



# PROCEEDINGS OF THE GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT

**AFTERNOON SESSION: 3.03 p.m. – 6.37 p.m.**

**Gibraltar, Wednesday, 23rd May 2018**

## **Contents**

Silence in memory of Manchester Arena victims.....	3
Suspension of Standing Order 7(1) to permit laying of papers .....	3
Papers to be laid.....	4
<b>Questions for Oral Answer .....</b>	<b>4</b>
Deputy Chief Minister .....	4
Q420/2018 Parliament building and lobby – Plans to beautify.....	4
Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.....	5
Q336/2018 Gibdock – Discussions re onshore power technology.....	5
Q337/2018 Waste Water Treatment Plan – Commencement of work.....	6
Q338/2018 Pets harmed by rat poison – Changes to system of rodent control.....	7
Q339-340/2018 Public cleaning contract Update re awarding of contract .....	8
Q341/2018 Lifeguarding service – Privatisation.....	10
Q342-343/2018 Upper Rock – Cleaning of Skywalk; safety of attractions.....	10
Q344/2018 Nun’s Well – Plans to tidy site and display information.....	13
Q345/2018 Upper Rock Nature Reserve entrance fees – Arrears update Moneys due from debtor and action taken to recover.....	14
Q346/2018 Vacant teaching posts – Update re any changes.....	15
Q347/2018 School facilities used by the community – Cancellations.....	16
Q348/2018 Scholarships – Details of non-mandatory awards.....	17

Q349-357/2018 New schools – Location; contract; classrooms; total area; cost; teacher support; traffic; evacuation and collection points .....	20
Q358/2018 New secondary schools – Compliance with EU law .....	29
Q359/2018 Portakabin classrooms – Number and location .....	31
Q360/2018 Special Educational Needs – Support for students into adulthood .....	31
Q361/2018 Pupils attending schools – Updated schedule .....	32
<i>The House recessed at 4.45 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 5.11 p.m.</i> .....	38
Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport .....	38
Q362/2018 Victoria Stadium – Lease payments .....	38
Q363/2018 Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority – Update re vacant post .....	39
Q364/2018 Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority – Pool operative/lifeguard posts .....	40
Q365/2018 Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority – Cancellations.....	40
Q366/2018 Victoria stadium floodlights – Cost of power supply upgrade.....	41
Q367/2018 Victoria Stadium floodlights – Responsibility for maintenance.....	42
Q368/2018 Cultural grants – Details of awards.....	42
Q369/2018 Sports-related grants – Details of awards.....	45
Q370/2018 Queen’s Hotel and Cinema site – Confirmation of sale .....	48
Q371/2018 Europa Point university accommodation – Cost of construction .....	48
Q372/2018 Island Games 2019 – Visitors .....	51
Q373/2018 Island Games – Air conditioning for sports complexes.....	55
Commerce.....	55
Q374-376/2018 – Cyber security – Government website .....	55
Q377/2018 Moneyval – Visit.....	56
Q378/2018 Real estate agents – Regulation.....	57
Health, Care and Justice.....	58
Q.379/2018 A&E – Contacting Minister re waiting times.....	58
Q380/2018 Out-of-court settlements – Amount paid .....	60
Q381/2018 Xanit – Termination of contract.....	61
Q382-384/2018 Diabetes – Number of sufferers; cost of treatment .....	63
Q385/2018 Hillside Residential Home and Bella Vista Day Centre – Allied healthcare professional services .....	64
Q386-387/2018 Europort Primary Care Centre – Government project; change of location. ....	64
Q388/2018 MedDoc – Value of contract re John Mackintosh Wing .....	66
Q389/2018 Prison new service – Provision of new vans .....	67
<i>The House adjourned at 6.37 p.m.</i> .....	67

# The Gibraltar Parliament

*The Parliament met at 3.03 p.m.*

[MR SPEAKER: Hon. A J Canepa GMH OBE *in the Chair*]

[CLERK TO THE PARLIAMENT: P E Martinez Esq *in attendance*]

## Silence in memory of Manchester Arena victims

**Clerk:** Meeting of Parliament, Wednesday, 23rd May 2018. Order of Proceedings.

**Mr Speaker:** The Hon. the Chief Minister.

5

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, yesterday, Parliament in the United Kingdom started its proceedings by calling a minute's silence to remember the attack at the Manchester Arena exactly a year ago and I call upon Parliament today, our first day back in Gibraltar, to do the same thing and to observe a minute's silence to remember those who died at the Manchester Arena a year ago.

10

*A minute's silence was observed.*

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I am grateful to the hon. Lady, who pointed out to me yesterday that the UK Parliament had started in that fashion, so we could emulate them today.

## Suspension of Standing Order 7(1) to permit laying of papers

**Clerk:** The suspension of Standing Orders. The Hon. the Minister for Commerce.

15

**Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola):** Mr Speaker, I beg to move, under Standing Order 7(3), to suspend Standing Order 7(1) in order to proceed with the laying of reports on the table.

**Mr Speaker:** I beg to move, in the terms of the motion proposed by the hon. Member ... Those in favour? (**Members:** Aye.) Those against? Carried.

**PAPERS TO BE LAID**

20 **Clerk:** Papers to be laid. The Hon. the Minister for Commerce.

**Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola):** Mr Speaker, I have the honour to lay the following on the table.

25 (1) The Financial Services Commission Annual Report and Audited Accounts for the years ending March 2000 to March 2017. If I may just briefly explain, for some reason these have not been laid before Parliament. I have done it as soon as I have become aware. The reports are all public and are all online and have been each of the years in the intervening period.

(2) The Financial Services Resolution and Compensation Committee Financial Statements for the year ending March 2017.

30 (3) The Report on the Operations of the Gibraltar Financial Services Commission 2017.

**Mr Speaker:** Ordered to lie.

## Questions for Oral Answer

**DEPUTY CHIEF MINISTER**

**Q420/2018**

**Parliament building and lobby –  
Plans to beautify**

**Clerk:** We now return to answers to Oral Questions.

We commence with Question 420. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

35

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Does Government have plans to beautify the dilapidated state of the outer facade of our Parliament building and lobby?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. The Deputy Chief Minister.

40

**Deputy Chief Minister (Hon. Dr J J Garcia):** Mr Speaker, the Government will look at the beautification of the outer facade of Parliament once the external lift has been installed.

45 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, can we have any idea of when this will be accomplished?

**Hon. Deputy Chief Minister:** Yes, Mr Speaker – as soon as the estimates of revenue and expenditure for this financial year are passed at Budget time. We will then have the funding to be able to proceed.

**ENVIRONMENT, ENERGY, CLIMATE CHANGE AND EDUCATION**

**Q336/2018**

**Gibdock –**

**Discussions re onshore power technology**

50 **Clerk:** We now go to Question 336. The Hon. T N Hammond.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, further to Question 242/2018, can the Minister confirm that the discussions being held with Gibdock outside of those pertaining to the lease include the requirement for the provision of shore-supplied power to vessels under repair; and can the  
55 Minister advise how many meetings have taken place and what progress has been made in these discussions?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

60 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, yes, sir. Approximately five meetings have been held with Gibdock, both with myself and with the CEO of the Gibraltar Electricity – that is five taken together. Additionally,  
65 there is contact with potential providers of onshore power technology. Some progress has been made.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** When the Minister says ‘some progress’, can he perhaps elaborate on that a little bit? Is it likely that the outcome will be that Gibdock will have the facility to provide shore power once these talks are complete?

70 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, we are heading in that direction. I do not think it would be prudent for me to give more details because these are clearly discussions that are developing, but I am hopeful. I am positive about the intended outcome.

75 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, could the Minister describe what obstacles might be in the way of providing shore supply for vessels being worked on at Gibdock?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** No, Mr Speaker, we are identifying that technology. We must make sure that the technology is possible to deploy in Gibraltar. Then we need to look at the details and so  
80 on. We are actually currently in discussions, as I have said, with potential providers of this technology but I do not really think there is anything more I can add at this stage.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Minister confirm that the obstacles are not of a financial or economic nature?

85 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** I could not confirm that they were, as I still do not have a firm idea of what the costs could be. So, at the moment those are not obstacles. At the moment, we are looking at the technology.

90 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Can the Minister confirm that shore-supply power of this nature is provided in other jurisdictions and other dockyards?

95 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, in some other jurisdictions it is and it is with providers in those jurisdictions that we are talking to see how technically feasible this would be. I am pretty convinced it will be, but as I say, it is too early for me to be able to answer that in any detail.

100 **Hon. T N Hammond:** One last question, Mr Speaker. Would the Minister agree that shore supply to vessels in Gibdock would provide immense benefits in terms of air quality in that area and therefore to the health of people living in and around the environment of the dockyard?

105 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I wonder why else the hon. Member would think that I wanted to achieve that. Shore power is supplied currently to ships in dry dock through a different system, and clearly taking away the need for ships to be powering with their own engines would result in improved air quality, and this is the reason why we are looking at this.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister advise if he is aware whether Her Majesty's naval base currently provides shore supply to naval vessels; and if so, why can we not do the same?

110 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, Her Majesty's naval base does. They bring in generators and they supply from generators. I am not convinced that that is what I would like to see for Gibdock.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q337/2018**  
**Waste Water Treatment Plan –**  
**Commencement of work**

115 **Clerk:** Question 337. The Hon. T N Hammond.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** When does Government expect works to commence on the Waste Water Treatment Plant?

120 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

125 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, meetings of the Waste Water Treatment Plant Advanced Works Group are being held on a regular basis, dealing with the preparatory work. Works on the ground are expected to commence during the next few months.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, we are obviously glad to hear that on this side of the House.

130 Can the Minister confirm that, as far as he is aware, there is no variation to the costs he announced in respect of the contract?

135 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** I am not aware of any variation. The advanced works group at the moment is looking at things like the environmental impact assessment, heritage assessments, planning the works – in fact, as I say, they are here on a very regular basis. At the moment, there is no indication of any variation of cost.

**Q338/2018**

**Pets harmed by rat poison –  
Changes to system of rodent control**

**Clerk:** Question 338. The Hon. D A Feetham.

140 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, how does the Government intend to change its present system of rodent control, or that of its sub-contractors, so that pets are not harmed by rat poison?

145 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, occasions when pets have been harmed by poison set out by Government contractors are extremely rare. The recently reported case, where the pet was unharmed following veterinary intervention by the Gibraltar Veterinary Clinic, was a result of someone  
150 unknown tampering with bait and exposing it from its greatly concealed and inaccessible location. Different methods and types of bait are now being considered and will be trialed very shortly.

155 **Hon. D A Feetham:** But Mr Speaker, surely if it is possible for somebody – a member of the public, obviously – to interfere with baits, it was foreseeable when it first occurred.

What I want to know, bearing in mind that of course yes, I am commenting on what happened in the past but I am interested as well on what is going to happen in the future ... I am a dog lover, he knows that – I have got four dogs myself – and it is a very, very bad way for a dog to go, to die from rat poisoning. Whilst the hon. Gentleman says they were unharmed, this  
160 particular dog – in fact, there was more than one dog; there were two dogs that I am aware of – although he says unharmed. It wasn't unharmed. The dog did not die as a consequence, but obviously it was harmed by consuming this.

What is he going to do as an immediate measure in order to ensure that no other dogs are harmed as a consequence of rat poison that is laid, at the end of the day by a subcontractor  
165 pertaining to the Government?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, it is down to the definition of harm and I will agree; what I meant is no lasting harm came to it, because of rapid intervention. I am not aware of any other  
170 case.

As I think the hon. Member will be aware – because this was stated publicly in answer to a press question, or in connection with a press release; I cannot remember the detail – my reaction was immediate and these were all removed immediately.

175 The system that we are about to trial, about which I have only been briefed over the last couple of days, will conceal a different type of bait – a type of bait that is known not to have residual effects, so that if a rat were to eat this bait and then got eaten by another animal it would not suffer – and these would be concealed within sealed containers, which would be bolted to the ground and only rats could come in and out. That is what was presented to me and I have approved as a trial run.

180 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** We do not know what effect it has on wolves.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, that is certainly a welcome announcement from the Minister for dog lovers in Gibraltar, I am sure, including myself. (*Interjection by Hon. Chief Minister*) And for the dogs – yes, indeed!

185 Am I right, therefore, in saying that the laying down of rat poison has been suspended until this new system is introduced? Or is it still the case that rat poison is being laid in places in Gibraltar at the present moment in time?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** No rat poison of the type that we were talking about has been laid since, and older ones have been removed. Because it is only a couple of weeks, we are not overly  
190 concerned about a sudden explosion of the rat population, because the new system is probably being laid this week if it has not been tried out already today. So, at the moment, there should be none of that type of rat poison. As I say, it was very well concealed down in between the rocks of the revetments, where there have been rat problems in the past. Somebody pulled it up  
195 and clearly that is not acceptable and as soon as I realised that we stopped it.

I think that people with pets need not be concerned, but neither should people who fear there is going to be a rat population explosion.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Just one final question – and it may well be that, in fact, in the light of the  
200 fact that the Government is changing the system to this system where only rats can access the bait it may be that it is superfluous – but has the Government considered any type of signage, or anything like that, that may also help?

The hon. Gentleman says, ‘Well, it was picked up by somebody – somebody must have taken the bait out.’ It could actually have been a small animal, a small dog, that could have accessed it  
205 and then taken it out. It is very difficult to say how that particular bait was inaccessible for a larger dog, but if you have proper signage even when it is very secure ... because accidents do happen and unforeseeable accidents do happen as well. Signage is important. I note that the Hon. Minister is nodding.

210 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I should have said that. There will be signage accompanying each of these bait boxes.

**Q339-340/2018**  
**Public cleaning contract**  
**Update re awarding of contract**

**Clerk:** Question 339. The Hon. R M Clinton.

215 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Government advise if it has reached a decision in respect of the award of the public cleaning contract?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

220 **Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 340.

**Clerk:** Question 340. The Hon. L F Llamas.



225 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government update this House as to the tendering process and plans for the new public cleaning contract?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

230

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the tender board is currently deliberating.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, if I may ask the Minister: when did the contract actually end? When was the deadline for submission of tenders?

235

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, there have been a number of extensions in order to allow the proper processing of the tender. I believe the current extension ends either end of May or end of June, but clearly if the award cannot be made before – if it is the end of June, I am sure it will be made – then there would have to be an additional extension.

240

**Hon. R M Clinton:** I thank the Minister for his answer.

How many extensions have been given so far, and again what was the deadline for the submission of tenders?

245

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I do not have that detail. I think the contract expired just under a year ago, so regardless of the number of extensions, the extension has been to the date that I have just mentioned. I can obviously obtain that information, but I cannot recall the date of the tender.

250

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, I just rise to ask one supplementary question in relation to this point. I have been approached by a number of employees in respect of the company performing those functions. What assurances can the Government give in respect of this particular contract? I know that the Minister says it is in progress, but a level of reassurance from the Minister would go down quite well.

255

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, we had a motion here in this House in which we guaranteed the interests of the employees. I am in regular contact with their union representatives and I have met with them probably on two or three occasions over the last few months, on which those reassurances that were publicly stated here in this House and have been stated elsewhere were repeated to them, so there is no reason for them to be concerned.

260

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, the Minister will appreciate that they are actively concerned in the tendering process and, with respect, of course they deserve that level of reassurance as to timing. That is the point that is being made to me by those employees. I do very much appreciate what the Hon. the Minister says about that, but I was seeking some form of reassurance as to the timing of that contract being awarded.

265

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Well, Mr Speaker, in relation to timing of something that is in the hands of an independent procuring board, I think what we all need to be saying is that we are not going to put pressure on an independent board to make a decision which might be the wrong decision; we are going to allow them to make the right decision. I think it is important that we are not seen to interfere with a board that is determining European tender in particular.

270

It is obvious that we have taken longer than the hon. Members opposite expected to be in different parties, because we have had the same question twice from the former independent

275 Member and Members of the party opposite. So it has clearly taken longer than they anticipated they were going to be apart when they put their questions together.

It has taken longer than we thought it was going to take, but it has to be done in a way that is not in any way interfered with. We cannot put pressure on the board to decide by next week, and I would have thought that the employees of the company – who have seen me quite regularly, have seen the Hon. Minister quite regularly and have my door open to them at any time – want us to make the right decision for this community and the right decision for them, and that means allowing the independent adjudicators of the tender to be able to reach the right decision.

**Q341/2018**  
**Lifeguarding service –**  
**Privatisation**

**Clerk:** Question 341. The Hon. T N Hammond.

285

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, further to Question 20/2018, does Government intend to privatise the lifeguarding services at our beaches?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

290

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, no, sir.

**Q342-343/2018**  
**Upper Rock –**  
**Cleaning of Skywalk; safety of attractions**

**Clerk:** Question 342. The Hon. T N Hammond.

295

**Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, what is the frequency of cleaning of the Skywalk, what methods are used to clean inaccessible areas, and who conducts the cleaning?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

300

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 343.

**Clerk:** Question 343. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

305

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** With the new and relatively new tourist attractions in the Upper Rock, like the Skywalk and the suspension bridge, is Government satisfied that the Upper Rock is generally safe for tourists; and if not, is it doing anything about this?

310

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

315 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the Skywalk is currently cleaned twice a day, mornings and evenings. The company carrying out twice-daily cleaning operations is Blastaway Ltd. The inaccessible areas are cleaned by Koala Ltd on an ad hoc basis using a rope access method, and this is carried out by trained personnel.

The Upper Rock is as safe as any other nature reserve or national park anywhere in the world with similar characteristics.

320

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, can I ask the hon. Gentleman whether they have guards constantly at their suspension bridge in particular, or if there is a security measure there?

325 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker, the presence of the security at the suspension bridge is more related to vandalism than to safety. I think we have answered questions in relation to the safety of the suspension bridge and I think we have answered those points, but the security guard is present there more in relation to the potential of vandalising it rather than for safety reasons.

