note that, although a high standard of care is presently on offer, the new
component will ensure that a more robust support network is available to patients after hours
and will be a welcome addition to the existing on-call team. Some of the services that will be
available will include: a nursing after-hours on-call service from five o'clock in the afternoon until
1090 eight in the morning, seven days a week, including Bank Holidays; improved discharge packages
incorporating more supportive structures for people moving back into the community from
Ocean Views; improved supervision and management of patient caseloads that require more
input or monitoring; increase in frequency of home visits and checking compliance with
medication.

1095 Following the necessary training, a mental health support line will be available to our known
patients/carers incorporating a combination of phone and physical presence and, where
necessary, linking with the excellent team at Club House to offer advice and support.

It is anticipated that this improved approach will have a positive impact in reducing the need
for admissions or length of stay in hospital.

1100 Mr Speaker, by way of additional information I think it is also important to say that the Hon.
the Deputy Chief Minister, the Hon. the Chief Minister and I are very much in close discussions
with Sams Gibraltar and we are looking to work closely with them to reinforce and add resilience
to the additional community outreach programme that I have just announced today in the
House.

1105 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I congratulate the Minister and the Government
for such a well thought-out package and I thank him as a citizen. I think it will benefit many,
many people.

1110 Can I ask when can we expect this service to be advertised and the number known to the
public. I personally receive many desperate pleas from people, and obviously I am not equipped
to deal with mental health issues so I am looking forward to the day when this will actually be up
and running. Can we have some type of timeframe, please?

1115 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker. The process that we followed was that we opened internal
vacancies for three enrolled nurses who have got specialised training in mental health, and
those three enrolled nurses are now currently undergoing extra training to make sure that when
they receive calls, and indeed when they make house visits, which for me was one of the most
important parts and components of the new strategy, that nurses are able to visit persons who
are in the community who have been discharged from Ocean Views and they are able to check
on medication and of course provide any other medical assistance that an enrolled nurse can
1120 provide ... We should be in a position to, the training having been completed in time, to fully roll
out this programme by before the Parliament recesses for summer. So hopefully at some point
in July.

Mr Speaker: The Hon. Roy Clinton.

1125 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, may I add my congratulations to the Minister, along with
those of the hon. Lady. As this House will recall, we both debated or brought separate motions
to this House in relation to the continuity of care for mental health patients in the community
and that more should be done to help the most vulnerable in the community.

1130 May I ask the Minister whether this initiative, which is obviously much welcomed on this side
of the House, was as a result of any review that was undertaken; and if so, would the Minister
be willing to publish details of that review?

1135 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, if the hon. Gentleman is asking me whether it was part of a
formal review, no it was not. When I became Minister for Health, one of the things that struck
me was that there should be a more robust and resilient community process where we ensured

1140 that persons who have been discharged from Ocean Views do not return to Ocean Views. And although there has already been, as I said before, a psychiatrist, a community mental welfare officer and a nurse that deal with after-hours support, in our estimation it was sound but not enough. Therefore, that is why we rolled it out, and I have and congratulate Kay and Chris Chipolina who have provided us with the clinical advice on that after having also received advice from Mr Manolo Peralta and from other members of the Community Mental Health team that this additional level of support will be sufficient. But of course, like with any new pilot programme that the Government deploys, we will have to wait and see whether three enrolled nurses are enough or whether that needs to be considered at an additional time.

1145

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Minister for the additional information. Just one final question: will an element of this service be available to the families of service users who may have concerns?

1150

Hon. N F Costa: Absolutely, Mr Speaker, yes.

HOUSING AND EQUALITY

Q365/2017

Government dwellings – Number vacant and/or derelict

Clerk: Question 365. The Hon. E J Reyes.

1155

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, following on from the answer provided to Question 288/2017, is the Minister for Housing now in a position to say how many Government dwellings are currently vacant and/or derelict in Gibraltar?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

1160

Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, as previously advised, we are undertaking an in-depth study of all properties and this is ongoing.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, does the Minister have an indication by when this study will be completed – to avoid me having to make the question unnecessarily if I have a rough estimate?

