



PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

AFTERNOON SESSION: 3.33 p.m. – 5.55 p.m.

Gibraltar, Wednesday, 14th February 2018

Contents

Prayer	3
Confirmation of Minutes	3
Communications from the Chair	3
Questions for Oral Answer	4
Culture, The Media, Youth and Sport.....	4
Q95/2018 Rocks dumped at Coaling Island – Origination, purpose and assessment	4
Q96/2018 Gibraltar Broadcasting Corporation – Subtitles for local programmes.....	6
Q97/2018 Europa Point shooting facilities – Government’s relocation plans	7
Q98/2018 Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority – Grade 9 administrative vacancy	8
Q99/2018 Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority – Staff vacancies to be filled.....	8
Q100/2018 Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority – Cancellations since 1st January 2018...8	
Q101/2018 Sports-related grants – Payment details	9
Q102/2018 Cultural grants – Payment details	11
Q103-106/2018 Gibraltar Football Association – Victoria Stadium: agreements, payments, compensation, instalments, delays	11
Q107/2018 University of Gibraltar Halls – Expected cost and name of contractor	14
Infrastructure and Planning.....	17
Q108/2018 Black cabs – Purchase agreement	17
Q109/2018 Parking schemes – Parking permits per household	18

Commerce.....	19
Q110/2018 Gibraltar Financial Services Commission – Statutory Review.....	19
Q111/2018 Gibraltar International Bank – Banking facilities for cryptocurrencies.....	19
Q112/2018 Data-cable security vulnerability – Safety of Gibraltar’s networks	20
Environment, Energy, Climate Change And Education.....	20
Q113/2018 Wastewater treatment plant – Question deferred	20
Health, Care and Justice.....	21
Q139/2018 Illegal use of fireworks – Government intended action	21
Q140/2018 Criminal justice system reforms – Electronic tagging.....	22
Q141/2018 Sexual harassment in the workplace – Promotion of legislation.....	22
Q142/2018 Access to CCTV footage – Protocols	27
Q143-148/2018 Care Agency and Elderly Residential Services – Employment details and fixed-term contracts.....	28
Q149/2018 St Bernard’s Hospital A & E Department – Three new Charge Nurses.....	33
Q150-152/2018 Hearing aids – Funding and patient numbers	33
Q153/2018 Mammography appointments – Cancellations without notice.....	35
Q154/2018 Orthopaedic Clinic – Average waiting time routine consultation.....	36
Q155-156/2018 Operations – Number carried out and cancelled 2016-17	36
Q157/2018 Mental health conditions – Diagnosis statistics for children and young adults .	37
Q158/2018 Obesity levels – Policy for reduction.....	37
Q159/2018 CCTV cameras at Dr Giraldi Home – Location.....	39
Q160/2018 GHA clinics – Specialist clinicians.....	40
Q161/2018 Specialist patient care – GHA resourcing.....	53
Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education	54
Q113/2018 Wastewater treatment plant – Financing.....	54
Q114/2018 Smoking – Reducing prevalence	55
Q115/2018 Complaints to EU Commission re flaring at Cepsa – Response received.....	58
Q116/2018 Thinking Green underwater camera – Operation.....	58
Q117-118/2018 Dogs – Testing of faeces; fines for non-registration.....	59
Q119/2018 Heritage Action Committee – Meetings since March 2017.....	60
Q120/2018 Upper Rock visitors – Numbers per month since July 2014	60
Q121/2018 Upper Rock Nature Reserve entrance fees – Arrears update.....	61
Q122/2018 Upper Rock-Gibraltar Nature Reserve App – Development	65
<i>The House adjourned at 5.55 p.m.</i>	65

The Gibraltar Parliament

The Parliament met at 3.33 p.m.

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: P E Martinez Esq *in attendance*]

PRAYER

Mr Speaker

CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

Clerk: Meeting of Parliament Wednesday, 14th February 2018. (i) Oath of Allegiance; (ii) Confirmation of Minutes. The Minutes of the last meeting of Parliament which were held on 18th and 29th January, 2018.

5

Mr Speaker: May I sign the Minutes as correct? (**Members:** Aye.)

The Minutes are confirmed and signed.

COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE CHAIR

Clerk: (iii) Communications from the Chair; (iv) Petitions; (v) Announcements; (vi) Papers to be laid.

10

The Hon. the Chief Minister.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay on the table, the amended Annual Report of the Gibraltar Police Authority for the year ended 31st March, 2017.

15

Mr Speaker: Ordered to lie.

Hon. Chief Minister: I have spoken to hon. Members opposite about the need to table this amended version of the report.

20

Clerk: The Hon. the Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port.

Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay on the table, the Accounts for the Gibraltar Port Authority for the financial year ended 31st March 2015.

25

Mr Speaker: Ordered to lie.

Questions for Oral Answer

CULTURE, THE MEDIA, YOUTH AND SPORT

Q95/2018

Rocks dumped at Coaling Island – Origination, purpose and assessment

Clerk: (vii) Reports of Committees; (viii) Answers to Oral Questions.
We commence with Question 95/2018, the Hon. T N Hammond.

30

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, where do the rocks being dumped in the sea at Coaling Island originate and can Government state for what purpose they are being dumped there and if the works have been subjected to a full Environmental Impact Assessment and if this has been presented to the DPC?

35

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, the rocks being placed off Coaling Island originate from the works at Lathbury Parade ground to construct the new sports facilities.

40

A substantial amount of limestone bedrock is being broken out which is similar to the rocks used for sea defence structures and this is being temporarily stockpiled for use in future sea defence works.

No Environmental Impact Assessment has been undertaken as these works are not reclamation but before works started, various key entities were consulted including the Department of the Environment and the Gibraltar Port Authority. The Town Planning Department were also informed.

45

Arising from these consultations, a number of surveys were carried out including a protected species survey and a seabed survey. A number of environmental measures have also been put in place including the deployment of a protective boom fitted with a silk curtain fender.

50

Hon. T N Hammond: I understand then that if the rocks are being stockpiled there, there would be an intention to lift them out again at some point in the future and it just strikes me, would it not have been more straightforward to have conducted such stockpiling on the east side reclamation?

55

Hon. S E Linares: Mr Speaker, the volume of the rocks generated is substantial, therefore on plan the excavation footprint is the size of a football pitch and the running track over a depth exceeding six metres.

The stockpile of the rocks on land would have required a very large footprint which is simply not available so it would not have fitted on the east side because of the amount of rocks that have been excavated.

60

So that is the answer as to putting it on the east side, so we could not have stockpiled it on the east side.

65

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, can the Minister give a flavour of how extensive the surveys he has said were conducted in order to protect the potential marine environment in that area, and why wasn't there an option of actually conducting a proper Environmental Impact Assessment which would have assured us that there is no environmental damage being conducted to potentially endangered species in that area?

Hon. S E Linares: Well, Mr Speaker, for a start I am quite satisfied that they did do the survey before they were stockpiled where they were. So much so, that we actually had some species removed from the place because they are protected species. So that is how extensive the survey went and we even had some limpets removed from some rocks before the stockpiling of these rocks.

So, I am quite satisfied that this was done, and as I said in the answer to the original question there was no need for an EIA at this point. The EIA would have to be done once the rocks are moved to become part of the reclamation, but not for stockpiling at this present time.

Hon. T N Hammond: Just one more question, Mr Speaker, as the Minister raised the subject of limpets, about which I am not an expert. But I am aware that the last time limpets were relocated the entire rocks were moved, it was not a case of removing the limpets from the rocks because clearly that would damage and potentially kill the limpets.

Is the Minister saying that entire rocks were removed from the area and if so, at what cost?

Hon. S E Linares: No, Mr Speaker, in this case although it took about three or four days to remove them, it was not removing the whole rock it was actually removing the species to some other area, which is pretty easy to do if you know how to deal with limpets.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, may I out of curiosity; I am always thirsting for knowledge. The Minister said at the end of the answer to the original question that they had placed a *silk* curtain. Could he enlighten us non-environmentalists what a silk curtain is?

Hon. S E Linares: Mr Speaker, in my answer I have silk but I am corrected and apparently it is silt, for the silt. *(Interjections)*

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, if I can be of assistance, I believe that what you have is a silk curtain that holds in silt. *(Laughter)*

So, in order for there not to be a silt curtain, in other words in order for there not to be silt going everywhere, you put in a silk curtain which holds in the silt.

Yes, and I do not know whether the protected species was a Member of the GSD for example, there are very few of them about, or a limpet or whatever it is, but the silk curtain prevents the silt affecting the protected species.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Hon. R M Clinton: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I just have a couple of supplementaries, can the Minister actually quantify in terms of cubic metres how much he expects in terms of rock, to be – using his own words – stockpiled there?

I am conscious of the fact that the Minister said this is not a reclamation project in itself and these are stones that will be used later on, I presume what he is telling the House is that there will be an exercise at some point in the future to actually go back, pick them up from where they have been dropped and move them somewhere else which would obviously involve some cost.

But having actually having witnessed the dumping by lorries of these rocks into that area, there is obviously going to be a time when there is a limit to how many rocks can be dumped in

the same area and there is going to have to be some form of reclamation in order to continue to fill in the area.

120 Can the Minister advise whether there is a project, these rocks are presumably going to break the surface, and *de facto* reclaim the area and it is going to appear as land; or is there anything involved in this stockpiling of rocks which effectively will set up a land road surface in that area?

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman has asked whether we have the information as to the cubic metres of rock that we expect will be taken from the site. We do
125 have that information, it is 65,000 cubic metres that are expected.

Now, Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman in relation to the rest of his question knows, and I do not think it arises from this but I am happy to assist the House and not require him to ask a specific question, knows that we have already announced that there is going to be a reclamation in front of Coaling Island, so the reasoning is therefore for using this site that we will be able to
130 move the rocks to form part of the revetment.

Now 65,000 cubic metres of rock might sound like a lot, but it may not even be enough to finish the revetment of the sort of reclamation that we envisage being in that area, although part of it may involve caissons being used rather than just rock revetment. And given the cost of double handling rock and other such materials, we will reduce the cost considerably by having
135 the rocks in that location, and simply having to displace the rocks rather than having to once again truck them down to the area if we had put them on the east side, for example, which would have cost twice again because of the double handling that would have been involved.

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Chief Minister for the additional
140 information. Just for the sake of completeness, am I correct in understanding then that these rocks will have to be dredged up at some point in the future and located in wherever the sea wall would be in the future?

Hon. Chief Minister: Well I think the hon. Gentleman is using the wrong nomenclature, I do
145 not think you can dredge a rock. I think you can displace a rock, you can move a rock but as he and I know once something heavy is under water it is much easier to move, including me for example!

So, the hon. Gentleman will understand that moving a rock that is under water is easier than moving a rock from Lathbury to the east side and then moving it from the east side to Coaling
150 island.

Q96/2018

Gibraltar Broadcasting Corporation – Subtitles for local programmes

Clerk: Question 96/2018, the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, can the Government state what steps, if any, are being taken
155 by the Gibraltar Broadcasting Corporation to ensure that subtitles for local programmes on television are available for the hearing impaired?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

160 **Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, GBC already provides closed captioning for the hearing impaired on its 'video on demand' service via the GBC Player that can be found on the Corporation's website. Subtitles are available within 48 hours of the programme first airing on GBC TV.

The corporation is currently investigating the possibility of introducing an element of subtitles on air, although this does not include live programmes, which would require a significant investment in technology and recruitment of additional specialist personnel.

165

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, I thank the Minister for the answer to that particular question. A number of people have approached me with hearing impediments in relation to this particular issue in relation to subtitles and obviously the GRA have issued several guidance notes, first of all in December 2013 in respect of accessibility for people with hearing and visual disability, and latterly on 17th March 2017 in which certain observations were made to the technical aspects of subtitling.

170

Is the Minister aware of those particular guidance notes issued by the GRA? I invite him to at some point, perhaps not today, comment on those to me privately. I would like to know whether or not subtitles can be provided on GBC news, for instance, because many people with hearing impediments get the news quite late, as you say 48 hours later, and it would be very helpful for members of our community that do have hearing difficulties to follow the news when it is delivered. If the Minister could give some information about the possible costings, or the 'significant' costs that the Minister alludes to, that would be helpful.

175

Hon. S E Linares: Well, Mr Speaker, initially it is not possible to give the costings of what is still at the investigation process, but I know GBC is investigating and the part where it says that it is the 'on air' is like for example the news could well be subtitled when it goes on at 11 o'clock rather than the 8.30 one. So those are the things that are being looked at.

180

I am aware of what the GRA is saying and I am also aware because we have had representations from the fraternity of people who have a hearing impediment. So, it is a thing that GBC is taking seriously but again it has to be in proportion to the financing and the availability of technology and also whether it is actually a thing that if we can provide it in another way, we would do so.

185

Q97/2018

Europa Point shooting facilities – Government's relocation plans

Clerk: Question 97/2018, the Hon. E J Reyes.

190

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, further to the answer provided to Question 595/2017, is the Minister for Sport now in a position to inform this House of Government's plans for the relocation of the shooting facilities presently sited at Europa Point?

195

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, it is now public knowledge since the whole of the project was presented to the Development and Planning Commission, which is a public forum, for guidance and advice.

200 The area in the North Mole has been identified to build the shooting range. The building will include stores, car parking spaces and offices which are much needed in the area.

Q98/2018

**Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority –
Grade 9 administrative vacancy**

Clerk: Question 98/2018, the Hon. E J Reyes.

205 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Further to the answer provided to Question 8/2018, can the Minister for Sport update this House in respect of the Grade 9 that was an Administrative Assistant post, which was vacant within the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

210 **Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the GSLA, the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority, has currently advertised this post internally within the public sector.

Q99/2018

**Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority –
Staff vacancies to be filled**

Clerk: Question 99/2018, the Hon. E J Reyes.

215 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Sport inform this House of any staff vacancies or posts which are currently waiting to be filled on a substantive basis within the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

220 **Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, there are currently five vacancies of Pool Operative/Lifeguard. Closing date was yesterday Tuesday, 13th February.

225 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, may I ask the Minister to confirm that we can deduce from that that there is no other post that has been covered in an acting basis by someone of a lower grade acting for a higher grade? Is that a correct assumption?

Hon. S E Linares: Yes, sir.

Q100/2018

**Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority –
Cancellations since 1st January 2018**

230 **Clerk:** Question 100/2018, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Sport inform this House how many cancellations have been necessary at any of the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority's facilities since 1st January 2018, indicating the location, date and reason for the cancellation.

235 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, allocations at the Victoria Sports Hall were cancelled due to water ingress on the following dates: 9th January 2018, 14th January, 28th January and 4th February 2018.