330 On some occasions – and people have been warned – when there are monkeys on the bridge it is best not to be there and sometimes the security guard will say, ‘Don’t cross it, there’s a monkey in the middle of the bridge,’ but other than that it is purely for reasons of preventing vandalism.

335 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, what I was trying to get to, if the hon. Gentleman might answer, is what are the times when the security guard is there.

And regarding the warnings about monkeys, is there signage? I do not personally go anywhere near it because I am scared of heights, so I would not know.

340 Also, is there a maximum weight or maximum number of people that the bridge can take, and is there something to stop more people than the maximum from getting in? I was given an example of one day when there were many tourists there, that it seemed a little overweight and that was my concern.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Who seemed overweight, the tourists?

345 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** The bridge was overladen with people.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, for some of the questions asked I would need to confirm the information. It is specific data which I would have recalled just after the bridge was built, but now I do not want to mislead the House in giving information.

350 Certainly it is a very robust structure. As far as the information that has come to me, we have never got anywhere near that being threatened in any way by excessive weight of users.

Again, the security officers are there ... I would again need to look exactly at the timings. There are occasions – for example, in high winds – where the bridge is actually closed off physically.

355 The kind of detail I am being asked is something that I would need notice of. I would be very happy either to answer a question again here or to respond to the hon. Member if she wishes to contact me directly. I would not like to rely on memory and possibly mislead this House.

360 **Hon. T N Hammond:** Mr Speaker, just with reference to the cleaning of the Skywalk and Koala’s ad hoc cleaning of the less accessible areas, the Skywalk is, of course, a new attraction heavily promoted and marketed of late and so it is, I hope, bringing people to see it – and of

course there will be nothing more disappointing than arriving at the Skywalk and finding areas of it are dirty and therefore not transparent but opaque. Could the Minister indicate how often this ad hoc activity is occurring? I have been to the Skywalk and certainly in certain wind conditions, particularly Levante, it is almost on a daily basis that the under-surfaces are obscured and I assume it is the under-surfaces which are the most difficult to get to and therefore those that are the responsibility of Koala.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** I would not be able to answer in detail. We have a mechanism by which, when the staff feel that it needs this specialist cleaning, that is triggered off. I can again obtain the information. We obviously respond to complaints or if anybody seems to think that there is a need we will respond. But again I could not tell you now. Because it is ad hoc, I could not tell you like I could on the actual cleaning of the accessible surfaces that it is twice a day. I would again need to check that, but also reassure the hon. Member that if it is identified that there is a need, then that is done right away.

**Hon. T N Hammond:** And are inspections therefore carried out by the staff on a regular basis – and would that be daily, twice daily, more often – in order to indicate when such cleaning might be required?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** There are inspections carried out. Remember that we have security staff there on a permanent basis and they will report back, as well as the supervisors on the staff who do their daily rounds. So we do get regular feedback.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, I have a couple of photos relating to the path to the new Skywalk, which shows some gaping holes in between some rocks leading to a cliff. So my question is: imagine the summer months when children and families ... How much of a responsibility does the Government have towards a nature reserve which can bring problems and fatalities, but how much is it the responsibility of a Government to deal with natural structures that could be dangerous?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, this is a question really of legal liability and where the Government might be considered to have liability in respect of areas of highway or not highway etc. We could say things to each other in the context of the debate that might result in a Government being found or not found liable in a subsequent case without having taken specific legal advice on the subject. In any event, in my view this is not the forum for that sort of debate as to potential liability.

I think that we all know the Upper Rock. It is our playground, our backyard. People who come from outside may not know it as well. They come to visit it, but it is clear that they are visiting an area of nature reserve maintained, insofar as it is possible to maintain it, as nature intended. Indeed, there are many who have pledged their lives to ensuring that that should be as much as nature intended it as possible.

So, if she will allow me to say that I think we should resist having a debate as to potential liability in hypothetical situations where things *might* happen, I think it is probably in the interests of our community that we should not progress to have a detailed discussion about *potential* areas of danger.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, just coming back to the Skywalk, the Hon. Minister said that Koala had the contract to maintain and to clean the areas of the Skywalk that were inaccessible to ordinary, basically, cleaning methods. Is that contract a contract for a price annually, or does it depend, for example, on the number of times that Koala are called out in order to do the cleaning?

415 So, for example, and I am getting at this, if you have a contract whereby Koala are paid every time that they are called out – so it is incident specific, if I can call it that – then at certain times in the year there may be more reluctance by people there to call out Koala because it is an additional expense; whereas if it is just a contract – every year somebody is paid x amount and it does not matter how many times they are called out – then it is a different situation. I would like to see what type of contract in that regard we are dealing with.

420 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, again I would need notice. I will look into it. I believe it is actually – but again I believe, I cannot confirm – that it is related to the number of times they are called out, but I could be wrong and I would need to check that particular detail.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** I am grateful to the Minister.  
425 Just a supplementary that piggybacks on to the question of the hon. Lady on the exchange that she had with the Chief Minister, I do visit the area occasionally – you cannot take dogs up there because of the monkeys, but I do visit the area occasionally. Obviously there are sheer drops. That is nature. We are talking about a road that effectively runs the course of the spine of the Rock at its very top, and it is very difficult to actually make it safe proof – it is impossible to  
430 do so. But is the Government considering signages, for example, in relation to that? Signage is something that can, if we are considering questions of liability of the future – God forbid that there is an accident, at the very least everything is being done to warn people of the dangers that they will face in a nature reserve, obvious as he and I might say that they are?

435 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Member is a neighbour to the Skywalk almost. I am trying to figure out which is the best way up there from his residence, but – (*Interjection by Hon. Chief Minister*) (*Hon. D A Feetham: Charles V Wall*) Mr Speaker, I will follow up on the Hon. Chief Minister's comment – if he is offering to use his specialised skills in cleaning it, we need to see whether it would be ad hoc or not.

440 The hon. Member will be aware – because he is on the Upper Rock certainly a lot more than the rest of us, for obvious reasons – that there has been a considerable improvement in the nature and extent of signage on the Upper Rock over the last few years. We are constantly reviewing signage and this is something that is very much on the cards.

**Q344/2018**  
**Nun's Well –**  
**Plans to tidy site and display information**

445 **Clerk:** Question 344. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Does Government have plans to restore Nun's Well, clear the debris and display appropriate signage and information about this historical site and potential location of interest for tourists?

450 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):**  
455 Mr Speaker, I wonder whether the hon. Lady was hiding behind a car when I was there a few weeks ago actually dealing with this very matter, because the answer is yes.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, if I can ask a supplementary – I haven't been following you, by the way – would it be possible to repair the site to allow access to the spring below? There is a spring.

460

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I said that because it was very current in my work agenda when this question came through – and I think I did look almost behind every car!

Yes, there are a number of phases planned, improving the area, removing the building which is a very new building and which is not in a very good state, introducing interpretation and seats, benches and so on. The next phase would be addressing access or at least visibility of the well underneath. There are a couple of ways in which this can be achieved and this is part of the work that we are looking at now.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I am aware that a number of years ago the Heritage Trust held the lease for Nun's Well. Can the Minister confirm that the lease has now reverted to the Government?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, as far as I am aware, certainly since I have been Minister for Heritage, which is just over a year and a half, I do not believe it is with the Heritage Trust any longer. I have some recollection – but I am not even sure whether I was in Government at the time – that it used to be, but I think they did not want to renew it because they were not able to do whatever it is they planned to do. I am not sure when it happened but it is no longer with the Heritage Trust, of that I am pretty certain.

#### Q345/2018

#### Upper Rock Nature Reserve entrance fees – Arrears update Moneys due from debtor and action taken to recover

**Clerk:** Question 345. The Hon. L F Llamas.

480

**Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, further to Written Question 12/2018, can the Government provide details of moneys due by the debtor in respect of moneys due outside of the three-month credit period, together with the action being taken to recover these moneys?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, £73,195.40 is presently owed – or at the time of preparing the answer, which was probably last week. An agreement is presently in place whereby the moneys owed are recovered by means of regular instalments.

**Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, by when is this agreement scheduled to end the payments and have the full moneys due fully paid?

495

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, there will be a continuation of regular instalments because we must remember that as the moneys are paid more money is owed when more visitors are brought over, so this will not have a finishing date. I think we have mentioned this before. There will always be a time lag and when you have a peak of visitors then the debt will be higher than

500 when you have a trough of visitors. So this is not a finite thing and this will need to continue on an indefinite basis.

**Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, surely it cannot be the case that a particular tour provider is being allowed to accrue such a level of debt which does fluctuate outside of the three month credit period – that is why there is a three month credit period where the money is due for the passengers and their tourists that have gone up to the Upper Rock are settled. If they are taking up the passengers, there is no reason why they should not be able to repay the moneys they have charged those passengers for taking them up.

510 For the Minister to suggest that this is an indefinite arrangement, then surely interest should be accrued in the same way as people have to get mortgages for £140,000 or £70,000 and have to pay interest. Is this something that the Government will actually look at in a bit more of a serious fashion?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the intention is to achieve – and we are much closer than we were, if you look at the figures – that the only money pending will be that which is due from recent visitors. That is what I am saying. So there will have to continue to be regular instalments to the payment – that is what I am saying. (*Interjection*) We are, I think, honing in on achieving that level within the next few months.

**Q346/2018**  
**Vacant teaching posts –**  
**Update re any changes**

**Clerk:** Question 346. The Hon. E J Reyes.

520

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister for Education provide details in respect of any changes of vacant teaching posts since the answer provided to Question 219/2018, indicating the school/establishment where these changes may have occurred and from which dates?

525 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, there are no changes in respect of vacant teaching posts. However, I can update the House in that interviews for new entrants were conducted from 5th to 12th April and vacant TLR interviews ... in fact, this says 'will be held' but are actually currently being held. They started yesterday and they finish... if today is the 23<sup>rd</sup>, which I think it is, they finish tomorrow.

535 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, the Minister has indicated that interviews are taking place. Some took place in April and others are taking place now. Does he have any figures for the numbers of applicants, the numbers of interviews being involved?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** No, Mr Speaker. I would need notice of that question.

540 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, when the interview process is complete and so on, does he envisage the successful applicants taking post immediately or, given that at this stage we are in the current academic year, they will not be effective until the start of the 2018-19 year? It is a

question of which academic year. The board surely must have some sort of indication of when the posts is tenable.

545

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, this will depend on a number of factors: it will depend on the actual posts; it will depend whether the vacancy is from somebody who is not there or somebody who is terminating at the end of the term; it will depend exactly when the Public Service Commission clears ... As the hon. Member will know, this can sometimes take a few weeks. So it is looking likely, the date that we are, that it could be that at least some of the posts will start in September, but I cannot answer that question without the facts and figures in front of me.

550

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, I know the interviews are taking place now. Is it in respect of one vacancy or a number of vacancies? Does he have an indication of that?

555

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, there were a number of vacancies for new entrants and for TLRs which were advertised. There was a batch of quite a few some couple of months ago and the interviews are ... If they are going on for three days – and believe you me, they are long sessions – that means there are quite a number of applicants and there are a number of vacancies. I think we probably have advertised for all the ones that I mentioned last time with the exception of one or two that I pointed out were subject to review.

560

**Q347/2018**  
**School facilities used by the community –**  
**Cancellations**

**Clerk:** Question 347. The Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Education inform this House how many cancellations have been necessary at any of the facilities made available for community use since the answer provided to Question 220/2018, indicating the location, date and reason for the cancellation?

565

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

570

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Yes, Mr Speaker, these are the numbers of cancellations made since the answer provided to Question 220: Westside School on 18th and 19th April to accommodate their parents' evenings; Governor's Meadow School on 26th March so that they could set up for their school assembly.

575

**Mr Speaker:** Since this information is not of an urgent nature, does the hon. Member not think that he could perhaps defer that for six months in order to abide with the six-month rule? It is not urgent: whether he gets this information now or in three months' time does not make any difference. He is asking questions to which the answers, I know, are different, but it is the same question. In Question 220 he wanted to know cancellations, now he wants to know cancellations and these are the only ones that have occurred in the interim period. There is no reason why he cannot wait six months to get the information more globally.

580

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, Question 220 was posed because in a previous session of Parliament I had asked that specific question to the Minister for Sport, who in his reply told me

585



that he did not maintain the records of the schools and therefore I should refer them to the Minister for Education.

590 There is a certain validity behind the suggestion Mr Speaker is offering me, but however because of my regular contact with the sporting fraternity, sometimes ... The reasons given today by the Hon. Minister are to do with parents' evening and preparing for the school assembly and are a one-off, one-day cancellation. There have been others that, due to certain remedial works needing to be undertaken, it has extended a long period of time, and if I wait six months it has gone beyond a period of time when I could ask the Minister what is the estimated date when this facility could be back in use.

595 I will bear Mr Speaker's suggestion in mind for next time. I hope as little disruption as possible will occur in the future, but given the Government's intentions to carry out certain refurbishment work within the schools and so on, it could well be that when the academic year starts again in September and we move on to the next season of allocation for community use, there may be extended or longer periods of time. It could be a particular area of community use.  
600 Hypothetically, the pitch area towards the western part of Westside School, which hits the back of Governor's Meadow School, could have to be taken over by a contractor to store materials, as has happened, and other reasons. So I do not want to shoot myself in the foot and not be able to ask those questions.

605 As and when the sporting fraternity bring these matters to my attention, I will use a bit of common sense and judgement and, if need be, consult with Mr Speaker before posing the questions.

**Mr Speaker:** The only thing is that I wonder is the cancellation of facilities for community use for a parents' evening ... That is what the school is there for, to hold parents' evenings on a particular ... Is that a cancellation or is that a school using the facilities of the school for the purpose for which the school exists?  
610

It seems superfluous to me, but anyhow, the hon. Member need not be afraid – he knows that I tend to be generally quite liberal with his questions.

**Q348/2018**  
**Scholarships –**  
**Details of non-mandatory awards**

615 **Clerk:** Question 348. The Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Education provide details of scholarships financed during the financial year 2017-18, other than mandatory awards, indicating the course being followed, the qualification to be attained upon successful completion, the institution delivering the course and the start and end dates of these courses?  
620

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):**  
625 Mr Speaker, I will hand over a schedule to the hon. Member which contains the information requested.

GIBRALTAR PARLIAMENT, WEDNESDAY, 23rd MAY 2018

Answer to Question 348

Award start dates	Award termination date	Course	Qualification	Institution
2017	2018	AAT Accounting Level 2	AAT	University of Gibraltar
2017	2018	Access to Nursing	Higher Education Diploma	Distance Learning Centre
2014	2018	Accounting	CIMA	CIMA
2016	2020	Accounting and Finance	BSc	University of Gibraltar
2018	2019	Accounts	BSc	The Open University
2017	2019	Addictions Counselling	Foundation	University of Bath
2017	2019	Advanced Certificate in Terrorism Studies	Advanced Certificate	University of St Andrews
2017	2018	Advanced Diploma in Accounting	AAT Level 4	University of Gibraltar
2017	2018	Advanced Diploma in Accounting	AAT Level 3	University of Gibraltar
2018	2019	Air Transport Pilot License	EASA CPL/IR	FTE Jerez, Flight Training Europe
2016	2019	Applied Psychology	BSc	University of Brighton
2017	2020	Arts and Humanities (Spanish)	BA	The Open University
2015	2018	BA (Hons) Business Management	BA	The Open University
2016	2019	BA (Hons) Early Years	BA (Hons)	The Open University
2015	2020	BA Childhood & Youth Studies	BA	The Open University
2012	2018	Bachelor of Laws (Hons)	BA	The Open University
2014	2018	Bachelor of Laws BA (Hons)	BA	The Open University
2016	2018	Bar Professional Training Course	BPTC	University of the West of England, Bristol, UWE
2015	2017	Business Administration	MBA	Bangor University
2017	2021	Business and Management	BSc	University of Gibraltar
2015	2018	Business and Management	BSc	University of Gibraltar
2016	2020	Business and Marketing	BSc	University of Gibraltar
2015	2019	Business Management	BA	The Open University
2014	2018	Business Studies	BA	The Open University
2016	2021	Business Sustainability	PhD	University of Gibraltar
2018	2018	Certificate in Advanced Value	Certificate	New York University
2017	2018	Certificate of Higher Education in Environment	HND	The Open University
2012	2019	Childhood & Youth Studies	BA	The Open University
2017	2020	Childhood and Youth Studies	BA	The Open University
2017	2019	Civil Engineering and Construction Management	MSc	Heriot Watt University
2015	2018	Clinical microbiology and infectious diseases	MSc	The University of Edinburgh
2017	2018	CMI Level 5 - Management and Leadership	Diploma	Gibraltar College
2015	2018	Coaching for Performance in Football	BSc	Anglia Ruskin University
2017	2018	Computer Games (Software Development) with placement and digital arts foundation	Foundation	Southampton Solent University
2012	2019	Computing (Information Security & Forensics)	PG Dip	The Open University
2011	2019	Computing & IT and a second subject	BSc	The Open University
2017	2023	Computing and IT	BSc (Hons)	The Open University
2017	2018	Construction Project Management	MSc	Liverpool John Moores University
2017	2019	Creative Arts	PhD	The University of Central Lancashire, UCLAN
2015	2018	Dementia Studies	MSc	University of Stirling
2016	2018	Development Management	MSc	The Open University
2014	2018	Diploma - International Relations	Diploma	London School of Economics
2017	2020	Early Childhood	BA	The Open University
2015	2019	Early Years	BA	The Open University
2016	2018	Electronic Music Production & Performance Degree	BA	Berlin
2014	2018	English Language and Literature	BA	The Open University
2017	2018	Fast Track Yachtmaster Offshore Motor Course	MCA RYA / SRC VHF incl GMDSS	All Abroad Sailing Academy
2016	2018	Fire Rescue Service Management	Foundation	Blackburn College
2017	2018	Google Squared Course	Certificate	Google Online
2017	2018	Graduate Diploma in Law	GDL	BPP Law School
2017	2018	Graduate Diploma in Law	GDL	BPP University, London
2017	2018	Graduate Diploma in Law	GDL	
2017	2018	Grant making, Philanthropy & Social Investment	MSc	CASS Business School
2017	2020	Health	BSc	The Open University
2017	2020	Health and Social Care	BA	The Open University
2017	2020	Health and Social Care	BA	Bangor University
2015	2021	Healthcare	PhD	University of Gibraltar
2017	2020	History	BA	The Open University
2017	2018	Human Resources Level 3	QLS	UK Open College
2017	2019	Information Security	MSc	University of London - Royal Holloway
2017	2018	International Beauty Therapy Diploma	CIBTAC	Marbella Beauty Academy
2015	2018	IT and Computing	BSc	The Open University
2013	2019	Law	LLB	The Open University
2014	2020	Law	LLB	The Open University
2015	2018	Law	LLB	The Open University
2016	2018	Law	LLB	The Open University
2016	2022	Law	BA (Hons)	The Open University
2017	2018	Law	LLB	The Open University
2017	2023	Law	LLB	The Open University
2017	2021	Law	LLB (Hons)	The Open University
2017	2018	Legal Practice Course with integrated LLM	LPC & LLM	BPP University, London