1165

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, I envisage that it will be ready now after the summer. However, the hon. Gentleman may recall that he has asked me a separate question about vacant flats and there are figures, in that it is a written question so he will get it in a written answer. But the exercise that we are undertaking is in respect of flats that are derelict and may no longer be, or we may decide are beyond economical repair.

Q366-367/2017

**Laguna, Glacis and Moorish Castle Estates –
Completed and pending refurbishment works**

1170 **Clerk:** Question 366. The Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes. Can the Minister for Housing provide an updated list of all refurbishment works already fully completed, with details of commencement and completion dates and naming the individual blocks of flats where concerned, within the following rental housing estates: (a) Laguna Estate; (b) Glacis Estate; and (c) Moorish Castle Estate?
1175

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 367.
1180

Clerk: Question 367. The Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Housing provide revised and updated estimated completion dates of pending refurbishment works, naming the individual blocks of flats where concerned, still being undertaken at the following rental housing estates: (a) Laguna Estate; (b) Glacis Estate; and (c) Moorish Castle Estate?
1185

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.
1190

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, in answer to Question 366/2017, the following refurbishment works have been completed.

For part (a): Rodney House, September 2013 to November 2016.

For part (b): George Jeger House, commencement September 2013, completion December 2016; Referendum House, September 2013 to December 2016; Constitution House, February 2014 to December 2016; Brother O'Brien, June 2014 to December 2016; Portmore House, June 2014 to December 2016; Gustavo Bacarisa House, August 2014 to November 2016; Ironside House, November 2014 to November 2016.
1195

For part (c): Calpe House, September 2014 to November 2016; Castle House, September 2013 to April 2017; Ince House, November 2013 to April 2017; Wall House, February 2014 to April 2017; and Key House, September 2014 to May 2017.
1200

In answer to Question 367, the following are the target dates for completion of the refurbishment of these estates. Estate (a) Laguna, December 2018; Estate (b) Glacis, December 2017; Estate (c) Moorish Castle, December 2017.
1205

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, the Minister has given me comprehensive information. However, in respect of Question 367 I did ask for the naming of the individual blocks of flats, where concerned. It is so that when I do meet with tenants from those estates I can then home in and at least we know for certain that a block that is still on the list of pending refurbishment works to be completed is not one that has been completed and it allows the tenants to be in a better position to know if works are still to be carried out.
1210

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, the answer is phrased in the way that it is because we have moved on from the initial way in which we were phasing the works at the estates. As you can see from the list of blocks that I have highlighted in Question 366, a lot of these blocks have been completed, so we are no longer working within the estates in phases as we were. The way we are working towards completion is works across the board in terms of all the blocks, so
1215

essentially we have the same completion date for everything that remains in the refurbishment process.

1220

Hon. E J Reyes: Yes, Mr Speaker, I think I understand what the Minister is saying, but if I give you one quick example. In Question 366 for Glacis Estate the Minister referred to Brother O'Brien House. In Question 367, by not homing in or not being able to provide details of the block, the residents of Brother O'Brien are still uncertain if any internal refurbishments have to be carried out – or is everything now ticked off and therefore no further works are to happen? Were that to be the case, the tenants may wish to get together and plead with Government that the works have not quite gone as far as they were led to believe. This is why I thought this information could help to perhaps calm their fears.

1225

1230

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Yes, Mr Speaker, insofar as Brother O'Brien, and indeed all the other blocks that are listed in part (b) of my answer to Question 366, all of these are now completed. We are at a stage where we have completion but we are finalising on the snagging of the completion works, The answer to that is that we have completion subject to snagging.

1235

Hon. E J Reyes: I will leave it at that, Mr Speaker, and if need be after the summer recess I can then clarify any further points with the Minister.

Q368/2017

Government rental housing estates – Intended new refurbishment works

Clerk: Question 368. The Hon. E J Reyes.

1240

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Housing provide details of what new refurbishment works it intends to carry out at any Government rental housing estates in the immediate future?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

1245

Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, we will continue to invest in the refurbishment of all Government housing estates and there is a programme of works to ensure that estates continue to be refurbished as well as maintained. More details will be announced in respect of the estates to be tackled and dates when the works will be undertaken.