240

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, last time I asked this question I had to clarify, and the Minister kindly sought out the information. What I really mean when I put down Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority's facilities, last time I said it was my intention to include the swimming facilities – what is sometimes commonly known as the GASA facilities – but perhaps I can quantify this one further.

245

I know that perhaps technically a facility may fall under a school grounds, for example, St Anne's School, but yet after school hours it is commonly known and recognised that it becomes a Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority facility. I do not know whether the Minister has that information at hand or he may need to find it.

250

Hon. S E Linares: No, Mr Speaker, because if the hon. Member would have asked that, I think it would have been the Hon. Minister for Education who would have answered that although the GSLA, as he well knows, is in charge of the allocations of the school, it is not in charge of the maintenance or the upkeep of the facility.

255

Therefore, if the question is the Gibraltar Leisure Authority's *facilities*, technically the schools are not the GSLA's facilities they are the Department of Education's facilities. But if the hon. Member wants to know about that he can well put the question, but it is not the GSLA's facilities, these are school facilities belonging to the Department of Education and therefore it is the Department of Education that deals with all the maintenance or issues like water ingress for example, if there is any in any of the school halls, and not the GSLA.

260

So, when he posed the question it was the GSLA's facilities and this is the only one where there has been water ingress.

Q101/2018
Sports-related grants –
Payment details

Clerk: Question 101/2018, the Hon. E J Reyes.

265

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Sport provide updated details of all payments made during this current financial year in respect of any sports related grants?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

270

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, I now hand over to the hon. Member opposite, a schedule in respect of all payments made during this current financial year in respect of any sports-related grants.

Answer to Question 101/2018

Gibraltar Darts Trophy	132,499.20
World Pool & Snooker Championships	168,176.00
Commonwealth Games Reception	2,592.00
Gibraltar Kennel Club	10,012.50
Gibraltar Classic Vehicle Association	1,200.00
Gold Coast Expenses	5,965.00
U 23 Qualifiers International Darts Competition	110.00
World Pool Masters	160,000.00
Gibraltar International Backgammon Tournament	70,500.00
Hockey Challenge Cup	850.00
Extra cleaning services contracted for the Gibraltar Song Festival	192.00
International Bike Rally	241.64
Harley Davidson Club	4,500.00
Maccabi Gibraltar	4,000.00
Extra cleaning services contracted for Boxing event	38.40
Eurafrica Trail Event	2,3339.39
Gibraltar International Junior Chess Championships	40,000.00
King's Bowl Bowling Tournament	16,000.00
Extra cleaning services contracted for Philharmonic event	250.00
Gibraltar Squash Open	6,000.00
Gibraltar Chess Trophy Sponsorship	200,000.00
Commonwealth Queen's Baton Relay Reception	1,200.00

Grants awarded to Sporting Associations, 2017/2018

Netball Association	13,340.51
Target Shooting	5,745.93
Shooting Association	11,933.61
Darts Association	15,812.50
Hockey Association	15,587.41
Ten Pin Bowling Association	2,631.06
Athletics Association	6,302.11
Basketball Association	46,644.10
Triathlon Association	3,025.00
Rowing Association	2,381.56
Swimming Association	4,380.34
Pool Association	5235.00
Backgammon Association	3038.36
Sea Angling	5,518.54

Sports Grants awarded for International Competitions, 2017/18

Island Games 178,257.67

Grants awarded for Sports Development Projects, 2017/2018

280

Cricket Association	1,394.13
Cycling Association	311.00
Shooting Federation	3,349.04
Badminton Association	3,242.14
Rowing Association	4,750.75
Hockey Association	3,684.00
Athletics Association	4177.25
Basketball Association	814.04
Karate Association	961.00
Taekwondo Association	311.99
Ice Skating Association	397.23

Q102/2018
Cultural grants –
Payment details

Clerk: Question 102/2018, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Can the Minister for Culture provide updated details of all cultural grants awarded during this current financial year?

285

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, since my answer to Question W196/2017, one further cultural grant of £3,000 has been awarded to the Gibraltar IDF Dance Association in their participation at the IDF World and European Championships 2017 and 2018.

290

I take this opportunity to remind the hon. Member that updated information is regularly posted on the HMGoG website.

Q103-106/2018
Gibraltar Football Association –
Victoria Stadium: agreements, payments, compensation, instalments, delays

Clerk: Question 103, the Hon. E J Reyes.

295

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Sport update this House with details of agreements entered into and payments made to date by the Gibraltar Football Association in respect of all facilities which they lease at Victoria Stadium?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

300

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 104 to 106.

Clerk: Question 104, the Hon. R M Clinton.

305

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, can the Government advise if it has agreed to pay any compensation to operators of catering establishments in the Victoria Stadium Complex, as a result of the anticipated sale to the Gibraltar Football Association and if so, to whom and in what amount?

310

Clerk: Question 105, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm that the two £5 million instalments payable by the GFA in this current financial year, are still expected to be paid before 31st March 2018?

315

Clerk: Question 106, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm the lengthy negotiations since the announcement was made in April 2017 in finalising the sale of the lease for the Victoria Stadium to the GFA will not result in the taxpayer being worse off?

320

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares): Mr Speaker, HM Government announced on 18th April 2017 that it had reached an agreement with the GFA on the sale of the Victoria Stadium.

325

The announcement stated the GFA would pay £16.5 million for the purchase of the land in three instalments with funds exclusively provided by UEFA and FIFA. Two instalments of £5 million each will be paid in the current financial year 2017/2018, with a third payment of £6.5 million paid in the 2018/2019. That is exactly what is going to happen.

330

At present HMGoG is working closely with the GFA in relation to the terms and conditions of the sale. There have not been lengthy negotiations, as stated in the question from the hon. Member. What there has been is careful co-ordination between the Government and the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority and the GFA as to how to manage the transition period.

335

As hon. Members know, the Sports Hall is part of the sale. Therefore, all sporting associations who regularly use these facilities including the track and field are to continue to use them and will do so for a period of time, while all the other *wonderful* facilities are being constructed.

There is only one operator having a catering establishment in the Victoria Stadium and we are still negotiating terms and conditions with the directors.

340

The taxpayer will certainly not be worse off but much better off. Better off with football acquiring a new Cat 4 National Football Stadium; two alternative pitches for domestic games at all levels; sufficient training facilities and pitches to meet all demand within Gibraltar and at least two indoor futsal pitches.

345

Gibraltar clubs will be better off since they no longer need to train in Spain, they will be able to base all their training needs in Gibraltar. Rugby and cricket will be better off and be able to enjoy their own state-of-the-art facilities at Europa Point. Indoor sports and cultural entities will be better off since they will be able to enjoy new and more modern multi-purpose hall at Europa Point, in addition to the continued use of the Tercentenary Hall and the rest of the Bayside area.

350 HM Government will also have funds available to invest in hockey and other sports like paddle tennis as has been seen with the new refurbished courts at Bayside. All this will assist basketball, netball, volleyball, badminton and squash, amongst others.

Darts will be better off since they finally will have the area they desperately need and deserve, which they have been seeking since 1958, given their international achievements.
355 Athletics will be better off when they obtain an enhanced 400 m track at Lathbury Parade. Swimming will be better off with a new, much needed, 54 m indoor pool.

Premises for associations and clubs, offices, lecture theatres, treatment rooms and boardrooms are all being included in all these facilities being developed.

A specific new facility has already started for our Special Olympians who have done us proud
360 so many times. And all facilities will be made available to our schools.

The taxpayer is already benefitting through a huge economic activity and investment on the infrastructure without costing a penny to the taxpayer.

The benefit will be seen when we see 2,500 athletes coming to our shores for the Island Games in 2019; 2,500 athletes will be filling all our hotels. Friends and family who will be
365 accompanying the athletes and who will drink and eat in our bars and restaurants during the nine days they will be here. Therefore, all businesses will be better off.

After the Island Games, all our facilities will be the legacy of the Games with these new facilities capable of bringing to Gibraltar many more people in the form of events such as athletics meets, Rugby 7s and 15s tournaments, international swimming competitions and more
370 netball tournaments, the Association is keen to host amongst others.

The fact that international football will be played here is yet another benefit to our taxpayers and our economy generally. All in all, a win-win situation not only for the taxpayer but for our children, our young people and even our elderly.

I would at this point like to give my sincere thanks to all. To all sports associations who are
375 being very co-operative in working with us together, so that all the facilities will comply with all international requirements and also for being patient and helpful during this two-year transitional period in which there are disruptions due to all the construction going on.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, in my own question which was number 103, the Minister has
380 reminded us of the agreements entered into with the Gibraltar Football Association and even the target payment dates and so on.

But my question does say the payments *made to date* by the Association and I have not heard the Minister confirm the figure of what payments have been made to date.

Hon. S E Linares: Mr Speaker, as I said in my lengthy answer, there has not been any figures
385 yet because of the leases. We are looking at leases, we are looking at contracts, we are looking at agreements as my answer stated.

So, whether the hon. Member says has any monies passed, the answer is no; but we are guaranteed and part of the agreement was that it will be paid before the end of this financial
390 year – the amounts that were two instalments.

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Minister for his answer. If he could perhaps come back to my specific question in respect of the catering, the one catering
395 establishment in the stadium complex: can the Minister advise whether this catering establishment has a licence agreement from the Government or a lease, and has the occupier or the operator of this catering establishment indicated the Government any sums of money they would be seeking in terms of compensation at this stage?

Furthermore, I would remind the Minister and I am grateful for his clarification that he
400 expects the £10 million by the end of the financial year, but by my calculation he has 45 days to get it in.

405 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, as in the occupier of the one operator having a catering establishment in the Victoria Stadium, he has a lease and we are negotiating with him because part of the lease is where the GFA will be, so there are negotiations with it; but at the moment we are still negotiating with the directors as to how we work that one out.

Hon. E J Phillips: A question, Mr Speaker, so you are negotiating with this individual relating to the level of compensation? Is that part of it?

410 **Hon. S E Linares:** Not necessarily, Mr Speaker.

Hon. E J Phillips: Either you are or you are not. I am not too sure of the answer to that question – ‘not necessarily’ is not really an answer, with respect.

415 **Hon. S E Linares:** Well, Mr Speaker, when it is negotiations it can be either one or the other. We are in negotiations, that was the crux of the answer. If you are in negotiations, you do not give away whether it is one or the other; we are still negotiating.

420 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

Hon. R M Clinton: Sorry, Mr Speaker I will be brief, my colleague may want a question as well.

425 Just coming back to finalise on the lease: are the negotiations for the complete surrender of the lease or partial surrender of the lease?

Hon. S E Linares: Well, Mr Speaker, as I said these are negotiating issues.

430 **Mr Speaker:** The answer that the Minister gave in his first answer was: ‘there is only one operator having a catering establishment in the stadium, we are still negotiating terms and conditions with the directors’. That is in the main body of his answer. *(Interjection)*
Next question.

Q107/2018
University of Gibraltar Halls –
Expected cost and name of contractor

Clerk: Question 107/2018, the Hon. L F Llamas.

435 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government state the expected cost for the building of the University of Gibraltar halls and the name of the contractor?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

440 **Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the exact cost of the project to develop accommodation in the area of the University of Gibraltar has not yet been determined. We are still in negotiations with the contractor in relation to certain items.
The name of the contractor is Casais.

445 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, I can understand that perhaps there will be small items of construction in terms of materials, etc. used which may affect the final monies paid for this project. But certainly the Government will have entered a contract with a contractor to provide

this facility and therefore, there must be a ballpark figure towards this project already allocated, and a vehicle through which it will be financed.

450

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, we repeatedly have to deal with these issues in the House. I mean it is almost as if hon. Members want us to get the worst possible deal for the taxpayer.

455

Now, if hon. Members are being told that we have not been able to finalise a figure, it is because we are trying to get a better deal for the taxpayer than the one that has already been presented to us. But some works can be done whilst other aspects of the contract are finalised. That is where we are.

460

We had lengthy exchanges in this respect in particular in relation to the magnificent car-parking facility now provided in the centre of town, where we said repeatedly we would provide the information once we finalised the amounts to be paid, but we were pushing to ensure that we got the best deal for the taxpayer.

465

Now, when you enter into an agreement with the contractor, the contractor is still negotiating with sub-contractors, and if a price is given in which the contracting party – the Government – has agreed with the contractor, then the sub-contractor is able to work out how much he can squeeze the contractor for.

Those are the issues, Mr Speaker. As soon as everything has been dealt with and finalised we will be in a position to give a final figure and do so when it is not in the interest of the taxpayer to continue a negotiation to squeeze the best possible price.

470

That is what we insist on doing, I would have thought we would have enjoyed the hon. Members' opposite support for that.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government explain what procurement procedure has taken place in the development of this project?

475

Hon. Chief Minister: Yes, Mr Speaker, we have sought quotes from a number of entities.

Hon. L F Llamas: And can the Government confirm whether this was the cheapest quote?

480

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, I believe this was the cheapest quote for the work that the Government required.

Hon. L F Llamas: And finally, Mr Speaker, has the Government undertaken an assessment as to how these halls will be populated once the project is completed?

485

Hon. Chief Minister: Of course, Mr Speaker.

Hon. L F Llamas: And is the Government able to disclose that assessment?

490

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, why would we disclose that assessment at this stage if we are not yet at the stage where the facility is finalised? What is it that the hon. Gentleman wants to know? Perhaps if he asks us specifically about that, we may be able to share some information with him, but he almost wants us to come up with the marketing brochure that we might use at the end, now.

495

I mean it does not make any sense, Mr Speaker, this is an attempt to waste everybody's time.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, sir may I?

500 **Mr Speaker:** Yes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Is this an opportune moment, if there are no further supplementaries to this question I would like to go back to Question 101 when you deem it.

505 **Mr Speaker:** The one where the –

Hon. E J Reyes: The one where they had the schedule, but I think we need to finish the supplementary on this one first.

510 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Thank you, Mr Speaker, thank you.

I am grateful to the Chief Minister for expanding on the answer. I just have one question for him, if he can advise the House the cost of building these units which I understand will be Halls of Residence for the University of Gibraltar, are these to be borne by the Government entirely i.e. through the Improvement and Development Fund, or is there some other mechanism? And am I correct in my understanding then that it is the intention of the Government to gift this building to the University of Gibraltar?

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, there are a number of questions there, not just one. The Government is looking at various options to finance this build.

520

Mr Speaker: The Hon. Edwin Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes: Thank you, Mr Speaker, sir.