Continued

Continued Answer to Question 348

2017	2019	Level 7 Advanced HR Management Course	CIPD Level 7	CIPD
2015	2021	Literature	PhD	University of Gibraltar
2011	2020	LLB	LLB	The University of Law
2016	2018	Management Accounting	BSc	The University of Derby
2017	2018	Management and Leadership Diploma	CMI Level 6 Diploma	Brighton School of Business and Management
2017	2018	Management and Leadership Diploma	CMI Level 6 Diploma	Brighton School of Business and Management
2017	2018	Management and Strategic Leadership	MA	London Metropolitan University
2015	2021	Marine Biology	PhD	University of Gibraltar
2017	2019	Master's in Education	MA	University of Exeter
2017	2018	MCA RYA Day Skipper / RYA Radar Course / RAY Diesel Engine Course / Maritime Radio Operators Licence	MCA RYA / SRC VHF incl GMDSS	All Abroad Sailing Academy
2017	2021	Mechanical Engineering	HND	Teesside University
2015	2018	Medical Ultrasound (MSK Route)	PgDIP	Bournemouth University
2017	2019	MLP Licensed Master Coach	NLP	NLP
2017	2018	MSc Musculoskeletal Science	MSc	The Open University
2017	2020	Music Production	BA	University of Central Lancashire, UCLan
2016	2022	Nutritional Therapy and Science Foundation Course	BSc (Hons)	BCNH College of Nutrition and Health
2016	2020	Part-time PhD Researcher	PhD	University of Gibraltar
2017	2018	Personal Trainer and Fitness Instructing	QCF Diploma level 3	Stone Bridge Associated College
2017	2018	PGCE	PGCE	Sunderland University
2015	2019	PhD History	PhD	Darwin College, University of Cambridge
2015	2022	PhD Researcher	PhD	University of Gibraltar
2017	2022	PhD Researcher	PhD	University of Gibraltar
2017	2022	PhD Researcher - Institute of Life and Earth Sciences	PhD	University of Gibraltar
2016	2021	PhD Social Work	PhD	University of Gibraltar
2017	2018	Phibrows Microblading Training	Microblading Training	Brank Babic Microblading Academy
2017	2019	Philosophy, Science and Religion	MSc	The University of Edinburgh
2016	2018	Physician Associate Studies	PGDip	Newcastle University
2016	2018	Post Graduate Certificate Mental Health & Substance Abuse	Post Grad Cert.	
2017	2018	Postgraduate Certificate in Advancing Healthcare Practice	MSc	The Open University
2017	2018	Primary Education	PGCE	Bath Spa University
2017	2018	Primary Modular PGCE	PGCE	Canterbury Christ Church University
2017	2018	Primary Modular PGCE	PGCE	Canterbury Christ Church University
2017	2018	Primary PE Specialism	PGCE with QTS	St Mary's University, Twickenham
2016	2019	Professional Computing	MSc	Staffordshire University
2017	2022	Professional Doctorate	DProf	University of Sunderland
2015	2018	Professional Practice in Arts	BA	Middlesex University London
2015	2018	Psychology	BSc	Cardiff Metropolitan University
2016	2019	Psychology	BSc	The University of Derby
2017	2019	Psychology	BSc	The Open University
2015	2021	Psychology with Counselling	BSc	The Open University
2017	2019	Quadrilingue	MA	Universite Sorbonne Nouvelle, Paris
2015	2018	Real Estate	BSc	University of the West of England , UWE
2014	2018	Research Life Sciences	Mphil/PhD	University of Westminster
2017	2018	Safe and Accepting Schools/Teaching students with communication needs (learning disability)/Teaching students with behavioural needs/Special Education Part1/Teaching Students with Communication Needs (Autism Spectrum Disorders)	AQ/ABQ Courses	Queens University
2017	2019	Social Work	MA	Liverpool John Moores University
2016	2021	Socio Economics	PhD	University of Gibraltar
2014	2018	Sport, fitness & coaching	BSc	The Open University
2016	2019	Sports and Physical Education	BSc	Liverpool Hope University
2017	2019	Sports Coaching	FdA	Leeds City College
2017	2018	STCW Basic Safety Training	STCW	All Abroad Sailing Academy
2016	2019	Theatre Arts (Prop & Special Effects)	BA (Hons)	Greater Brighton Metropolitan College, MET
2017	2019	Theology & Christian Ministry	MA	San Franciscan University of Steubenville
2017	2020	Trichology	Diploma	The Trichology Society
2015	2021	Youth Work	BA	The Open University

**Q349-357/2018**

**New schools –**

**Location; contract; classrooms; total area; cost;  
teacher support; traffic; evacuation and collection points**

**Clerk:** Question 349. The Hon. E J Reyes.

630 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, given the strong opposition expressed by the majority of the  
teaching profession in respect of the closeness of location of the two new co-educational  
secondary schools, is Government now reconsidering the sites where the new schools will be  
built?

635 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and  
Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):**  
Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 350 to 357.

640 **Clerk:** Question 350. The Hon. R M Clinton.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, further to Q39/2018, can the Government advise the  
monetary value of the contract awarded to GJBS for the construction of Notre Dame School?

645 **Clerk:** Question 351. The Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** How many classrooms will the two new proposed comprehensive schools  
contain?

650 **Clerk:** Question 352. The Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** What will be the total constructed area in square metres of each of the  
two proposed new comprehensive schools?

655 **Clerk:** Question 353. The Hon. D A Feetham.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Does the price of £52 million, announced by the Government for the  
construction of the two new schools in the area of Waterport terraces, include all necessary  
internal fittings such as would render those schools fully functioning?

660 **Clerk:** Question 354. The Hon. L F Llamas.

**Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, is the Government satisfied it has the support of the secondary  
education teaching fraternity in developing the two secondary schools as outlined in their plans?

665 **Clerk:** Question 355. The Hon. L F Llamas.

**Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide an update to Question 711/2017?

670 **Clerk:** Question 356. The Hon. L F Llamas.

**Hon. L F Llamas:** Further to Question 222/2018, can the Government update this House with the latest information relating to traffic assessments in connection to the new schools?

675 **Clerk:** Question 357. The Hon. L F Llamas.

**Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, further to Question 229/2018, can the Government update this House with the latest information relating to the evacuation and collection points for the new schools?

680

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):**  
685 Mr Speaker, the location is not being reconsidered and a contract has been awarded for the schools' design and build.

685

Some secondary school teachers from Westside have raised questions on the location of their new school and other aspects of the educational reform proposed, which the Chief Minister addressed yesterday at a meeting with them. The issues raised can be mitigated in full consultation with the professionals. We have no doubt that the staff in secondary education will be extremely happy with the finished product. Children will be delighted to see the facilities we will provide.

690

In relation to Notre Dame, in view of the fact that we will shortly be inviting proposals for similar schools, this information cannot yet be made public.

695

In answer to Question 351, 60 classrooms for Bayside and 60 classrooms for Westside.

In relation to the surface area, Bayside will have 23,623 m<sup>2</sup> and Westside 24,883.5 m<sup>2</sup>.

The provision of fixtures, fittings and equipment (FFE) as well as the provision ICT equipment are excluded from the contract awarded for the construction of the new schools at Waterport.

In relation to Question 355, there is no change to the stated position.

700

Discussions continue with the Ministry for Traffic.

In relation to Question 357, this matter is under consideration, as stated in my reply to a similar question at the last sitting.

705

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, specifically on Question 351, the Minister indicated that each of the two schools would have 60 classrooms. Is that figure of 60 inclusive or not inclusive of specialist rooms – for example, a science laboratory, or a kitchen in respect of home economics and so on?

710

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, that is exclusive of specialist rooms; that is basic classrooms.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, on my specific Question 349 the Minister said that the location is not being reconsidered and I believe he has now indicated that the Chief Minister met with the teaching fraternity yesterday, so more so in light of whatever may have happened or the exchanges with the Chief Minister yesterday.

715

I do not think there was any specific reply to Question 354, which I know pertains to Mr Llamas but he is asking is the Government satisfied it has the support of the secondary education teaching fraternity.

720

**Hon Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, I think I did answer. I said that there were secondary school teachers, particularly in Westside, who have raised questions. I have said that the Chief Minister at the meeting yesterday, which I was very pleased to accompany him to, addressed these issues, that they will be mitigated in full consultation and that we have no doubt that at the end

of the process the staff in secondary education – not just teachers but other staff in the education system – will be extremely happy.

725

**Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, is the Government satisfied, given that they are still undergoing traffic assessments and evacuation and collection points for the schools, that the locations of these schools will not actually provide any issues moving forward, given that they are located in a difficult area of Gibraltar with cruise passenger traffic and things like that?

730

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Yes, Mr Speaker.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, if I can take the Minister to his answer to Question 350, which is following up on previous Question 39, for the Minister to say this cannot yet be public, and yet obviously the building is going up, GJBS has been awarded the contract ... He comes to this House and says this cannot yet be made public, and yet on 23rd April of this year the Government is happy to announce the cost of the construction of two comprehensive schools at £52,208,375. Could the Minister please explain to me what is the difference and why is it that he can announce the contract cost awarded to Casais but not to GJBS?

740

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Absolutely, Mr Speaker. They are very different. Comprehensive schools and first schools are very different in their requirements, in their extent, in the number of specialist rooms. They are completely different animals and therefore you cannot compare and you cannot even calculate by approximation even ... Based on what we have stated quite openly and transparently on the cost of the construction of the comprehensive school, you cannot get the slightest inkling of how much a primary school would cost.

We are about to go out and look at awarding a contract on the next primary – middle school as opposed to first school, but it is more similar to a first school than it is to a comprehensive school – and shortly we will be having to deal with another first school which will be very similar in content, maybe not in layout, to the one that we have just awarded. If we go out to a competitive process, we have already said how much we are paying for this one. That might prejudice the issue and I would rather not give any hints to the people who are going to compete in order to be able to make the best use of taxpayers' money.

750

So they are very different and that is the explanation.

755

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I would accept the Minister's explanation if he were building standardised schools across a huge country, but I am sure each school will have its own design requirements and each school will have a different size, so we are not talking about standardised units of school. So I really do not follow his logic that he cannot explain or give information to this House about a contract that has obviously patently already been awarded and is under construction. These are not going to be modularised school units that are going to be rolled out across Gibraltar; each one is going to be different. So why can't he just give us the cost information for this one?

760

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, they are going to be different but the basic content will be very similar. The contractors would speak to each other and it is not in the interest of the taxpayer to reveal how much we are going to be spending on one school when we are about to put out a process of asking for bids for other schools which are not identical at all but similar. We think that this would not be in the best interests of obtaining a reasonable cost which is in the interest of the taxpayer.

770

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can I then ask the Minister: the contracts that he has ... well, certainly the one he has already awarded to GJBS and the ones he intends to seek tenders for,

775 do those include ICT fitting out and other fixtures and fittings which he obviously has not included for the comprehensives?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, there is an allowance within that for fixtures and fittings, which has been allowed. So there is an allowance for it.

780 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Minister explain why the difference in procedure behind these schools and the comprehensives – as to why, obviously the comprehensives being a much more complex project, it did not include ICT and FFE?

785 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Precisely because of the complexity and precisely because it was felt that it was in the Government's interest to have a more direct ability to decide and determine, in consultation and within the Department of Education, what is required. It is a much more complex building that we felt was better treated in that way.

790 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, in which case, can I ask the Minister: how does he intend to deal with those aspects, given that he will then inherit a shell of a building? Does he intend to go out to separate tender on this, or is he going to be speaking effectively to the same contractor once he has made up his mind what he wants in the school?

795 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, there will not be a shell of a building. This is a process that is concurrent. There is a process. There is a board, which I chair, which is leading on these projects. We have expertise which we can call on and there will be aspects that will have to be contracted out, absolutely, but this is all the work that is going to be undertaken. It is not that we are going to get an empty shell.

800 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Just related to these questions and related to the original question that I asked about what was actually included in the price of £52 million, can the Government confirm that when this went out to tender the original tender included things such as ICT and what the Government has done is ... subsequent to the tender actually going out, there has been a cutback in the amount that people have been asked to provide; hence why the price has actually  
805 come down?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, when it went out to the competitive process the competitive bids came in for different elements. It was decided to not incorporate this in this tender, but that does not mean that the building will not be fully fitted as will be required. So that will be  
810 done.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, but I am getting to a different point. If you go out to tender on one basis, in other words almost a turnkey operation – you are building the school, you are including all the equipment within it – a contractor comes back and he bids for that, but then after  
815 tenders have closed there is a scaling back. When you compare, say for example, £52 million in relation to Casais, it may not be comparable to what other companies have actually bid because of course they are tendering for more to be included within the works that they are doing. That is what I am asking the Hon. Minister.

820 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, there would have been an identical process regardless who the successful bidder would have been.

825 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I do not know whether it is helpful to the hon. Gentleman, but the prices are broken down between construction and the other elements, so you could easily compare the bit that you were deciding to proceed with, were precise on, to the bits that others had submitted for exactly the same works. So you were comparing like with like across the board.

830 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can I then ask the Chief Minister, in terms of the analysis he has obviously had on the tender, what was the amount that has now been excluded in respect of ICT and fixtures and fittings? How much is that going to cost?

835 **Hon. Chief Minister:** That is a question of which he should give specific notice.

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, just one question on this, and hopefully a simple question that results in a simple answer from the Minister for Education. In the press release of 23rd April, the Chief Minister described this as an unprecedented investment in the education of our children. What I am asking is that when headmasters open these two schools on whatever day – the Day – will it cost us £52 million or will it cost us more? That is the simple answer. A fully functional school: does it cost us £52 million on the day of opening, or will it cost us any more?

845 **Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Clearly, Mr Speaker, if the cost does not include fixtures and fittings there will be an additional element of fixtures and fittings. That is clear from your questioning. Even the questions you have asked made it clear that there will be provision for fixtures and fittings.

850 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, and it may well be £5 million, £10 million or £20 million, or whatever, but let me just draw the Minister's attention and, if I may, be granted a little bit of indulgence because I am going to quote square metre prices in terms of other projects and then I am going to ask the Hon. Minister a supplementary.

Here, based on the square metreage that the Hon. Minister has given me in answer to my question and based on the price of £52 million, this is going to cost just over £1,000 per m<sup>2</sup>. This is the price of this particular project, all right?

855 If you look at the Law Courts project – a complicated project; it is a complicated site – that was £3,000 per m<sup>2</sup>. If you look at the catering facility in St Bernard's Hospital, that was £5,000 per m<sup>2</sup>. If you look at St Bernard's School – again, more complicated, I agree, but still £7,000 per m<sup>2</sup>. If you look at the work on Loreto which was undertaken when we were in Government, £1,800 per m<sup>2</sup>. If you look at the Jewish School, which was work that was done in eight weeks, that was £2,000 per m<sup>2</sup>. Actually, low-cost housing is round about £1,200 to 860 £1,300 per m<sup>2</sup>.

This looks pretty low per square metre in comparison – and I have come prepared because I have done my homework in terms of other Government projects that have taken place here in Gibraltar. Can the Minister say to this House that he really feels very confident that this is going to come in at just over £1,000 per m<sup>2</sup>?

865 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, yes, sir, and I expect that when it does come in at that price, or if it deviates because there is good reason during the course of the works to make a decision that changes the cost in some way which we do not anticipate, I expect the hon. Members will want to congratulate us for having been able to deliver a project which will be a magnificent – at last – new set of secondary schools for Gibraltar's children on price, on budget and on time.

870 And then it will be very helpful indeed that the hon. Gentleman has done the homework that he tells us he has done, although of course I never accept his figures and will go and check them myself because I will then be able to come back and say that our Government, eight years later,



875 has delivered those two new schools for much less than they were able to deliver some of the projects that he referred to.

Indeed, given that he has thrown down the gauntlet, I dare say that at £84 million the Airport cost £2,400 per m<sup>2</sup>. I think there is a demonstration there of the Government's ability to deliver for the right price, of the fact that we have delivered a contract price which is good for the taxpayer and which will be producing the product that we all expect for our children. I am not going to bother calculating what the Theatre Royal cost per square meter because that was £10 million and we do not have a theatre: I think that means it was £10 million for no square metres.