Q369/2017

Alameda House – Works re fresh water system

Clerk: Question 369. The Hon. E J Reyes.

1250

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Housing provide details of remedial works undertaken and/or works still to be undertaken or completed, to the supply of the fresh water system at Alameda House in Alameda Estate, indicating if they are of a permanent or temporary arrangement?

1255

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

1260 **Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, the fresh water supply at Alameda Estate was provisionally rerouted externally via corridors as an emergency measure. The provisional installation is currently being secured within the inner side of the common areas to afford protection against extreme weather conditions, vandalism and accidental damage until a permanent re-routing solution is implemented as part of the forthcoming external refurbishment of Alameda House.

1265 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful and I am certain that the tenants will welcome that eventually a more permanent thing will happen. Any possibility of an indication of the dates when these external works would take place at Alameda House that will finalise the works that unfortunately had to be taken to the fresh water supply system at Alameda House?

1270 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Yes, Mr Speaker, in respect of Alameda House we are on track with our refurbishment plan and it is envisaged that the external refurbishment of Alameda House will commence in January 2018.

Q370/2017

Homeless and drug-dependent ex-offenders – Access to Government accommodation

Clerk: Question 370. The Hon. E J Phillips.

1275 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Can the Government state what arrangements are in place for those who have completed a custodial sentence, have no place of residence and have drug dependency issues to immediately access Government accommodation?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

1280 **Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento):** Mr Speaker, arrangements have been established between the Housing Department and all partner bodies, where cases of people falling under this category are discussed on a multi-agency basis and suitable accommodation is identified in accordance with Government allocation policies.

1285 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Just one further question arising from that: does that mean, Minister, that as soon as someone is released from prison having completed that custodial sentence, that arrangements are either put in place before they simply make their application for urgent rehousing or housing? How does it work on a practical level for those people to access accommodation in those circumstances? I am grateful.

1290

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, under the new arrangements we do not wait for someone to have completed their sentence. This is where the Housing Department works with the prison authorities and social workers, probation officers or drugs workers, depending on the offender, to assist them in their reintegration prior to release. They will assist them in making an application.

1295 What I have said is that their application will be considered in accordance with the housing allocation policies. That is not to say that someone will automatically be rehoused upon release but that their application will be considered in line with the policy. If in consideration in line with the policy it means that the person meets the criteria for rehousing, they will be rehoused but

1300

they will be rehoused because they meet the housing criteria as opposed to an automatic rehousing because they have been in prison. I hope that is clear.

1305 **Hon. E J Phillips:** It is, yes. One further question: insofar as immediate homelessness is concerned, I assume that criteria speeds up their process.

1310 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** It will be treated in the same way as a case of homelessness is concerned. It is not an automatic case that someone who finishes serving a custodial sentence will be rehoused by the Housing Department; that person may have a house to go back to. If that person is likely to be vulnerable or at risk because they are homeless, then the case will be treated as a homeless case in the same way that other cases are treated and they will be given priority accordingly.

Thank you.

Q371/2017
Assisted living flats –
Allocation to old age pensioners

1315 **Clerk:** Question 371. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: What is this Government's policy in relation to allocating assisted living flats to old age pensioners?

1320 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, Government does not have assisted living flats for old age pensioners.

1325 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, firstly, can I just clarify the term I am using so that the Minister understands: the ones like Sea Master Lodge and Charles Bruzon House – what are they known as?

1330 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Mr Speaker, those are flats that are purpose built for the elderly. They are not assisted living flats. Assisted living flats are something completely different and it is something that ... In the UK, for example, assisted living flats for the elderly would have live-in assistance or some kind of care or assistance provided to them as part of the package of the flat.

1335 The flats that we have are flats for elderly people, for pensioners, and the two latest blocks that our Government has built and which we inaugurated recently have been specifically purposely built and are completely accessible for the needs of elderly people to help them live independently in the community. If these are the flats that the hon. Lady is referring to, flats such as Charles Bruzon House and Sea Master Lodge etc., then the criteria used for allocating these is primarily for people who are elderly and are on the medical list. Allocations are also made to the people who may be on the housing exchange list. Those are the two primary ways of people being rehoused in these flats that are purposely built for the elderly.