In the schedule provided as an answer to Question 101 I have tried to have a quick look to a previous answer I had via Written Question 195/2017. I notice first, Mr Speaker, the headings seem to have changed which makes it rather difficult to track but I thought – and I would like the Minister to confirm – he said this is an updated list of what has been paid in this year.

530 And if one looks at the 2017 answer for example, there was a £709 expenditure towards pistol shooting which in February 2018 does not appear in my schedule, it seems to have disappeared. Therefore, I am giving the Minister the benefit of the doubt, it cannot have been updated if it is missing data that was there before. Either the figure increases or it remains the same, but it seems to have disappeared.

535 And whereas in the previous schedule of last time, the Minister very kindly and very helpfully put down grants awarded for hosting special sports and leisure events, for example he had the backgammon tournament of which I know there has been a lot happening in that respect recently, I cannot find the backgammon tournament in the update of February 2018.

540 Maybe because that heading is missing as the heading of support granted to sporting societies, probably means the same as grants awarded to sports associations. But I need the Minister to confirm that where one reads societies it means the same as associations and there is no heading at the top of these - the answer to schedule Question 101 – whereas there was in the previous one.

If the Minister does have that information now, Mr Speaker, in the spirit of wanting just that information I do not mind delaying it and the Minister can come back at a convenient stage when you allow such a thing to be tabled properly and double checked.

545

Hon. S E Linares: Well, Mr Speaker, first and foremost the backgammon is on the list, it is Gibraltar International Backgammon Tournament £70,500. It is nine down the line of the schedule. Gibraltar International Backgammon Tournament, that is the first one.

550 The second one that the hon. Member is saying about, the target shooting, remember this is the current one so therefore if the target shooting had £700-odd when you asked the question

before, it means that now they probably have applied for more money and it is updated from £700 to Target Shooting £5,745.

555 But given that the hon. Member is not happy with certain things, I have no problem in going through it with the hon. Member, like we have done before, and go through and see which are the ones ... because from the two he has mentioned they are there, and I have an explanation and I have just said it. But if he wants, I mean it is up to him how he wants to tackle this.

560 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Well, Mr Speaker, I did not use the words target shooting, I used the specific title here which is pistol shooting, because target shooting is what appears in the 2018 answer and I have been looking for what was given in the 2017 answer which was pistol. In 2017 it was given under the heading Grants Awarded for Sports Development Projects, and under Grants Awarded for Sports Development Projects neither pistol nor target – sorry, it just says Shooting Federation which is... and my interpretation is that it encompasses the triple pistol, clay and so on.

565 So at first glance it is extremely difficult to decipher this. But I think the Minister has extended an invitation for us to meet behind the Chair. We can do so and then if one has to modify anything in *Hansard* –

570 **Mr Speaker:** I prefer that since my understanding is that pistols would be firing at a target. In any case you might as well settle it behind my Chair.

575 **Hon. S E Linares:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I am happy to do so because yes there is. I can see where the hon. Member could be well confused where it says Target Shooting in one place and then there is another one that says Shooting Federation in another. And anyway, there are three different associations and clubs of shooting, so we will shoot each other behind the Chair.

Mr Speaker: Well, let us get on with Question Time.

INFRASTRUCTURE AND PLANNING

Q108/2018

Black cabs –

Purchase agreement

580 **Clerk:** Question 108, the Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, further to Question 231/2017, are the black cabs now available for purchase in left-hand drive and has Government finalised its agreement with the Gibraltar Taxi Association regarding their purchase?

585 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Infrastructure and Planning.

590 **Minister for Infrastructure and Planning (Hon. P J Balban):** Mr Speaker, no left-hand drive variants are available yet of the new black cabs, the TX Model and no agreements have been finalised with the Gibraltar Taxi Association.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, does the Minister have an update on when the left-hand drives might be becoming available?

595 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, the left-hand drives are starting to become available now, as we speak. In fact, there is an order which has been placed and the first 25 units are currently in production for a company, for a client in Holland. This is the first 25 units at the moment and there is actually no availability for anyone else because obviously they manufacture right-hand drive vehicles and they have just started to move into left-hand drive territory.

600 **Hon. T N Hammond:** I thank the Minister for that update and I presume therefore that we are a lot further than we were when I last asked this question in terms of being able to procure the vehicles.

Therefore, in that light has the Minister engaged or has Government engaged with the Taxi Association reference the purchase at all yet?

605 **Hon. P J Balban:** Mr Speaker, the first thing that we have to do is to ensure that when these cars become available, they are suitable for Gibraltar's roads and until the thorough checks are carried out then we are not in a position to actually finalise or progress down the route of negotiation with the GTA.

610 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

Q109/2018
Parking schemes –
Parking permits per household

Clerk: Question 109, the Hon. L F Llamas.

615 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, without disclosing the household itself, can the Government provide a schedule on the number of parking permits issued per household since the recent launch of the parking schemes and the residential building or road that the household belongs to?

620 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Infrastructure and Planning.

Minister for Infrastructure and Planning (Hon. P J Balban): Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is set out in the schedule that I now hand over.

Schedule to Q109 of 2018

Housing Block	1 Permit	2 Permits	3 Permits
Alameda House	44	4	
Governors Meadow House	38	11	1
Kingsway House	54	10	
Picton House	38	10	
Queens Hotel	12		
Red Sands House	32	8	2
Sandpits Road	9	1	
Ross House	38	4	
Sandpits House	8	2	1

Trafalgar House	38	5	
Victoria House	31	7	

625 **Mr Speaker:** Given that the hon. questioner wishes to come back if necessary, Question 110.

COMMERCE

Q110/2018

**Gibraltar Financial Services Commission –
Statutory Review**

Clerk: Question 110, the Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. D A Feetham.

630 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, when will the Statutory Review of the Gibraltar Financial Services Commission carried out in 2016, be published?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Commerce.

635 **Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola):** Mr Speaker, it is Government's intention to publish the Statutory Review shortly.

That does not mean that I am accepting in any way that it is a 2016 Statutory Review, because obviously that is not when it was completed.

640 **Hon. T N Hammond:** I appreciate this may not directly arise from the question, but can the Minister advise how much the exercise has cost to date?

Hon. A J Isola: Mr Speaker, no, I cannot, but what I can tell him is that I recall it was well within the budget that the FSC had provided for in its accounts.

645 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, I know we have been around this particular buoy before: when the Minister says shortly, are we talking days, weeks, months, years? (*Interjection*)

650 **Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Speaker, shortly. It is due very shortly – I mean, shortly. (*Interjection and laughter*)

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q111/2018

**Gibraltar International Bank –
Banking facilities for cryptocurrencies**

Clerk: Question 111, the Hon. T N Hammond on behalf of the Hon. D A Feetham.

655 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, has the Gibraltar International Bank obtained alternative clearing facilities to enable it to offer banking facilities to cryptocurrency-related service providers?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Commerce.

660

Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola): Mr Speaker, this work is commercially confidential.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q112/2018

**Data-cable security vulnerability –
Safety of Gibraltar’s networks**

665

Clerk: Question 112, the Hon. L F Llamas.

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, following recent reports in the UK media relating to data-cable security vulnerability, is the Government confident that Gibraltar’s networks are safe from sabotage and attacks?

670

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Commerce.

Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola): Mr Speaker, Government’s Data/Voice communications infrastructure at the data centre and official buildings have appropriate physical security measures in place. These range from security personnel on-site, CCTV and access control systems.

675

Mr Speaker: Next question.

ENVIRONMENT, ENERGY, CLIMATE CHANGE AND EDUCATION

Q113/2018

**Wastewater treatment plant –
Question deferred**

680

Clerk: Question 113, the Hon. R M Clinton.

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm that the entire £22 million cost of the announced wastewater treatment plant will be borne by the Improvement –
(*Interjections*)

685

Mr Speaker: In the absence of the Minister, is any other Minister answering this question, otherwise we can defer it? (*Interjection*)

I think we will defer it, shall we? (*Interjections*) We move on to Question 139.

HEALTH, CARE AND JUSTICE

Q139/2018

**Illegal use of fireworks –
Government intended action**

690 **Clerk:** Question 139, the Hon. E J Phillips on behalf of the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, what does the Government intend to do about the illegal use of fireworks in Gibraltar?

695 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the Government supports the celebration of the festive season, which on New Year's Eve has traditionally meant the discharging of fireworks. Government nevertheless believes that this should be done in a safe, legal and responsible manner and has, for some years supported the awareness campaigns conducted by the GFRS and the Royal Gibraltar Police.

700 As in previous years Customs, the Royal Gibraltar Police and the Gibraltar Fire and Rescue Service jointly engaged in their annual awareness campaign. These highlight that fireworks are prohibited imports, except under licence granted by the Collector of Customs, warning about the possible criminal offences concerning the use and possession of fireworks in certain circumstances, and setting out the Firework Code for the safe handling and use of fireworks. The campaign is promoted through social and traditional media outlets.

705 As part of this campaign, GFRS fire prevention officers distributed firework safety awareness flyers and placed posters at prominent locations. As an innovation and in a bid to curtail the indiscriminate discharge of fireworks in the run up to the New Year's Eve celebrations Government introduced a sales embargo window for legally imported fireworks that restricted their sale between 27th and 31st December.

710 This largely reduced the previously prevalent practice of discharging fireworks during the month of December and was hailed as a success by the Royal Gibraltar Police and the GFRS. Her Majesty's Customs also continue with their enforcement activity at the land frontier supported by RGP Dog Section officers with the explosives detection capability dogs. This served as a valuable and powerful deterrent in respect of the illegal importation of fireworks.

715 Government remains committed to the safe, legal and responsible use of fireworks during the festive season and will continue to promote similar campaigns in the future.

720

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, just one further question in relation – I thank the Minister for Justice for that answer. Does the Minister have any information relating to the numbers of dangerous fireworks confiscated by Customs during that particular period?

725 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, I do not have the answer to that specific question but I will be happy to seek it from Customs. What I do have is supplementary information to say that no one had been arrested for the discharge of fireworks.

730 **Hon. E J Phillips:** The one thing that we could do during that particular period would be to have a sort of amnesty bin where people are permitted to dump any fireworks that they have purchased, at Customs when they come in, with relevant warnings erected at Customs during this particular season. It may be an idea that the Government may wish to consider.

735 **Hon. N F Costa:** Well, Mr Speaker, I know as I said in the answer that the RGP and Customs do deploy dogs during the particular season, they are very much aware of the attempt to import

any unlawful fireworks, but as I also said in the answer, any fireworks can be imported legally under the licence of the Director of Customs. But in respect of the particular question that he asks me, I do not have the information with me, but I will be happy to ask for it.

740 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

Q140/2018
Criminal justice system reforms –
Electronic tagging

745 **Clerk:** Question 140, the Hon. E J Phillips on behalf of the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government confirm whether they are considering introducing electronic tagging of individuals as part of its reforms of the criminal justice system?

750 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, no.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q141/2018
Sexual harassment in the workplace –
Promotion of legislation

755 **Clerk:** Question 141 the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state whether or not it intends to promote legislation before the House to strengthen measures in relation to sexual harassment in the workplace?

760 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the Crimes Act 2011 provides for offences which would capture the eventuality of sexual harassment type behaviour in any location, including the work place. These offences can be found under section 215 if the harassment includes physical contact.

In cases where the harassment involves verbal abuse or visual representations, as well as following or monitoring of an individual, offences exist under sections 88, 89 and 92 of the Act.

770 These offences are all captured under Schedules 3 and 4 of the Crimes Act, which, in turn, means that any conviction which carries a sexual element could trigger notification requirements, by virtue of sentencing thresholds or the application of Sexual Offences Prevention Orders on the offender.

775 The Act ensures the protection of victims of sexual assaults and sexual harassment type of behaviours, by ensuring legislation exists which criminalises this behaviour and allows for the monitoring of those convicted offenders through the Multi Agency Public Protection Arrangements process.

Sexual harassment in the workplace is firmly prohibited by section 14 of the Equal Opportunities Act 2006. The Equal Opportunities Act defines sexual harassment as 'any form of

780 verbal, non-verbal or physical conduct of a sexual nature or that is related to gender
reassignment or sex that has the purpose or effect of violating an individual's dignity; or creating
an intimidating, hostile, degrading, humiliating or offensive environment for that individual'. This
definition reflects international standards including an EU definition that we are obliged to
conform to.

785 A complaint for sexual harassment may be made to the Employment Tribunal. The Equal
Opportunities Act 2006 includes a separate harassment claim in cases where an individual is
treated less favourably because of that individual's rejection of or submission to the conduct.

790 Additionally, an individual subjected to less favourable treatment because they have made or
intend to make a complaint under the Equal Opportunities Act has a right to claim for unlawful
victimisation.

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Minister for explaining to me the statutory
provisions in relation to criminal offences and indeed those that relate to equal opportunities
and the ability of complainants to seek recourse through the Employment Tribunal in relation to
complaints of sexual harassment in the work place; I am familiar with those.

795 My question really was to see whether there was any indication from the Government
whether any of those laws would be strengthened. What I mean by that is in recent years, the
United Kingdom Government have been debating whether or not additional protection should
be afforded to those who have suffered sexual harassment in the workplace by ensuring that
those companies and those employers in that situation who have compromise claims, as it were,
800 before the Industrial Tribunal or the Employment Tribunal, will not be allowed to hide away
from those compromise agreements and that it would be recorded within an organisation such
as the Employment Tribunal, the fact that a complaint had been registered against that
employer.

805 So effectively, what I am asking the Government is whether Government intends to promote
legislation to further protect individuals who have a complaint against sexual harassment against
an employer for instance in the workplace, and whether or not it would consider whether those
compromise agreements that had been entered into by the employer and the employee should
not be obviously disclosed to the general public, but the fact that it be recorded that sexual
harassment has been compromised in those circumstances with that particular type of
810 employer.

And what I put to him that of course, it is important that those who seek employment with
our employers in Gibraltar understand that there have been complaints made against them in
the past. That is what I am getting at. Of course there is debate in many countries relating to this
particular point of compromising claims, but I would ask the Government to clarify whether it
815 intends to bring legislation to promote that.

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, it is not an area or a subject that I have discussed with any of my
teams. It is not a matter that has been referred to me either by employers or the Royal Gibraltar
Police. However, given that he raised it in this House I will refer the matter to the Royal Gibraltar
820 Police and we will discuss it.

But it seems in any case as though the subject relates more to employment law, rather than
any amendment to the criminal law, in which case I will allow my hon. colleague to –
(Interjection)

825 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Just to clarify the point yes, I was aiming particularly, given the fact that my
question related to the workplace and strengthening measures in relation to sexual harassment,
clearly as Minister for Justice, Mr Speaker, the Minister is answering the question from the
context of the criminal law and indeed on equal opportunities. But the question is directed
specifically to the employment situation, that is correct.