880  
885 But in the context of what we are doing now, Mr Speaker, I think this is exactly the right way to be negotiating for the Gibraltar taxpayer to be getting the best possible deal and to deliver the best possible product for our children.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can I ask the Chief Minister if the Government is paying a premium – because of the haste at which this project is progressing – to have it completed by September 2019; and if perhaps he did not have such an ambitious timeframe, we could have got a better price for this project?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I really do not know whether the fracturing on the Opposition benches is worse than even I imagined, because we seem to have been told a moment ago that it was too cheap to be realistic, whilst the hon. Gentleman seems to be implying in the thrust of his question that it is too expensive because of the timescale.

895 There is, as far as we are concerned, no premium relating to the speed with which the project will be completed. If there were, it would be included in the per metre that the hon. Gentleman has indicated is already much lower than in some of the other projects that he referred to.

900 It would appear, for example, that there might have been a premium paid for the completion of the Law Courts, because I still remember people complaining about works going on late into the evening before the 2011 General Election.

It would appear there was a premium payable in respect of the completion of the Airport, because I remember being thrown off the side of the site – and I had to insist on my right to be there – whilst I was photographing works going on at midnight at Gibraltar Airport. Indeed, there were certificates granted after resolutions of this House to allow 24-hour working at the Airport, so I suppose that the huge cost of the existing terminal, which went up from £20 million to £84 million by the time of completion, includes an element of that premium.

910 But no, Mr Speaker, in the context of this contract price there is no premium being paid separately in order to ensure delivery of the schools in keeping with our manifesto commitments or indeed in order to achieve the timetable that hon. Members were chiding us and challenging us to achieve before they realised we could achieve it, at which moment they turned from chiding and challenging us to achieve it to telling us that we were going too fast and that we should slow down. You could not make it up.

915 I would say that they are trying to hunt with the hares and run with the hounds –

**Hon. D A Feetham:** I think it's the other way round!

920 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Or the other way round, run with the hares and hunt with the hounds. I am grateful to the hon. Gentleman for pointing that out, but I think it is more likely a case of trying to hunt with the wolves and run with the hounds, given the analogies that we have been given of how the alien resurrection we have before us has come about.

925 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I will probably be whistling in the wind before I get a straight answer from the Chief Minister, but does he not accept that having workers working on May Day, when they should be on holiday –?

**Mr Speaker:** No, that is totally irrelevant.

930 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Well, if you will let me finish what I am saying, Mr Speaker, you might see the relevance.

**Mr Speaker:** I will rule it out of order immediately.

935 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Well, fine, but let me finish.

**Mr Speaker:** If you insist, go on.

940 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Thank you. And having workers starting at eight o'clock in the morning in that area must indicate there is obviously a haste about the project – and that comes at a price.

**Mr Speaker:** The Hon. Chief Minister does not have to answer that question if he does not want to.

945 **Hon. Chief Minister:** I am grateful, Mr Speaker.

Many people work on Mayday. Mayday is not a day when shops are required to close. Even though we declared it a bank holiday, when they were in Government they changed it from 1st May to any other bank holiday weekend. Indeed, there was work on bank holidays on many of the projects which they ran and there is work on bank holiday on many of the projects that we run.

950 I think it is important to point out to the hon. Gentleman – who has obviously never been on a construction site and never dirtied his *Financial Times* toting hands with bricks or cement or anything like that – that work on construction sites starts everywhere between seven and eight in the morning. It is a working day for a person who works on a construction site. That is not unusual. If that is what he thought we would pay extra for, he has got it completely wrong. He needs to go back and consult his textbook about what construction is all about.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can I alternate from my fellow wolf to my right and attempt to take a nibble out of the Chief Minister myself a little bit?

960 What the hon. Gentleman has said in answer to my previous supplementary and also the answer that he has given to the Hon. Mr Clinton as well just does not assuage my own concerns that £52 million is an under price for this particular project.

965 The Hon. the Chief Minister in answer to me said, 'But the Airport cost £2,400.' Actually, yes, absolutely. If you look at the comparators of Government projects, all the ones that I have cited, the ones that the Chief Minister has cited, they have never come in at £1,069 per m<sup>2</sup>. If you then add on top of that the point that has been made by the Hon. Mr Clinton, which is that there is undoubtedly a haste in relation to this particular project because the Government is going to want to deliver it within the 18 months that it said that it was going to deliver it – and we all know, and certainly I was very hands on in relation to the projects that I was involved in, we all know that if there is haste it comes at a premium, it comes at an increased price, and therefore this price of £52 million appears to us, or it certainly appears to me, to be a very unrealistic price. When you then add on to that the fact that today we have found out that this is not a turnkey operation, that this is effectively ... I am not going to describe it as the shell because I think that that would be a disservice to the Hon. Minister, but certainly it has got to be equipped

975 on the inside and that is going to cost also a significant amount of money, which I believe is probably going to be around the figure of £7 million or £8 million. But in any event, when you add all those factors, does he not agree with me that it is going to come back for the taxpayer at considerably more than just simply £1,069 per m<sup>2</sup>?

980 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, no, Mr Speaker, but –

**Mr Speaker:** Let me intervene here. We are now getting a debate. Questions have been asked: what is the area of the comprehensive school? We know from the press release issued by Government that £52 million is the cost and comparisons are being made about the cost, when  
985 the GSD were in Government, of various projects and so on, and we are now getting a debate about whether the cost of £52 million is realistic or not.

This is not a matter for this House at this juncture. Question Time is about seeking information, it is about asking the Government to adopt certain policies, urging the Government to adopt certain courses of action. It is not about debating whether a tender price is realistic or  
990 is not realistic. That is the expression of opinions and it becomes a debate.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, may I –?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, may I just deal with the points that the hon. Gentleman has  
995 raised? I think it is important that I do because he has raised them and therefore I think this community deserves that I should address them.

It deserves that I should address them because this is the first time, I think, in the history of this Parliament that an Opposition has urged the Government to pay more for something, which is in effect what the hon. Gentleman is doing. (**Hon. D A Feetham:** No.) He is urging price  
1000 inflation for all those who in future submit a tender or a competitive bid to the Government. That, Mr Speaker, is remarkably dangerous, in my view, and it is not in the interest of the taxpayer. It is an attempt to cover their own obvious shame at the huge cost that they paid for some of their projects.

If there was a particular contract in the history of Gibraltar that was granted at an under  
1005 value, it is obviously the tunnel contract, which was granted at £30 million. You could not find a tunnel in the world, of the sorts of characteristics that we were dealing with here, that could be completed at that price. Result? What the Hon. the now back-in-the-fold Mr Bossino referred to when he was here as a then member of the then GSD – I really do not know what I am looking at now – was the golden legacy of the GSD. The golden legacy of the GSD was the litigation in  
1010 respect of the tunnel under the runway, which cost millions. That was a contract awarded at an under value, not to say anything about the loan lost to OEM in respect of the projects that they were undertaking at Cumberland – all moneys lost and litigation incurred under the GSD.

But, Mr Speaker, we are talking about a company, in Casais, that has submitted a price to the Government in Gibraltar which the Government has accepted, based in particular of course on  
1015 the track record of that company of delivering for Government and to private sector companies on price, on budget and on time. The hon. Gentleman seems to be ready to carve out the excuse for them not to complete on budget and on time and to return to the negotiating table and ask the Government for more, ask the taxpayer for more money. How are they representing the interests of the taxpayer in doing that? It makes absolutely no sense.

But I will tell him why it is that GJBS costs more in many projects. The men and women of Gibraltar Joinery and Building Services, who are of a company the shares of which are owned by the Government, whom we have the highest regard for, who do some of the best work that the Government undertakes, were subjected to the gift of a 16% pay rise after the election had been  
1020 called in 2011, and in that way –

1025

**Mr Speaker:** No, no. I must interrupt. This is getting completely out of hand and I am not going to have it, Chief Minister. I have given you an opportunity to reply. Reply, but within the parameters of the subject of the question, please.

1030 **Hon. Chief Minister:** No, Mr Speaker, I will tell you – with the greatest of respect, as usual – why this is in the context of the parameters of the question: because the hon. Member has used price per square metre of GJBS. That is why it is within the parameters of the question.

The price per square metre of GJBS is subjected to a 16% increase in the cost of direct labour to GJBS by the former Chief Minister turning up at the lot where GJBS do their business after the  
1035 election had been called and announcing a 16% increase in salary. All of those things go to the bottom line of what it costs to use a particular company and all of those things have led to price inflation in this market. That is why this Government will fight for the best price for the taxpayer.

Hon. Members opposite should realise what they are doing. They should give some thought to what they have done today and the public should know that the Government will, despite  
1040 that, resist any attempt by any contractor in Gibraltar to take the taxpayer for more than he should be paying for any project and we shall ensure that we always get the best value for money. And if there was ever any evidence of the fact that we do that, I want to thank the hon. Gentleman for the homework that he says he has done, which absolutely demonstrates it beyond peradventure.

1045 And, by the way, it is pronounced ‘assuage’.

**Mr Speaker** One last supplementary.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** Yes, Mr Speaker, just addressing the point and then we will move on.

1050 With respect to Mr Speaker and the point that Mr Speaker made earlier – and I just make this point because it may arise in the future – it is perfectly within the remit of an Opposition and the function of an Opposition within the context of Question and Answer sessions to hold the Government to account as to whether they are going to be able to keep to a particular price that they have announced for a particular project. Hence why I have come to this House today very  
1055 well prepared in terms of comparables with other projects, and that is why I have asked –

**Mr Speaker:** The hon. Member knows perfectly well that with all of that information that he has he would not be allowed in any other parliament in Western Europe to do what he is doing today and for the Chief Minister then to engage in a debate. It would not happen during  
1060 Question Time. That is clear. That is as clear as can be. I have seen footage of Winston Churchill being called to order during Question Time because he was introducing matters more appropriate to a debate. Hon. Members do it here very often, in spite of what I say. They get away with it – most of the time they get away with it; I allow them to get away with it most of the time.

1065 It has been a very simple question. The area of the two schools has been asked for and been confirmed, we know the cost, and what happens is that information is then used for a debate lasting nearly half an hour. I am not stopping hon. Members from debating: bring a motion and debate it. You are going to have an opportunity during the debate on the Estimates. Surely education is going to figure very prominently in that, so I am not depriving you. By all means  
1070 raise the matter, but under Question Time you have to be specific.

You have been getting away with it for many years and, much as I have tried over the last five years, I do not think I am successful, particularly where the Chief Minister is concerned and where the Hon. Mr Daniel Feetham is concerned. You are the two who do it all the time. Now it is happening less because you are no longer Leader of the Opposition, but when you are here  
1075 and when you intervene in the exchanges it happens once again – and I am getting a little bit tired, honestly, so –

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, can I –

1080 **Mr Speaker:** I will allow you a supplementary, I will allow the Chief Minister to answer – then we are moving on to the next question on the Agenda.

1085 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am not going to say he started it; *(Laughter)* what I wanted to say was that I think you are absolutely right and I did not want my intervention to seem that we were somehow challenging your ruling. We are not. My only concern is that once the hon. Member has been allowed to raise those issues it must be right that the Government must then be able to respond. Otherwise, we are left with the pregnant pause of issues put in question and the answer not being put.

1090 **Mr Speaker:** And I do allow you to –

**Hon. Chief Minister:** And I wanted to signify –

**Mr Speaker:** Generally you continue to act on each other symbiotically.

1095 **Hon. Chief Minister:** I wanted to just thank you for giving us the leeway to do that and to just say to hon. Members that we would welcome if they wanted to have a debate on the subject, if they want to put a motion on the subject – of course we would.

1100 We certainly agree with Mr Speaker that we sometimes are allowed on both sides much more leeway in respect of questions than would be the case in any other parliament, which is probably why, in the context of this Parliament, Question Time takes longer than motions and Bills for debate etc.

**Mr Speaker:** Do you have another supplementary – a relevant supplementary?

1105 **Hon. D A Feetham:** No, Mr Speaker. We can move on.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q358/2018**  
**New secondary schools –**  
**Compliance with EU law**

**Clerk:** Question 358. The Hon. L F Llamas.

1110 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government explain why it has not complied with EU law when contracting for the new secondary schools?

1115 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, all principles and obligations of EU law and Gibraltar laws have been fully complied with when contracting for the new secondary schools.

1120 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, my understanding from a document circulated in this House – and from EU law, which I have also researched – is that any works contracted by Government exceeding £4 million should, and have to be subjected to an EU tender process in the same way as the Hon. Minister did for the public cleaning contract when that exceeded €134,000.

1125 Therefore, I am at a loss as to how the Hon. Minister can say that we are complying with EU directives but on the other hand it seems that we are not. Can the Hon. Minister please clarify that position?

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, this contract has been procured through a Government company.

1130 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, could the Hon. Chief Minister please expand on how that works? Obviously Casais is not a Government-owned company, so if the Hon. Chief Minister could explain the process that has led to this contract being allocated.

1135 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I have not told him that Casais is a Government company; I have told him that the contract has been procured through a Government company.

**Hon. L F Llamas:** So could the Hon. Chief Minister explain the process: which Government-owned company procured the contract and how that process was derived?

1140 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I do not think that arises. The simple principle is that the EU procurement rules do not apply to procurement by Government companies. It is something that was established at the time that hon. Members were in office. In fact, I have the opinion that was left behind by them telling us exactly that.

1145 **Hon. L F Llamas:** So, on that basis, Mr Speaker, how does the Government justify not using the same loophole with the public service contract that they say that the contract did have to go out to the EU tender process?

1150 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, it is not a loophole, Mr Speaker; it is a straightforward different type of contract. One is the Government contract for cleaning and this is a contract through a Government company that is going to own the property when it is built.

So it is not a question of loopholes; it is a question of correctly applying EU law in the proper way in the context of each of the particular instances that we are dealing with.

1155 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, the Chief Minister has just said something which has sparked my interest, and that is that the Government-owned company will own the building on the land. Would the Chief Minister be willing to ...? I guess he is going to say the question does not arise. He is not willing to disclose the name of the company that has been doing the procurement, but  
1160 if I came to this House with a question, would he be willing to give an answer as to which company is doing the procurement and what land it owns, in terms of our schools?

**Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, I do not have that information here with me and it does not arise from the question.

1165 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q359/2018**  
**Portakabin classrooms –**  
**Number and location**

**Clerk:** Question 359. The Hon. L F Llamas.

1170 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, since December 2011, can the Government provide for each academic year how many classrooms are being conducted in portakabins and the schools they relate to?

1175 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the number of classes conducted in portakabins since December 2011 is as follows. Gibraltar College: two classroom portakabins that have been used continuously since December 2011.

1180 St Martin's Special School: two classroom portakabins, ground floor installed in August 2016 and first floor in August 2017 and in use since installation.

1185 Bishop Fitzgerald School: four classroom portakabins and one small soft room portakabin. Three portakabins predate December 2011 and have been in use continuously since they were installed. The soft room portakabin was installed in August 2016 and is used as and when needed by the Learning Support Facilities Unit. The fourth portakabin classroom was installed in August 2017 and has been in use since installation.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q360/2018**  
**Special Educational Needs –**  
**Support for students into adulthood**

1190 **Clerk:** Question 360. The Hon. L F Llamas.

**Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide an updated schedule to table ED8, together with details on the policy and work being deployed to support these pupils into adulthood?

1195 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, the next update for this table is expected in July.

1200 Pupils with SEN are supported in our schools in a variety of ways. The curriculum in our schools allows these students to develop life skills that are important for them as they move into adulthood. Pupils receive career advice and additional work placement opportunities to allow them to develop skills that make them employable young adults. Pupils are carefully transitioned from the secondary school environment to the Gibraltar College, making use of familiarisation visits. Additionally, students at St Martin's are transitioned to St Bernadette's or into employment.

1205

**Q361/2018**  
**Pupils attending schools –**  
**Updated schedule**

**Clerk:** Question 361. The Hon. L F Llamas.

**Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government provide updated schedules, for the academic years 2012-13, 2013-14, 2014-15, 2015-16, 2016-17 and 2017-18, of pupils attending schools in the same format and detail as it provided in tables labelled ED9, ED10, ED11, ED14 during the 2011 publication of statistics on the Government website?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education.

**Minister for the Environment, Energy, Climate Change and Education (Hon. Dr J E Cortes):** Mr Speaker, I have handed over a schedule containing the information requested for ED9/10/11 for the academic years 2012-13 to 2017-18. The schedule additionally contains the information on ED14 for 2017-18.

There has been a change in the way that the data from ED9/10/11 has been processed within that timeframe. However, the hon. Member will see that the schedule provided gives him the snapshot of information that he would have obtained from ED9/10/11.

Mr Speaker, I have no doubt that this will take a little bit of time to digest.