1340 **Hon. E J Reyes:** May I, Mr Speaker? In connection with that, the hon. Lady has just explained the criteria and the priority being given to those on the medical list and so on, which I think is a well-established norm. However, Mr Speaker, could the Minister enlighten us: is it correct that there are those elderly people on the medical list who have been led to believe that because
1345 they are renting from a private landlord at present and not from the Government rental stock

that they will not be eligible to move into these flats? Can the Minister confirm or deny that, so that we can allay certain fears?

1350 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** No, that is not the case at all, because those individuals are entitled to be applicants and, as applicants, if they are then considered to be on the medical list they will be on the medical list just like anybody else who is a current housing tenant. So it is not to say that only people who are housing tenants and on the exchange list are eligible for the elderly flats. Anybody on the waiting list, depending on where they are at this stage, would be allocated one of these flats, and indeed we have allocated many of these. So that is absolutely
1355 not true.

1360 **Hon. E J Reyes:** I thank her, Mr Speaker. I know what elderly people are like... I already fall into the category of those of us who are on the 60-plus! I am not saying that her Ministry or Department are necessarily incorrect in the information they give, but elderly people can sometimes easily misunderstand. More than one person came out from meetings at the Housing Ministry saying, 'Yes, but we've been told there's a huge disadvantage because we don't have a Government flat to return back to the stock,' something that I know previous Governments have also at times had to use that priority – if an elderly couple, for example, could be occupying a 4RKB and are on the medical list and would benefit from moving down to the 2RKB in, for
1365 example, the beautiful Charles Bruzon House, and release a 4RKB. But certainly it is good news to hear that because someone is renting from the private sector it does not necessarily exclude them from the list and therefore if there are still any misunderstandings I will take it up personally with the lady, like we do on a couple of occasions.

1370 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** No, Mr Speaker, the supplementary question was as to eligibility and I can confirm that as long as people meet the criteria to be an applicant for housing – and someone who is in a private rental would meet the criteria – then there is no reason why they cannot be on there. The rules are very clear and I know that the Department explains it very clearly.
1375

Mr Speaker: The Hon. Marlene Hassan Nahon.

1380 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** My supplementary was pretty much along the same lines as the hon. Gentleman on my right, in that I have had a couple of complaints from constituents who feel that because they are not on the Government tenants list and are renting privately ... old age pensioners want to be eligible to rent these old age pensioner flats – we are not calling it assisted living – so I will go back and tell them that they are not prejudiced in any way and they have the same rights as any existing Government tenant. Is that right?

1385 **Hon. Miss S J Sacramento:** Yes. What the Department does when they consider allocation, because there is a difference between eligibility and your entitlement to be on the list and how then your application is considered and the urgency and the weight that you are given when allocation ... At the time of allocation we look at who at that point on the list will need it most. So, if someone is on the waiting list and is in a private rental but may be particularly old or frail
1390 and living in a flat that is extremely inaccessible for them, which means that they have a very poor quality of life, then that person would have priority over somebody who may be a bit fitter or a bit healthier and living in Government rental accommodation, notwithstanding the fact that they would release rental accommodation. What the Department does is they do a balancing exercise where they try and assist all the applicants on the list and also try to look at everything
1395 in the round. So it all depends on the individual and the individual's circumstances and the urgent need of the individual to be re-accommodated.

Q372/2017

**Government rental housing –
Policy re arrears agreements and parking spaces**

Clerk: Question 372. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: What is the Government's policy in relation to Government housing rental tenants who have arrears agreements and parking spots?
1400

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Housing and Equality.