830

Minister for Tourism, Employment, Commercial Aviation and the Port (Hon. G H Licudi): Mr Speaker, as the Hon. the Minister for Justice has indicated, this is not a matter that the Government has given consideration to, it is a matter that we may well now need to consider.

835 As I understand the hon. Member's point, it is that where there is a compromise arrangement, that there should be some form of register, some form of record which is publicly available to anybody that might possibly be seeking employment with that employer in the future. It is something that we will clearly need to consider, discuss and debate.

840 But two immediate issues come to mind of concern in relation to such a scheme. Firstly, the fact that there is going to be, or that there would be legislation requiring these compromise agreements at least to form part of a register, even not the detail of the compromise agreement. That may actually lead to a great deal of reluctance by employers to enter into a compromise agreement in relation to sexual harassment if there is going to be a record that the employer has, in some way, acknowledged sexual harassment by entering into this compromise agreement. So that might add to the detriment of the employee by making employers reluctant

845 to enter into such a compromise agreement.

And the second issue is in relation to the register which could be a public record. I really do not see how this could actually work in practice. If there is a compromise agreement, a compromise agreement could be made in relation to a complaint, an allegation which may not necessarily be proven, which may not necessarily be subject to any particular finding, simply an

850 internal issue between the employer and the employee which they decide to compromise in a particular way.

And as the hon. Member will know, having I am sure done many compromise agreements in the employment scenario in different aspects, that does not necessarily lead to any acknowledgement or acceptance of the facts. Therefore, a register where the employer could be

855 seen to be acknowledging something simply on the basis of an allegation, that would be something which could perhaps lead to conclusions which may not necessarily be 100% correct, simply on the basis of tarnishing or judging entities simply on the basis of allegations which may have been made and which, because of the compromise agreement, have not gone to an industrial tribunal or any kind of formal setting or any kind of judicial setting without there being

860 a particular finding.

So those are two areas of concern. I am not saying that this is not something we are going to consider, but having heard the hon. Member for the first time on this issue now, these are two red lights that spring to mind and could cause some concern, certainly on our part.

865 **Hon. E J Phillips:** I am grateful for the answer by the Minister and this is a hotly discussed topic in the United Kingdom at the moment for obvious reasons. But I would certainly argue that having legislation or provisions like this that would strengthen the rules against sexual harassment in the workplace, would effectively prevent it from happening in the first place.

870 There is one argument to suggest that strengthening our measures would prevent employers from abusing their positions and prevent this from happening in the first place.

But look, it is a difficult subject I agree, but I take it that the Government is not as a result of that, intending to look at this in any detail at this stage.

875 **Mr Speaker:** Any other supplementaries?

Hon. Ms M D Hasson Nahon: Mr Speaker.

880 **Hon. G H Licudi:** Mr Speaker, I will answer that particular point. The Government has not closed its mind to the possibility of considering this, but there is a matter of public interest and public concern which we would have to look into.

Mr Speaker: The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, in the wake of the issues arising out of sexual harassment in Westminster, would the Government be looking at implementing a code of conduct for Parliament and parliamentarians on sexual harassment?
885

Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola): Mr Speaker, it is not something that is under consideration at this moment in time.

Mr Speaker: Sorry, what was that?
890

Hon. A J Isola: It is not something that is under consideration at this moment in time.

Mr Speaker: It isn't?
895

Hon. A J Isola: It is not, not that we are aware.

Mr Speaker: Perhaps it ought to be.

Hon. A J Isola: Perhaps it may, Mr Speaker.
900

Mr Speaker: Because there was a report, a Commission that I myself chaired which was debated here and it was a subject that is supposed to be dealt with by a Select Committee of this House and that Select Committee is not able to meet for the simple reason that most of its Members, notably on the Government side, the Chief Minister and the Deputy Chief Minister are otherwise occupied.
905

But I would put it to hon. Members that it is about time that perhaps a lower powered Select Committee were to be formed, involving other Ministers and other Members of the Opposition that could deal with these matters.

Mr Speaker: The question of a Parliamentary Code of Conduct is well overdue in my view. Otherwise, I think that the work that Commission did has been wasted. The years go by and it has not been done. I know that the Chief Minister is committed to it but he is physically, and his Deputy, unable to deal with the matter.
910

Therefore, I would put it to the Ministers who are here now, that it is up to them, two or three of them, to take on this burden. The Minister for Labour, the Minister for Justice, they could take over the work of the Select Committee and get on with the work. There is a need, I think, for a Parliamentary Code of Conduct.
915

Hon. A J Isola: Mr Speaker, thank you for that. We will certainly ensure that it is discussed at Cabinet at our next meeting on Monday morning.
920

Mr Speaker: I commend that precisely.

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, just in relation to... for our part, we stand ready to participate in that.
925

Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon: Mr Speaker, by when could we expect some kind of briefing or answer on these Cabinet discussions?

Hon. A J Isola: Mr Speaker, it is not customary for us to give briefings on Cabinet discussions, but when a conclusion is arrived at, I am sure that it will be communicated appropriately.
930

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): If I can be of assistance, Mr Speaker.

935 **Mr Speaker:** Well, we are left pending the Hon. Dr Cortes.

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, if I can be of assistance on this point as Leader of the House in respect of the issue of the Parliamentary Code of Conduct: there is a Code of Conduct prepared by the Government, it sits behind hon. Gentlemen, we have it here, it is available
940 online, the Government is entirely committed to it, Mr Speaker.

The only reason we have not progressed that is because the GSD asked us to take it to a Select Committee, Mr Speaker, and that is the reason why the Select Committee was created.

It is true I have heard you from inside that the Government has unfortunately been dealing with other matters which have made it impossible for us to progress the Select Committee – and
945 indeed, the fragmentation of the Opposition has made it impossible to progress with the Select Committees as constituted and therefore it will be necessary to ensure fairness, particularly in the context of a Code of Conduct for Members of the House, not just for Ministers, to amend the composition of the Select Committee to include both the independent hon. Members.

That is an issue that the Hon. the Deputy Chief Minister has already dealt with today in the
950 context of the composition of the Committee on Brexit and we intend to deal with in the context of the Committee on the Codes of Conduct and I am quite happy to commit to the House that we shall try and do that before the House breaks for Easter, Mr Speaker, so that we are able to finalise these matters that quickly.

This is something that I have wanted to see happen from the moment that I was elected to
955 this House and indeed, I was committed to see happen from the moment that I became Chief Minister. The entreaty from the GSD was that we should not progress with the Code without them having the opportunity to deal with it in the Select Committee. I think we are there, I do not think there is anything more to debate in this context, but I want to give hon. Members, in particular the Independent Members, the opportunity to contribute.

960 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, just on the point that the Chief Minister makes in relation to this, we have said categorically that we stand ready to participate in this process quite clearly, but it is certainly wrong to suggest that ... He describes it as a fragmented Opposition, but it is quite clear we stand ready to participate in this process.

965 The world did not stop the day that the United Kingdom decided to leave the EU –

Mr Speaker: It very nearly did –

Hon. E J Phillips: But it did not, Mr Speaker, but it does not mean that –

970

Mr Speaker: It very nearly did –

Hon. E J Phillips: But it does not mean that the rest of Gibraltar needs to stop functioning. We need to carry on, Mr Speaker, doing our daily business and accept the –

975

Mr Speaker: Twenty-four hours in a day.

Hon. Chief Minister: Yes, Mr Speaker, the world did not stop the day that Brexit happened. In fact the Government has demonstrated that we are continuing with a whole raft of local
980 legislation, with a whole raft of initiatives. (*Interjection*) We are doing so many that the hon. Gentlemen say that we are rushing it.

But, Mr Speaker, that Select Committee did have to stop the minute that the GSD started to fall apart and the first time it lost a Member, we had to include her in that Committee; the second time it has lost a Member up to now, we are going to have to include him in that
985 Committee and if they lose any others, Mr Speaker, we are committed to Independent Members

having a say, in particular on a code that regulates Members. So although Brexit did not stop the Select Committee, Mr Speaker, the breakup of the GSD did interfere with it.

Mr Speaker: Next question, 113. (*Interjections*)

990 I assumed that automatically Mr Cortes would want to carry on, but if between them they prefer that the Hon. Neil Costa should carry on, I am quite happy to do so.

Very well, okay so call the next question.

995

Q142/2018
Access to CCTV footage –
Protocols

Clerk: Question 142, the Hon. E J Phillips.

1000 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, can the Government state what protocols are in place to limit access to CCTV footage?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

1005 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker,
The Royal Gibraltar Police (RGP) controls and operates the Gibraltar Government's Public CCTV Scheme, which includes CCTV cameras located at various points throughout Gibraltar. This CCTV system operates with fixed and Pan, Tilt and Zoom (PTZ) cameras. The Code of Practice governs the evidential integrity and effective management of inter alia the Public CCTV system operated by the RGP. The Public CCTV system has been registered with the Data Protection
1010 Commissioner (DPC) and a copy of the Code of Practice has been made available to the DPC. Access to the Public CCTV system is password protected and auditable. The processing, storage and security of the data is performed in strict compliance with the provisions of the Data Protection Act 2004. A copy of the Code of Practice is also available on the Gibraltar Government Website.

1015 CCTV operators are not authorised to operate any of the cameras or system until they have received suitable training and are familiar with the Code of Practice. Everyone involved in the management and operation of the RGP and CCTV systems will be issued with a copy of the Code of Practice. They will be fully conversant with the contents of the Code and appropriate
1020 procedures, which may be updated from time to time, and with which they are expected to comply. The data controller runs a list of those persons who are authorised to view live images and amends the list accordingly. Viewing of live images from the Public CCTV cameras is restricted to secure areas at New Mole House.

1025 The CCTV system is operated with respect for all individuals and in such a way as to avoid infringement of individual privacy. The RGP recognises that it is its responsibility to ensure that the systems must always comply with all relevant legislation, to ensure its legality and legitimacy. The external Public CCTV systems will only be used insofar as it is necessary for public safety, the prevention and detection of crime or public disorder. The Code of Practice also ensures that evidence is secured, retained and made available as required so that there is absolute respect for everyone's right to a fair trial.

1030 The RGP's Professional Standards Department (PSD) is responsible for the effective management of the systems, ensuring the integrity and probity of the operating system for evidential purposes. The Professional Standards Department conducts audits on the operation of the RGP systems and compliance with this Code of Practice. Audits include examination of the monitoring room records and the content of recorded material.

1035 All cameras are positioned within an area suitably signed to alert the general public of their presence. The CCTV system has a 'privacy mask' feature, which allows for all windows and private areas to be masked out. This privacy mask setting will be applied to black out private areas, which are not intended to be viewed or recorded. The CCTV system will therefore only view and record images of public areas that are within its field of view.

1040 A member of the public wishing to register a complaint with regard to any aspect of the RGP systems may do so in accordance with the Data Protection Act 2004. Any performance issues identified will be considered under the disciplinary procedures to which all police CCTV operators are subject.

1045 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, sorry, just one thing. Can the Minister just confirm then because I seem to recall asking a question along these lines some time ago and it became apparent that the RGP were not the only operators of CCTV systems in Gibraltar and that perhaps the Customs and the Environment Agency and others ... Do the same rules apply or have they all now been brought under the single agency of the RGP?

Hon. N F Costa: Yes, Mr Speaker, I have conferred with the Hon. the Chief Minister and the Hon. the Minister for the Environment and they are stand-alone systems.

1055 **Hon. T N Hammond:** And can the Minister confirm whether the same rules that he has just described as applying to the RGP system apply to those systems also, or are there no rules?

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):
1060 Mr Speaker, if I may assist, there is close liaison between the Department of the Environment and the RGP and we follow their Code of Practice. In fact, the people or person, I think it is one person who actually looks at CCTV footage, is already in contact with the RGP and has received training from the RGP.

1065 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

Q143-148/2018

Care Agency and Elderly Residential Services – Employment details and fixed-term contracts

Clerk: Question 143, the Hon. E J Phillips on behalf of the Hon. D A Feetham.

1070 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, as at 31st December 2017, how many individuals were employed directly by the Care Agency and Elderly Residential Services?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

1075 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 144 to 148.

Clerk: Question 144, the Hon. E J Phillips on behalf of the Hon. D A Feetham.

1080 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Can the Government state how many workers as at 31st December 2017 employed directly by the Care Agency were on fixed-term contracts?

Clerk: Question 145, the Hon. E J Phillips on behalf of the Hon D A Feetham.

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, as at 31st December 2017, in what Department within the GHA were the workers employed by the GHA on fixed-term contracts working in?

1085

Clerk: Question 146, the Hon. E J Phillips on behalf of the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state how many workers as at 31st December 2017 employed directly by the GHA were on fixed-term contracts?

1090

Clerk: Question 147, the Hon. E J Phillips on behalf of the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state how many workers as at 31st December 2017 working within Mount Alvernia were on fixed-term contracts?

1095

Clerk: Question 148, the Hon. E J Phillips on behalf of the Hon. D A Feetham.

Hon. E J Phillips: Of the previous three questions concerning fixed-term contracts within the Care Agency, the GHA and Mount Alvernia, please provide a schedule setting out (a) how many successive fixed term contracts each worker has been engaged on; and (b) the date each were first engaged on the first contract.

1100

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, as at 31st December last year, the Care Agency employed 538 individuals, of which 316 were deployed within the Elderly Residential Services.

1105

The total number of workers as at 31st December of last year employed directly by the Care Agency on fixed-term contracts, was 24.

As at 31st December of last year, workers employed by the GHA on fixed-term contracts were working in the following departments – Ambulance Services; Medical Department; Nursing Department; Physiotherapy Department; and Radiology Department.

1110

As at 31st December of last year, there were 113 workers employed directly by the GHA on fixed-term contracts. It is pertinent to note that out of those 113 workers, 68 are contracts of consultants and doctors who have been on fixed-term contracts, some, for over 20 years.

1115

The Government is confident that all consultants will enter into new and specifically negotiated contracts during the course of this year. To date, 18 consultants have now entered into their new contracts.

As at 31st December of last year, there were two workers employed on fixed-term contracts working within Mount Alvernia.

1120

I now hand over to the hon. Gentleman a schedule setting out (a) how many successive fixed-term contracts each worker has been engaged on; and (b) the date each were engaged on their first contract.