Answer to Question 361

**Pupils per Year in Gibraltar Schools: 2012/13**

School Name	School Year																	2012/13														
	N		R		1		2		3		4		5		6		7		8		9		10		11		12		13			
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F		
St Josephs First	39	37	39	35	42	49	37	54	60	51																						
St Mary's First			23	27	23	20	21	21	17	25																						
St Paul's First			36	38	36	39	38	24	38	41																						
St Bernard's First	18	16	14	10	11	14	14	14	14	15																						
Governor's Meadow	25	17	37	34	29	22	34	34	32	30																						
Notre Dame			30	41	37	27	34	23	35	27																						
Hebrew Primary			6	12	13	9	9	11	6	17	12	8	9	12	8	7	9	12														
St Martin's Special	10	4																													26	6
Bishop Fitzgerald									47	52	64	39	52	63	69	56																
St Anne's									62	52	50	45	61	41	53	51																
Sacred Heart Middle									34	30	22	30	22	19	29	27																
St Joseph's Middle									45	54	54	40	42	52	60	54																
Westside																	185	179	220	209	116	98										
Bayside																	229	213	232	203	123	100										

**Pupils per Year in Gibraltar Schools: 2013/14**

School Name	School Year																	2013/14														
	N		R		1		2		3		4		5		6		7		8		9		10		11		12		13			
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F		
St Josephs First	42	42	55	35	45	41	45	50	55	37																						
St Mary's First	29	23	28	28	25	28	27	18	21	21																						
St Paul's First	20	21	32	35	37	40	37	39	40	25																						
St Bernard's First	25	9	18	14	16	11	15	15	15	17																						
Governor's Meadow	27	32	33	32	37	33	29	23	32	30																						
Notre Dame	24	36	32	29	32	44	38	27	31	22																						
Hebrew Primary			9	13	5	10	13	8	7	10	5	14	13	7	8	13																
St Martin's Special	12	3																													22	11
Bishop Fitzgerald									48	50	48	53	64	38	55	63																
St Anne's									60	47	60	59	48	40	59	42																
Sacred Heart Middle									33	35	37	33	22	29	27	20																
St Joseph's Middle									56	52	47	55	53	41	42	54																
Westside																	227	184	194	210	150	96										
Bayside																	223	230	223	218	142	100										





Continued answer to Question 361

Pupils per Year in Gibraltar Schools: 2017/18

School Name	School Year																																			
	N		R		1		2		3		4		5		6		7		8		9		10		11		12		13		2017/18					
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F				
St Josephs First	44	41	34	44	52	42	47	53	54	54																										
St Mary's First	11	21	24	17	23	18	25	28	43	31																										
St Paul's First	20	20	33	40	40	43	29	30	35	43																										
St Bernard's First	21	20	26	17	22	14	22	24	32	13																										
Governor's Meadow	31	11	39	34	35	28	38	29	40	37																										
Notre Dame			39	28	47	44	33	34	43	41																										
Hebrew Primary			9	8	12	9	5	12	7	9	9	17	4	8	10	6	9	9																		
St Martin's Special	11	5																																		
Bishop Fitzgerald											66	44	56	64	53	48	57	44																		
St Anne's											57	49	53	61	65	40	48	43																		
St Bernard's Middle											40	46	37	36	43	41	34	37																		
St Joseph's Middle											59	49	51	46	45	43	44	51																		
Westside																			196		201		167		182		179		118							
Bayside																			216		214		190		182		157		129							

Classes per Year in Gibraltar Schools: 2012/13

School Name	School Year								
	N	R	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
St Josephs First	2	4	5	5	5				
St Mary's First	1	3	2	2	2				
St Paul's First	2	4	4	3	4				
St Bernard's First	1	2	2	2	2				
Governor's Meadow	2	3	3	3	3				
Notre Dame	2	3	3	3	3				
Hebrew Primary		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Bishop Fitzgerald						4	4	5	5
St Anne's						5	4	4	4
Sacred Heart Middle						3	3	2	3
St Joseph's Middle						4	4	5	4

Classes per Year in Gibraltar Schools: 2013/14

School Name	School Year								
	N	R	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
St Josephs First	2	4	4	5	4				
St Mary's First	1	3	3	2	2				
St Paul's First	2	4	4	3	4				
St Bernard's First	1	2	2	2	2				
Governor's Meadow	2	3	4	3	3				
Notre Dame	1	3	4	3	3				
Hebrew Primary		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	0
Bishop Fitzgerald						4	4	5	5
St Anne's						5	4	4	4
Sacred Heart Middle						4	3	2	3
St Joseph's Middle						4	4	4	5

Continued answer to Question 361/2018

**Classes per Year in Gibraltar Schools: 2014/15**

School Name	School Year								
	N	R	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
St Josephs First	2	5	5	4	5				
St Mary's First	1	4	3	3	2				
St Paul's First	1	4	4	4	4				
St Bernard's First	1	2	2	2	2				
Governor's Meadow	2	4	3	4	3				
Notre Dame	2	4	3	4	3				
Hebrew Primary		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Bishop Fitzgerald						4	4	4	4
St Anne's						4	5	5	4
Sacred Heart Middle						3	4	3	3
St Joseph's Middle						4	5	4	4

**Classes per Year in Gibraltar Schools: 2015/16**

School Name	School Year								
	N	R	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
St Josephs First	2	5	5	5	4				
St Mary's First	1	3	4	3	3				
St Paul's First	2	3	4	4	4				
St Bernard's First	1	2	2	2	2				
Governor's Meadow	2	3	4	3	4				
Notre Dame	2	3	3	4	3				
Hebrew Primary		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Bishop Fitzgerald						4	4	4	4
St Anne's						5	4	5	5
St Bernard's Middle						4	3	4	3
St Joseph's Middle						4	4	5	4

**Classes per Year in Gibraltar Schools: 2016/17**

School Name	School Year								
	N	R	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
St Josephs First	2	4	5	5	5				
St Mary's First	1	2	3	4	3				
St Paul's First	2	4	3	4	4				
St Bernard's First	1	2	2	2	2				
Governor's Meadow	2	3	3	4	3				
Notre Dame	2	4	3	4	3				
Hebrew Primary		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Bishop Fitzgerald						5	4	4	4
St Anne's						5	4	5	5
St Bernard's Middle						3	4	3	4
St Joseph's Middle						4	4	4	5

Continued answer to Question 361/2018

Classes per Year in Gibraltar Schools: 2017/18

School Name	School Year								
	N	R	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
St Josephs First	1	3	4	4	4				
St Mary's First	1	2	2	3	3				
St Paul's First	2	3	4	3	4				
St Bernard's First	1	2	2	2	2				
Governor's Meadow	2	3	3	3	4				
Notre Dame	2	3	4	3	4				
Hebrew Primary		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Bishop Fitzgerald						5	5	4	4
St Anne's						5	5	5	4
St Bernard's Middle						4	3	4	3
St Joseph's Middle						5	4	4	4

ED14: 2017/2018

Total number of students & school leavers for the academic year 2017/18		
Bayside School		
Year	Total number of students	Total number of students who left school this academic year
10	191	2
11	185	5
12	166	10
13	129	5
Total	671	22

Total number of students & school leavers for the academic year 2017/18		
Bayside School		
Year	Total number of students	Total number of students who left school this academic year
10	166	2
11	180	4
12	175	14
13	115	5
Total	636	25

1230 **Mr Speaker:** I believe the Hon. Mr Reyes has some supplementaries arising from the schedule to Question 328.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Yes, Mr Speaker. Thank you for that.

1235 Can I bring the Minister back to his answer on Question 348. I think it is a typographical error which the Minister might be able to update us with. Because the courses are listed in alphabetical order, it is easier for him to refer to the one I am referring to. There are three references being made to courses under the heading 'Graduate Diploma in Law'. The first one is BPP Law School, the second one is BPP University, London, and the third one has no institution identified. That could perhaps could just be a typographical error which the Minister can correct at some stage, so that it goes down correctly in *Hansard*.

1240 Likewise, on the following page, under a course entitled 'Postgraduate Certificate Mental Health & Substance Abuse', it says 'Post Grad Cert.' and no idea of the institution offering the course. Again, it just could be a simple error.

Other than those typographical figures, may I please ask the Minister, Mr Speaker ...? He may recall – I think it was probably sometime around Christmas – when I first started on a question similar to this, and I have even spoken behind the Speaker's Chair with the Minister on this issue. In respect of non-mandatory courses, there seems to have been a course that has been financed, hence the wording on my question was 'details of scholarships financed during the financial year'.

1250 There is a student who I believe is still of compulsory school age, who is being financed undertaking some sort of dance-related course – I believe it is in Canada – and it does not appear in the schedule. I know it cannot be a mandatory, so it must be non-mandatory. My question referred to other mandatory there. The Minister at some stage was trying to get the information. It does not appear here. Perhaps he has information – I even accept if he has to give it to me behind the Speaker's Chair, but I cannot let the occasion pass because then I will be stuck for six months before being able to pose anything similar.

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Mr Speaker, the Hon. Member knows and will accept that he does not have to wait six months to get an answer from me directly.

1260 On the two gaps in the table, it can only be that it is a typographical error, or maybe there is some information still missing, but I will endeavour to answer him very quickly.

The last time I asked on that particular student he was referring to, the reply I got was that that was actually not being financed at the time, so I can only assume that it still is not being financed. But I know the case he is referring to and I will ask again.

1265 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Because of my cordial relationship with the Minister, I accept for the record that at this particular stage he has got no teachers who are being financed. Does the Minister agree that as and when he gets an update and full confirmation, if it is being financed? It could be and he may have to point me in the direction if it is not being financed from an educational grant and from somewhere else. But if we can get to it, then it settles the matter in an amicable manner.

1270 Mr Speaker, can the Minister commit himself to continue co-operating with me on that issue?

**Hon. Dr J E Cortes:** Most certainly, Mr Speaker.

1275

**Mr Speaker:** Any supplementaries arising from the schedule to Question 361?

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, can I just make a point, because I think it is an important one?

1280 In the same way as in other parliaments we do not see supplementaries of the sort that we see here descending into debate, in other parliaments people who receive an answer which is statistical, if they wish to ask for that statistical information orally they are then required to ask a supplementary or they ask another question later.

1285 It is another indulgence of the Chair – for which we are all grateful, depending on what side we are sitting on – that people in this Parliament are able to look over the statistical information provided to them and come back later to ask a supplementary out of order. I think it should be recorded for the purposes of *Hansard* that this is an additional indulgence that we enjoy when we are Members of the Opposition in this Parliament. It would be unfair not to also have that clearly provided for. (*Interjection by Hon. D A Feetham*)

1290

**Mr Speaker:** Hon. Member, we did some research at the time of the Commission on Parliamentary Democracy. In most parliaments within the Commonwealth there are time limits to Question Time – an hour and a half, two hours, perhaps two or three times a week. There is a guillotine as well.

1295 And as for the number of supplementaries, well ...! If you look at the *Hansard* here you will find that Ministers are also to blame because they may answer a supplementary with four or five pages. That does not happen anywhere. It is something that has developed here in this Parliament and to the extent that sometimes that is necessary and may be relevant I do not have any problem. Where I do have a problem is when Members extend those exchanges and  
1300 effectively we get a debate which last 20 or 25 minutes. That, I think, is an abuse of Question Time.

Having said that, I think this is, because it is the end of questions on education, a very convenient moment to have a short break of 15 or 20 minutes. We shall have now a short recess.

*The House recessed at 4.45 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 5.11 p.m.*

## CULTURE, THE MEDIA, YOUTH AND SPORT

Q362/2018

Victoria Stadium –  
Lease payments

1305

**Clerk:** We resume with Question 362. The Hon. E J Reyes.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, further to the answer provided to Question 103/2018, can the Minister for Sports update this House with details of payments made by the Gibraltar Football Association in respect of the facilities which they lease at Victoria Stadium and which the  
1310 Minister stated would be paid within the 2017-18 financial year?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

**Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, a payment of £10 million was made by the Gibraltar Football Association during the last financial year  
1315 2017-18, as stated in my answer to Question 103/2018.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** If I recall, the Minister has previously stated the balance of the price was to be paid. Can he update this House on the timespan in which they have to pay now I think it is  
1320 another £6 million, or something like that?

**Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, as I have stated publicly before, the payments were to be to two instalments of £5 million in the financial year 2017-18 – i.e. they did pay the £10 million in one go – and the balance, which is £6.5 million, will be paid in the current year, the 2018-19  
1325 financial year.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1330 I am grateful to the Minister for his answer. Can the Minister advise the House if a sale agreement has been signed?

**Hon. S E Linares:** As I understand it, not yet.

1335 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can I ask the Minister, then, on what basis was the £10 million paid to the Government?

1340 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, this was done on the basis of a development licence. Because the GFA are now developing the area, they will be given a development licence and it will follow all the leases, and all the other documentation will also follow. So they have got a development licence.

1345 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, the £16½ million – the Minister may correct me – is the total purchase price for the stadium, of which the Minister has just advised the House £10 million is by way of development licence. In terms of stamp duty, has any stamp duty been paid in that £10 million, or will it be paid on final signing of the contract on the full £16½ million?

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I understand the position is that the full amount of the stamp duty is paid on completion of the conveyance, which is at the end of the process, when the lease is entered into.

#### Q363/2018

#### Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority – Update re vacant post

1350 **Clerk:** Question 363. The Hon. E J Reyes.

1355 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Further to the answer provided to Question 202/2018, can the Minister for Sport update this House in respect of the Grade 9 (Administrative Assistant) post which was vacant within the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority and being covered temporarily by a supply worker via S & K Recruitment?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

1360 **Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the post continues to be covered by a supply worker via S & K Recruitment. Government is working with the relevant unions to address how to agree to fill any vacant post permanently.

1365 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, the Minister has mentioned the unions in plural. That post probably pertained to one particular union as far as their union rights, but perhaps he can expand a bit more just to avoid my further doubts for future questions.

1370 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, some of the SLOs and some of the workers down below – I mean down below physically, not as in post – have changed unions. They are split into which union they belong to, so it will depend on which union. For example, this is an administrative post. I would suggest that it is the GGCA in bulk, but some of them have changed unions and therefore there is a bit of discrepancy and that is why I said ‘unions’ in plural.

1375 **Hon. E J Reyes:** But in previous questions, Mr Speaker, the Minister had told us that for some time he had been in discussions with the union – I interpreted it at the time to be one – in respect of what the staffing levels should be at GSLA and so on, and my interpretation was that that had been concluded, hence why certain posts came out. Am I right in saying that this is just the only issue left pending? But the other bulk review of the established posts, is that certainly settled, or are we back at the negotiating table with that?

1380 **Hon. S E Linares:** No, Mr Speaker. What I would like to remind the hon. Member is that any authority or agency that was set up by the previous administration does not have fixed manning levels, and therefore because there are not fixed manning levels we can then say whether we need it; that is the discussion that we have. And I insist on unions because it is to do with how many people we need on the administrative side or how many people we need on the industrial side.

**Q364/2018**

**Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority –  
Pool operative/lifeguard posts**

1385 **Clerk:** Question 364. The Hon. E J Reyes.

1390 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Further to the answer provided to Question 203/2018, can the Minister for Sports update this House in respect of the five staff vacancies for pool operative/lifeguard which are currently waiting to be filled on a substantive basis within the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority, indicating the start dates of employment in respect of the successful applicants?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

1395 **Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, all vacancies were filled, with the successful applicants starting employment on 1st April 2018.

As a result of the completion of this recruitment process, we have now addressed the historical staff shortages at the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority Swimming Pool Complex. In addition, it has also facilitated the opening of the facility seven days a week, offering an enhanced service to the general public.

1400 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q365/2018**

**Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority –  
Cancellations**

**Clerk:** Question 365. The Hon. E J Reyes.

1405 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Sports inform this House how many cancellations have been necessary at any of the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority's facilities since the answer provided to Question 204/2018, indicating the location, date and reason for the cancellation?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.



1410 **Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the following cancellations were necessary at the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority facilities since the answer provided to Question 204/2018.

Victoria Sports Hall – Tuesday, 10th April 2018 – water ingress.

1415 Accessible Swimming Pool – Thursday, 12th April to Friday, 13th April for a period of 24 hours; and from Thursday, 26th April to Friday, 27th April for a period of 24 hours. Both these occasions were due to human faecal incidents.

1420 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, in previous questions the Minister has provided a schedule of the cost of repair works to some facilities, including the sports hall, due to water ingress and so on. Is the Minister now in a position to say he is satisfied, save for minor discrepancies, that we seem to have tackled the bulk of the problem of the water ingress at the sports hall? It unfortunately keeps reoccurring. Neither he nor anyone at the stadium is to blame for the weather, but it certainly hinders the training purposes of the sportsmen, and more so when young children are involved and it does cause great disruption to parents.

1425 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, I am glad to say that the sports hall will soon not be the property of the Authority anyway, but we are satisfied at this time that we are trying to address the water ingress.

1430 The hon. Member alludes to the weather, but even leaving a window just slightly open will have water ingress. The roofs have been constantly maintained and looked after as best can be with a building that is now getting pretty old, but we will try and mitigate it as best we can. It is just one of those things that every time we fix it – and we are fixing it and we maintain it – there seems to be water coming in from parts that probably were not coming in before.

#### Q366/2018

#### Victoria stadium floodlights – Cost of power supply upgrade

**Clerk:** Question 366. The Hon. E J Reyes.

1435 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Further to the answer provided to Question 206 /2018, can the Minister for Sports provide details in respect of the cost for the supply and installation of a new switch fuse for the East Side pylons deemed necessary in order to up the power supply and cater for the floodlights to work at full capacity?

1440 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

1445 **Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the cost of this upgrade was met by the Gibraltar Football Association directly. Therefore, I cannot provide specific details of the cost of these works.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** I am glad to hear that, Mr Speaker, because last time obviously the Minister was not aware of what the costs were and so on. That seems to be good news and it may even pre-empt a bit the next question, but I will wait patiently before we table Question 367.

**Q367/2018**  
**Victoria Stadium floodlights –**  
**Responsibility for maintenance**

**Clerk:** Question 367. The Hon. E J Reyes.

1450

**Hon. E J Reyes:** The question proper, Mr Speaker: further to the answer provided to Question 206/2018, can the Minister for Sports now say where does the responsibility for maintenance of the floodlights at Victoria Stadium lie in the future?

1455

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

**Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, I find I could have answered these questions both together, but never mind.

1460

For the time being, the day to day maintenance contract remains with the Gibraltar Sports and Leisure Authority, with all major capital expenses met by the Gibraltar Football Association.

In future, all maintenance of what has become the Gibraltar Football Association's footprint will be dealt with directly by the Gibraltar Football Association.

1465

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, I think I understand that, but, let me clarify, in the last part he said that eventually, we are going to lead that all maintenance will be done by the GFA – so that means that the day to day running will not therefore fall under the GSLA; or is he just referring to the capital expenditure side? I am not entirely clear, so I would rather clarify it now.