Minister for Housing and Equality (Hon. Miss S J Sacramento): Mr Speaker, household tenancies and parking spaces are not connected. As such, anyone with an agreement for payment of arrears of rent enters into an agreement in respect of the flat only. Anyone who is in arrears of rent is not entitled to additional benefits, and this includes a parking permit or a licence to park in the estate.
1405

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, would the Minister for Housing understand that to those tenants who are paying their arrears – many of whom have financial issues, which is what got them there in the first place – this policy to them is connected in the sense that it does punish those with arrears agreements because their parking spot gets removed and perhaps they depend on their cars to maybe take their kids to school or do the shopping, or perhaps it is a very important part of their everyday living? Considering that they have come into an arrears agreement, and especially for those, I suspect, most of whom are keeping to it, they feel like this parking spot removal is a punishment to them and to their lives. Would the Minister for Housing be willing to review such a policy?
1410
1415

Hon. Miss S J Sacramento: Mr Speaker, the starting point is that we are talking about people who do not pay their rent but still can afford a car – and of course the petrol and the insurance and all the inherent expenses of the vehicle.
1420

I have to say, Mr Speaker, that there have been a couple of estates where the parking permits have expired in the last couple of months – there have been four estates that come to mind – and since we have written to people informing them of the Government policy that anybody in arrears of rent is not entitled to any extras ... So it is not just the parking, the ability to avail themselves of a parking space that we are not making available anymore; it is the same as people who are not entitled to have a berth and to have certain other additions that go beyond the protection of being in your dwelling.
1425

Mr Speaker, the number of people who have automatically come in and paid lump sums have been people who have not paid rent in 10 years, 15 years, who, for the sake of not losing their parking, have paid the arrears. So I do not agree with the hon. Lady's premise that people cannot afford to pay their rent and that is why they are in arrears. In fact, some of the anecdotal information that I have from my office, who are meeting people who are coming in and clearing their arrears completely in the last couple of months when we started dealing with estates where parking has expired ... There was a particular gentleman who came in and said, 'No, I cannot pay – let me pay you half of my arrears,' which was a few thousand pounds, 'but I'll pay you the other thousand in a few months' time because I'm going on a cruise next week,' and he said, 'Well, sorry, your parking space, your permit, expires in the next two weeks – you can either pay it in full or you will find yourself clamped when you come back from your cruise,' and within 24 hours the full lump sum was paid. Someone else paid a lump sum, Mr Speaker, incredibly enough, of £19,000 so as not to lose their parking space.
1430
1435
1440

So, Mr Speaker, all cases are considered on a case-by-case basis – (*Mr Speaker: Que caradura tienen la gente!*) (*Laughter and banging on desks*) Precisely, Mr Speaker, and it is because we

1445 recognise ... What we do is we distinguish between *la gente con la caradura* and people who genuinely cannot pay, and it is the *caraduras* who are not allowed the parking permit. We do look at people as individual cases and there have been exceptions made for people who we know are in genuine hardship or people who may have a disability and they therefore need their parking. But what we will not do it for, Mr Speaker, is for the *caradura*.

1450 Only recently – another anecdote, Mr Speaker – someone asked for us to make an exception to the parking permit. When we looked at the household and the income, there were four people in the household in employment – all of them were in employment. Most of them were earning around £20,000 and the highest earner was earning £40,000, and the car for which they were seeking the permit and they were asking us not to enforce the policy for the parking was a brand new Mercedes Benz. So, yes, *cara dura* indeed.

1455 But it is for the *caraduras*, Mr Speaker, to whom this policy applies, and for the people who are in circumstances of genuine hardship to whom it does not apply, and it is because of the application of that policy that we have for the first time made tremendous in-roads in the recovery of arrears.

1460 **Several Members:** Hear, Hear. (*Banging on desks*)

Mr Speaker: Next question.

CULTURE, THE MEDIA, YOUTH AND SPORT

Q373/2017

Ince's Hall mural – Cost and selection of artist

Clerk: Question 373. The Hon. R M Clinton.

1465 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Government please advise what was the cost of the graffiti mural painted on the northern side of Ince's Hall and what tender process was followed in selecting the artist?

1470 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, the total cost of the graffiti mural was £19,881.34. The acclaimed and highly regarded street artist Ben Eine directly approached the Government to undertake the job.

1475 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, if I then correctly understand the Minister, by the artist directly approaching the Government obviously there was no tender process. Can I ask the Minister: £20,000 to paint the side of the building is not an inconsequential sum – how was the artistic merit of the proposal decided upon?