Answer to Question 148 of 2018

GHA

FTC worker	Number of successive fixed-term contracts	Date first engaged
1	31	05/02/1997
2	31	25/02/1997

3	7	02/02/1998
4	23	05/02/2001
5	21	05/02/2003
6	35	27/05/2003
7	18	06/08/2003
8	16	04/02/2004
9	30	01/02/2005
10	8	08/08/2005
11	27	05/09/2005
12	33	01/07/2006
13	34	07/08/2006
14	12	01/09/2006
15	12	02/10/2006
16	29	01/09/2007
17	11	01/10/2008
18	26	09/11/2009
19	19	01/11/2010
20	15	01/12/2010
21	12	01/06/2011
22	5	05/09/2011
23	1	08/01/2012
24	13	01/02/2012
25	6	06/06/2012
26	9	03/09/2012
27	5	06/01/2014
28	4	09/01/2014
29	4	01/02/2014
30	2	25/02/2014
31	4	28/09/2014
32	2	13/10/2014
33	2	20/10/2014
34	1	05/01/2015
35	3	11/01/2015
36	3	12/01/2015
37	3	25/01/2015
38	4	03/02/2015
39	3	10/03/2015
40	1	13/04/2015
41	3	19/04/2015
42	4	14/06/2015
43	3	01/07/2015
44	3	02/07/2015
45	4	14/07/2015
46	3	30/07/2015
47	1	01/08/2015
48	3	03/08/2015
49	1	10/08/2015
50	3	11/08/2015

51	3	23/08/2015
52	3	27/08/2015
53	2	14/09/2015
54	5	01/10/2015
55	1	01/10/2015
56	1	26/10/2015
57	3	22/11/2015
58	3	22/11/2015
59	5	03/12/2015
60	1	04/01/2016
61	3	06/03/2016
62	3	14/03/2016
63	3	01/04/2016
64	3	14/06/2016
65	2	20/06/2016
66	3	17/07/2016
67	3	03/08/2016
68	2	29/08/2016
69	4	11/09/2016
70	2	11/09/2016
71	2	24/10/2016
72	3	28/10/2016
73	2	30/10/2016
74	3	30/10/2016
75	2	31/10/2016
76	1	16/01/2017
77	2	17/01/2017
78	1	23/01/2017
79	1	20/02/2017
80	2	14/03/2017
81	1	01/04/2017
82	1	01/04/2017
83	1	24/04/2017
84	1	01/05/2017
85	1	02/05/2017
86	1	02/05/2017
87	1	26/06/2017
88	1	24/07/2017
89	1	24/07/2017
90	1	01/08/2017
91	1	01/08/2017
92	1	07/08/2017
93	1	14/08/2017
94	1	29/08/2017
95	1	01/09/2017
96	1	01/09/2017
97	1	04/09/2017
98	1	05/09/2017

99	1	11/09/2017
100	1	12/09/2017
101	1	15/09/2017
102	1	17/09/2017
103	1	02/10/2017
104	1	02/10/2017
105	1	05/10/2017
106	1	09/10/2017
107	1	10/10/2017
108	1	23/10/2017
109	1	30/10/2017
110	1	06/11/2017
111	1	07/11/2017
112	1	13/11/2017
113	1	18/12/2017

Care Agency

FTC worker	Number of successive fixed-term contracts	Date first engaged
1	3	17/08/15
2	3	05/06/15
3	1	22/05/17
4	6	19/10/12
5	6	04/11/13
6	4	26/03/15
7	3	11/09/15
8	5	21/07/14
9	3	10/08/15
10	1	04/12/17
11	3	26/05/15
12	1	14/09.17
13	3	28/07/14
14	1	02/10/17
15	1	02/10/17
16	3	18/05/15
17	1	17/07/17
18	1	07/08/17
19	1	05/09/17
20	1	27/11/17
21	1	27/11/17
22	1	05/06/17

Mount Alvernia

FTC worker	Number of successive fixed-term contracts	Date first engaged
1	2	01/04/16
2	2	11/05/16

Q149/2018

**St Bernard's Hospital A & E Department –
Three new Charge Nurses**

1125

Clerk: Question 149, the Hon. E J Reyes.

Hon. E J Reyes. Mr Speaker, further to the answers provided to Question numbers 658/2017 and 733/2017, can the Minister for Health say on which dates the three Charge Nurses took up their posts on a substantive basis at St Bernard's Hospital A & E Department?

1130

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the three Charge Nurses took up the substantive posts at the A & E Department on 2nd January this year.

1135

Q150-152/2018

**Hearing aids –
Funding and patient numbers**

Clerk: Question 150, the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, can the Government state its position with respect to the funding of hearing aids for those suffering from hearing impairment and associated hearing conditions?

1140

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 151 and 152.

1145

Clerk: Question 151, the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state the position in respect of the funding of the maintenance of hearing aids issued by the GHA?

1150

Clerk: Question 152, the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state the number of adults seen by the Audiology Department in the GHA in 2016 and 2017?

1155

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

1160 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, the GHA offers hearing aids free of charge to all entitled patients following clinical assessment.

The GHA finances the maintenance and repairs of all hearing aids issued. If the manufacturers advise that the age or condition of a particular hearing aid is beyond economical repair, the patient is reassessed and issued with a new device.

The Audiology Department saw 1,251 adult patients in 2016 and 1,267 last year.

1165

Hon. E J Reyes: Mr Speaker, may I?

Hon. N F Costa: You are affected!

1170 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Perhaps I should declare a vested interest because I am one of those who fit into the figure of 1,251 in 2016 and 1,267 of 2017.

The Minister said that it provides free of charge hearing aids to those suffering from hearing impediments yet, Mr Speaker, I know that some payments are to be made in respect of acquiring your first hearing aid.

1175 Are there certain conditions of why, for example, I have had to make a contribution? The way it was explained to me by the audiologist is that I was not paying the full cost, it was subsidised but certainly, payments have been made by many patients, of which I am one of those personally affected.

1180 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, according to the information I have been provided, and I have no reason to doubt the information provided, there should be no cost whatever to any of our patients who are entitled patients.

1185 The only thing I can think of – although of course I will need to go back to the Department and ask them specifically what the hon. Gentleman has raised in this House today – may be that the specification for a particular hearing aid is such, but that the patient wishes to have a different model or a different type of hearing aid and the difference is paid between the patient's choice and what is being advised.

1190 That is the only thing that I can think of but it may be completely mistaken of me to have said so, it may not be that at all, so I will go back to the Department and I will ask the question that the hon. Gentleman has raised today.

Hon. E J Reyes: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Having now heard the Minister, that could well be a possibility as well. You may be entitled to something but then there is a medical sort of recommendation that you want something else.

1195 It is not a pressing matter, I think he understands we are not trying to quiz him or anything but for members of the public at large who do unfortunately suffer this hearing impediment, if the Minister can simply find out and get himself informed, then it gives future patients as well the opportunity of saying, 'Well look, I could go for this other version.'

1200 Some people are a bit worried about what it looks like and they would like a hearing aid that would not be seen. At my age I am not bothered about that, I just want one that works, especially if it works with the loop system which makes a vast difference in your life.

1205 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker, as I said I will be happy to go back to the Audiology Department and as I say, given the remarks that the hon. Gentleman has made, it may be that there is a difference of opinion between the clinician and the patient as to what model the person wishes to be ordered and the view of the clinician may differ from that of the patient who may, in instances that have come to my desk, request a smaller hearing aid which the clinical advice is will not be sufficient for their purposes and that may be the reason why payments are made but I will confirm the answer for him.

Q153/2018
Mammography appointments –
Cancellations without notice

1210

Clerk: Question 153, the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state why mammography appointments have been cancelled without advance notice to patients?

1215

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

1220

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, routine mammography screening appointments were regrettably cancelled recently due to the unexpected failure of the equipment.

All patients affected have been contacted and advised of the reason for the cancellation. Patients have been informed both by post and by phone of the new rescheduled appointment date.

1225

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, this arises from just over five persons that became very concerned about the fact that they had not received such notification, or early notification as has been described, and effectively turned up to the hospital expecting to have this procedure done. They were then informed that it would be some time in April for these appointments and for the machinery to come back on line, as it will fixed.

1230

Obviously their concern was that obviously this is a delicate procedure for many women that have to undergo this procedure and therefore we wanted clarification as to why there would have been a mishap with five of them at least, I have been told at the very least, have been affected by this. But if the Government is assuring us that they have been communicated separately and through multi mediums, that is fine.

1235

Hon. N F Costa: Mr Speaker, I think the point that I wish to stress is that we are talking about routine mammography screening appointments, so we are not talking about urgent referrals or anything of the sort. This relates to appointments for routine screening.

1240

As a result of the breakdown of the mammography equipment, the appointments for these routine slots had to be rescheduled, I always insist when re-arranging meetings whether you bring them forward or back that you call the person and I am assured that the Department made a point of calling every single lady.

1245

Of course, there may have been cases where we have been unable to contact the lady for whatever reason, maybe the number we have is a landline and not a mobile, or indeed we have called the mobile and there has been no one to pick up and then a letter would have been sent and there would have been no oral contact.

But I always make it a point of making sure that people are called to be told of any rescheduled appointment, for the reason as he says, these appointments are important and we would rather minimise any disruption to patients.

1250

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q154/2018
Orthopaedic Clinic –
Average waiting time routine consultation

Clerk: Question 154, the Hon. E J Phillips.

1255

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, can the Government state the average waiting time for persons referred to the Orthopaedic Clinic for a routine consultation?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

1260

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the average waiting time for persons referred to the Orthopaedic Clinic for a routine consultation is 11 months.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q155-156/2018
Operations –
Number carried out and cancelled 2016-17

1265

Clerk: Question 155, the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, can the Government state the total number of operations carried out in 2016 and 2017?

1270

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 156.

1275

Clerk: Question 156, the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state by percentage, cancellations of operations due to bed shortages from the years 2016 and 2017?

1280

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, a total number of 3,632 operations were carried out during 2016 and a total number of 3,649 operations were carried out during 2017.

1285

The percentage of cancellations of elective operations due to bed shortages for years 2016 and 2017 are as follows: 2016, 1.79%; and 2017, 0.06%.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q157/2018

**Mental health conditions –
Diagnosis statistics for children and young adults**

1290

Clerk: Question 157, the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Can the Government state what statistics it has to hand in relation to the number of children and young adults, ages 12 to 25, diagnosed with depression and other mental health conditions?

1295

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

1300

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the Government has statistics in relation to the type of mental health condition and the number of children and young adults diagnosed with depression and other mental health conditions. These are available on our Primary Care Electronic Patient Record.

Q158/2018

**Obesity levels –
Policy for reduction**

1305

Clerk: Question 158, the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, further to Question 56/2018, can the Government confirm what its policy is in reducing the high levels of obesity in our community?

1310

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, child obesity is an important matter for concern, but the overall levels of adult obesity in Gibraltar is also significant.

1315

The Government's strategy on the reduction of obesity is therefore designed to meet the needs of different ages, different strata of society and different lifestyles.

The Public Health department addresses these needs using a multi-dimensional approach, including health education, public engagement and direct interventions.

There are numerous ongoing activities, some examples as follows.

1320

In health education, the GHA Public Health Department presents several leaflets on obesity prevention, healthy diets and other health improvement topics in its website www.healthygibraltar.org and updates these regularly.

Posters on healthy diets and lifestyle are placed on display at the Primary Care Centre and within St Bernard's Hospital. These are available to the public and regularly updated.

1325

A number of TV infomercials are regularly aired on GBC on topics such as the Change4Life initiatives, dietary fats, sugars and salt. All of these have been produced in the last two years.

Articles on healthy eating and lifestyle are written for the *Chronicle* and *Insight Magazine* on a regular basis.

The health promotion officers have delivered a series of healthy eating lifestyle sessions to young adults at the Gibraltar College.

1330

A healthy eating campaign is currently being offered to Year 10 students of Bayside School.

The Health Promotion Officers contributed to the Citizen's Advice Bureau's 'Stay Safe' campaign for senior citizens of the South District, providing information on healthy living and answering questions.

1335 The Health Promotion Officers regularly appear on Radio Gibraltar's *Health File* presenting key facts on contemporary topics like obesity and answering questions.

The Public Health department is working with Dieticians to expand the food and snacks offered in the Hospital canteen with healthy options.

The Public Health Department is working with Hospital managers and Dieticians to substitute healthy products in the vending machines within GHA premises.

1340 Highly calorific food products contribute to obesity and a number of leaflets highlighting the health, environmental and economic benefits of reducing dietary consumption of meat have been designed and distributed throughout Gibraltar.

1345 The Department is working with the Ministry of Environment on the 'Conscious Eating – A green Gibraltar' Initiative which promotes eating for health reasons as well as to protect the environment.

Mr Speaker, further, may I inform this House, with respect to Question 56 of this year, that I mistakenly referred the hon. Gentleman to the 'Health Matters' report of 2015, when, in fact, it is the 'Health and Lifestyle' report, which is available online in the GHA website and which contains information on obesity. My apologies.

1350 **Hon. E J Phillips:** I am grateful to the Minister for clarifying the position, it is just obviously when the Minister said that I should do my homework properly and read it, which I had done, and then ... I am grateful for the correction.

1355 But it is right, after reading this document, there is no short, medium or long-term strategy of the Government. It is effectively a statistical analysis conducted of a survey on the health of Gibraltar effectively relating to obesity, smoking prevalence, eating habits etc. But it is quite clear from this document that we need to do more as a community to reduce obesity. Some of the levels that have been described in this document and the summary as well, which is more alarming, which suggests that there is serious concern for the population of Gibraltar, it brings significant health risks and the likelihood of disease of these people and consequently increases the future burden of health care.

1360 Therefore, that is why I put the question as to what is the short-term, medium- and long-term strategy by the Government in relation to this and I am grateful to the Minister for answering the specific questions.

1365 But coming to the question that I was going to put, quite recently there was some debate as to whether increasing activity for our children in schools may well be an option from the usual 30-minute activity levels up to an hour per day. Has the Government considered any of those measures that could assist in obesity levels generally, reducing them?

1370 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I have been roped in by my learned colleague in view of my responsibility for public health and for education.

1375 This is certainly something I hesitate to say that we are reviewing physical activity in schools because I am going to be accused of doing yet more things because obviously it is now a crime for me to try and do anything more than I am doing already.

But certainly, this is something that we are reviewing, the important effect of obesity on the health and obviously on future budgets on healthcare is very important and this is certainly one thing that is being looked at.

1380 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Minister of Education's clarification in relation to those points relating to children.