1470

**Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, once the stadium – or the footprint of the Victoria Stadium part of the GFA – becomes completely part of the GFA, it will be up to the GFA how they will manage that.

The Sports and Leisure Authority now are managing it on a day to day basis while the transition period is ongoing, and then after that it will be up to the GFA how they wish to manage that.

1475

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q368/2018**  
**Cultural grants –**  
**Details of awards**

**Clerk:** Question 368. The Hon. E J Reyes.

1480

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Can the Minister for Culture provide updated consolidated details of all cultural grants awarded during the 2017-18 financial year?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

1485

**Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, I now hand over to the hon. Member opposite updated consolidated details of all cultural grants awarded during the 2017-18 financial year.

**Hon. S E Linares:** I take this opportunity to remind the hon. Member that updated information is posted on the HMGoG website and I believe it will also be on the culture.gi website.

1490 **Mr Speaker,** if I also could say to the Hon. Member that if he does have questions related to the whole schedule, I am willing to discuss it with him.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, the one that sticks out, and it may be worth ... so that the taxpayer knows, is the fifth one down, the Gibraltar National Dance Organisation. I am not  
1495 disputing the sum of £11,700, but that is in respect of International Dance Organisation affiliation fees/dance workshops. Is the affiliation fee per se a huge amount, or was it considered a worthwhile investment to forward the bulk of the money? By putting those two things together which are not workshop related and nothing to do with affiliation – it would be nice for the performing fraternity to know what are the affiliation fees and hence deduce what the  
1500 workshops investment was.

**Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, unfortunately, I have not got those details, but I am willing to pass it over or at least give the hon. Member all the details that are appertaining to that.

1505 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Answer to Question 368**

**CULTURAL GRANTS FOR FINANCIAL YEAR 2017-2018**

MH Bland & Co – Book Grant “What on Earth?” “The Story of Gibraltar”	5,000.00
Gibraltar Productions – Sponsorship for the Gib World Music Festival	50,000.00
State Media Ltd – The Art Bermondsey Project Space	4,000.00
M.O Productions – Organisation staging and production of the 16 <sup>th</sup> Gibraltar International Dance Festival	5,000.00
Gibraltar National Dance Organisation – GNDO for IDO affiliation fee/dance workshops	11,700.00
Bayside & Westside Drama Group to travel to Medway Theatre in Rochester, UK to participate in the Duncan Youth Festival	2,000.00
Urban Dance – support to cover costs of participation at the “Vive tu Sueno” European Dance finals in Paris	2,000.00
Gibraltar Face & Body paint Association – Assistance for the Gibraltar Body Painting Festival 2018	3,000.00
Regina Danino – Installation cost for exhibiting work with group of artists at Bermondsey Project	3,000.00
Ayelet Shay – Book Grant for the translation, production & printing of her book “Relocation Darling Relocation”	6,250.00
Stylos Studios in support of their participation at the World Dance Movement Competition in Italy in July 17	3,000.00
Shane Dalmedo – Purchase of materials and tools for the project of the Encyclopedia of Migrants	2,000.00
Gail Francis Tiron – Book Grant for the production and printing of book “Don’t you Just Love Them”	4,100.00
Sunbow Projects – Virtual Gibraltar Festival	10,000.00
Miss S A McLaren – Assistance for final year at the Northern Ballet School in Manchester, UK	4,260.00
Group 2000 – Assistance for the WWI Play presentation at the Gibraltar Garrisons Library	500.00
The Gibraltar Photographic Society – Purchase of equipment	1,700.00
The Gibraltar philharmonic Society – Support for various concerts promoting classical music	10,000.00
Gibraltar Cultural Services Ltd – Gibraltar Berlin Artist Exchange student sponsorship	6,000.00
R Barabich – The reprint of the book “The memoirs of Arnold Barabiscio”	1,320.00
Davinia Baglietto – Assistance for return flights post Mrs Europe Pageant	488.00
Gibraltar Cultural Services in conjunction with Leisure Cinemas Ltd – Cultural Development Programme	500.00
Gibraltar Horticultural Society – Forthcoming events and projects	2,000.00
Gibraltar Artisans Market – Support towards the Gibraltar Christmas Village 2017	5,000.00
Karen Avellano – Book Grant “Queendom of the Skies”	3,805.00
GibMedia – Gibraltar International Magic Festival Sensory Performance	2,000.00
DSA Old Tyme & Modern Sequence Dance Club – Junior Dance couple travel assistance to Gibraltar	2,000.00
Gibraltar Arts and Crafts Association – St Bernadette’s School workshops	2,000.00
Gibraltar IDF Dance Association – Participation at the IDF World and European Championships 2018	3,000.00
Gibraltar Academy of Music and Performing Arts – Trophies for Festival of Young Musicians	1,500.00

**Q369/2018**  
**Sports-related grants –**  
**Details of awards**

**Clerk:** Question 369. The Hon. E J Reyes.

1510

**Hon E J Reyes:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Can the Minister for Sports provide updated consolidated details of all payments made during the 2017-18 financial year in respect of any sports-related grants?

1515

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

**Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, I now hand over to the hon. Member opposite updated consolidated details of all payments during the 2017-18 financial year in respect of any sports-related grants.

1520

Mr Speaker, I would like to also remind the hon. Member that this information is regularly – or I should say ‘as from now on’; I understand that the [gsla.gi](http://gsla.gi) website has not been running but it is up and running now. All the updates will be on that website.

**Answer to Question 369/2018**

**Grants awarded for Hosting of Special Sports and Leisure Events, 2017/2018**

Gibraltar Darts Trophy	133,341.00
World Pool & Snooker Championships	397,798.49
Commonwealth Games Reception	2,592.00
Gibraltar Kennel Club	10,012.50
Commonwealth Games Expenses	8,656.27
Gibraltar Classic Vehicle Association	3,200.00
U 23 Qualifiers International Darts Competition	110.00
Gibraltar International Backgammon Tournament	108,000.00
Hockey Challenge Cup	850.00
International Bike Rally	866.64
Harley Davidson Club	4,500.00
Maccabi Gibraltar	4,000.00
Eurafrica Trail	23,419.39
Gibraltar International Junior Chess Championships	40,000.00
Kings Bowl Bowling Tournament	16,000.00
Philharmonic Reception	250.00
Squash Open	6,000.00
Gibraltar Chess Trophy Sponsorship	200,000.00
Community Chess Professional	33,160.93
Futsal Competition	4,000.00
Sports and Media Management (Paolo Futre Event Sponsorship)	1,000.00
Mr Sebastian Coe visit reception	2,200.00
Sports Days PA Systems	9,150.00
Gibraltar International Sailing Regatta	6,000.00
Queens Baton Relay catering expense	1,200.00

**Grants awarded to Sporting Societies, 2017/2018**

Netball Association	10,375.75
Shooting Association	17,456.20
Darts Association	6,475.00
Hockey Association	19,167.37
Ten Pin Bowling Association	2,631.06
Athletics Association	6,008.62
Basketball Association	48,924.42
Triathlon Association	4,523.50
Rowing Association	2381.56
Swimming Association	2,870.34
Pool Association	24,255.40
Badminton Association	5,819.00
Cricket Association	9,832.40
Squash Association	4,215.61
Sea Angling	5,518.54

**Continued answer to Question 369/2018**

**Sports Grants awarded for International Competitions, 2017/18**

Island Games	178,257.67
--------------	------------

**Grants awarded for Sports Development Projects, 2017/2018**

Cricket Association	14,756.14
Chess Association	2,198.83
Cycling Association	394.00
Shooting Federation	12,525.86
Darts Association	4,987.50
Badminton Association	8,187.77
Rowing Association	2629.40
Football Association	2,904.89
Hockey Association	10,133.86
Athletics Association	7,552.75
Basketball Association	9,850.00
Karate Association	961.00
Taekwondo Association	311.99
Netball Association	375.00
Rhythmic Gymnastics Association	11,173.55
Rugby Association	34,067.00
Ice Skating Association	1,805.05
Table Tennis Association	2,316.85
Sailing Association	5,000.00

**Grants awarded for Improvement to Facilities Projects, 2017/2018**

Cricket Association	25,000.00
Badminton Association	15,456.00
Swimming Association	1,824.15
Canoeing Association	2,000.00
Chess Association	1,930.00
Table Soccer Association	17,000.00

**Grants awarded Elite Athletes, 2017/2018**

Golf Union	3,000.00
Athletics Association	5,976.96
Darts Association	4,656.40

**Answer to Question 369/2018**

**Grants awarded to Sport Associations for Attendance at Congresses, 2017/2018**

Triathlon Association	1,128.99
Shooting Association	1,000.00
Hockey Association	365.68
Cricket Association	2,378.52
Rugby Association	998.16
Rowing Association	118.14
Badminton Association	740.00
Volleyball Association	597.36
Athletics Association	2,066.74

**Q370/2018**

**Queen's Hotel and Cinema site –  
Confirmation of sale**

**Clerk:** Question 370. The Hon. R M Clinton.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Government advise if it has sold the Queen's Hotel and Queen's Cinema site?

1530 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

**Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, no, sir.

**Q371/2018**

**Europa Point university accommodation –  
Cost of construction**

**Clerk:** Question 371. The Hon. R M Clinton.

1535 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, further to Question 107/2018, can the Government advise what is the total monetary value of the contract awarded to Casais for the construction of the University accommodation block at Europa Point?

1540 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

**Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, the answer to this question is presently commercially sensitive. The information requested will be disclosed to the hon. Member opposite outside this session of the Parliament on a confidential basis.

1545 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I appreciate the Minister's offer to share this information with me privately. Unfortunately, I will not be able to take him up on that offer, in that I am here to ask questions publicly.



1550 I would ask him to explain to this House why this particular contract with Casais is commercially sensitive and yet the contract for the comprehensives is not, which is in a quantum of fifty-odd million, and yet this contract is commercially sensitive. Could he explain to this House the difference in position that he is adopting?

1555 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Well, Mr Speaker, because the hon. Gentleman might have realised that we are all about to go into the market to tender or go into competitive process for other residential accommodation, whilst we do not expect to be tendering or going into a competitive process of procurement for other comprehensives for many generations from now.

1560 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I must confess I am not aware what other residential projects the Chief Minister is referring to, other than of course affordable housing, but he will of course appreciate the distinction between an accommodation block for what I believe the Minister referred to ... about 147 rooms for an accommodation block cannot be compared to affordable housing schemes that the Government will do for the people of Gibraltar.

1565 I just really would like an answer from the Minister, since this contract is self-evidently underway and is obviously costing us, the taxpayer money, as to what exactly it is that is so commercially sensitive about this particular project.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** It is exactly what I have told the hon. Gentleman, Mr Speaker, because there is no difference between residential accommodation and the cost of it based on the size of the internal layout of the rooms or apartments provided. We have had an analysis of cost per square metre and just how much things used to cost before and how much less they cost now as a result of us pursuing a commercially sensitive and sensible approach. We are not wanting to give away what one costs in order to be able to ensure that we achieve that or better pricing in respect of others in the future.

1570 We think this is in the best interest of the taxpayer and we are here to look after the interests of the taxpayer, to deliver the best value for money and to ensure that the affordable housing that we provide for our people is delivered at the most affordable prices so that we do not have to do what hon. Members did when they were in Government, which was to sell as much as possible to those who were prepared to buy 100%. We want to be able to have a policy, as we did last time, of selling to those who are in most need, whether they can buy 50% or they can buy 100%, and that means being keen on the price at which these properties are offered for sale, which means being keen in the way that we procure the properties as they are built.

1575 For that reason, Mr Speaker, I think we have explained very fully what we consider to be the commercial sensitivity. The hon. Gentleman may or may not agree, but that is not going to change the Government's position on why at this stage – not for good, but at this stage – we do not think it is in the interest of the taxpayer to disclose the price.

1580 We have had instances in the past where we have said, 'Look, at this stage we cannot release the price in respect of this particular building that is going up, because we are still negotiating parts of it or we are trying to deal with similar contracts,' but we have subsequently provided the cost. One of those is the magnificent multi-story car park at Midtown, where some people wish that they had bought parking spaces and regret that they did not, and other similar facilities. The price has been made available as soon as that sensitivity disappears, but it is our obligation to make these judgements, it is our obligation to look after taxpayers' money and I think we do a magnificent job of doing so.

1590 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, if I may, just one supplementary on this. If the Chief Minister recalls last time we debated – (*Interjection*) Oh, we shouldn't use the word 'debate'; I apologise, Mr Speaker. Last time we asked about the accommodation block he did mention – I did ask in the supplementary questions – about the financing for this particular project, and he said in

1600 answer that he had not yet made up his mind or they were exploring options. Can the Chief Minister share with this House now what the result of that process is and whether he can now share with his House how exactly this accommodation block is to be financed – whether it is by the Government through the Improvement & Development Fund or through a private vehicle?

1605 **Hon. Chief Minister:** No, Mr Speaker, I am not comfortable doing that because, first of all, I did not have notice of the question and I do not want to say something that might not be entirely accurate; and second, because we are in the process of finalising our negotiation in respect of one the option that we did choose. Therefore, when we finish the negotiation it will be possible to say more but not at this stage.

1610 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, may I?

**Mr Speaker:** Yes.

1615 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, the Government's role is undoubtedly to make sure that it gets the best deal for the taxpayer. Our role, as an Opposition, is to make sure that we hold the Government to account to ensure that it gets the best deal for the taxpayer.

1620 Can I ask a question designed to drill down in terms of the comparison that he has chosen to deploy in answer to the question from Mr Clinton. It was the Minister who said, 'I cannot give you the answer – it's commercially sensitive because we are now undertaking other projects for the low-cost housing etc.' But are we really dealing with apartments when we are talking about this particular block? Are we not talking about something akin to halls of residence, and therefore really it is not comparable? I may be wrong, and I would like an answer.

**Hon. Chief Minister:** The hon. Gentleman is wrong.

1625 **Hon. D A Feetham:** So we are talking, then, of apartments? This is what is being built here? Or are we talking about rooms that may have a kitchenette, for example, or a bathroom, which is what you would expect to see in some halls of residence? Not sure about the kitchenette, but certainly a bathroom.

1630 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Well, Mr Speaker, most apartments have kitchens. The size of them is not relevant in terms of the cost because what you are talking about is putting in the facilities for drainage and running water and a cable to power a hob or an oven. Then what you choose to put in it is down to the individual who purchases the property. Most apartments have showers and toilets, and so those are the costs that are incurred. You might have some apartments that have two sets of bathrooms, but most of them have one kitchen and so the cost is not necessarily different when you are looking at per square meter – it is residential accommodation. And so, Mr Speaker, that is why we have made the determination that there is an element of sensitivity here and why we want to be able to keep our powder dry in the context of negotiation.

1640 As he has himself analysed, we seem to be driving so good a bargain for the taxpayer that even he cannot believe the numbers that we are achieving in terms of costs. We want to continue doing that, to be able to drive the cost of residential accommodation affordable housing for our people down whilst keeping the quality up. That is why we are not at this stage wanting to give the price out. We are ready to give the price out at the right moment when that sensitivity has gone away, and then they can tell us whether they think we have done a good job or not.

1645 Given the exercise that he has done, which is now mercifully set out in *Hansard* for posterity, we will be able to judge the numbers that we achieve against the benchmark that he has set

1650 through the homework that he has done today, and I estimate that we will do very well indeed, given our approach, and that young people in our community will be very happy to see that we are driving cost down while keeping quality up in the offer that we make to them of affordable housing in the future.

**Q372/2018**  
**Island Games 2019 –**  
**Visitors**

**Clerk:** Question 372. The Hon. D A Feetham.

1655 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, can the Government explain its plans to cater for visitors to Gibraltar for the forthcoming Island Games?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

1660 **Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** Mr Speaker, neither HM Government nor the Island Games Association will be responsible for visitors coming to the Island Games in July 2019.

1665 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Well, with respect to the hon. Gentleman, that is a very churlish answer indeed. If you stage a games within a city, be it Island Games, the Commonwealth Games, the Olympic Games or whatever games, you would expect that there is an analysis of whether you are going to be able to cater for visitors coming to the jurisdiction. Is the Hon. Minister saying that the Government has not done that analysis?

1670 **Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, not for visitors, and I will explain to the hon. Member the difference.

1675 Visitors are people who come to visit and see Gibraltar. For the Island Games these are athletes, coaches and officials who are coming to participate in the Island Games. If the hon. Member wants all the details of what we are going to do for the participants and not visitors, I can give it to him, and this is the information I have. It is up to him whether he wants to listen to that, but there is a vast difference between somebody coming to visit Gibraltar as a tourist and somebody who comes to Gibraltar as a participant. *(Interjections)*

1680 **Hon. E J Phillips:** It's absurd!

1685 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, may I ask the Chief Minister to provide me with a coherent answer, because quite frankly that is not a coherent answer. *(Interjections)* Well, it isn't; plainly it isn't. If I ask can it explain how it is going to cater for visitors to Gibraltar for the forthcoming Island Games, does he really think that when I draft these questions I am thinking about visitors going to the Upper Rock to view the monkeys or to use the facilities that we were discussing a few moments ago? Of course not! I am talking about visitors who come to Gibraltar for the purpose of the Island Games and I am asking the Minister whether the Government has conducted an analysis of that so that, in terms of numbers, we know whether there is sufficient accommodation, for example, to cater for those people. It is a very simple question and the Hon. Minister I am surprised did not understand it first time round.

1690

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** I am delighted to rise to assist, Mr Speaker. I refer the hon. Gentleman to the answer given a few moments ago.

1695 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Has the Government conducted any kind of analysis as to how many people are going to come to Gibraltar during the time that the Island Games are on show here in Gibraltar for the purposes of the Island Games?