1480 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Member asks first of all about the tender. If someone wants to commission a Dalí or a Picasso or a Christian Hook, you do not go out to tender. That is the first thing. (*Interjection*) Christian Hook, yes, that is why I had to put him in! You could not acquire a Picasso or a Dalí, because they are both dead, Mr Speaker! But anyway, the point is that if you want somebody who is a brilliant artist to do a job, you tell them, 'Here's the wall: do your art,' which is the second point that the hon. Member actually made. We do not tell the artist what they have to do. It is their skill, their profession, to do what they need to do with the

1485

1490 wall, and that was the case with Ben Eine, who is, like I said, an acclaimed street artist who wanted to do a street art. We gave him the opportunity of using that wall and he produced the magnificent, fantastic painting which is there.

1495 This is a subjective thing, therefore people might like the wall in grey and I might like it in orange, and the artist believed at the time that what he painted on the wall was what should have been done. So there might be people who like it or there might be people who do not like it. All I can tell you is that it is attracting loads of tourists taking photographs because of the magnificent painting on that wall.

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, indeed, art is in the eye of the beholder, but can I ask the Minister how was the decision made: is there an art appreciation committee within the Culture Agency that decides these things, or was it purely a subjective matter for himself?

1500 And I may ask one further question: how was it that the artist approached the Gibraltar Government? What are his connections to Gibraltar? And are there any plans for him to do any further such murals in Gibraltar?

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, the artist approached me through his girlfriend, who is a Gibraltarian. This is a person of international renown as a street artist and he said, through that link to the Government of Gibraltar, 'I would be delighted to paint a wall in Gibraltar.'

1505 This gentleman has a huge following. People travel to see his art around the world. He has just finished doing something in Buenos Aires; he has done a number of things in Spain and in the United Kingdom. He was very well connected to somebody the hon. Gentleman may have heard of: Banksy. He painted with Banksy for many years and Ben was very closely linked to Banksy.

1510 This was not a question of the Government deciding it wanted street art of that form; this was an artist who approached the Government and said, 'I would be delighted if you would give me a wall to paint my street art,' and depending on what wall a different sort of thing would have been painted. The wall proposed by the Government was Ince's Hall, which is related to entertainment. So, in his view, because he is the artist, he thought it made sense to paint 'That's Entertainment'. I think it is a magnificent depiction of what has gone on in that building for many hundreds of years and a way of making that building modern for a while. But, as Mr Eine himself said on television, all he has put on the building is paint. It can be taken down when the time comes to do a full refurbishment of that building in the style of the Gibraltar International Bank, which refurbishment Minister Isola led on and did a magnificent job on.

1515 I do not know whether there is such a thing as an arbiter of taste, but most artists decide for themselves what it is that they put on whatever they are invited to use as canvas. Frankly, from my point of view, as somebody who has no understanding of art and is just a layman who sees things that he likes and things that he does not like – and some of the things I like art critics think are terrible, and some of the things I dislike art critics think are magnificent – I happen to think this is magnificent because it really shows in a piece of modern street art what the Ince's Hall is all about. It is smarter than it was and I would like to use this opportunity to thank Ben Eine for having come to Gibraltar, for having decorated a historic building like the Ince's Hall as he has. It is not something that is going to be there forever, because the building will be refurbished in the style of the whole of that area in some appropriate moment, but I am delighted that we have been able to have Ben Eine come to Gibraltar. He volunteered to do so; we have really just paid for paint, accommodation and for him to come – at his request.

1525 I think that part of Gibraltar is smarter and it is more fun as a result of this magnificent piece of street art. Is my view shared? Well, Mr Speaker, it might not even be shared on this side of the House, it may not be shared on that side of the House, it may be shared by many outside, it may be shared by very few outside. Beauty is in the eye of the beholder and I reckon that if we

1540 had painted it beige, the hon. Gentleman opposite might have loved it. But look, at the end of the day, that's entertainment! (*Laughter and banging on desks*)

1545 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Well, Mr Speaker, I am grateful for the Chief Minister's intervention and his acceptance of responsibility for the choice of artist and in fact the graffiti that was painted on that wall. I hasten to add that I have always been a great admirer of art, albeit a lot of the art now, in the form of Christian Hook, I cannot afford, alas.