1385 But quite clearly, our levels of obesity are higher than those in Spain according to this survey and Gibraltar has the highest prevalence of obesity in adults at the age of 45 in relation to the countries that were included within this survey, i.e. England, Scotland and other countries such as Malta, and some of the Channel Islands.

1390 So it is a significant problem concerning the health of Gibraltar generally, not only in relation to children but also older males as well and therefore, these are the reasons why I have targeted these questions and hopefully, put it on the public agenda because it is quite concerning when you read in detail, the Health and Lifestyle Report as to the consequences of obesity on our healthcare system – not only for those children, but for our growing elderly population as well and the burdens that it will create.

That is why I am trying to ascertain the short- and medium-term commitments by the Government in relation to reducing obesity across the wide ranges of the ages and demographic.

1395 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

Q159/2018
CCTV cameras at Dr Giraldi Home –
Location

1400 **Clerk:** Question 159, the Hon. E J Phillips.

Hon. E J Phillips: Mr Speaker, can the Government state that the location of CCTV cameras situated at Dr Giraldi Home are restricted to the kitchen, communal areas and sitting room?

1405 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, the CCTV cameras situated at the Dr Giraldi Home are located in communal areas which include lounges, kitchens and offices.

1410 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Can the Minister confirm whether or not any of those cameras would be facing rooms, residential rooms for these particular people who are residing there?

1415 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker, the answer is no. They will never be pointed towards the personal living areas.

1420 **Hon. E J Phillips:** And just so that we get the position clear, because we talked about protocols in relation to previous questions of CCTV, I assume, and perhaps the Minister could correct me if I am wrong, that the protocols deployed by other agencies in relation to the use and limit of the view that CCTV cameras are applied also in the Dr Giraldi Home.

1425 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, first to say that the CCTV is not yet operational, the cameras are not yet in operation and the Care Agency are developing their own protocol relying of course, on the experience of other agencies. But because we are dealing with a residential setting, we thought it was best to have a particular protocol designed for that setting, rather than just relying on other agency protocols.

1430 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, when were the CCTV cameras installed? I take the point that they are not operational so they are not switched on, but when were they installed?
Does the Minister have that information to hand?

Hon. N F Costa: They were all installed in the week commencing 29th January this year.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q160/2018
GHA clinics –
Specialist clinicians

1435 **Clerk:** Question 160, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1440 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government since December 2011, provide details of specialist clinicians who have been providing GHA clinics including (a) the clinics, trusts or hospitals the specialist is from and (b) the time period the specialist has been or is hosting the GHA clinics?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health Care and Justice.

1445 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, since December 2011, the details of specialist clinicians who have been providing GHA clinics including (a) the clinic, trust or hospital the specialist is from and (b) the time period the specialist has been or is hosting the GHA clinics, is in the schedule I now hand over to the hon. Gentleman.

Answer to Question 160/2018

COLORECTAL SCREENING PROGRAMME
ST GEORGE'S HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
24-25	NOVEMBER	2014
16-17	MARCH	2014
07-08	JUNE	2015
27-29	SEPTEMBER	2015
06-08	DECEMBER	2015
29-01	FEB/MARCH	2016
18-19	JULY	2016
25-27	SEPTEMBER	2016
20-22	NOVEMBER	2016
26-28	MARCH	2017
16-18	JULY	2017
08-11	OCTOBER	2017

ST GEORGE'S HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
14-15	JULY	2014
12-13	OCTOBER	2014
12-13	JULY	2015
16-18	AUGUST	2015
16-17	NOVEMBER	2015

26-28	JUNE	2016
21-23	AUGUST	2016
08-10	JANUARY	2017
23-25	APRIL	2017
17-19	SEPTEMBER	2017
11-12	DECEMBER	2017

ST GEORGE'S HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
30-02	NOV/DEC	2014
08-10	FEB	2015
10-12	MAY	2015
14-15	SEPTEMBER	2015
02-03	NOVEMBER	2015
07-08	MARCH	2016
23-24	MAY	2016
17-18	OCTOBER	2016
05-06	DECEMBER	2016
27-28	FEBRUARY	2017
22-23	MAY	2017
14-15	AUGUST	2017
06-07	NOVEMBER	2017

E.N.T.

ROYAL NATIONAL THORAT, NOSE AND EAR HOSPITAL, LONDON

Date	Month	Year
06-08	FEBRUARY	2013
17-18	DECEMBER	2013
17-18	MARCH	2014
14-15	JULY	2014

ROYAL MARSDEN HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
28-31	JANUARY	2013
07-08	OCTOBER	2013
06-08	OCTOBER	2014
23-25	FEBRUARY	2015
03	APRIL	2017

**GASTROENTEROLOGY
LEICESTER**

Date	Month	Year
2-4	JULY	2012
12-15	NOVEMBER	2012
22-24	APRIL	2013
23-25	SEPTEMBER	2013

24-27	JUNE	2014
19-21	NOVEMBER	2014
14-16	DECEMBER	2015
20-22	APRIL	2016
19-21	SEPTEMBER	2016
23-24	JANUARY	2017
12-14	JUNE	2017
04-05	DECEMBER	2017

LEICESTER

Date	Month	Year
28-02	NOV/DEC	2011
02-04	JULY	2012
13-15	NOVEMBER	2012
23-26	OCTOBER	2013
13-16	JANUARY	2014
24-27	JUNE	2014
19-21	NOVEMBER	2014
21-24	APRIL	2015
14-16	DECEMBER	2015

**DERMATOLOGY
LEICESTER**

Date	Month	Year
10-13	DECEMBER	2011
27-28	APRIL	2012
17-20	AUGUST	2012
10-12	DECEMBER	2012
24-26	FEBRUARY	2013
14-19	AUGUST	2013
12-14	DECEMBER	2013
23-26	APRIL	2014
23-26	JUNE	2014
21-26	AUGUST	2014
27-29	OCTOBER	2014
02-03	FEBRUARY	2015
25	APRIL	2015
28-30	OCTOBER	2015
08-10	FEBRUARY	2016
16	APRIL	2016
20-24	FEBRUARY	2017
22	APRIL	2017

LEICESTER

Date	Month	Year
20-22	FEBRUARY	2012
19-20	JUNE	2012

22-24	OCTOBER	2012
22-24	APRIL	2013
03-05	JUNE	2013
30-02	SEPT/OCT	2013
24-26	FEBRUARY	2014
25-26	APRIL	2014
27-29	OCTOBER	2014
01-03	DECEMBER	2014
25	APRIL	2015
07-09	SEPTEMBER	2015
07-09	DECEMBER	2015
13-16	DECEMBER	2015
05-07	SEPTEMBER	2016
05-07	DECEMBER	2016
19-22	APRIL	2017
12-14	JUNE	2017
21-23	AUGUST	2017
04-06	DECEMBER	2017

LEICESTER

Date	Month	Year
18-19	SEPTEMBER	2017

**GENETICIST
HAMMERSMITH HOSPITAL**

Date	Month	Year
27-01	FEB/MARCH	2013
02-04	OCTOBER	2013
02-04	APRIL	2014
01-03	OCTOBER	2014
06-08	MAY	2015
07-09	OCTOBER	2015
20-22	APRIL	2016
11-14	OCTOBER	2016
03-05	MAY	2017
29-01	NOV/DEC	2017

**NEPHROLOGY
HAMMERSMITH HOSPITAL**

Date	Month	Year
23	JANUARY	2012
23	APRIL	2012
16	JULY	2012
24	SEPTEMBER	2012
28	JANUARY	2013

15	APRIL	2013
29	JULY	2013
07	OCTOBER	2013
27	JANUARY	2014
7-8	APRIL	2014
14-15	JULY	2014
20-21	OCTOBER	2014
12-13	JANUARY	2015
13-14	APRIL	2015
06-07	JULY	2015
12-14	OCTOBER	2015
18-20	JANUARY	2016
14-16	APRIL	2016
24-26	OCTOBER	2016
16-18	JANUARY	2017
25-26	APRIL	2017
04	MAY	2017
10-12	JULY	2017
11	SEPTEMBER	2017
26-27	OCTOBER	2017

**NEUROLOGY
ST GEORGE'S HOSPITAL**

Date	Month	Year
17-19	NOVEMBER	2014
12-14	OCTOBER	2015
25-26	JANUARY	2016
11-12	JULY	2016
03-04	OCTOBER	2016
20-21	MARCH	2017
10-12	JULY	2017

LEICESTER

Date	Month	Year
08-10	DECEMBER	2014
04-07	AUGUST	2015
07-10	APRIL	2015

LEICESTER

Date	Month	Year
7-9	MAY	2012
26-28	SEPTEMBER	2012
09-11	JANUARY	2013
06-08	JUNE	2013
17-20	SEPTEMBER	2013
21-24	JANUARY	2014
05-07	MAY	2014
30-03	SEPT/OCT	2014

10-13	FEBRUARY	2015
17-19	JUNE	2015

UCLH

Date	Month	Year
03-04	OCTOBER	2017
28-04	OCT/NOV	2017
30	DECEMBER	2017

**GYNAECOLOGY & OBSTETRICS
ROYAL MARSDEN HOSPITAL**

Date	Month	Year
23	APRIL	2012
22	OCTOBER	2012
21-22	OCTOBER	2013
7-8	APRIL	2014
16-18	NOVEMBER	2014
07-08	APRIL	2015
19-20	OCTOBER	2015
04-06	APRIL	2016
27-29	SEPTEMBER	2016
18-20	APRIL	2017
23-25	OCTOBER	2017

**SPINAL SURGEON
GUYS & ST THOMAS' HOSPITAL**

Date	Month	Year
09-10	DECEMBER	2011
02-03	MARCH	2012
08-09	JUNE	2012
14-15	SEPTEMBER	2012
07-08	DECEMBER	2012
01-02	MARCH	2013
12-13	APRIL	2013
28-29	JUNE	2013
13-14	SEPTEMBER	2013
08-09	NOVEMBER	2013
31-01	FEBRUARY	2014
02-03	MAY	2014
18-19	JUNE	2014
18-19	SEPTEMBER	2014
05-06	DECEMBER	2014
13-14	FEBRUARY	2015
24-25	APRIL	2015
03-04	JULY	2015

ST GEORGE'S HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
13-14	OCTOBER	2014
17-18	SEPTEMBER	2015
16-18	MAY	2016
18-20	JULY	2016
25-27	SEPTEMBER	2016
05-07	DECEMBER	2016
06-08	MARCH	2017
05-07	JUNE	2017
25-27	SEPTEMBER	2017

Date	Month	Year
06-07	NOVEMBER	2016

SCOLIOSIS

Date	Month	Year
12-13	OCTOBER	2013
04-05	JULY	2014
27-28	MARCH	2015
02-03	DECEMBER	2016
10-11	NOVEMBER	2017

**CARDIO VASCULAR SURGEON
VITHAS XANIT HOSPITAL**

Date	Month	Year
14	FEBRUARY	2014
21	MARCH	2014
10	APRIL	2014
25	APRIL	2014
09	MAY	2014
29	MAY	2014
13	JUNE	2014
26-27	JUNE	2014
11	JULY	2014
24	JULY	2014
14	AUGUST	2014
11	SEPTEMBER	2014
02	OCTOBER	2014
06	NOVEMBER	2014
11	DECEMBER	2014
15	JANUARY	2015
12	FEBRUARY	2015
05	MARCH	2015
19	MARCH	2015
16	APRIL	2015
30	APRIL	2015

07	MAY	2015
28	MAY	2015
04	JUNE	2015
18	JUNE	2015
02	JULY	2015
16	JULY	2015
24	SEPTEMBER	2015
01	OCTOBER	2015
22	OCTOBER	2015
05	NOVEMBER	2015
19	NOVEMBER	2015
03	DECEMBER	2015
17	DECEMBER	2015
14	JANUARY	2016
28	JANUARY	2016
11	FEBRUARY	2016
18	FEBRUARY	2016
10	MARCH	2016
31	MARCH	2016
14	APRIL	2016
21	APRIL	2016
12	MAY	2016
26	MAY	2016
09	JUNE	2016
23	JUNE	2016
07	JULY	2016
21	JULY	2016
01	SEPTEMBER	2016
15	SEPTEMBER	2016
29	SEPTEMBER	2016
20	OCTOBER	2016
27	OCTOBER	2016
10	NOVEMBER	2016
24	NOVEMBER	2016
01	DECEMBER	2016
15	DECEMBER	2016
12	JANUARY	2017
26	JANUARY	2017
09	FEBRUARY	2017
23	FEBRUARY	2017
09	MARCH	2017
23	MARCH	2017
06	APRIL	2017
20	APRIL	2017

04	MAY	2017
18	MAY	2017
01	JUNE	2017
15	JUNE	2017
29	JUNE	2017
06	JULY	2017
13	JULY	2017
27	JULY	2017
10	AUGUST	2017
07	SEPTEMBER	2017
21	SEPTEMBER	2017
05	OCTOBER	2017
19	OCTOBER	2017
02	NOVEMBER	2017
09	NOVEMBER	2017
16	NOVEMBER	2017
30	NOVEMBER	2017
14	DECEMBER	2017

PAEDIATRICS

SPINAL – GREAT ORMOND STREET HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
18	MAY	2012
21	SEPTEMBER	2012
12	APRIL	2013
08	NOVEMBER	2013
23	MAY	2014

ENDOCRINOLOGIST – IMPERIAL COLLEGE

Date	Month	Year
24-27	APRIL	2012
21-24	MAY	2013
13-16	MAY	2014
22-24	MAY	2015
25-27	MAY	2016
10-12	MAY	2017

NEUROLOGIST - BRISTOL ROYAL HOSPITAL FOR CHILDREN

Date	Month	Year
5-6	JANUARY	2012
16-17	AUGUST	2012
08-10	JANUARY	2013
15-16	AUGUST	2013

NEUROLOGIST - GUYS AND ST THOMAS' HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
10-12	FEBRUARY	2014
23-25	FEBRUARY	2015
14-16	MARCH	2016
01-03	AUGUST	2016
13-14	FEBRUARY	2017
31-02	AUGUST	2017

PSYCHIATRIST - GUYS AND ST THOMAS'S HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
21-24	JUNE	2015
04-07	OCTOBER	2015
13-16	DECEMBER	2015
06-09	MARCH	2016
05-06	JUNE	2016
25-28	SEPTEMBER	2016

SLAM HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
21-24	MAY	2012
26-29	MARCH	2017
26-28	JUNE	2017

SLAM HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
21-23	JANUARY	2013
22-24	APRIL	2013
18-21	AUGUST	2013
04-05	NOVEMBER	2013
02-05	FEBRUARY	2014
19-20	MAY	2014
27-30	JULY	2014
01-03	DECEMBER	2014
01-04	MARCH	2015