1700 **Hon. S E Linares:** Yes, Mr Speaker, we have, actually, and we have worked very hard. The Accommodation Committee has worked extremely hard to make sure that 2,500 participants will have accommodation in Gibraltar. I will give him even the breakdowns of how we have worked all this out.

1705 We envisage 2,500 participants and an Accommodation Committee was set up over a year ago to look into how and where the visitors, i.e. the participants – we say the visitors and participants – would be accommodated. Of the athletes, coaches and officials who will be staying, 756 will be staying in hotels, 1,146 will be staying in the Europa housing estate, 300 will be staying in Trafalgar Heights flats and 450 in the wonderful student accommodation which we are building. Therefore, the total number is 2,652, so we have a leeway of 152.

1710 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Thank you very much for that answer to my question. Over and above the participants, does the Government expect anybody to come to Gibraltar in order to view the Island Games? And if so, how many does the Government expect to come to Gibraltar as non-participants to view the Island Games and to enjoy what are likely to be magnificent Games, I am sure – they are organising it and everything that they do is absolutely magnificent.

1715 **Several Members:** Hear, hear.

**Hon. S E Linares:** I am sure the hon. Member, when he says –

1720 **Hon. D A Feetham:** They keep changing their minds on that side! These days!

**Hon. S E Linares:** I am sure when the hon. Member says ‘they are’ it includes me, because I am also included. He says ‘they’ as if I did not exist. But never mind, Mr Speaker.

1725 There are more beds in hotels. We are not actually taking all the beds in every single hotel. I insist we will not be responsible for any family or friends who might want to come to the Games. There is still capacity in hotels, where the family and friends could stay, but we are not responsible for where they stay; they can stay anywhere they want, but all the athletes and participants ...

1730 It is important for the hon. Member to understand that the difference is that when you host an Island Games all the participants have to stay within the Island. Although Gibraltar is not an Island, we are considered to be an Island and therefore we have got to make sure that if 2,500 athletes, coaches and participants come we will have places for them. But we are not responsible for any family or friends that come. They will then have to look at their own accommodation.

1735 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Mr Speaker, thank you very much for that.

1740 May I start by apologising to the Hon. Minister: when I referred to ‘they’, obviously I did include him; I did not mean to offend him. There is no need for him to resign from the Government benches as a consequence of my question. I have had enough resignations to last me a lifetime, I have to tell the Hon. Minister, (*Laughter*) so please do not resign because of

anything that I have said or asked him during the course of today. That I, please, ask you.  
(*Interjection by Hon. Chief Minister*)

1745 But, Mr Speaker, I must insist. Is the Hon. Minister saying – because that is what it appears as, and I am just getting one more opportunity ... Is he really saying that the Government is organising an Island Games and it has not even undertaken a study as to how many people – non-participants, okay, let's be clear about this – are going to be visiting Gibraltar at the time of the Games in order to view those magnificent Games and as to whether Gibraltar can actually cater for those people? That is what it appears that he is really saying.

1750 **Hon. S E Linares:** Well, Mr Speaker, I do not intend to resign. I am very happy with my friends, and therefore because I am happy in this Government as opposed to people that resign on the other side willy-nilly – as in any little issue they go and resign – I am not willing to resign. I am going to stay put. (**Hon. Chief Minister:** Hear, hear.) (*Banging on desk*)

1755 Mr Speaker, it is obvious that the hon. Member does not understand the difference. I insist that there is a difference. Of course we have made an analysis of how many people possibly will come with each team. In fact, I can go even further: that when a team like Jersey, Guernsey, Isle of Man – 28 of them; I am not going to mention them all. We asked them, 'How many athletes are coming? How many officials are coming? How many coaches are coming? Those we will accommodate. And can you please also tell us if you have any indication of how many people will come?' Mr Speaker, you cannot for the life of me know how many exactly are going to come, and that is why we have left extra capacity in hotels, where the people who come can take up those hotels. I will give you an example. In the Rock Hotel, for example, we have not taken the whole of the hotel; we are taking part of the hotel. There will be a team staying in that hotel and therefore the people who come with them might want to take those extra rooms that are available. So that is the explanation.

1760 And one other thing that I do not like saying: they could well stay in La Línea and around here. Why not? But the athletes, coaches and the officials will be staying in Gibraltar. That is the explanation.

1770 We have done an analysis of how many people might be coming to Gibraltar. That is why we have not got all the hotel beds, because if not we would have got all the hotel beds full and not put them in the Village, for example. That is the answer to the hon. Member.

1775 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Okay, so he says that he has done an analysis of the number of people that are coming to Gibraltar. How many people does he expect to come to Gibraltar, visiting for the purpose of viewing these Games?

1780 **Hon. Chief Minister:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman has been very clear in what he has told him. He has told him that we have got exact numbers from all of the participating nations as to athletes and as to officials and team members. That is what it is our responsibility to accommodate. The hon. Gentleman does understand that, doesn't he? The responsibility of the Government of Gibraltar will be to accommodate those officials, coaches etc. and players.

1785 It is not the responsibility of the Government of Gibraltar, as the organising nation, to house those who visit as tourists to view the Games, but we have asked for indications from those participating nations, if they know from past experience or have had other indications, how many others will come. For that reason we are leaving space available in our touristically available facilities for those tourists to take the space. But it would be impossible – and let's be very clear about this, it would be impossible – for Gibraltar to host 28 nations, all of their coaches, officials and players and anyone who might wish to come with them, without committing the foolishness of renting something that you could float in to house them and lose money on, because it is impossible to float something in to house those potential numbers of people and break even. And because hon. Members just seem to be accusing us of looking after

1795 taxpayers' money and ensuring that we do things at the best possible value-for-money rate, as  
they have in relation to our cost of building, what we are not going to do is to incur, in the  
foolishness of a flight of fancy, like I believe they once did, of bringing in a cruise ship and losing  
1800 money on it in order to bring visitors ... In other words, you bring visitors not to increase the  
value to Gibraltar but to lose money on them. We are not going to do that, and so the right  
decision, which the hon. Member has taken with the committee organising the Island Games, is  
to take the responsibility, as every organising nation does, to house officials, athletes and  
coaches, to ensure that you do that inasmuch as possible outside of hotels, to leave hotels  
1810 insofar as possible available for the numbers of visitors that may come. That is the right way to  
go about ensuring that the Gibraltar Games are not just a success but a magnificent success.

**Mr Speaker:** The Hon. Edwin Reyes.

1805 **Hon. E J Reyes:** Mr Speaker, the Minister indicated this figure of 2,500 and so on, but may I  
ask, let me use a word that perhaps will cater for all of them, Team Gibraltar, the participants of  
Gibraltar, would they be accommodated? Because it does happen in many sports. Would they  
be accommodated under that figure of 2,500, or are they going to be expected to stay in their  
homes and just attend the venues and so on? There is value to having the whole team together,  
1810 as I know – he has also participated in sports – and it is certainly a very worthwhile exercise.

**Hon. S E Linares:** Mr Speaker, I said 2,500 athletes. Remember that this is a figure that is  
given by each Island of how many may come, but as the hon. Member knows, when we host a  
games they say that 200 are coming and maybe 150 come or 170 come. Usually they give you  
1815 the top number, the maximum of who is coming. That is the maximum, 2,500. I have given the  
figures, which add up to 2,652, and we are working closely to make sure that the 152 – and I  
know that there are more participants from Gibraltar than 152, because when we flew over in  
the chartered plane we went with 180-odd ... We will look at having our own athletes probably  
within the Village, where they can be in the atmosphere and be ambassadors to all our – I  
1820 should not say our visitors, the competitors, because if not I will get into trouble ... all the  
participants that are coming to Gibraltar.

**Mr Speaker:** The Hon. Roy Clinton.

1825 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Thank you, Mr Speaker. I will be brief.  
If I may ask the Minister: in the DPC presentation he gave on the accommodation block he  
mentioned that there would be ... I think in the answer to the question he disclosed that there  
would be 144 rooms in the university accommodation block and he has just indicated to the  
House that the idea is to accommodate 450 students in this accommodation. Am I correct in  
1830 assuming, then, that we are talking about an average of three people per room? Is that what the  
Government's intention is?

**Hon. S E Linares:** They are not students; they are participants. Yes, he is right. The rooms are  
big enough because when you accommodate athletes ... I had the privilege of going to the Gold  
1835 Coast in Australia and they were housing four to five people in a room in the Village. These  
rooms are big enough to have a bunk bed and a bed beside. Remember, these are conservative  
numbers because we could even house four in a room, but we are trying to be more  
accommodating to have three in a room. There are also apartments like, for example, in  
Trafalgar Heights, in which there are three-bedroom flats. We are not accommodating people,  
1840 for example, in the living room – which we could. So there is still more leeway where we can put  
more people, but we are trying to make people comfortable and I can assure the hon. Member

that three people in that room is pretty comfortable when you go to a games – if he has ever gone to one.

1845 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q373/2018**  
**Island Games –**  
**Air conditioning for sports complexes**

**Clerk:** Question 373. The Hon. E J Phillips.

1850 **Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, can the Government state whether it has awarded a contract in respect of the provision of air conditioning to the new sports complexes to be built in anticipation of the 2019 Island Games?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport.

1855 **Minister for Culture, the Media, Youth and Sport (Hon. S E Linares):** No, sir, Mr Speaker.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**COMMERCE**

**Q374-376/2018 –**  
**Cyber security –**  
**Government website**

**Clerk:** Question 374. The Hon. R M Clinton.

1860 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Government advise what cyber security measures it has in place and why did they fail to prevent the recent hacking attack on the Government's website?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Commerce.

1865 **Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 375 and 376.

**Clerk:** Question 375. The Hon. R M Clinton.

1870 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Government advise if any Government Departments have been subject to a ransomware attack; and if so, how have they been resolved?

**Clerk:** Question 376. The Hon. R M Clinton.

1875 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Government confirm that during the recent attack on its website, that no personally identifiable information or confidential data was stolen?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Commerce.

1880 **Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola):** Mr Speaker, Government can confirm that it has been advised that we have in place all the necessary cyber security measures to mitigate existing and emerging cyber threats. These measures are fully compliant with all the necessary cyber security industry standards and best practices.

1885 The perpetrators carried out what is known as a zero day exploit attack on the Government website, which is hosted in the United Kingdom and is totally separate to the Government network and its systems. The attack occurred on the same day that the weakness was discovered on the website by the perpetrators, at which point the vulnerability was exploited successfully before a patch/fix was developed and made available to us.

1890 ITLD can confirm that as the website is totally separate from Government systems, no Government Department, Agency or Authority has been affected by any type of ransomware attack and no personal information or confidential data compromised.

**Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Whatever you may have been told by your experts.

1895 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I thank the Minister for his response.

Can the Minister advise whether the e-Government website is completely different, on a different platform to that of the Government website? And if so, what were the reasons for the e-Government website going down? Or is that nothing to do with any kind of hacking attack, rather a system failure per se?

1900 **Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Speaker, as I have explained, it is totally separate. The Government website is not connected to any other part of the Government network or systems and the e-Government issues are totally separate and unrelated to this issue.

1905 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, just on that point, he can confirm that e-Government's issues are not as a result of any kind of malicious attack?

**Hon. A J Isola:** Yes, Mr Speaker, I can confirm that.

**Q377/2018**  
**Moneyval –**  
**Visit**

**Clerk:** Question 377. The Hon. R M Clinton.

1910 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Government advise if a Moneyval visit has been scheduled for Gibraltar; and if so, when?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Commerce.

1915 **Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola):** Mr Speaker, yes, sir, Moneyval has confirmed formal commencement of its evaluation process. This will initially entail the submission of information and responses to the FATF methodology over the next few months. This will culminate in an onsite visit, which will take place between 1st and 12th April 2019.



**Q378/2018**  
**Real estate agents –**  
**Regulation**

**Clerk:** Question 378. The Hon. E J Phillips.

1920

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, there is an error, in fact, in this question. It relates to 'Further to Question 48/2018' – that should have read 83, but it does not in substance change the nature of the question that I am putting to the Minister, so I will read it.

1925 Further to Question 48 – it should read 83/2018 – can the Government state whether it intends to further regulate real estate agents beyond the scope of the Estate Agents Code of Conduct created under section 91(3) of the Fair Trading Act?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Commerce.

1930

**Minister for Commerce (Hon. A J Isola):** Mr Speaker, in addition to the code of conduct issued under the Fair Trading Act 2015, the OFT has been appointed as a supervisory authority for real estate agents under the Proceeds of Crime Act 2015 (POCA). The OFT is therefore required to regulate compliance by real estate agents with the Anti-Money Laundering and Combatting the Financing of Terrorism obligations as set out in POCA. To this end it issued guidance notes last month to assist real estate agents to meet their legal requirements and to set out the OFT's regulatory approach. The OFT is currently in the process of engaging with each licensed real estate agent individually to ensure and assist with compliance.

1935

The OFT also regulates real estate agents in the process of obtaining a licence to provide real estate services in Gibraltar in accordance with Part 9 of the Fair Trading Act 2015. Real estate agents are required to meet the requirements to obtain a licence under this legislation – for example, to have appropriate premises from which to carry on business and to have a separate client account.

1940

It is also worth noting that the OFT is also in the advanced stages of drafting a revised code of conduct to replace the existing code issued under section 91(3) of the Fair Trading Act. This code makes important updates to the current code and is based in part on the UK Property Ombudsman's code of conduct, which is applicable to real estate agents in the United Kingdom.

1945

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Minister for that extensive answer relating to the regulation of estate agents.

1950

Will the revised code of conduct effectively professionalise the industry in relation to estate agents? I say this because of course the new measures that were adopted in the United Kingdom seek to do that by ensuring that estate agents have professional qualifications. Given the fact that every day property is sold and bought by individuals in our community, is the Government intending on pursuing those measures that were adopted in the United Kingdom, particularly in relation to professional qualifications of estate agents?

1955

**Hon. A J Isola:** Mr Speaker, the issue of professional qualifications is one that is not as simple as the question suggests, in the sense that in many different sectors industry experience is often enabling those that hold it to be grandfathered into a qualification which they may not actually have in terms of exam qualifications. And so, in considering the code of conduct that we seek to implement, which will deal with, as I mentioned earlier and as you have referred to in your question, the UK code of conduct issued, we hope to replicate as far as we possibly can similar standards to those that are in the UK.

1960

Of course the hon. Member will have sight of these as and when they are available and I will be very happy to discuss them at that time, but I would not like to prejudge or pre-empt any of

1965

the conclusions of the discussions and the consultations that we are entering into before these are put in place.

1970 **Hon. E J Phillips:** I mention this point, of course, because although a number of industry professionals have approached me in respect of this particular issue, saying that the regulations do not go far enough for them, and I suspect it is one or two of the professional organisations that deal with the buying and selling of property within the industry, I take it from the answer ... I understand the problems with professionalising an industry where you have to grandfather professional qualifications in, and I understand that he clearly does not want to pre-empt what  
1975 the committee will say in relation to professional qualifications, but is it the Government's position that it will pursue this, or will just take the lead from the professionals in industry?

1980 **Hon. A J Isola:** I think I have said that we are pursuing a code of conduct based on the UK model, by which we hope to raise the standards of estate agents in Gibraltar. I have to say at the same time that in all our engagements with them – and as I said in my answer, the OFT is meeting with them individually in terms of their POCA compliance and how we can support them – their response to further increases in the standards that we expect of them have been welcomed and I think that is indicative of their support for trying to raise the quality of the services they provide their clients with.

1985 I really do not want to commit to doing anything more than I have said. I would be very happy to share our thinking with him before we make it public, but at this stage really I do not want to commit any further than saying that when we are ready I am happy to have that discussion with him and go through them then.

1990 **Mr Speaker:** Next question.

## HEALTH, CARE AND JUSTICE

Q.379/2018

A&E –

### Contacting Minister re waiting times

**Clerk:** Question 379. The Hon. R M Clinton.

1995 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, does the Minister for Health stand by the GHA press release of 27th February 2017 where he stated: 'I have encouraged anyone who was kept waiting for more than 90 minutes in A&E to contact me'; and if so, what actual measures has he put in place in the waiting room at A&E to make patients aware of this and the mechanism to contact the Minister if they so wish?

2000 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

2005 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, yes. I am continually contacted by members of our community who wish to discuss issues relating to health, social care, elderly care and justice. For anyone who is unaware of my email address – although I dare say there are few people who are unaware – it is [neil.costa@gibraltar.gov.gi](mailto:neil.costa@gibraltar.gov.gi).

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I do not think I heard an answer to my question, and I do not want to repeat what I said again, so I will ask him quite simply: does he still stand by his

statement regarding 90 minutes in A&E; and again, what has he done in practical terms at the A&E waiting room for people to contact him, other than reading out his email address to us now in this Chamber?

**Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, we have just started my answers to questions, so I will try not to dive in to the answer I would ordinarily have given him had it been later in the day.

I answered by saying yes, therefore I stand by the press release that noted that if anyone waits in A&E for more than 90 minutes they should contact me. I have said to the hon. Gentleman that people can contact me by emailing me and I also said that I dare say very few people do not know what my e-mail address is, and if they do not know my e-mail address they definitely contact me by Facebook or by telephone. We are very contactable and very approachable and I do not think that there is anybody left in the community who has not tried to contact me for one reason or another.

Are there any specific measures at A&E to repeat the statement that I made in public and in this Chamber? No, there are not, Mr Speaker.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I thank the Minister for his honest answer.

I would ask him: would he consider now to at least putting some kind of notice in reasonably large typescript for the people who are waiting there for a considerable period of time? Having done so myself personally, staring at the wall, it would be useful to have that information prominently displayed so that members of the public can take up his invitation, as he so kindly suggests.

**Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, if he wants, I will pass on a picture to A&E that they can put on the wall so he can stare at me instead.