1550 If I may ask the Chief Minister just one supplementary, then, on this subject: is there any intention of any further art to be done in Gibraltar by this particular artist, or indeed any other street artist? And, as regards the choice of colour of beige, no, perhaps white would have been better – at a much lower cost of £5,000 plus waterproofing – but never mind.

1555 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I had a magnificent choice before me. The hon. Gentleman has said that I have taken responsibility for the choice of artist. I had an absolutely magnificent choice of artist: I had one artist who volunteered. So, given that choice, I felt duty bound to give it to him, given that nobody else had volunteered to give us of their time. Nobody else of international renown, or indeed at all, had offered to give us of their time to create this street art at cost. So I will take full responsibility for making the choice out of the one that was available.

1560 Mr Speaker, there is a programme of street art – which is not my responsibility, it is the responsibility of the Ministry for Culture in close liaison with the Ministry for the Environment – which will shortly be rolled out. I do not think we should be prompted to make an announcement about that now, because I think it is an exciting opportunity, which many other cities are taking, which does not involve much painting in beige or in white, which the hon. Gentleman would obviously quite love. I think that modernising a city at the same time as being militant in the preservation of its heritage is what the future is all about, and that is what this Government is all about.

1565 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

Q374-375/2017
Gibraltar Football Association –
Arrangements re purchase or lease of facilities

Clerk: Question 374. The Hon. E J Reyes.

1570 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Sport furnish this House with full details pertaining to the sale/lease of any sporting or other facilities, such as at the Victoria Stadium, to the Gibraltar Football Association?

1575 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 375.

1580 **Clerk:** Question 375. The Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Sport furnish this House with full details of its intentions, if any, to re-provide or re-site sporting facilities which may be lost for public use at the Victoria

Stadium/Bayside Sports Complex as a result of the arrangements it has entered into with the Gibraltar Football Association?

1585

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

Hon. S E Linares: Mr Speaker, both these questions will be answered in detail in the Budget statement which I will be delivering early next week.

1590

Hon. E J Reyes: I understand that, Mr Speaker; however, it will not allow me to pose any supplementary questions should they, in the information that has come forward, arise. I do not know ... Perhaps your guidance ...?

1595

Mr Speaker: Unless the Hon. Mr Reyes speaks before ... If you speak before the Minister, then you have a problem. If you speak after the Minister you will be able, in your own contribution, to raise matters which you are interested in and which he may or may not have covered. In any case, given that you have put these questions and they have not been totally answered, I will be liberal and I would hope the Minister would also be liberal if you ask him to give way and to answer any specific matters that you may deal with.

1600

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo) Mr Speaker, if I can be of assistance to the House, I am intending to inform the House that we should be taking the Budget debate to the Appropriation Bill on Monday.

1605

The Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister has a proposed draft order of speeches that we will circulate, so that we can agree, as usual, the order of our interventions, and the hon. Gentleman will be pleased to see that he will be speaking in our proposal, just like last year, after the hon. Gentleman – in fact, I think four or five after the hon. Gentleman – so he will have an opportunity to tailor his congratulations to the hon. Gentleman for the announcements he will make in good time.

1610

Mr Speaker: So, if the Hon. Mr Reyes deals in your contribution with issues that you would have tackled in supplementaries, then I would give the Minister the opportunity, if you give way to him, to deal with those matters.

1615

Hon. E J Reyes: Yes, Mr Speaker, I think we will do that and I think it is implied in what you are saying that, if as a result of all that and digesting on the answers, should I then need to come up with a formal oral question or whatever, say in the September session, I am sure Mr Speaker will be liberal enough to allow me to pose a question despite not being in the six months' time span because of what is happening. With that assurance, then, I am satisfied with what has been explained, Mr Speaker.

1620

Mr Speaker: Right, we now recess until three this afternoon.

The House recessed at 1.03 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 3 p.m.