Date	Month	Year
6-7	JULY	2017

EVELINAS CHILDREN HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
06-07	OCTOBER	2017

ST GEORGE'S HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
9-10	OCTOBER	2016

**PLASTIC SURGERY
LEICESTER HOSPITAL**

Date	Month	Year
20-22	FEBRUARY	2012
20-22	AUGUST	2012
19-21	AUGUST	2013
24-26	MARCH	2014
18-20	AUGUST	2014
20-22	APRIL	2015
24-27	AUGUST	2015
25-29	JANUARY	2016
21-23	MARCH	2016
22-24	AUGUST	2016
27-29	MARCH	2017
21-24	AUGUST	2017
10-15	DECEMBER	2017

LEICESTER HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
28-01	NOV/DEC	2011
22-25	APRIL	2012
19-23	NOVEMBER	2012
11-15	FEBRUARY	2013
03-07	JUNE	2013
02-06	SEPTEMBER	2013
18-21	NOVEMBER	2013
12-16	MAY	2014
01-06	SEPTEMBER	2014
08-12	DECEMBER	2014
23-27	FEBRUARY	2015
12-17	MAY	2015
22-27	JUNE	2015
10-15	AUGUST	2015
16-21	NOVEMBER	2015
15-19	FEBRUARY	2016
04-09	APRIL	2016
19-23	SEPTEMBER	2016
14-17	JUNE	2016
06-10	FEBRUARY	2017
03-07	APRIL	2017
05-09	JUNE	2017
07-18	AUGUST	2017

13-17	NOVEMBER	2017
-------	----------	------

RHEUMATOLOGY

Date	Month	Year
27-28	JANUARY	2011
06-08	JULY	2011
05-07	OCTOBER	2011
12-13	DECEMBER	2011
19-21	MARCH	2012
16-19	MAY	2012
12-14	JULY	2012
10-12	OCTOBER	2012
15-17	NOVEMBER	2012
17-18	JANUARY	2013
20-22	MARCH	2013
29-31	MAY	2013
28-30	AUGUST	2013
05-07	DECEMBER	2013
30-01	JAN/FEB	2014
27-29	MARCH	2014
28-30	MAY	2014
03-04	SEPTEMBER	2014
15-17	OCTOBER	2014
18-19	DECEMBER	2014
05-06	FEBRUARY	2015
26-27	MARCH	2015
27-29	MAY	2015
12-14	AUGUST	2015
19-21	OCTOBER	2015
10-11	DECEMBER	2015
11-12	FEBRUARY	2016
17-18	MARCH	2016
13-15	APRIL	2016
16-17	JUNE	2016
25-26	AUGUST	2016
27-28	OCTOBER	2016
08-09	DECEMBER	2016
16-17	FEBRUARY	2017
16-17	MARCH	2017
25-26	MAY	2017
26-28	JULY	2017
21-22	SEPTEMBER	2017
27-01	NOV/DEC	2017

**CARDIOLOGY
ST MARY'S HOSPITAL**

Date	Month	Year
31-01	JAN/FEB	2011
04-06	SEPTEMBER	2011
20-21	FEBRUARY	2012
03-04	SEPTEMBER	2012
28-30	JANUARY	2013
05-06	AUGUST	2013
24-25	FEBRUARY	2014
15-16	SEPTEMBER	2014

ST MARY'S HOSPITAL

Date	Month	Year
04-06	SEPTEMBER	2011

IMPERIAL COLLEGE LONDON

Date	Month	Year
03-04	SEPTEMBER	2012
15-16	SEPTEMBER	2014

**RESPIRATORY
LEICESTER HOSPITAL**

Date	Month	Year
02-03	FEBRAURY	2011
25-27	MAY	2011
30-01	NOV/DEC	2011
03-04	MAY	2012
28-30	NOVEMBER	2012
08-09	MAY	2013
27-28	NOVEMBER	2013
07-09	MAY	2014
26-27	NOVEMBER	2014
04-05	JUNE	2015
26-27	NOVEMBER	2015
19-20	MAY	2016
24-25	NOVEMBER	2016
25-26	MAY	2017
23-24	NOVEMBER	2017

SCIENTIFIC OFFICE (RESPIRATORY)

Date	Month	Year
21-23	FEBRUARY	2012
02-04	MARCH	2012
03-04	MAY	2012

29-30	AUGUST	2012
28-30	NOVEMBER	2012
23-24	JANUARY	2013
25-26	MARCH	2013
08-09	MAY	2013
02-03	JULY	2013
01-02	SEPTEMBER	2013
27-28	NOVEMBER	2013
26-28	MARCH	2014
07-09	MAY	2014
29-30	JULY	2014
22-24	SEPTEMBER	2014
26-27	NOVEMBER	2014
24-26	FEBRUARY	2015
03-05	JUNE	2015
01-02	OCTOBER	2015
25-27	NOVEMBER	2015
04-05	FEBRUARY	2016
19-20	MAY	2016
08-09	SEPTEMBER	2016
24-25	NOVEMBER	2016
23-24	FEBRUARY	2017
25-26	MAY	2017
25-26	AUGUST	2017
23-24	NOVEMBER	2017

**ALLERGY SPECIALIST
ROYAL NATIONAL THROAT, NOSE AND EAR HOSPITAL**

Date	Month	Year
22	NOVEMBER	2017

**Q161/2018
Specialist patient care –
GHA resourcing**

Clerk: Question 161, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1455 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government state whether any patient has been deprived of the appropriate specialist care as a result of the GHA not making appropriate resources available?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

1460

Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa): Mr Speaker, I can confirm that no patient has been deprived of the appropriate clinical care as determined by the GHA clinical team due to lack of resources.

1465 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, as I have explained to the Hon. Minister through private messages on some particular cases which I have been informed of, there has been what seems to be a breakdown in communication or a lack of resources being made available.

My understanding from what may have happened in a particular case which we are not going to ventilate in this Chamber for sure, is that a patient has for some reason been put into an annual list of reviews for example and not been communicated.

1470 Can the Hon. Minister please pledge to investigate circumstances such as this one and ensure that the patient is always aware of the care that person is meant to be receiving and is not left in a vacuum of uncertainty?

1475 **Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I have already carried out the investigation following the hon. Gentleman's message to me.

I have a note in front of me, the note seems to suggest that the gentleman in question was informed of the next step. Having said that I am working from notes so I was not present at the meeting where any such communication would have taken place. But it is entirely possible that either the information was not communicated entirely effectively or that the person did not quite understand what was being communicated to him. And to assuage the gentleman's concerns, there has been in any event an additional appointment now set for this particular gentleman, next week.

1485

ENVIRONMENT, ENERGY, CLIMATE CHANGE AND EDUCATION

Q113/2018

Wastewater treatment plant – Financing

Clerk: We now return to Question 113, the questioner is the Hon. R M Clinton.

1490 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm that the entire £22 million cost of the announced wastewater treatment plant will be borne by the Improvement and Development Fund and if not, by whom?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1495

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the Government is considering a number of financing options.

1500 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I am sure the Minister is aware that in the last Budget there was a nominal £1,000 in the Improvement and Development Fund in respect of the wastewater treatment plant.

Is the Minister now advising this House that he does not think that this cost will be going through the Improvement and Development Fund?

1505 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, what I am saying is that we are considering a number of financing options. The £1,000 is there to reflect our commitment to it and to leave those options open. If a number of options are open, this could be one of them but we are not in a position right now to give any more information.

1510 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I must say I find it strange that the Minister announces the signing of a contract but he cannot tell this House how he intends to pay for it.

Will the Minister at least give an undertaking to come back to the House and tell the House how he intends to pay those contracts?

1515 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, that is not the position. The position is that the Government knows it has different options available to it to enable us to pay for the liabilities in the contract and we want to continue to have those options available to us.

When we have made a final decision in the interest of the taxpayer, because we are not going to choose the option that is most expensive, we are going to choose the option that is most in the interest of the taxpayer, we will then be in a position to make an announcement in that respect.

Hon. R M Clinton: Mr Speaker, the Chief Minister is confusing the cost to the taxpayer in terms of the contract and the way he is going to pay for it.

1525 At the end of the day he has already signed a contract, there is no further benefit to be obtained for the taxpayer as far as I am aware, so is the Chief Minister saying that he really does not know how he is going to pay for this wastewater treatment plant at this moment in time?

1530 **Hon. Chief Minister:** That is not the position, Mr Speaker. What the hon. Gentleman is confusing is whether or not there might be any financing cost attached to the way in which we determine that we will pay for the cost of this liability or whether we will decide to approach the cost in another way which might reduce either the financing cost or indeed the £22 million in some way.

1535 Mr Speaker, what he should be saying to me is that he is very pleased to hear that there is an opportunity to ensure that the taxpayer gets an even better deal.

Q114/2018
Smoking –
Reducing prevalence

Clerk: Question 114, the Hon. E J Phillips.

1540 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Can the Government state how it intends to reduce the prevalence of tobacco smoking in our community?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1545 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the Government intends to reduce the prevalence of smoking in Gibraltar through the following initiatives:

Campaigning against the uptake of smoking by children – working through the Health Promotion team of Public Health.

1550 Monitoring the prevalence of smoking in schools – working with the Gibraltar Drugs Advisory Council to survey uptake of substances in schools.

Supporting the No Smoking Day initiative – a well-established initiative in Gibraltar to promote quitting.

1555 Promoting smoking cessation where tobacco consumption is disproportionately high – older men, ethnic groups, manual workers, etc.

Supporting and promoting the GHA Smoking Cessation service.
Increasing prices of tobacco products.

1560 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, given this report that I have been avidly reading because of Minister Costa's reference to it on the last occasion, it is quite clear that our community has one of the highest smoking prevalences compared to any other country studied in relation to this report.

1565 Therefore, I ask the question as to whether the Government intends to neutralise the packets containing cigarettes so they are blank so that we get rid of this advertising of the names on these packets. Also, you have seen in other countries where they illustrate in quite graphic detail some disturbing images relating to tumours and cancer generally speaking.

1570 But does the Government intend to do anything about the packaging in relation to cigarettes in order to further enhance armoury against tobacco and the prevalence of tobacco smoking in Gibraltar?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, there is no doubt about both obesity and tobacco smoking are concerns as reflected in that report, which is the second report that this Government produced. It was produced in my time as Health Minister.

1575 The first one was also published by us, the survey had been carried out in GSD times but they never provided the funding for publication. So we are very pleased and proud that we are putting this sort of information in the public domain because it is of interest to the community and also it spurs us on to greater things.

1580 So in the same way that in answer to the previous question we are promoting different initiatives to help tackle obesity, we are looking at a wide range of possibilities in decreasing smoking in Gibraltar, particularly for young people.

These are some of the matters that are on the list of things that are being considered, but we have not taken a firm decision on those and that is why the ones that appear in the answer to the questions are the ones that we are actually carrying out at the moment.

1585 **Hon. E J Phillips:** And, Mr Speaker, just one further question in relation to that. Clearly the position in 2008 the percentage of those individuals who had declared themselves as smokers was about 28% but in the 2015 report that the Government has commissioned, demonstrates that there was 35% so clearly something is not working in so far as strategy is concerned.

1590 In relation to children of course, the figures are fairly low and although I appreciate and commend the Government for going into schools and telling children about smoking in particular, it is quite clear that we need to do more.

Does the Minister agree with that?

1595 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** As I say with anything, any question on environment, of course I agree we can do more; we are never going to reach total satisfaction in campaigning and working for things that are good for the environment and good for the health of the community.

1600 I think I have to remind the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition that we did introduce a Smoke-Free Environment Act, so although the statistics indicate that there are a few percentage more smoking, I would like to think that there is a huge percentage more of non-smokers who are now not exposed to smoke.

So overall, perhaps the direction is the right one that we are following but clearly the community has more to do on this and we are committed to doing so.

1605 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, may I take this opportunity to ask the Minister whether they have made any progress on the question I made about a year ago regarding banning smoking in children's play parks and then asked again five months ago, which is an issue of course of health and of environment as the Minister says, because we can educate our

children all we want in schools but if they are living and breathing it in children's play parks, I do not know what example that is.

1610

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, we did, if my memory serves me right, ban smoking in the sports complex, I think that has been led by my friend and colleague the Hon. Stephen Linares, but I think that has already happened and we are intending to identify play areas and possibly other recreational areas.

1615

We are considering for example some parts of the Upper Rock where smoking can actually be a danger of fire that perhaps away from the roads and so on, to introduce for other reasons but this is certainly something that we are still considering and I hope that we will be able to see progress soon.

1620

Hon. E J Phillips: Just one final question, I promise, in relation to this. So the Government has no intention of standardising the packaging of tobacco products.

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, I did not say that. I said that this was one of the matters that is on the list of things to look at by way of improving our performance in smoking statistics.

1625

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, the Minister did say part of the strategy would or could be to increase the price of tobacco, a strategy that has been known to work in other jurisdictions certainly.

1630

Is the Government seriously considering that or is the Minister just saying that for purposes in this House?

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): As Minister for Public Finance, I have raised the price of tobacco more in six years than was the case in the past 20, so I think there is an indication of our commitment.

1635

Hon. T N Hammond: That does not actually answer the question because clearly if you are considering raising prices to discourage people from smoking, they need to be raised significantly and considerably. And that is why I asked the question, is the Government considering the kind of raises, the kind of levels that we may see tobacco prices have reached in other jurisdictions like the UK or even possibly Spain or not?

1640

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, in the past six years I have raised the price of tobacco more than has been the case in 20 years in this community and so, therefore, I think we have a track record of using price in a way that deters people from smoking. But if people are foolish enough to want to put a stick of grass in their mouth and light it, Mr Speaker, then it is very difficult to dissuade them.

1645

In the United Kingdom, raising the price of tobacco has meant that people continue smoking so in a community as affluent as ours that may not be the silver bullet that hon. Members pretend it is.

1650

But given that the last time they were in Government they did not take those steps, can I ask them, at least rhetorically, Mr Speaker, what it is that has changed their minds now.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q115/2018

**Complaints to EU Commission re flaring at Cepsa –
Response received**

1655 **Clerk:** Question 115, the Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Further to Question 115/2017, has Government received a response to its complaints to the EU Commission reference the flaring at Cepsa and if so, what was the content of that response?

1660

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, if I can be of assistance to the House, I am just reminded that the increase in tobacco prices in the time that I have been Leader of this House, is 134%.

1665 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the –

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, I am grateful for the answer to that question, but clearly the Government's – (*Interjection by Mr Speaker*) it is a question related -

1670 **Mr Speaker:** No, the matter is closed, I closed the matter, we are moving on to the next question.