I do not think there is any need to write that on an A&E wall, because for the reason I have told him already, people feel very free to contact me on any issue. It is not hard to be able to find me cybernetically or in person. Only recently, in fact, I have had two queries relating to A&E. So, as I say, notwithstanding the absence of any specific measures at A&E reminding people of the public statement that I made in respect of 90 minutes, people nonetheless were able to find me and contact me on any matter.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I am afraid I really must labour the point. Is the Minister seriously telling us that yes, people can make a complaint but no, I do not need to tell them how to make a complaint because they can just google me? Is that really what the Minister is saying? If he was serious about his intent, he would put up a public notice saying 'If you have any complaints or any concerns, please contact me at this email address or on this telephone number'.

Mr Speaker, seriously, just on the back of vehicles on the streets you see notices: 'If you have a problem with my driving, call this number'. Is the Minister so afraid of having a sudden flood of complaints that he does not have the courage to put a notice up in A&E saying 'If you are waiting more than 90 minutes, this is the number to call and this is my email'? Can he not at least do that?

**Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the hon. Gentleman needs to get a life. Seriously, as I have told him already, I am extremely contactable and approachable.

I tell you what, Mr Speaker, the people who certainly needed notices for people to be able to contact them were certainly the GSD when they were in Government. I do not think that there is anyone left in the community who does not know how to contact me.

And it is not that I am hiding behind anything. I have made a series of press releases and public announcements. What I tell members of the community often is that if they wish to

2060 contact me they can do so in various ways, and on my Facebook page I also have my e-mail address constantly in place so that people can contact me if they want to.

2065 It is not a question of hiding, it is not a question of being afraid. We must be the Government that has been the most accessible Government in Gibraltar history and we keep repeating that if people have any issues they should feel free to do so – so much so that one of the very first things that I did when I was appointed Minister for Health was to create the Patient Advocacy and Liaison Service and there is, for the first time, a fully resourced office where people can make complaints should they wish to do so and we facilitate that endeavour by having fully resourced an office.

2070 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can I ask the Minister if I would have his permission to put up a notice in A&E saying ‘If you are waiting for more than 90 minutes, the Minister has asked you to contact him on this email’?

**Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, he can try and do that and see what happens.

2075 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I have just asked him for his permission. Yes or no?

**Hon. N F Costa:** He can try and do that and we will see what happens.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q380/2018**  
**Out-of-court settlements –**  
**Amount paid**

2080 **Clerk:** Question 380. The Hon. E J Phillips.

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, I have lost Health to my hon. Friend Mr Llamas, but I promise I will not contact the Minister cybernetically in future on the question of health – maybe on other subjects, but potentially not on health.

2085 Mr Speaker, further to Question 65/2018, and without naming any complainant, can the Minister for Health state the total amount paid in out-of-court settlements?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

2090 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, in relation to Question 65/2018, the total amount paid in out-of-court settlements was £947,276.

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Would the Hon. Minister confirm in how many cases?

2095 **Hon. N F Costa:** Eleven, Mr Speaker.

2100 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, if I may ask the Minister: when he comes to settling these disputes, is it on the basis of – and again, forgive my ignorance – a commercial view taken by the Minister and his lawyers, or would it necessarily have to be because of a court order having been obtained against the Government?

**Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, in 10 out of the 11 cases they have been out-of-court settlements, so that would be on the basis of legal advice; and in respect of one case it was by way of court order.

2105 **Mr Speaker:** Do you have any more supplementaries?

**Hon. R M Clinton:** I have one but I do not think it will be in order.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q381/2018**  
**Xanit –**  
**Termination of contract**

2110 **Clerk:** Question 381. The Hon. E J Phillips.

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, further to Questions 656/2017 and 68/2018, is the Minister for Health now in a position to make a full statement to the House in respect to the termination of contractual arrangements with Xanit?

2115

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

**Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, I am not in a position to make a statement in respect of our contractual relationship with Xanit. This is because my negotiations with Xanit's General Director continue.

2120

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Mr Speaker, I appreciate the sensitivity surrounding those discussions. I think on the last occasion we had a number of questions in relation to how many patients were currently still receiving care from Xanit and how the Minister anticipates the move to the second provider. Does the Minister expect that to be resolved soon? It is just that it has been some time since we had this question/answer about Xanit and its use by the GHA.

2125

**Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, nothing would give me greater pleasure, in fact, than to be able to finalise those negotiations, given that we have been in discussion now for quite some time. They are, I think, substantially progressed. I do hope to be able to finalise those discussions. Unfortunately, though, given the breadth of the relationship in the sense of the many services that Xanit provides to the GHA, which therefore requires us to negotiate a whole series of prices in respect of all of those services, it has not been the most straightforward of discussions. But, as I say, I dare say we are quite advanced but I cannot give an end date by which we will finish those discussions because I cannot reasonably foresee whether it is going to be in a couple of weeks' time or whether it is going to be in a couple of months' time.

2130

2135

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Is the potential stumbling block a financial issue concerning Xanit? Will there be a payout by the Government in respect to the termination of that contract?

2140

**Hon. N F Costa:** There are various live issues, Mr Speaker. Financial is one of them.

**Hon. D A Feetham:** But in parallel with those negotiations that he is conducting with Xanit can he also confirm – because I seem to recall that that is what he has said to the House on a

2145 previous occasion – that he is conducting parallel negotiations with other service providers, other hospitals and institutions in Spain, so that he can then have comparators between Xanit and those alternative providers?

**Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker, we have been able to conclude pricing with one Spanish tertiary centre. We are in negotiations with Xanit and a third tertiary centre. So, in respect of one of them we are quite comfortable that the pricing that we have been given is satisfactory and we are happy with those prices. In respect of Xanit, as I say, we have progressed significantly but I am not quite happy yet. And in respect of a third tertiary centre we are still discussing prices.

2155 **Hon. D A Feetham:** And when the Minister talks about Xanit, a second tertiary centre and a third tertiary centre, just so that we understand it, it is not the intention of the Government to replace Xanit for one of the second or the third; it is negotiations with these three, which the Government will deploy as and when necessary for the benefit of patients within the GHA.

2160 **Hon. N F Costa:** That is exactly correct, Mr Speaker. We think at the GHA that it is always best for clinicians to have a variety of centres to which the GHA can refer patients to.

I should say, in fact, now that I am standing on my feet, that we have approached a fourth tertiary centre that we wish to enter into discussions with to formalise a relationship that we have on an ad hoc basis, for the simple reason that, as I have just said, it is always beneficial not to have all of your eggs in one basket and for the Tertiary Referrals Board to be able to have different tertiary centres, all of which have comparable prices, when they have to decide to which centre it is best clinically to refer a patient, to be able to have that flexibility. Because, of course, apart from having different centres that may specialise or which in the GHA's opinion may provide a better service in a particular area, it may be that on any particular occasion one of the tertiary centres is full and we may have to fall back on or use other tertiary centres.

2170 So, in the same way that the GHA has always had different partner institutions in the UK to which now the Tertiary Referrals Board may refer a patient, depending on the surgery or the procedure to which the patient is referred, we think it makes perfect sense to have that kind of variety available to the Tertiary Referrals Board. But of course these centres are private, so that complicates matters to the extent that we want to make sure that the Gibraltar taxpayer is paying the right price for any services that it receives.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

2180 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Just one more?

**Mr Speaker:** Yes.

2185 **Hon. D A Feetham:** Are any of these centres – if he can give me that information – a centre that specialises in cancer treatment at all?

**Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker. That is the fourth one that I remembered when I was on my feet.

2190

**Q382-384/2018**

**Diabetes –**

**Number of sufferers; cost of treatment**

**Clerk:** Question 382. The Hon. E J Phillips.

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Can the Government state the number of people currently living with diabetes in Gibraltar?

2195

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

**Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Questions 383 and 384.

2200

**Clerk:** Question 383. The Hon. E J Phillips.

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Can the Government state the number of children diagnosed with type 2 diabetes?

2205

**Clerk:** Question 384. The Hon. E J Phillips.

**Hon. E J Phillips:** Can the Government state the cost to the GHA of treatment and management of type 2 diabetes?

2210

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

**Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, as at 11th May of this year the total number of patients on the GHA diabetes register is 2,685.

2215

There are no children diagnosed with type 2 diabetes under the care of the GHA.

There are many costs associated with the treatment and management of type 2 diabetes, such as those relating to clinical staff, which can vary from general practitioners, diabetes nurse specialists, dieticians, optometrists, ophthalmologists, ophthalmic nurses, podiatrists, consultant physicians and all clinical and support staff that are involved in the day-to-day management of these patients. To calculate the total cost to the GHA of treatment and management of type 2 diabetes is not a possible task, given the fact that each case is different in terms of acuity, clinical management and time allocated by each professional in respect of each patient. I can however, confirm that the cost for medication related to the treatment of type 2 diabetes is approximately £320,000 annually.

2220  
2225

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** May I, Mr Speaker? In answer to Question 382 the Minister gave a figure of 2,685 as patients with diabetes. I declare a vested interest because I am a diabetic myself. Would he happen to know the breakdown, approximately, of that figure, of type 1 and type 2?

2230

**Hon. N F Costa:** Yes, Mr Speaker, for type 1 diabetes it is 206 and for type 2 diabetes, 2,479.

**Hon. E J Reyes:** I am very grateful for that, Mr Speaker. I am surprised. I actually thought the type 1 would have been a bit higher. As a type 2 sufferer I think my life is very inconvenienced at times, but I am glad to see that that number is down. At some stage I was convinced it was over the 500 mark. I am very grateful for giving me a ray of hope there. Thank you.

2235

**Q385/2018**

**Hillsides Residential Home and Bella Vista Day Centre –  
Allied healthcare professional services**

**Clerk:** Question 385. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

2240 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** How many allied healthcare professionals are currently working within Bella Vista and Hillsides dementia centres?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

2245 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, the current allied health professional services being provided at Hillsides Residential Home are physiotherapy, speech and language therapy, and occupational therapy, each for 20 hours a week.

2250 Bella Vista Day Centre also provides physiotherapy, speech and language therapy and occupational therapy, each for 20 hours per week, and the Centre also provides a psychology service for 40 hours per week.

In addition, all residents at Hillsides and service users at Bella Vista are seen by a chiroprapist every six weeks.

2255 **Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Mr Speaker, various representations have been made to me that there are no allied health professionals in these centres and that it was something that was committed to when the centre opened its doors in January 2017. So, without wanting to contradict the hon. Gentleman, perhaps he can furnish me with more information in private because I have been approached by various people who are sure that there are no allied health professionals working in these centres.

2260 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, there are allied health professionals, the ones that I have mentioned, working in Hillsides and Bella Vista.

2265 It may be that the hon. Lady is referring to ... I cannot remember the exact number of weeks but there was a time where, because of recruitment, the services were not being provided. But I can assure the hon. Lady that these services are being provided presently in the hours and in respect of the services that I have just read to the House.

**Q386-387/2018**

**Europort Primary Care Centre –  
Government project; change of location**

**Clerk:** Question 386. The Hon. R M Clinton.

2270 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, can the Government explain why the proposed new Primary Care Centre in Europort has been presented as a Government project to the Development and Planning Commission?



**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

2275 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, I will answer this question together with Question 387.

**Clerk:** Question 387. The Hon. L F Llamas.

2280 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, what factors were deliberated when deciding the change of location for the Primary Care Centre from the ICC to Europort?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

2285 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, the proposed new Primary Care Centre was presented to the Development and Planning Commission as a Government project because the end user will be the Gibraltar Health Authority.

2290 The current PCC facility based at the International Commercial Centre has served our community for many years. The decision to move away from this location was not a decision that was taken lightly. The spatial limitations and environmental issues of the current PCC, however, have reached the point at which the move has become necessary.

2295 There are many reasons why Europort was chosen as the best site from which to offer primary care services. The unique location offers the possibility not only of providing a new, purpose-built facility but also to have the facility directly linked to St Bernard's Hospital and therefore connected to all secondary healthcare services, which would not otherwise be possible.

Practical advantages of the location include the possibility of consolidating services, maximising resources, the ability to pool nursing and administrative support and eliminating the need for separate storage facilities.

2300 Logistical advantages include linked infrastructure and maintenance, greater security and much more efficient supply chains.

Importantly, the main factor which has led to this decision is – as ever, of course – our patients. The synergy between primary and secondary healthcare will streamline clinical and administrative services, enhance patient pathways and ultimately serve to improve the entire patient experience.

2305 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I am grateful to the Minister for his answer. In the DPC description of this particular project it is actually described as:

Podium level Atlantic Suites, Europort, proposed construction of a three-storey building extension connected to the existing St Bernard's Hospital.

2310 I must confess, Mr Speaker, I have not seen the plans, but if the Minister could just advise the House – the land at the present, who owns that land and will there be a connection in the existing Atlantic Suites building?

2315 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, if I understood the hon. Gentleman correctly, the connection will be to the Hospital, not to the adjacent Atlantic Suites building. And the land, unless I am mistaken ... I did not come prepared to answer questions in respect of the DPC planning application, Mr Speaker, but I do not think I am misrecollecting when I say that the land is Europort land.

**Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, I just wanted to ask the Minister can he confirm that factors such as the availability of chemists surrounding the current Primary Care Centre and how people will then go to seek their prescriptions from the new Primary Care Centre were taken into

2320 consideration and how they will deal with that? Also, in terms of factors such as transport and  
traffic in getting to the new Primary Care Centre and whether ... I am sure these things have  
been well thought out, but I just want confirmation from the Minister, the most obvious one  
being housing the primary centre which deals with primary health issues and the secondary  
2325 health institution within the same ground – whether that does not present difficulties should  
illnesses which are contagious break and therefore jeopardise their primary care in that  
situation?

**Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, in the first place I would like to thank the hon. Gentleman for  
saying that he is sure that we have thought about these things carefully. I can assure him that  
2330 we have.

If I can answer the last question first, the fact that we will have the Hospital next to the  
Primary Care Centre in fact provides greater synergy between primary and secondary care and  
is, I am told by the clinicians, a very good thing indeed. So he should rest assured that in respect  
of the clinical aspects of it, having primary links with secondary is, I am told by all the clinicians I  
2335 have spoken to, beneficial to the patients.

In respect of parking, this is a matter, as the hon. Gentleman can be sure, that has also been  
thoroughly looked into. We will be making announcements before the paediatric hub and the  
new PCC are announced. The parking plans that we have in mind, which of course will be  
announced in due course jointly with my colleague the Hon. Mr Paul Balban, the Minister for  
2340 Infrastructure and Planning, very much take into account the current throughput that we see at  
the Primary Care Centre on a daily basis and the paediatric hub, so we have no concerns in that  
respect either.

**Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, I would be grateful if the Minister could perhaps clarify one  
2345 point he made, in that he referred to the land as being owned by Europort, i.e. Europort land.  
Can he be more specific when he says Europort land?

**Hon. N F Costa:** No, Mr Speaker, I am afraid that I cannot because I did not come armed with  
either the legal documentation or the planning application, but if he were to give me notice of  
2350 that question I will be happy to answer that question for him.

**Mr Speaker:** Next question.

**Q388/2018**

**MedDoc –**

**Value of contract re John Mackintosh Wing**

**Clerk:** Question 388. The Hon. L F Llamas.

2355 **Hon. L F Llamas:** Mr Speaker, can the Government disclose the value of the care contract  
entered into with MedDoc on 6th April 2018 in relation to the John Mackintosh Wing, together  
with factors deliberated in making their decision?

**Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

2360 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, the value of the contract  
entered into with MedDoc on 6th April 2018 in relation to the John Mackintosh Wing is  
£1,100,000. MedDoc's was the most competitive offer received.

2365 **Hon. R M Clinton:** Mr Speaker, just to follow on from my colleague's question, can I ask for what term? Is that just for one year? And how long is the contract for?

**Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, yes, it relates to the financial year, of course. He has got me on the length or the term of the contract. I do not know the answer to that, I am sorry.

**Q389/2018**

**Prison new service –  
Provision of new vans**

2370 **Clerk:** Question 389. The Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Would the Minister for Justice provide information as to when the Prison Service will be provided with new vans?

2375 **Clerk:** Answer, the Hon. the Minister for Health, Care and Justice.

2380 **Minister for Health, Care and Justice (Hon. N F Costa):** Mr Speaker, the procurement process for the purchase of a new prison escort vehicle was commenced in May of last year. An order was placed with a supplier at the end of July of last year. I can confirm that the vehicle for the Prison Service has now arrived in Gibraltar, finally, and is currently being fitted out. The supplier estimates that this will be delivered to the Prison Service in approximately two weeks.

2385 In addition, a new vehicle for the Prison's workshop section is in the process of being procured and funds have been allocated within the 2018-19 Estimates to that effect. The procurement process for this second vehicle has just commenced and there is no delivery date at this moment.

**Hon. Ms M D Hassan Nahon:** Thank you for that answer, Mr Speaker.

2390 Can I just ask the Minister for Justice: he was talking about two vans in total that are coming in, and does he believe that this is enough for the complement of vans that are needed at this present moment, to have three in total?

2395 **Hon. N F Costa:** Mr Speaker, the basis on which we proceeded to procure the Prison escort vehicle was on the basis of the advice of the Prison Superintendent and his deputy. That has been their advice since I have met with them on the issue. So, what I am telling the hon. Lady is unless I am advised to the contrary, there is currently no need for an additional escort vehicle – but I am sure if there were I would be advised.

2400 **Chief Minister (Hon. F R Picardo):** Mr Speaker, I think that might be a convenient moment to now move that we adjourn – to the next episode of what the hon. Gentleman Mr Feetham called 'Alien Resurrection' – to next Wednesday, 30th May at three in the afternoon.

**Mr Speaker:** The House will now adjourn to Wednesday 30<sup>th</sup> May at 3.00 p.m.

*The House adjourned at 6.37 p.m.*