I would think there is enough tobacco smoke around this place without dealing with the matter any further. It has been amply ventilated and we are moving on.

1675 **Clerk:** Question 115 and answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, as has previously been confirmed, the Government has received formal notification from the European Commission that the complaint has been registered and that it is being considered.

1680

However, the Government has received no further feedback from the Commission since then. The Gibraltar office in Brussels is urging the Commission to expedite a reply.

Q116/2018

**Thinking Green underwater camera –
Operation**

1685 **Clerk:** Question 116, the Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, has the Thinking Green underwater camera worked at all since the beginning of last month?

1690 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, no, sir.

Hon. T N Hammond: Mr Speaker, what is the reason for it not having been serviceable?

1695 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, in answer to a previous question, I had mentioned that there was a question of online connectivity. On this occasion, the problem was a little bit more severe

and the diving team from the Department of the Environment and Climate Change inspected the whole length of the cable from the shore to the camera and found that severe weather had dislodged the rock that had fallen on the cable and pinched it.

1700 Therefore, it has required the removal of the whole cable and it will have to be laid again and the team is looking towards doing it over the next couple of weeks.

Hon. T N Hammond: I appreciate this may not arise from the question so I do understand, but does the Minister have any idea of what the cost of that particular exercise would be?

1705

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Yes, Mr Speaker, we have enough cable to be able to relay it without having to purchase anymore, because most of it can be recouped and used and the work is carried out in-house by members of the Department's diving team so we do not have to pay over and above the normal wages of the men and women in question.

1710 So there is no separate cost other than the one as I said last time, routine maintenance is done by the in-house team.

Q117-118/2018

Dogs –

Testing of faeces; fines for non-registration

Clerk: Question 117, the Hon. T N Hammond.

1715 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, what is the cost of each DNA test or batch of tests conducted on samples of dog faeces?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1720

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 118.

Clerk: Question 118, the Hon. T N Hammond.

1725

Hon. T N Hammond: How many fines have been issued or are pending for ownership of unregistered dogs?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1730

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the cost of each faecal DNA test is €12.88.

1735 In answer to Question 118, none yet sir, but I have to qualify that: although there has been no fining for unregistered dogs, there has been one fine currently being processed for an unlicensed dog. You have to register it and then license it every year. So the dog was registered but the licence had not been produced.

This is despite the fact that several hundred dog owners have been stopped to confirm their registration and there are daily patrols checking dog owners accordingly.

Q119/2018
Heritage Action Committee –
Meetings since March 2017

1740

Clerk: Question 119, the Hon. T N Hammond.

Hon. T N Hammond: How many meetings of the Heritage Action Committee have taken place since March 2017 and what has been discussed?

1745

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):
1750 Mr Speaker, the Heritage Action Committee has met twice since March 2017.

Mr Speaker, in my prepared answer, I do not have the details of what has been discussed, but as I have it here, I am going to read through in order to assist to pre-empt the supplementary that is inevitably coming if I may, Mr Speaker.

1755 Discussion of the role of the committee in its method of operation, its terms of reference – this was in the first meeting which slightly pre-dates this, there was a meeting in February so it is three altogether since I reconstituted it – two since March, discussion on the Heritage and Antiquities Act and Government archives on the Gibraltar Museum, on the Garrison Library, the handing in of artefacts found by the public, heritage environment records, heritage management plans, GIS for plotting the schedule to the Heritage Act, inclusion of caves in the schedule, mobile heritage assets moratorium, Heritage Act feedback, the sports complex at
1760 Europa and Lathbury Barracks, Europa Point expressions of interest, Nun's Well options, Southport gates and the maintenance of city walls, the ex-MOD gatehouse relocation, the location of Admiralty anchors, Witham Cemetery, street art initiative, the World Heritage viewing platform, provision of archaeological services, the Garrison Library again, Lathbury Barracks and Europa Pass Battery, and discussion of heritage aspects of MOD assets.

1765

These are the ones listed in a list. There will have been more informal discussions but I think that highlights the range. If I may add as well, Mr Speaker, this is an action committee so it meets when there are specific actions to be decided. There is a lot more consultation with the different members in our day-to-day work.

1770

Hon. R M Clinton: Just one question, Mr Speaker. I notice reference to a Heritage Management Plan; I do not believe that has been published yet. When might that be published?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, I think I have answered a question on this previously. This is being drafted by the Gibraltar Museum team and I am looking forward to receiving a draft but without notice, I cannot tell the hon. Member exactly when I expect this.
1775

Q120/2018
Upper Rock visitors –
Numbers per month since July 2014

Clerk: Question 120, the Hon. T N Hammond.

1780

Hon. T N Hammond: Can Government provide a list of the number of visitors to the Upper Rock, by month, since July 2014?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1785

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, the information requested by the hon. Member is in the schedule which I now hand over.

In the meantime, Mr Speaker, I would like to bring his attention to the fact that this information is available on line at <https://www.gibraltar.gov.gi/new/statistics-topic-area/2018/tourism>.

1790

Hon. T N Hammond: I am not going to try and write that down!

1795

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: No, I am happy to give him a copy of this behind your Chair, Mr Speaker.

Answer to Question 120/2018

Total number of upper rock nature reserve visitors by month

Year	January	February	March	April	May	June
2014						
2015	18,774	27,507	41,685	87,614	85,252	83,586
2016	21,725	27,962	60,461	83,962	102,234	92,177
2017	25,558	32,279	55,259	96,367	117,267	105,011
2018	24,608					
Year	July	August	September	October	November	December
2014	100,337	110,603	103,961	90,846	37,560	27,465
2015	105,621	118,572	112,692	101,942	43,177	32,151
2016	117,980	129,284	123,050	118,980	51,238	30,052
2017	127,188	140,384	119,242	118,086	59,191	37,192

Q121/2018

**Upper Rock Nature Reserve entrance fees –
Arrears update**

Clerk: Question 121, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1800

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government provide an update on the arrears detail position of debtors who may have exceeded their credit periods on Upper Rock Nature Reserve entrance fees, together with details of any other debts they may owe to the Government or its agents?

1805

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, there is currently one debtor. Arrears pending amount to £168,790.40.

1810

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, is that exclusively in relation to Upper Rock entrance fees or does that encompass other arrears.

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, exclusively to the Upper Rock. I have not found any other debts by that debtor in other areas. If there are some, they certainly have not come to our attention when we were researching the answer.

1815

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Minister confirm that this is the same debtor that has owed a substantial amount of money for the last two years?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Yes, sir.

1820

Hon. L F Llamas: Therefore, Mr Speaker, could I ask what the Government is doing in order to recoup this amount of money, given that this is again on the increase and obviously the operator or whoever the individual is, keeps on entering the Upper Rock whilst having this debt over the Government.

1825

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, this is a snapshot, that debtor is regularly making fairly large payments. This is a snapshot at the time that this information was captured and it will depend on how many visitors come in and some months there will be more, some months there will be less, so I suspect that this will reflect a period, because there is a time lag of a couple of months before payments come in, so this could well reflect the end of the summer period.

1830

I can find more information but I can assure the hon. Member that payments are coming in regularly.

And in answer to previous questions, he will have seen how this does in fact go up and down depending on when we take the actual data. I am happy to look into a more long-term analysis of this but I do assure the hon. Member that regular payments are being received.

1835

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, could I ask is any interest charged together with these payments for what could be described as an unsolicited loan?

1840

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Without accepting that definition I am not aware of what that answer would be, I would need to look into that.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, just in relation to the answer the hon. Gentleman has given, does he know ...? Because what he is saying is that payments are regularly coming in, but of course, if payments are regularly coming in but the debt remains in the region of £200,000 then effectively the Government is subsidising this particular operator in a very significant way.

1845

Now, does the Minister know whether in the period since the summer for example, whether that debt has actually reached zero, because then I could understand the situation better and I could understand what we have here is an open tally whereby on a monthly or bi-monthly basis or every three months the debt may go up and then it is reduced to zero.

1850

I am just trying to understand what the nature of this debt and how long it has been outstanding is.

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, it has not reached zero, but it would be almost impossible to reach zero unless there were no visitors brought by that operator into the Nature Reserve for say a period of three months.

1855

There will always be, it is a dynamic situation, there will always be some debt. The debt has been considerably lower than it is now, when I have been asked at other times. I do not have a recollection nor the figures at this point in time as to what my answers have been, but they have been certainly at least, I think, I am working from memory, Mr Speaker, at least half of this.

1860

And if you then translate it into the number of tourists brought through, it may be that it is a reasonable amount of tourists if we are working on a two or three month lag. So it looks

perhaps, I think it certainly looks worse than it is, but I would need a little bit of time to research it in the context that it has been asked.

1865 I was asked for a specific figure, that is what I have provided. I would be happy either if the hon. Member or Members write to me or if there is another question in future to analyse it in that way, but it is highly unlikely that it would ever be zero if there is a lot of trade, but I need to research that further.

1870 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, the fact that it cannot go down to zero is slightly confusing when this matter was first raised by the Principal Auditor in his report from 2014-15 and therefore, it was highlighted by the Principal Auditor as a going concern, given that it is the only ... There were two operators at the time, one obviously has satisfied his debts but obviously there still remains one particular operator or individual out there that simply cannot manage its
1875 debt appropriately and has been doing so now for two years, when this was not the case before this was actually raised by the Principal Auditor.

Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo): Mr Speaker, how does the hon. Gentleman reach that
1880 assumption? Couldn't it also be the biggest operator by far, rather than just a debtor that is unable to manage its debt?

Hon. L F Llamas: Well, Mr Speaker, answering to the Chief Minister, I take that assumption from the concerns raised in the Principal Auditor's Report and if he is raising it as a concern, it is obviously a concern which we must then address and I hope the Chief Minister agrees that if he
1885 highlights it, it is something that his Government should be looking into.

Hon. Chief Minister: Nobody is saying it is not a concern. What I am saying is how has the hon. Gentleman assumed it is a debtor that is unable to manage debt and that the sums are not large sums because we might be dealing with one of the largest operators that brings the larger
1890 number of people, and the hon. Gentleman has said to him, as a result of that, the numbers get large.

Hon. D A Feetham: Mr Speaker, may I? Mr Speaker, no, I understand the point made by the Hon. the Chief Minister, but if it were the position that ... Effectively what we are dealing with is
1895 a running total of amounts owed to the Government simply because there are a lot of tourists going into the Upper Rock and at any given time there is always going to be some money that is owed to the Government, I could understand there is no concern.

But the point that is made by the Hon. Mr Llamas is that in 2014, the Principal Auditor raised this as a concern; therefore, it was a concern to the Principal Auditor and if it was a concern to
1900 the Principal Auditor, I think that it is a reasonable assumption to make. We do not know – I mean we are blind on this side of the House in relation to this; the Government has the facts. But if it was a concern to the Principal Auditor in 2014, then a reasonable assumption is that it cannot just simply be explained away by way of a running total that is reasonable in the context of a lot of tourists coming into the Upper Rock. I just wonder whether the Government knows
1905 the answer to this.

Are we talking about, which I think from the inferences to be drawn ... I do not think that is right, but is the Government satisfied that this is just simply a reasonable debt incurred as a running total because of the amount of tourists that are going in or is it a matter of concern which the Government then is attempting to deal with in any particular way?
1910

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, the Government is satisfied that the monies that the Principal Auditor said were outstanding in 2014 have been paid and that the monies that are outstanding today have been accrued subsequently as a result of the volume of traffic that this

1915 particular operator moves and the credit terms this operator provides to its clients and therefore the credit terms that it requires from the Government.

1920 But we are dealing with a going concern that pays the amounts outstanding to the Government, although unfortunately with slightly greater delay than the Government would like to see. The hon. Gentleman knows that this is a complex business which Government has an intention to try and see if we can deal with it in a different way. Not in relation to this operator but generally.

1925 But given the numbers that we are dealing with in the context of this particular operator, it would be wrong to say that this is mis-management of debt and this is the thing that the Hon. Mr Llamas said and it was the assumption that Mr Llamas made that I was challenging. There are some things Mr Llamas has said in this House which I very much welcome that the hon. Gentleman has taken issue with.

This one I take issue with because it is based on an assumption and as I often say to the hon. Gentleman, to assume makes an ass of you and me and in this instance, that is exactly what Mr Llamas has done.

1930 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, if I may, would the Minister be able to advise what the standard credit terms would be for this operator – is it 30 days, 60 days, 90 days? Because obviously the concern of the Principal Auditor would have been that they exceeded their credit period.

1935 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I believe it is three months and as I say, I have this snapshot in order to be able to elaborate and analyse that. This amount of money by three months would be 56 per month, and then you would have to divide by the cost per visitor to see how many visitors we are talking about. So it is difficult to analyse it with all the information but it is, I believe, a three-month period.

1940 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Just one more, Mr Speaker.

Mr Speaker: Yes, go on.

1945 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Does the Minister know whether the £200,000 that are outstanding –

Mr Speaker: £169,000.

1950 **Hon. D A Feetham:** £169,000, I stand corrected – that that money is outstanding for more than three months or less than three months? Because if it is less than three months, then of course, there is less of a concern. But if it is more than three months, then there is more of a concern because obviously they are exceeding and breaching their credit terms.

1955 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I am not going to speculate. I learned my mathematics from you at school and without the data I cannot answer, I would have to look into exactly how this figure has come about.

1960 **Hon. Chief Minister:** I can tell the hon. Gentleman the way the question is phrased, I believe it is inclusive of monies owed in the period of three months and therefore, the out-of-credit-term amount is going to be significantly lower.

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Q122/2018
Upper Rock-Gibraltar Nature Reserve App –
Development

Clerk: Question 122, the Hon. L F Llamas.

1965

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, can the Government explain whether it is still pursuing a working Upper Rock-Gibraltar Nature Reserve App?

Clerk: Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

1970

Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes): Mr Speaker, yes, sir.

1975

Hon. L F Llamas: Mr Speaker, just one supplementary: does the Minister know when this App will be live and what the expected cost will be?

Hon. Dr J E Cortes: Mr Speaker, I know when: 'when' is the opening of the Sky Walk which is at last looming as we finish the safety works that we are doing in the area. The cost, I would need notice of that, Mr Speaker.

1980

Mr Speaker: Next question.

Clerk: Question 123, the Hon. E J Reyes.

1985

Hon. Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, this might be a convenient time for the House to now adjourn until Friday at 3.00 p.m.

Mr Speaker: The House will now adjourn until Friday at three in the afternoon.

The House adjourned at 5.55 p.m.